

**U.S. District Court  
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:06-cv-15521-SHS**

Clark et al v. Barnhart et al  
Assigned to: Judge Sidney H. Stein  
Case in other court: USCA 2nd Circuit, 08-05801  
Cause: 42:402 Social Security Benefits

Date Filed: 12/28/2006  
Date Terminated: 09/12/2012  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 890 Other Statutory  
Actions  
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff**

**Elaine Clark**  
*individually*  
*TERMINATED: 03/14/2011*

represented by **Bettina Barasch Plevan**  
Proskauer Rose LLP  
11 Times Square  
New York, NY 10036  
(212) 969-3065  
Fax: (212) 969-2900  
Email: [Bplevan@proskauer.com](mailto:Bplevan@proskauer.com)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Steven E. Obus**  
Proskauer Rose LLP  
11 Times Square  
New York, NY 10036  
(212) 969-3525  
Fax: (212) 969-2900  
Email: [sobus@proskauer.com](mailto:sobus@proskauer.com)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Elaine Clark**  
*on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of  
all similarly situated*  
*TERMINATED: 03/14/2011*

represented by **Bettina Barasch Plevan**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Steven E. Obus**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Raymond Giangrosso**  
*individually*

represented by **Bettina Barasch Plevan**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Jennifer Jean Parish**  
Urban Justice Center  
123 William Street, 16th Floor  
New York, NY 10038  
(646) 602-5644  
Fax: (212) 533-4598  
Email: [jparish@urbanjustice.org](mailto:jparish@urbanjustice.org)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Steven E. Obus**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Gerald A. McIntyre**  
National Senior Citizens Law Ctr,  
3435 Wilshire Blvd, #2860

Los Angeles, CA 90010  
(213) 674-2900  
Fax: (213) 639-0934  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Raymond Giangrosso**  
*on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of  
all those similarly situated*

represented by **Bettina Barasch Plevan**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Jennifer Jean Parish**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Steven E. Obus**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Gerald A. McIntyre**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Tony Gonzales**  
*individually*

represented by **Bettina Barasch Plevan**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Jennifer Jean Parish**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Steven E. Obus**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Gerald A. McIntyre**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Tony Gonzales**  
*on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of  
all those similarly situated*

represented by **Bettina Barasch Plevan**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Jennifer Jean Parish**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Steven E. Obus**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Gerald A. McIntyre**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Johnny L. Heatherman**  
*individually*

represented by **Bettina Barasch Plevan**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Jennifer Jean Parish**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Steven E. Obus**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Gerald A. McIntyre**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Johnny L. Heatherman**  
*on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of*  
*all those similarly situated*

represented by **Bettina Barasch Plevan**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Jennifer Jean Parish**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Steven E. Obus**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Gerald A. McIntyre**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Monell White**  
*individually*

represented by **Bettina Barasch Plevan**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Jennifer Jean Parish**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Steven E. Obus**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Gerald A. McIntyre**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Monell White**  
*on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of*  
*all those similarly situated*

represented by **Bettina Barasch Plevan**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Jennifer Jean Parish**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Steven E. Obus**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Gerald A. McIntyre**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Ryan Clark**

represented by **Bettina Barasch Plevan**  
Proskauer Rose LLP (NY)  
11 Times Square  
New York, NY 10036  
(212) 969-3065  
Fax: (212) 969-2900  
Email: [Bplevan@proskauer.com](mailto:Bplevan@proskauer.com)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Jennifer Jean Parish**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Steven E. Obus**  
Proskauer Rose LLP (NY)  
11 Times Square  
New York, NY 10036  
(212) 969-3525  
Fax: (212) 969-2900  
Email: [sobus@proskauer.com](mailto:sobus@proskauer.com)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Gerald A. McIntyre**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Joy Jordan**

represented by **Bettina Barasch Plevan**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Jennifer Jean Parish**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Steven E. Obus**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Gerald A. McIntyre**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

**Defendant**

**Commissioner Michael J. Astrue**  
*of the Social Security Administration, in  
 his official capacity*

**Defendant**

**Social Security Administration**  
*TERMINATED: 03/08/2007*

represented by **Sean Chance Cenawood**  
 U.S. Attorney's Office, SDNY (86  
 Chambers St.)  
 86 Chambers Street  
 New York, NY 10007  
 212-637-2200  
 Fax: 212-637-2717  
 Email: [Sean.Cenawood@usdoj.gov](mailto:Sean.Cenawood@usdoj.gov)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
12/28/2006	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Jo Anne B. Barnhart, Social Security Administration. (Filing Fee \$ 350.00, Receipt Number 601283) Document filed by Raymond Giangrasso (on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Tony Gonzales (individually), Tony Gonzales (on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman (individually), Johnny L. Heatherman (on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White (individually), Monell White (on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Elaine Clark (individually), Elaine Clark (on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso (individually). (mbe, ) Additional attachment(s) added on 1/4/2007 (laq, ). (Entered: 12/29/2006)
12/28/2006		SUMMONS ISSUED as to Jo Anne B. Barnhart, Social Security Administration, U.S. Attorney and U.S. Attorney General. (mbe, ) (Entered: 12/29/2006)
12/28/2006		Magistrate Judge Ronald L. Ellis is so designated. (mbe, ) (Entered: 12/29/2006)
01/04/2007	<u>2</u>	FILING ERROR – ELECTRONIC FILING IN NON-ECF CASE – AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,, Jo Anne B. Barnhart served on 12/29/2006, answer due 1/18/2007; Social Security Administration served on 12/29/2006, answer due 1/18/2007. Service was accepted by Kim Sciro, Esq., Office of the General Counsel, Chief Counsel, Region II, Social Security Administration. Service was made by Certified Mail on Jo Anne Barnhart, Commissioner, Social Security Administration. Document filed by Raymond Giangrasso (on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated); Tony Gonzales (individually); Tony Gonzales (on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated); Johnny L. Heatherman (individually); Johnny L. Heatherman (on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated); Monell White (individually); Monell White (on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated); Elaine Clark (individually); Elaine Clark (on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all similarly situated); Raymond Giangrasso (individually). (Plevan, Bettina) Modified on 2/22/2007 (lb). (Entered: 01/04/2007)
01/10/2007	22	UNSIGNED ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE, Temporary Restraining Order, and Order Granting Expedited Discovery. (jmi) Modified on 3/6/2007 (jm). Modified on 3/6/2007 (Entered: 03/06/2007)
01/17/2007	3	ORDER: It is hereby ordered that defendants shall respond to the plaintiffs' motion for a preliminary injunction and temporary restraining order on or before 2/2/2007; and the plaintiffs shall reply to the motion on or before 2/6/2007. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 1/16/2007) (lb) (Entered: 01/18/2007)
02/02/2007	6	ANSWER to Complaint. Document filed by Social Security Administration. (js) (Entered: 02/06/2007)

02/02/2007	7	MOTION for Summary Judgment dismissing the complaint purs to FRCP 56. Document filed by Social Security Administration.(cd) (Entered: 02/06/2007)
02/02/2007	8	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 7 MOTION for Summary Judgment. Document filed by Social Security Administration. (cd) (Entered: 02/06/2007)
02/06/2007	4	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 1/16/07 before Judge Sidney H. Stein. (jbe) (Entered: 02/06/2007)
02/06/2007	5	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 1/16/07 before Judge Sidney H. Stein. (jbe) (Entered: 02/06/2007)
02/06/2007	9	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from John E. Gura Jr. dated 2/2/2007 re: to we write respectfully to request permission to sudmit a brief exceeding this Court's generally-applicable page limit for memoranda of law by thirty-one pages. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 2/5/2007) (jmi) (Entered: 02/07/2007)
02/06/2007	10	ORDER Replies due by 2/13/2007., Oral Argument set for 2/22/2007 03:00 PM before Judge Sidney H. Stein. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 2/5/2007) (jmi) (Entered: 02/07/2007)
02/14/2007	11	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from Russell L. Hirschorn dated 2/12/2007 re: to the reply memorandum willbe approximately fifteen pages.ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 2/13/2007) (jmi) (Entered: 02/20/2007)
02/20/2007	12	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support of Plaintiffs' Application for a Temporary Restraining Order, Preliminary Injunction and Expedited Discovery. Document filed by Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually), Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Elaine Clark(individually), Elaine Clark(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually). (jmi) (Entered: 02/27/2007)
02/22/2007		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT - NON-ECF CASE ERROR. Note to Attorney Bettina Barasch Plevan to MANUALLY RE-FILE Document AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE, Document No. 2. This case is not ECF. (lb) (Entered: 02/22/2007)
02/26/2007	14	DECLARATION of Raymond Glangrasso. Document filed by Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually), Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Elaine Clark(individually), Elaine Clark(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually). (jmi) (Entered: 03/02/2007)
02/26/2007	15	DECLARATION of Tony Gonzales. Document filed by Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually), Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Elaine Clark(individually), Elaine Clark(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually). (jmi) (Entered: 03/02/2007)
02/26/2007	16	DECLARATION of Johnny L. Heatherman. Document filed by Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated),

		Monell White(individually), Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Elaine Clark(individually), Elaine Clark(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually). (jmi) (Entered: 03/02/2007)
02/26/2007	17	DECLARATION of Monell White. Document filed by Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually), Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Elaine Clark(individually), Elaine Clark(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually). (jmi) (Entered: 03/02/2007)
02/26/2007	18	DECLARATION of Elaine Clark. Document filed by Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually), Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Elaine Clark(individually), Elaine Clark(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually). (jmi) (Entered: 03/02/2007)
02/26/2007	19	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support of Plaintiffs' Application for a Preliminary Injunction, A Temporary Restraining Order and Expedited Discovery. Document filed by Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually), Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Elaine Clark(individually), Elaine Clark(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually). (jmi) (Entered: 03/02/2007)
02/26/2007	20	DECLARATION of Bettina B. Plevan in Support of Plaintiffs' Expedited Discovery. Document filed by Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually), Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Elaine Clark(individually), Elaine Clark(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually). (jmi) (Entered: 03/02/2007)
02/28/2007	13	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint. Service was accepted by Ms. Orlavia Hines. Service was made by Certified Mail # 7005 1160 0004 7352 0748 to General Counsel, Certified Mail # 7005 1160 0004 7352 0731 to Jo Annw B. Barnhardt, Certified Mail # 7005 1160 0004 7352 0809 to the Attorney General of the United States, and Certified Mail # 7005 1160 0004 7352 0816 to Office of the General Counsel (ALL) on 12/29/06. Document filed by Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually), Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Elaine Clark(individually), Elaine Clark(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually). (db) (Entered: 03/01/2007)
02/28/2007	21	ORDER that for the reasons set forth on the record, plaintiffs' request for a temporary restraining order pending determination its motion for a preliminary injunction is denied. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 2/26/2007) (jmi) (Entered: 03/02/2007)

03/08/2007	<u>23</u>	OPINION AND ORDER # 94377: as set forth above, plaintiffs have not demonstrated a likelihood of success on the merits and plaintiffs' motion for a preliminary injunction is therefore DENIED. So ordered. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 3/8/07) (js) Modified on 3/12/2007 (rw). (Entered: 03/09/2007)
03/08/2007	25	ORDER...Brief in opposition due by 5/4/2007.,Discovery due by 4/20/2007.,Replies due by 5/18/2007. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 3/8/2007) (jmi) (Entered: 03/12/2007)
03/09/2007	24	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 2/26/07 before Judge Sidney H. Stein. (jbe) (Entered: 03/09/2007)
03/19/2007	26	ORDER that the following typographical errors in that order shall be corrected: after the first block quote on page nine of the order "24 U.S.C." should be "42 U.S.C."; in the second sentence of the last paragraph of page ten of the order, "43 U.S.C." is used twice. Both Citations should be "42 U.S.C."; in the first sentence of the second full paragraph of page eleven of the order, the second consecutive use of the work "that" should be deleted. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 3/16/07) (dle) (Entered: 03/20/2007)
03/28/2007	27	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 2/26/07 before Judge Sidney H. Stein. (jbe) (Entered: 03/28/2007)
03/28/2007	28	REVISED SCHEDULING ORDER:Replies due by 6/18/2007.,Discovery due by 5/21/2007. Plaintiff's brief in opposition to Defendants motion for summary judgment is to be submitted on or before 6/4/07. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 3/27/07) (js) (Entered: 03/29/2007)
05/02/2007	<u>29</u>	NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Jennifer Jean Parish on behalf of all plaintiffs. New Address: Urban Justice Center, 123 William Street, 16th floor, New York, NY, USA 10038, (646) 602-5644. (Parish, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/02/2007)
05/22/2007	<u>30</u>	REVISED SCHEDULING ORDER:Responses due by 6/29/2007,Replies due by 7/16/2007.,Discovery due by 6/15/2007. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 5/22/2007) (jmi) Modified on 5/23/2007 (Miles, Janeen). (Entered: 05/23/2007)
06/11/2007	<u>31</u>	REVISED SCHEDULING ORDER: Discovery due by 7/13/2007,Plaintiffs' Brief in Opposition due by 7/27/2007, Defendant's Replies Brief due by 8/10/2007. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 6/11/2007) (jmi) (Entered: 06/12/2007)
07/13/2007	32	REVISED SCHEDULING ORDER: Discovery due by 8/24/2007,Responses due by 9/14/2007,Replies due by 10/5/2007. SO ORDERED (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 7/12/2007) (jmi) (Entered: 07/17/2007)
08/07/2007	33	ORDER dismissing 7 Motion for Summary Judgment without prejudice to defendant to refile this motion in its entirety on or before October 5, 2007; and There will be no further extensions of the briefing schedule. SO ORDERED (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 8/6/2007) (jmi) (Entered: 08/09/2007)
08/16/2007	34	STIPULATED PROTECTIVE (CONFIDENTIALITY) ORDER...regarding procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of confidential material... (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 8/15/07) (cd) (Entered: 08/16/2007)
10/12/2007	35	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from John E. Gura, Jr. dated 10/5/07 re: The parties request the following breifing schedule – Plaintiffs' opposition to the Government's Motion due 11/16/07 and Government's reply due 12/7/07. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment dated 2/2/07 is deemed renewed on 10/5/07. Set Deadlines as to Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment: Responses due by 11/16/2007,Replies due by 12/7/2007. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 10/9/07) (db) (Entered: 10/12/2007)
11/16/2007	39	MOTION for Summary Judgment purs to ruld 56 of the FRCP. Attached is 56.1 Statement and Rauch Declaration. Document filed by Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated),



		Monell White(individually), Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Elaine Clark(individually), Elaine Clark(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually). (document received in night dep. on 11/16/07 at 6:46 p.m.)(djc) (Entered: 11/20/2007)
11/16/2007	40	DECLARATION of Elon Harpa. (djc) (Entered: 11/20/2007)
11/16/2007	41	DECLARATION of Laura Green. (djc) (Entered: 11/20/2007)
11/16/2007	42	DECLARATION of Valerie R. Arbie-McClelland. (djc) (Entered: 11/20/2007)
11/16/2007	43	DECLARATION of Bill White. (djc) (Entered: 11/20/2007)
11/16/2007	44	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition to Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment and in Support of Plaintiff's 39 MOTION for Summary Judgment. Document filed by Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually), Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Elaine Clark(individually), Elaine Clark(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually). (djc) (Entered: 11/20/2007)
11/16/2007	45	RESPONSE to Defendant's Statement of Undisputed Facts Pursuant to Local Rule 56.1. Document filed by Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually), Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Elaine Clark(individually), Elaine Clark(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually). (djc) (Entered: 11/20/2007)
11/26/2007	<u>46</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from Russell L. Hirschhorn dated 11/26/07 re: a request for an extension of time until 12/28/2007 to submit reply papers in support of the motion for summary judgment. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 11/26/07) (kco) (Entered: 11/27/2007)
12/13/2007	47	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from John E. Gura dated 12/6/07 re: counsel for defendant requests an adjournment of this Court's scheduling order making defendant's reply brief due by 1/10/08 and plaintiff's reply due by 1/31/08. ENDORSEMENT: This maintains the 3 week period that existed previously plaintiff to file their reply. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 12/10/07) (dle) (Entered: 12/17/2007)
01/14/2008	<u>48</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from John E. Gura, Jr. dated 1/8/2008 re: request for an adjournment on Cross-motions for Summary Judgment making defendant's reply brief due by 1/24/2007 and plaintiffs' reply due by 2/14/2008. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 1/14/2008) (jar) (Entered: 01/14/2008)
01/24/2008	<u>49</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Sidney H. Stein from John E. Gura dated 1/23/08 re: The Commissioner of Social Security, the defendant in this action. We write to request a two week adjournment of the Court's scheduling order. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 1/24/08) (js) (Entered: 01/25/2008)
02/08/2008	<u>50</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from Sean Cenawood dated 2/7/08 re: Defendant request to extend time to submit its response to its summary judgment motion/reply (to plaintiffs' cross motion for summary judgment) brief from 2/7/08 to 2/11/08. ENDORSEMENT: So ordered. Set Deadlines/Hearing as to 39 MOTION for Summary Judgment.( Reply due by 2/11/2008. Responses due by 2/11/2008) (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 2/8/08) (cd) (Entered: 02/08/2008)
02/12/2008	51	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support of Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment and in Opposition to Plaintiff's 39 MOTION for Summary Judgment.

		Document filed by Michael J. Astrue. (dj) (Entered: 02/14/2008)
03/13/2008	52	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Summary Judgment. Document filed by Tony Gonzales(individually), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Monell White(individually), Elaine Clark(individually), Raymond Giangrasso(individually). (dj) (Entered: 03/14/2008)
03/13/2008	53	SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION of Brian S. Rauch of information based on personal knowledge and a review of documents relevant to this case. Document filed by Tony Gonzales(individually), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Monell White(individually), Elaine Clark(individually), Raymond Giangrasso(individually). (dj) (Entered: 03/14/2008)
09/22/2008	<u>54</u>	OPINION AND ORDER # 96538: Plaintiffs have failed to establish that the SSI and OASDI suspension provisions or the SSI Regulation permit suspension of Social Security benefits only after an individual has been formally adjudicated to have violated a condition of probation or parole. The SSA's practice of suspending benefits upon a warrant based on probable cause is consistent with the statute and regulation and with Second Circuit precedent and is entitled to deference by this Court. Because the practice is lawful, this Court may not substitute its own policy judgment for the SSA's policy judgment. Accordingly, the SSA's motion for summary judgment is granted and plaintiffs' cross-motion for summary judgment is denied. The Clerk of Court is directed to enter judgment in defendant's favor. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 9/22/2008) (rw) Modified on 9/25/2008 (jab). (Entered: 09/23/2008)
09/22/2008		Transmission to Judgments and Orders Clerk. Transmitted re: <u>54</u> Order on Motion for Summary Judgment, to the Judgments and Orders Clerk. (rw) (Entered: 09/23/2008)
09/23/2008	<u>55</u>	CLERK'S JUDGMENT That for the reasons stated in the Court's Opinion and Order dated September 22, 2008, defendants motion for summary judgment is granted and plaintiffs cross-motion for summary judgment is denied; accordingly, the case is closed. (Signed by J. Michael McMahon, clerk on 9/23/08) (Attachments: # <u>1</u> notice of right to appeal)(ml) (Entered: 09/23/2008)
09/23/2008		Mailed notice of Right to Appeal to Attorney(s) of Record: Sean Chance Cenawood, Steven E. Obus, Bettina Barasch Plevan. (mro) (Entered: 09/29/2008)
10/08/2008	56	LETTER addressed to Judge Stein from John E. Gura, Jr. dated 9/9/08 re: response to plaintiffs'letter dated August 19, 2008. Document filed by Michael J. Astrue.(dj) (Entered: 10/08/2008)
10/08/2008	57	LETTER addressed to Judge Stein from Brian S. Rauch dated 8/19/08 re: counsel writes to bring to the court's attention two Administrative Law Judge decisions. Document filed by Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually), Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Elaine Clark(individually), Elaine Clark(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually).(dj) (Entered: 10/08/2008)
11/21/2008	58	NOTICE OF APPEAL from <u>54</u> Order on Motion for Summary Judgment. Document filed by Tony Gonzales(individually), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Monell White(individually), Elaine Clark(individually), Raymond Giangrasso(individually). Filing fee \$ 455.00, receipt number E 670527. Copies of Notice of Appeal mailed to attorney(s) of record: A.U.S.A. (nd) (Entered: 11/24/2008)
11/24/2008		Transmission of Notice of Appeal to the District Judge re: 58 Notice of Appeal. (nd) (Entered: 11/24/2008)
11/24/2008		Transmission of Notice of Appeal and Certified Copy of Docket Sheet to US Court of Appeals re: 58 Notice of Appeal,. (nd) (Entered: 11/24/2008)
01/21/2009	<u>59</u>	Appeal Record Sent to USCA (Index). Notice that the Original index to the record on Appeal for 58 Notice of Appeal, filed by Tony Gonzales, Johnny L. Heatherman, Elaine Clark, Monell White, Raymond Giangrasso USCA Case Number 08-5801, 3 Copies of the index, Certified Clerk Certificate and Certified Docket Sheet were

		transmitted to the U.S. Court of Appeals. (tp) (tp). (Entered: 01/21/2009)
01/27/2009		USCA Case Number 08-5801 from the USCA 2nd Circuit assigned to 58 Notice of Appeal, filed by Tony Gonzales, Johnny L. Heatherman, Elaine Clark, Monell White, Raymond Giangrasso. (tp) (Entered: 01/27/2009)
01/27/2009		First Supplemental ROA Sent to USCA (Electronic File). Certified Supplemental Indexed record on Appeal Electronic Files for <u>59</u> Appeal Record Sent to USCA – Index, <u>49</u> Endorsed Letter, Set Deadlines/Hearings, <u>29</u> Notice of Change of Address filed by Tony Gonzales, Johnny L. Heatherman, Elaine Clark, Monell White, Raymond Giangrasso USCA Case Number 08-5801, were transmitted to the U.S. Court of Appeals. (tp) (Entered: 01/27/2009)
06/17/2010	<u>60</u>	MANDATE of USCA (Certified Copy) as to 58 Notice of Appeal, filed by Tony Gonzales, Johnny L. Heatherman, Elaine Clark, Monell White, Raymond Giangrasso USCA Case Number 08-5801-cv. Ordered, Adjudged and Decreed that the judgment of the District Court is VACATED and the case is REMANDED in accordance with the opinion of this Court. Catherine O'Hagan Wolfe, Clerk USCA. Issued As Mandate: 06/17/2010. (nd) (Entered: 06/17/2010)
06/17/2010		Transmission of USCA Mandate/Order to the District Judge re: <u>60</u> USCA Mandate,. (nd) (Entered: 06/17/2010)
06/22/2010	61	MOTION to Substitute Party pursuant to Rule 25(a). Old Party: Elaine Clark (deceased), New Party: Ryan Clark and Joy Jordan. Document filed by the plaintiffs.(mro) (Entered: 06/23/2010)
06/22/2010	62	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 61 MOTION to Substitute Party. Old Party: Elaine Clark, New Party: Ryan Clark and Joy Jordan. Document filed by the plaintiffs. (mro) (Entered: 06/23/2010)
06/22/2010	63	MOTION to Certify Class pursuant to Rule 23 of the FRCP. Document filed by Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually), Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Elaine Clark(individually), Elaine Clark(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually).(mro) (Entered: 06/23/2010)
06/22/2010	64	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 63 MOTION to Certify Class. Document filed by Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually), Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Elaine Clark(individually), Elaine Clark(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually). (mro) (Entered: 06/23/2010)
07/02/2010	<u>65</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from John E. Gura, Jr dated 7/2/2010 re: Counsel respectfully request an adjournment of the Government's time to oppose or otherwise respond to plaintiffs' motion for class certification and motion to substitute to 8/17/2010, and plaintiff's time to reply to the Government's opposition papers until 10/4/2010. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 7/2/2010) (jfe) Modified on 7/14/2010 (jfe). (Entered: 07/02/2010)
07/14/2010		Set/Reset Deadlines as to 61 MOTION to Substitute Party. Old Party: Elaine Clark, New Party: Ryan Clark and Joy Jordan., 63 MOTION to Certify Class.. Responses due by 8/17/2010 (jfe) (Entered: 07/14/2010)
08/16/2010	<u>66</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from John E. Gura, Jr. dated 8/13/10 re: Counsel for defendant respectfully request that the Court extend the Government's time to oppose or otherwise respond to plaintiffs motion for class certification and motion to substitute one week, to August 24, 2010, and also requests a one week adjournment for plaintiff's reply which would be due by October 12, 2010.

		ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 8/16/10) (pl) (Entered: 08/17/2010)
08/26/2010	<u>67</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from John E. Gura, Jr., dated 8/23/10 re: counsel requests that the Court extend the Government's time to oppose or otherwise respond to plaintiffs' motion for class certification and motion to substitute to September 2, 2010; and requests that Plaintiff's reply be due by 10/21/10. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 8/26/10) (djc) Modified on 8/27/2010 (djc). (Entered: 08/26/2010)
08/26/2010		Set/Reset Deadlines as to 61 MOTION to Substitute Party. Old Party: Elaine Clark, New Party: Ryan Clark and Joy Jordan, 63 MOTION to Certify Class. Responses due by 9/2/2010; Replies due by 10/21/2010. (djc) (Entered: 08/26/2010)
09/02/2010	68	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 63 MOTION to Certify Class. Document filed by Michael J. Astrue. (mbe) (Entered: 09/07/2010)
10/19/2010	<u>69</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from Steven E. Obus dated 10/19/10 re: counsel requests a two–page extension for their Reply Brief in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification, which is due Thursday, October 21, 2010. ENDORSEMENT: Request granted. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 10/19/10) (djc) Modified on 10/20/2010 (djc). (Entered: 10/19/2010)
10/21/2010	70	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 63 MOTION to Certify Class. Document filed by Elaine Clark(individually), Elaine Clark(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually). (mbe) (Entered: 10/22/2010)
12/22/2010	<u>71</u>	NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Russell Laurence Hirschhorn on behalf of Elaine Clark(individually), Elaine Clark(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually). New Address: Proskauer Rose LLP, Eleven Time Square, New York, NY, USA 10036–8299, 2129693000. (Hirschhorn, Russell) (Entered: 12/22/2010)
03/14/2011	<u>72</u>	ORDER granting 61 Motion to Substitute Party. Ryan Clark and Joy Jordan added. Elaine Clark, Elaine Clark, Elaine Clark and Elaine Clark terminated. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 3/14/11) (cd) (Entered: 03/14/2011)
03/18/2011	<u>73</u>	OPINION & ORDER, #100055 the Court grants plaintiffs' motion for class certification and hereby certifies the following class: All persons nationwide whose SSI and/or OASDI benefits were denied and/or suspended based solely on the existence of a warrant for an alleged violation of probation or parole during the period from October 29, 2006 to and including such time in the future when final relief is entered in this action. Plaintiffs Johnny L. Heatherman, Ryan Clark and Joy Jordan are to serve as representatives of this class and Betina B. Plevan, Steven E. Obus, Jennifer J. Parish and Gerald A. McIntyre are appointed as class counsel. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 3/18/2011) (lnl) Modified on 3/28/2011 (ajc). (Entered: 03/18/2011)
03/23/2011	74	MOTION for Clarification and/or Reconsideration of the Court's 3/18/2011 Opinion and Order. Document filed by Ryan Clark, Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Joy Jordan, Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually).(mbe) (Entered: 03/24/2011)

03/23/2011	75	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 74 Motion for Clarification and/or Reconsideration of the Court's 3/18/2011 Opinion and Order.. Document filed by Ryan Clark, Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Joy Jordan, Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually). (mbe) (Entered: 03/24/2011)
04/06/2011	<u>76</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from John E. Gura, Jr., dated 4/5/2011, re: Counsel for Commissioner of Social Security, the defendant writes to request that the Court extend the Government's time to oppose or otherwise respond to the plaintiffs' motion to April 15, 2011. Plaintiffs do not object to requested adjournment. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. Set Deadline as to 74 MOTION for Reconsideration: Response due by 4/15/2011. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 4/6/2011) (Inl) (Entered: 04/06/2011)
04/08/2011	77	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Jennifer Jean Parish on behalf of Ryan Clark, Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Joy Jordan, Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually) (mbe) (Entered: 04/11/2011)
04/15/2011	78	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Reconsideration of the Court's Order. Document filed by Michael J. Astrue. (mbe) (Entered: 04/18/2011)
04/20/2011	79	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Clarification and/or Reconsideration of the Court's 3/18/2011 Opinion and Order. Document filed by Ryan Clark, Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Joy Jordan, Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually). (mbe) (Entered: 04/21/2011)
04/20/2011	80	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Gerald A. McIntyre on behalf of Ryan Clark, Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Joy Jordan, Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually) *Staff Note: Accepted for filing by the Chambers of Judge Sidney H. Stein on 4/20/2011.* (tro) (Entered: 04/25/2011)
04/29/2011	<u>81</u>	Letter addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from John E. Gura, Jr., dated 4/27/2011, re: This Office represents the Commissioner of Social Security, the defendant in this action. We write respectfully to request that the Court consider this surreply to address a factual inaccuracy that is contained in the Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Clarification and/or Reconsideration of the Court's March 18, 2011 Opinion and Order ("Pl. Rep."). (Inl) (Entered: 04/29/2011)
11/23/2011		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Sidney H. Stein: pretrial Conference held on 11/23/2011. (lab) (Entered: 11/23/2011)
12/02/2011	<u>82</u>	Letter addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from John E. Gura, Jr. dated 11/30/2011 re: We write respectfully to advise the Court of the Social Security Administration's position regarding the class definition that was proposed by the Court at the conference held on November 23, 2011. Document filed by Social Security Administration.(lmb) (Entered: 12/02/2011)

12/02/2011	<u>83</u>	ORDER granting 74 Motion for Reconsideration re <u>73</u> Memorandum & Opinion. The Court therefore grants plaintiffs' motion for clarification (Dkt. No. 74) and amends the prior certification order to certify the following class: All persons nationwide for whom an initial determination to suspend or deny SSI and/or OASDI benefits was made and/or an initial determination of overpayment of such benefits was made and such initial determination was based solely on the existence of a warrant for an alleged violation of probation or parole, provided: (i) the initial determination was made during the period from October 24, 2006 to and including such time in the future when final relief is entered in this action; or (ii) a timely administrative appeal of such initial determination was pending on or after October 24, 2006. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 12/2/2011) (lmb) (Entered: 12/02/2011)
02/09/2012	<u>84</u>	ORDER: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the next pretrial conference will be held on March 13, 2012, at 12:30 in the afternoon in Courtroom 23A. Pretrial Conference set for 3/13/2012 at 12:30 PM in Courtroom 23A, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Sidney H. Stein. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 2/9/2012) (rdz) (Entered: 02/09/2012)
02/09/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Sidney H. Stein: Telephone Conference held on 2/9/2012. (lab) (Entered: 02/14/2012)
03/12/2012	<u>85</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from Brian S. Rauch dated 3/9/2012 re: counsel for plaintiffs request that the conference scheduled for March 13 be adjourned to provide the parties with additional time to negotiate a final order. ENDORSEMENT: March 13 conf. adjourned to April 5 at 9 AM., ( Pretrial Conference set for 4/5/2012 at 09:00 AM before Judge Sidney H. Stein.) (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 3/9/2012) (pl) (Entered: 03/12/2012)
04/05/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Sidney H. Stein: Telephone Conference held on 4/5/2012. (lab) (Entered: 04/05/2012)
04/13/2012	<u>86</u>	ORDER: In an opinion dated March 19,2010, the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit held that the "the Social Security Administration's practice of treating a warrant alleging that a recipient is violating a condition of probation or parole as sufficient and irrebuttable evidence that the recipient is in fact violating a condition of probation or parole is inconsistent with the plain meaning of the Social Security Act." Clark v. Astrue, 602 F.3d 140 (2d Cir. 2010). This Court subsequently certified a class defined as "All persons nationwide for whom an initial determination to suspend or deny SSI and/or OASDI benefits was made and/or an initial determination of overpayment of such benefits was made and such initial determination was based solely on the existence of a warrant for an alleged violation of probation or parole, provided: (i) the initial determination was made during the period from October 24, 2006 to and including such time in the future when final relief is entered in this action; or (ii) a timely administrative appeal of such initial determination was pending on or after October 24, 2006." Accordingly, it is hereby ORDERED, ADJUDGED AND DECREED as set forth herein. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 4/13/2012) (djc) (Entered: 04/13/2012)
05/14/2012	87	NOTICE OF MOTION for an Order, pursuant to the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. 2412, awarding attorneys' fees. Document filed by Ryan Clark, Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Joy Jordan, Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually).(lmb) (Entered: 05/15/2012)
05/14/2012	88	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 87 NOTICE OF MOTION for an Order, pursuant to the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. 2412, awarding attorneys' fees. Document filed by Ryan Clark, Raymond Giangrasso(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Raymond Giangrasso(individually), Tony Gonzales(individually), Tony Gonzales(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Johnny L. Heatherman(individually), Joy Jordan, Monell White(on behalf of themselves, and on behalf of all those similarly situated), Monell White(individually).(lmb) (Entered: 05/15/2012)

05/25/2012	<u>89</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from John E. Gura, Jr. dated 5/25/2012 re: Counsel for the defendant requests that the Government's opposition to plaintiffs' fee request be adjourned until June 29, 2012. Any reply is due July 13, 2012. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Responses due by 6/29/2012, Replies due by 7/13/2012.) (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 5/25/2012) (ft) (Entered: 05/25/2012)
06/12/2012	<u>90</u>	Letter addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from John E. Gura dated 6/08/2012 re: This Office represents the Commissioner of Social Security, the defendant in this action. As provided in the Court's April 13, 2012 order, we are submitting the Commissioner's plan and time frames for implementing relief to the class. Document filed by Social Security Administration.(ama) (Entered: 06/12/2012)
06/28/2012	<u>91</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from John E. Gura, Jr. dated 6/27/12 re: Counsel for the Government requests that the Government's opposition to plaintiffs' fee request be adjourned until 7/20/12. ENDORSEMENT: Any reply by plaintiffs is due August 3, 2012. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 6/28/2012) (mro) (Entered: 06/28/2012)
06/28/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines as to 87 MOTION for Attorney Fees: Responses due by 7/20/2012 Replies due by 8/3/2012. (mro) (Entered: 06/28/2012)
07/20/2012	<u>92</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from John E. Gura, Jr. dated 7/19/2012 re: Counsel for Defendant requests that the Government's opposition to plaintiffs' fee request be adjourned until August 10, 2012. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered., ( Responses due by 8/10/2012) (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 7/19/2012) (pl) Modified on 7/26/2012 (pl). (Entered: 07/20/2012)
08/10/2012	<u>93</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from John E. Gura, Jr. dated 8/9/2012 re: Counsel for Defendants write respectfully to request an adjournment until August 28, 2012 of the Government's time to respond to plaintiffs' motion for attorney's fees pursuant to the Equal Access to Justice Act ("EAJA") and for costs. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 8/10/2012) (pl) Modified on 8/10/2012 (pl). (Entered: 08/10/2012)
08/10/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: Responses due by 8/28/2012 (pl) (Entered: 08/10/2012)
08/27/2012	<u>94</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from John E. Gura, Jr. dated 8/23/2012 re: I respectfully request that the Government's opposition to plaintiffs' fee request be adjourned until September 10, 2012. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED., ( Responses due by 9/10/2012) (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 8/24/2012) (ama) (Entered: 08/27/2012)
09/12/2012	<u>95</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on STIPULATION AND ORDER: As set forth on p. 2 of Plts' Memo in Support for fees and costs (Dkt 88), Proskauer shall donate all recovered fees to the Urban Justice Center and the Nat'l Senior Citizens Law Center. All counsel have the appreciation of the Court for their skillful advocacy during this litigation. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 9/12/2012) (cd) (Entered: 09/13/2012)
11/19/2012		<b>***DELETED DOCUMENT. Deleted document number 96 Letter. The document was incorrectly filed in this case. ***Deleted pursuant to instructions from Chambers on 12/14/2012. (tro)</b> (Entered: 12/14/2012)
01/22/2013	<u>96</u>	Letter addressed to Mr. Reddy from Laura Blakely dated 1/22/2013 re: The Court has received your letter in Clark, et al. v. Michael J. Astrue, 06 Civ. 15521 (SHS). Please be advised that that case has been closed. I am sending a copy of your letter to Gerald McIntyre, Esq., one of the lawyers who represented the plaintiffs in the Clark action. He may be able to advise you on how to proceed. (djc) (Entered: 01/22/2013)
01/22/2013	<u>97</u>	Letter addressed to Smarrow S. Helm from Laura Blakely dated 1/22/2013 re: The Court has received your letter in Clark, et al. v. Michael J. Astrue, 06 Civ. 15521 (SHS). Please be advised that that case has been closed. I am sending a copy of your letter to Gerald McIntyre, Esq., one of the lawyers who represented the plaintiffs in the Clark action. He may be able to advise you on how to proceed. (djc) (Entered: 01/22/2013)
01/24/2013	<u>98</u>	SEALED DOCUMENT placed in vault.(nm) (Entered: 01/24/2013)

01/25/2013	99	Letter from John Timothy Reddy, Jr. re: Submission of Motion for Disbursement of Funds. (ago) (Entered: 01/25/2013)
01/25/2013	100	Letter addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from Samarrow S. Helm dated 11/10/2012 re: the termination of his benefits. (ago) (Entered: 01/25/2013)
03/15/2013	<u>101</u>	Letter addressed to Ms. Johnson from Laura Blakely, Courtroom Deputy to Hon. Sidney H. Stein dated 3/15/13 re: The Court has received your letter in Clark, et al. v. Michael J. Astrue, 06 Civ. 15521 (SHS). Please be advised that that case has been closed. I am sending a copy of your letter to Gerald McIntyre, Esq., one of the lawyers who represented the plaintiffs in the Clark action. He may be able to advise you on how to proceed. (mro) (Entered: 03/15/2013)
03/18/2013	<u>102</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: MOTION held on 11/23/2011 before Judge Sidney H. Stein. Court Reporter/Transcriber: William Richards, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 4/11/2013. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 4/22/2013. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 6/20/2013.(Rodriguez, Somari) (Entered: 03/18/2013)
03/18/2013	<u>103</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a MOTION proceeding held on 11/23/11 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(Rodriguez, Somari) (Entered: 03/18/2013)
04/17/2013	<u>104</u>	Letter addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from Charles Newton dated 4/10/13 re: Charles Newton states that the Social Security administration has not refunded the money that they withheld from him. (mro) (Entered: 04/17/2013)
04/17/2013	<u>105</u>	Letter addressed to Mr. Newton from Laura Blakely, Courtroom Deputy to Hon. Sidney H. Stein dated 4/17/13 re: The Court has received your letter in Clark, et al. v. Michael J. Astrue, 06 Civ. 15521 (SHS). Please be advised that that case has been closed. I am sending a copy of your letter to Gerald McIntyre, Esq., one of the lawyers who represented the plaintiffs in the Clark action. He may be able to advise you on how to proceed. (mro) (Entered: 04/17/2013)
08/26/2013	<u>106</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from Moshe Ben-Hod dated 8/19/2013 re: I received a letter from the SSA office in Baltimore dated March 10, 2013 stating that I am to receive \$74,241 plus \$1,143 every month. I am in contact with the SSA office at the US Consulate in Jerusalem, as I live in Israel I have numerous correspondence with them and they state that they sent the money to my bank account. Nothing has ever arrived. Could you please look into this. (rjm) (Entered: 08/26/2013)
08/26/2013	<u>107</u>	LETTER addressed to Mr. Ben-Hod from Laura Blakely dated 8/26/2013 re: The Court has received your letter in Clark, et al. v. Michael J. Astrue, 06 Civ. 15521 (SHS). Please be advised that that case was closed on September 12, 2012. I am sending a copy of your letter to Gerald McIntyre, Esq., one of the lawyers who represented the plaintiffs in the Clark action. He may be able to advise you on how to proceed. (rjm) (Entered: 08/26/2013)
09/24/2013	<u>108</u>	LETTER addressed to Ms. Mosley from William Frank Wolf dated 9/20/2013 re: To the best of my knowledge and belief, Social Security is a social program created by Franklin D. Roosevelt. (rjm) (Entered: 09/24/2013)
09/24/2013	<u>109</u>	LETTER addressed to Mr. William F. Wolf from Laura Blakely, Courtroom Deputy to Hon. Sidney H. Stein dated 9/24/2013 re: The Court has received your letter in Clark, et al. v. Michael J. Astrue, 06 Civ. 15521 (SHS). Please be advised that that case was closed on September 12, 2012. I am sending a copy of your letter to Gerald McIntyre, Esq., one of the lawyers who represented the plaintiffs in the Clark action. He may be able to advise you on how to proceed. (rjm) (Entered: 09/24/2013)
09/24/2013		<b>***DELETED DOCUMENT. Deleted document number 110 LETTER. The document was incorrectly filed in this case. (ft)</b> (Entered: 09/26/2013)



09/26/2013	<u>111</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from William Frank Wolf dated 9/23/2013 re: Overview... If Hon. Stein has any questions please do not hesitate to ask. (rjm) (Entered: 09/26/2013)
10/01/2013	<u>112</u>	LETTER addressed to Ossie Dennis, Sr. from Laura Blakely dated 10/1/2013 re: I am sending a copy of your letter to Gerald McIntyre, Esq., one of the lawyers who represented the plaintiffs in the Clark action. He may be able to advise you on how to proceed. (ft) (Entered: 10/01/2013)
10/01/2013	<u>113</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from Sloan Dennis dated 9/16/2013 re: My dad Ossie J. Dennis, Sr. gets (SSI) which they cut off 1-06 for a probation. (rjm) (Entered: 10/01/2013)
10/08/2013	<u>115</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from William F. Wolf dated 10/4/2013. (rsh) (Entered: 10/11/2013)
10/10/2013	<u>114</u>	LETTER addressed to Mr. William F. Wolf from Laura Blakely, Courtroom Deputy to Hon. Sidney H. Stein dated 10/9/2013 re: The Court has received a third letter from you dated October 4, 2013. Your letters will be filed in the above case. As I previously advised you, this case was closed on September 12, 2012. Judge Stein no longer has jurisdiction over this matter. I am sending a copy of your letter to Gerald McIntyre, Esq., one of the lawyers who represented the plaintiffs in the Clark action. He may be able to advise you on how to proceed. (rsh) (Entered: 10/10/2013)
10/30/2013	<u>116</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from Chester Bernard Pugh dated 10/25/2013 re: COMPLAINT/AFFIDAVIT OF CHESTER BERNARD PUGH. (rjm) (Entered: 10/30/2013)
10/31/2013	<u>117</u>	LETTER addressed to Mr. Chester B. Pugh from Laura Blakely, Courtroom Deputy to Hon. Sidney H. Stein dated 10/31/2013 re: The Court has received a letter from you dated October 25, 2013. Your letter will be filed in the above case. Please be advised that this case was closed on September 12, 2012. Judge Stein no longer has jurisdiction over this matter. I am sending a copy of your letter to Gerald McIntyre, Esq., one of the lawyers who represented the plaintiffs in the Clark action. He may be able to advise you on how to proceed. (rjm) (Entered: 10/31/2013)
01/07/2014	<u>118</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from Thomas Strippone undated re: I have medical bills from 2008. I have called Medicare time and time again to pay these bills. (rjm) Modified on 1/7/2014 (rjm). (Entered: 01/07/2014)
01/07/2014	<u>119</u>	LETTER addressed to Mr. Thomas Strippone from Laura Blakely, Courtroom Deputy to Hon. Sidney H. Stein dated 1/7/2014 re: On January 6, 2014, the Court received your letter. The letter will be filed and docketed in the above case. Please be advised that this case was closed on September 12, 2012. Judge Stein no longer has jurisdiction over this matter, and as further specified herein. (rjm) (Entered: 01/07/2014)
03/07/2014	<u>120</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Cotter from William F. Wolf dated 2/27/2014 re: To the best of my knowledge and belief, please find the spark that ignited the firestorm. (tn) (Entered: 03/07/2014)
03/26/2014	<u>121</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from John E. Gura, Jr. dated March 26, 2014 re: extension of implementation plan. Document filed by Michael J. Astrue.(Gura, John) (Entered: 03/26/2014)
03/27/2014	<u>122</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>121</u> Letter filed by Michael J. Astrue. ENDORSEMENT: So ordered. (Signed by Judge Sidney H. Stein on 3/26/2014) (kgo) (Entered: 03/27/2014)
06/11/2014	<u>123</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from Mona Diane Sawtelle re: I would be so appreciative if you have any suggestions or help in this matter so I can get benefits from 2002-2007 because I was not in prison. (kgo) (Entered: 06/11/2014)
06/11/2014	<u>124</u>	LETTER addressed to Mona Diane Sawtelle from Laura Blakely dated 6/11/2014 re: Judge Stein no longer has jurisdiction over this matter. I am sending a copy of your letter to Gerald McIntyre, Esq., one of the lawyers who represented the plaintiffs in the Clark action. He may be able to advise you on how to proceed. (kgo) (Entered: 06/11/2014)

09/12/2014	<u>125</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from Cavlin Murry dated 9/5/2014 re: letter to the Court from Calvin Murry. (tn) (Entered: 09/12/2014)
09/12/2014	<u>126</u>	LETTER addressed to Mr. Calvin Murry from Laura Blakely dated 9/12/2014 re: On September 12, 2014, the Court received your letter in connection with the above case. I am sending a copy of your letter to Gerald McIntyre, Esq., one of the lawyers who represented the class in the Clark action. Any motion would have to be presented by your lawyer. (tn) (Entered: 09/12/2014)
02/18/2015	<u>127</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Sidney H. Stein from Stephen Dwight Greene dated 2/10/2015 re: Your Honor, my humble request to you for your assistance for "remedial" relief are the following. (ama) (Entered: 02/18/2015)
02/19/2015	<u>128</u>	LETTER addressed to Mt. Stephen Dwight Greene from Laura Blakely Courtroom Deputy to Hon. Sidney H. Stein dated 2/19/2015 re: On February 18, 2015, the Court received your letter in connection with the above case. Please be advised that this case was closed on September 12, 2012. Judge Stein no longer has jurisdiction over this matter. Your letter will be docketed and electronically filed in the above case. Gerald McIntyre, Esq., one of the lawyers who represented the class in the Clark action, will receive an electronic notification that your letter was filed. He may be able to advise you on how to proceed. (ama) (Entered: 02/19/2015)
11/02/2016	<u>129</u>	LETTER from Mary Blackmore on behalf, Doug Olson re: I am not an attorney, but I believe, as you shall review, it states in the section enclosed, section 3 under Remedial Provisions subsection 3.1 the defendant, SSA shall fully reinstate all benefits retroactive to date benefits were suspended. (ama) (Entered: 11/02/2016)
11/02/2016	<u>130</u>	LETTER addressed to Ms. Mary Blackmore from Laura Blakely Courtroom Deputy to Hon. Sidney H. Stein dated 11/02/2016 re: On October 31, 2016, the Court received your letter in connection with the above case. Please be advised that this case was closed on September 12, 2012. Judge Stein no longer has jurisdiction over this matter. A copy of your letter (without the attachments) was docketed and electronically filed in the above case, and the original letter with attachments was mailed to Gerald McIntyre, Esq., one of the lawyers who represented the class in the Clark action. He may be able to advise you on how to proceed. (ama) (Entered: 11/02/2016)
11/02/2016		Terminate Transcript Deadlines (ama) (Entered: 11/03/2016)
08/10/2017	<u>131</u>	LETTER addressed to Laura Blakely from Donna Chatlos dated 8/09/2017 re: Based on everything we have read about this class Action Settlement the monies should already be paid, but for some reason Social Security Administration is holding the monies. (ama) (Entered: 08/10/2017)
08/10/2017	<u>132</u>	LETTER addressed to Mr. Van De Wege from Laura Blakely Courtroom Deputy to Hon. Sidney H. Stein dated 8/10/2017 re: The Court received your letter in connection with the above action. Please be advised that this case was closed on September 12, 2012. Judge Stein no longer has jurisdiction over this matter. A copy of your letter and this letter will be docketed and a notice of electronic filing will be emailed to all the attorneys who appeared in this action. Gerald McIntyre, Esq., one of the lawyers who represented the class, may be able to advise you on how to proceed. His address is: National Senior Citizens Law Center, 3660 Wilshire Blvd, Suite 718, Los Angeles, CA 90010. (ama) (Entered: 08/10/2017)