

**U.S. District Court
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:04-cv-04454-RWS**

Williston et al v. Eggleston et al
Assigned to: Judge Robert W. Sweet
Cause: 28:1331 Fed. Question: Other

Date Filed: 06/15/2004
Date Terminated: 04/18/2008
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 444 Civil Rights: Welfare
(DISCONTINUED AFTER 1/1/2012)
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Gertrude Williston

represented by **Wendy Anne Bach**
Urban Justice Center
123 William Street, 16th Floor
New York, NY 10038
646-602-5640
Fax: 212-533-4598
Email: wbach@urbanjustice.org
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ami T. Sanghvi
Urban Justice Center
123 William Street, 16th Floor
New York, NY 10038
(646) 602-5643
Fax: (212) 533-4598
Email: asanghvi@urbanjustice.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Elena Stacy Goldstein
New York Legal Assistance Group
7 Hanover Square, 7th Floor
New York, NY 10004
(212)-613-5024
Fax: (212)-750-0820
Email: egoldstein@nylag.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leslie T. Annexstein
Urban Justice Center
123 William Street, 16th Floor
New York, NY 10038
(646)-602-5600 X5640
Fax: (212)-533-4598
Email: lannexstein@urbanjustice.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Petra T. Tashoff
National Center For Law and Economic
Justice
275 Seventh Ave,
New York, NY 10001
(212)-633-6967
Fax: (212)-633-6371
Email: tashoff@nclej.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marc Cohan
Welfare Law Center, Inc.
275 Seventh Avenue

Suite 1506
New York, NY 10001
212-633-6967
Fax: 212-633-6371
Email: cohan@nclej.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Tawana Cummins

by their parent, Paulette Cummins, on their own behalf of all others similarly situated

represented by **Wendy Anne Bach**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leslie T. Annexstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Latoya Cummins

by their parent, Paulette Cummins, on their own behalf of all others similarly situated

represented by **Wendy Anne Bach**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leslie T. Annexstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Paulette Cummins

by their parent, Paulette Cummins, on their own behalf of all others similarly situated

represented by **Wendy Anne Bach**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ami T. Sanghvi
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leslie T. Annexstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Personnel Director Verna Eggleston
as commissioner of the New York City Department of Social Services

represented by **Abigail Lynne Goldenberg**
New York City Law Department
100 Church Street, Room 4-114
New York, NY 10007
212-788-1275
Fax: 212-788-0940
Email: abgolden@law.nyc.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Martha Anne Calhoun
NYC Law Department, Office of the Corporation Counsel (NYC)
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
212-356-0856
Fax: 212-356-1148
Email: mcalhoun@law.nyc.gov

*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Madonna Marie Kasbohm
New York City Law Depart. Office of the
Corporation Counsel
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
212-788-0957
Fax: 212-788-0940
Email: dkasbohm@law.nyc.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Robert Doar
*as commissioner of the New York State
Office of Temporary and Disability
Assistance*

represented by **Jennifer Lynn Johnson**
New York State Office of the Attorney
General (NYC)
120 Broadway 12th Floor
New York, NY 10271
(212)-416-6211
Fax: (212)-416-6075
Email: jennifer.johnson@oag.state.ny.us
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Deborah Ellen Hochhauser
Attorney General of the State of New York
120 Broadway
New York, NY 10271
(212)416-8629
Fax: (212)416-6077
Email: Deborah.Hochhauser@oag.state.ny.us
TERMINATED: 07/08/2008

Robert Lewis Kraft
Office of the Attorney General, New York
State
120 Broadway
24th Floor
New York, NY 10271
212-416-8632
Fax: 212-416-6075
Email: robert.kraft@ag.ny.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

City of New York

represented by **Abigail Lynne Goldenberg**
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Intervenor Plaintiff

Jose Feliz

represented by **Ami T. Sanghvi**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leslie T. Annexstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Intervenor Plaintiff

Florence Greenbaum

represented by

Ami T. Sanghvi
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leslie T. Annexstein
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Intervenor Plaintiff

Viveca Peatree

Intervenor Plaintiff

Miladis Nunez

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
06/15/2004	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Robert Doar, Verna Eggleston. (Filing Fee \$ 150.00, Receipt Number 511926)Document filed by Latoya Cummins, Paulette Cummins, Tawana Cummins, Gertrude Williston.(laq,) Additional attachment(s) added on 6/18/2004 (laq,). (Entered: 06/15/2004)
06/15/2004		SUMMONS ISSUED as to Robert Doar, Verna Eggleston. (laq,) (Entered: 06/15/2004)
06/15/2004		Magistrate Judge Gabriel W. Gorenstein is so designated. (laq,) (Entered: 06/15/2004)
06/15/2004		Case Designated ECF. (laq,) (Entered: 06/15/2004)
06/18/2004	<u>2</u>	FIRST MOTION to Certify Class pursuant to FRCP 23(b)(2). Document filed by Gertrude Williston. Responses due by 7/23/2004 Return Date set for 8/18/2004 12:00 PM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Devins Declaration# <u>2</u> Exhibit # <u>3</u> # <u>4</u> # <u>5</u> # <u>6</u> # <u>7</u> # <u>8</u> # <u>9</u> Exhibit)(Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 06/18/2004)
06/18/2004	<u>3</u>	FIRST BRIEF re: <u>2</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class pursuant to FRCP 23(b)(2).. Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of MOL in Support of Motion for Class Certification)(Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 06/18/2004)
07/16/2004	<u>4</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Donna M. Kasbohm dated 7/6/04. Defendant City's time to respond to the complaint is extended to 8/7/04. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 7/14/04) (kw,) (Entered: 07/16/2004)
07/16/2004		Set Answer Due Date purs. to <u>4</u> Endorsed Letter as to City of New York answer due on 8/7/2004. (kw,) (Entered: 07/16/2004)
07/16/2004	<u>5</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Deborah Ferleger dated 7/8/04. Defendant Robert Doar's time to respond to the complaint is extended to 8/23/04. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 7/14/04) (kw,) (Entered: 07/16/2004)
07/16/2004		Set Answer Due Date purs. to <u>5</u> Endorsed Letter as to Robert Doar answer due on 8/23/2004. (kw,) (Entered: 07/16/2004)
08/09/2004	<u>6</u>	FIRST MOTION to Dismiss. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. Responses due by 9/17/2004 Return Date set for 10/6/2004 12:00 PM. (Kasbohm, Madonna) (Entered: 08/09/2004)
08/09/2004	<u>7</u>	MOTION to Dismiss MOL. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. Responses due by 9/17/2004 Return Date set for 10/6/2004 12:00 PM. (Kasbohm, Madonna) (Entered: 08/09/2004)
08/20/2004	<u>8</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Notic of Motion to Dismiss and Memorandum of Law served on Gertrude Williston; and Tawana Cummins et al on August 9, 2004. Service was made by Electronically and by mail. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Kasbohm, Madonna) (Entered: 08/20/2004)

08/23/2004	<u>9</u>	FIRST MOTION to Dismiss <i>the Complaint</i> . Document filed by Robert Doar. Responses due by 9/28/2004 Return Date set for 10/20/2004 09:30 AM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Karins# <u>2</u> Affidavit Ferleger# <u>3</u> Supplement OTDA memorandum of Law in Support)(Ferleger, Deborah) (Entered: 08/23/2004)
09/08/2004	<u>10</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Donna M. Kasbohm dated 8/27/04. All defendants' time to respond to plaintiffs' motion for class certification is adjourned. Return date on City defendant's motion is adjourned to 10/20/04. Plaintiffs' Response to City's motion to dismiss due by 9/28/2004. Reply due by 10/15/2004. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 9/7/04) (kw,) (Entered: 09/09/2004)
09/27/2004	<u>11</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Marc Cohan dated 9/27/04. Granting plaintiffs' request for an extension until 9/30/04 to respond to defendants' motions to dismiss. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 9/27/04) (kw,) (Entered: 09/28/2004)
09/30/2004	<u>12</u>	FIRST MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>6</u> FIRST MOTION to Dismiss., <u>7</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>MOL.</i> , <u>9</u> FIRST MOTION to Dismiss <i>the Complaint.</i> . Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 09/30/2004)
09/30/2004	<u>13</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>6</u> FIRST MOTION to Dismiss., <u>7</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>MOL.</i> , <u>9</u> FIRST MOTION to Dismiss <i>the Complaint.</i> . Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 09/30/2004)
10/07/2004	<u>14</u>	ORDER re: <u>2</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class. The plaintiffs' motion for class certification is removed from the docket, with leave to restore by letter. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 10/6/04) (kw,) (Entered: 10/07/2004)
10/14/2004	<u>15</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Donna M. Kasbohm dated 10/13/04. Defendants' reply to their pending motion to dismiss is now due by 10/18/2004. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 10/14/04) (kw,) (Entered: 10/15/2004)
10/15/2004	<u>16</u>	FIRST REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>9</u> FIRST MOTION to Dismiss <i>the Complaint.</i> . Document filed by Robert Doar. (Ferleger, Deborah) (Entered: 10/15/2004)
10/18/2004	<u>17</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>6</u> FIRST MOTION to Dismiss.. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Kasbohm, Madonna) (Entered: 10/18/2004)
11/02/2004	<u>18</u>	SECOND REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>9</u> FIRST MOTION to Dismiss <i>the Complaint. Sur-Reply</i> . Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 11/02/2004)
11/02/2004	<u>19</u>	FIRST MOTION for Leave to File <i>Plaintiffs' Sur-Reply to State Defendant's Motion to Dismiss</i> . Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 11/02/2004)
12/14/2004	<u>20</u>	FIRST MOTION to Intervene <i>Jose Feliz</i> . Document filed by Gertrude Williston. Return Date set for 1/5/2005 12:00 PM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Intervenor declaration# <u>2</u> Affidavit Affidavit of translation# <u>3</u> Exhibit Exhibit 1)(Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 12/14/2004)
12/14/2004	<u>21</u>	MOTION to Intervene <i>Proposed Intervenor Complaint</i> . Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 12/14/2004)
12/14/2004	<u>22</u>	MOTION to Intervene <i>Memorandum of Law</i> . Document filed by Gertrude Williston. Return Date set for 1/5/2005 12:00 PM. (Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 12/14/2004)
12/23/2004	<u>23</u>	FIRST MOTION to Intervene <i>Florence Greenbaum</i> . Document filed by Gertrude Williston. Return Date set for 1/12/2004 12:00 PM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Greenbaum Declaration# <u>2</u> Exhibit Greenbaum Exhibit 1# <u>3</u> Exhibit Greenbaum Exhibit 2# <u>4</u> Exhibit Greenbaum Exhibit 3# <u>5</u> Proposed Amended Complaint# <u>6</u> Memorandum of Law)(Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 12/23/2004)

01/07/2005	<u>24</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Donna M. Kasbohm dated 12/29/04 re: request that motions made returnable 1/19/05; oppositions due 1/13/05 and replies due 1/18/05. Application GRANTED. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 1/5/05) (db,) (Entered: 01/11/2005)
01/07/2005		Set/Reset Deadlines: Replies due by 1/18/2005. Responses due by 1/13/2005 (db,) (Entered: 01/11/2005)
01/07/2005		Set/Reset Deadlines as to <u>23</u> FIRST MOTION to Intervene <i>Florence Greenbaum</i> . Responses due by 1/13/2005 Replies due by 1/18/2005. (db,) (Entered: 01/11/2005)
01/13/2005	<u>25</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>20</u> FIRST MOTION to Intervene <i>Jose Feliz.</i> , <u>21</u> MOTION to Intervene <i>Proposed Intervenor Complaint.</i> , <u>22</u> MOTION to Intervene <i>Memorandum of Law.</i> , <u>23</u> FIRST MOTION to Intervene <i>Florence Greenbaum.</i> . Document filed by Robert Doar. (Hochhauser, Deborah) (Entered: 01/13/2005)
01/13/2005	<u>26</u>	MOTION to Intervene <i>Stip of No Opposition</i> . Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Kasbohm, Madonna) (Entered: 01/13/2005)
01/18/2005	<u>27</u>	FIRST REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>20</u> FIRST MOTION to Intervene <i>Jose Feliz.</i> , <u>26</u> MOTION to Intervene <i>Stip of No Opposition.</i> , <u>23</u> FIRST MOTION to Intervene <i>Florence Greenbaum.</i> . Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 01/18/2005)
07/19/2005	<u>28</u>	OPINION 91876 re:granting <u>20</u> FIRST MOTION to Intervene <i>Jose Feliz.</i> filed by Gertrude Williston., <u>23</u> FIRST MOTION to Intervene <i>Florence Greenbaum.</i> filed by Gertrude Williston., (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 7/14/05) (djc,) Modified on 7/21/2005 (sao,). (Entered: 07/20/2005)
07/29/2005	<u>29</u>	PRETRIAL ORDER; ptc set for 9/14/05 at 4:30 pm. Plntf's counsel to notify all parties. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 7/29/05) (cd,) (Entered: 08/01/2005)
07/29/2005	<u>30</u>	OPINION # 91928 ; re: Based upon the foregoing conclusions the motions of the City and the State to dismiss the Complaint are denied : <u>6</u> FIRST MOTION to Dismiss, filed by Verna Eggleston. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 7/27/05) (sac,) Modified on 8/3/2005 (sgu,). (Entered: 08/02/2005)
08/15/2005	<u>31</u>	ANSWER to Complaint. Document filed by Robert Doar.(Hochhauser, Deborah) (Entered: 08/15/2005)
08/15/2005	<u>32</u>	NOTICE of Leave to Appeal. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Kasbohm, Madonna) (Entered: 08/15/2005)
08/15/2005	<u>33</u>	FIRST MOTION for Leave to Appeal <i>Pursuant to 1292(b)</i> Document filed by Verna Eggleston. Return Date set for 9/14/2005 12:00 PM. (Kasbohm, Madonna) (Entered: 08/15/2005)
09/07/2005	<u>34</u>	FIRST MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>33</u> FIRST MOTION for Leave to Appeal <i>Pursuant to 1292(b)</i> . Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 09/07/2005)
09/14/2005	<u>35</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>33</u> FIRST MOTION for Leave to Appeal <i>Pursuant to 1292(b)</i> . Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Kasbohm, Madonna) (Entered: 09/14/2005)
11/28/2005	<u>36</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Robert Lewis Kraft on behalf of Robert Doar (Kraft, Robert) (Entered: 11/28/2005)
01/24/2006	<u>37</u>	OPINION 92653 for the reasons stated above,the Defendant's motions to certify an issue for appeal and to concomitantly stay this action are denied.It is so ordered. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 1/24/2006) (jmi,) Modified on 1/26/2006 (ns,). (Entered: 01/25/2006)
01/24/2006	<u>38</u>	ORDER Pretrial Conference set for 3/15/2006 04:30 PM before Judge Robert W. Sweet. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 1/24/2006) (jmi,) (Entered: 01/25/2006)

02/08/2006	<u>39</u>	ANSWER to Complaint. Document filed by Verna Eggleston, City of New York.(Goldenberg, Abigail) (Entered: 02/08/2006)
03/15/2006		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Robert W. Sweet : Pretrial Conference held on 3/15/2006. Parties are to submit a stipulation regarding proposed dates. (db,) (Entered: 03/20/2006)
04/04/2006	<u>40</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER: Motions due by 4/27/2007. Discovery due by 4/27/2007. Final Pretrial Conference set for 5/9/2007 04:30 PM before Judge Robert W. Sweet. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 4/4/06) (js,) (Entered: 04/05/2006)
04/04/2006	<u>41</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER: The motion for class certification shall be returnable no later than June 14, 2006. All expert reports, if any, shall be served by January 27, 2007. All rebuttal expert reports, if any shall be served by February 26, 2007 Motions due by 4/27/2007. Discovery due by 12/13/2006. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 4/3/06) (js,) (Entered: 04/05/2006)
04/11/2006	<u>42</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Marc Cohan on behalf of Gertrude Williston (Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 04/11/2006)
04/11/2006	<u>43</u>	PRETRIAL SCHEDULING ORDER: Motions due by 4/27/2007. Discovery due by 12/13/2006. See Document for further Scheduling Deadlines. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 4/10/06) (sac,) (Entered: 04/11/2006)
05/11/2006	<u>44</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Elena Stacy Goldstein on behalf of Gertrude Williston (Goldstein, Elena) (Entered: 05/11/2006)
05/22/2006	<u>45</u>	MOTION to Certify Class. Document filed by Gertrude Willistonand Tawana, Latoya and Tandika Cummins by parent Paulette Cummins. Responses due by 6/6/2006 (Goldstein, Elena) (Entered: 05/22/2006)
05/22/2006	<u>46</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>45</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Ami Sanghvi# <u>2</u> Exhibit A-F to Sanghvi Decl.# <u>3</u> Exhibit G-K to Sanghvi Decl.# <u>4</u> Affidavit Elena Goldstein# <u>5</u> Exhibit A-C to Goldstein Decl.# <u>6</u> Exhibit D-F to Goldstein Decl.)(Goldstein, Elena) (Entered: 05/22/2006)
05/31/2006	<u>47</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Ami T. Sanghvi on behalf of Jose Feliz, Florence Greenbaum, Gertrude Williston, Tawana Cummins, Latoya Cummins, Paulette Cummins (Sanghvi, Ami) (Entered: 05/31/2006)
06/06/2006	<u>48</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER: re plntfs' restored motion for class certification: Responses due by 7/6/2006 Replies due by 7/18/2006. Oral Argument set for 7/19/2006 12:00 PM before Judge Robert W. Sweet. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 6/6/06) (cd,) (Entered: 06/06/2006)
06/07/2006	<u>49</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Robert L. Kraft dated 6/6/2006 re: to ask that the State defednant's time to respond to the motion for class certification be adjusted to conform to that agreed upon by plaintiffs and the city defendant in their proposed revised scheduling order forwarded to you this date. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 6/6/2006) (jmi,) (Entered: 06/08/2006)
06/29/2006	<u>50</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>45</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Robert Doar. (Kraft, Robert) (Entered: 06/29/2006)
07/13/2006	<u>51</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Abigail Goldenberg dated 7/5/2006 re: to request an extension of time from July 6, 2006, until July 20, 2006, for City defednant to submit its opposition to plaintiffs' restored Motion for Class Certification. Responses due by 7/20/2006. ENDORSEMENT So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 7/12/2006) (jmi,) (Entered: 07/14/2006)
07/27/2006	<u>52</u>	REVISED PRETRIAL SCHEDULING ORDER: Motions due by 6/27/2006. Responses due by 9/20/2006 Replies due by 10/2/2006. Discovery due by 2/13/2007. Additional deadlines are as set forth in this Order. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 7/27/06) (pl,) Modified on 7/28/2006 (pl,). (Entered: 07/28/2006)

07/28/2006	<u>53</u>	PRETRIAL ORDER; Pretrial Conference set for 7/4/2006 04:30 PM before Judge Robert W. Sweet. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 7/28/06) (pl,) (Entered: 07/28/2006)
09/21/2006	<u>54</u>	PROPOSED REVISED PRETRIAL SCHEDULING ORDER: City defednat's opposition to plaintiffs' Restored Motion for Class Certification shall be served no later than November 6, 2006. Any reply to City and State defednants' opposition shall be served no later than November 20, 2006. The motion for Class Certification shall be returnable on November 22, 2006, at noon, or as soon thereafter as counsel may be heard. All discovery, except for expert discovery, shall be completed by March 30, 2007. All expert reports, if any, shall be served by May 11, 2007. All rebuttal expert reports, if any, shall be served by June 11, 2007. Dispositive motions shall be served and filed August 11, 2007. So Ordered. Motions due by 11/22/2006. Discovery due by 3/30/2007. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 9/21/2006) (jmi,) (Entered: 09/22/2006)
09/21/2006	<u>55</u>	PRETRIAL ORDER Pretrial Conference set for 9/12/2007 at 04:30 PM before Judge Robert W. Sweet. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 9/21/2006) (jmi,) (Entered: 09/22/2006)
11/07/2006	<u>56</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Martha A. Calhoun and Abigail Goldenberg dated 11/6/06 re: a request on behalf of defendant Commissioner Verna Egelston to hold this matter in abeyance for an additional thirty days until 12/6/2006 so that the parties can continue to attempt to negotiate a possible settlement. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 11/6/06) (kco,) (Entered: 11/08/2006)
12/06/2006	<u>57</u>	ORDER; parties shall complete all discovey, inspection and motions by 11/12/07; Parties shall submit to teh court trial briefs, a jointproposed pretrial order, and, if applicable, proposed jury charges and voir dire requests in accordance with the annexed form and instructions by 11/28/07. A final pretrial conference will be held at 4:30 p.m. on Nov. 28, 2007. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 12/6/06) (djc,) (Entered: 12/06/2006)
12/06/2006		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Discovery due by 11/12/2007. Motions due by 11/12/2007. Pretrial Order due by 11/28/2007. Final Pretrial Conference set for 11/28/2007 04:30 PM before Judge Robert W. Sweet. (djc,) (Entered: 12/06/2006)
12/06/2006	<u>58</u>	PROPOSED REVISED PRETRIAL SCHEDULING ORDER:Dispositive Motions due by 11/12/2007. Discovery due by 6/30/2007. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 12/5/06) (db,) (Entered: 12/07/2006)
01/10/2007	<u>59</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Leslie T. Annexstein on behalf of Jose Feliz, Florence Greenbaum, Gertrude Williston, Tawana Cummins, Latoya Cummins, Paulette Cummins (Annexstein, Leslie) (Entered: 01/10/2007)
01/31/2007	<u>60</u>	MOTION to Intervene <i>Proposed Class Representatives Peartree and Nunez</i> . Document filed by Gertrude Williston.Return Date set for 2/21/2007 12:00 PM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Declaration of Ami Sangvhi# <u>2</u> Affidavit Peartree Declaration# <u>3</u> Affidavit Hargraves Declaration for Peartree# <u>4</u> Affidavit Nunez Declaration# <u>5</u> Affidavit Hargraves Declaration for Nunez# <u>6</u> Affidavit Dandelat Affidavit of translation)(Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 01/31/2007)
01/31/2007	<u>61</u>	FILING ERROR – WRONG DOCUMENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU – MOTION to Intervene (Peartree and Nunez Proposed Complaint)(INTERVENOR COMPLAINT). Document filed by Gertrude Williston.Return Date set for 2/21/2007 12:00 PM.(Cohan, Marc) Modified on 2/1/2007 (Allen, Kathleen). (Entered: 01/31/2007)
01/31/2007	<u>62</u>	FILING ERROR – WRONG DOCUMENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU – BRIEF re: <u>60</u> MOTION to Intervene (Proposed Class Representatives Peartree and Nunez) (MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN SUPPORT OF MOTION). Document filed by Gertrude Williston.(Cohan, Marc) Modified on 2/1/2007 (Allen, Kathleen). (Entered: 01/31/2007)
01/31/2007	<u>63</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Notion of Motion, Exhibits, Brief served on Eggleston, Doar on January 31, 2007. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 01/31/2007)

02/01/2007		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT - DOCUMENT TYPE ERROR. Note to Attorney Marc Cohan to RE-FILE Document <u>61</u> MOTION to Intervene (Peartree and Nunez Proposed Complaint). Use the document type Intervenor Complaint found under the document list Complaints and Other Initiating Documents. (kg) (Entered: 02/01/2007)
02/01/2007		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT - DOCUMENT TYPE ERROR. Note to Attorney Marc Cohan to RE-FILE Document <u>62</u> Brief. Use the document type Memorandum of Law in support of motion found under the document list Replies, Opposition and Supporting Documents. (kg) (Entered: 02/01/2007)
02/01/2007	<u>64</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>60</u> MOTION to Intervene <i>Proposed Class Representatives Peartree and Nunez..</i> Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 02/01/2007)
02/02/2007	<u>65</u>	DECLARATION of Elena S. Goldstein in Support re: <u>60</u> MOTION to Intervene <i>Proposed Class Representatives Peartree and Nunez..</i> Document filed by Tawana Cummins, Latoya Cummins, Paulette Cummins. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A - Plaintiffs' Proposed Class Action Intervenor Complaint)(Goldstein, Elena) (Entered: 02/02/2007)
02/02/2007	<u>66</u>	PRETRIAL ORDER: Counsel are directed to appear in Courtroom 18C on April 11, 2007 at 4:30 pm for a pretrial conference for the purpose of resolving any outstanding discovery or other issues, and setting a time for trial. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 2/2/07) (js) (Entered: 02/05/2007)
02/02/2007		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Pretrial Conference set for 4/11/2007 04:30 PM before Judge Robert W. Sweet. In courtroom 18C. (js) (Entered: 02/05/2007)
02/09/2007	<u>67</u>	REVISED PRETRIAL SCHEDULING ORDER:City defts' opposition to Plaintiffs' Restored Motion for Class Certification and Def't's opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion to Intervene shall be served no later than 3/6/2007. Any Replies to City and State defts' opposition to plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification and to Intervene shall be served by 3/21/2007. The pending motions shall be returnable on 3/28/2007 at noon. All Discovery due by 7/30/2007.All expert reports, if any served by 9/10/2007. All rebuttal expert reports, served by 10/10/2007. Dispositive motions shall be served and filed by 12/12/2007.SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 2/7/2007) (jar) (Entered: 02/13/2007)
02/09/2007	<u>68</u>	ORDER. The parties shall submit to the Court trial briefs, a joint proposed pretrial order, and if applicable, proposed jury charges and voir dire requests by 12/26/2007. Final pretrial conference will be held at 4:30 pm on that date. Adjournemtns of the dates set forth above will not be granted except for good cause and upon written application. Failure to comply with any of the provisions of this order will result in dismissal of the action, entry of a default judgment, or other appropriate sanction. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 2/9/2007) (jar) (Entered: 02/13/2007)
02/09/2007		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Final Pretrial Conference set for 12/26/2007 04:30 PM before Judge Robert W. Sweet. (jar) (Entered: 02/13/2007)
03/06/2007	<u>69</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re: <u>60</u> MOTION to Intervene <i>Proposed Class Representatives Peartree and Nunez.. Stipulation of No Opposition to Intervene Proposed Class Representatives Peartree and Nunez..</i> Document filed by Robert Doar. (Hochhauser, Deborah) (Entered: 03/06/2007)
03/09/2007	<u>70</u>	REVISED SCHEDULING ORDER:Dispositive Motions due by 12/12/2007; Responses by City defts to plntfs' Restored Motion for Class certification due by 3/13/2007,Replies due by 3/28/2007.,Discovery due by 7/30/2007. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 3/7/07) (cd) (Entered: 03/12/2007)
03/12/2007	<u>71</u>	STIPULATION OF NO OPPOSITION Verna Eggleston, and Robert Doar do not oppose plaintiffs' motions to Intervene proposed Plaintiffs Viveca Peartree and Miladis Nunez. Should the Court grant Plaintiffs' Intervenor Motions, City and State Defendants reserve all defenses against the complaints of Intervenor Viveca Peartree and Miladis Nunez. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Miriam Goldman Cedarbaum on 3/9/07) (jco) (Entered: 03/13/2007)

03/13/2007	<u>72</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>45</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Verna Eggleston, City of New York. (Goldenberg, Abigail) (Entered: 03/13/2007)
03/13/2007	<u>73</u>	DECLARATION of Lisa Fitzpatrick in Opposition re: <u>45</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Verna Eggleston, City of New York. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Goldenberg, Abigail) (Entered: 03/13/2007)
03/28/2007	<u>74</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>45</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Certificate of Service)(Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 03/28/2007)
04/03/2007	<u>75</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Ami Sanghvi dated 3/26/07 re: counsel for plaintiffs request permission to submit a reply memorandum of law to dfts' opposition to plaintiff's restored motion for class certification in excess of 10 pages in order to fully address the points raised by dfts. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 4/2/07) (dle) (Entered: 04/04/2007)
08/03/2007	<u>76</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Abigail Goldenberg dated 7/27/07 re: Counsel writes to request a ninety-day extension until 10/30/07 to complete fact discovery. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. Discovery due by 10/30/2007. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 7/31/07) (jco) (Entered: 08/03/2007)
08/03/2007	<u>77</u>	ORDER Discovery due by 3/12/2008. Motions due by 3/12/2008. Pretrial Order due by 3/26/2008. Final Pretrial Conference set for 3/26/2008 at 04:30 PM before Judge Robert W. Sweet. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 8/3/07) (jco) (Entered: 08/03/2007)
08/13/2007	<u>78</u>	NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Leslie T. Annexstein on behalf of all plaintiffs. New Address: Urban Justice Center, 123 William Street, 16th Floor, New York, New York, USA 10038, 646-602-5600. (Annexstein, Leslie) (Entered: 08/13/2007)
08/13/2007	<u>79</u>	NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Leslie T. Annexstein on behalf of all plaintiffs. New Address: Urban Justice Center, 123 William Street, 16th Floor, New York, New York, USA 10038, 646-602-5600. (Annexstein, Leslie) (Entered: 08/13/2007)
08/13/2007	<u>80</u>	NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Leslie T. Annexstein on behalf of all plaintiffs. New Address: Urban Justice Center, 123 William Street, 16th Floor, New York, New York, USA 10038, 646-602-5600. (Annexstein, Leslie) (Entered: 08/13/2007)
01/17/2008	<u>81</u>	ORDER: The motion for class certification filed by plaintiffs on May 22, 2006 (docket no. 45) shall be dismissed without prejudice or penalty for failure to prosecute. Leave is GRANTED to refile the motion by letter without payment of filing fee. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 1/17/08) (js) (Entered: 01/18/2008)
02/26/2008	<u>82</u>	SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT <i>AND PROPOSED ORDER</i> . Document filed by Gertrude Williston.(Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 02/26/2008)
02/26/2008	<u>83</u>	FILING ERROR – ELECTRONIC FILING FOR NON-ECF DOCUMENT – FIRST MOTION to Certify Class, FIRST MOTION to Approve Consent Judgment, MOTION to Approve Consent Judgment(ORDER PURS. TO FRCP 23(e).(Return Date set for 2/27/2008 at 12:00 PM.) Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Letter to Court, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order Granting Class Certification, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Proposed Notice to Class)(Cohan, Marc) Modified on 2/26/2008 (KA). (Entered: 02/26/2008)
02/26/2008		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – NON-ECF DOCUMENT ERROR. Note to Attorney Marc Cohan to E-MAIL pdf copy of ORDER to orders_and_judgments@nysd.uscourts.gov Document No. <u>83</u> Order. This document is not filed via ECF. (KA) (Entered: 02/26/2008)

03/03/2008	<u>84</u>	ORDER CERTIFYING CLASS AND APPOINTING CLASS COUNSEL: pursuant to the parties' Stipulation, the following class is certified: All Individuals who apply for Food Stamp benefits at a Non-Cash Assistance Food Stamp Center, or for whom an application is submitted at an NCA Food Stamp Center. The New York Legal Assistance Group, Urban Justice Center, and Welfare Law Center, all in New York, are appointed class counsel for the certified class. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 2/27/08) (tro) (Entered: 03/03/2008)
03/03/2008	<u>85</u>	ORDER PURSUANT TO FED. R. CIV. P. 23(e): A Hearing pursuant to Rule 23(e) of the F.R.C.P. shall be held on 4/16/2008 at 12:00 PM, Room 1920, before Judge Robert W. Sweet. Any member of the plaintiff class may object to or comment on the Settlement by submitting objections in writing. Objections or comments must be post-marked by 4/10/08. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 2/27/08) (tro) (Entered: 03/03/2008)
03/03/2008	<u>86</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER OF SETTLEMENT...regarding procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of the settlement of this action. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 2/27/08) (tro) (Entered: 03/03/2008)
04/09/2008	<u>87</u>	AFFIDAVIT of Ami Sangvhi in Support re: <u>83</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.FIRST MOTION to Approve Consent Judgment. MOTION to Approve Consent Judgment.. Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 04/09/2008)
04/09/2008	<u>88</u>	AFFIDAVIT of Lynn Lu in Support re: <u>83</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.FIRST MOTION to Approve Consent Judgment. MOTION to Approve Consent Judgment.. Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 04/09/2008)
04/15/2008	<u>89</u>	FILING ERROR – WRONG DOCUMENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU – MOTION to Approve Consent Judgment(DECLARATION OF MARTHA A. CALHOUN). Document filed by Verna Eggleston.(Calhoun, Martha) Modified on 4/16/2008 (KA). (Entered: 04/15/2008)
04/15/2008	<u>90</u>	FILING ERROR – WRONG DOCUMENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU – MOTION to Approve Consent Judgment (Declaration of Compliance with 23(e) order). Document filed by Verna Eggleston.(Calhoun, Martha) Modified on 4/16/2008 (KA). (Entered: 04/15/2008)
04/16/2008	<u>91</u>	FILING ERROR – WRONG DOCUMENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU – MOTION to Approve Consent Judgment (Declaration of Sebastian Addamo). Document filed by Robert Doar. Return Date set for 4/16/2008 at 12:00 PM.(Hochhauser, Deborah) Modified on 4/16/2008 (KA). (Entered: 04/16/2008)
04/16/2008		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – DOCUMENT TYPE ERROR. Note to Attorney Martha Anne Calhoun to RE-FILE Document <u>89</u> MOTION to Approve Consent Judgment. Use the document type Declaration (non-motion) found under the document list Other Answers. (KA) (Entered: 04/16/2008)
04/16/2008		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – DOCUMENT TYPE ERROR. Note to Attorney Martha Anne Calhoun to RE-FILE Document <u>90</u> MOTION to Approve Consent Judgment (Declaration of Compliance with 23(e) order). Use the document type Declaration (non-motion) found under the document list Other Answers. (KA) (Entered: 04/16/2008)
04/16/2008		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – DOCUMENT TYPE ERROR. Note to Attorney Deborah Ellen Hochhauser to RE-FILE Document <u>91</u> MOTION to Approve Consent Judgment (Declaration in support). Use the document type Declaration (non-motion) found under the document list Other Answers. (KA) (Entered: 04/16/2008)
04/16/2008	<u>92</u>	DECLARATION of Sebastian Addamo in Support. Document filed by Robert Doar. (Hochhauser, Deborah) (Entered: 04/16/2008)
04/18/2008	<u>93</u>	ORDER: It is hereby ordered that the Stipulation and Order of settlement of this action is approved. The parties Stipulation and Order of Settlement is so ordered; the terms of that Stipulation and Order are deemed to be in effect as of the date of

		this Order, as set forth herein. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 4/17/2008) (jpo) (Entered: 04/21/2008)
07/08/2008	<u>94</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Jennifer Lynn Johnson on behalf of Robert Doar (Johnson, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/08/2008)
07/10/2008	<u>95</u>	STIPULATION REGARDING ATTORNEY'S FEE MOTION: It is hereby stipulated and agreed that the time within which plaintiff's must file an application for costs and fees with the Court as provided for in the Settlement is extended to and including October 1, 2008. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 7/9/2008) (jfe) (Entered: 07/10/2008)
09/12/2008	<u>96</u>	STIPULATION REGARDING ATTORNEY'S FEE MOTION that the time within which plaintiffs must file an application for costs and fees with the Court as provided for in the Settlement is extended to and including 11/3/08. (Motion due by 11/3/2008.) (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 9/12/08) (cd) (Entered: 09/15/2008)
10/21/2008	<u>97</u>	STIPULATION, that the time within which plaintiffs must file an application for costs and fees with the Court as provided for in the Settlement is extended to and including 12/1/08. (Motion due by 12/1/2008.) (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 10/20/08) (cd) (Entered: 10/21/2008)
11/24/2008	<u>98</u>	STIPULATION REGARDING ATTORNEY'S FEE MOTION: IT IS THEREFORE STIPULATED AND AGREED that the time within which plaintiffs must file an application for costs and fees with the Court as provided for in the Settlement is extended to and including January 16, 2009. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 11/24/2008) (jfe) (Entered: 11/24/2008)
01/14/2009	<u>99</u>	STIPULATION REGARDING ATTORNEY'S FEE MOTION: The time within which plaintiffs must file an application for costs and fees with the Court as provided for in the Settlement is extended to and includes 2/16/09. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 1/14/09) (tro) (Entered: 01/14/2009)
02/12/2009	<u>100</u>	STIPULATION REGARDING ATTORNEY'S FEE MOTION: IT IS THEREFORE STIPULATED AND AGREED that the time within which plaintiffs must file an application for costs and fees with the Court as provided for in the Settlement is extended to and includes April 17, 2009. So Ordered (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 2/10/09) (js) (Entered: 02/13/2009)
04/06/2009	<u>101</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Petra T. Tasheff dated 4/6/09 re: On behalf of all parties, counsel requests that the Court "so order" the attached Stipulation Regarding Attorney's Fee Motion. Counsel now proposes extending the date by which plaintiffs must file a motion for their application for fees from 8/17/09 to 6/16/09. ENDORSEMENT: So ordered. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 4/6/09) (tro) Modified on 4/17/2009 (tro). (Entered: 04/07/2009)
06/10/2009	<u>102</u>	STIPULATION REGARDING ATTORNEY'S FEE MOTION: It is therefore stipulated and agreed by and between the parties that the time within which plaintiffs must file an application for costs and fees with the Court as provided for in the Settlement is extended to and including August 17, 2009. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 6/5/2009) (jpo) (Entered: 06/10/2009)
08/14/2009	<u>103</u>	STIPULATION REGARDING ATTORNEY'S FEE MOTION; that the time within which plaintiffs must file an application for Costs and fees with the Court as provided for in the Settlement is extended to and includes September 16, 2009. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 8/14/2009) (tve) Modified on 8/14/2009 (tve). (Entered: 08/14/2009)
09/02/2009	<u>104</u>	SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT <i>CONCERNING ATTORNEYS FEES</i> . Document filed by Gertrude Williston.(Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 09/02/2009)
09/03/2009	<u>105</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER OF SETTLEMENT CONCERNING ATTORNEYS' FEES: NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by and between plaintiffs and defendants as represented below, as follows: 1. City Defendant agrees to pay the total sum of thee–hundred and fifty–six thousand and two–hundred and fifty dollars and no cents (\$356,250.00)

		to the below designated plaintiffs' counsel; and State Defendant agrees to pay the total sum of one-hundred and eighteen-thousand and seven-hundred and fifty dollars and no cents (\$118,750.00) to the below designated plaintiffs' counsel, for a total of four-hundred and seventy-five thousand dollars and no cents (\$475,000.00), which payment will be made in full satisfaction of all claims for attorneys' fees and costs sought by the Plaintiff Class as against the Defendants for the period from the commencement of this action through the Court's so-order of the Stipulation and Order of Settlement on April 18,2008, as well as for all fees generated in connection with negotiating the terms of this Stipulation and Order. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 9/2/2009) (jfe) Modified on 9/10/2009 (jfe). (Entered: 09/03/2009)
04/16/2012	<u>106</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – FIRST MOTION for Settlement <i>Approval and Enforcement</i> . Document filed by Gertrude Williston. Return Date set for 5/9/2012 at 12:00 PM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Exhibit A)(Cohan, Marc) Modified on 4/17/2012 (db). (Entered: 04/16/2012)
04/16/2012	<u>107</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>106</u> FIRST MOTION for Settlement <i>Approval and Enforcement</i> .. Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Cohan, Marc) Modified on 4/17/2012 (db). (Entered: 04/16/2012)
04/17/2012		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Note to Attorney Marc Cohan to RE-FILE Document <u>106</u> FIRST MOTION for Settlement <i>Approval and Enforcement</i>. ERROR(S): Supporting Documents are filed separately, each receiving their own document #. (db) (Entered: 04/17/2012)
04/17/2012		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Note to Attorney Marc Cohan to RE-FILE Document <u>107</u> Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion. ERROR(S): Document linked to filing error. (db) (Entered: 04/17/2012)
04/17/2012	<u>108</u>	MOTION for Settlement <i>and Enforcement</i> . Document filed by Gertrude Williston. Return Date set for 5/9/2012 at 12:00 PM.(Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 04/17/2012)
04/17/2012	<u>109</u>	AFFIRMATION of Marc Cohan in Support re: <u>108</u> MOTION for Settlement <i>and Enforcement</i> .. Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Exhibit A)(Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 04/17/2012)
04/17/2012	<u>110</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>108</u> MOTION for Settlement <i>and Enforcement</i> .. Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Cohan, Marc) (Entered: 04/17/2012)
04/23/2012	<u>111</u>	ORDER: Plaintiffs' motion for settlement and enforcement, dated April 16, 2012, will be heard at noon on Wednesday, May 9, 2012, in Courtroom 18C. All motion papers shall be served in accordance with Local Civil Rule 6.1. Set Deadlines/Hearing as to <u>108</u> MOTION for Settlement <i>and Enforcement</i> :(Motion Hearing set for 5/9/2012 at 12:00 PM in Courtroom 18C, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Robert W. Sweet.) (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 4/23/2012) (mro) (Entered: 04/23/2012)
05/08/2012	<u>112</u>	AMENDED STIPULATION AND ORDER OF SETTLEMENT governing the terms of settlement. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 5/08/2012) (ama) (Entered: 05/08/2012)
07/30/2012	<u>113</u>	STIPULATION REGARDING ATTORNEY'S FEE MOTION: IT IS THEREFORE STIPULATED AND AGREED that the time within which plaintiffs must file an application for costs and fees with the Court as provided for in the Settlement is extended to and includes October 16, 2012. (Motions due by 10/16/2012.) (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 7/25/2012) (jfe) (Entered: 07/30/2012)
10/10/2012	<u>114</u>	STIPULATION REGARDING ATTORNEY'S FEE MOTION: Motion for costs and fees as provided for in the Settlement due by 11/16/2012. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 10/10/2012) (cd) (Entered: 10/10/2012)

11/15/2012	<u>115</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT RE: STIPULATION REGARDING ATTORNEY'S FEE MOTION: IT IS THEREFORE STIPULATED AND AGREED that the time within which plaintiffs must file an application for costs and fees with the Court as provided for in the Settlement is extended to and includes December 17, 2012. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 11/15/2012) (mt) (Entered: 11/16/2012)
11/15/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: Application for costs and fees due by 12/17/2012. (mt) (Entered: 11/20/2012)
12/19/2012	<u>116</u>	STIPULATION REGARDING ATTORNEY'S FEE MOTION: that the time within which plaintiffs must file an application for costs and fees with the Court as provided for in the Settlement is extended to and includes January 31, 2013. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 12/12/2012) (pl) (Entered: 12/19/2012)
12/19/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: Motions due by 1/31/2013. (pl) (Entered: 12/19/2012)
01/28/2013	<u>117</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – MOTION for Attorney Fees . Document filed by Gertrude Williston. Return Date set for 3/6/2013 at 12:00 PM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Cohan Declaration, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Exhibit A to Cohan Declaration, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Exhibit B to Cohan Declaration, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Exhibit C to Cohan Declaration)(Tasheff, Petra) Modified on 1/29/2013 (ldi). (Entered: 01/28/2013)
01/28/2013	<u>118</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>117</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees.. Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Tasheff, Petra) Modified on 1/29/2013 (ldi). (Entered: 01/28/2013)
01/28/2013		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Note to Attorney Petra T. Tasheff to RE-FILE Document <u>117</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees. ERROR(S): Supporting documents must be filed separately, each receiving their own document number. Declaration in Support of Motion is found under the event list Replies, Opposition and Supporting Documents. (ldi) (Entered: 01/29/2013)
01/28/2013		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Note to Attorney Petra T. Tasheff to RE-FILE Document <u>118</u> Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion. ERROR(S): Document linked to filing error. (ldi) (Entered: 01/29/2013)
01/29/2013	<u>119</u>	MOTION for Attorney Fees. Document filed by Gertrude Williston. Return Date set for 3/6/2013 at 12:00 PM.(Tasheff, Petra) (Entered: 01/29/2013)
01/29/2013	<u>120</u>	DECLARATION of Marc Cohan in Support re: <u>119</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees.. Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Ex A NCLEJ Time Records, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Ex B NYLAG Time Records, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Ex C UJC Time Records)(Tasheff, Petra) (Entered: 01/29/2013)
01/29/2013	<u>121</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>119</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees.. Document filed by Gertrude Williston. (Tasheff, Petra) (Entered: 01/29/2013)
01/31/2013	<u>122</u>	ORDER: Plaintiffs' motion for fees and costs, dated January 29, 2013, will be heard at noon on Wednesday, March 13, 2013, in Courtroom 18C. All motion papers shall be served in accordance with Local Civil Rule 6.1. Set Deadlines/Hearing as to <u>119</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees. :(Motion Hearing set for 3/13/2013 at 12:00 PM in Courtroom 18C, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Robert W. Sweet.) (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 1/30/2013) (pl) (Entered: 01/31/2013)
02/11/2013	<u>123</u>	STIPULATION REGARDING ATTORNEYS FEE MOTION: IT IS THEREFORE STIPULATED AND AGREED that the time for defendants to file their opposition be adjourned from February 11 to February 25, 2013 and the time for plaintiffs reply be adjourned to March 4, 2013. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 2/11/2013) (js) (Entered: 02/11/2013)
03/04/2013	<u>124</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER: The briefing schedule for the response and reply to the plaintiffs' pending <u>119</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees is revised so that defendants' responsive papers, if any, are to be filed on or before 4/1/2013, and

		plaintiffs' reply papers, if any, are to be filed on or before 4/15/2013, with a date for oral argument on the motion to be set thereafter at the Court's convenience. To the extent the Court's jurisdiction to enforce prior stipulations in this action does not extend beyond 3/31/2013, the parties hereto agree that this Court shall retain jurisdiction after 3/31/2013, for the limited purposes of plaintiffs' pending motion for attorney's fees.(Responses due by 4/1/2013, Replies due by 4/15/2013.) (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 2/27/2013) (sac) (Entered: 03/04/2013)
03/08/2013	<u>125</u>	ORDER: Plaintiffs' motion for attorney's fees will be heard at noon on Wednesday, April 17, 2013, in courtroom 18C. All papers to be served in accordance with Local Rule 6.1. Set Deadlines/Hearing as to <u>119</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees: (Motion Hearing set for 4/17/2013 at 12:00 PM in Courtroom 18C, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Robert W. Sweet.) (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 3/8/2013) (ft) (Entered: 03/08/2013)
04/02/2013	<u>126</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER ON CONSENT: That the terms of the Stipulation of Settlement entered by the Court on May 8, 2012 and this Court's jurisdiction for all purposes be extended through and including May 31, 2013. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 3/29/2013) (cd) (Entered: 04/02/2013)
04/03/2013	<u>127</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER OF SETTLEMENT CONCERNING ATTORNEYS' FEES: City Defendant agrees to pay the total sum of fifty-two thousand dollars and no cents (\$52,000.00) to the below designated plaintiffs' counsel; and State Defendant agrees to pay the total sum of thirteen thousand dollars and no cents (\$13,000.00) to the below designated plaintiffs' counsel, for a total of sixty-five thousand dollars and no cents (\$65,000.00), which payment will be made in full satisfaction of all claims for attorneys' fees and costs sought by the Plaintiff Class as against the Defendants for the period from the commencement of this action through the Court's so-order of the Stipulation and Order of Settlement on May 8, 2012, as well as for all fees generated in connection with negotiating the terms of this Stipulation and Order. Payment of the amount owed by Defendants shall be made no later than ninety (90) days from the date that a so ordered copy of this Agreement has been docketed with the Clerk of the Court. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 4/3/2013) (ft) (Entered: 04/03/2013)
05/31/2013	<u>128</u>	STIPULATION: that the terms of the Stipulation of Settlement entered by the Court on May 8, 2012 and this Court's jurisdiction for all purposes be extended to July 1, 2013. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 5/29/2013) (ja) (Entered: 05/31/2013)