

**US District Court Electronic Case Filing System
District of Utah (Central)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 2:16-cv-00789-DN**

Remick et al v. State of Utah et al
Assigned to: Judge David Nuffer
Case in other court: 3rd District, Salt Lake County, 160903921
Cause: 28:1441 Notice of Removal- Civil Rights Act

Date Filed: 07/13/2016
Date Terminated: 03/23/2018
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 440 Civil Rights: Other
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Colton Guy Remick
an individual

represented by **John P. Harrington**
HOLLAND & HART (UT)
222 S MAIN ST STE 2200
SALT LAKE CITY, UT 84101
(801)799-5819
Email: jharrington@hollandhart.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Christopher B. Hadley
JONES WALDO HOLBROOK &
MCDONOUGH
1441 W UTE BLVD #330
PARK CITY, UT 84098
(435)200-0085
Email: chadley@joneswaldo.com
TERMINATED: 06/08/2017
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jennifer S. Horne
HOLLAND & HART (UT)
222 S MAIN ST STE 2200
SALT LAKE CITY, UT 84101
(801)799-5904
Email: jshorne@hollandhart.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John M. Mejia
ACLU OF UTAH
355 N 300 W STE 1
SALT LAKE CITY, UT 84103
(801)521-9862
Email: jmejia@acluutah.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leah M. Farrell
ACLU OF UTAH
355 N 300 W STE 1
SALT LAKE CITY, UT 84103
(801)521-9862
Email: lfarrell@acluutah.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Steven G. Jones
HOLLAND & HART (UT)
222 S MAIN ST STE 2200
SALT LAKE CITY, UT 84101
(801)799-5800
Email: sgjones@hollandhart.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Skylar W. Garner
an individual

represented by **John P. Harrington**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Christopher B. Hadley
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/08/2017
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jennifer S. Horne
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John M. Mejia
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leah M. Farrell
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Steven G. Jones
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Bryce Tucker Lloyd
an individual

represented by **John P. Harrington**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Christopher B. Hadley
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/08/2017
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jennifer S. Horne
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John M. Mejia
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leah M. Farrell
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Steven G. Jones
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Anthony Murdzak
an individual

represented by **John P. Harrington**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Christopher B. Hadley
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/08/2017

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jennifer S. Horne
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John M. Mejia
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leah M. Farrell
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Steven G. Jones
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Colter Ricks
an individual

represented by **John P. Harrington**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Christopher B. Hadley
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/08/2017
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jennifer S. Horne
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John M. Mejia
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leah M. Farrell
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Steven G. Jones
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Brandon Timms
an individual

represented by **John P. Harrington**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Christopher B. Hadley
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/08/2017
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jennifer S. Horne
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John M. Mejia
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leah M. Farrell
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Steven G. Jones
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

State of Utah

represented by **Andrew Dymek**
UTAH ATTORNEY GENERAL'S
OFFICE (160-6-140856)
LITIGATION UNIT
160 E 300 S 6TH FL
PO BOX 140856
SALT LAKE CITY, UT 84114-0856
(801)366-0100
Email: adymek@agutah.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David N. Wolf
UTAH ATTORNEY GENERAL'S
OFFICE (160-6-140856)
LITIGATION UNIT
160 E 300 S 6TH FL
PO BOX 140856
SALT LAKE CITY, UT 84114-0856
(801)366-0100
Email: dnwolf@agutah.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Parker Douglas
UTAH ATTORNEY GENERAL'S
OFFICE
350 N STATE ST STE 230
PO BOX 142320
SALT LAKE CITY, UT 84114-2320
(801)538-9600
TERMINATED: 07/27/2017
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Sean D. Reyes
*in his capacity as Attorney General of the
State of Utah*

represented by **Andrew Dymek**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David N. Wolf
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Parker Douglas
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/27/2017
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Movant**Roger Bryner**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
07/13/2016	<u>1</u>	Case has been indexed and assigned to Magistrate Judge Brooke C. Wells. Defendants Sean D. Reyes, State of Utah is directed to E-File the <u>Notice of Removal and cover sheet</u> (found under Complaints and Other Initiating Documents) and pay the filing fee of \$ 400.00 by the end of the business day. NOTE: The court will not have jurisdiction until the opening document is electronically filed and the filing fee paid in the CM/ECF system. (mms) (Entered: 07/13/2016)
07/13/2016	<u>2</u>	NOTICE OF REMOVAL from 3rd District Court, Salt Lake, case number 160903921, (Filing fee \$ 400, receipt number 1088-2550470) filed by Sean D. Reyes, State of Utah. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A-Summons and Complaint, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Certificate of Service, # <u>3</u> Civil Cover Sheet Civil Cover Sheet) Assigned to Magistrate Judge Brooke C. Wells (Wolf, David) (Entered: 07/13/2016)
07/14/2016	<u>3</u>	NOTICE OF ADR, e-mailed or mailed to Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms, Defendants Sean D. Reyes, State of Utah. (mms) (Entered: 07/14/2016)
07/14/2016	<u>4</u>	NOTICE – This case is assigned to a magistrate judge. To consent or request reassignment, use <u>the form on this link</u> or use the included form for non-efilers and send it to consents@utd.uscourts.gov within 15 days or mail to the court with <i>Attention: Consent Clerk</i> on the envelope. Notice e-mailed or mailed to Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms, Defendants Sean D. Reyes, State of Utah. Form due by 7/29/2016. (mms) (Entered: 07/14/2016)
07/18/2016	<u>5</u>	RECEIVED Consent/Reassignment Form from Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (las) (Entered: 07/18/2016)
07/18/2016	<u>6</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Parker Douglas on behalf of Sean D. Reyes, State of Utah (Douglas, Parker) (Entered: 07/18/2016)
07/20/2016	<u>7</u>	MOTION (1) Notice of Non-Compliance with Local Rule CUCivR 42-1 Regarding Motion to Consolidate; and (2) Motion for Order Voiding Motion to Consolidate with Respect to Plaintiffs and Memorandum in Support of Motion for Order and Memorandum in Support filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 – Email from Valerie Valencia, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 – Email from Valerie Valencia, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3 – Docket)(Harrington, John) (Entered: 07/20/2016)
07/20/2016	<u>8</u>	NOTICE of Consolidation by Sean D. Reyes, State of Utah (Wolf, David) (Entered: 07/20/2016)
07/20/2016	<u>9</u>	EXHIBITS filed by Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms re <u>7</u> MOTION (1) Notice of Non-Compliance with Local Rule CUCivR 42-1 Regarding Motion to Consolidate; and (2) Motion for Order Voiding Motion to Consolidate with Respect to Plaintiffs and Memorandum in Support of Motion for Order and Memorandum in Suppo. (Harrington, John) (Entered: 07/20/2016)
07/20/2016	<u>10</u>	DOCKET TEXT ORDER FOR REASSIGNMENT. Based upon the procedural posture of the case and the pending motion, [docket no. 7] even as all parties have not yet consented to the jurisdiction of a magistrate judge, the Court orders reassignment of this case to a district judge. No attached document Signed by Magistrate Judge Brooke C. Wells on 7/20/2016. (rh) (Entered: 07/20/2016)
07/20/2016	<u>11</u>	After review of the case, case reassigned to District Judge per 10 Docket text order. Case randomly assigned to Judge Robert J. Shelby. Magistrate Judge Brooke C. Wells no longer assigned to the case. (las) (Entered: 07/20/2016)

07/21/2016	<u>12</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re <u>7</u> MOTION (1) Notice of Non-Compliance with Local Rule CUCivR 42-1 Regarding Motion to Consolidate; and (2) Motion for Order Voiding Motion to Consolidate with Respect to Plaintiffs and Memorandum in Support of Motion for Order and Memorandum in Suppo filed by Defendants Sean D. Reyes, State of Utah. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Exhibit)(Wolf, David) (Entered: 07/21/2016)
07/26/2016	<u>13</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Jennifer S. Horne on behalf of All Plaintiffs (Horne, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/26/2016)
07/26/2016	<u>14</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Christopher B. Hadley on behalf of All Plaintiffs (Hadley, Christopher) (Entered: 07/26/2016)
07/26/2016	<u>15</u>	MOTION Ex Parte for Leave to File Over Length Memorandum filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Jones, Steven) (Entered: 07/26/2016)
07/26/2016	<u>16</u>	Plaintiff's MOTION to Certify Class and Memorandum in Support filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Jones, Steven) (Entered: 07/26/2016)
07/26/2016	<u>17</u>	AFFIDAVIT/DECLARATION of John P. Harrington in Support re <u>16</u> Plaintiff's MOTION to Certify Class and Memorandum in Support filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1-2015 GRAMA Request, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2-2009 GRAMA Request, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3-Duchesne and Morgan Counties, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4-Millard County, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5-Cache County, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6-Davis County, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7-Iron County, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8-Sevier County, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9-Failing Gidion, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10-October 26, 2015 Report, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 11-Judicial Council Report)(Jones, Steven) (Entered: 07/26/2016)
07/26/2016	<u>18</u>	AFFIDAVIT/DECLARATION of Steven G. Jones in Support re <u>16</u> Plaintiff's MOTION to Certify Class and Memorandum in Support filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1-First Amended and Supplemental Complaint)(Jones, Steven) (Entered: 07/26/2016)
07/26/2016	<u>19</u>	AFFIDAVIT/DECLARATION of John Mejia in Support re <u>16</u> Plaintiff's MOTION to Certify Class and Memorandum in Support filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Jones, Steven) (Entered: 07/26/2016)
07/26/2016	<u>20</u>	AFFIDAVIT/DECLARATION of Leah M. Farrell in Support re <u>16</u> Plaintiff's MOTION to Certify Class and Memorandum in Support filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Jones, Steven) (Entered: 07/26/2016)
07/26/2016	<u>21</u>	NOTICE OF CONVENTIONAL FILING of Declarations of Class-Action Plaintiffs Colton Guy Remick and Brandon Timms filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms (Jones, Steven) (Entered: 07/26/2016)
07/26/2016	<u>22</u>	AFFIDAVIT/DECLARATION of Colton Guy Remick in Support re <u>16</u> Plaintiff's MOTION to Certify Class and Memorandum in Support filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Jones, Steven) (Entered: 07/26/2016)
07/26/2016	<u>23</u>	AFFIDAVIT/DECLARATION of Brandon Timms in Support re <u>16</u> Plaintiff's MOTION to Certify Class and Memorandum in Support filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Jones, Steven) (Entered: 07/26/2016)
07/26/2016	<u>24</u>	ORDER granting <u>15</u> Plaintiffs' Ex Parte Motion for Leave to File Over Length Motion for Class Certification. Signed by Judge Robert J. Shelby on 7/26/2016. (jds) (Entered: 07/26/2016)

07/26/2016	<u>25</u>	WITHDRAWAL OF MOTION by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms re <u>7</u> MOTION (1) Notice of Non-Compliance with Local Rule CUCivR 42-1 Regarding Motion to Consolidate; and (2) Motion for Order Voiding Motion to Consolidate with Respect to Plaintiffs and Memorandum in Support of Motion for Order and Memorandum in Suppo filed by Colter Ricks, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Skylar W. Garner, Colton Guy Remick, Brandon Timms, Anthony Murdzak . (Harrington, John) (Entered: 07/26/2016)
07/29/2016	<u>26</u>	Stipulated MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer to <i>Plaintiffs' Amended Complaint</i> filed by Defendants Sean D. Reyes, State of Utah. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order Order)(Wolf, David) (Entered: 07/29/2016)
07/29/2016	<u>27</u>	ORDER granting <u>26</u> Motion for Extension of Time to Answer Answer deadline updated for Sean D. Reyes answer due 8/5/2016; State of Utah answer due 8/5/2016. Signed by Judge Robert J. Shelby on 7/29/2016. (jds) (Entered: 07/29/2016)
08/05/2016	<u>28</u>	MOTION to Dismiss and Memorandum in Support filed by Defendants Sean D. Reyes, State of Utah. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Douglas, Parker) (Entered: 08/05/2016)
08/05/2016	<u>29</u>	Defendant's MOTION to Stay re <u>16</u> Plaintiff's MOTION to Certify Class and Memorandum in Support and Memorandum in Support filed by Defendants Sean D. Reyes, State of Utah. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Wolf, David) (Entered: 08/05/2016)
08/05/2016	<u>30</u>	Defendant's MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>16</u> Plaintiff's MOTION to Certify Class and Memorandum in Support and Memorandum in Support filed by Defendants Sean D. Reyes, State of Utah. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Wolf, David) (Entered: 08/05/2016)
08/08/2016	31	DOCKET TEXT ORDER In view of the Motion to Consolidate pending in Case No. 2:16-cv-00053, Cox et al. v. State of Utah, the court orders that all briefing deadlines are stayed relevant to Plaintiffs' Motion to Certify Class <u>16</u> and Defendants' Motion to Dismiss <u>28</u> filed in this case. In light of this order, the court denies without prejudice Defendants' Motion to Stay <u>29</u> and Motion for Extension of Time <u>30</u> . Signed by Judge Robert J. Shelby on 8/8/2016. No Document Attached. (jds) (Entered: 08/08/2016)
08/08/2016	32	ORDER REFERRING CASE to Magistrate Judge Dustin B. Pead under 28:636 (b)(1)(A), Magistrate to hear and determine all nondispositive pretrial matters. No attached document. Signed by Judge Robert J. Shelby on 8/8/2016. (mjm) (Entered: 08/08/2016)
10/18/2016	33	ORDER REASSIGNING CASE. Case reassigned to Judge David Nuffer for all further proceedings. Judge Robert J. Shelby no longer assigned to case, Signed by Judge Robert J. Shelby on 10/18/2016. Case Number shall now read 2:16cv00789 DN (rks) (Entered: 10/18/2016)
10/18/2016	<u>34</u>	NOTICE AFFIRMING PRIOR ORDER OF REFERENCE re 32 Order Referring Case to Magistrate Judge. Orders of the prior judge are affirmed including the order of reference to Magistrate Judge Dustin Pead under 28:636 (b)(1)(A). (rks) (Entered: 10/18/2016)
11/21/2016	<u>35</u>	Plaintiff's MOTION for Lift of Stay and Request for Scheduling Hearing and Entry of Scheduling Order Pursuant to Rule 16 F.R.C.P. filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order) Motions referred to Dustin B. Pead.(Harrington, John) (Entered: 11/21/2016)
11/28/2016	36	Motions No Longer Referred: <u>35</u> Plaintiff's MOTION for Lift of Stay and Request for Scheduling Hearing and Entry of Scheduling Order Pursuant to Rule 16 F.R.C.P. (jcw) (Entered: 11/28/2016)
12/02/2016	37	Motions No Longer Referred: <u>35</u> Plaintiff's MOTION for Lift of Stay and Request for Scheduling Hearing and Entry of Scheduling Order Pursuant to Rule 16 F.R.C.P. (jcw) (Entered: 12/02/2016)

12/05/2016	<u>38</u>	Amended MOTION to Stay re <u>35</u> Plaintiff's MOTION for Lift of Stay and Request for Scheduling Hearing and Entry of Scheduling Order Pursuant to Rule 16 F.R.C.P. and Memorandum in Support filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order) Motions referred to Dustin B. Pead.(Harrington, John) (Entered: 12/05/2016)
12/06/2016	39	Motions No Longer Referred: <u>38</u> Amended MOTION to Stay re <u>35</u> Plaintiff's MOTION for Lift of Stay and Request for Scheduling Hearing and Entry of Scheduling Order Pursuant to Rule 16 F.R.C.P. and Memorandum in Support shall be handled by the District Court. (amn) (Entered: 12/06/2016)
12/08/2016	40	DOCKET TEXT ORDER taking under advisement <u>38</u> Motion to Stay. Per DTO 31 the stay of this case was based on a motion to consolidate filed in Case No. 2:16-CV-53 pending before Judge Dee Benson (docket no. 41 in Judge Benson's case). Judge Benson issued an order dismissing Case No. 2:16-CV-53, which rendered the motion to consolidate the cases moot (docket no. 58 in Judge Benson's case). A Notice of Appeal was filed in Case No. 2:16-CV-53-DB on December 7, 2016 (docket no. 59 in Judge Benson's case). The parties are directed to file simultaneous briefing by no later than 4:00 p.m., Thursday, December 15, 2016 , discussing the impact of the appeal of Case No. 2:16-CV-53-DB on the stay of proceedings in this case and any need to avoid potential for conflicting rulings with the 10th Circuit Court of Appeals. The court will rule on the state of the record as of 4:00 p.m., Thursday, December 15, 2016. Signed by Judge David Nuffer on 12/08/2016. No attached document. (apm) (Entered: 12/08/2016)
12/15/2016	<u>41</u>	Simultaneous BRIEF re 40 Order on Motion to Stay,,,, filed by Defendants Sean D. Reyes, State of Utah. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A – Cox, Hearing Transcript of July 27, 2016)(Wolf, David) (Entered: 12/15/2016)
12/15/2016	<u>42</u>	BRIEF re 40 Order on Motion to Stay,,,, <i>Plaintiffs' Memorandum Regarding Impact of Cox Case Notice of Appeal on Remick Case</i> filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Harrington, John) (Entered: 12/15/2016)
01/04/2017	43	DOCKET TEXT ORDER finding as moot <u>35</u> Motion for Lift of Stay. Given the filing of Plaintiffs' <u>38</u> Amended Motion for Lift of Stay, Plaintiffs' <u>35</u> Motion for Lift of Stay is moot. Signed by Judge David Nuffer on 01/04/2017. No attached document. (apm) (Entered: 01/04/2017)
01/04/2017	44	DOCKET TEXT ORDER granting in part and denying in part <u>38</u> Motion to Stay. After balancing factors of judicial economy, the benefits of a stay, and any hardship to the parties, and carefully considering the issues raised in this case and in the similar case <i>Cox et al v. State of Utah et al</i> , Case No. 2:16-CV-53-DB, the stay of proceedings is LIFTED IN PART to permit disposition of Defendants' <u>28</u> Motion to Dismiss. Therefore, Plaintiffs' <u>38</u> Motion is granted and the stay of proceedings is lifted for purposes of briefing and ruling on Defendants' <u>28</u> Motion to Dismiss. However, the stay of proceedings shall remain in effect for all other purposes. Plaintiffs' response to Defendants' <u>28</u> Motion to Dismiss must be filed by no later than February 1, 2017. Defendants' reply, if any, must be filed by no later than February 15, 2017. Either party may request a hearing on Defendants' <u>28</u> Motion to Dismiss, but a determination as to whether a hearing is necessary will not be made until briefing on the <u>28</u> Motion to Dismiss is complete. Signed by Judge David Nuffer on 01/04/2017. No attached document. (apm) (Entered: 01/04/2017)
02/01/2017	<u>45</u>	Ex Parte (Not Sealed) MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order) Motions referred to Dustin B. Pead.(Harrington, John) Modified on 2/2/2017: corrected motion relief (alt) (Entered: 02/01/2017)

02/01/2017	<u>46</u>	Plaintiff's MEMORANDUM in Opposition re <u>28</u> MOTION to Dismiss filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1-Red-Line Version of Complaint, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2- Informal Opinion, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3-Hurrell-Harring Statement of Interest, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4-Wilbur Statement of Interest)(Harrington, John) (Entered: 02/01/2017)
02/02/2017	<u>47</u>	ORDER granting <u>45</u> Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages. Signed by Judge David Nuffer on 2/2/17 (alt) (Entered: 02/02/2017)
02/09/2017	<u>48</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time file reply brief in support of motion to dismiss and Memorandum in Support , MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages and Memorandum in Support filed by Defendants Sean D. Reyes, State of Utah. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order) Motions referred to Dustin B. Pead.(Douglas, Parker) (Entered: 02/09/2017)
02/10/2017	<u>49</u>	ORDER granting <u>48</u> Motion for Extension of Time; granting <u>48</u> Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages. Signed by Judge David Nuffer on 2/10/17 (alt) (Entered: 02/10/2017)
03/13/2017	<u>50</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>28</u> MOTION to Dismiss filed by Defendants Sean D. Reyes, State of Utah. (Douglas, Parker) (Entered: 03/13/2017)
03/15/2017	<u>51</u>	Plaintiff's MOTION for Leave to File Surreply Brief in Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Dismiss filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order) Motions referred to Dustin B. Pead.(Harrington, John) (Entered: 03/15/2017)
03/16/2017	<u>52</u>	MEMORANDUM in Opposition re <u>51</u> Plaintiff's MOTION for Leave to File Surreply Brief in Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Dismiss filed by Defendants Sean D. Reyes, State of Utah. (Douglas, Parker) (Entered: 03/16/2017)
03/17/2017	<u>53</u>	REQUEST to Submit for Decision re <u>51</u> Plaintiff's MOTION for Leave to File Surreply Brief in Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Dismiss , <u>52</u> Memorandum in Opposition to Motion filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Harrington, John) (Entered: 03/17/2017)
03/20/2017	<u>54</u>	Motions No Longer Referred: Plaintiff's Motion for Leave to File Surreply Brief in Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Dismiss <u>51</u> shall be handled by the District Court. (amn) (Entered: 03/20/2017)
03/21/2017	<u>55</u>	ORDER granting <u>51</u> Motion for Leave to File Surreply Brief re <u>28</u> Motion to Dismiss. Signed by Judge David Nuffer on 3/21/17 (alt) (Entered: 03/21/2017)
03/28/2017	<u>56</u>	Surreply BRIEF re <u>28</u> MOTION to Dismiss filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Harrington, John) (Entered: 03/28/2017)
04/04/2017	<u>57</u>	Surreply BRIEF re <u>28</u> MOTION to Dismiss filed by Defendants Sean D. Reyes, State of Utah. (Douglas, Parker) (Entered: 04/04/2017)
04/05/2017	<u>58</u>	REQUEST to Submit for Decision re <u>28</u> MOTION to Dismiss, <u>56</u> Brief, <u>50</u> Reply Memorandum/Reply to Response to Motion, <u>57</u> Brief, <u>46</u> Memorandum in Opposition to Motion, filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Harrington, John) (Entered: 04/05/2017)
04/06/2017	<u>59</u>	MOTION to Intervene and Memorandum in Support filed by Movant Roger Bryner (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit D, # <u>4</u> Exhibit E) Motion referred to Dustin B. Pead (alt) (Entered: 04/06/2017)
04/20/2017	<u>60</u>	MEMORANDUM in Opposition re <u>59</u> MOTION to Intervene and Memorandum in Support filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 - Declaration of David S. McNeill, PhD, MBA, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 - Bryner State Cases, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3 - Bryner Federal Cases)(Harrington, John) (Entered: 04/20/2017)

04/20/2017	<u>61</u>	MEMORANDUM in Opposition re <u>59</u> MOTION to Intervene and Memorandum in Support filed by Defendants Sean D. Reyes, State of Utah. (Douglas, Parker) (Entered: 04/20/2017)
04/27/2017	<u>62</u>	DECLARATION of David S. McNeill, PhD, MBA re <u>60</u> Memorandum in Opposition to Motion, <i>Amended Declaration</i> filed by Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A–North Carolina PD Directory, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B–Utah Courts Information XChange Subscription Agreement, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C–Court Calendar, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D–Excerpt of Criminal Cases, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E–Excerpt of Attorneys, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F–Red–Lined Version of Declaration)(Harrington, John) (Entered: 04/27/2017)
05/01/2017	<u>63</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE by Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms re <u>62</u> Declaration,, (Harrington, John) (Entered: 05/01/2017)
05/01/2017	<u>64</u>	NOTICE of SUPPLEMENTAL AUTHORITY by Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 – Decision) (Harrington, John) (Entered: 05/01/2017)
05/03/2017	<u>65</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>59</u> MOTION to Intervene, MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages filed by Movant Roger Bryner. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order) Motions referred to Dustin B. Pead (alt) (Entered: 05/03/2017)
05/04/2017	<u>66</u>	ORDER granting <u>65</u> Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply re <u>59</u> MOTION to Intervene (Reply due by 5/12/2017); granting <u>65</u> Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages. Signed by Magistrate Judge Dustin B. Pead on 5/4/17 (alt) (Entered: 05/04/2017)
05/10/2017	<u>67</u>	Mail Returned as Undeliverable. Mail sent to Roger Bryner as to doc no. <u>66</u> . (kpf) (Entered: 05/10/2017)
05/12/2017	<u>68</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>59</u> MOTION to Intervene filed by Movant Roger Bryner (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G) (alt) (Entered: 05/12/2017)
05/15/2017	<u>69</u>	REQUEST to Submit for Decision re <u>59</u> MOTION to Intervene filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Harrington, John) (Entered: 05/15/2017)
06/08/2017	<u>70</u>	NOTICE OF WITHDRAWAL OF COUNSEL of Christopher B. Hadley filed by Christopher B. Hadley on behalf of Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks (Hadley, Christopher) (Entered: 06/08/2017)
07/25/2017	<u>71</u>	MOTION to Lift Stay and for Entry of Scheduling Order Regarding Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. Motions referred to Dustin B. Pead.(Harrington, John) (Entered: 07/25/2017)
07/27/2017	<u>72</u>	SUBSTITUTION OF COUNSEL Andrew Dymek replacing Parker Douglas as counsel on behalf of Sean D. Reyes, State of Utah. (Dymek, Andrew) (Entered: 07/27/2017)
08/07/2017	<u>73</u>	Defendant's MEMORANDUM in Opposition re <u>71</u> MOTION to Lift Stay and for Entry of Scheduling Order Regarding Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification filed by Defendants Sean D. Reyes, State of Utah. (Wolf, David) (Entered: 08/07/2017)
08/21/2017	<u>74</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>71</u> MOTION to Lift Stay and for Entry of Scheduling Order Regarding Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Harrington, John) (Entered: 08/21/2017)
08/21/2017	<u>75</u>	REQUEST to Submit for Decision re <u>73</u> Memorandum in Opposition to Motion, <u>74</u> Reply Memorandum/Reply to Response to Motion, <u>71</u> MOTION to Lift Stay and for Entry of Scheduling Order Regarding Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification filed by Plaintiffs Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms. (Harrington, John) (Entered: 08/21/2017)

01/26/2018	<u>76</u>	NOTICE of SUPPLEMENTAL AUTHORITY by Skylar W. Garner, Bryce Tucker Lloyd, Anthony Murdzak, Colton Guy Remick, Colter Ricks, Brandon Timms (<i>Second</i>) (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 – Order Granting Motion for Class Certification, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 – Decision) (Harrington, John) (Entered: 01/26/2018)
02/09/2018	77	Motions No Longer Referred: <u>59</u> Movant Roger Bryner's MOTION to Intervene and <u>71</u> Plaintiffs' MOTION to Lift Stay and for Entry of Scheduling Order Regarding for Class Certification shall be handled by the District Court and are no longer referred to the Magistrate Judge. (amn) (Entered: 02/09/2018)
03/23/2018	<u>78</u>	MEMORANDUM DECISION AND ORDER granting <u>28</u> Motion to Dismiss; finding as moot <u>59</u> Motion to Intervene; finding as moot <u>71</u> Motion to Lift Stay; finding as moot <u>16</u> Motion to Certify Class. Signed by Judge David Nuffer on 3/23/18 (alt) (Entered: 03/23/2018)
03/23/2018	<u>79</u>	JUDGMENT: action is dismissed without prejudice – CASE CLOSED. Magistrate Judge Dustin B. Pead no longer assigned to case. Signed by Judge David Nuffer on 3/23/18 (alt) (Entered: 03/23/2018)