

1 Israel G. Torres (#020303)  
2 James E. Barton II (#023888)  
3 Jacqueline Mendez Soto (#022597)  
4 TORRES LAW GROUP, PLLC  
5 2239 West Baseline Road  
6 Tempe, Arizona 85283  
7 (480) 588-6120  
8 [James@TheTorresFirm.com](mailto:James@TheTorresFirm.com)  
9 [Jacqueline@TheTorresFirm.com](mailto:Jacqueline@TheTorresFirm.com)  
10 *Attorneys for Plaintiff*

11 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
12 FOR THE DISTRICT OF ARIZONA

13 Arizonans for Fair Elections (AZAN),  
14 et al;

15 Plaintiffs,

16 v.

17 Katie Hobbs, Arizona Secretary of  
18 State, et al,

19 Defendants.

Case No.: 2:20-cv-00658-DWL

**PLAINTIFFS' OPPOSITION TO  
THE STATE'S CONDITIONAL  
MOTION TO CERTIFY**

20 Plaintiffs oppose the Intervenor's request that the Court certify questions  
21 concerning the interpretation of Arizona's Constitution to the Arizona Supreme Court.  
22 The Plaintiffs have not challenged Article IV, Part 1, Section 1(9). The Court does not  
23 need to rule on the application of this section to the E-Equal system. Intervenor and the  
24 several Amici are wrong in claiming that it is necessary to challenge this section.  
25

26 Intervenor is fully aware that but for recent changes to Arizona's Title 19,  
27 substantial compliance, not strict compliance, applies to the requirements for gathering  
28

1 initiative signatures. “Accordingly, in the context of the formal requirements for  
2 initiatives, substantial compliance means that the petition as circulated fulfills the purpose  
3 of the relevant statutory or constitutional requirements, despite a lack of strict or technical  
4 compliance.” *Feldmeier v. Watson*, 211 Ariz. 444, 447, ¶ 14, 123 P.3d 180, 183 (2005)  
5 (gathering cases). The Arizona Constitution does not explicitly require in-person  
6 signature gathering. Ariz. Const. art. IV, Pt. 1 § 1. Title 19, however, requires that  
7 “[c]onstitutional and statutory requirements for statewide initiative measures must be  
8 strictly construed and persons using the initiative process must strictly comply with those  
9 constitutional and statutory requirements.” A.R.S. § 19-102.01(A). This statute was  
10 enacted in 2017 to reverse the well-established case law of substantial compliance. 2017  
11 Ariz. Legis. Serv. Ch. 151 (H.B. 2244).

12  
13  
14  
15 The Court does not need to rule on the application of Arizona’s Constitution to E-  
16 Qual to decide this case. Nor have Plaintiffs asked it to do so. The question need not be  
17 certified to the Arizona Supreme Court. For these same reasons, the Court does not need  
18 to address the State’s request for certification of its severability question.

19  
20 For the foregoing reasons, Plaintiffs ask that this Court deny the State’s motion.

21  
22 RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this 17<sup>th</sup> day of April, 2020

23 /s/James E. Barton II  
24 TORRES LAW GROUP, PLLC  
25 James E. Barton II  
26 Jacqueline Mendez Soto  
27 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs*  
28

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on April 17, 2020 I electronically transmitted the attached document to the Clerk's Office using the CM/ECF System for filing, and transmitted a copy to the follow parties via email.

Roy Herrera  
Daniel A. Arellano  
Ballard Spahr LLP  
1 East Washington Street, Suite 2300  
Phoenix, Arizona 85004  
(602) 798-5400  
[herrerar@ballardspahr.com](mailto:herrerar@ballardspahr.com)  
[arellanod@ballardspahr.com](mailto:arellanod@ballardspahr.com)  
[andrewsj@ballardspahr.com](mailto:andrewsj@ballardspahr.com)  
*Attorneys for Katie Hobbs, Secretary of State*

Joseph Young  
Apache County Attorney's Office  
Post Office Box 637  
St. Johns, Arizona 85936  
(928) 337-7560  
[JYoung@Apachelaw.net](mailto:JYoung@Apachelaw.net)  
*Attorney for Defendant Edison Wauneka, Apache County Recorder*

Britt W. Hanson  
Christine J. Roberts  
Cochise County Attorney  
Post Office Drawer CA  
Bisbee, Arizona 85603  
(520) 432-8700  
[CVAttmeo@cochise.az.gov](mailto:CVAttmeo@cochise.az.gov)  
[Bhanson@cochise.az.gov](mailto:Bhanson@cochise.az.gov)  
*Attorneys for Defendant David Stevens, Cochise County Recorder*

Rose M. Winkeler  
Coconino County Attorney  
110 East Cherry Avenue  
Flagstaff, Arizona 86001  
(928) 679-8200  
[rwinkeler@coconino.az.gov](mailto:rwinkeler@coconino.az.gov)  
*Attorney for Defendant Patty Hansen, Coconino County Recorder*

1 Jeff Dalton  
2 Gila County Attorney's Office  
3 1400 East Ash Street  
4 Globe, Arizona 85501  
5 (928-402-8630  
6 [jdalton@gilacountyaz.gov](mailto:jdalton@gilacountyaz.gov)  
7 *Attorney for Sadie Jo Bingham Gila County Defendants*

8 Kenneth Angle  
9 Graham County Attorney's Office  
10 800 West Main Street  
11 Safford, Arizona 85546  
12 (928) 428-3620  
13 [kangle@graham.az.gov](mailto:kangle@graham.az.gov)  
14 *Attorney for Wendy John, Graham County Recorder*

15 Jeremy Ford  
16 Greenlee County Attorney's Office  
17 Post Office Box 1717  
18 Clifton, Arizona 85533  
19 (928) 865-2072  
20 [jford@co.greenlee.az.us](mailto:jford@co.greenlee.az.us)  
21 *Attorney for Sharie Milheiro, Greenlee County Recorder*

22 Tony Rogers  
23 La Paz County Attorney's Office  
24 1320 Kofa Avenue  
25 Parker Arizona 85344  
26 (928) 669-6118  
27 [trogers@lapazcountyaz.org](mailto:trogers@lapazcountyaz.org)  
28 *Attorney for Defendant Richard Garcia, La Paz County Recorder*

29 Joseph E. La Rue  
30 Joseph Branco  
31 Maricopa County Attorney's Office  
32 Civil Services Division  
33 222 North Central Avenue, Suite 1100  
34 Phoenix, Arizona 85004  
35 (602) 506-8541  
36 [laruej@mcao.maricopa.gov](mailto:laruej@mcao.maricopa.gov)  
37 [branco@mcao.maricopa.gov](mailto:branco@mcao.maricopa.gov)  
38 *Attorneys for Adrian Fontes, Maricopa County Recorder*

1 Jeffrey B. Haws  
2 Mohave County Attorney's Office  
3 315 North 4<sup>th</sup> Street  
4 Post Office Box 7000  
5 Kingman, Arizona 86402  
6 (928) 753-0770  
7 [Jeff.Haws@mohavecounty.us](mailto:Jeff.Haws@mohavecounty.us)  
8 *Attorney for Defendant Kristi Blair, Mohave County Recorder*

9 Brad Carlyon  
10 Jason S. Moore  
11 Navajo County Attorney's Office  
12 Post Office Box 668  
13 Holbrook, AZ 86025  
14 (928) 524-4026  
15 [Jason.moore@navajocountyaz.gov](mailto:Jason.moore@navajocountyaz.gov)  
16 *Attorneys for Doris Clark, Navajo County Recorder*

17 Daniel Jurkowitz  
18 Pima County Attorney's Office, Civil Division  
19 32 North Stonve Avenue, Suite 2100  
20 Tucson, Arizona 85701  
21 (520) 724-5700  
22 [Daniel.jurkowitz@pcao.pima.gov](mailto:Daniel.jurkowitz@pcao.pima.gov)  
23 *Attorney for Defendant F. Ann Rodriguez, Pima County Recorder*

24 Kent Volkmer  
25 Craig Cameron  
26 Pinal County Attorney  
27 Post Office Box 887  
28 Florence, AZ 85132  
(520) 866-6466  
[Craig.cameron@pinalcountyaz.gov](mailto:Craig.cameron@pinalcountyaz.gov)  
*Attorneys for Defendant Virginia Ross, Pima County Recorder*

29 Kimberly Hunley  
30 Santa Cruz County Attorney's Office  
31 2150 North Congress Drive, #201  
32 Nogales, Arizona 85621  
33 (520) 375-7780  
34 [khunley@santacruzcountyaz.gov](mailto:khunley@santacruzcountyaz.gov)  
35 *Attorney for Defendant Suzanne Sainz, Santa Cruz County Recorder*

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Thomas M. Stoxen  
Yavapai County Attorney's Office  
255 East Gurley Street  
Prescott, Arizona 86301  
(928) 777-7143  
[Thomas.Stoxen@yavapai.us](mailto:Thomas.Stoxen@yavapai.us)  
*Attorney for Defendant Yavapai County Recorder*

William J. Kerekes  
Office of the Yuma County Attorney  
250 West Second Street, Suite G  
Yuma, Arizona 85364  
(928) 817-4300  
[YCAAttyCivil@yumacountyaz.gov](mailto:YCAAttyCivil@yumacountyaz.gov)  
[Bill.Kerekes@yumacountyaz.gov](mailto:Bill.Kerekes@yumacountyaz.gov)  
*Attorney for Defendant Robyn Pouquette, Yuma County Recorder*

/s/ Monse Vejar