

**U.S. District Court
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:07-cv-01327-MGC**

S. et al v. Alexander et al
Assigned to: Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum
Cause: 42:12131 Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990

Date Filed: 02/22/2007
Date Terminated: 02/14/2011
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 440 Civil Rights: Other
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Messiah S.
*on behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Antony L Ryan**
Cravath, Swaine & Moore LLP
825 Eighth Avenue
New York, NY 10019
(212) 474-1000
Fax: (212) 474-3700
Email: aryan@cravath.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Chelsea Willow Teachout
Goodwin Procter, LLP (Boston)
53 State Street, Exchange Place
Boston, MA 02109
(617) 570-1000
Fax: (617) 523-1231
Email: cteachout@goodwinprocter.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Josef Maxim Klazen
Kobre & Kim LLP
800 Third Avenue
6th Floor
New York, NY 10022
(212) 488-4931
Fax: (212) 488-1220
Email: jef.klazen@kobrekim.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael Paul Zulandt
Cravath, Swaine & Moore LLP
825 Eighth Avenue
New York, NY 10019
(212)-474-1746
Fax: (212)-474-3700
Email: mzulandt@cravath.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kenneth Richard Stephens
The Legal Aid Society (Civil Div. NYC)
199 Water Street
3rd Floor
New York, NY 10038
212-440-4257
Fax: 212-509-8761
Email: KStephens@legal-aid.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Quintin V.
*on behalf of themselves and all other
similarly situated*

represented by **Antony L Ryan**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Chelsea Willow Teachout
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Josef Maxim Klazen
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael Paul Zulantt
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Jessie E.
*on behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Antony L Ryan**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Chelsea Willow Teachout
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Josef Maxim Klazen
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael Paul Zulantt
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Greg W.
*on behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Antony L Ryan**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Chelsea Willow Teachout
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Josef Maxim Klazen
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael Paul Zulantt
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Alberto B.
*on behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Antony L Ryan**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Chelsea Willow Teachout
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Josef Maxim Klazen
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael Paul Zulant
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Sheldon D.
*on behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Antony L Ryan**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Chelsea Willow Teachout
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Josef Maxim Klazen
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael Paul Zulant
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Viken M.
*on behalf of themselves and all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Antony L Ryan**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Chelsea Willow Teachout
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Josef Maxim Klazen
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Michael Paul Zulant
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

George B. Alexander

*as Acting Chairman and Chief Executive
Officer of the New York State Division of
Parole*

represented by **Edward J. Curtis , Jr**
New York State Department of Law (120
Broadway)
120 Broadway, 24th Floor
New York, NY 10271
212 416 8610
Fax: 212 416 6075
Email: ecurtis@oag.state.ny.us
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jane R. Goldberg

New York State Office of the Attorney
General
120 Broadway
New York, NY 10271
(212) 416-6133
Fax: (212) 416-6075
Email: jane.goldberg@oag.state.ny.us
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John Michael Schwartz

State of New York Office of the Attorney
General
120 Broadway
New York, NY 10271
(212) 416-8559
Fax: (212) 416-6075
Email: john.schwartz@oag.state.ny.us
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marc Alan Konowitz

New York State Office of the Attorney
General
120 Broadway
New York, NY 10271
(212) 416-8549
Fax: (212)-416-6075
Email: marc.konowitz@ag.ny.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY

Ivan B. Rubin

Office of the NYS Attorney General Eliot
Spitzer
120 Broadway (Litigation Bureau)
New York, NY 10271
212 416 6046
Fax: 212 416 6077
Email: Ivan.Rubin@oag.state.ny.us
TERMINATED: 06/03/2010

Defendant

New York State Division of Parole

represented by **Edward J. Curtis , Jr**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jane R. Goldberg

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John Michael Schwartz
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marc Alan Konowitz
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Ivan B. Rubin
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/03/2010

Defendant

**New York State Office of Mental
Health**

represented by **Edward J. Curtis , Jr**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jane R. Goldberg
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John Michael Schwartz
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marc Alan Konowitz
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Ivan B. Rubin
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/03/2010

Defendant

Michael F. Hogan
*as Acting Commissioner of the New York
State Office of Mental Health*

represented by **Edward J. Curtis , Jr**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jane R. Goldberg
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John Michael Schwartz
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marc Alan Konowitz
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Ivan B. Rubin
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/03/2010

Defendant

New York State Department of Health

represented by **Edward J. Curtis , Jr**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jane R. Goldberg
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John Michael Schwartz
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marc Alan Konowitz
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Ivan B. Rubin
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/03/2010

Defendant

Richard F. Daines
as Commissioner of the New York State
Department of Health

represented by **Edward J. Curtis , Jr**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jane R. Goldberg
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John Michael Schwartz
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marc Alan Konowitz
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Ivan B. Rubin
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/03/2010

Defendant

**New York State Office of Temporary
and Disability Assistance**

represented by **Edward J. Curtis , Jr**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jane R. Goldberg
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John Michael Schwartz
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marc Alan Konowitz
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Ivan B. Rubin
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/03/2010

Defendant

David A. Hansell
*as Acting Commissioner of the New York
State Office of Temporary and Disability
Assistance*

represented by **Edward J. Curtis , Jr**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jane R. Goldberg
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

John Michael Schwartz
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marc Alan Konowitz
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Ivan B. Rubin
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/03/2010

Defendant

**New York City Department of Health
and Mental Hygiene**

represented by **Jeffrey Scott Dantowitz**
Office of Corporation Counsel NYC
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
212-788-0939
Fax: 212-788-8877
Email: jdantowi@law.nyc.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Thomas R. Frieden
*as Commissioner of the New York City
Department of Health and Mental
Hygiene*

represented by **Jeffrey Scott Dantowitz**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

**New York City Human Resources
Administration**

represented by **Jeffrey Scott Dantowitz**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Robert L. Doar
*as Commissioner of the New York City
Human Resources Administration*

represented by **Jeffrey Scott Dantowitz**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
02/22/2007	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against George B. Alexander, New York State Division of Parole, New York State Office of Mental Health, Michael F. Hogan, New York State Department of Health, Richard F. Daines, New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance, David A. Hansell, New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, Thomas R. Frieden, New York City Human Resources Administration, Robert L. Doar. (Filing Fee \$ 350.00, Receipt Number 606955) Document filed by Jessie E., Greg W., Alberto B., Sheldon D., Messiah S., Viken M., Quintin V..(mbe) Additional attachment(s) added on 3/1/2007 (Becerra, Maribel). (Entered: 02/22/2007)
02/22/2007		SUMMONS ISSUED as to George B. Alexander, New York State Division of Parole, New York State Office of Mental Health, Michael F. Hogan, New York State Department of Health, Richard F. Daines, New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance, David A. Hansell, New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, Thomas R. Frieden, New York City Human Resources Administration, Robert L. Doar. (mbe) (Entered: 02/22/2007)
02/22/2007		Magistrate Judge Frank Maas is so designated. (mbe) (Entered: 02/22/2007)
02/22/2007		Case Designated ECF. (mbe) (Entered: 02/22/2007)
02/23/2007	<u>2</u>	MOTION to Certify Class. Document filed by Jessie E., Greg W., Alberto B., Sheldon D., Messiah S., Viken M., Quintin V..Responses due by 3/12/2007,Return Date set for 3/22/2007 09:30 AM.(Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 02/23/2007)
02/23/2007	<u>3</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>2</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Jessie E., Greg W., Alberto B., Sheldon D., Messiah S., Viken M., Quintin V.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order for Class Certification)(Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 02/23/2007)
02/23/2007	<u>4</u>	DECLARATION of ALBERTO, B. in Support re: <u>2</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Jessie E., Greg W., Alberto B., Sheldon D., Messiah S., Viken M., Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 02/23/2007)
02/23/2007	<u>5</u>	DECLARATION of GREGORY, W. (REDACTED) in Support re: <u>2</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Jessie E., Greg W., Alberto B., Sheldon D., Messiah S., Viken M., Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 02/23/2007)
02/23/2007	<u>6</u>	DECLARATION of JESSIE, E. (REDACTED) in Support re: <u>2</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Jessie E., Greg W., Alberto B., Sheldon D., Messiah S., Viken M., Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 02/23/2007)
02/23/2007	<u>7</u>	DECLARATION of QUINTIN, V. (REDACTED) in Support re: <u>2</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Jessie E., Greg W., Alberto B., Sheldon D., Messiah S., Viken M., Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 02/23/2007)
02/23/2007	<u>8</u>	DECLARATION of SHELDON, D. (REDACTED) in Support re: <u>2</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Jessie E., Greg W., Alberto B., Sheldon D., Messiah S., Viken M., Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 02/23/2007)
02/23/2007	<u>9</u>	DECLARATION of VIKEN, M. (REDACTED) in Support re: <u>2</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Jessie E., Greg W., Alberto B., Sheldon D., Messiah S., Viken M., Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 02/23/2007)
02/23/2007	<u>10</u>	DECLARATION of MESSIAH, S. (REDACTED) in Support re: <u>2</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Jessie E., Greg W., Sheldon D., Messiah S., Viken M., Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 02/23/2007)
02/23/2007	<u>11</u>	DECLARATION of JENNIFER J. PARISH in Support re: <u>2</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Jessie E., Greg W., Alberto B., Sheldon D., Messiah S., Viken M., Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 02/23/2007)
02/23/2007	<u>12</u>	DECLARATION of BETSY GINSBERG in Support re: <u>2</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Jessie E., Greg W., Alberto B., Sheldon D., Messiah S., Viken M., Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 02/23/2007)

02/23/2007	<u>13</u>	DECLARATION of ANTONY L. RYAN in Support re: <u>2</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Jessie E., Greg W., Alberto B., Sheldon D., Messiah S., Viken M., Quintin V.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A# <u>2</u> Exhibit B# <u>3</u> Exhibit C# <u>4</u> Exhibit D# <u>5</u> Exhibit E# <u>6</u> Exhibit F# <u>7</u> Exhibit G)(Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 02/23/2007)
02/23/2007	<u>14</u>	DECLARATION of ANTONY L. RYAN in Support re: <u>2</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Jessie E., Greg W., Alberto B., Sheldon D., Messiah S., Viken M., Quintin V.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit H# <u>2</u> Exhibit I# <u>3</u> Exhibit J# <u>4</u> Exhibit K# <u>5</u> Exhibit L# <u>6</u> Exhibit M# <u>7</u> Exhibit N)(Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 02/23/2007)
02/23/2007	<u>15</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of NOTICE OF MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION & SUPPORTING PAPERS served on ALL DEFENDANTS on 2/23/2007. Service was made by MAIL. Document filed by Jessie E., Greg W., Alberto B., Sheldon D., Messiah S., Viken M., Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 02/23/2007)
02/27/2007	<u>16</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Edward J. Curtis, Jr on behalf of George B. Alexander, New York State Division of Parole, New York State Office of Mental Health, Michael F. Hogan, New York State Department of Health, Richard F. Daines, New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance, David A. Hansell (Curtis, Edward) (Entered: 02/27/2007)
03/06/2007	<u>17</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by John Michael Schwartz on behalf of George B. Alexander, New York State Division of Parole, New York State Office of Mental Health, Michael F. Hogan, New York State Department of Health, Richard F. Daines, New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance, David A. Hansell (Schwartz, John) (Entered: 03/06/2007)
03/07/2007	<u>18</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Ivan B. Rubin on behalf of George B. Alexander (Rubin, Ivan) (Entered: 03/07/2007)
03/07/2007	<u>19</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Ivan B. Rubin on behalf of Richard F. Daines (Rubin, Ivan) (Entered: 03/07/2007)
03/07/2007	<u>20</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Ivan B. Rubin on behalf of David A. Hansell (Rubin, Ivan) (Entered: 03/07/2007)
03/07/2007	<u>21</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Ivan B. Rubin on behalf of Michael F. Hogan (Rubin, Ivan) (Entered: 03/07/2007)
03/07/2007	<u>22</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Ivan B. Rubin on behalf of New York State Department of Health (Rubin, Ivan) (Entered: 03/07/2007)
03/07/2007	<u>23</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Ivan B. Rubin on behalf of New York State Division of Parole (Rubin, Ivan) (Entered: 03/07/2007)
03/07/2007	<u>24</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Ivan B. Rubin on behalf of New York State Office of Mental Health (Rubin, Ivan) (Entered: 03/07/2007)
03/07/2007	<u>25</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Ivan B. Rubin on behalf of New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance (Rubin, Ivan) (Entered: 03/07/2007)
03/14/2007	<u>26</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Jeffrey Scott Dantowitz on behalf of New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, Thomas R. Frieden, New York City Human Resources Administration, Robert L. Doar (Dantowitz, Jeffrey) (Entered: 03/14/2007)
03/19/2007	<u>27</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,,. New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene served on 2/23/2007, answer due 3/15/2007. Service was accepted by Edna Gonzalez, Secretary to General Counsel. Document filed by Jessie E.; Greg W.; Alberto B.; Sheldon D.; Messiah S.; Viken M.; Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 03/19/2007)
03/19/2007	<u>28</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,,. Thomas R. Frieden served on 2/23/2007, answer due 3/15/2007. Service was accepted by Edna Gonzalez, Secretary to General Counsel. Document filed by Jessie E.; Greg W.; Alberto B.; Sheldon D.; Messiah S.; Viken M.; Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony)

		(Entered: 03/19/2007)
03/19/2007	<u>29</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,, New York City Human Resources Administration served on 2/23/2007, answer due 3/15/2007. Service was accepted by Nathan Solomon, Subpoena Processor. Document filed by Jessie E.; Greg W.; Alberto B.; Sheldon D.; Messiah S.; Viken M.; Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 03/19/2007)
03/19/2007	<u>30</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,, Robert L. Doar served on 2/23/2007, answer due 3/15/2007. Service was accepted by Nathan Solomon, Subpoena Processor. Document filed by Jessie E.; Greg W.; Alberto B.; Sheldon D.; Messiah S.; Viken M.; Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 03/19/2007)
03/19/2007	<u>31</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,, New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance served on 2/23/2007, answer due 3/15/2007. Service was accepted by Z. Zaman, Clerk and Totlyn M. Lewis, Clerk. Document filed by Jessie E.; Greg W.; Alberto B.; Sheldon D.; Messiah S.; Viken M.; Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 03/19/2007)
03/19/2007	<u>32</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,, David A. Hansell served on 2/23/2007, answer due 3/15/2007. Service was accepted by Z. Zaman, Clerk and Totlyn M. Lewis, Clerk. Document filed by Jessie E.; Greg W.; Alberto B.; Sheldon D.; Messiah S.; Viken M.; Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 03/19/2007)
03/19/2007	<u>33</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,, New York State Department of Health served on 2/23/2007, answer due 3/15/2007. Service was accepted by Joseph C. Bierman and Totlyn M. Lewis, Clerk. Document filed by Jessie E.; Greg W.; Alberto B.; Sheldon D.; Messiah S.; Viken M.; Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 03/19/2007)
03/19/2007	<u>34</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,, Richard F. Daines served on 2/23/2007, answer due 3/15/2007. Service was accepted by Joseph C. Bierman, Principal Attorney and Totlyn M. Lewis, Clerk. Document filed by Jessie E.; Greg W.; Alberto B.; Sheldon D.; Messiah S.; Viken M.; Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 03/19/2007)
03/19/2007	<u>35</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,, New York State Division of Parole served on 2/23/2007, answer due 3/15/2007. Service was accepted by Robin Filmer, Administrative Assistant and Totlyn M. Lewis, Clerk. Document filed by Jessie E.; Greg W.; Alberto B.; Sheldon D.; Messiah S.; Viken M.; Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 03/19/2007)
03/19/2007	<u>36</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,, George B. Alexander served on 2/23/2007, answer due 3/15/2007. Service was accepted by Robin Filmer, Administrative Assistant and Totlyn M. Lewis, Clerk. Document filed by Jessie E.; Greg W.; Alberto B.; Sheldon D.; Messiah S.; Viken M.; Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 03/19/2007)
03/19/2007	<u>37</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,, New York State Office of Mental Health served on 2/23/2007, answer due 3/15/2007. Service was accepted by Peter A. Durfee, Deputy Counsel Litigation and Totlyn M. Lewis, Clerk. Document filed by Jessie E.; Greg W.; Alberto B.; Sheldon D.; Messiah S.; Viken M.; Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 03/19/2007)
03/19/2007	<u>38</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,, Michael F. Hogan served on 2/23/2007, answer due 3/15/2007. Service was accepted by Peter A. Durfee, Deputy Counsel Litigation and Totlyn M. Lewis, Clerk. Document filed by Jessie E.; Greg W.; Alberto B.; Sheldon D.; Messiah S.; Viken M.; Quintin V.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 03/19/2007)
03/19/2007	<u>39</u>	STIPULATION: defendants time to answer or move with respect to the complaint shall be extended to 4/19/07; Plaintiff's Motion for Class Certification, noticed for 3/22/07, shall be adjourned to 5/3/07 at 9:30 a.m.; defendants' time to serve response by 4/19/07 at noon; plaintiffs' time to serve replies by 5/1/07 at noon. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 3/19/07) (db) (Entered: 03/19/2007)

		03/20/2007)
03/19/2007		Set Answer Due Date purs. to <u>39</u> Stipulation and Order, as to George B. Alexander answer due on 4/19/2007; New York State Division of Parole answer due on 4/19/2007; New York State Office of Mental Health answer due on 4/19/2007; Michael F. Hogan answer due on 4/19/2007; New York State Department of Health answer due on 4/19/2007; Richard F. Daines answer due on 4/19/2007; New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance answer due on 4/19/2007; David A. Hansell answer due on 4/19/2007; New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene answer due on 4/19/2007; Thomas R. Frieden answer due on 4/19/2007; New York City Human Resources Administration answer due on 4/19/2007; Robert L. Doar answer due on 4/19/2007. (db) (Entered: 03/20/2007)
03/19/2007		Set/Reset Deadlines: Motions due by 5/3/2007. (db) (Entered: 03/20/2007)
04/16/2007	<u>40</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Marc Alan Konowitz on behalf of George B. Alexander, New York State Division of Parole, New York State Office of Mental Health, Michael F. Hogan, New York State Department of Health, Richard F. Daines, New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance, David A. Hansell (Konowitz, Marc) (Entered: 04/16/2007)
04/23/2007	<u>41</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER that the dfts' time to answer or move with respect to the complaint shall be extended from 4/19/07 to ans including 6/19/07; plaintiffs agree that, pending discussions with the dfts of possible settlement of the litigation, the plaintiff will withdraw their motion for class certification, filed on 2/23/07, withut prejudice to reinstating the motion at a later date and subject of the terms herein; the reason for plaitniffs' withdrawal of their motion for class certification without prejudice is to prevent the motion from potentially pending ont he court's docket for an extended period of time while settlement discussions are ongoing; dft furtehr agree that they will not contest the named plaitniffs' appropriateness to serve as representatives of the class as specified in the complaint as further set forth in this order; plaintiffs' counsel may notify dfts' counsel about any emergent cases and the parties will make good faith attempts to address such issues. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 4/23/07) (dle) (Entered: 04/24/2007)
04/23/2007		Set Answer Due Date purs. to <u>41</u> Stipulation and Order,,, as to George B. Alexander answer due on 6/19/2007; New York State Division of Parole answer due on 6/19/2007; New York State Office of Mental Health answer due on 6/19/2007; Michael F. Hogan answer due on 6/19/2007; New York State Department of Health answer due on 6/19/2007; Richard F. Daines answer due on 6/19/2007; New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance answer due on 6/19/2007; David A. Hansell answer due on 6/19/2007; New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene answer due on 6/19/2007; Thomas R. Frieden answer due on 6/19/2007; New York City Human Resources Administration answer due on 6/19/2007; Robert L. Doar answer due on 6/19/2007. (dle) (Entered: 04/24/2007)
04/25/2007	<u>42</u>	Memo Endorsement withdrawing <u>2</u> Motion to Certify Class.. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 4/23/07) (dle) (Entered: 04/26/2007)
05/02/2007	<u>43</u>	NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Jennifer Jean Parish on behalf of all plaintiffs. New Address: Urban Justice Center, 123 William Street, 16th floor, New York, NY, USA 10038, (646) 602-5644. (Parish, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/02/2007)
05/24/2007	<u>44</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Kenneth Richard Stephens on behalf of Messiah S. (Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 05/24/2007)
06/18/2007	<u>45</u>	STIPULATION: the time for all defendants to answer or move with respect to the complaint is extended to 8/3/07 as further set forth in said Order. Paragraphs 2 and 3 of the 4/19/07 Stipulation between the parties, as So Ordered by the Court on 4/23/07, remain in effect and are not limited as to duration by the second sentence of paragraph 4 of said stipulation. George B. Alexander answer due 8/3/2007; New York State Division of Parole answer due 8/3/2007; New York State Office of Mental Health answer due 8/3/2007; Michael F. Hogan answer due 8/3/2007; New York State Department of Health answer due 8/3/2007; Richard F. Daines answer due 8/3/2007; New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance

		answer due 8/3/2007; David A. Hansell answer due 8/3/2007; New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene answer due 8/3/2007; Thomas R. Frieden answer due 8/3/2007; New York City Human Resources Administration answer due 8/3/2007; Robert L. Doar answer due 8/3/2007. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 6/18/07) (db) (Entered: 06/19/2007)
07/31/2007	<u>46</u>	STIPULATION that the dfts' time to answer or move with respect to the complaint shall be extended to and including 10/4/07; paragraphs 2 and 3 of the parties' 4/19/07 stipulation, as "So Ordered" by the court on 4/23/07, remain in effect and are not limited as to duration by the second sentence of paragraph four of said stipulation. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 7/31/07) (dle) (Entered: 08/01/2007)
10/16/2007	<u>47</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER, that the defendants' time to answer or move with respect to the Complaint shall be extended from 10/4/07, to and including 12/4/07. George B. Alexander answer due 12/4/2007; New York State Division of Parole answer due 12/4/2007; New York State Office of Mental Health answer due 12/4/2007; New York State Department of Health answer due 12/4/2007; Richard F. Daines answer due 12/4/2007; New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance answer due 12/4/2007; David A. Hansell answer due 12/4/2007; New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene answer due 12/4/2007; Thomas R. Frieden answer due 12/4/2007; Robert L. Doar answer due 12/4/2007. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 10/12/07) (cd) (Entered: 10/16/2007)
12/05/2007		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum: Telephone Conference held on 12/5/2007. (djc) (Entered: 12/10/2007)
12/06/2007	<u>48</u>	STIPULATION: The defendants' time to answer or move with respect to the complaint is extended from 12/4/07 to 2/5/08. George B. Alexander answer due 2/5/2008; New York State Division of Parole answer due 2/5/2008; New York State Office of Mental Health answer due 2/5/2008; Michael F. Hogan answer due 2/5/2008; New York State Department of Health answer due 2/5/2008; Richard F. Daines answer due 2/5/2008; New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance answer due 2/5/2008; David A. Hansell answer due 2/5/2008; New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene answer due 2/5/2008; Thomas R. Frieden answer due 2/5/2008; New York City Human Resources Administration answer due 2/5/2008; Robert L. Doar answer due 2/5/2008. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 12/5/07) (db) (Entered: 12/07/2007)
01/22/2008	<u>49</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Jane R. Goldberg on behalf of George B. Alexander, New York State Division of Parole, New York State Office of Mental Health, Michael F. Hogan, New York State Department of Health, Richard F. Daines, New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance, David A. Hansell (Goldberg, Jane) (Entered: 01/22/2008)
02/07/2008	<u>50</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER, that the time for defendants' to to answer with respect to the complaint shall be extended form 2/5/08 to and including 4/4/08. George B. Alexander answer due 4/4/2008; New York State Division of Parole answer due 4/4/2008; New York State Office of Mental Health answer due 4/4/2008; Michael F. Hogan answer due 4/4/2008; New York State Department of Health answer due 4/4/2008; Richard F. Daines answer due 4/4/2008; New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance answer due 4/4/2008; New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene answer due 4/4/2008; Thomas R. Frieden answer due 4/4/2008; New York City Human Resources Administration answer due 4/4/2008; Robert L. Doar answer due 4/4/2008. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 2/6/08) (cd) (Entered: 02/07/2008)
04/10/2008	<u>51</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER, that defendants' time to answer the Complaint shall be extended from 4/4/08 to and including 6/4/08. George B. Alexander answer due 6/4/2008; New York State Division of Parole answer due 6/4/2008; New York State Office of Mental Health answer due 6/4/2008; Michael F. Hogan answer due 6/4/2008; New York State Department of Health answer due 6/4/2008; Richard F. Daines answer due 6/4/2008; New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance answer due 6/4/2008; David A. Hansell answer due 6/4/2008; New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene answer due 6/4/2008;

		Thomas R. Frieden answer due 6/4/2008; New York City Human Resources Administration answer due 6/4/2008; Robert L. Doar answer due 6/4/2008. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 4/8/08) (cd) (Entered: 04/10/2008)
06/05/2008	<u>52</u>	STIPULATION The defendants' time to answer or move with respect to the complaint shall be extended from June 4, 2008, to and including August 6, 2008; Plaintiffs' counsel may notify defendants' counsel about any emergent cases, and the parties will make good faith attempts to address such issues. Nothing in this paragraph two(2) will bind the parties to any course of action beyond the period of the extension of time provided in paragraph one (1) of this stipulation; Paragraph two (2) and three(3) of the parties' April 19, 2007 stipulation, as amended and "So ordered" by the court on April 23, 2007, remain in effect and are not limited as to duration by the second sentence in paragraph four(4) of said stipulation. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 6/5/08) (mme) (Entered: 06/05/2008)
08/14/2008	<u>53</u>	STIPULATION: That the time for defendants' to answer or move with respect to the complaint is extended to 10/8/08. George B. Alexander answer due 10/8/2008; New York State Division of Parole answer due 10/8/2008; New York State Office of Mental Health answer due 10/8/2008; Michael F. Hogan answer due 10/8/2008; New York State Department of Health answer due 10/8/2008; Richard F. Daines answer due 10/8/2008; New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance answer due 10/8/2008; David A. Hansell answer due 10/8/2008; New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene answer due 10/8/2008; Thomas R. Frieden answer due 10/8/2008; New York City Human Resources Administration answer due 10/8/2008; Robert L. Doar answer due 10/8/2008. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan, part I on 8/13/08) (db) (Entered: 08/14/2008)
10/15/2008	<u>54</u>	STIPULATION: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED by and among counsel for the plaintiffs; counsel for defendants George B. Alexander, New York State Division of Parole, New York State Office of Mental Health, Michael F. Hogan, New York State Department of Health. Richard F. Daines, New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance and David A. Hansell ("the State Defendants"); and counsel for defendants New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, Thomas R. Frieden, New York City Human Resources Administration and Robert L. Doar ("the City Defendants"), that: The defendants' time to answer or move with respect to the Complaint shall be extended from October 8, 2008 to and including December 8, 2008. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 10/14/2008) (jfe) (Entered: 10/15/2008)
10/16/2008	<u>55</u>	NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Jane R. Goldberg on behalf of George B. Alexander, New York State Division of Parole, New York State Office of Mental Health, Michael F. Hogan, New York State Department of Health, Richard F. Daines, New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance, David A. Hansell. New Address: Office of Attorney General, 120 Broadway, 24th Floor, New York, New York, New York 10271, (212) 416-6133. (Goldberg, Jane) (Entered: 10/16/2008)
12/09/2008	<u>56</u>	STIPULATION It is hereby stipulated and agreed that the defendants' time to answer or move with respect to the Complaint shall be extended from December 8, 2008 to and including February 9, 2009. Plaintiffs' counsel may notify defendants' counsel about any emergent cases, and the parties will make good faith attempts to address such issues. Nothing in this paragraph two (2) will bind the parties to any course of action beyond the period of the extension of time provided in paragraph one (1) of this Stipulation. Paragraphs two (2) and three (3) of the parties' April 19, 2007 stipulation, as amended and So Ordered by the Court on April 23, 2007 remain in effect and are not limited as to duration by the second sentence of paragraph four (4) of said stipulation. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 12/9/08) (mme) (Entered: 12/09/2008)
02/23/2009	<u>57</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER that the defendants' time to answer or move to the Complaints shall be extended from 2/9/09 to and including 4/9/09. George B. Alexander answer due 4/9/2009; New York State Division of Parole answer due 4/9/2009; New York State Office of Mental Health answer due 4/9/2009; Michael F. Hogan answer due 4/9/2009; New York State Department of Health answer due 4/9/2009; Richard F. Daines answer due 4/9/2009; New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance answer due 4/9/2009; David A. Hansell

		answer due 4/9/2009; New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene answer due 4/9/2009; Thomas R. Frieden answer due 4/9/2009; New York City Human Resources Administration answer due 4/9/2009; Robert L. Doar answer due 4/9/2009. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 2/20/09) (cd) (Entered: 02/23/2009)
04/14/2009	<u>58</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER,1. The defendants' time to answer or move with respect to the Complaint shall be extended from April 9, 2009 to and including June 9, 2009, 2. Plaintiffs' counsel may notify defendants' counsel about any emergent cases, and the parties will make good faith attempts to address such issues. Nothing in this paragraph two (2) will bind the parties to any course of action beyond the period of the extension of time provided in paragraph one (1) of this stipulation. 3. Paragraphs two (2) and three (3) of the parties' April 19, 2007 stipulation, as amended and "So Ordered" by the Court on April 23, 2007, remain in effect and are not limited as to duration by the second sentence of paragraph four (4) of said stipulation. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 4/14/09) (pl) (Entered: 04/14/2009)
06/09/2009	<u>59</u>	STIPULATION; The defendants' time to answer or move with respect to the Complaint shall be extended from 6/9/2009, to and including 8/10/2009. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 6/9/2009) (tve) (Entered: 06/09/2009)
09/01/2009	<u>60</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER, George B. Alexander answer due 10/9/2009; New York State Division of Parole answer due 10/9/2009; New York State Office of Mental Health answer due 10/9/2009; Michael F. Hogan answer due 10/9/2009; New York State Department of Health answer due 10/9/2009; Richard F. Daines answer due 10/9/2009; New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance answer due 10/9/2009; New York City Human Resources Administration answer due 10/9/2009; Robert L. Doar answer due 10/9/2009. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 8/31/09) (djc) (Entered: 09/23/2009)
10/16/2009	<u>61</u>	STIPULATION: The defendants' time to answer or move with respect to the Complaint shall be extended from 10/9/09, to and including 12/9/09. Plaintiffs' counsel may notify defendants' counsel about any emergent cases, and the parties will make good faith attempts to address such issues. Nothing in this paragraph two (2) will bind the parties to any course of action beyond the period of the extension of time provided in paragraph one (1) of this Stipulation. Paragraphs two (2) and three (3) of the parties' 4/19/07 stipulation, as amended and "So Ordered" by the Court on 4/23/07, remain in effect and are not limited as to duration by the second sentence of paragraph four (4) of said stipulation. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 10/15/09) (tro) (Entered: 10/22/2009)
12/14/2009	<u>62</u>	STIPULATION that the defendants' time to answer or move with respect to the complaint shall be extended to and including 2/8/10. Paragraphs two and three of the parties' 4/19/07 stipulation, as amended and "so ordered" by the Court on 4/23/07, remain in effect and are not limited as to duration by the second sentence of paragraph four of said stipulation. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 12/7/09) (dle) (Entered: 12/14/2009)
02/09/2010	<u>63</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER, George B. Alexander answer due 4/8/2010; New York State Division of Parole answer due 4/8/2010; New York State Office of Mental Health answer due 4/8/2010; Michael F. Hogan answer due 4/8/2010; New York State Department of Health answer due 4/8/2010; Richard F. Daines answer due 4/8/2010; New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance answer due 4/8/2010; New York City Human Resources Administration answer due 4/8/2010; Robert L. Doar answer due 4/8/2010. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 2/9/10) (djc) (Entered: 02/09/2010)
04/12/2010	<u>64</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER, George B. Alexander answer due 6/8/2010; New York State Division of Parole answer due 6/8/2010; New York State Office of Mental Health answer due 6/8/2010; Michael F. Hogan answer due 6/8/2010; New York State Department of Health answer due 6/8/2010; Richard F. Daines answer due 6/8/2010; New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance answer due 6/8/2010; New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene

		answer due 6/8/2010; New York City Human Resources Administration answer due 6/8/2010; Robert L. Doar answer due 6/8/2010. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 4/9/10) (djc) (Entered: 04/12/2010)
06/03/2010	<u>65</u>	NOTICE OF WITHDRAWAL AND APPEARANCE AND ORDER. PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that Ivan Rubin will no longer be employed by the Office of the Attorney General of the State of New York and, accordingly, hereby withdraws as counsel of record for the State Defendants in the above-captioned action and requests that his appearance herein be terminated. PLEASE TAKE FURTHER NOTICE that the Office of the Attorney General of the State of New York continues to serve as counsel of record for the State Defendants through Assistant Attorneys General Goldberg and Schwartz, who request that copies of all notices, pleadings and other papers herein continue to be served upon them in accord with their appearances which they previously entered. Attorney Ivan B. Rubin terminated. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 6/2/10) (rjm) (Entered: 06/03/2010)
06/08/2010	<u>66</u>	STIPULATION: The time for defendants to answer or move with respect to the complaint is extended from 6/8/10 to 8/9/10. George B. Alexander answer due 8/9/2010; New York State Division of Parole answer due 8/9/2010; New York State Office of Mental Health answer due 8/9/2010; Michael F. Hogan answer due 8/9/2010; New York State Department of Health answer due 8/9/2010; Richard F. Daines answer due 8/9/2010; New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance answer due 8/9/2010; David A. Hansell answer due 8/9/2010; New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene answer due 8/9/2010; Thomas R. Frieden answer due 8/9/2010; New York City Human Resources Administration answer due 8/9/2010; Robert L. Doar answer due 8/9/2010. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 6/8/10) (db) (Entered: 06/08/2010)
08/09/2010	<u>67</u>	STIPULATION: It is hereby stipulated and agreed by and between the parties that defendants' time to answer or move with respect to the complaint is extended until 10/12/2010, as set forth in this Stipulation. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 8/9/2010) (jpo) (Entered: 08/09/2010)
10/13/2010	<u>68</u>	STIPULATION, that the defendant's time to answer or move with respect to the Complaint shall be extended from October 12, 2010 to and including December 13, 2010. Additional relief as set forth in this Order. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 10/8/10) (pl) (Entered: 10/13/2010)
12/15/2010	<u>69</u>	STIPULATION: The defendants' time to answer or move with respect to the Complaint shall be extended from 12/13/10, to and including 2/14/11. George B. Alexander answer due 2/14/2011; Richard F. Daines answer due 2/14/2011; Robert L. Doar answer due 2/14/2011; Thomas R. Frieden answer due 2/14/2011; David A. Hansell answer due 2/14/2011; Michael F. Hogan answer due 2/14/2011; New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene answer due 2/14/2011; New York City Human Resources Administration answer due 2/14/2011; New York State Department of Health answer due 2/14/2011; New York State Division of Parole answer due 2/14/2011; New York State Office of Mental Health answer due 2/14/2011; New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance answer due 2/14/2011. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 12/13/10) (db) (Entered: 12/15/2010)
02/14/2011	<u>70</u>	NOTICE OF VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL Pursuant to Rule 41(a)(1)(A)(i) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, the plaintiff(s) and or their counsel(s), hereby give notice that the above-captioned action is voluntarily dismissed, without prejudice against the defendant(s) George B. Alexander, Richard F. Daines, Robert L. Doar, Thomas R. Frieden, David A. Hansell, Michael F. Hogan, New York City Department of Health and Mental Hygiene, New York City Human Resources Administration, New York State Department of Health, New York State Division of Parole, New York State Office of Mental Health, New York State Office of Temporary and Disability Assistance. Document filed by Viken M., Quintin V., Greg W., Messiah S., Alberto B., Sheldon D., Jessie E.. (Ryan, Antony) (Entered: 02/14/2011)