

**U.S. District Court  
DISTRICT OF ARIZONA (Phoenix Division)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 2:16-cv-02337-ROS**

Planned Parenthood Arizona Incorporated et al v. Betlach  
Assigned to: Senior Judge Roslyn O Silver  
Cause: 42:1983 Civil Rights Act

Date Filed: 07/14/2016  
Date Terminated: 09/07/2016  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 440 Civil Rights: Other  
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

**Plaintiff**

**Planned Parenthood Arizona  
Incorporated**

represented by **Daniel Benjamin Pasternak**  
Squire Patton Boggs (US) LLP – Phoenix,  
AZ  
1 E Washington St., Ste. 2700  
Phoenix, AZ 85004  
602-528-4000  
Fax: 602-253-8129  
Email: [daniel.pasternak@squirepb.com](mailto:daniel.pasternak@squirepb.com)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Diana Salgado**  
Planned Parenthood Federation of America  
– New York, NY  
123 William St.  
New York, NY 10038  
212-541-7800  
Fax: 212-247-6811  
Email: [diana.salgado@ppfa.org](mailto:diana.salgado@ppfa.org)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Laura Lawless Robertson**  
Squire Patton Boggs (US) LLP – Phoenix,  
AZ  
1 E Washington St., Ste. 2700  
Phoenix, AZ 85004  
602-528-4000  
Fax: 602-253-8129  
Email: [laura.robertson@squirepb.com](mailto:laura.robertson@squirepb.com)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Alyson Zureick**  
ACLU – New York, NY  
125 Broad St., 18th Fl.  
New York, NY 10004  
212-549-2633  
Fax: 212-549-2651  
Email: [azureick@aclu.org](mailto:azureick@aclu.org)  
**TERMINATED: 08/22/2016**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Plaintiff**

**Desert Star Family Planning LLC**

represented by **Alyson Zureick**  
(See above for address)  
**TERMINATED: 08/22/2016**  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Brigitte Amiri**

ACLU – New York, NY  
125 Broad St., 18th Fl.  
New York, NY 10004  
212–549–2633  
Fax: 212–549–2651  
Email: [bamiri@aclu.org](mailto:bamiri@aclu.org)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Daniel Joseph Pochoda**  
ACLU – Phoenix, AZ  
P.O. Box 17148  
Phoenix, AZ 85011  
602–650–1854  
Fax: 602–650–1376  
Email: [dpochoda@acluaz.org](mailto:dpochoda@acluaz.org)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jennifer Lee**  
ACLU – New York, NY  
125 Broad St., 18th Fl.  
New York, NY 10004  
212–549–2633  
Fax: 212–549–2651  
Email: [jlee@aclu.org](mailto:jlee@aclu.org)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Kathleen E Brody**  
ACLU – Phoenix, AZ  
P.O. Box 17148  
Phoenix, AZ 85011  
602–650–1854  
Fax: 602–650–1376  
Email: [kbrody@acluaz.org](mailto:kbrody@acluaz.org)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**DeShawn Taylor**  
*M.D.*

represented by **Alyson Zureick**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 08/22/2016*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Brigitte Amiri**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Daniel Joseph Pochoda**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jennifer Lee**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Kathleen E Brody**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Eric Reuss**  
*M.D., M.P.H.*

represented by **Alyson Zureick**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 08/22/2016*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Brigitte Amiri**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Daniel Joseph Pochoda**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jennifer Lee**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Kathleen E Brody**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Unknown Parties**  
*named as Jane Does #2-5*

represented by **Alyson Zureick**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 08/22/2016*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Brigitte Amiri**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Daniel Joseph Pochoda**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jennifer Lee**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Unknown Party**  
*named as Jane Doe #1*

represented by **Daniel Benjamin Pasternak**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Diana Salgado**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Laura Lawless Robertson**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Alyson Marie Zureick**  
 ACLU – New York, NY  
 125 Broad St., 18th Fl.  
 New York, NY 10004  
 212–284–7351  
 Fax: 212–549–2651  
 Email: [azureick@aclu.org](mailto:azureick@aclu.org)  
 TERMINATED: 08/22/2016  
 ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Kathleen E Brody**  
 (See above for address)  
 ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

**Defendant**

**Thomas Betlach**

*Director, Arizona Health Care  
 Containment System, in his official  
 capacity*

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
07/14/2016	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT. Filing fee received: \$ 400.00, receipt number 0970–13175472 filed by Eric Reuss, Planned Parenthood Arizona Incorporated, DeShawn Taylor, Desert Star Family Planning LLC, Unknown Parties. (Submitted by Laura Robertson) (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Civil Cover Sheet)(LAD) (Entered: 07/14/2016)
07/14/2016	<u>2</u>	SUMMONS Submitted by Desert Star Family Planning LLC, Planned Parenthood Arizona Incorporated, Eric Reuss, DeShawn Taylor, Unknown Parties. (Submitted by Laura Robertson) (LAD) (Entered: 07/14/2016)
07/14/2016	<u>3</u>	Corporate Disclosure Statement by Desert Star Family Planning LLC, Planned Parenthood Arizona Incorporated, Eric Reuss, DeShawn Taylor, Unknown Parties. (LAD) (Entered: 07/14/2016)
07/14/2016	<u>4</u>	Filing fee paid, receipt number 0970–13175472. This case has been assigned to the Honorable Roslyn O Silver. All future pleadings or documents should bear the correct case number: CV–16–02337–PHX–ROS. Notice of Availability of Magistrate Judge to Exercise Jurisdiction form attached. (LAD) (Entered: 07/14/2016)
07/14/2016	<u>5</u>	Summons Issued as to Thomas Betlach. (LAD). *** IMPORTANT: When printing the summons, select "Document and stamps" or "Document and comments" for the seal to appear on the document. (Entered: 07/14/2016)
07/15/2016	<u>6</u>	MOTION for Admission Pro Hac Vice as to attorney Brigitte A Amiri by Desert Star Family Planning LLC, Eric Reuss, DeShawn Taylor, Unknown Parties. (Amiri, Brigitte) (Entered: 07/15/2016)
07/15/2016	<u>7</u>	MOTION for Admission Pro Hac Vice as to attorney Jennifer K Lee by Desert Star Family Planning LLC, Eric Reuss, DeShawn Taylor, Unknown Parties. (Lee, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/15/2016)
07/15/2016	<u>8</u>	ORDER that motions pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b) are discouraged if the defect can be cured by filing an amended pleading. The parties must meet and confer prior to the filing of such motions to determine whether it can be avoided. FURTHER ORDERED that Plaintiff(s) serve a copy of this Order upon Defendant(s) and file a notice of service. See attached Order for complete details. Signed by Senior Judge Roslyn O. Silver on 7/15/16. (CLB) (Entered: 07/15/2016)
07/18/2016	<u>9</u>	MOTION for Admission Pro Hac Vice as to attorney Diana Salgado by Planned Parenthood Arizona Incorporated. (Salgado, Diana) (Entered: 07/18/2016)

07/19/2016		PRO HAC VICE FEE PAID. \$ 35, receipt number PHX174146 as to Brigitte Amiri, Diana Salgado. This is a TEXT ENTRY ONLY. There is no PDF document associated with this entry. (BAS) (Entered: 07/19/2016)
07/19/2016		PRO HAC VICE FEE PAID. \$ 35, receipt number PHX174147 as to Jennifer Lee. This is a TEXT ENTRY ONLY. There is no PDF document associated with this entry. (BAS) (Entered: 07/19/2016)
07/19/2016	10	ORDER pursuant to General Order 09-08 granting <u>6</u> Motion for Admission Pro Hac Vice; granting <u>7</u> Motion for Admission Pro Hac Vice. Per the Court's Administrative Policies and Procedures Manual, applicant has five (5) days in which to register as a user of the Electronic Filing System. Registration to be accomplished via the court's website at www.azd.uscourts.gov. Counsel is advised that they are limited to two (2) additional e-mail addresses in their District of Arizona User Account. (BAS) (This is a TEXT ENTRY ONLY. There is no.pdf document associated with this entry.) (Entered: 07/19/2016)
07/20/2016	<u>11</u>	SERVICE EXECUTED filed by Desert Star Family Planning LLC, Planned Parenthood Arizona Incorporated, Eric Reuss, DeShawn Taylor, Unknown Parties, Unknown Party: Acceptance of Service re: Complaint, Summons, Plaintiffs' Corporate Disclosure Agreements, Notice of Availability of US Magistrate Judge to Exercise Jurisdiction, Court's July 15, 2016 Order concerning Rule 12 motions upon Matthew J. Devlin on behalf of Defendant Thomas Betlach on 07/20/2016. (Lee, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/20/2016)
07/26/2016	<u>12</u>	MOTION for Admission Pro Hac Vice as to attorney Alyson Zureick on behalf of plaintiffs Desert Star Family Planning LLC, Planned Parenthood Arizona Incorporated, Eric Reuss, DeShawn Taylor, Unknown Parties, and Unknown Party. (BAS) (Entered: 07/26/2016)
07/26/2016		PRO HAC VICE FEE PAID. \$ 35, receipt number PHX174380 as to Alyson Zureick. This is a TEXT ENTRY ONLY. There is no PDF document associated with this entry. (BAS) (Entered: 07/26/2016)
07/26/2016	13	ORDER pursuant to General Order 09-08 granting <u>12</u> Motion for Admission Pro Hac Vice. Per the Court's Administrative Policies and Procedures Manual, applicant has five (5) days in which to register as a user of the Electronic Filing System. Registration to be accomplished via the court's website at www.azd.uscourts.gov. Counsel is advised that they are limited to two (2) additional e-mail addresses in their District of Arizona User Account. (BAS) (This is a TEXT ENTRY ONLY. There is no.pdf document associated with this entry.) (Entered: 07/26/2016)
07/29/2016	14	ORDER pursuant to General Order 09-08 granting <u>9</u> Motion for Admission Pro Hac Vice. Per the Court's Administrative Policies and Procedures Manual, applicant has five (5) days in which to register as a user of the Electronic Filing System. Registration to be accomplished via the court's website at www.azd.uscourts.gov. Counsel is advised that they are limited to two (2) additional e-mail addresses in their District of Arizona User Account. (BAS) (This is a TEXT ENTRY ONLY. There is no.pdf document associated with this entry.) (Entered: 07/29/2016)
08/02/2016		PRO HAC VICE FEE PAID. \$ 35, receipt number PHX174674 as to Diana Salgado. This is a TEXT ENTRY ONLY. There is no PDF document associated with this entry. (BAS) (Entered: 08/02/2016)
08/04/2016	<u>15</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Kathleen E Brody on behalf of Desert Star Family Planning LLC, Eric Reuss, DeShawn Taylor, Unknown Party. (Brody, Kathleen) (Entered: 08/04/2016)
08/18/2016	<u>16</u>	MOTION to Withdraw as Attorney <i>Alyson Zureick</i> by Desert Star Family Planning LLC, Planned Parenthood Arizona Incorporated, Eric Reuss, DeShawn Taylor, Unknown Parties, Unknown Party. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Zureick, Alyson) (Entered: 08/18/2016)
08/22/2016	<u>17</u>	ORDER granting <u>16</u> Motion to Withdraw as Attorney. Attorney Alyson Zureickis withdrawn as counsel in this action. Signed by Senior Judge Roslyn O. Silver on 8/22/16.(CLB) (Entered: 08/22/2016)

09/01/2016	<u>18</u>	STIPULATION of Dismissal <i>without Prejudice and Agreement of Nonenforcement</i> by Desert Star Family Planning LLC, Planned Parenthood Arizona Incorporated, Eric Reuss, DeShawn Taylor, Unknown Parties, Unknown Party. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Lee, Jennifer) (Entered: 09/01/2016)
09/07/2016	<u>19</u>	ORDER granting <u>18</u> Stipulation of Dismissal. This case is dismissed without prejudice. See PDF for details. Signed by Senior Judge Roslyn O Silver on 9/6/16. (DXD) (Entered: 09/07/2016)