

**U.S. District Court  
Middle District of Florida (Jacksonville)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 3:10-cv-00414-MMH-TEM**

Haddad v. Arnold et al  
Assigned to: Judge Marcia Morales Howard  
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Thomas E. Morris  
Cause: 28:1343 Violation of Civil Rights

Date Filed: 05/13/2010  
Date Terminated: 02/03/2012  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 446 Civil Rights:  
Americans with Disabilities – Other  
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

**Plaintiff**

**Michele Haddad**

represented by **Jay M. Howanitz**  
Spohrer & Dodd, PL  
Suite 2  
701 W Adams St  
Jacksonville, FL 32204  
904/309-6500  
Fax: 904/309-6501  
Email: [jhowanitz@sdlitigation.com](mailto:jhowanitz@sdlitigation.com)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Stephen F. Gold**  
Law Office of Stephen F. Gold  
2nd Floor  
1709 Benjamin Franklin Pkwy  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
215/627-7100  
Fax: 215/627-3183  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

V.

**Defendant**

**Thomas Arnold**  
*in his official capacity as Secretary,  
Florida Agency for Health Care  
Administration*

represented by **Andrew T. Sheeran**  
Florida Agency for Health Care  
Administration  
Bldg 3 – MS 3  
2727 Mahan Dr  
Tallahassee, FL 32308-5407  
850/412-3630  
Fax: 850/921-0158  
Email: [sheerana@ahca.myflorida.com](mailto:sheerana@ahca.myflorida.com)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**William Michael Blocker , II**  
Agency for Health Care Administration  
Mail Stop 3  
2727 Mahan Dr  
Tallahassee, FL 32308-5407  
850/421-3634  
Fax: 850/921-0158  
Email: [blockerw@ahca.myflorida.com](mailto:blockerw@ahca.myflorida.com)  
**TERMINATED: 08/06/2010**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Defendant**

**Doctor Anna Viamonte Ross**  
*in her official capacity as Secretary,*  
*Florida Department of Health*

represented by **Enoch Jonathan Whitney**  
Office of the Attorney General\*  
PL-01 – The Capitol  
Tallahassee, FL 32399-1050  
850/414-3672  
Fax: 850/488-4872  
Email: [Jon.Whitney@myfloridalegal.com](mailto:Jon.Whitney@myfloridalegal.com)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**Elizabeth Dudek**

represented by **Andrew T. Sheeran**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Enoch Jonathan Whitney**  
Office of the Attorney General  
PL-01 – The Capitol  
107 W. Gaines St  
Tallahassee, FL 32399-1050  
850/414-3672  
Fax: 850/488-4872  
Email: [Jon.Whitney@myfloridalegal.com](mailto:Jon.Whitney@myfloridalegal.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**Surgeon General Harry Frank Farmer, Jr., M.D.**

represented by **Enoch Jonathan Whitney**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Movant**

**USA**

represented by **Beth A. Esposito**  
US Department of Justice – Civil Rights  
Division  
1425 NY Ave NW – Ste 4038  
PO Box 66738  
Washington, DC 20035  
202/305-1130  
Fax: 202-616-6862  
Email: [beth.esposito@usdoj.gov](mailto:beth.esposito@usdoj.gov)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**John L. Wodatch**  
US Department of Justice – Civil Division  
950 Pennsylvania Ave NW  
Washington, DC 20530  
202-305-8454  
Fax: 202-616-6862  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Philip L. Breen**  
US Department of Justice – Civil Division  
950 Pennsylvania Ave NW  
Washington, DC 20530  
202/305-8454  
Fax: 202/616-6862  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Renee M. Wohlenhaus**  
 US Department of Justice – Civil Division  
 950 Pennsylvania Ave NW  
 Washington, DC 20530  
 202/305-8454  
 Fax: 202/616-6862  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
05/13/2010	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Thomas Arnold, Anna Viamonte Ross (Filing fee \$ 350 receipt number J035096) filed by Michele Haddad.(PAM) (Entered: 05/13/2010)
05/13/2010	<u>2</u>	MOTION for preliminary injunction and MOTION for Expedited Hearing by Michele Haddad. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C)(PAM) (Entered: 05/13/2010)
05/13/2010		Summons issued as to Thomas Arnold, Anna Viamonte Ross. (PAM) (Entered: 05/13/2010)
05/13/2010	<u>3</u>	AMENDED STANDING ORDER: Filing of documents that exceed twenty-five pages. Signed by All Divisional Judges on 5/25/2005. (PAM) (Entered: 05/13/2010)
05/13/2010	<u>4</u>	ORDER taking under advisement <u>2</u> Motion for preliminary injunction. Plaintiff is directed to promptly effect service of process on Defendants and file proof of such service. See Order for details. Signed by Judge Unassigned Judge MMH on 5/13/2010. (BMR) (Entered: 05/13/2010)
05/14/2010	<u>5</u>	NOTICE of designation under Local Rule 3.05 – track 2. Signed by Deputy Clerk on 5/14/2010. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Case Management Report Form, # <u>2</u> Consent Letter and Form)(JW) (Entered: 05/14/2010)
05/17/2010	<u>6</u>	MOTION for miscellaneous relief, specifically Leave to Appear Specially by United States. (MHH) (Entered: 05/17/2010)
05/19/2010	<u>7</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Andrew T. Sheeran on behalf of Thomas Arnold (Sheeran, Andrew) (Entered: 05/19/2010)
05/20/2010	<u>8</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by William Michael Blocker, II on behalf of Thomas Arnold (Blocker, William) (Entered: 05/20/2010)
05/21/2010	<u>9</u>	ORDER granting <u>6</u> United States' Motion for Leave to Appear Specially. The United States may file a brief in this action no later than 6/4/2010. Signed by Judge Marcia Morales Howard on 5/21/2010. (BMR) (Entered: 05/21/2010)
05/24/2010	<u>10</u>	RESPONSE re <u>9</u> Order on Motion for Miscellaneous Relief <i>STATEMENT OF INTEREST</i> filed by United States. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit)(Esposito, Beth) (Entered: 05/24/2010)
05/25/2010	<u>11</u>	RETURN of service executed on May 17, 2010 by Michele Haddad as to Thomas Arnold. (Howanitz, Jay) (Entered: 05/25/2010)
05/25/2010	<u>12</u>	RETURN of service executed on May 17, 2010 by Michele Haddad as to Anna Viamonte Ross. (Howanitz, Jay) (Entered: 05/25/2010)
05/25/2010	<u>13</u>	ORDER taking under advisement <u>2</u> Motion for Preliminary Injunction. This matter is set for a hearing on Monday, June 7, 2010, at 3:00 p.m. See Order for details and briefing schedule. Signed by Judge Marcia Morales Howard on 5/25/2010. (BMR) (Entered: 05/25/2010)
05/26/2010	<u>14</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Enoch Jonathan Whitney on behalf of Anna Viamonte Ross (Whitney, Enoch) (Entered: 05/26/2010)
05/26/2010	<u>15</u>	MOTION for Stephen F. Gold to appear pro hac vice by Michele Haddad. (Howanitz, Jay) Motions referred to Magistrate Judge Thomas E. Morris. (Entered: 05/26/2010)

05/26/2010	<u>16</u>	Emergency MOTION for leave to file excess pages <i>in Defendants' Response to Preliminary Injunction</i> by Thomas Arnold, Anna Viamonte Ross. (Sheeran, Andrew) (Entered: 05/26/2010)
05/26/2010	<u>17</u>	ORDER granting <u>16</u> Emergency Motion for Leave to Exceed Page Limit. See Order for details. Signed by Judge Marcia Morales Howard on 5/26/2010. (BMR) (Entered: 05/26/2010)
05/27/2010	<u>18</u>	ENDORSED ORDER granting <u>15</u> motion to appear pro hac vice. Signed by Magistrate Judge Thomas E. Morris on 5/27/2010. (JE) (Entered: 05/27/2010)
05/27/2010	<u>19</u>	Joint MOTION for extension of time to complete discovery <i>and expert witness disclosure deadlines and memorandum of law</i> by Michele Haddad. (Howanitz, Jay) Motions referred to Magistrate Judge Thomas E. Morris. Modified on 5/28/2010 Notified by counsel document inadvertently added to incorrect case (MHH). (Entered: 05/27/2010)
05/27/2010	<u>20</u>	Emergency MOTION for extension of time to file response/reply as to <u>2</u> MOTION for Hearing MOTION for preliminary injunction by Thomas Arnold, Anna Viamonte Ross. (Sheeran, Andrew) Motions referred to Magistrate Judge Thomas E. Morris. (Entered: 05/27/2010)
05/27/2010	<u>21</u>	ORDER scheduling telephone conference on May 27, 2010 at 4:30 p.m. re <u>20</u> Emergency MOTION for extension of time to file response/reply as to <u>2</u> MOTION for Hearing MOTION for preliminary injunction filed by Anna Viamonte Ross, Thomas Arnold. See Order for details. Signed by Judge Marcia Morales Howard on 5/27/2010. (DH) (Entered: 05/27/2010)
05/27/2010	<u>22</u>	Minute Entry. Proceedings held before Judge Marcia Morales Howard: re <u>20</u> Emergency MOTION for extension of time to file response/reply as to <u>2</u> MOTION for preliminary injunction filed by Anna Viamonte Ross, Thomas Arnold. Motion Hearing held on 5/27/2010; granting <u>20</u> Motion for extension of time to file response/reply as to <u>2</u> MOTION for preliminary injunction (Responses due by 6/2/2010; Replies due by 6/6/2010). Court Reporter: Shelli Kozachenko. (DH) Modified text on 5/28/2010 (DH). (Entered: 05/28/2010)
05/28/2010	<u>23</u>	NOTICE of Hearing on Motion <u>2</u> MOTION for Hearing MOTION for preliminary injunction: Motion Hearing set for 6/15/2010 at 02:00 PM in Jacksonville Courtroom 10 B before Judge Marcia Morales Howard. (DH) (Entered: 05/28/2010)
06/02/2010	<u>24</u>	NOTICE by Thomas Arnold <i>Notice of Filing Affidavit of Elizabeth Y. Kidder</i> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Affidavit of Elizabeth Y. Kidder, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Ex. I: Draft Nursing Home Transition Plan, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Ex. II: Long v Benson Settlement Agreement)(Sheeran, Andrew) (Entered: 06/02/2010)
06/02/2010	<u>25</u>	NOTICE by Thomas Arnold <i>Notice of Filing Affidavit of Kristen Russell</i> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Affidavit of Kristen Russell, 6-2-2010)(Sheeran, Andrew) (Entered: 06/02/2010)
06/02/2010	<u>26</u>	NOTICE by Thomas Arnold <i>Notice of Filing Affidavit of Michele Hudson</i> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Michele Hudson, 6-2-2010)(Sheeran, Andrew) (Entered: 06/02/2010)
06/02/2010	<u>27</u>	RESPONSE in opposition re <u>2</u> MOTION for Hearing MOTION for preliminary injunction filed by Thomas Arnold. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Kristen Russell, 4-29-2010)(Sheeran, Andrew) (Entered: 06/02/2010)
06/04/2010	<u>28</u>	Emergency MOTION for leave to file excess pages by Michele Haddad. (Howanitz, Jay) (Entered: 06/04/2010)
06/06/2010	<u>29</u>	REPLY to response to motion re <u>2</u> MOTION for Hearing MOTION for preliminary injunction. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Exhibit, # <u>3</u> Exhibit, # <u>4</u> Exhibit, # <u>5</u> Exhibit, # <u>6</u> Exhibit, # <u>7</u> Exhibit, # <u>8</u> Exhibit, # <u>9</u> Exhibit, # <u>10</u> Exhibit)(Gold, Stephen) (Entered: 06/06/2010)
06/07/2010	<u>30</u>	ORDER granting <u>28</u> Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages. See Order for details. Signed by Judge Marcia Morales Howard on 6/7/2010, nunc pro tunc to 6/4/2010. (BMR) (Entered: 06/08/2010)

06/08/2010	<u>31</u>	SUPPLEMENT re <u>10</u> Response <i>STATEMENT OF INTEREST</i> by United States. (Esposito, Beth) Modified on 6/10/2010 STRICKEN pursuant to Order #36 (MHH). (Entered: 06/08/2010)
06/08/2010	<u>32</u>	MOTION to dismiss Complaint by Thomas Arnold, Anna Viamonte Ross. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A – Dubois Complaint, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B – Dubois Settlement, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C – Dubois Order of Dismissal, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D – Affidavit of Kristen Russell dated 4/29/10)(Sheeran, Andrew) (Entered: 06/08/2010)
06/08/2010	<u>33</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE by United States re <u>31</u> Supplement <i>Statement of Interest</i> (Esposito, Beth) Modified on 6/9/2010 Counsel notified to refile document with case style and case number(MHH). (Entered: 06/08/2010)
06/09/2010	<u>34</u>	AMENDED CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE by United States re <u>31</u> Supplement (Esposito, Beth) Modified on 6/9/2010 to edit text only(MHH). (Entered: 06/09/2010)
06/09/2010	<u>35</u>	MEMORANDUM in opposition re <u>32</u> Motion to dismiss <i>complaint</i> filed by Michele Haddad. (Gold, Stephen) (Entered: 06/09/2010)
06/10/2010	<u>36</u>	ORDER directing the Clerk of the Court to strike <u>31</u> Supplemental Statement of Interest of the United States. See Order for details. Signed by Judge Marcia Morales Howard on 6/10/2010. (BMR) (Entered: 06/10/2010)
06/10/2010	<u>37</u>	MOTION for miscellaneous relief, specifically <i>Leave to File a Supplemental Statement of Interest</i> by United States. (Esposito, Beth) (Entered: 06/10/2010)
06/14/2010	<u>38</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Anne S, Raish on behalf of United States (Carter, Ronnie) Modified on 6/14/2010 (PAM). [Counsel notified to use correct case number on future pleadings] (Entered: 06/14/2010)
06/15/2010	<u>39</u>	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Marcia Morales Howard: Motion Hearing held on 6/15/2010 regarding <u>2</u> Plaintiff's Motion for Preliminary Injunction; granting <u>37</u> the United States' Motion for Leave to File a Supplemental Statement of Interest. The Clerk of the Court is directed to file the Supplemental Statement of Interest of the United States of America which is attached as Exhibit A to the motion. Court Reporter: Shelli Kozachenko (JW) (Entered: 06/16/2010)
06/15/2010	<u>45</u>	SUPPLEMENTAL Statement of Interest re <u>10</u> Response by United States. (MHH) Modified on 6/23/2010 to edit docket text (SMS). (Entered: 06/22/2010)
06/21/2010	<u>40</u>	NOTICE by Michele Haddad <i>Notice of Status Re Hospital Discharge</i> (Gold, Stephen) (Entered: 06/21/2010)
06/21/2010	<u>41</u>	MEMORANDUM in support re <u>40</u> Notice (Other) <i>Preliminary Injunction Relief</i> filed by Michele Haddad. (Gold, Stephen) (Entered: 06/21/2010)
06/21/2010	<u>42</u>	MEMORANDUM in opposition re <u>2</u> Motion for HearingMotion for preliminary injunction <i>Memorandum of Law on Mandatory Nature of Requested Injunction</i> filed by Thomas Arnold. (Sheeran, Andrew) (Entered: 06/21/2010)
06/21/2010	<u>43</u>	NOTICE by Thomas Arnold re <u>42</u> Memorandum in opposition <i>Notice of Substituted Filing</i> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Main Document Ex.A – Amended Memorandum of Law on Standard for Preliminary Injunction)(Sheeran, Andrew) (Entered: 06/21/2010)
06/21/2010	<u>44</u>	MEMORANDUM in support re <u>2</u> Motion for HearingMotion for preliminary injunction <i>Memorandum of Law Regarding Preliminary Injunction Standard</i> filed by United States. (Raish, Anne) (Entered: 06/21/2010)
06/23/2010	<u>46</u>	ORDER granting <u>2</u> Plaintiff Michele Haddad's Motion for Preliminary Injunction, Memorandum in Support Thereof, and Expedited Hearing. Signed by Judge Marcia Morales Howard on 6/23/2010. (JW) (Entered: 06/23/2010)
07/08/2010	<u>47</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Preliminary Injunction Hearing held on June 15, 2010, before Judge Marcia Morales Howard. Court Reporter/Transcriber Shelli Kozachenko, Telephone number 904.301.6842. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be

		obtained through PACER or purchased through the Court Reporter. Redaction Request due 7/29/2010, Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 8/9/2010, Release of Transcript Restriction set for 10/6/2010. (SMK) (Entered: 07/08/2010)
07/09/2010	<u>48</u>	NOTICE to counsel of filing of OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days. Any party needing a copy of the transcript to review for redaction purposes may purchase a copy from the court reporter or view the document at the clerk's office public terminal. Court Reporter: Shelli Kozachenko, telephone number 904.301.6842. (SMK) (Entered: 07/09/2010)
07/09/2010	<u>49</u>	OPINION regarding <u>2</u> Plaintiff Michele Haddad's Motion for Preliminary Injunction. Signed by Judge Marcia Morales Howard on 7/9/2010. (JW) (Entered: 07/09/2010)
07/09/2010	<u>50</u>	ORDER reassigning this case from the unassigned docket to the docket of the undersigned for all further proceedings. Signed by Judge Marcia Morales Howard on 7/9/2010. (JW) (Entered: 07/09/2010)
07/12/2010	<u>51</u>	Case Reassigned to Judge Marcia Morales Howard. New case number: 3:10-cv-414-J-34TEM. Judge Unassigned Judge MMH no longer assigned to the case. (PAM) Modified on 7/12/2010 (PAM). [Incorrect: See Doc. 52] (Entered: 07/12/2010)
07/12/2010	<u>52</u>	AMENDED Case Reassigned to Judge Marcia Morales Howard. New case number: 3:10-cv-414-J-34TEM. Judge Unassigned Judge MMH no longer assigned to the case. (PAM) Modified on 7/12/2010 to edit text (PAM). (Entered: 07/12/2010)
07/22/2010	<u>53</u>	MOTION for William M. Blocker II to withdraw as attorney by Thomas Arnold. (Blocker, William) Motions referred to Magistrate Judge Thomas E. Morris. Modified on 7/23/2010 (PAM). [Counsel notified to use correct case number on future pleadings] (Entered: 07/22/2010)
07/30/2010	<u>54</u>	CASE MANAGEMENT REPORT. (Howanitz, Jay) (Entered: 07/30/2010)
08/04/2010	<u>55</u>	CASE MANAGEMENT AND SCHEDULING ORDER AND REFERRAL TO MEDIATION: Discovery due by 3/11/2011. Dispositive motions due by 4/1/2011. Conduct mediation hearing by 5/2/2011. Pretrial statement due by 7/11/2011. Final Pretrial Conference set for 7/18/2011 at 10:00 AM in Jacksonville Courtroom 10 B before Judge Marcia Morales Howard. Bench Trial set for trial term commencing on 8/1/2011 at 09:30 AM in Jacksonville Courtroom 10 B before Judge Marcia Morales Howard. Signed by Judge Marcia Morales Howard on 8/4/2010. (JW) (Entered: 08/04/2010)
08/05/2010	<u>56</u>	NOTICE by Thomas Arnold, Anna Viamonte Ross <i>Notice of Filing Affidavit of Kristen Russell, dated August 5, 2010</i> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Affidavit of Kristen Russell, dated August 5, 2010)(Sheeran, Andrew) (Entered: 08/05/2010)
08/06/2010	<u>57</u>	ORDER granting <u>53</u> Motion to withdraw as attorney. See Order for details. Signed by Magistrate Judge Thomas E. Morris on 8/6/2010. (JE) (Entered: 08/06/2010)
08/12/2010	<u>58</u>	CERTIFICATE of interested persons and corporate disclosure statement by Thomas Arnold, Anna Viamonte Ross. (Sheeran, Andrew) (Entered: 08/12/2010)
08/16/2010	<u>59</u>	CERTIFICATE of interested persons and corporate disclosure statement by Michele Haddad. (Howanitz, Jay) (Entered: 08/16/2010)
12/01/2010	<u>60</u>	Joint MOTION for extension of time to complete discovery <i>and Memorandum of Law</i> by Thomas Arnold, Michele Haddad, Anna Viamonte Ross. (Howanitz, Jay) Motions referred to Magistrate Judge Thomas E. Morris. (Entered: 12/01/2010)
12/17/2010	<u>61</u>	ORDER granting <u>60</u> Motion for extension of time to complete discovery. Plaintiffs Disclosure of Expert Reports due February 4, 2011; Defendants Disclosure of Expert Reports due March 11, 2011; Deadline for Discovery is May 10, 2011. Signed by Magistrate Judge Thomas E. Morris on 12/17/2010. (JE) (Entered: 12/17/2010)

		12/17/2010)
02/03/2011	<u>62</u>	NOTICE of compliance by Michele Haddad (Howanitz, Jay) (Entered: 02/03/2011)
03/16/2011	<u>63</u>	ORDER denying <u>32</u> Defendants' Motion to Dismiss Complaint. The deadlines and settings in the Court's Case Management and Scheduling Order remain in effect. Signed by Judge Marcia Morales Howard on 3/16/2011. (JW) (Entered: 03/16/2011)
03/25/2011	<u>64</u>	AFFIDAVIT of Kristen Russell <i>Notice of Filing</i> by Elizabeth Dudek. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Kristen Russell)(Sheeran, Andrew) (Entered: 03/25/2011)
03/25/2011	<u>65</u>	MOTION to dismiss Complaint <i>as Moot</i> by Elizabeth Dudek. (Sheeran, Andrew) (Entered: 03/25/2011)
04/07/2011		Mail returned as Undeliverable re: <u>63</u> Order on motion to dismiss. Mail not resent to Philip L. Breen per phone conversation that counsel has retired. (MHH) (Entered: 04/07/2011)
04/08/2011	<u>66</u>	Unopposed MOTION to extend time to respond to Defendant's Motion to Dismiss by Michele Haddad. (Howanitz, Jay) (Entered: 04/08/2011)
04/11/2011	<u>67</u>	ORDER granting <u>66</u> Agreed Motion for Extension of Time to Respond to Defendants' Motion to Dismiss. Response due April 20, 2011. Signed by Judge Marcia Morales Howard on 4/11/2011. (JW) (Entered: 04/11/2011)
04/15/2011	<u>68</u>	STIPULATION of Dismissal <i>With Prejudice</i> by Thomas Arnold, Elizabeth Dudek, Michele Haddad, Anna Viamonte Ross. (Howanitz, Jay) INCORRECT PDF, COUNSEL REFILED DOCUMENT, REFER TO DOC. 69. Modified on 4/15/2011 (EAM). (Entered: 04/15/2011)
04/15/2011	<u>69</u>	AMENDED STIPULATION of Dismissal <i>With Prejudice</i> by Thomas Arnold, Elizabeth Dudek, Michele Haddad, Anna Viamonte Ross. (Howanitz, Jay) Modified text on 4/15/2011 (EAM). (Entered: 04/15/2011)
04/19/2011	<u>70</u>	ORDER dismissing case with prejudice. The Clerk of the Court is directed to close the file. Signed by Judge Marcia Morales Howard on 4/19/2011. (JW) (Entered: 04/19/2011)
04/20/2011	<u>71</u>	AMENDED ORDER dismissing case. Signed by Judge Marcia Morales Howard on 4/20/2011. (JW) (Entered: 04/20/2011)
06/20/2011	<u>72</u>	Unopposed MOTION to reopen Case by Michele Haddad. (Howanitz, Jay) (Entered: 06/20/2011)
06/22/2011	<u>73</u>	ORDER granting <u>72</u> Plaintiff's Unopposed Motion to Re-Open Action. The Clerk of the Court is directed to re-open this case. Signed by Judge Marcia Morales Howard on 6/21/2011. (JW) (Entered: 06/22/2011)
07/06/2011	<u>74</u>	MOTION for attorney fees <i>and litigation expenses</i> by Michele Haddad. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Gold declaration, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Howanitz declaration, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Gold resume, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Howanitz resume, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Gold fees and costs, # <u>6</u> Exhibit Howanitz fees and costs, # <u>7</u> Exhibit Coker declaration, # <u>8</u> Exhibit Alexander declaration)(Howanitz, Jay) Motions referred to Magistrate Judge Thomas E. Morris. (Entered: 07/06/2011)
07/08/2011	<u>75</u>	ORDER referring motion for report and recommendation: <u>74</u> Plaintiff's Motion for Attorneys' Fees and Litigation Expenses. Signed by Judge Marcia Morales Howard on 7/8/2011. (JW) Motions referred to Magistrate Judge Thomas E. Morris. (Entered: 07/08/2011)
07/22/2011	<u>76</u>	RESPONSE in opposition re <u>74</u> MOTION for attorney fees <i>and litigation expenses</i> ( <i>Defendants' Response and Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Attorneys' Fees and Litigation Expenses</i> ) filed by Thomas Arnold, Elizabeth Dudek, Anna Viamonte Ross, Harry Frank Farmer, Jr., M.D.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit "A" (Order denying Plaintiff Haddad's Motion for Preliminary Injunction in Jones v. Arnold), # <u>2</u> Exhibit "B" (Stipulation of Dismissal of Class Action Claims in Jones v. Arnold), # <u>3</u> Exhibit "C" (attorney

		Gold's disallowed hours related to Jones case), # <u>4</u> Exhibit "D" (attorney Howanitz' disallowed hours related to Jones case), # <u>5</u> Exhibit "E" (Plaintiff Haddad' Motion for Preliminary Injunction, etc., filed in Jones v. Arnold), # <u>6</u> Exhibit "F" (Motion for Leave to Amend First Amended Class Action Complaint in Jones v. Arnold), # <u>7</u> Exhibit "G" (Complaint filed in Cruz and De la Torre v. Arnold), # <u>8</u> Exhibit "H" (Amended Complaint filed in Robledo v. Dudek), # <u>9</u> Exhibit "I" (Defendants' Rspnse and Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Plaintiff Haddad's Motion for Preliminary Injunction filed in Jones v. Arnold), # <u>10</u> Exhibit "J" (Hours claimed by attorney Gold with objections), # <u>11</u> Exhibit "K" (Hours claimed by attorney Howanitz with objections))(Whitney, Enoch) (Entered: 07/22/2011)
07/22/2011	<u>77</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Enoch Jonathan Whitney on behalf of Elizabeth Dudek, Harry Frank Farmer, Jr., M.D. (Whitney, Enoch) (Entered: 07/22/2011)
07/29/2011	<u>78</u>	Unopposed MOTION for leave to file reply brief <i>to Deft's response and memorandum of law in opposition to plaintiff's motion for attorneys' fees and litigation expenses</i> by Michele Haddad. (Howanitz, Jay) (Entered: 07/29/2011)
08/03/2011	<u>79</u>	ENDORSED ORDER granting <u>78</u> Motion for leave to file a reply to Defendant's response and memorandum of law in opposition to Plaintiff's motion for attorneys' fees and litigation expenses. Reply may not exceed 15 pages, conforming to requirements of Local Rule 1.05(a). Reply due by the close of business day on 8/12/2011. Signed by Magistrate Judge Thomas E. Morris on 8/3/2011. (NTM) (Entered: 08/03/2011)
08/12/2011	<u>80</u>	REPLY to response to motion re <u>74</u> MOTION for attorney fees <i>and litigation expenses</i> filed by Michele Haddad. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Hours of S Gold, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Hours of J Howanitz)(Howanitz, Jay) (Entered: 08/12/2011)
08/19/2011	<u>81</u>	MOTION for Hearing re <u>76</u> Response in opposition to motion, <u>80</u> Reply to response to motion, <u>74</u> MOTION for attorney fees <i>and litigation expenses (Defendants' Request for Oral Argument upon Plaintiff's Motion for Attorney's Fees and Litigation Costs and Defendants' Response in Opposition)</i> , MOTION to extend time to request oral argument by Elizabeth Dudek, Harry Frank Farmer, Jr., M.D.. (Whitney, Enoch) (Entered: 08/19/2011)
08/23/2011		Mail returned as Undeliverable re: 79 Order on motion for leave to file. Mail not resent to John L. Wodatch, phoned office informed attorney has retired. (MHH) (Entered: 08/23/2011)
08/26/2011	<u>82</u>	RESPONSE in opposition <i>to Defendant</i> filed by Michele Haddad. (Howanitz, Jay) (Entered: 08/26/2011)
08/26/2011	<u>83</u>	Unopposed MOTION for leave to file a reply to Plaintiff's Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Defendants' Request for Oral Argument by Elizabeth Dudek, Harry Frank Farmer, Jr., M.D.. (Whitney, Enoch) (Entered: 08/26/2011)
08/29/2011	<u>84</u>	ORDER granting <u>83</u> Motion for leave to file reply. Reply may not exceed five pages, conforming to requirements of Local Rule 1.05(a). Defendant's reply due 9/6/11. Plaintiff's sur-reply, if desired, due 9/13/11. Signed by Magistrate Judge Thomas E. Morris on 8/29/2011. (NTM) (Entered: 08/29/2011)
09/02/2011	<u>85</u>	REPLY to response to motion re <u>83</u> Unopposed MOTION for leave to file a reply to Plaintiff's Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Defendants' Request for Oral Argument ( <i>Defendants' Reply to Plaintiff's Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Defendants' Request for Oral Argument</i> ) filed by Elizabeth Dudek, Harry Frank Farmer, Jr., M.D.. (Whitney, Enoch) (Entered: 09/02/2011)
09/08/2011	<u>86</u>	REPLY to response to motion <i>Plaintiff's Sur-Reply Regarding Defendants' Request for Oral Argument</i> filed by Michele Haddad. (Howanitz, Jay) (Entered: 09/08/2011)
09/14/2011	<u>87</u>	ORDER granting <u>81</u> Motion for Hearing; granting <u>81</u> Motion to extend time to request oral argument. Oral argument set for 10/3/11 at 2:00 p.m. in Courtroom 5B. Signed by Magistrate Judge Thomas E. Morris on 9/14/2011. (NTM) (Entered: 09/14/2011)



09/19/2011		Mail returned as Undeliverable – marked Moved Left No Address, Unable to forward re: 79 Order on motion for leave to file. Mail not resent to Philip L. Breen. (MHH) (Entered: 09/19/2011)
09/20/2011	<u>88</u>	NOTICE of supplemental authority by Michele Haddad (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit)(Howanitz, Jay) (Entered: 09/20/2011)
09/23/2011	<u>89</u>	NOTICE of supplemental authority re <u>76</u> Response in opposition to motion <i>for attorneys' fees and litigation expenses</i> , by Elizabeth Dudek, Harry Frank Farmer, Jr., M.D. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A,, Dionne v. Floormasters Enterprises, Inc., 2011 WL 3189770 (C.A.11 (Fla.) July 28, 2011))(Whitney, Enoch) (Entered: 09/23/2011)
10/03/2011	<u>90</u>	Minute Entry. Proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Thomas E. Morris: Motion Hearing held on 10/3/2011 re <u>74</u> MOTION for attorney fees <i>and litigation expenses</i> filed by Michele Haddad. (DIGITAL) Court Reporter: Shannon Bishop, Official Court Reporter (CJH) (Entered: 10/03/2011)
10/10/2011	<u>91</u>	NOTICE of supplemental authority re <u>76</u> Response in opposition to motion <i>for attorneys' fees and litigation expenses</i> , by Elizabeth Dudek, Harry Frank Farmer, Jr., M.D. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, Long v. Morton Plant Hospital Association, Inc., 265 Fed. Appx. 798, 2008 WL 383808 (C.A. 11 (Fla.) 2008), # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, Notice of Settlement filed in Long v. Morton Plant Hospital Association, Inc., Case No. 05-0613-CIV-JSM-TBM)(Whitney, Enoch) (Entered: 10/10/2011)
10/20/2011	<u>92</u>	REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION re <u>74</u> MOTION for attorney fees and litigation expenses filed by Michele Haddad. Signed by Magistrate Judge Thomas E. Morris on 10/20/2011. (NTM) (Entered: 10/20/2011)
11/01/2011	<u>93</u>	OBJECTION re <u>92</u> REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION re <u>74</u> MOTION for attorney fees <i>and litigation expenses</i> filed by Michele Haddad. ( <i>DEFENDANTS' OBJECTIONS TO REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION REGARDING RESOLUTION OF PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR ATTORNEY'S FEES AND LITIGATION EXPENSES</i> ). (Whitney, Enoch) (Entered: 11/01/2011)
11/02/2011	<u>94</u>	REQUEST for oral argument re <u>93</u> Objection ( <i>DEFENDANTS' OBJECTIONS TO REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION REGARDING RESOLUTION OF PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR ATTORNEY'S FEES AND LITIGATION EXPENSES</i> ), by Elizabeth Dudek, Harry Frank Farmer, Jr., M.D.. (Whitney, Enoch) (Entered: 11/02/2011)
11/03/2011	<u>95</u>	RESPONSE re <u>93</u> Objection filed by Michele Haddad. (Howanitz, Jay) (Entered: 11/03/2011)
11/04/2011	<u>96</u>	NOTICE of supplemental authority re <u>93</u> Objection ( <i>DEFENDANTS' OBJECTIONS TO REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION REGARDING RESOLUTION OF PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR ATTORNEY'S FEES AND LITIGATION EXPENSES</i> ), by Elizabeth Dudek, Harry Frank Farmer, Jr., M.D. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, Farrar v. Hobby, 506 U.S. 103, 113 S.Ct. 566, 573-74 (1992),)(Whitney, Enoch) (Entered: 11/04/2011)
01/12/2012	<u>97</u>	NOTICE of supplemental authority re <u>93</u> Objection ( <i>DEFENDANTS' OBJECTIONS TO REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION REGARDING RESOLUTION OF PLAINTIFF'S MOTION FOR ATTORNEY'S FEES AND LITIGATION EXPENSES</i> ), by Elizabeth Dudek, Harry Frank Farmer, Jr., M.D. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit "A", Higher Taste v. City of Tacoma, Case No. C10-5252BHS, 2011 WL 5864665, (U. S. District Court, W.D. Wash., Nov. 22, 2011))(Whitney, Enoch) (Entered: 01/12/2012)
01/28/2012	<u>98</u>	NOTICE to the Courts to take judicial notice regarding <u>92</u> REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION re <u>74</u> MOTION for attorney fees <i>and litigation expenses</i> filed by Michele Haddad. by Elizabeth Dudek, Harry Frank Farmer, Jr., M.D.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit "A", on-line docket for Petition for Writ of Certiorari in the United States Supreme Court in the case of David J. King, In His Official Capacity as Chair of the Kansas Commission on Judicial Qualifications, et al., Petitioners, v. Kansas Judicial Watch, et al., No. 11-829, filed December 28, 2011.)(Whitney, Enoch) (Entered: 01/28/2012)

01/31/2012	<u>99</u>	SUPPLEMENT re <u>98</u> Notice to the Courts to take judicial notice by Elizabeth Dudek, Harry Frank Farmer, Jr., M.D.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit "A", Petition for Writ of Certiorari in the United States Supreme Court in the case of David J. King, In His Official Capacity as Chair of the Kansas Commission on Judicial Qualifications, et al., Petitioners, v. Kansas Judicial Watch, et al., No. 11-829, filed December 28, 2011)(Whitney, Enoch) (Entered: 01/31/2012)
02/02/2012	<u>100</u>	ORDER adopting, as modified by the Order, <u>92</u> Report and Recommendation; granting, in part, <u>74</u> Plaintiff's Motion for Attorneys' Fees and Litigation Expenses. The Clerk of the Court is directed to enter judgment in accordance with this Order and close the file. Signed by Judge Marcia Morales Howard on 2/2/2012. (JW) (Entered: 02/02/2012)
02/03/2012	<u>101</u>	JUDGMENT that pursuant to this Court's Order, entered February 2, 2012, Judgment is entered in favor of Plaintiff Michele Haddad, and against Defendant Elizabeth Dudek, in her official capacity as Secretary, Florida Agency for Health Care Administration, Defendant Dr. Harry Frank Farmer, in his official capacity as Surgeon General, Florida Department of Health, in the amount of \$75, 641.16, for attorneys' fees and costs. Signed by Deputy Clerk on 2/3/2012. (ZSF) (Entered: 02/03/2012)
03/26/2012		Mail returned as damaged by the United States Postal Service re: <u>101</u> Judgment. Mail resent to John L. Wodatch. (ZSF) (Entered: 03/26/2012)
03/28/2012		Mail returned damaged by U.S. Postal Service re: <u>100</u> Order Adopting Report and Recommendations. Mail resent to Philip L. Breen. (ZSF) (Entered: 03/28/2012)
04/05/2012		Mail returned as damaged by U.S. Postal Service re: <u>101</u> Judgment. Mail resent to Philip L. Breen. (ZSF) (Entered: 04/05/2012)