

**U.S. District Court  
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:98-cv-08877-WHP**

Reynolds, et al v. Giuliani, et al  
Assigned to: Judge William H. Pauley, III  
Demand: \$0  
Case in other court: 00-09460.  
Cause: 42:1983 Civil Rights Act

Date Filed: 12/16/1998  
Date Terminated: 12/14/2005  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 444 Civil Rights: Welfare  
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

**Plaintiff**

**Lakisha Reynolds**

*on her own behalf and on behalf of all  
others similarly situated*

represented by **Adriene L. Holder**  
The Legal Aid Society  
Civil Division  
90 Church Street  
New York, NY 10007  
(212) 577-3300  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Anne K. Callagy**  
The Legal Aid Society  
Civil Division  
90 Church Street  
New York, NY 10007  
(212) 577-3300  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Christopher D. Lamb**  
The Legal Aid Society  
Civil Division  
90 Church Street  
New York, NY 10007  
(212) 577-3300  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Constance P. Carden**  
New York Legal Assistance Group  
450 West 33rd Street  
11th Floor  
New York, NY 10001  
(212) 750-0800  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Esperanza Colon**  
The Legal Aid Society  
Civil Division  
90 Church Street  
New York, NY 10007  
(212) 577-3300  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Hwan-Hui Helen Lee**  
Northern Manhattan Improvement Corp.  
76 Wadsworth Avenue  
New York, NY 10036  
(212) 822-8306  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Joshua E. Goldfein**  
The Legal Aid Society  
Civil Division  
90 Church Street

New York, NY 10007  
(212) 577-3300  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Kenneth Rosenfeld**  
Northern Manhattan Improvement  
Corporation  
76 Wadsworth Avenue  
New York, NY 10033  
Email: [kenrosenfeld@nmic.org](mailto:kenrosenfeld@nmic.org)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Marc Cohan**  
Welfare Law Center, Inc.  
275 Seventh Avenue  
Suite 1506  
New York, NY 10001  
212-633-6967  
Fax: 212-633-6371  
Email: [cohan@nclej.org](mailto:cohan@nclej.org)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Randal S. Jeffrey**  
New York Legal Assistance Group  
130 East 59th Street  
14th Floor  
New York, NY 10022  
(212) 750-0800  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Rebecca Lynn Scharf**  
Welfare Law Center, Inc.  
275 Seventh Avenue  
Suite 1506  
New York, NY 10001  
718-877-0510  
Fax: 212-633-6371  
Email: [scharf@welfarelaw.org](mailto:scharf@welfarelaw.org)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Scott Alan Rosenberg**  
The Legal Aid Society  
Civil Division  
90 Church Street  
New York, NY 10007  
(212) 577-3300  
Email: [srosenberg@legal-aid.org](mailto:srosenberg@legal-aid.org)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Yisroel Schulman**  
New York Legal Assistance Group  
450 West 33rd Street  
11th Floor  
New York, NY 10001  
(212) 750-0800  
Fax: (212) 750-0820  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Georgina Bonilla**  
*on her own behalf and on behalf of all  
others similarly situated*

represented by **Adriene L. Holder**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Anne K. Callagy**

(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Christopher D. Lamb**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Constance P. Carden**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Esperanza Colon**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Hwan-Hui Helen Lee**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Joshua Gold**  
Anderson Kill & Olick, P.C.  
1251 Avenue of the Americas  
New York, NY 10020  
212-278-1886  
Fax: 212-278-1733  
Email: [jgold@andersonkill.com](mailto:jgold@andersonkill.com)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Kenneth Rosenfeld**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Marc Cohan**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Randal S. Jeffrey**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Rebecca Lynn Scharf**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Scott Alan Rosenberg**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Yisroel Schulman**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**April Smiley**  
*on her own behalf and on behalf of all  
others similarly situated*

represented by **Adriene L. Holder**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Anne K. Callagy**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Christopher D. Lamb**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Constance P. Carden**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Esperanza Colon**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Hwan–Hui Helen Lee**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Joshua Gold**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Kenneth Rosenfeld**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Marc Cohan**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Randal S. Jeffrey**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Rebecca Lynn Scharf**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Scott Alan Rosenberg**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Yisroel Schulman**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Lue Garlick**  
*on her own behalf and on behalf of all  
others similarly situated*

represented by **Adriene L. Holder**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Anne K. Callagy**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Christopher D. Lamb**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Constance P. Carden**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Esperanza Colon**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Hwan–Hui Helen Lee**  
(See above for address)

*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Joshua Gold**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Kenneth Rosenfeld**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Marc Cohan**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Randal S. Jeffrey**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Rebecca Lynn Scharf**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Scott Alan Rosenberg**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Yisroel Schulman**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Adriana Calabrese**  
*on her own behalf and on behalf of all  
others similarly situated*

represented by **Adriene L. Holder**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Anne K. Callagy**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Christopher D. Lamb**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Constance P. Carden**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Esperanza Colon**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Hwan–Hui Helen Lee**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Joshua Gold**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Kenneth Rosenfeld**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Marc Cohan**

(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Randal S. Jeffrey**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Rebecca Lynn Scharf**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Scott Alan Rosenberg**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Yisroel Schulman**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Jenny Cuevas**  
*on her own behalf and on behalf of all  
others similarly situated*

represented by **Adriene L. Holder**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Anne K. Callagy**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Christopher D. Lamb**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Constance P. Carden**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Esperanza Colon**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Hwan–Hui Helen Lee**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Joshua Gold**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Kenneth Rosenfeld**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Marc Cohan**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Randal S. Jeffrey**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Rebecca Lynn Scharf**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Scott Alan Rosenberg**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Yisroel Schulman**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Plaintiff**

**Elston Richards**  
*on his own behalf and on behalf of all  
others similarly situated*

represented by **Adriene L. Holder**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Anne K. Callagy**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Christopher D. Lamb**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Constance P. Carden**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Esperanza Colon**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Hwan–Hui Helen Lee**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Joshua Gold**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Kenneth Rosenfeld**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Marc Cohan**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Randal S. Jeffrey**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Rebecca Lynn Scharf**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Scott Alan Rosenberg**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Yisroel Schulman**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

V.

**Defendant**

**Rudolph Giuliani**  
as Mayor of the City of New York

**Defendant**

**Jason Turner**  
as Commissioner of the New York City  
Department of Social Services

**Defendant**

**Brian J. Wing**  
as Commissioner of the New York State  
Office of Temporary and Disability  
Assistance

**Defendant**

**Barbara DeBuono**  
as Commissioner of the New York State  
Department of Health

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
12/16/1998	1	COMPLAINT filed; Summons issued and Notice pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 636(c); (em) (Entered: 12/18/1998)
12/16/1998		Magistrate Judge Buchwald is so Designated. (em) (Entered: 12/18/1998)
12/16/1998	3	Order endorsed on declaration and support of request to proceed in forma pauperis; granted. ( signed by Judge Peter K. Leisure/Part I ) (kw) (Entered: 12/21/1998)
12/16/1998	4	Notice of reassignment to Judge William H. Pauley III. Copy of notice mailed to Attorney(s) of record: Hwan-Hui Helen Lee, Kenneth Rosenfeld, Randal S. Jeffrey, Constance P. Carden, Yisroel Schulman, Rebecca L. Scharf, Marc Cohan, Adriene L. Holder, Esperanza Colon, Joshua E. Goldfein, Anne K. Callagy, Christopher D. Lamb and Scott A. Rosenberg and Joshua E. Goldfein . (em) (Entered: 12/21/1998)
12/17/1998	2	ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE AND A TEMPORARY RESTRAINING ORDER by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards; Show Cause Hearing set for 9:30 12/30/98; pursuant to Rule 23 of the FRCP, to certify class action ; pursuant to Rule 65 of the FRCP, for a preliminary injunction against the defendants ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (ae) (Entered: 12/18/1998)
12/18/1998		Memorandum to Docket Clerk: OTSC before Judge Pauley – Judge's decision: provide the named plttfs expedited food stamps or emergency cash grants within 24 hrs.; next PTC set for 12/23/98 @10:00; Evidentiary Hearing set for 12/30/98 @9:30am. (lam) (Entered: 12/23/1998)
12/18/1998		Pre-trial conference set at 10:00 12/23/98 (lam) (Entered: 12/23/1998)
12/21/1998		Telephone conference held and concluded with Judge Pauley; Judge's Decision: city's opposition due 1/8/99, plttf's reply due 1/12/99; Evidentiary Hearing adjourned to 1/14/99 @9:00am. Submitted by Stan Pugliese. (lam) (Entered: 12/29/1998)
12/23/1998		Memorandum to Docket Clerk: Hearing begun and concluded before Judge Pauley on 12/23/98; Order signed. Submitted by Stan Pugliese. (lam) (Entered: 12/29/1998)
12/28/1998	5	ORDER, on consent of all parties that pending a hearing and determination of plttfs' application for preliminary injunctive relief, plttfs and the NYC defts shall implement an "informal intervention" procedure to address individual cases of exigent need for "expedited food stamps" and/or "emergency cash assistance" ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 01/04/1999)



01/06/1999	7	NOTICE OF SUPPLEMENTAL MOTION SUPPLEMENTING: an order to show cause by intervener Posr A. Posr to audio-visually record, with a video camera the proceedings in this case ; Return date of 9:30 a.m. on 1/11/99. (kw) (Entered: 01/11/1999)
01/06/1999		Telephone conference held and concluded with Judge Pauley; Evidentiary Hearing adjourned until 1/20/99 @9:00am. (lam) (Entered: 01/12/1999)
01/07/1999	6	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER, on 12/21/98, this Court received an ex parte application from Mr. Posr A. Posr, executive director of an organization known as Pro Se Views, seeking permission to videotape and televise further courtroom proceedings in this civil action. For the reasons stated in this memorandum and order, the application is denied. ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III); Copies mailed (djc) (Entered: 01/08/1999)
01/12/1999		Telephone conference held and concluded before Judge Pauley. (kw) (Entered: 01/14/1999)
01/13/1999		Telephone conference held and concluded before Judge Pauley. (kw) (Entered: 01/14/1999)
01/14/1999		Telephone conference held before and concluded before Judge Pauley. (kw) (Entered: 01/15/1999)
01/15/1999		Telephone conference held and concluded before Judge Pauley. (kw) (Entered: 01/20/1999)
01/15/1999		Telephone conference held and concluded before Judge Pauley. (kw) (Entered: 01/20/1999)
01/19/1999	8	ORDER, regarding the Court decision on the letter memoranda submitted by the City defendants and the plaintiffs dated 1/13/99, and 1/14/99. The production of documents required by this Order shall be made by delivering copies to plaintiffs' counsel at the offices of the Welfare Law Center, or such other location as the parties may designate in New York County, no later than 1/16/99 at 11:00 a.m. ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed (kw) (Entered: 01/20/1999)
01/19/1999		Telephone conference held and concluded before Judge Pauley. (kw) (Entered: 01/20/1999)
01/20/1999		Motion hearing on preliminary injunction/TRO begun before Judge Pauley. (kw) (Entered: 02/01/1999)
01/21/1999	9	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER, by letter memorandum dated 1/19/99, the City defendants move for an order in limine to preclude the introduction of a declaration by Adrienne L. Holder and to preclude the testimony of Sue Kelly and Mary A. Ferris. In view of the plaintiffs' stipulation, Ferris will not testify at the hearing. The City defendants motion in limine is denied ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed (kw) (Entered: 01/25/1999)
01/21/1999		Motion hearing before Judge Pauley continued. (kw) (Entered: 02/01/1999)
01/22/1999		Motion hearing continued and concluded before Judge Pauley. (kw) (Entered: 02/01/1999)
01/22/1999	33	NOTICE OF APPEAL by Posr A. Posr Executive Director of Pro-Se Views, A Court News Organization ; from ; permission to make a video-recording of the proceedings in the above entitled matter and denying Pro-Se Views to make a video recording of Pro-Se Views' application to video record proceedings netered in this action on the 7th day of January, 1999. Copies of notice of appeal mailed to Attorney(s) of Record: Corporation Counsel and Attorney General for the State of New York . *(IFP GRANTED FEBRUARY 16, 1999)*. Appeal record due on 2/22/99. (dt) (Entered: 02/24/1999)
01/26/1999	10	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER granting in part, denying in part [2-2] motion pursuant to Rule 65 of the FRCP, for a preliminary injunction against the defendants; the Court will hear oral argument on the sufficiency of the corrective plan as soon as practicable after the submissions have been filed. At that time, the

		Court will also entertain any requests to modify the preliminary injunction. Finally, the parties are directed to confer on the formulation of a pretrial discovery plan pursuant to FRCP 16 to be presented for approval to this Court on 2/18/99 ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed (kw) (Entered: 01/27/1999)
01/26/1999	11	DECLARATION of Jacquelyn Flaum. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/26/1999	12	DECLARATION of William Stalzer. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/26/1999	13	DECLARATION of Atler Williams–Kahn. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/26/1999	14	DECLARATION of Jacqueline King. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/26/1999	15	DECLARATION of Zebedee Daniels. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/26/1999	16	DECLARATION of William Satter White. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/26/1999	17	DECLARATION of Christopher Burch. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/26/1999	18	DECLARATION of Robertino Cox. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/26/1999	19	DECLARATION of Seth W. Diamond. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/26/1999	20	Plaintiffs' Supplemental Deposition Designations. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/26/1999	21	Transcript of record of the deposition of Rafael Heral on 1/20/99. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/26/1999	22	Transcript of record of the deposition of Adrienne Fleming on 1/20/99. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/26/1999	23	Transcript of record of the deposition of Gloria Lamboy on 1/20/99. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/26/1999	24	Transcript of record of the deposition of Sylvia Gonzalez on 1/20/99. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/26/1999	25	Transcript of record of the deposition of Edward Brown on 1/20/99. (kw) (Entered: 01/28/1999)
01/29/1999	26	NOTICE OF CROSS MOTION by Brian J. Wing, and Barbara DeBuono for an order and judgment pursuant to FRCP Rule 12(b), dismissing plaintiffs' claims against the State defendants ; affidavit in support is attached. (kw) (Entered: 02/02/1999)
01/29/1999	27	MEMORANDUM by Brian J. Wing, and Barbara DeBuono in support of [26–1] cross motion for an order and judgment pursuant to FRCP Rule 12(b), dismissing plaintiffs' claims against the State defendants. (kw) (Entered: 02/02/1999)
02/01/1999	28	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Pauley on 12/16/98. (kw) (Entered: 02/08/1999)
02/01/1999	29	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Pauley on 12/21/98. (kw) (Entered: 02/08/1999)
02/01/1999	30	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Pauley on 12/23/98. (kw) (Entered: 02/08/1999)
02/10/1999	37	Job Center Action Plan by the NYC Human Resources Administration in response to the memorandum and order dated 1/25/99 of Judge Pauley in connection to 98 civ. 8877. (kw) (Entered: 03/09/1999)
02/16/1999	31	Order endorsed on declaration in support of request to proceed in forma pauperis, granted; (signed by Judge William H. Pauley III) (dj) (Entered: 02/16/1999)
02/16/1999		Telephone conference held before Judge Pauley. Contested issue – yes. (kw) (Entered: 02/22/1999)
02/19/1999	32	Plaintiffs' comments on the City defendants' corrective action plan. (kw) (Entered: 02/22/1999)

02/24/1999		Notice of appeal and certified copy of docket to USCA: [33-1] appeal ; Copy of notice of appeal sent to District Judge. (dt) (Entered: 02/24/1999)
03/01/1999	34	Notice that the record on appeal has been certified and transmitted to the U.S. Court of Appeals: [33-1] appeal. (dt) (Entered: 03/01/1999)
03/01/1999		Indexed record on appeal files sent to the U.S.C.A. (dt) (Entered: 03/01/1999)
03/03/1999	35	Filed Memo-Endorsement on letter from Marc Cohan, for plttfs dated 2/26/99, The City defts will serve and file their response to plttfs' comments by 3/10/99; plttfs will serve and file their reply to the City defts' response by 3/17/99 ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ) (lam) (Entered: 03/04/1999)
03/09/1999	36	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 1/21/99 @9:45 before Judge Pauley. (lam) (Entered: 03/09/1999)
03/10/1999		Telephone conference held and concluded before Judge Pauley. Contested issue - yes. (kw) (Entered: 03/17/1999)
03/11/1999		Telephone conference held and concluded before Judge Pauley. Contested issue - yes. (kw) (Entered: 03/17/1999)
03/12/1999		Telephone conference held and concluded before Judge Pauley. Contested issue - yes. (kw) (Entered: 03/17/1999)
03/16/1999	38	Filed Memo-Endorsement on letter from Jonathan Pines, Asst Corp Counsel, atty for the City defts dated 3/10/99, granting request for an enlargement of time within which to file a response to plttfs' comments to the Job Center Action Plan; the City defts' response will be served by close of business on 3/15/99, and plttfs' response will be served by close of business on 3/22/99 ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ) (lam) (Entered: 03/16/1999)
03/17/1999	39	Filed Memo-Endorsement on letter from Jonathan Pines, Asst Corp Counsel, atty for City defts dated 3/15/99, granting request for a 24 hrs. enlargement of time; the City defts' response will be served by close of business on 3/16/99, and plttfs' response will be served by close of business on 3/23/99 ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ) (lam) (Entered: 03/19/1999)
03/17/1999	40	DECLARATION of Hannah Cohen, with the NYC Human Resources Administration, Office of Legal Affairs, in response to plaintiffs' comments on the City Defendants' Corrective Action Plan ("Comments"), and in support of City defendants' seeking a lifting of the stay of conversion of additional Centers pursuant to the Court's preliminary injunction. (kw) (Entered: 03/22/1999)
03/17/1999	41	DECLARATION of Jonathan Pines in response to plaintiffs' comments and in support of City Defendants' Order to Show Cause for Modification of the Preliminary Injunction. (kw) (Entered: 03/22/1999)
03/19/1999		Pre-trial conference held and concluded before Judge Pauley. Contested issue - yes. (kw) (Entered: 03/22/1999)
03/19/1999	42	Affidavit of service of brief dated 3/17/99 upon Jonathan Pines, Asst Corp counsel by Hwan-Hui Helen Lee, The Legal Aid Society on 3/17/99. (lam) (Entered: 03/24/1999)
03/22/1999	43	REPLY DECLARATION in support of Hwan-Hui Helen Lee, one of the attys for Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Cuevas, Elston Richards [2-1] motion pursuant to Rule 23 of the FRCP, to certify class action, [2-2] motion pursuant to Rule 65 of the FRCP, for a preliminary injunction against the defendants (lam) (Entered: 03/25/1999)
03/22/1999	44	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards re: in support of [2-1] motion pursuant to Rule 23 of the FRCP, to certify class action, [2-2] motion pursuant to 65 of the FRCP, for a preliminary injunction against the defendants (lam) (Entered: 03/25/1999)
03/22/1999	45	Filed Memo-Endorsement on letter to Judge Pauley from Hwan-Hui Helen Lee dated 3/18/99, counsel requests an extension of time to file their response to the

		City defendants' response to plaintiffs' comments to the City defendants' corrective action plan, from 3/23/99 to 3/29/99. Application granted ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ) (kw) (Entered: 03/25/1999)
03/24/1999		Telephone conference held and concluded before Judge Pauley. Contested issue – yes. (kw) (Entered: 03/29/1999)
03/25/1999	46	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Pauley filed on 1/20/99. (kw) (Entered: 03/30/1999)
03/26/1999	47	SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION of Jonathan Pines. (kw) (Entered: 03/30/1999)
03/29/1999	48	REPLY by plaintiffs' to City Defendants' response to plaintiffs' comments on City Defendants' corrective action plan. (kw) (Entered: 03/31/1999)
03/29/1999	49	Reply DECLARATION of Hwan–Hui Helen Lee, one of the attorneys for the plaintiffs, in opposition to the City defendants' application. (kw) (Entered: 03/31/1999)
03/31/1999	50	STIPULATION and ORDER; that pending the vacating or modification of the 1/25/99 stay against converting Income Support Centers to Job Centers, City defts shall provide this Court and counsel for the plttfs and for the State defts with written notice 30 days in advance of (a) closing an Income Support Center; (b) reducing the number of zip codes served by an Income Support Center; or (c) transferring responsibility for any zip codes from an Income Support Center to a Job Center, where any of the above would result in the directing of applicants from an Income Support Center to a Job Center; effective as of the signing of this Stipulation and Order and until such time as this Court vacates or modifies the 1/25/99 stay against converting Income Support Centers to Job Centers, the city defts shall cease referring applicants for public assistance, food stamps, and medicaid who would, prior to 3/1/99, have gone to the East End Income Support Center and will instead process their applications at the East End Income Support Center. In addition, City defts shall issue a memorandum revoking Center Director Memo CD–99–9, dated 2/16/99, in so far as it pertains to new applicants ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ). (jp) (Entered: 04/02/1999)
03/31/1999	51	ORDER, that plttf's application to inspect the City defts' Job Centers purs to FRCP 34 is granted as set forth in this Order ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 04/05/1999)
03/31/1999	52	SCHEDULING ORDER: First sets of interrogatories and notices to produce documents to be served by 4/1/99; Depositions will commence no later than 5/1/99; All fact Discovery cutoff 9/30/99; Requests for admissions will be served by 10/29/99, and responses will be served by 11/22/99; The parties will serve their respective expert reports by 10/29/99; All expert discovery, including expert depositions, will be completed by 12/3/99; Joint Pretrial order to be submitted on or before 1/15/99; A Final Pretrial conference for 9:30 1/7/00 ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed by Chambers. (lam) (Entered: 04/05/1999)
04/08/1999	53	Filed Memo–Endorsement on letter to Judge Pauley from Jonathan Pines, dated 4/2/99, granting City defts' request for the Court to schedule argument on the sufficiency of City defts' Job Cetner Action Plan; Oral argument on the sufficiency of the City defts'Job Center Action Plan is scheduled for 4/20/99 at 4:00 p.m. ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ) (cd) (Entered: 04/08/1999)
04/08/1999		Telephone conference held and concluded before Judge Pauley. Contested issue – yes. (kw) (Entered: 04/13/1999)
04/19/1999		Telephone conference held and concluded before Judge Pauley. Contested issue – yes. (kw) (Entered: 04/22/1999)
04/20/1999		Telephone conference held and concluded before Judge Pauley. Contested issue – yes. (kw) (Entered: 04/22/1999)
04/23/1999	54	Transcript of record of proceeding before Judge Pauley 2/16/99. (kw) (Entered: 04/23/1999)

04/23/1999		Telephone conference held and concluded before Judge Pauley. Contested issue – yes. (kw) (Entered: 04/29/1999)
04/27/1999	55	SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION of Patricia M. Smith. (kw) (Entered: 05/04/1999)
04/29/1999	56	DECLARATION in opposition of Hwan–Hui Helen Lee, an atty for Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Cuevas, Elston Richards re: City defts' application for approval of the CAP and for modification of the Preliminary Injunction. (lam) (Entered: 05/04/1999)
04/29/1999	57	Deposition Designations filed by plttfs. (lam) (Entered: 05/04/1999)
04/30/1999	58	MEMORANDUM by Lakisha Reynolds in support of plaintiffs' motion for class certification. (kw) (Entered: 05/06/1999)
05/03/1999	63	Deposition Designation from the deposition of Sheila Butler on 4/16/99. (lam) (Entered: 05/10/1999)
05/03/1999	64	DECLARATION of Ismaila Toure re: injury caused by his car being hit by an ambulance. (lam) (Entered: 05/10/1999)
05/05/1999	59	SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION of Jonathan Pines in response to Re: [57–1] to the materials submit by plaintiffs on 4/29/99. (kw) (Entered: 05/07/1999)
05/05/1999	60	Filed Memo–Endorsement on letter from Marc Cohan, atty dated 4/29/99, approving the following briefing schedule for the motion for class certification: plttfs' will serve their Memorandum of Law in Support of Class Certification on the defts by 4/30/99; defts are permitted 30 days to submit their opposition papers; plttfs' reply briefing is due 15 days later; plttfs will serve copies of this endorsed letter on all counsel of record ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ) (lam) (Entered: 05/07/1999)
05/05/1999	61	Filed Memo–Endorsement on letter from James M. Hershler, Asst Atty General dated 4/27/99, granting joint request for a 2 wk extension of time to respond to the interrogatories and document requests served by plttfs on 4/1/99 ; the City defts will serve copies of this endorsed letter on all counsel of record ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ) (lam) (Entered: 05/07/1999)
05/05/1999	62	Filed Memo–Endorsement on letter to Judge Pauley from Hwan–Hui Helen Lee dated 5/3/99, counsel, for plaintiffs, requests an order from the Court requiring the City defendants to provide plaintiffs with the data described in plaintiffs' 4/30/99 letter to the Court by the close of business today and permitting plaintiffs until the close of business on 5/5/99 to submit their analysis of the data to the Court. Plaintiffs may submit their analysis of the data concerning income support centers by 5/5/99 at 5:00 p.m. ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ) (kw) (Entered: 05/10/1999)
05/06/1999	65	Plaintiffs' reply declaration. (kw) (Entered: 05/11/1999)
05/24/1999	66	MEMORANDUM AND ORDER, the "City defendants" motion to modify a preliminary injunction entered by this Court on 1/25/99 is granted in part and denied in part ; set pre–trial conference for 3:00 p.m. on 6/3/99 ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed (kw) (Entered: 05/26/1999)
06/03/1999		Pretrial Conference held and concluded before Judge William H. Pauley III. Contested issue – yes. (kw) (Entered: 06/15/1999)
06/08/1999	67	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 3/24/99 @4:15pm before Judge Pauley. (lam) (Entered: 06/08/1999)
06/08/1999	68	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 4/8/99 @5:49pm before Judge Pauley. (lam) (Entered: 06/08/1999)
06/08/1999	69	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 4/29/99 @4:20pm before Judge Pauley. (lam) (Entered: 06/08/1999)
06/11/1999	70	SCHEDULING ORDER: the City defendants will serve and file their expert report by 6/21/99; plaintiffs will serve and file their expert report by 7/2/99; the parties will serve and file their respective witness lists by 7/2/99; an evidentiary hearing is

		scheduled for 7/14/99 at 9:30 a.m. ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed (kw) (Entered: 06/15/1999)
06/11/1999		Telephone Conference held before Judge William H. Pauley III (lam) (Entered: 06/15/1999)
06/15/1999	71	Filed Memo–Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Pauley, dated 6/9/99, from Jonathan Pines, Asst Corp. Counsel; requesting that City depts be permitted to serve their opposition to plttfs' motion for class certification on 7/21/99, with plttfs' reply papers due on 8/12/99; the revised briefing schedule is approved ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 06/17/1999)
06/22/1999	72	Report of City Defendants' expert Dr. June E. O'Neill. (kw) (Entered: 06/24/1999)
06/24/1999		Telephone Conference held and concluded before Judge William H. Pauley III. Contested issue – yes. (kw) (Entered: 06/28/1999)
07/08/1999		Pretrial Conference held before Judge William H. Pauley III (lam) (Entered: 07/14/1999)
07/09/1999	73	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 4/8/99 @5:49pm before Judge Pauley. (lam) (Entered: 07/09/1999)
07/09/1999	74	Transcript of record of proceedings filed for dates of 3/19/99 @11:05am before Judge Pauley. (lam) (Entered: 07/09/1999)
07/14/1999	75	SCHEDULING ORDER: that the City depts' motion to preclude plttfs from offering the testimony of the 11 fact witnesses identified on plttfs' witness list is denied; however, plttf will offer the direct testimony of any such witnesses through declarations to be served by 5:00pm on 7/12/99; the City depts' motion to strike the declaration of Randall S. Jeffrey, dated 7/2/99, is denied; the hearing scheduled for 7/14/99 is adjourned to 7/26/99 @2:00pm ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed (lam) (Entered: 07/15/1999)
07/20/1999	76	Filed Memo–Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Pauley from Jonathan Pines, dated 7/14/99, counsel, for City defendants, requests a telephone conference with the Court for the purpose of re–visiting City defendants' application to preclude the declaration of Randall S. Jeffrey, dated 7/2/99. The City defendants' application is denied, except with respect to those figures and calculations set forth in the Jeffrey declaration which are not accompanied by an evidentiary citation and, where relevant, an explanation of the methodology behind the calculation, the City defendants may serve narrowly tailored interrogatories seeking that clarifying information. Any such interrogatories will be served and filed by 5:00 p.m. on 7/19/99. Response will be served and filed by 5:00 p.m. on 7/22/99 ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (kw) Modified on 07/23/1999 (Entered: 07/21/1999)
07/26/1999		Telephone Conference held before Judge William H. Pauley III. (lam) (Entered: 08/03/1999)
07/28/1999	78	DECLARATION of Randal S. Jeffrey on behalf of plaintiffs in opposition to the City defendants' motion to further modify this Court's preliminary injunction. (kw) (Entered: 07/30/1999)
07/28/1999	79	RESPONSE by plaintiffs to City defendants' first interrogatories to plaintiffs. (kw) (Entered: 07/30/1999)
07/29/1999	77	Filed Memo–Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Pauley from Jonathan Pines, Asst Corp. Counsel, atty for City depts, dated 7/21/99; granting request for a revision in the briefing schedule for plttfs' motion for class certification, requesting that City depts be permitted to serve their opposition to the motion 8/4/99, with plttfs' reply papers due on 8/26/99 ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 07/30/1999)
07/29/1999	80	ORDER, the City defendants' application to modify the preliminary injunction entered by this Court on 1/25/99 is denied without prejudice to its renewal upon further application to the Court ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (kw) (Entered: 08/02/1999)

08/04/1999	81	SEALED DOCUMENT placed in vault (da) (Entered: 08/04/1999)
08/10/1999	82	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Pauley on 6/3/99. (kw) (Entered: 08/10/1999)
08/30/1999	83	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, and Elston Richards in support of plaintiffs' motion for class certification. (kw) (Entered: 08/31/1999)
09/08/1999	84	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Pauley on 7/26/99. (kw) (Entered: 09/09/1999)
09/14/1999	85	ORDER, set status conference for 9:00 a.m. on 9/15/99 ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (kw) (Entered: 09/15/1999)
10/21/1999		Pretrial Conference held before Judge William H. Pauley III. Contested issue yes. (kw) (Entered: 10/26/1999)
10/28/1999	86	ORDER, plttfs will serve and file their expert report by 12/6/99 ; the City defts will conduct the deposition of plttfs' expert on 12/8 and 9, 1999 ; the parties will submit their respective proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law, and a joint pre-hearing order identifying exhibits, by the close of business on 12/10/99 ; an evidentiary hearing is scheduled for 12/15/99 @9:00am ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ) Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 11/01/1999)
10/28/1999	86	ORDER, plttfs will serve and file their expert report by 12/6/99 ; the City defts will conduct the deposition of plttfs' expert on 12/8 and 9, 1999 ; the parties will submit their respective proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law, and a joint pre-hearing order identifying exhibits, by the close of business on 12/10/99 ; set evidentiary hearing for 9:00 12/15/99 (signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 11/05/1999)
11/08/1999	87	Transcript of record of proceeding before Judge William H. Pauley III on 4/20/99. (kw) (Entered: 11/08/1999)
11/08/1999	88	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge William H. Pauley III for the date(s) of 4/22/99 @9:00am. (lam) (Entered: 11/08/1999)
11/08/1999	89	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge William H. Pauley III for the date(s) of 9/22/99 @9:15am. (lam) (Entered: 11/08/1999)
11/08/1999	90	MANDATE OF USCA (certified copy) Re: [33-1] appeal. The order of the Dist. Court is affirmed. (emil) (Entered: 11/09/1999)
11/09/1999	91	NOTICE OF MOTION by Rudolph Giuliani, Jason Turner; for an order pursuant to Local Rule 1.3(c) for Tracey H. Cohen to appear pro hac vice ; w/ attch. certif. in support; Return date: not indicated (pl) (Entered: 11/12/1999)
11/12/1999	92	NOTICE OF MOTION by Rudolph Giuliani, Jason Turner for Coleen Friel to appear pro hac vice for Giuliani, and Turner . With Certificate attached. Return date not indicated. (lam) Modified on 12/03/1999 (Entered: 11/16/1999)
11/24/1999	93	ORDER, granting [91-1] motion for an order pursuant to Local Rule 1.3(c) for Tracey H. Cohen to appear pro hac vice. ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (Sent document to Attorney Admission Clerk) (kw) (Entered: 12/01/1999)
11/24/1999	94	ORDER, granting [92-1] motion for Coleen Friel to appear pro hac vice for Giuliani, and Turner. ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (Sent document to Attorney Admission Clerk) (kw) (Entered: 12/01/1999)
12/01/1999	95	STIPULATION and PROTECTIVE ORDER, governing the handling of confidential information ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ) (lam) (Entered: 12/03/1999)
12/01/1999	96	STIPULATION and PROTECTIVE ORDER, governing the handling of confidential information ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ) (lam) (Entered: 12/03/1999)

12/01/1999	97	ORDER, for Charles A. Miller to appear pro hac vice for City depts' Giuliani and Turner ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (orig doc. sent to the atty admissions clerk) (lam) Modified on 12/08/1999 (Entered: 12/06/1999)
12/02/1999	98	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge William H. Pauley III for the date(s) of 10/21/99 @3:30pm. (lam) (Entered: 12/06/1999)
12/07/1999	99	NOTICE OF MOTION by Rudolph Giuliani, Jason Turner for Charles A. Miller to appear pro hac vice for Giuliani and Turner . With Certification and Certificate attached. Return date not indicated. (lam) Modified on 12/10/1999 (Entered: 12/10/1999)
12/10/1999		Remark by the Cashier's Office on a one page docketed sheet that on 12/10/99 \$25.00 was paid. (kw) (Entered: 12/13/1999)
12/10/1999	100	FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW by City Defendants. (kw) (Entered: 12/13/1999)
12/10/1999	101	NOTICE OF MOTION by Rudolph Giuliani, Jason Turner, Brian J. Wing, and Barbara DeBuono for an order vacating the Court's preliminary injunction of 1/22/99 ; declaration of Abdullah, Bush, Dworkin, Elbaz, Flaum, O'Neill and Smith in support are attached. (kw) Modified on 12/13/1999 (Entered: 12/13/1999)
12/10/1999	102	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Rudolph Giuliani, Jason Turner, Brian J. Wing, and Barbara DeBuono in support of [101-1] motion for an order vacating the Court's preliminary injunction of 1/22/99. (kw) (Entered: 12/13/1999)
12/13/1999		Telephone Conference held before Judge William H. Pauley III. (lam) (Entered: 12/13/1999)
12/14/1999		Telephone Conference held before Judge William H. Pauley III (lam) (Entered: 12/22/1999)
12/16/1999		Remark by Cashiers Office on doc. #94, Order of Pro Hac Vice; on 12/16/99 the following transaction was made: 362033, Ca \$25. (lam) (Entered: 12/21/1999)
12/17/1999	103	Remark by Cashiers Office on copy of order for pro hac vice (doc. #93); on 12/17/99 the following transaction was made: 362097 CA \$25. (lam) (Entered: 12/21/1999)
01/10/2000	104	Supplemental DECLARATION of Patrica M. Smith. (kw) Modified on 01/18/2000 (Entered: 01/18/2000)
01/10/2000	105	Second Supplemental DECLARATION of June O'Neill. (kw) (Entered: 01/18/2000)
01/18/2000		Telephone Conference held before Judge William H. Pauley III. (lam) (Entered: 02/01/2000)
01/25/2000	106	STIPULATION and ORDER, the parties consent to the filing of all the volumes of exhibits to the plttfs' 12/10/99 submissions under seal because they contain the names and other confidential information of welfare applicants at the job centers and the income support centers ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ) (lam) (Entered: 01/27/2000)
01/31/2000	107	Memo to Civil Docket clerk: a hearing began on 12/15/99 and concluded on the following date: 1/19/00; the submission of simultaneous proposed findings and conclusions are due 2/4/00, simultaneous responsive briefs are due 2/11/00, oral argument set for 2/16/00 @5:00. (lam) (Entered: 02/01/2000)
02/04/2000	108	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge William H. Pauley III for the date(s) of 12/14/99 @3:05pm. (lam) (Entered: 02/04/2000)
02/04/2000	109	Transcript of record of proceeding before Judge William H. Pauley III on 12/15/99. (kw) (Entered: 02/07/2000)
02/04/2000	110	Post-hearing MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Rudolph Giuliani, Jason Turner, Brian J. Wing, and Barbara DeBuono in support of [101-1] motion for an order vacating the Court's preliminary injunction of 1/22/99. (kw) (Entered: 02/08/2000)



02/04/2000	111	City defendants' proposed FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW. (Submitted Post-hearing) (kw) (Entered: 02/08/2000)
02/11/2000	112	RESPONSE by Rudolph Giuliani, Jason Turner, Brian J. Wing, and Barbara DeBuono to plaintiffs' opposition to motion to vacate the preliminary injunction. (kw) (Entered: 02/15/2000)
02/28/2000	114	Supplemental Deposition Designations by plaintiffs. (kw) (Entered: 03/03/2000)
02/28/2000	116	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by plaintiffs and the plaintiff class in opposition to [101-1] motion for an order vacating the Court's injunction of 1/22/99. (kw) (Entered: 03/03/2000)
02/28/2000	117	REPLY MEMORANDUM by plaintiffs and the plaintiff class in opposition to re: [101-1] motion for an order vacating the Court's preliminary injunction of 1/22/99. (kw) (Entered: 03/03/2000)
02/28/2000	115	Plaintiffs' revised proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law. (kw) (Entered: 03/08/2000)
03/02/2000	113	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge William H. Pauley III for the date(s) of 1/19/00 @9:00am. (lam) (Entered: 03/02/2000)
03/10/2000		Record on appeal files returned from U.S. Court of Appeals: [33-1] appeal. (dt) (Entered: 03/10/2000)
04/06/2000	118	SEALED DOCUMENT placed in vault. (da) (Entered: 04/06/2000)
04/06/2000	119	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge William H. Pauley III for the date(s) of 2/16/00 @5:23pm. (lam) (Entered: 04/06/2000)
05/18/2000		Telephone Conference held before Judge William H. Pauley III. (lam) (Entered: 05/24/2000)
05/24/2000	120	ORDER, by 6/1/00, plaintiffs will serve and file a supplemental memorandum of points and authorities in opposition to Point II, III and IV of the State defendants' memorandum of law dated 1/18/99 and also as set forth in this document. The State defendants will serve and file a supplemental memorandum of points and authorities regarding the foregoing issues by 6/12/00. Plaintiffs may serve and file an additional memorandum in response to the State defendants' arguments by 6/14/00. Plaintiffs are directed to serve a copy of this scheduling order on all counsel by telecopier ; ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); copies mailed. (kw) (Entered: 05/25/2000)
06/12/2000	121	Supplemental MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Rudolph Giuliani, Jason Turner, Brian J. Wing, and Barbara DeBuono in support of their motion to dismiss. (Received in the night deposit box on 6/12/00 at 5:51 p.m.) (kw) (Entered: 06/15/2000)
06/23/2000	122	DECLARATION of Rebecca L. Scharf by plaintiffs in opposition to State defendants' motion to dismiss the complaint. (kw) (Entered: 06/27/2000)
06/23/2000	123	SUPPLEMENTAL MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Lakisha Reynolds in opposition to State defendants' motion to dismiss the complaint. (kw) (Entered: 06/27/2000)
07/07/2000	124	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge William H. Pauley III on 1/19/00. (kw) (Entered: 07/07/2000)
07/21/2000	125	MEMORANDUM & ORDER, denying the City defts' [101-1] motion for an order vacating the Court's preliminary injunction of 1/22/99; denying the State defts' [26-1] cross motion for an order and judgment pursuant to FRCP 12(b), dismissing plaintiffs' claims against the State defendants; granting plttfs' motion for class certification ; setting status conference with all counsel for 3:45 8/4/00 ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 07/21/2000)
08/03/2000	126	NOTICE OF MOTION by Rudolph Giuliani, Jason Turner, Brian J. Wing, Barbara DeBuono for reconsideration/reargument of [125-1] order granting plttfs' motion for class certification ; Return date 8/30/00 (cd) (Entered: 08/04/2000)

08/03/2000	127	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Rudolph Giuliani, Jason Turner, Brian J. Wing, Barbara DeBuono in support of [126-1] motion for reconsideration/reargument of [125-1] order granting plttfs' motion for class certification . (cd) (Entered: 08/04/2000)
08/04/2000	128	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Pauley from Tracey H. Cohen, dated 8/2/00; reset status conference for 12:00 8/24/00 ( signed by Judge William Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 08/07/2000)
08/04/2000	129	NOTICE OF MOTION by City defts to alter or amend the judgment denying City defts motion to vacate the preliminary injunction in its entirety purs to FRCP 59(e) ; modifying the injunction by eliminating decretal paragraph 6 . Return date 9/22/00 @10:00am. (lam) (Entered: 08/08/2000)
08/04/2000	130	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by City defts in support of [129-1] motion to alter or amend the judgment denying City defts motion to vacate the preliminary injunction in its entirety purs to FRCP 59(e), [129-2] motion modifying the injunction by eliminating decretal paragraph 6 . (lam) (Entered: 08/08/2000)
08/30/2000	131	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards in opposition to [129-1] motion to alter or amend the judgment denying City defts motion to vacate the preliminary injunction in its entirety purs to FRCP 59(e); [129-2] motion modifying the injunction by eliminating decretal paragraph 6; [126-1] motion for reconsideration/reargument of [125-1] order granting plttfs' motion for class certification. (sn) (Entered: 08/31/2000)
09/05/2000	132	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Pauley from James M. Hershler, dated 8/22/00, Plntfs' Response to motion reset to 8/30/00 for [126-1] motion for reconsideration/reargument of [125-1] order granting motion for class certification ; Defts' Reply to Response to Motion reset to 9/7/00 for [126-1] motion for reconsideration/reargument of [125-1] order granting motion for class certification ; Return date reset to 9/8/00 for [126-1] motion for reconsideration/reargument of [125-1] order granting plttfs' motion for class certification ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (cd) (Entered: 09/07/2000)
09/07/2000	133	REPLY MEMORANDUM by City Defts in support re: [129-1] motion to alter or amend the judgment denying City defts motion to vacate the preliminary injunction in its entirety purs to FRCP 59(e); [129-2] motion modifying the injunction by eliminating decretal paragraph 6 (lf) (Entered: 09/08/2000)
09/07/2000	134	REPLY MEMORANDUM by Brian J. Wing in support re: State Defts' motion for reargument (lf) (Entered: 09/08/2000)
10/06/2000		Oral argument begun and concluded before Judge William H. Pauley III. Contested issue - yes. (kw) (Entered: 10/19/2000)
10/13/2000	135	ORDER denying [129-1] motion to alter or amend the judgment denying City defts motion to vacate the preliminary injunction in its entirety purs to FRCP 59(e), denying [129-2] motion modifying the injunction by eliminating decretal paragraph 6, denying [126-1] motion for reconsideration/reargument of [125-1] order granting plttfs' motion for class certification; by 11/6/00, plntfs will serve and file any memo addressing the impact of the City defts' job search initiative for family assistance applicants referenced in City defts' 10/4/00 letter to the Court ; reset pre-trial conference for 10:00 11/17/00. The parties may submit letter memo raising any pretrial issues by 11/13/00. Opposition letters may be submitted by 11/15/00 ; trial is scheduled for 2/12/01 at 9:30 am ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (cd) Modified on 10/16/2000 (Entered: 10/13/2000)
11/09/2000	136	NOTICE OF APPEAL by Rudolph Giuliani, Jason Turner ; from [135-1] order by 11/6/00, plntfs will serve and file any memo addressing the impact of the City defts' job search initiative for family assistance applicants referenced in City defts' 10/4/00 letter to the Court . Copies of notice of appeal mailed to Attorney(s) of Record: Marc Cohan, Esq. and James Hershler. \$105.00 Appeal filing fee paid 11/9/00 on receipt # E 389879. (dt) (Entered: 11/13/2000)
11/09/2000	137	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Pauley from Caroline M. Brown, atty for City defts, dated 11/6/00; City defts are directed to submit a letter to the

		Court on notice to counsel by 11/13/00 stating when they will be able to respond to plttfs' questions ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 11/14/2000)
11/13/2000		Notice of appeal and certified copy of docket to USCA: [136-1] appeal by Jason Turner, Rudolph Giuliani ; Copy of notice of appeal sent to District Judge. (dt) (Entered: 11/13/2000)
11/17/2000		Pretrial Conference held and concluded before Judge William H. Pauley III. Contested issue – yes. (kw) (Entered: 11/28/2000)
11/22/2000	138	ORDER, the parties will file a proposed audit instrument by 11/22/00; the City defts will respond to the plttfs' questions regarding the zip code transfer plan by 11/22/00; plttfs will submit any opposition to the plan in the form of letter memorandum by 12/15/00 ; set pre-trial conference for 9:00 11/29/00 ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed by Chambers. (lam) (Entered: 11/27/2000)
11/29/2000	139	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Pauley from Marc Cohan, dated 11/22/00; granting the parties' request for an extension of time to submit the proposed audit instrument. The parties will submit a joint proposed audit instrument by 11/28/00 at 5:00 PM . ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (sn) (Entered: 11/30/2000)
12/05/2000	140	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge William H. Pauley III on 10/6/00. (kw) (Entered: 12/05/2000)
12/15/2000		Telephone Conference held before Judge William H. Pauley III. (kw) (Entered: 12/18/2000)
12/27/2000	141	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge William H. Pauley III for the date(s) of 11/17/00 @10:20am. (lam) (Entered: 12/27/2000)
01/04/2001	142	NOTICE OF MOTION by Rudolph Giuliani, Jason Turner for Emily Johnson Henn to appear pro hac vice for defts Giuliani and Turner . With Certificate attached. Return date not indicated. (lam) (Entered: 01/09/2001)
01/12/2001		Telephone Conference held before Judge William H. Pauley III. (kw) (Entered: 02/07/2001)
01/22/2001		USCA Case Number Re: [136-1] appeal by Jason Turner, Rudolph Giuliani USCA NUMBER: 00-9460. (dt) (Entered: 01/22/2001)
01/22/2001		Telephone Conference held before Judge William H. Pauley III. (lam) (Entered: 02/06/2001)
01/25/2001	143	NOTICE OF MOTION by Rudolph Giuliani, Jason Turner for Donald J. Ridings, Jr. to appear pro hac vice . With Certifications attached. Return date not indicated. (lam) (Entered: 01/29/2001)
01/31/2001	146	ORDER, the parties will submit supplemental witness lists by 1/26/01, and will advise of any revisions to the lists by 2/2/01; the parties will submit declarations of their fact witnesses by 2/2/01 ; the parties will conduct depositions of fact witnesses by 2/16/01 ; the City defts' expert report by Jessica Pollner and the plttfs' expert report by Richard Faust will be served by 2/9/01 ; the parties will make Jessica Pollner and Richard Faust available for depositions by 2/16/01 ; motions in limine due by 2/21/01; Opposition to motions in limine due by 2/23/01 ; the parties will file and serve their respective findings of fact and conclusions of law, and premark and exchange their exhibits by the close of business on 2/22/01 ; set bench trial for 9:15 2/26/01 ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (lam) (Entered: 02/02/2001)
02/01/2001	144	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge William H. Pauley III for the date(s) of 12/1/00 @9:00am. (lam) (Entered: 02/01/2001)
02/01/2001	145	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge William H. Pauley III on 12/15/00. (kw) (Entered: 02/01/2001)

02/02/2001		Telephone Conference held before Judge William H. Pauley III. (kw) (Entered: 02/07/2001)
02/05/2001	147	ORDER; granting [143-1] motion for Donald J. Ridings, Jr. to appear pro hac vice . ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. Forwarded orig. doc. to Admissions Clerk. (pl) Modified on 02/08/2001 (Entered: 02/07/2001)
02/08/2001	148	Letter filed by Lakisha Reynolds addressed to Judge Pauley from Marc Cohan, dated 2/8/01, re: informing the Court that they believe, on the basis of evidence adduced during discovery, that the scope of the issues to be tried in this case may be narrowed and simplified in certain respects. (kw) (Entered: 02/09/2001)
02/16/2001	149	ORDER MODIFYING PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION; so much of decretal paragraph 6 of this Court's order of January 25, 1999, as preliminarily enjoins City defendants from converting any Income Support Center to a Job Center or opening any new Job Centers, is Vacated; and this Court's order entered March 23, 1999, prohibiting transfer of responsibility for certain zip codes from Income Support Center to Job Centers, is vacated ; ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (dj) (Entered: 02/16/2001)
02/16/2001		Telephone Conference held before Judge William H. Pauley III. (kw) (Entered: 03/29/2001)
02/22/2001	150	STIPULATION and PROTECTIVE ORDER; regarding procedures that will govern the handling of confidential material ; ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ) (lf) (Entered: 02/23/2001)
02/22/2001	151	SCHEDULING ORDER: that unless the parties have agreed on three proposed mediators for this Court's consideration, the plaintiffs, the City defendants, and the State Defendants will each submit to the Court the name and curriculum vitae of a proposed mediator by 2/23/01; the City dfts will submit the expert reports and declarations to of William Waldman and Kathryn Way to the plaintiffs by 3/9/01; trial will commence on 4/2/01 at 9:15 a.m.. ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (pl) Modified on 02/26/2001 (Entered: 02/23/2001)
02/26/2001	152	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Pauley from Caroline M. Brown, dated 2/23/01 Re: joint parties request to submit names to the Court with respect to possible mediators: Application granted. The parties will submit the names of the proposed mediators by 2/26/01 ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (cd) (Entered: 02/26/2001)
03/02/2001	153	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge William H. Pauley III for the date(s) of 1/12/01 @11:10am. (lam) (Entered: 03/02/2001)
03/02/2001	154	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge William H. Pauley III on 1/22/01. (kw) (Entered: 03/06/2001)
03/08/2001		Telephone Conference held before Judge William H. Pauley III. (lam) (Entered: 03/29/2001)
03/09/2001	155	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Pauley from James M. Hershler, dated 03/08/01; granting counsel to defendants' request to submit supplemental declarations by 03/13/01 ; ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (dj) (Entered: 03/12/2001)
03/22/2001		Telephone Conference held before Judge William H. Pauley III. (lam) (Entered: 03/29/2001)
03/26/2001	156	SCHEDULING ORDER: counsel for this action are directed to participate in a pretrial telephone conference scheduled for 3/27/01 at 10:30 a.m. ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (kw) (Entered: 03/27/2001)
03/26/2001		Pretrial telephone conference set at 10:30 a.m. on 3/27/01 before Judge William H. Pauley III. (kw) (Entered: 03/27/2001)
03/29/2001	157	SCHEDULING ORDER: the parties will submit to chambers a joint pre-trial order and their pre-marked trial exhibits by 3/29/01 at 5:00 p.m.; a final pre-trial telephone conference is scheduled for 3/30/01 at 11:30 a.m. ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (sac) (Entered: 03/29/2001)

03/30/2001		Telephone Conference held before Judge William H. Pauley III . (lam) (Entered: 04/03/2001)
03/30/2001	164	CONSENT ORDER; the parties consent to the filing under seal of the Declaration of Sylvia Ruiz, the Exhibits to the Declaration of Michael Bermudez, the Exhibits to the Supplemental Declaration of Jacquelyn Flaum, and the exhibits to the declarations of plaintiffs' witnesses in their entirety because they contain the names and other personally-identifiable confidential information of welfare applicants at the Job Centers ; (signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); (djc) (Entered: 04/06/2001)
04/02/2001	159	Letter filed by the City defts, addressed to Judge Pauley from Caroline M. Brown, dated 3/27/01, re: City defts move the Court to strike the 5th Report of plttfs' expert Richard Faust on the ground that it was untimely produced to City defts; in the alternative, City defts move the Court to strike those portions of the report that offer an opinion on matters beyond Mr. Faust's expertise. (lam) (Entered: 04/04/2001)
04/02/2001	160	Letter filed by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards addressed to Judge Pauley from Marc Cohan, Welfare Law Center, dated 3/29/01, re: in response to City defts' letter of 3/27/01 to oppose their motion to strike the 5th Report of plttfs' Expert Richard Faust. (lam) (Entered: 04/04/2001)
04/02/2001		Bench trial begun before Judge William H. Pauley III (lam) (Entered: 04/05/2001)
04/03/2001		Bench trial concluded before Judge William H. Pauley III; the submission of simultaneous proposed findings and memorandum of law are due 5/4/01, and simultaneous responsive briefs are due 6/4/01, decision reserved. (lam) (Entered: 04/05/2001)
04/04/2001	158	SEALED DOCUMENT placed in vault. (da) (Entered: 04/04/2001)
04/04/2001	161	SEALED DOCUMENT placed in vault. (da) (Entered: 04/05/2001)
04/04/2001	162	SEALED DOCUMENT placed in vault. (da) (Entered: 04/05/2001)
04/05/2001	163	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge William H. Pauley III for the date(s) of 2/16/01 @10:30am. (lam) (Entered: 04/05/2001)
04/06/2001	165	WITNESS DECLARATION of America Antigua by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. (sn) (Entered: 04/10/2001)
04/06/2001	165	WITNESS DECLARATION of Wanda Baez by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. (sn) (Entered: 04/10/2001)
04/06/2001	165	WITNESS DECLARATION of Sharon Boxill by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. (sn) (Entered: 04/10/2001)
04/06/2001	165	WITNESS DECLARATION of Robert J. Field by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. (sn) (Entered: 04/10/2001)
04/06/2001	165	WITNESS DECLARATION of Randal S. Jeffrey by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. (sn) (Entered: 04/10/2001)
04/06/2001	165	WITNESS DECLARATION of Alexandria Rouse by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. (sn) (Entered: 04/10/2001)
04/06/2001	165	WITNESS DECLARATION of Anairis Suero by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. (sn) (Entered: 04/10/2001)

04/06/2001	165	WITNESS DECLARATION of Carmen Urena by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. (sn) (Entered: 04/10/2001)
04/06/2001	165	WITNESS DECLARATION of Laura Vazquez by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. (sn) (Entered: 04/10/2001)
04/06/2001	165	WITNESS DECLARATION of Norma Wharton by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. (sn) (Entered: 04/10/2001)
04/06/2001	165	Stipulated facts between plttfs and City defts. (sn) (Entered: 04/10/2001)
04/10/2001	166	SCHEDULING ORDER: the parties will serve and file their findings of fact and memorandum of law by 5/4/01. Courtesy copies of all findings of fact and memoranda of law will be submitted to chambers in printed form and on computer disk formatted for WordPerfect 8.0. The parties will serve and file their reply memoranda by 6/4/01. ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (kw) (Entered: 04/12/2001)
05/02/2001	167	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge William H. Pauley III for the date(s) of 3/8/01 @3:30pm. (lam) (Entered: 05/02/2001)
05/02/2001	168	Memo–Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Pauley from Caroline M. Brown, dated 5/1/01. Re: City defendants writes to request an extension of the filing date for the findings of fact, conclusions of law and memoranda of law until 5/11/01. Application granted. City defendants will file their findings of fact, conclusions of law, and memorandum of law by 5/11/01 . ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (kw) (Entered: 05/03/2001)
05/04/2001	169	Memo–Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Pauley from Marc Cohan, dated 05/02/01; all parties will file and serve their submissions of Findings of Fact and Memoranda of Law by 05/11/01 ; (signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (djc) Modified on 05/08/2001 (Entered: 05/07/2001)
05/11/2001	170	POST–TRIAL MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richardsi. (lam) (Entered: 05/15/2001)
05/11/2001	171	PLTFFS FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW (lam) (Entered: 05/15/2001)
05/11/2001	172	STATE DEFTS' PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW (filed in night deposit on 5/11/01 @5:31pm) (lam) (Entered: 05/15/2001)
05/11/2001	173	POST TRIAL MEMORANDUM OF LAW by State defts Brian J. Wing, Barbara DeBuono (filed in night deposit on 5/11/01 @5:31pm) (lam) (Entered: 05/15/2001)
05/16/2001	174	Memo–Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Pauley from Emily Johnson Henn, Marc Cohan, and James Hershler dated 5/9/01. Re: counsel for parties jointly requests a waiver o the Court's page limit for memoranda of law; Application granted. The parties memoranda of law are not to exceed Forty Pages . ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (ae) (Entered: 05/16/2001)
05/16/2001	175	Memo–Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Pauley from Caroline M. Brown, dated 5/10/01. Re: granting all parties leave to file a memorandum of law not in excess of fifty pages . ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (kg) (Entered: 05/16/2001)
05/17/2001	176	MANDATE OF USCA WITHDRAWING APPEAL (certified copy) Re: withdrawing [136–1] appeal by Jason Turner, Rudolph Giuliani. 00–9460, Roseann B. Mackechnie, Clerk. (sg) (Entered: 05/18/2001)
05/25/2001	177	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge William H. Pauley III for the date(s) of 4/2,3/01. (kg) (Entered: 05/25/2001)

06/04/2001	178	REPLY MEMORANDUM by State defts Brian J. Wing, Antonia Novello in further support of their applicaiton for judgment dismissing the complaint. (lam) (Entered: 06/06/2001)
06/04/2001	179	STATE DEFTS' REPLY PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT. (lam) (Entered: 06/06/2001)
06/06/2001	180	Memo-Endorsement on letter addressed to Judge Pauley from Constance P. Carden, dated 5/31/01; all parties may file rply briefs that do not exceed 40 pages in length. ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. (sac) (Entered: 06/07/2001)
06/12/2001	181	SUPPLEMENTAL PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW by plaintiffs. (kw) (Entered: 06/15/2001)
06/12/2001	182	POST-TRIAL REPLY MEMORANDUM by plaintiffs. (kw) (Entered: 06/15/2001)
07/12/2001	183	PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. (sac) (Entered: 07/13/2001)
07/12/2001	184	POST-TRIAL REPLY MEMORANDUM by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. (sac) (Entered: 07/13/2001)
07/12/2001	185	SUPPLEMENTAL PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. (sac) (Entered: 07/13/2001)
07/25/2001	186	ORDER; granting [142-1] motion for Emily Johnson Henn to appear pro hac vice for defts Giuliani and Turner. ( signed by Judge William H. Pauley III ); Copies mailed. Original document forwarded to Attorney Admissions Clerk. (kkc) (Entered: 07/26/2001)
10/21/2002	187	Filed (Policy Directive #99-06R(2) Family Independence Administration. (Exhibit QQQ) (rag) (Entered: 10/22/2002)
10/21/2002	188	Filed Report of City Defendants' Expert William Waldman. (dated 3/9/01) (rag) (Entered: 10/22/2002)
10/21/2002	189	CITY DEFENDANTS'DEPOSITION DESIGNATIONS. (rag) (Entered: 10/22/2002)
10/21/2002	190	CITY DEFENDANTS' DEPOSITION COUNTER-DESIGNATIONS. (rag) (Entered: 10/22/2002)
10/21/2002	191	DECLARATIONS OF CITY DEFENDANTS' WITNESSES VOLUME I. (rag) (Entered: 10/22/2002)
10/21/2002	192	DECLARATIONS OF CITY DEFENDANTS' WITNESSES VOLUME II. (rag) (Entered: 10/22/2002)
10/21/2002	193	DECLARATION OF JESSICA POLLNER Re: Statistical results of plaintiffs' audit of case files in this matter. (dated 2/14/01) (rag) Modified on 10/22/2002 (Entered: 10/22/2002)
10/21/2002	194	DECLARATION of Jessica Pollner Re: Statistical results of plaintiffs' audit of case files in this matter.(dated 3/9/01) (rag) Modified on 10/22/2002 (Entered: 10/22/2002)
10/23/2002	195	PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW by City Defendants Rudolph Giuliani, Jason Turner . (dj) (Entered: 10/24/2002)
10/23/2002	196	Post-Trial MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Rudolph Giuliani, Jason Turner (dj) (Entered: 10/24/2002)
05/27/2004	197	Letter addressed to Judge Pauley from Randall Jeffrey dated 5/21/04: plntf's counsel NY Legal Assistance has moved to 450 West 33rd St., NY NY 10001. Document filed by Georgina Bonilla, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Lue

		Garlick, Lakisha Reynolds, Elston Richards, April Smiley.(cd, ) (Entered: 05/27/2004)
12/30/2004	198	MEMORANDUM AND OPINION # 91065. For the reasons further set forth in this Order, the plaintiff class is entitled to a permanent injunction requiring the City defendants and the State defendants to: (i) provide expedited food stamp service to eligible applications within 7 days; (ii) separately process applications for food stamps when the applications for cash assistane are denied or withdrawn; (iii) send notices to applicants confirming voluntary withdrawals for Medicaid in accord with 42 C.F.R. 435.913 and document such withdrawals pursuant to 7 C.F.R. 273.2(c)(6); and (iv) provide adequate and timely notice by correctly completing Forms W-145HH and M-3. The parties are directed to submit a proposed final judgment consistent with this Memorandum and Opinion by 1/18/05 (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 12/30/04) Copies mailed by Chambers.(yv, ) Modified on 1/3/2005 (yv, ). (Entered: 01/03/2005)
01/06/2005	199	ORDER. All parties are directed to appear for a status conference on 1/28/2005 at 02:00 PM in Courtroom 11D in the Daniel Patrick Moynihan U.S. Courthouse, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 1/4/05) Copies mailed by Chambers.(yv, ) (Entered: 01/11/2005)
01/13/2005	200	MOTION for Reconsideration of the Court's Order dated 12/30/2004. Document filed by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. Return Date set for 2/9/2005 09:30 AM. (jp, ) (Entered: 01/18/2005)
01/13/2005	201	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 200 MOTION for Reconsideration.. Document filed by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. (jp, ) (Entered: 01/18/2005)
01/18/2005	202	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Pauley from Carolline Brown dated 1/14/05: re extension of time to submit a proposed Judgment: application granted. The date for filing the proposed judgment is adjourned pending plntfs motion for reconsideration. Additionally, the conference scheduled for 1/28/05 is adjourned to 2/18/05 at 12:00 pm. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 1/14/05) (cd, ) (Entered: 01/20/2005)
01/28/2005	203	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 200 MOTION for Reconsideration. Document filed by Rudolph Giuliani, Jason Turner. (rw, ) (Entered: 02/07/2005)
02/07/2005	204	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 200 MOTION for Reconsideration.. Document filed by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. (fk, ) (Entered: 02/11/2005)
02/14/2005	205	AMENDED MEMORANDUM AND OPINION #91065, the plntf class is entitled to a permanent injunction requiring the City defts and the State defts to: provide expedited food stamp service to eligible applicants within five days, as further set forth in this document. The parties are directed to submit a proposed final judgment consistent with this Amended Memorandum and Opinion by 2/17/05. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 2/14/05) copies sent by chambers(cd, ). (Entered: 02/16/2005)
02/14/2005	206	ORDER granting 200 Motion for Reconsideration. Upon reconsideration, this Court concludes that plntfs' pendent state claims are privately enforceable in this actin. This Court's reasoning is set forth in an Amended Opinion dated 2/14/05. The 12/30/04 Memo and Opinion is withdrawn and is withdrawn and is superceded by the Amended Opinion dated 2/14/05. . (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 2/14/05) copies sent by chambers.(cd, ) (Entered: 02/17/2005)
02/23/2005	207	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Pauley from Marc Cohan dated 02/14/05 re: parties jointly request a postponement of the conference presently scheduled for 02/18/05; Application granted. The parties are directed to appear for a conference on 02/24/05 at 2:15 p.m. The date for filing the proposed judgment is adjourned pending that conference. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 2/18/05) copies faxed by Chambers.(dj, ) (Entered: 02/24/2005)



03/01/2005	208	ORDER that the parties shall submit an agreed upon judgment or portions thereof, by 3/24/05; parties shall submit their counter proposals concerning the judgment, if any, by 3/31/05; parties shall submit their memoranda in support of their counter proposals, if any, by 4/12/05. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 2/24/05) (dle, ) (Entered: 03/04/2005)
04/12/2005	209	DECLARATION of Seth Diamond in Support of City Defendants' Memorandum regarding the City and State Defendants' Proposed Judgment in this case. (djc, ) (Entered: 04/19/2005)
04/12/2005	210	CITY DEFENDANTS' MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support of the Proposed Judgment of the City and State Defendants. (docmt received in night dep. on 4/12/05 at 6:11 p.m.) (djc, ) (Entered: 04/19/2005)
04/12/2005	211	STATE DEFENDANTS MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support of PROPOSED JUDGMENT OF THE CITY AND STATE DEFENDANTS. (djc, ) (Entered: 04/19/2005)
04/12/2005	212	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support IN SUPPORT OF THEIR PROPOSED FINAL JUDGMENT. (djc, ) (Entered: 04/19/2005)
04/21/2005	213	REPLY to plaintiffs' arguments and in further support of the proposed judgment submitted by the City and State Defendants. Document filed by Brian J. Wing, Barbara DeBuono, Jason Turner. (ll, ) (Entered: 04/26/2005)
04/21/2005	214	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support of their proposed final Judgment. re: 213 Reply. Document filed by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. (ll, ) (Entered: 04/26/2005)
04/21/2005	215	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Pauley from Marc Cohan dated 4/14/05: granting application to submit responsive memo of law re the proposed judgments of no more than 10 pages in length by no later than the close of business on 4/21/05. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 4/18/05) copies sent by chambers(cd, ) (Entered: 04/28/2005)
12/14/2005	216	JUDGMENT resolving action. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 12/14/05) (ml, ) (Entered: 12/14/2005)
12/15/2005		Mailed notice of Right to Appeal re: 216 Judgment and to Attorney(s) of Record: Anne K. Callagy, Constance P. Carden, Marc Cohan, Esperanza Colon, Joshua E. Goldfein, Adriene L. Holder, Randal S. Jeffrey, Christopher D. Lamb, Hwan-Hui Helen Lee, Scott Alan Rosenberg, Kenneth Rosenfeld, Rebecca L. Scharf, Yisroel Schulman. (lma, ) (Entered: 12/15/2005)
12/27/2005	217	STIPULATION AND ORDER that the partie stipulate and agree that any motion for attorney's fees, costs and disbursements, will not be due for an additional 90 days to and including 3/29/06; conference is scheduled for 1/3/06 at 10:00 a.m. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 12/21/05) (dle, ) (Entered: 12/27/2005)
12/27/2005		Received returned mail re: 216 Judgment. Mail was addressed to Scott A. Rosenberg of The Legal Aid Society at 90 Church Street, New York, NY 10007 and was returned for the following reason(s): no foward order on file. (tve, ) (Entered: 12/28/2005)
01/12/2006	218	NOTICE OF APPEAL from 216 Judgment. Document filed by Brian J. Wing, Barbara DeBuono. Filing fee \$ 255.00, receipt number E 566920. Copies of Notice of Appeal mailed to Attorney(s) of Record: Welfare Law Center, Inc.; NY Legal Assistance Group; The Legal Aid Society; Northern Manhattan Improvement Corp.. (tp, ) (Entered: 01/17/2006)
01/12/2006	219	NOTICE OF APPEAL from 216 Judgment. Document filed by Brian J. Wing, Rudolph Giuliani, Jason Turner. Filing fee \$ 255.00, receipt number E 566361. Copies of Notice of Appeal mailed to Attorney(s) of Record: Welfare Law Center, Inc.; NY Legal Assistance Group; The Legal Aid Society; Northern Manhattan Improvement Corp. (tp, ) (Entered: 01/17/2006)

01/17/2006		Transmission of Notice of Appeal and Certified Copy of Docket Sheet to US Court of Appeals re: 218 Notice of Appeal. (tp, ) (Entered: 01/17/2006)
01/17/2006		Transmission of Notice of Appeal to the District Judge re: 218 Notice of Appeal. (tp, ) (Entered: 01/17/2006)
01/17/2006		Transmission of Notice of Appeal and Certified Copy of Docket Sheet to US Court of Appeals re: 219 Notice of Appeal,. (tp, ) (Entered: 01/17/2006)
01/17/2006		Transmission of Notice of Appeal to the District Judge re: 219 Notice of Appeal,. (tp, ) (Entered: 01/17/2006)
01/18/2006	220	SCHEDULING ORDER: Motions due by 3/29/2006. Responses due by 4/19/2006 Replies due by 4/28/2006. Oral Argument set for 5/12/2006 11:00 AM before Judge William H. Pauley III. See Document for further Scheduling Deadlines. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 1/13/06) (sac, ) (Entered: 01/19/2006)
01/27/2006		Received returned mail re: 216 Judgment. Mail was addressed to Randal S. Jeffrey of New York Legal Assistance Group at 130 East 59th Street, 14th Floor, New York, NY 10022 and was returned for the following reason(s): not deliverable as adressed. (tve, ) (Entered: 02/01/2006)
03/03/2006	<u>221</u>	Appeal Record Sent to USCA (Index). Notice that the Original index to the record on Appeal for 218 Notice of Appeal, filed by Brian J. Wing,, Barbara DeBuono,, 136 Notice of Appeal, filed by Rudolph Giuliani,, Jason Turner, USCA Case Number 06-0283(L), 06-0284 (Con), 3 Copies of the index, Certified Clerk Certificate and Certified Docket Sheet were transmitted to the U.S. Court of Appeals. (nd, ) Additional attachment(s) added on 9/12/2006 (nd, ). (Entered: 03/03/2006)
03/21/2006	222	SCHEDULING ORDER: Motions due by 4/19/2006. Responses due by 5/10/2006 Replies due by 5/22/2006. Oral Argument set for 6/15/2006 02:30 PM before Judge William H. Pauley III. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 3/17/06) "Copies Mailed By Chambers"(jco, ) (Entered: 03/22/2006)
04/20/2006	223	REVISED SCHEDULING ORDER: Plaintiff Motion for attorneys' fees and costs due by 7/19/2006. Responses due by 8/10/2006. Replies due by 8/22/2006. Oral Argument set for 9/13/2006 at 02:30 PM before Judge William H. Pauley III. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 4/19/2006) Copies Mailed By Chambers.(lb, ) (Entered: 04/20/2006)
04/20/2006	224	ENDORSED LETTER: addressed to Judge William H. Pauley III from James M. Hershler dated 4/11/2006 re: request that the documents listed in this letter be filed with the District Court clerk so that they may be entered on the docket. ENDORSEMENT: Counsel is directed to deliver copies of these documents to the Court for filing. So Ordered (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 4/18/2006) (lb, ) (Entered: 04/20/2006)
04/28/2006	225	JOINT PRETRIAL ORDER. Document filed by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards.(jco, ) (Entered: 05/01/2006)
04/28/2006	226	SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION of Betty Rice. (jco, ) (Entered: 05/01/2006)
04/28/2006	227	SUPPLEMENTAL DEPOSITION DESIGNATION. Document filed by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. (jco, ) (Entered: 05/01/2006)
04/28/2006	228	DECLARATION of Cornelia McElligott. (jco, ) (Entered: 05/01/2006)
04/28/2006	229	DECLARATION of Russell J. Hanks. (jco, ) (Entered: 05/01/2006)
04/28/2006	230	DECLARATION of Betty Rice. (jco, ) (Entered: 05/01/2006)
04/28/2006	231	FIFTH REPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' EXPERT RICHARD FAUST. (jco, ) (Entered: 05/01/2006)
04/28/2006	232	PLAINTIFFS' DEPOSITION DESIGNATIONS. Document filed by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. (jco, ) (Entered: 05/01/2006)

04/28/2006	233	STATE DEFENDANTS' CROSS-DEPOSITION DESIGNATIONS. (jco, ) (Entered: 05/01/2006)
04/28/2006	234	STATE DEFENDANTS' DEPOSITION DESIGNATIONS. (jco, ) (Entered: 05/01/2006)
04/28/2006	235	FOURTH REPORT OF PLAINTIFFS' EXPERT RICHARD FAUST. (jco, ) (Entered: 05/01/2006)
04/28/2006	236	DECLARATION of Steve Ptak. Exhibits attached. (jco, ) (Entered: 05/01/2006)
04/28/2006	237	SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION of Steve Ptak. (jco, ) (Entered: 05/01/2006)
05/09/2006	238	LETTER addressed to Judge Pauley from Richard Dearing dated 4/24/06: re memo endorsed dated 4/18, documents previously requested are provided. Document filed by Rudolph Giuliani et al.(cd, ) (Entered: 05/10/2006)
05/24/2006	239	STIPULATION: It is hereby stipulated and agreed between the parties that: the plaintiffs' trial exhibits 1 through 157, as identified in the annexed Exhibit 1, are part of the record in this case. The City defendants' trial exhibits A through PPP, as identified in the annexed Exhibit 2, are part of the record in this case... Except to the extent that they are already in the Court's file, the documents described in this stip. will be held by the attorneys of record for the respective parties until requested by the U.S.C. of Appeals for the Second Circuit. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 5/19/2006) (lb, ) (Entered: 05/24/2006)
06/01/2006	<u>240</u>	First Supplemental ROA Sent to USCA (Index). Notice that the Supplemental Index to the record on Appeal for 219 Notice of Appeal, filed by Brian J. Wing,, Rudolph Giuliani,, Jason Turner, USCA Case Number 06-0283-cv, 3 Copies of the index, Certified Supplemental Clerk Certificate and Certified Docket Sheet were transmitted to the U.S. Court of Appeals. (nd, ) Additional attachment(s) added on 9/12/2006 (nd, ). (Entered: 06/01/2006)
07/13/2006	241	SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION of Randale S. Jeffrey. (jmi, ) (Entered: 07/14/2006)
07/13/2006	242	Report of Plaintiffs' Expert Richard Faust. (jmi, ) (Entered: 07/14/2006)
07/13/2006	243	Second Report of Plaintiffs' Expert Richard Faust. (jmi, ) (Entered: 07/14/2006)
07/13/2006	244	Third Report of Plaintiffs' Expert Richard Faust(independent consultant). (djc, ) (Entered: 07/14/2006)
08/08/2006	245	REVISED SCHEDULING ORDER: Plaintiffs Motions for Atty. Fees due by 8/21/2006. Responses due by 9/12/2006 Replies due by 9/25/2006. Oral Argument set for 10/13/2006 12:00 PM before Judge William H. Pauley III. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 7/28/06) (pl, ) (Entered: 08/08/2006)
08/21/2006	246	REVISED SCHEDULING ORDER:Plaintiffs motions for Atty's Fees and costs due by 9/22/2006. Responses due by 10/13/2006 Replies due by 10/25/2006. Oral Argument set for 11/9/2006 11:00 AM before Judge William H. Pauley III. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 8/18/06) (pl, ) (Entered: 08/22/2006)
09/22/2006	247	MOTION for Attorney Fees and Cost w/ atch. Delcaration in support of Marc Cohan. Document filed by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. Return Date set for 11/9/2006 11:00 AM. (pl, ) Modified on 9/26/2006 (pl, ). (Entered: 09/26/2006)
09/22/2006	248	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 247 MOTION for Attorney Fees. Document filed by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards. (pl, ) (Entered: 09/26/2006)
09/22/2006	249	PART II APPENDICES to 247 MOTION for Attorney Fees. Document filed by Lakisha Reynolds, Georgina Bonilla, April Smiley, Lue Garlick, Adriana Calabrese, Jenny Cuevas, Elston Richards.(pl, ) (Entered: 09/26/2006)
10/12/2006	250	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge William H. Pauley III from Jonathan Pines dated 10/6/2006 re: requesting a 30 day enlargement of time within which to resolve plaintiffs' pending fee motion, currently returnable 11/9/2006.

		ENDORSEMENT: Application Granted. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 10/10/2006) (lb, ) (Entered: 10/13/2006)
10/23/2006	<u>251</u>	ORDER of USCA (Certified Copy) as to 219 Notice of Appeal, filed by Brian J. Wing, Rudolph Giuliani, Jason Turner. Only parties, Rudolph Giuliani and Jason Turner hereby withdraw their appeal with prejudice pursuant to Rule 42(b) of the FRAP as further described herein. USCA Case Number 06-0283. Roseann B. MacKechnie, Clerk USCA. Certified: 10/20/06. (tp, ) (Entered: 10/23/2006)
10/23/2006		Transmission of USCA Mandate/Order to the District Judge re: <u>251</u> USCA Mandate Withdrawing Appeal. (tp, ) (Entered: 10/23/2006)
11/20/2006	<u>252</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Pauley from Jonathan Pines dated 11/6/06 re: counsel requests an enlargement of time within which to resolve plaintiff's pending fee motion...; Application granted. The parties' return date is adjourned to 12/15/06. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 11/8/06) (djc, ) (Entered: 11/21/2006)
11/20/2006		Set/Reset Deadlines as to 247 MOTION for Attorney Fees.. Motion Hearing set for 12/15/2006 10:30 AM before Judge William H. Pauley III. (djc, ) (Entered: 11/21/2006)
12/20/2006	253	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge William H. Pauley III from Jonathan Pines dated 12/11/2006 re: on behalf of the City and State Defendants in this action, they are requesting a third, small enlargement of 1 week within which to resolve plaintiffs' pending fee motion, currently returnable 12/15/2006. ENDORSEMENT: Application Granted. Oral argument is adjourned to 1/19/2007 at 12:00 p.m. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 12/18/2006) (lb, ) (Entered: 12/20/2006)
12/20/2006		Set/Reset Hearings: Oral Argument set for 1/19/2007 at 12:00 PM before Judge William H. Pauley III. (lb, ) (Entered: 12/20/2006)
01/26/2007	<u>254</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge William H. Pauley from Jonathan Pines dated 1/18/2007 re: to writing to request a final brief adjournment of the return date for Plaintiffs' fee motion in the above-referenced action. The parties have reached agreement regarding fees, with only the last level of approval of the State defendants remaining outstanding. Oral Argument set for 3/2/2007 10:45 AM before Judge William H. Pauley III. ENDORSEMENT: Application granted. The oral argument is adjourned to 3/2/07 at 10:45 a.m. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 1/26/2007) (jmi) (Entered: 01/30/2007)
01/31/2007	<u>255</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER: It is hereby stipulated agreed, and ordered as follows: (\$2,559,675.94) in full satisfaction of all claims for attorneys' fees and costs sought by the plaintiff class as against the City defendants for the period through December 14, 2005. Payment of the City fee payment shall be made by checks, issued in the amounts that follow, made payable to the following entities, and at the addresses shown. New York Legal Assistance Group \$688,775.72, Northern Manhattan Improvement Corp. \$265,557.16, Legal Aid Society \$922,937.84. Welfare Law Center \$682,405.22. The City Defendants will deliver the City fee payment within sixty days of the date of this stipulation is "so ordered" by the Court. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley III on 1/31/07) (js) (Entered: 02/01/2007)
06/14/2007		Appeal Record Sent to USCA (File). Indexed record on Appeal Files for 219 Notice of Appeal, filed by Jason Turner, Brian J. Wing, Rudolph Giuliani, 218 Notice of Appeal, filed by Barbara DeBuono, Brian J. Wing USCA Case Number 06-0283, were transmitted to the U.S. Court of Appeals. (tp) (Entered: 06/14/2007)
06/14/2007		First Supplemental ROA Sent to USCA (File). Supplemental Indexed record on Appeal Files for 219 Notice of Appeal, filed by Jason Turner, Brian J. Wing, Rudolph Giuliani, 218 Notice of Appeal, filed by Barbara DeBuono, Brian J. Wing USCA Case Number 06-0283, were transmitted to the U.S. Court of Appeals. (tp) (Entered: 06/14/2007)
12/04/2007	<u>256</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER the State Defendants' obligation to pay attorneys' fees and costs to the Plaintiff Class pursuant to the January 31, 2007 Stipulation

		and Order is hereby tolled pending the conclusion of all appellate proceedings in this action. Following the conclusion of all appellate proceedings in the Second Circuit and the United States Supreme Court in review of the December 14, 2005 judgment, the State Defendants shall have 30 days to move to vacate or modify their obligations to pay attorney's fees and costs pursuant to the January 31, 2007 Stipulation and Order. However, if the Second Circuit's October 31, 2007 decision remains fully in effect upon the conclusion of all appellate proceedings, the State Defendants' obligation to pay attorney's fees and costs pursuant to January 31, 2007 Stipulation and Order shall be deemed vacated and void without the need for a motion. Facsimile signatures are acceptable for execution and filing of this Stipulation and Order. SO ORDERED (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley, III on 12/3/2007) (jmi) (Entered: 12/04/2007)
06/17/2008	<u>257</u>	MANDATE of USCA (Certified Copy) as to 219 Notice of Appeal, filed by Jason Turner, Brian J. Wing, Rudolph Giuliani, 218 Notice of Appeal, filed by Barbara DeBuono, Brian J. Wing USCA Case Number 06-0283-cv (L) and 06-0284-cv (CON). On Consideration whereof, it is hereby ORDER, ADJUDGED and DECREED that the judgment of the said district court is REVERSED and the complaint DISMISSED, in accordance with the opinion of this court. Catherine O'Hagan Wolfe, Clerk USCA. Issued As Mandate: 6/16/2008. (nd) (Entered: 06/17/2008)
06/17/2008		Transmission of USCA Mandate/Order to the District Judge re: <u>257</u> USCA Mandate,,. (nd) (Entered: 06/17/2008)
07/25/2008		Appeal and First Supplemental records Returned. Indexed record on Appeal Files for Appeal Record Sent to USCA - File, Supplemental ROA Sent to USCA - File, USCA Case Number 06-0283, returned from the U.S. Court of Appeals. (nd) (Entered: 07/28/2008)
04/23/2010	<u>258</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER: The City of New York shall pay the Plaintiff Class, and the Plaintiff shall agree to accept, two hundred and seventy-five thousand dollars (\$275,000.00), in full satisfaction of all claims for attorneys' fees and costs sought by the Plaintiff Class as against the City Defendants for the period from 12/15/05 through 12/14/08. Payment of the Fee shall be made by checks, issued in the amounts, made payable to the entities, and at the addresses as further set forth in this Order. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley, III on 4/23/2010) (tro) (Entered: 04/26/2010)
12/23/2010	<u>259</u>	STIPULATION AND PROTECTIVE ORDER: Regarding procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of confidential material. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley, III on 12/23/10) (db) (Entered: 12/23/2010)
12/23/2010	<u>260</u>	STIPULATION: 1. Within ten (10) days after the effective date of this Stipulation, the New York City Human Resources Administration ("HRA") will identify certain households who required, but did not receive, a FSD between December 15, 2005 and November 30, 2006, as a result of an application at a Job Center in which a request for cash assistance was denied (rejected or closed) ("identified households"), using the following identifiers: (a) Public assistance/Food Stamp denials under codes that require a FSD as listed in the Food Stamp Separate Determination Desk Guide where the transaction date associated with the codes was between December 15, 2005 and November 30, 2006;(b) Public assistance denials on expedited Food Stamp cases using Food Stamp closing code Y99 where the transaction date associated with the codewas between December 15, 2005 and November 30, 2006; (c) Food Stamp denials under rejection code J05 where the transaction date associated with the code was between December 15, 2005 and November 30, 2006. Households that became active for Food Stamp benefits within 210 days of the Job Center denial: 2. HRA will issue, pursuant to paragraphs 3 and 4 of this Stipulation, restored Food Stamp benefits to identified households that became active for Food Stampbenefits within 210 days of the denial. The restored Food Stamp benefits will be added to the household's Electronic Benefit Transfer ("EBT") account. 3. The restored Food Stamp benefits for each identified household will be calculated by multiplying (a) the amount of the household's monthly Food Stamp grant once the household became active for Food Stamp benefits, by (b) the number of months of lost Food Stamp benefits from the application file date until the month prior to the first month of benefits issued when

		the household became active for Food Stamp benefits, all other details are as further set forth in said Order. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley, III on 12/22/10) (db) (Entered: 12/23/2010)
07/22/2011	<u>261</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER: The City of New York shall pay the Plaintiff Class, and the Plaintiff Class shall agree to accept, eighty-six thousand dollars (\$86,000.00), in full satisfaction of all claims for attorneys' fees and costs sought by the Plaintiff Class as against the City Defendants for the period from 12/15/2008 through 6/14/2010. Payments shall be issued as further set forth in this Order. The City Defendants will deliver the Fee Payment within ninety days of the date this Stipulation is "so ordered" by the Court. (Signed by Judge William H. Pauley, III on 7/22/2011) (tro) (Entered: 08/02/2011)