

**U.S. District Court  
Southern District of Ohio (Cincinnati)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:16-cv-00539-MRB**

Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio et al v. Hodges et al  
Assigned to: Judge Michael R. Barrett  
Case in other court: Sixth Circuit Court of Appeals, 16-04027  
Cause: 42:1983 Civil Rights Act

Date Filed: 05/11/2016  
Date Terminated: 08/12/2016  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 440 Civil Rights: Other  
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

**Plaintiff**

**Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio**

represented by **Alan E. Schoenfeld**  
Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr  
LLP  
7 World Trade Center  
250 Greenwich St.  
New York, NY 10007  
212-937-7294  
Fax: 212-230-8888  
Email: [alan.schoenfeld@wilmerhale.com](mailto:alan.schoenfeld@wilmerhale.com)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Alphonse Adam Gerhardstein**  
Gerhardstein & Branch Co. LPA  
441 Vine Street  
Suite 3400  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
513-621-9100  
Fax: 513-345-5543  
Email: [agerhardstein@gbfirm.com](mailto:agerhardstein@gbfirm.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Carrie Y. Flaxman**  
Planned Parenthood Federation of America  
1110 Vermont Ave, NW, Suite 300  
Washington, DC 20005  
(202) 973-4830  
Fax: (202) 296-3480  
Email: [carrie.flaxman@ppfa.org](mailto:carrie.flaxman@ppfa.org)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Helene T. Krasnoff**  
1110 Vermont Avenue NW  
Suite 300  
Washington, DC 20005  
202/973-4890  
Fax: 202/296-3480  
Email: [helene.krasnoff@ppfa.org](mailto:helene.krasnoff@ppfa.org)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**John Barrow Sprangers**  
Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr  
LLP  
1875 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20006  
202-663-6265  
Fax: 202-663-6363  
Email: [john.sprangers@wilmerhale.com](mailto:john.sprangers@wilmerhale.com)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Kimberly A. Parker**

Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr  
LLP  
1875 Pennsylvania Avenue NW  
Washington, DC 20006  
202-663-6987  
Fax: 202-663-6363  
Email: [kimberly.parker@wilmerhale.com](mailto:kimberly.parker@wilmerhale.com)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Michelle Nicole Diamond**

Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr  
LLP  
7 World Trade Center  
250 Greenwich Street  
New York, NY 10007  
212-295-6427  
Fax: 212-230-8888  
Email: [michelle.diamond@wilmerhale.com](mailto:michelle.diamond@wilmerhale.com)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Paul R. Q. Wolfson**

Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr  
LLP  
1875 Pennsylvania Avenue NW  
Washington, DC 20006  
202-663-6390  
Fax: 202-663-6363  
Email: [paul.wolfson@wilmerhale.com](mailto:paul.wolfson@wilmerhale.com)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Stephanie N. Simon**

Wilmer Cutler Pickering Hale and Dorr  
LLP  
7 World Trade Center  
250 Greenwich Street  
New York, NY 10007  
212-295-7210  
Fax: 212-230-8888  
Email: [stephanie.simon@wilmerhale.com](mailto:stephanie.simon@wilmerhale.com)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jennifer Lynn Branch**

Gerhardstein & Branch Co. LPA  
441 Vine Street, Suite 3400  
Cincinnati, OH 45202  
513-621-9100 x13  
Fax: 513-345-5543  
Email: [jbranch@gbfirm.com](mailto:jbranch@gbfirm.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Planned Parenthood of Southwest  
Ohio Region**

represented by **Alan E. Schoenfeld**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Alphonse Adam Gerhardstein**  
(See above for address)

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Carrie Y. Flaxman**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Helene T. Krasnoff**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**John Barrow Sprangers**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Kimberly A. Parker**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Michelle Nicole Diamond**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Paul R. Q. Wolfson**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Stephanie N. Simon**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jennifer Lynn Branch**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

**Defendant**

**Richard Hodges**  
*in his official capacity as Director of the  
Ohio Department of Health*

represented by **Ryan L. Richardson**  
Ohio Attorney General's Office  
Constitutional Offices Section  
30 East Broad Street, 16th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
614-466-2872  
Fax: 614-728-7592  
Email: [ryan.richardson@ohioattorneygeneral.gov](mailto:ryan.richardson@ohioattorneygeneral.gov)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Steven T Voigt**  
Ohio Attorney General's Office  
Constitutional Offices Section  
30 E. Broad St., 16th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
614-466-2872  
Fax: 614-728-7592  
Email: [steven.voigt@ohioattorneygeneral.gov](mailto:steven.voigt@ohioattorneygeneral.gov)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Tiffany L. Carwile**  
 Ohio Attorney General  
 Constitutional Offices Section  
 30 E. Broad St., 16th Floor  
 Columbus, OH 43215  
 614-466-2872  
 Fax: 614-728-7592  
 Email: [tiffany.carwile@ohioattorneygeneral.gov](mailto:tiffany.carwile@ohioattorneygeneral.gov)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Defendant**

**Timothy Ingram**  
*in his official capacity as Commissioner  
 of Hamilton County Public Health*  
**TERMINATED: 05/27/2016**

represented by **Roger Edward Friedmann**  
 Hamilton County Civil Division  
 230 East Ninth Street  
 Suite 4000  
 Cincinnati, OH 45202  
 513/946-3004  
 Fax: 513/579-1707  
 Email: [roger.friedmann@hcpros.org](mailto:roger.friedmann@hcpros.org)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Michael Gerard Florez**  
 Assistant Prosecutor, Hamilton County  
 Ohio  
 Civil Division  
 230 East Ninth Street  
 Suite 4000  
 Cincinnati, OH 45202  
 513-946-3229  
 Fax: 513-946-3018  
 Email: [Michael.Florez@HCPros.org](mailto:Michael.Florez@HCPros.org)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Pamela J Sears**  
 Hamilton County Prosecutor  
 Civil  
 230 East Ninth Street  
 Suite 4000  
 Cincinnati, OH 45202  
 513/946-3082  
 Fax: 946-3018  
 Email: [pam.sears@hcpros.org](mailto:pam.sears@hcpros.org)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
05/11/2016	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against All Defendants ( Filing fee \$ 400 paid – receipt number: 0648-5494285), filed by Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Civil Cover Sheet) (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/11/2016)
05/11/2016	<u>2</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Alphonse Adam Gerhardstein for Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region (Gerhardstein, Alphonse) (Entered: 05/11/2016)
05/11/2016	<u>3</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice of Paul R.Q. Wolfson, Kimberly Parker, Alan Schoenfeld, Carrie Flaxman, Helene Krasnoff (Filing fee \$ 1000, receipt number 0648-5494353) by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing) (Gerhardstein, Alphonse) (Entered: 05/11/2016)

05/11/2016	<u>4</u>	ORDER granting <u>3</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice of Paul R.Q. Wolfson, Kimberly Parker, Alan Schoenfeld, Carrie Flaxman, and Helene Krasnoff. Signed by Judge Susan J. Dlott. (wam) (Entered: 05/11/2016)
05/11/2016	<u>5</u>	MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/11/2016)
05/11/2016	<u>6</u>	ORDER REASSIGNING CASE signed by Judge Susan J. Dlott on 5/11/16. Case reassigned to Judge Michael R. Barrett for all further proceedings. Judge Susan J. Dlott no longer assigned to case. (eh) (Entered: 05/11/2016)
05/11/2016		NOTATIONAL ORDER by Judge Michael R. Barrett on 5/11/16 granting <u>5</u> Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages. (ba) (Entered: 05/11/2016)
05/11/2016	<u>7</u>	MOTION for Temporary Restraining Order <i>and Preliminary Injunction</i> by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit of Iris Harvey and Exhibits, # <u>2</u> Affidavit of Jerry Lawson and Exhibits, # <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order) (Branch, Jennifer). Added MOTION for Preliminary Injunction on 5/12/2016 (eh). (Entered: 05/11/2016)
05/11/2016	<u>8</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Ryan L. Richardson for Defendant Richard Hodges (Richardson, Ryan) (Entered: 05/11/2016)
05/12/2016		NOTICE of Hearing on Motion re <u>7</u> MOTION for Temporary Restraining Order <i>and Preliminary Injunction</i> ; Please be aware that a status conference pursuant to S.D. Ohio Civ. R. 65.1 is set for 5/12/2016 at 03:00 PM by teleconference before Judge Michael R. Barrett; Plaintiff is responsible for notifying opposing counsel regarding the setting of this matter and the following contact information; parties shall initiate contact with the Court by calling 513-564-7660 five minutes prior to 3:00 pm. (ba) (Entered: 05/12/2016)
05/12/2016		If this case is referred, it will be to Magistrate Judge Stephanie K. Bowman. (eh) (Entered: 05/12/2016)
05/12/2016	<u>9</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Tiffany L. Carwile for Defendant Richard Hodges (Carwile, Tiffany) (Entered: 05/12/2016)
05/12/2016		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Michael R. Barrett: Status Conference held on 5/12/2016 re <u>7</u> MOTION for Temporary Restraining Order ; <i>Carrie Flaxman, Jennifer Branch, Alphonse Gerhardtstein and Paul Wolfson appeared for Plaintiff; Ryan Richardson appeared for Defendant Hodges; Roger Friedmann and Mike Florez appeared for Defendant Ingram; a possible briefing schedule was discussed and a potential hearing of 5/20/16 at 9:30 am; a follow up Status Conference is set for 5/16/2016 at 09:30 AM by teleconference before Judge Michael R. Barrett; a separate notice to follow regarding conference instructions.</i> (ba) (Entered: 05/12/2016)
05/13/2016	<u>10</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Roger Edward Friedmann for Defendant Timothy Ingram (Friedmann, Roger) (Entered: 05/13/2016)
05/13/2016	<u>11</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Michael Gerard Florez for Defendant Timothy Ingram (Florez, Michael) (Entered: 05/13/2016)
05/13/2016	<u>12</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Pamela J Sears for Defendant Timothy Ingram (Sears, Pamela) (Entered: 05/13/2016)
05/13/2016	<u>13</u>	NOTICE: Please be aware that a Status Conference is set for 5/16/2016 at 09:30 AM by teleconference before Judge Michael R. Barrett; <b>YOU MUST ACCESS THIS DOCUMENT TO OBTAIN CONFERENCING INFORMATION. PLEASE BE AWARE THAT YOU MUST BE LOGGED INTO CM/ECF THROUGH THE COURTS WEBSITE (NOT PACER) AT WWW.OHSD.USCOURTS.GOV USING YOUR OWN PASSWORD BEFORE RETRIEVING THIS DOCUMENT THROUGH THE NOTICE OF ELECTRONIC FILING.</b> NOTE: You will be required to use this information each time the Court conducts a telephone conference. (ba) (Entered: 05/13/2016)
05/16/2016		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Michael R. Barrett: Status Conference held on 5/16/2016; Carrie Flaxman, Jennifer Branch, Paul Wolfson and Michelle Diamond appeared for Plaintiff; Ryan Richardson appeared for Defendant Hodges;

		Roger Friedmann, Mike Florez and Pam Sears appeared for Defendant Ingram; parties to submit an agreed briefing order re: <u>7</u> Motion for TRO to barrett_chambers@ohsd.uscourts.gov and follow up with the Court for a Status Conference set 5/24/2016 at 11:00 AM by teleconference before Judge Michael R. Barrett; <b>parties shall refer to <u>13</u> Notice of Telephone Conference for conferencing instructions.</b> (ba) Modified on 5/16/2016 (ba) to edit participants and regenerate a NEF. (Entered: 05/16/2016)
05/16/2016	<u>14</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region <i>Proposed Joint Agreed Schedule for Temporary Restraining Motion</i> , Defendants. (Branch, Jennifer) Modified on 5/17/2016 (eh). (Entered: 05/16/2016)
05/18/2016	<u>15</u>	MOTION to Dismiss <i>Plaintiffs' Complaint</i> by Defendant Timothy Ingram. Responses due by 6/13/2016 (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A–D) (Florez, Michael) (Entered: 05/18/2016)
05/18/2016	<u>16</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>7</u> MOTION for Temporary Restraining Order <i>and Preliminary Injunction</i> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction filed by Defendant Timothy Ingram. (Florez, Michael) (Entered: 05/18/2016)
05/18/2016	<u>17</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>7</u> MOTION for Temporary Restraining Order <i>and Preliminary Injunction</i> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction filed by Defendant Richard Hodges. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Affidavit Tina Bickert, # <u>4</u> Affidavit Amanda Dennison, # <u>5</u> Affidavit Angela Norton, # <u>6</u> Affidavit Dyane Gogan Turner) (Richardson, Ryan) (Entered: 05/18/2016)
05/20/2016	<u>18</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>7</u> MOTION for Temporary Restraining Order <i>and Preliminary Injunction</i> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction filed by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Second Harvey Declaration, # <u>2</u> Affidavit Second Lawson Declaration, # <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order Revised Proposed TRO) (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/20/2016)
05/23/2016	<u>19</u>	ORDER granting <u>7</u> Motion for TRO and holding in abeyance the Motion for Preliminary Injunction; this TRO shall expire on 6/6/16 at 11:59 pm; no bond required. Signed by Judge Michael R. Barrett on 5/23/16. (ba) (Entered: 05/23/2016)
05/24/2016		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Michael R. Barrett: Status Conference held on 5/24/2016; Carrie Flaxman, Jennifer Branch and Paul Wolfson appeared for Plaintiff; Ryan Richardson and Tiffany Carwile appeared for Defendant Hodges; Roger Friedmann, Mike Florez and Pam Sears appeared for Defendant Ingram; Status Conference set 5/26/2016 at 9:30 AM by teleconference before Judge Michael R. Barrett; parties shall refer to 13 Notice of Telephone Conference for conferencing instructions. (jlw) (Entered: 05/24/2016)
05/26/2016		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Michael R. Barrett: Status Conference held on 5/26/2016; Carrie Flaxman, Jennifer Branch, and Paul Wolfson appeared for Plaintiff; Ryan Richardson, Tiffany Carwile, Roger Friedmann, Michael Florez and Pamela Sears appeared for Defendants; parties to provide agreed extension to the <u>19</u> TRO Order as soon as possible; a Motion Hearing is set for 8/2/2016 10:00 AM in Courtroom 109 – Cincinnati before Judge Michael R. Barrett as to <u>7</u> Motion for Preliminary Injunction; the Court will follow up with the Parties at a Status Conference set for 6/6/2016 at 03:00 PM by teleconference before Judge Michael R. Barrett; <b>parties shall refer to <u>13</u> Notice of Telephone Conference for conferencing instructions.</b> (ba) (Entered: 05/26/2016)
05/27/2016	<u>20</u>	STIPULATION of Dismissal of <i>Defendant Timothy Ingram</i> , by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Wolfson, Paul) (Entered: 05/27/2016)
05/31/2016	<u>21</u>	WAIVER OF SERVICE Returned Executed. Waiver sent to Richard Hodges on 5/12/2016, answer due 7/11/2016. (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/31/2016)
06/01/2016	<u>22</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER as to <u>7</u> Preliminary Injunction; Expiration date extended to 8/5/16 at 11:59 pm as to <u>19</u> Order as to <u>7</u> MOTION for Temporary Restraining Order; Discovery requests due 6/6/16. Discovery Responses and Initial Witness Lists due



		6/20/16. Discovery due by 7/8/2016. Simultaneous Opening Briefs due 7/15/16. Simultaneous Response Briefs due 7/25/16. Motion Hearing set for 8/2/2016 at 10:00 AM in Courtroom 109 – Cincinnati before Judge Michael R. Barrett. Signed by Judge Michael R. Barrett on 6/1/16. (ba) (Entered: 06/01/2016)
06/06/2016		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Michael R. Barrett: Status Conference held on 6/6/2016; Paul Wolfson appeared for Plaintiff; Ryan Richardson and Tiffany Carwile appeared for Defendant; parties agree the <u>22</u> Calendar Order issued is amenable; Court orders the parties to file a witness list due by 7/25/16; case to proceed as scheduled. (ba) (Entered: 06/06/2016)
06/30/2016	<u>23</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice of Stephanie Simon and Michelle Diamond (Filing fee \$ 400, receipt number 0648-5558281) by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Michelle Diamond Certificate of Good Standing, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Stephanie Simon Certificate of Good Standing) (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 06/30/2016)
07/01/2016		NOTICE of Hearing: Please be aware that a Discovery Conference is set for 7/5/2016 at 11:30 AM by teleconference before Judge Michael R. Barrett; <b>parties shall refer to <u>13</u> Notice of Telephone Conference for conferencing instructions.</b> Should counsel wish to submit information for the Court's review (i.e., protective order), prior to the 11:30 am status conference on 7/5/16, it can be emailed to barrett_chambers@ohsd.uscourts.gov (ba) (Entered: 07/01/2016)
07/05/2016		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Michael R. Barrett: Discovery Conference held on 7/5/2016; Jennifer Branch, Allen Schoenfeld, and Michelle Diamond appeared for Plaintiff; Ryan Richardson and Tiffany Carwile appeared for Defendant; plaintiff to file a motion for protective order noting defendant's objections. (ba) (Entered: 07/05/2016)
07/05/2016	<u>24</u>	MOTION for Protective Order by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order) (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/05/2016)
07/05/2016	<u>25</u>	PROTECTIVE ORDER REGARDING DISCLOSURE AND USE OF DISCOVERY MATERIALS. Signed by Judge Michael R. Barrett on 7/5/16. (ba) (Entered: 07/05/2016)
07/06/2016	<u>26</u>	ORDER granting <u>23</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice of Stephanie Simon and Michelle Diamond for Plaintiffs. Signed by Judge Michael R. Barrett on 7/5/16. (ba) (Entered: 07/06/2016)
07/07/2016	<u>27</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Steven T Voigt for Defendant Richard Hodges (Voigt, Steven) (Entered: 07/07/2016)
07/07/2016	<u>28</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice of John Sprangers (Filing fee \$ 200, receipt number 0648-5566237) by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing for John Sprangers) (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/07/2016)
07/08/2016	<u>29</u>	ORDER granting <u>28</u> Motion for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice of John Sprangers for Plaintiffs. Signed by Judge Michael R. Barrett on 7/8/16. (ba) (Entered: 07/08/2016)
07/11/2016		NOTICE of Hearing: Please be aware that a Status Conference is set for 7/12/2016 at 03:30 PM by teleconference before Judge Michael R. Barrett; <b>parties shall refer to <u>13</u> Notice of Telephone Conference for conferencing instructions.</b> (ba) (Entered: 07/11/2016)
07/12/2016		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Michael R. Barrett: Status Conference held on 7/12/2016; Paul Wolfson, Jennifer Branch and Michelle Diamond appeared for Plaintiff; Ryan Richardson appeared for Defendant; opening brief deadlines as to <u>7</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction are modified as follows: Responses due by 7/18/2016; Replies due by 7/27/2016; additional pleadings due 7/18/16; responses due 7/20/16 and replies are optional and would be due 7/22/16; case to proceed with hearing re <u>7</u> Motion for Preliminary Injunction hearing set 8/2/16 at 10:00 am, Courtroom 109. (ba) (Entered: 07/13/2016)

07/15/2016	<u>30</u>	MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages <i>Joint Motion to File Briefs in Excess of 20 Pages</i> by Defendant Richard Hodges. Responses due by 8/8/2016 (Richardson, Ryan) (Entered: 07/15/2016)
07/18/2016	<u>31</u>	ORDER granting <u>30</u> Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages. Signed by Judge Michael R. Barrett on 7/18/16. (ba) (Entered: 07/18/2016)
07/18/2016	<u>32</u>	NOTICE by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region of <i>Manual Filing of January 27, 2016 Senate Floor Debate</i> (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/18/2016)
07/18/2016		NOTICE re <u>32</u> Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region of Manual Filing of January 27, 2016 Senate Floor Debate. DVD was received and sent to Chambers of Judge Michael R. Barrett. (jlw) (Entered: 07/18/2016)
07/18/2016	<u>33</u>	MOTION to Clarify <u>19</u> Order on Motion for TRO by Defendant Richard Hodges. Responses due by 8/11/2016 (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A Declaration of Henry Lustig) (Richardson, Ryan) (Entered: 07/18/2016)
07/18/2016	<u>34</u>	MOTION in Limine to <i>Exclude Plaintiffs' Expert Report of Dr. Stanley K. Henshaw</i> by Defendant Richard Hodges. Responses due by 8/11/2016 (Richardson, Ryan) (Entered: 07/18/2016)
07/18/2016	<u>35</u>	DEPOSITION of PPGOH Diego Espino, Barbara Singhaus and Iris Harvey taken on July 8, 2016 by Defendant Richard Hodges. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Errata, # <u>2</u> Exhibit) (Carwile, Tiffany) (Entered: 07/18/2016)
07/18/2016	<u>36</u>	TRIAL BRIEF by Defendant Richard Hodges. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A PPSWO Annual report, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B PPGOH Annual report, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C – PPSWO Interrogatories, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D – PPGOH Interrogatories) (Richardson, Ryan) (Entered: 07/18/2016)
07/18/2016	<u>37</u>	SEALED DEPOSITION of PPSWO Jerry Lawson and Lee Bower taken on July 6, 2016 by Defendant Richard Hodges. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Errata) (Carwile, Tiffany) (Entered: 07/18/2016)
07/18/2016	<u>38</u>	MOTION for Judgment on the Merits and a Permanent Injunction by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. Responses due by 8/11/2016 (Wolfson, Paul) (Entered: 07/18/2016)
07/18/2016	<u>39</u>	BRIEF re <u>38</u> MOTION for Judgment on the Merits and a Permanent Injunction by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Wolfson, Paul) (Entered: 07/18/2016)
07/18/2016	<u>40</u>	AFFIDAVIT in Support re <u>38</u> MOTION for Judgment on the Merits and a Permanent Injunction ( <i>Declaration of Paul R.Q. Wolfson</i> ) filed by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 13, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 14, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 15, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 16, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 17, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 18, # <u>19</u> Exhibit 19, # <u>20</u> Exhibit 20, # <u>21</u> Exhibit 21, # <u>22</u> Exhibit 22, # <u>23</u> Exhibit 23, # <u>24</u> Exhibit 24, # <u>25</u> Exhibit 25, # <u>26</u> Exhibit 26, # <u>27</u> Exhibit 27, # <u>28</u> Exhibit 28, # <u>29</u> Exhibit 29, # <u>30</u> Exhibit 30, # <u>31</u> Exhibit 31, # <u>32</u> Exhibit 32, # <u>33</u> Exhibit 33, # <u>34</u> Exhibit 34) (Wolfson, Paul) (Entered: 07/18/2016)
07/18/2016	<u>41</u>	AFFIDAVIT in Support re <u>38</u> MOTION for Judgment on the Merits and a Permanent Injunction ( <i>Declaration of Terrie Hubbard</i> ) filed by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Wolfson, Paul) (Entered: 07/18/2016)
07/18/2016	<u>42</u>	AFFIDAVIT in Support re <u>38</u> MOTION for Judgment on the Merits and a Permanent Injunction ( <i>Declaration of W.M. Martin Haskell</i> ) filed by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Wolfson, Paul) (Entered: 07/18/2016)
07/18/2016	<u>43</u>	AFFIDAVIT in Support re <u>38</u> MOTION for Judgment on the Merits and a Permanent Injunction ( <i>Declaration of Stanley K. Henshaw, Ph.D.</i> ) filed by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A) (Wolfson, Paul) (Entered: 07/18/2016)



07/18/2016	<u>44</u>	AFFIDAVIT in Support re <u>38</u> MOTION for Judgment on the Merits and a Permanent Injunction ( <i>Third Declaration of Iris E. Harvey</i> ) filed by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Wolfson, Paul) (Entered: 07/18/2016)
07/18/2016	<u>45</u>	AFFIDAVIT in Support re <u>38</u> MOTION for Judgment on the Merits and a Permanent Injunction ( <i>Third Declaration of Jerry H. Lawson</i> ) filed by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Wolfson, Paul) (Entered: 07/18/2016)
07/18/2016	<u>46</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region re <u>41</u> Affidavit in Support of Motion, <u>44</u> Affidavit in Support of Motion, <u>42</u> Affidavit in Support of Motion, <u>38</u> MOTION for Judgment on the Merits and a Permanent Injunction , <u>43</u> Affidavit in Support of Motion, <u>40</u> Affidavit in Support of Motion,,, <u>39</u> Brief, <u>45</u> Affidavit in Support of Motion, (Wolfson, Paul) (Entered: 07/18/2016)
07/20/2016		NOTICE of Hearing on Motion re <u>7</u> Motion for Preliminary Injunction; Please be aware that the Motion Hearing set for 8/2/2016 at 10:00 am is RESET IN TIME ONLY from 10:00 am to 01:00 PM and remains set in Courtroom 109 – Cincinnati before Judge Michael R. Barrett. (ba) (Entered: 07/20/2016)
07/20/2016	<u>47</u>	MOTION for Permanent Injunction by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. Responses due by 8/15/2016 (Wolfson, Paul) (Entered: 07/20/2016)
07/20/2016	<u>48</u>	Amended MOTION in Limine by Defendant Richard Hodges. Responses due by 8/15/2016 (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Depo Transcript of Dr. Henshaw) (Richardson, Ryan) (Entered: 07/20/2016)
07/20/2016	<u>49</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re <u>33</u> MOTION to Clarify <u>19</u> Order on Motion for TRO filed by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit of Diego Espino and Exhibits) (Branch, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/20/2016)
07/25/2016	<u>50</u>	MOTION to Seal Document <u>37</u> Deposition by Defendant Richard Hodges. Responses due by 8/18/2016 (Richardson, Ryan) (Entered: 07/25/2016)
07/25/2016	<u>51</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint, filed by Richard Hodges. (Richardson, Ryan) (Entered: 07/25/2016)
07/27/2016		NOTATIONAL ORDER by Judge Michael R. Barrett on 7/27/16 granting <u>50</u> Motion to Seal Document re <u>37</u> Deposition. (ba) (Entered: 07/27/2016)
07/27/2016	<u>52</u>	ORDER finding as moot <u>15</u> Motion to Dismiss. Signed by Judge Michael R. Barrett on 7/27/16. (ba) (Entered: 07/27/2016)
07/27/2016	<u>53</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>38</u> MOTION for Judgment on the Merits and a Permanent Injunction filed by Defendant Richard Hodges. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A) (Richardson, Ryan) (Entered: 07/27/2016)
07/27/2016	<u>54</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>34</u> MOTION in Limine to Exclude Plaintiffs' Expert Report of Dr. Stanley K. Henshaw filed by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Wolfson, Paul) (Entered: 07/27/2016)
07/27/2016	<u>55</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>47</u> MOTION for Permanent Injunction , <u>38</u> MOTION for Judgment on the Merits and a Permanent Injunction filed by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Wolfson, Paul) (Entered: 07/27/2016)
07/29/2016	<u>56</u>	Objection re <u>25</u> Protective Order to Certain of Plaintiffs' Confidentiality Designations by Defendant Richard Hodges. (Richardson, Ryan) (Entered: 07/29/2016)
08/02/2016	<u>57</u>	Minute Order. Proceedings held before Judge Michael R. Barrett: Motion Hearing held on 8/2/2016 re <u>38</u> and <u>47</u> Motion for Judgment and Permanent Injunction; taking under advisement <u>33</u> Motion to Clairfy; finding as moot <u>34</u> Motion and overruling <u>48</u> Amended MOTION in Limine ; Responses due by 8/5/2016 re <u>56</u> Objection re <u>25</u> Protective Order; Court's decision to follow. (Court Reporter Maryann Maffia,

		Official.) (ba) (Entered: 08/02/2016)
08/02/2016		NOTICE re <u>22</u> Scheduling Order; the TRO will be extended to 8/12/16 at 11:59 pm. (ba) (Entered: 08/02/2016)
08/05/2016	<u>58</u>	Response re <u>56</u> Objection (non motion) to <i>Certain of Plaintiffs' Confidentiality Designations</i> by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. (Wolfson, Paul) (Entered: 08/05/2016)
08/12/2016	<u>59</u>	ORDER denying <u>33</u> Motion to Clairfy. Signed by Judge Michael R. Barrett on 8/12/16. (ba) (Entered: 08/12/2016)
08/12/2016	<u>60</u>	ORDER granting <u>38</u> Motion Preliminary Injunction; granting <u>47</u> Motion for Permanent Injunction; granting <u>7</u> Motion for Preliminary Injunction. Signed by Judge Michael R. Barrett on 8/12/16. (ba) (Entered: 08/12/2016)
08/12/2016	<u>61</u>	CLERK'S JUDGMENT filed concurrently with <u>60</u> Order signed by Judge Michael R. Barrett on 8/12/16. (ba) (Entered: 08/12/2016)
08/16/2016	<u>62</u>	<p>Transcript of Proceedings, Motion for Judgment on the Merits and a Permanent Injunction, held on August 2, 2016, before Judge Michael R. Barrett. Court Reporter/Transcriber Maryann T. Maffia, Telephone number 513-564-7677. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER.</p> <p>NOTICE RE: REDACTION OF TRANSCRIPTS: Within 5 business days of this filing, each party shall inform the Court, by filing a Notice of Redaction, of the party's intent to redact personal data identifiers from the electronic transcript of the court proceeding. The policy is located on our website at <a href="http://www.ohsd.uscourts.gov">www.ohsd.uscourts.gov</a> (Forms – Electronic Availability of Transcripts). Please read this policy carefully.</p> <p>For a complete copy of a transcript, please contact the Court Reporter or the Clerk's Office. Redaction Request due 9/6/2016. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 9/16/2016. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 11/14/2016. (Maffia, Maryann) (Entered: 08/16/2016)</p>
09/06/2016	<u>63</u>	NOTICE OF APPEAL re <u>61</u> Clerk's Judgment, <u>60</u> Order on Motion for Miscellaneous Relief, Order on Motion for Permanent Injunction, Order on Motion for Preliminary Injunction (Filing fee has been paid, receipt number 0648-5643533) by Defendant Richard Hodges. (Richardson, Ryan) (Entered: 09/06/2016)
09/08/2016		USCA Case Number 16-4027 for <u>63</u> Notice of Appeal, filed by Richard Hodges. Case Manager – Louise Schwarber. (sct) (Entered: 09/08/2016)
09/12/2016	<u>64</u>	Unopposed MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Re: Application for Costs and Attorney's Fees</i> , by Plaintiffs Planned Parenthood of Greater Ohio, Planned Parenthood of Southwest Ohio Region. Responses due by 10/6/2016 (Wolfson, Paul) Modified docket text to remove "date requested" text on 9/13/2016 (jee). (Entered: 09/12/2016)
09/19/2016	<u>65</u>	ORDER granting <u>64</u> Motion for Extension of Time to File an Application for costs and Attorney's Fees; Plaintiffs shall file any Application for Costs and Attorneys Fees 45 days after the last judgment rendered by any court in this case becomes final and not subject to further appeal, certiorari, or other judicial review.. Signed by Judge Michael R. Barrett on 9/19/16. (ba) (Entered: 09/19/2016)