

CLOSED

**U.S. District Court
Middle District of Florida (Tampa)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 8:12-cv-01294-JDW-MAP**

Mi Familia Vota Education Fund, et al. v. Detzner
Assigned to: Judge James D. Whittemore
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Mark A. Pizzo
Cause: 42:1973 Voting Rights Act

Date Filed: 06/08/2012
Date Terminated: 07/24/2013
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 441 Civil Rights: Voting
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Mi Familia Vota Education Fund
as an organization

represented by **Dara Lindenbaum**
Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights Under
Law
1401 New York Avenue, NW, Suite 400
Washington, DC 20005
202-662-8324
Email: DLindenbaum@Lawyerscommittee.org
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Edward Robert McCarthy
Weil, Gotshal & Manges, LLP
Suite 1200
1395 Brickell Ave
Miami, FL 33131
305/577-3100
Fax: 305/374-7159
Email: edward.mccarthy@weil.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Edward Soto
Weil, Gotshal & Manges, LLP
Suite 1200
1395 Brickell Ave
Miami, FL 33131
305/577-3177
Fax: 305/374-7159
Email: edward.soto@weil.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Julie A Ebenstein
ACLU Foundation of Florida, Inc.
Suite 340
4500 Biscayne Blvd
Miami, FL 33137
786/363-4434
Email: jebenstein@aclufl.org
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katie O'Connor
American Civil Liberties Union Foundation
230 Peachtree Street, NW, Suite 1440
Atlanta, GA 30303
404/523-2721
Email: koconnor@aclu.org
TERMINATED: 07/16/2012
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

M. Laughlin McDonald
American Civil Liberties Union Foundation
230 Peachtree Street, NW, Suite 1440
Atlanta, GA 30303
Email: lmcdonald@aclu.org
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Randall C. Marshall
ACLU Foundation of Alabama, Inc.
PO Box 6179
Montgomery, AL 36106-0179
334/265-2754
Fax: 3342695666
Email: rmarshall@aclualabama.org
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Robert Kengle
Lawyers' Committee for Civil Rights Under
Law
1401 New York Avenue NW, Suite 400
Washington, DC 20005
202/662-8324
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Murat Limage

represented by **Dara Lindenbaum**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Edward Robert McCarthy
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Edward Soto
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Julie A Ebenstein
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katie O'Connor
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/16/2012
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

M. Laughlin McDonald
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Randall C. Marshall

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Robert Kengle
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Pamela Gomez

represented by **Dara Lindenbaum**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Edward Robert McCarthy
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Edward Soto
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Julie A Ebenstein
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katie O'Connor
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/16/2012
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

M. Laughlin McDonald
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Randall C. Marshall
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Robert Kengle
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Ken Detzner
in his official capacity as Florida
Secretary of State

represented by **Ashley E. Davis**
Florida Education Association
213 S Adams St
Tallahassee, FL 32301-1720
850-224-0447
Email: ashley.davis@floridaea.org

*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Daniel Elden Nordby
Executive Office of the Governor
Room 209 – The Capitol
400 S Monroe St
Tallahassee, FL 32399–1050
850/717–5500
Email: daniel.nordby@eog.myflorida.com
*TERMINATED: 12/12/2012
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

J. Andrew Atkinson
Florida Department of State
500 S Bronough St Ste 100
Tallahassee, FL 32399–0250
850/245–6536
Fax: 850–245–6127
Email: JAndrew.Atkinson@DOS.MyFlorida.com
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

John M. Gore
Jones Day
51 Louisiana Avenue NW
Washington, DC 20001
202/879–3939
Email: jmgore@jonesday.com
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Michael A. Carvin
Jones Day
51 Louisiana Avenue NW
Washington, DC 20001
202/879–3939
Email: macarvin@jonesday.com
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Interested Party

United States Department of Justice

represented by **John A. Russ**
U.S. Department of Justice
Civil Rights Division
950 Pennsylvania Avenue
Voting Section, 1800G
Washington, DC 20530
202/307–6262
Email: John.Russ@usdoj.gov
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Jenigh J. Garrett
United States Department of Justice
950 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Room 7205 NWB
Washington, DC 20530
Email: jenigh.garrett@usdoj.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
------------	---	-------------

06/08/2012	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT FOR DECLARATORY AND INJUNCTIVE RELIEF AND REQUEST FOR THREE JUDGE PANEL against Ken Detzner (Filing fee \$ 350 receipt number TPA11654) filed by Mi Familia Vota Education Fund, Pamela Gomez, Murat Limage. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Civil Cover Sheet)(SAH) (Entered: 06/12/2012)
06/08/2012	<u>2</u>	Summons issued as to Ken Detzner. (SAH) (Entered: 06/12/2012)
06/13/2012	<u>3</u>	NOTICE of designation under Local Rule 3.05 – track 2 (AO) (Entered: 06/13/2012)
06/22/2012	<u>4</u>	MOTION for Katherine O'Connor to appear pro hac vice by All Plaintiffs. (Ebenstein, Julie) (Entered: 06/22/2012)
06/22/2012	<u>5</u>	MOTION for M Laughlin McDonald to appear pro hac vice by All Plaintiffs. (Ebenstein, Julie) (Entered: 06/22/2012)
06/22/2012	<u>6</u>	MOTION for Robert Kengle to appear pro hac vice by All Plaintiffs. (Ebenstein, Julie) (Entered: 06/22/2012)
06/22/2012	<u>7</u>	MOTION to extend time to Seek Pro Hac Vice Admission by Pamela Gomez, Murat Limage, Mi Familia Vota Education Fund. (McCarthy, Edward) (Entered: 06/22/2012)
06/25/2012		***PRO HAC VICE FEES paid and Special Admission Attorney Certification Form filed by attorney Dara Lindenbaum appearing on behalf of Pamela Gomez, Murat Limage, Mi Familia Vota Education Fund (Filing fee \$10 receipt number TPA11862.) (JNB) (Entered: 06/26/2012)
06/25/2012		***PRO HAC VICE FEES paid and Special Admission Attorney Certification Form filed by attorney Robert Kengle appearing on behalf of Pamela Gomez, Murat Limage, Mi Familia Vota Education Fund (Filing fee \$10 receipt number TPA11862.) (JNB) (Entered: 06/26/2012)
06/25/2012		***PRO HAC VICE FEES paid and Special Admission Attorney Certification Form filed by attorney M. Laughlin McDonald appearing on behalf of Pamela Gomez, Murat Limage, Mi Familia Vota Education Fund (Filing fee \$10 receipt number TPA11863.) (JNB) (Entered: 06/26/2012)
06/25/2012		***PRO HAC VICE FEES paid and Special Admission Attorney Certification Form filed by attorney Katherine O'Connor appearing on behalf of Pamela Gomez, Murat Limage, Mi Familia Vota Education Fund (Filing fee \$10 receipt number TPA11863.) (JNB) (Entered: 06/26/2012)
06/27/2012	8	ENDORSED ORDER granting <u>7</u> Motion to extend time to seek pro hac vice admission. Signed by Judge James D. Whittemore on 6/27/2012. (KE) (Entered: 06/27/2012)
06/27/2012	<u>9</u>	RETURN of service executed on 6/15/12 by Mi Familia Vota Education Fund, Pamela Gomez, Murat Limage as to Ken Detzner. (McCarthy, Edward) (Entered: 06/27/2012)
07/02/2012	<u>10</u>	ORDER granting <u>4</u> motion to appear pro hac vice; granting <u>5</u> motion to appear pro hac vice; granting <u>6</u> motion to appear pro hac vice. Signed by Judge James D. Whittemore on 7/2/2012. (KE) (Entered: 07/02/2012)
07/12/2012	<u>11</u>	NOTIFICATION OF REQUEST FOR THREE JUDGE COURT. Signed by Judge James D. Whittemore on 7/11/2012. (KE) (Entered: 07/12/2012)
07/12/2012	<u>12</u>	MOTION for Katie O'Connor to withdraw as attorney by Pamela Gomez, Murat Limage, Mi Familia Vota Education Fund. (O'Connor, Katie) (Entered: 07/12/2012)
07/13/2012	<u>13</u>	MOTION for Michael Carvin to appear pro hac vice by Ken Detzner. (Nordby, Daniel) (Entered: 07/13/2012)
07/13/2012	<u>14</u>	MOTION for John Gore to appear pro hac vice by Ken Detzner. (Nordby, Daniel) (Entered: 07/13/2012)
07/13/2012	<u>15</u>	ORDER granting <u>12</u> Motion for Katie O'Connor, Esq. to withdraw as attorney. Signed by Judge James D. Whittemore on 7/13/2012. (AO) (Entered: 07/13/2012)
07/13/2012	<u>16</u>	MOTION to dismiss Complaint by Ken Detzner. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4)(Nordby, Daniel) (Entered: 07/13/2012)

07/16/2012		***PRO HAC VICE FEES paid and Special Admission Attorney Certification Form filed by attorney John M. Gore appearing on behalf of Ken Detzner (Filing fee \$10 receipt number TPA12264.) (JNB) (Entered: 07/17/2012)
07/16/2012		***PRO HAC VICE FEES paid and Special Admission Attorney Certification Form filed by attorney Michael A. Carvin appearing on behalf of Ken Detzner (Filing fee \$10 receipt number TPA12264.) (JNB) (Entered: 07/17/2012)
07/20/2012	<u>17</u>	MOTION for Dara Lindenbaum to appear pro hac vice by All Plaintiffs. (Ebenstein, Julie) (Entered: 07/20/2012)
07/24/2012	<u>18</u>	ORDER granting <u>17</u> motion to appear pro hac vice. Signed by Judge James D. Whittemore on 7/24/2012. (KE) (Entered: 07/24/2012)
07/24/2012	<u>19</u>	ORDER granting <u>13</u> motion to appear pro hac vice; granting <u>14</u> motion to appear pro hac vice. Signed by Judge James D. Whittemore on 7/24/2012. (KE) (Entered: 07/24/2012)
07/27/2012	<u>20</u>	AMENDED COMPLAINT <i>First Amended Complaint for Declaratory and Injunctive Relief and Request for Three Judge Panel</i> against Ken Detzner filed by Mi Familia Vota Education Fund, Pamela Gomez, Murat Limage. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A – May 31, 2012 Letter)(Soto, Edward) (Entered: 07/27/2012)
07/27/2012	<u>21</u>	NOTICE of Filing <i>First Amended Complaint</i> by Pamela Gomez, Murat Limage, Mi Familia Vota Education Fund re <u>20</u> Amended complaint (Soto, Edward) Modified on 7/30/2012 (BES). (Entered: 07/27/2012)
07/27/2012	<u>22</u>	NOTICE of filing <i>Statement of Interest</i> by United States Department of Justice (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1a, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 1b, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 1c, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 1d, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 2a, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 2b, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 2c, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 2d, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 10)(Russ, John) Modified on 7/30/2012 (BES). (Entered: 07/27/2012)
07/30/2012	23	ENDORSED ORDER denying as moot <u>16</u> Motion to Dismiss based on the filing of an Amended Complaint. Signed by Judge James D. Whittemore on 7/30/2012. (KE) (Entered: 07/30/2012)
07/30/2012	<u>24</u>	DESIGNATION OF THREE–JUDGE COURT ORDER designating Circuit Judge Charles R. Wilson and District Judge James S. Moody to serve with District Judge James D. Whittemore. Signed by Chief Judge Joel F. Dubina, U.S. Court of Appeals on 7/17/2012. (JNB) (Entered: 07/30/2012)
08/20/2012	<u>25</u>	MOTION to dismiss Plaintiffs' First Amended Complaint by Ken Detzner. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5)(Carvin, Michael) (Entered: 08/20/2012)
09/04/2012	<u>26</u>	NOTICE of <i>Supplemental Statement of Interest</i> by United States Department of Justice re <u>25</u> MOTION to dismiss Plaintiffs' First Amended Complaint (Garrett, Jenigh) Modified on 9/5/2012 (BES). (Entered: 09/04/2012)
09/04/2012	<u>27</u>	RESPONSE in opposition re <u>25</u> MOTION to dismiss Plaintiffs' First Amended Complaint filed by Pamela Gomez, Murat Limage, Mi Familia Vota Education Fund. (Soto, Edward) (Entered: 09/04/2012)
09/07/2012	<u>28</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Ashley E. Davis on behalf of Ken Detzner (Davis, Ashley) (Entered: 09/07/2012)
09/11/2012	<u>29</u>	MOTION for leave to file Reply In Support Of Motion To Dismiss First Amended Complaint by Ken Detzner. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Reply)(Carvin, Michael) (Entered: 09/11/2012)
09/12/2012	30	ENDORSED ORDER granting The Secretary's Motion for Leave to File Reply (Dkt. 29. The Clerk is directed to separately docket the Reply attached to the motion. Signed by Judge James D. Whittemore on 9/12/2012. (Whittemore, James) (Entered: 09/12/2012)
09/13/2012	<u>31</u>	REPLY to response to motion re <u>25</u> MOTION to dismiss Plaintiffs' First Amended Complaint filed by Ken Detzner. (BES) (Entered: 09/13/2012)

09/18/2012	<u>32</u>	ORDER denying <u>25</u> Secretary's Motion to Dismiss First Amended Complaint. Signed by Judge James D. Whittemore on 9/18/2012. (KE) (Entered: 09/18/2012)
10/02/2012	<u>33</u>	ANSWER and affirmative defenses to <u>20</u> Amended complaint by Ken Detzner.(Carvin, Michael) (Entered: 10/02/2012)
10/22/2012	<u>34</u>	ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE. Signed by Judge James D. Whittemore on 10/22/2012. (KE) (Entered: 10/22/2012)
10/22/2012	<u>35</u>	RESPONSE TO ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE re <u>34</u> Order to show cause filed by Pamela Gomez, Murat Limage, Mi Familia Vota Education Fund. (Soto, Edward) (Entered: 10/22/2012)
10/23/2012	<u>36</u>	CASE MANAGEMENT REPORT. (Soto, Edward) (Entered: 10/23/2012)
10/29/2012	<u>37</u>	CASE MANAGEMENT AND SCHEDULING ORDER: Discovery due by 3/11/2013, Dispositive motions due by 4/12/2013, Pretrial Conference set for 7/12/2013 at 10:00 AM in Tampa Courtroom 13B before Judge James D. Whittemore, Non-Jury Trial set for August 2013 trial term which commences 8/5/2013. Signed by Judge James D. Whittemore on 10/29/2012. (KE) (Entered: 10/29/2012)
10/30/2012	<u>38</u>	ORDER discharging <u>34</u> Order to show cause. Signed by Judge James D. Whittemore on 10/29/2012. (KE) (Entered: 10/30/2012)
12/10/2012	<u>39</u>	Unopposed MOTION for to withdraw as attorney by Ken Detzner. (Davis, Ashley) (Entered: 12/10/2012)
12/11/2012	<u>40</u>	ORDER granting <u>39</u> Motion to withdraw as attorney. Signed by Judge James D. Whittemore on 12/11/2012. (KE) (Entered: 12/11/2012)
12/17/2012	<u>41</u>	Unopposed MOTION to stay by Ken Detzner. (Davis, Ashley) (Entered: 12/17/2012)
12/17/2012	<u>42</u>	ORDER granting <u>41</u> Unopposed Motion to Stay Proceedings. [SEE ORDER]. Signed by Judge James D. Whittemore on 12/17/2012. (AO) (Entered: 12/17/2012)
12/18/2012		Case stayed (BES) (Entered: 12/18/2012)
01/25/2013	<u>43</u>	MOTION to stay <i>pending decision in Shelby County</i> by Ken Detzner. (Davis, Ashley) (Entered: 01/25/2013)
02/06/2013	<u>44</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>43</u> MOTION to stay <i>pending decision in Shelby County</i> filed by Pamela Gomez, Murat Limage, Mi Familia Vota Education Fund. (Soto, Edward) (Entered: 02/06/2013)
02/11/2013	<u>45</u>	ORDER granting in part <u>43</u> motion to stay. Signed by Judge James D. Whittemore on 2/8/2013. (KE) (Entered: 02/11/2013)
03/01/2013	<u>46</u>	Joint MOTION for protective order by Ken Detzner, Pamela Gomez, Murat Limage, Mi Familia Vota Education Fund. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order Stipulated Protective Order Governing Confidential Information and Documents)(Soto, Edward) Motions referred to Magistrate Judge Mark A. Pizzo. (Entered: 03/01/2013)
03/13/2013	<u>47</u>	ORDER granting <u>46</u> Joint Motion for Protective Order. See order for details. Signed by Magistrate Judge Mark A. Pizzo on 3/13/2013. (ACS) (Entered: 03/13/2013)
06/25/2013	<u>48</u>	NOTICE of <i>decision in Shelby County v. Holder</i> by Ken Detzner (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit <i>Shelby County v. Holder</i>)(Davis, Ashley) (Entered: 06/25/2013)
06/26/2013	<u>49</u>	ORDER directing compliance with Court's 2/8/12 Order. Signed by Judge James D. Whittemore on 6/26/2013. (KE) (Entered: 06/26/2013)
06/27/2013	<u>50</u>	AMENDED ORDER amending <u>49</u> Order directing compliance with court order. Signed by Judge James D. Whittemore on 6/27/2013. (KE) (Entered: 06/27/2013)
07/01/2013	<u>51</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by John Andrew Atkinson on behalf of Ken Detzner (Atkinson, John) (Entered: 07/01/2013)
07/09/2013	<u>52</u>	NOTICE of hearing: Telephonic Status Conference set for 7/11/2013 at 04:30 PM in Tampa Courtroom 13 B before Judge James D. Whittemore. On the date/time specified, counsel shall call 1-888-684-8852; enter access code 7302428; and the

		security code 1294 (4 digit case number) followed by the # (pound) sign.(AO) (Entered: 07/09/2013)
07/10/2013	<u>53</u>	NOTICE of Proposed Order of Dismissal with Prejudice by Ken Detzner re <u>50</u> Amended Order (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Davis, Ashley) (Entered: 07/10/2013)
07/11/2013	<u>54</u>	NOTICE of Proposed Order of Dismissal With Prejudice Only to Extent the Section 5 is Predicated on the Current Section 4 Coverage Formula by Pamela Gomez, Murat Limage, Mi Familia Vota Education Fund (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Soto, Edward) (Entered: 07/11/2013)
07/11/2013	<u>55</u>	Minute Entry. Proceedings held before Judge James D. Whittemore: TELEPHONIC STATUS CONFERENCE held on 7/11/2013. Court Reporter: Linda Starr (AO) (Entered: 07/12/2013)
07/15/2013	<u>56</u>	MOTION to Dismiss Any and All Claims in Plaintiffs' First Amended Complaint Predicated on the Coverage Formula in Section 4 of the Voting Rights Act Held to Be Unconstitutional in Shelby County, Alabama v. Holder by All Plaintiffs. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Soto, Edward) (Entered: 07/15/2013)
07/19/2013	<u>57</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re <u>56</u> MOTION to Dismiss Any and All Claims in Plaintiffs' First Amended Complaint Predicated on the Coverage Formula in Section 4 of the Voting Rights Act Held to Be Unconstitutional in Shelby County, Alabama v. Holder filed by Ken Detzner. (Davis, Ashley) (Entered: 07/19/2013)
07/19/2013	<u>58</u>	MOTION for miscellaneous relief, specifically to dissolve stay by Ken Detzner. (Davis, Ashley) (Entered: 07/19/2013)
07/22/2013	<u>59</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re <u>58</u> MOTION for miscellaneous relief, specifically to dissolve stay filed by Pamela Gomez, Murat Limage, Mi Familia Vota Education Fund. (Soto, Edward) (Entered: 07/22/2013)
07/24/2013	<u>60</u>	ORDER granting in part <u>56</u> motion to dismiss; granting <u>58</u> Motion to Dissolve Stay. The clerk is directed to close this case. Signed by Judge James D. Whittemore on 7/24/2013. (KE) (Entered: 07/24/2013)