

**U.S. District Court
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:13-cv-06951-RA**

Tanvir v. Comey et al
Assigned to: Judge Ronnie Abrams
Cause: 28:1331cv Fed. Question: Other Civil Rights

Date Filed: 10/01/2013
Date Terminated: 02/01/2016
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 440 Civil Rights:
Other
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Muhammad Tanvir

represented by **Ramzi Kassem**

Main Street Legal Services, Inc.
2 Court Square, 5th Floor
Long Island City, NY 11101
718-340-4558
Fax: 718-340-4478
Email: ramzi.kassem@law.cuny.edu
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Baher Azmy
Seton Hall Law School Center For
Social Justice
833 Mccarter Highway
Newark, NJ 07102
(973)-642-8700
Fax: (973)-642-8295
Email: bazmy@ccrjustice.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Christopher Sean Ford
Debevoise & Plimpton, LLP (NYC)
919 Third Avenue, 31st Floor
New York, NY 10022
(212)-909-6161
Email: csford@debevoise.com
TERMINATED: 08/18/2015

Diala Shamas
Center for Constitutional Rights
666 Broadway, 7th Floor
New York, NY 10012
212-614-6426

Email: dshamas@ccrjustice.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Erol Nazim Gulay

Debevoise & Plimpton LLP(919
Third Ave)
919 Third Avenue
New York, NY 10022
(212)-909-6549
Email: egulay@debevoise.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jennifer R. Cowan

Debevoise & Plimpton, LLP (NYC)
919 Third Avenue,31st Floor
New York, NY 10022
2129097445
Fax: 2129096836
Email: jrcowan@debevoise.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Naz Ahmad

Main Street Legal Services, Inc
Cuny School of Law 2 Court Square
Long Island City, NY 10026
(718)-340-4630
Email: naz.ahmad@law.cuny.edu
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rebecca Sue Hekman

Debevoise & Plimpton, LLP (NYC)
919 Third Avenue,31st Floor
New York, NY 10022
(212)-909-6219
Fax: (212)-521-7417
Email: rshekman@debevoise.com
TERMINATED: 07/31/2015

Robert N. Shwartz

Debevoise & Plimpton, LLP (NYC)
919 Third Avenue,31st Floor
New York, NY 10022
(212) 909 6000
Fax: (212) 909-6836
Email: rnshwartz@debevoise.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rushmi Bhaskaran

Debevoise & Plimpton LLP
919 Third Avenue
New York, NY 10022
(212) 909-6905
Fax: (212) 521-7116
Email: rbhaskaran@debevoise.com
TERMINATED: 01/17/2019

Shayana Devendra Kadidal

Center for Constitutional Rights
666 Broadway, 7th Floor
New York, NY 10012
(212)614-6438
Fax: (212)614-6499
Email: shanek@ccr-ny.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Susan Shanke Hu

Center For Constitutional Rights
666 Broadway 7th Floor
New York, NY 10012
(212)-614-6491
Fax: (212)-614-6499
Email: shu@ccrjustice.org
TERMINATED: 09/05/2014

Plaintiff

Jameel Algibhah

represented by **Baher Azmy**

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Christopher Sean Ford

(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 08/18/2015

Erol Nazim Gulay

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jennifer R. Cowan

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Naz Ahmad

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rebecca Sue Hekman
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/31/2015

Robert N. Shwartz
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rushmi Bhaskaran
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 01/17/2019

Plaintiff

Awais Sajjad

represented by **Baher Azmy**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Christopher Sean Ford
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 08/18/2015

Erol Nazim Gulay
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jennifer R. Cowan
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Naz Ahmad
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rebecca Sue Hekman
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/31/2015

Robert N. Shwartz
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rushmi Bhaskaran

(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 01/17/2019

Plaintiff

Naveed Shinwari

represented by **Baher Azmy**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Christopher Sean Ford
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 08/18/2015

Erol Nazim Gulay
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jennifer R. Cowan
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Naz Ahmad
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rebecca Sue Hekman
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 07/31/2015

Robert N. Shwartz
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rushmi Bhaskaran
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 01/17/2019

V.

Defendant

James Comey
*Director, Federal Bureau of
Investigation*

represented by **Sarah Sheive Normand**
U.S. Attorney's Office, SDNY (86
Chambers St.)
86 Chambers Street
New York, NY 10007
(212) 637-2200
Fax: (212) 637-2686

Email: sarah.normand@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jennifer Ellen Blain
United States Attorney Office,
SDNY
One Saint Andrew's Plaza
New York, NY 10007
(212)637-2743
Fax: (212) 637-2730
Email: Ellen.Blain@usdoj.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Christopher M. Piehota
Director, Terrorist Screening Center

represented by **Sarah Sheive Normand**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jennifer Ellen Blain
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Rand Beers
Acting Secretary, Department of
Homeland Security
TERMINATED: 06/10/2015

represented by **Sarah Sheive Normand**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jennifer Ellen Blain
(See above for address)

Defendant

John S. Pistole
Administrator, Transportation
Security Administration
TERMINATED: 04/22/2014

represented by **Sarah Sheive Normand**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jennifer Ellen Blain
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

"John" Tanzin
Special Agent, FBI

represented by **Sarah Sheive Normand**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jennifer Ellen Blain
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Sanya Garcia
Special Agent FBI

represented by **Sarah Sheive Normand**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jennifer Ellen Blain
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

John LNU
Special Agent, FBI

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sarah Sheive Normand
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

John Doe
Special Agent, FBI

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sarah Sheive Normand
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Eric H. Holder
TERMINATED: 06/10/2015

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)

Sarah Sheive Normand
(See above for address)

Defendant

Jeh C. Johnson

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sarah Sheive Normand
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Francisco Artousa

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sarah Sheive Normand
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Michael Rutkowski

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sarah Sheive Normand
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

William Gale

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sarah Sheive Normand
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

John C. Harley III

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sarah Sheive Normand
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Steven LNU

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sarah Sheive Normand
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Michael LNU

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sarah Sheive Normand
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Gregg Grossoehmig

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sarah Sheive Normand
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Weysan Dun

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sarah Sheive Normand
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

James C. Langenberg

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sarah Sheive Normand
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

John Does 1-9, 11-13

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)

*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Sarah Sheive Normand
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Defendant

John Doe 10

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Sarah Sheive Normand
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Defendant

Loretta E. Lynch

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
10/01/2013	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Rand Beers, James Comey, John Doe, Sanya Garcia, John LNU, Christopher M. Piehota, John S. Pistole, "John" Tanzin. (Filing Fee \$ 350.00, Receipt Number 465401078011)Document filed by Muhammad Tanvir.(cde) (Entered: 10/02/2013)
10/01/2013		SUMMONS ISSUED as to Rand Beers, James Comey, John Doe, Sanya Garcia, John LNU, Christopher M. Piehota, John S. Pistole, "John" Tanzin. (cde) (Entered: 10/02/2013)
10/01/2013		Magistrate Judge Ronald L. Ellis is so designated. (cde) (Entered: 10/02/2013)
10/01/2013		Case Designated ECF. (cde) (Entered: 10/02/2013)
10/03/2013	<u>2</u>	ORDER AND NOTICE OF INITIAL CONFERENCE: Initial Conference set for 12/13/2013 at 03:45 PM in Courtroom 1506, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Ronnie Abrams. By December 6, 2013, the parties are ordered to submit a joint letter, not to exceed 5 pages, providing the information further set forth in this Order. By December 6, 2013, the parties are ordered to jointly submit to the Court a proposed case management plan and scheduling order. Plaintiff is ordered to serve Defendants with a copy of this order and to file an affidavit on ECF certifying that such

		service has been effectuated. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 10/3/2013) (tn) (Entered: 10/04/2013)
10/05/2013	3	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Ramzi Kassem on behalf of Muhammad Tanvir. (Kassem, Ramzi) (Entered: 10/05/2013)
10/17/2013	4	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Susan Shanke Hu on behalf of Muhammad Tanvir. (Hu, Susan) (Entered: 10/17/2013)
12/03/2013	5	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Sarah Sheive Normand on behalf of Rand Beers, James Comey, John Doe, Sanya Garcia, John LNU, Christopher M. Piehota, John S. Pistole, "John" Tanzin. (Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 12/03/2013)
12/03/2013	6	LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from AUSA Sarah S. Normand dated 12/03/2013., LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from AUSA Sarah S. Normand dated 12/03/2013. Document filed by Rand Beers, James Comey, John Doe, Sanya Garcia, John LNU, Christopher M. Piehota, John S. Pistole, "John" Tanzin.(Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 12/03/2013)
12/05/2013	7	ORDER granting 6 Letter Motion to Adjourn Conference; granting 6 Letter Motion for Extension of Time to Answer re 1 Complaint. Application granted. The conference scheduled for December 13, 2013, is adjourned. After Plaintiff files his amended complaint, the parties shall submit a proposed Revised Scheduling Order as described above. Rand Beers answer due 3/31/2014; James Comey answer due 3/31/2014; Christopher M. Piehota answer due 3/31/2014. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 12/5/2013) (cd) (Entered: 12/05/2013)
12/05/2013	8	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Diala Shamas on behalf of Muhammad Tanvir. (Shamas, Diala) (Entered: 12/05/2013)
03/07/2014	9	ORDER. The parties shall submit a joint status letter by March 21, 2014. That letter shall state a date by which Plaintiff seeks to file an amended complaint. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 3/7/2014) (rjm) (Entered: 03/10/2014)
03/21/2014	10	STATUS REPORT. <i>Joint</i> Document filed by Rand Beers, James Comey, John Doe, Sanya Garcia, John LNU, Christopher M. Piehota, John S. Pistole, Muhammad Tanvir, "John" Tanzin.(Kassem, Ramzi) (Entered: 03/21/2014)
03/24/2014	11	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: 10 Status Report filed by James Comey, John LNU, Rand Beers, John Doe, Sanya Garcia, John S. Pistole, "John" Tanzin, Muhammad Tanvir, Christopher M. Piehota.

		<p>ENDORSEMENT: Plaintiff shall file an amended complaint by April 22, 2014, and Defendants will have sixty days from the filing of any amended complaint to respond. An initial pretrial conference is scheduled for 10:15 a.m. on June 27, 2014. By June 20, 2014, the parties shall file their pre conference submissions, which are described in the Court's October 3, 2013 Order. So ordered. (Amended Pleadings due by 4/22/2014.), (Initial Conference set for 6/27/2014 at 10:15 AM before Judge Ronnie Abrams.) (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 3/24/2014) (rjm) (Entered: 03/25/2014)</p>
04/22/2014	12	<p>NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Robert N. Shwartz on behalf of Muhammad Tanvir, Jameel Algibhah, Naveed Shiwnari, Awais Sajjad. (Shwartz, Robert) (Entered: 04/22/2014)</p>
04/22/2014	13	<p>NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Jennifer R. Cowan on behalf of Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir. (Cowan, Jennifer) (Entered: 04/22/2014)</p>
04/22/2014	14	<p>NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Rushmi Bhaskaran on behalf of Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir. (Bhaskaran, Rushmi) (Entered: 04/22/2014)</p>
04/22/2014	15	<p>FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT amending 1 Complaint against James Comey, Sanya Garcia, John LNU, Christopher M. Piehota, "John" Tanzin, Eric H. Holder, Jeh C. Johnson, Francisco Artousa, Michael Rutkowski, William Gale, John C. Harley III, Steven LNU, Michael LNU, Gregg Grossoehmig, Weysan Dun, James C. Langenberg, John Does 1-9, 11-13, John Doe 10. Document filed by Naveed Shiwnari, Jameel Algibhah, Muhammad Tanvir, Awais Sajjad. Related document: 1</p> <p>Complaint filed by Muhammad Tanvir.(Shwartz, Robert) (Entered: 04/22/2014)</p>
04/23/2014	16	<p>ORDER. Plaintiff filed his Amended Complaint in this action on April 22, 2014, and by stipulation of the parties, Defendants have until June 23, 2014, to answer or otherwise respond. It is hereby: ORDERED that an initial pretrial conference is scheduled for 4:00 p.m. on July 11, 2014, in Courtroom 1506 of the Thurgood Marshall United States Courthouse, 40 Foley Square, New York, New York. The parties' joint preconference submissions, described in the Court's October 3, 2013 Order, shall be due by July 3, 2014. Francisco Artousa answer due 6/23/2014; Rand Beers answer due 6/23/2014; James Comey answer due 6/23/2014; John Doe answer due 6/23/2014; John Doe 10 answer due 6/23/2014; John Does 1-9, 11-13 answer due 6/23/2014; Weysan Dun answer due 6/23/2014; William Gale answer due 6/23/2014; Sanya Garcia answer due 6/23/2014; Gregg Grossoehmig answer due 6/23/2014; John C.</p>

		Harley III answer due 6/23/2014; Eric H. Holder answer due 6/23/2014; Jeh C. Johnson answer due 6/23/2014; John LNU answer due 6/23/2014; Michael LNU answer due 6/23/2014; Steven LNU answer due 6/23/2014; James C. Langenberg answer due 6/23/2014; Christopher M. Piehota answer due 6/23/2014; John S. Pistole answer due 6/23/2014; Michael Rutkowski answer due 6/23/2014; "John" Tanzin answer due 6/23/2014. (Initial Conference set for 7/11/2014 at 04:00 PM in Courtroom 1506, U.S. Courthouse, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Ronnie Abrams.) (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 4/23/2014) (rjm) (Entered: 04/23/2014)
06/02/2014	17	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to The United States of America; Eric H. Holder, Attorney General of the United States; Jeh C. Johnson, Secretary, Department of Homeland Security; Francisco Artousa, Special Agent, FBI; Michael Rutkowski, Special Agent, FBI; William Gale, Supervisory Special Agent, FBI; Gregg Grossoehmig, Special Agent, FBI; Weysan Dun, Special Agent In Charge, FBI; James C. Langenberg, Assistant Special Agent In Charge, FBI, re: 15 Amended Complaint,, Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir. (Shwartz, Robert) (Entered: 06/02/2014)
06/02/2014	18	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to Francisco Artousa, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Gregg Grossoehmig, Eric H. Holder, Jeh C. Johnson, James C. Langenberg, Michael Rutkowski, U.S. Attorney and U.S. Attorney General. (jom) (Entered: 06/03/2014)
06/11/2014	19	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to John C. Harley III, c/o Sarah S. Normand, re: 15 Amended Complaint,, Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir. (Shwartz, Robert) (Entered: 06/11/2014)
06/12/2014	20	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to John C. Harley III. (lcu) (Entered: 06/12/2014)
06/19/2014	21	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from AUSA Sarah S. Normand dated 06/19/14. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, Rand Beers, James Comey, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Eric H. Holder, Jeh C. Johnson, James C. Langenberg, Christopher M. Piehota, John S. Pistole, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin.(Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 06/19/2014)

06/20/2014	22	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Erol Nazim Gulay on behalf of Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir. (Gulay, Erol) (Entered: 06/20/2014)
06/20/2014	23	LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference <i>Regarding Initial Pretrial Conference and in Response to Sarah S. Normand's Letter of June 19, 2014</i> addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Robert N. Shwartz dated June 20, 2014. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir.(Shwartz, Robert) (Entered: 06/20/2014)
06/20/2014	24	ORDER granting 21 Letter Motion for Extension of Time: Application granted. The proposed briefing schedule is approved, and the pretrial conference scheduled for July 11, 2014 is adjourned to August 6, 2014 at 1:00 p.m. The parties' joint preconference submissions described in the Court's October 3, 2013 Order, shall be due by July 30, 2014. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 6/20/2014) (tn) (Entered: 06/23/2014)
06/20/2014		Set/Reset Deadlines: Motions due by 7/28/2014. Responses due by 9/29/2014. Replies due by 10/27/2014. (tn) (Entered: 06/23/2014)
06/20/2014		Set/Reset Hearings: Initial Conference set for 8/6/2014 at 01:00 PM before Judge Ronnie Abrams. (tn) (Entered: 06/23/2014)
07/03/2014	25	FIRST LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference / <i>Initial Pretrial Conference to July 31, 2014 or such other date convenient to the Court</i> / addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Rushmi Bhaskaran, et al. dated July 3, 2014. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir. Return Date set for 8/6/2014 at 01:00 PM.(Bhaskaran, Rushmi) (Entered: 07/03/2014)
07/08/2014	26	ORDER granting 25 Letter Motion to Adjourn Conference. The conference is rescheduled to 5:15 p.m. on July 31, 2014. Submissions are due by 5 p.m. on July 30, 2014. Initial Conference set for 7/31/2014 at 05:15 PM before Judge Ronnie Abrams. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 7/8/2014) (lmb) (Entered: 07/08/2014)
07/23/2014	27	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Baher Azmy on behalf of Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir. (Azmy, Baher) (Entered: 07/23/2014)
07/23/2014	28	LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages <i>and Providing Status Update</i> addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from AUSA Ellen Blain dated July 23, 2014. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, Rand Beers, James Comey, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Eric H. Holder, Jeh C. Johnson, James C. Langenberg, Christopher M. Piehota, John S. Pistole, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/23/2014)

07/24/2014	29	ORDER granting 28 Letter Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages. Application granted. So ordered. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 7/24/2014) (rjm) (Entered: 07/25/2014)
07/24/2014	30	STIPULATION AND ORDER REGARDING JOHN DOE DEFENDANTS. Plaintiffs and Defendants, by their undersigned counsel, stipulate and agree as follows: The U.S. Attorney's Office shall accept service of process and file a Notice of Appearance as counsel for each of the following Defendants: a. "FNU" (first name unknown) Tanzin; b. John "LNU" (last name unknown); c. Steven "LNU" (last name unknown); d. Michael "LNU" (last name unknown); e. John Doe 1; f. John Doe 2 (who shall proceed for the next phase of this litigation as "John Doe 2/3"); g. John Doe 4; h. John Doe 5; i. John Doe 6; j. John Doe 9; k. John Doe 10; l. John Doe 11; m. John Doe 12; and n. John Doe 13, and as further set forth in this Stipulation and Order. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 7/24/2014) (rjm) (Entered: 07/25/2014)
07/25/2014	31	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to "FNU" Tanzin; John "LNU"; Steven "LNU"; Michael "LNU"; John Doe 1; John Doe 2/3; John Doe 4; John Doe 5; John Doe 6; John Doe 9; John Doe 10; John Doe 11; John Doe 12; John Doe 13, re: 15 Amended Complaint,,. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir. (Shwartz, Robert) (Entered: 07/25/2014)
07/28/2014	32	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, "John" Tanzin. (laq) (Entered: 07/28/2014)
07/28/2014	33	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Sarah Sheive Normand on behalf of Francisco Artousa, Rand Beers, James Comey, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Eric H. Holder, Jeh C. Johnson, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Christopher M. Pichota, John S. Pistole, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. (Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 07/28/2014)
07/28/2014	34	MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction . Document filed by Francisco Artousa, Rand Beers, James Comey, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Eric H. Holder, Jeh C. Johnson, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Christopher M. Pichota, John S. Pistole, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. Responses due by 9/29/2014(Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 07/28/2014)

07/28/2014	35	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Jennifer Ellen Blain on behalf of Francisco Artousa, Rand Beers, James Comey, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Eric H. Holder, Jeh C. Johnson, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Christopher M. Piehota, John S. Pistole, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/28/2014)
07/28/2014	36	DECLARATION of Deborah Moore in Support re: 34 MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction .. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, Rand Beers, James Comey, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Eric H. Holder, Jeh C. Johnson, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Christopher M. Piehota, John S. Pistole, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B, # 3 Exhibit C, # 4 Exhibit D)(Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 07/28/2014)
07/28/2014	37	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 34 MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction . . Document filed by Francisco Artousa, Rand Beers, James Comey, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Eric H. Holder, Jeh C. Johnson, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Christopher M. Piehota, John S. Pistole, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. (Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 07/28/2014)
07/28/2014	38	MOTION to Dismiss . Document filed by Francisco Artousa, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/28/2014)
07/28/2014	39	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 38 MOTION to Dismiss . . Document filed by Francisco Artousa, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Jeh C. Johnson, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/28/2014)
07/28/2014	40	DECLARATION of Deborah Moore in Support re: 38 MOTION to Dismiss .. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B, # 3 Exhibit C, # 4 Exhibit D)(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/28/2014)

07/28/2014	41	DECLARATION of Sarah S. Normand in Support re: 38 MOTION to Dismiss .. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/28/2014)
07/28/2014	42	DECLARATION of John Doe 1 in Support re: 38 MOTION to Dismiss .. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/28/2014)
07/28/2014	43	DECLARATION of John Doe 6 in Support re: 38 MOTION to Dismiss .. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/28/2014)
07/28/2014	44	DECLARATION of Weysan Dun in Support re: 38 MOTION to Dismiss .. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/28/2014)
07/28/2014	45	DECLARATION of Gregg Grossoehmig in Support re: 38 MOTION to Dismiss .. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/28/2014)
07/28/2014	46	DECLARATION of John C. Harley, III in Support re: 38 MOTION to Dismiss .. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/28/2014)
07/28/2014	47	DECLARATION of James Langenberg in Support re: 38 MOTION to Dismiss .. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/28/2014)

07/28/2014	48	DECLARATION of Michael LNU in Support re: 38 MOTION to Dismiss .. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/28/2014)
07/28/2014	49	DECLARATION of Steven LNU in Support re: 38 MOTION to Dismiss .. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/28/2014)
07/28/2014	50	DECLARATION of John Doe 12 in Support re: 38 MOTION to Dismiss .. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/28/2014)
07/30/2014	51	LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Robert N. Shwartz and Sarah S. Normand dated July 30, 2014 re: Joint Status Letter. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir.(Shwartz, Robert) (Entered: 07/30/2014)
07/30/2014	52	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Amended Complaint,,. John Doe 10 served on 7/28/2014, answer due 6/23/2014; John Does 1-9, 11-13 served on 7/28/2014, answer due 6/23/2014; John LNU served on 7/28/2014, answer due 6/23/2014; Michael LNU served on 7/28/2014, answer due 6/23/2014; Steven LNU served on 7/28/2014, answer due 6/23/2014; "John" Tanzin served on 7/28/2014, answer due 6/23/2014. Service was accepted by Lisa Ahearn, Civil Clerk at the U.S. Attorney's Office. Document filed by Naveed Shiwnari; Muhammad Tanvir; Awais Sajjad; Jameel Algibhah. (Shwartz, Robert) (Entered: 07/30/2014)
07/31/2014		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Ronnie Abrams: Initial Pretrial Conference held on 7/31/2014. (arc) (Entered: 08/01/2014)
08/11/2014	53	LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Rushmi Bhaskaran dated 08/11/2014 re: Plaintiffs write to inform the Court that they will not, at this time, seek leave to amend the First Amended Complaint. Document filed by Muhammad Tanvir.(Bhaskaran, Rushmi) (Entered: 08/11/2014)
08/19/2014	54	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to Serve Defendants John Doe 7 and John Doe 8</i> addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from

		Robert N. Shwartz dated August 19th, 2014. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir.(Shwartz, Robert) (Entered: 08/19/2014)
08/20/2014	55	ORDER granting 54 Letter Motion for Extension of Time: APPLICATION GRANTED. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 8/20/2014) (tn) (Entered: 08/20/2014)
08/25/2014	56	LETTER MOTION for Local Rule 37.2 Conference <i>and Order permitting Plaintiffs to take limited jurisdictional discovery from eight Defendants</i> addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Robert N. Shwartz dated August 25, 2014. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir.(Shwartz, Robert) (Entered: 08/25/2014)
08/26/2014	57	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply <i>to Plaintiff's August 25, 2014, Letter-Motion</i> addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from AUSA Ellen Blain dated August 26, 2014. Document filed by John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 08/26/2014)
08/26/2014	58	ORDER granting 57 Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply re 57 LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply <i>to Plaintiff's August 25, 2014, Letter-Motion</i> addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from AUSA Ellen Blain dated August 26, 2014. Application Granted. SO ORDERED. Responses due by 9/2/2014. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 8/26/2014) (ama) (Entered: 08/26/2014)
08/29/2014	59	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Christopher Sean Ford on behalf of Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir. (Ford, Christopher) (Entered: 08/29/2014)
08/29/2014	60	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Rebecca Sue Hekman on behalf of Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir. (Hekman, Rebecca) (Entered: 08/29/2014)
08/29/2014	61	NOTICE of Withdrawal of Representation. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir. (Hu, Susan) (Entered: 08/29/2014)
09/02/2014	62	LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from AUSA Ellen Blain dated September 2, 2014 re: Plaintiffs' August 25, 2014, Letter-motion. Document filed by John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 09/02/2014)
09/04/2014	63	LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Robert N. Shwartz of Debevoise & Plimpton LLP dated 9/4/14 re: jurisdictional discovery. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais

		Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir.(Shwartz, Robert) (Entered: 09/04/2014)
09/05/2014	64	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: 61 Notice (Other) filed by Awais Sajjad, Muhammad Tanvir, Naveed Shiwnari, Jameel Algibhah. ENDORSEMENT: The Clerk of Court is respectfully requested to remove Ms. Hu as counsel of record in this case. SO ORDERED. Attorney Susan Shanke Hu terminated. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 9/5/2014) (ajs) (Entered: 09/05/2014)
09/05/2014	65	LETTER RESPONSE in Opposition to Motion addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from AUSAs Sarah S. Normand and Ellen Blain dated 09/05/14 re: 56 LETTER MOTION for Local Rule 37.2 Conference and Order permitting Plaintiffs to take limited jurisdictional discovery from eight Defendants addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Robert N. Shwartz dated August 25, 2014. . Document filed by John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg. (Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 09/05/2014)
09/09/2014	66	ORDER granting 56 Letter Motion for Local Rule 37.2 Conference. As set forth within, it is hereby ORDERED that a conference is scheduled for 11 a.m. on September 16, 2014 in Courtroom 1506 of the Thurgood Marshall United States Courthouse, 40 Foley Square, New York, NY 10007. SO ORDERED. Status Conference set for 9/16/2014 at 11:00 AM in Courtroom 1506, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Ronnie Abrams. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 9/9/2014) (ajs) (Entered: 09/10/2014)
09/16/2014		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Ronnie Abrams: Status Conference held on 9/16/2014. (Court Reporter Sam Mauro) (arc) (Entered: 09/16/2014)
09/22/2014	67	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>re Defendants' Motion to Dismiss</i> addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Robert N. Shwartz dated September 22, 2014. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir.(Shwartz, Robert) (Entered: 09/22/2014)
09/23/2014	68	MEMO ENDORSED ORDER granting 67 Letter Motion for Extension of Time. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 9/23/2014) (ajs) (Entered: 09/23/2014)
09/23/2014		Set/Reset Deadlines: Responses due by 11/13/2014. Replies due by 12/18/2014. (ajs) (Entered: 09/23/2014)
09/24/2014	69	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: ARGUMENT held on 9/16/2014 before Judge Ronnie Abrams. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Samuel Mauro, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber

		before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 10/20/2014. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 10/30/2014. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 12/29/2014.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 09/24/2014)
09/24/2014	70	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a ARGUMENT proceeding held on 9/16/2014 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 09/24/2014)
11/12/2014	71	LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages <i>re Plaintiffs' opposition to Defendants' two motions to dismiss</i> addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Rushmi Bhaskaran dated November 12, 2014. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir.(Bhaskaran, Rushmi) (Entered: 11/12/2014)
11/13/2014	72	ORDER granting 71 Letter Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages. APPLICATION GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 11/13/2014) (ajs) (Entered: 11/13/2014)
11/13/2014	73	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 34 MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction ., 38 MOTION to Dismiss . <i>Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Law In Opposition to Defendants' Motions to Dismiss</i> . Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir. (Shwartz, Robert) (Entered: 11/13/2014)
11/13/2014	74	DECLARATION of Rushmi Bhaskaran in Opposition re: 34 MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction ., 38 MOTION to Dismiss .. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A, # 2 Exhibit B (Part 1 of 5), # 3 Exhibit B (Part 2 of 5), # 4 Exhibit B (Part 3 of 5), # 5 Exhibit B (Part 4 of 5), # 6 Exhibit B (Part 5 of 5), # 7 Exhibit C, # 8 Exhibit D (Part 1 of 6), # 9 Exhibit D (Part 2 of 6), # 10 Exhibit D (Part 3 of 6), # 11 Exhibit D (Part 4 of 6), # 12 Exhibit D (Part 5 of 6), # 13 Exhibit D (Part 6 of 6), # 14 Exhibit E, # 15 Exhibit F, # 16 Exhibit G, # 17 Exhibit H, # 18 Exhibit I (Part 1 of 4), # 19 Exhibit I (Part 2 of 4), # 20 Exhibit I (Part 3 of 4), # 21 Exhibit I (Part 4 of 4), # 22 Exhibit J, # 23 Exhibit K, # 24 Exhibit L, # 25 Exhibit M)(Bhaskaran, Rushmi) (Entered: 11/13/2014)

12/03/2014	75	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from AUSA Sarah S. Normand dated 12/03/2014. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, Rand Beers, James Comey, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Eric H. Holder, Jeh C. Johnson, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Christopher M. Piehota, John S. Pistole, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin.(Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 12/03/2014)
12/03/2014	76	ORDER granting 75 Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply. APPLICATION GRANTED. SO ORDERED. Replies due by 1/22/2015. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 12/3/2014) (ajs) (Entered: 12/03/2014)
12/17/2014	77	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to serve Defendants John Doe 7 and John Doe 8</i> addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Erol N. Gulay dated December 17, 2014. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir.(Gulay, Erol) (Entered: 12/17/2014)
12/18/2014	78	ORDER granting 77 Letter Motion for Extension of Time. The deadline to serve John Does 7 and 8 is extended through 30 days after the pending motions to dismiss. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 12/18/2014) (ajs) (Entered: 12/19/2014)
01/21/2015	79	LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages <i>in Support of Motions to Dismiss</i> addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from AUSA Ellen Blain dated January 21, 2015. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, Rand Beers, James Comey, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Eric H. Holder, Jeh C. Johnson, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Christopher M. Piehota, John S. Pistole, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 01/21/2015)
01/21/2015	80	ORDER granting 79 Letter Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages for Defendants' respective reply memoranda of law in further support of their coordinated motions to dismiss the amended complaint. APPLICATION GRANTED. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 1/21/2015) (spo) (Entered: 01/21/2015)
01/22/2015	81	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 34 MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction . . Document filed by Francisco Artousa, Rand Beers, James Comey, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Eric H. Holder, Jeh C. Johnson, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg,

		Christopher M. Piehota, John S. Pistole, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. (Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 01/22/2015)
01/22/2015	82	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 38 MOTION to Dismiss . . Document filed by Francisco Artousa, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 01/22/2015)
01/29/2015	83	LETTER MOTION for Conference re: 34 MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction ., 38 MOTION to Dismiss . //Letter from Robert N. Shwartz of Debevoise & Plimpton LLP to the Honorable Judge Abrams requesting that the Court schedule oral argument on the Defendants' motions to dismiss addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Robert N. Shwartz dated 1/29/15. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir.(Shwartz, Robert) (Entered: 01/29/2015)
04/08/2015	84	ORDER granting 83 Letter Motion for Conference. Application granted. Oral argument is scheduled for May 14, 2015 at 10:30 a.m. SO ORDERED. Oral Argument set for 5/14/2015 at 10:30 AM before Judge Ronnie Abrams. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 4/8/2015) (ajs) (Entered: 04/09/2015)
04/13/2015	85	NOTICE of Revised Redress Procedures. Document filed by James Comey, Eric H. Holder, Jeh C. Johnson, Christopher M. Piehota. (Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 04/13/2015)
04/16/2015	86	LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference /Oral Argument addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from AUSA Sarah S. Normand dated 04/16/15. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, Rand Beers, James Comey, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Eric H. Holder, Jeh C. Johnson, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Christopher M. Piehota, John S. Pistole, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin.(Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 04/16/2015)
04/16/2015	87	ORDER granting 86 LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference/Oral Argument addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from AUSA Sarah S. Normand dated 04/16/15. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, Rand Beers, James Comey, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Eric H. Holder, Jeh C. Johnson, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Christopher M. Piehota, John S. Pistole, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. Application granted. Oral argument is adjourned until June 12, 2015 at 2:00 p.m. So ordered. (Oral

		Argument set for 6/12/2015 at 02:00 PM before Judge Ronnie Abrams). (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 4/16/2015) (rjm) (Entered: 04/17/2015)
05/04/2015	88	LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from AUSA Ellen Blain dated May 4, 2015 re: Status Update. Document filed by James Comey, Eric H. Holder, Jeh C. Johnson, Christopher M. Piehota, John S. Pistole. (Attachments: # 1 Supplement Courtesy Copy)(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/04/2015)
06/01/2015	89	MOTION to Stay <i>Official Capacity Claims</i> . Document filed by Francisco Artousa, Rand Beers, James Comey, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Eric H. Holder, Jeh C. Johnson, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Christopher M. Piehota, John S. Pistole, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin.(Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 06/01/2015)
06/01/2015	90	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 89 MOTION to Stay <i>Official Capacity Claims</i> . . Document filed by Francisco Artousa, Rand Beers, James Comey, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Eric H. Holder, Jeh C. Johnson, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Christopher M. Piehota, John S. Pistole, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin. (Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 06/01/2015)
06/03/2015	91	LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Rushmi Bhaskaran dated June 3, 2015 re: Response to the Government's June 1, 2015 Motion for a Limited Stay of Proceedings with Regard to Plaintiffs' Official Capacity Claims. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir.(Bhaskaran, Rushmi) (Entered: 06/03/2015)
06/10/2015	92	LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Robert N. Shwartz dated June 10, 2015 re: withdrawing Plaintiffs' opposition to the Government's Motion for a Limited Stay of Proceedings, and consenting to a stay. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir.(Shwartz, Robert) (Entered: 06/10/2015)
06/10/2015	93	ORDER deferring ruling on 34 Motion to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction; granting 89 Motion to Stay. In view of the foregoing, Defendant's motion for a stay of the Official Capacity Claims is GRANTED. The Clerk of Court is respectfully directed to terminate the motion pending at Dkt. 89 and stay the motion pending at Dkt. 34. Oral argument on Defendants' motion to dismiss the claims made against them in their personal capacities, see Dkt. 39, will proceed as scheduled on June 12, 2015 at 2 p.m. in Courtroom 1506, 40 Foley

		Square. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 6/10/2015) (ajs) (Entered: 06/10/2015)
06/12/2015		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Ronnie Abrams: Oral Argument held on 6/12/2015 re: 38 MOTION to Dismiss . filed by John LNU, John Doe, John Does 1-9, 11-13, James C. Langenberg, Weysan Dun, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, John Doe 10, Sanya Garcia, "John" Tanzin, William Gale, Francisco Artousa, Steven LNU, Michael LNU, Michael Rutkowski. (Court Reporter Sabrina Demidio) (arc) (Entered: 06/12/2015)
06/29/2015	94	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: hearing held on 6/12/2015 before Judge Ronnie Abrams. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Sabrina D'Emidio, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 7/23/2015. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 8/3/2015. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 10/1/2015.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 06/29/2015)
06/29/2015	95	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a HEARING proceeding held on 6/12/2015 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 06/29/2015)
07/06/2015	96	LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from AUSA Sarah S. Normand dated 07/06/15 re: Second Circuit's Decision in Turkmen v. Hasty. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Eric H. Holder, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin.(Normand, Sarah) (Entered: 07/06/2015)
07/14/2015	97	LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Diala Shamas dated July 14, 2015 re: Second Circuit's Decision in Turkmen v. Hasty. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir.(Shamas, Diala) (Entered: 07/14/2015)
07/14/2015	98	LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Robert N. Shwartz dated 7/14/15 re: Post Argument Letter. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir.(Shwartz, Robert) (Entered: 07/14/2015)

07/31/2015	99	LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Rebecca S. Hekman dated July 31, 2015 re: Withdrawal of RS Hekman from case. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir.(Hekman, Rebecca) (Entered: 07/31/2015)
07/31/2015	100	LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from AUSA Ellen Blain dated July 31, 2015 re: Plaintiffs' July 14, 2015, Letters. Document filed by Francisco Artousa, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Michael Rutkowski, "John" Tanzin.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/31/2015)
07/31/2015	101	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: 99 Letter filed by Awais Sajjad, Muhammad Tanvir, Naveed Shiwnari, Jameel Algibhah, re: Withdrawal of RS Hekman from case. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. Attorney Rebecca Sue Hekman terminated. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 7/31/2015) (ajs) (Entered: 07/31/2015)
08/14/2015	102	LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Christopher S. Ford dated August 14, 2015 re: Withdrawal of Christopher S. Ford. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shiwnari, Muhammad Tanvir.(Ford, Christopher) (Entered: 08/14/2015)
08/18/2015	103	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: 102 Letter filed by Awais Sajjad, Muhammad Tanvir, Naveed Shiwnari, Jameel Algibhah, re: Withdrawal of Christopher S. Ford. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. Attorney Christopher Sean Ford terminated. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 8/18/2015) (ajs) (Entered: 08/18/2015)
09/03/2015	104	OPINION & ORDER #105808 re: 38 MOTION to Dismiss filed by John LNU, John Doe, John Does 1-9, 11-13, James C. Langenberg, Weysan Dun, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, John Doe 10, Sanya Garcia, "John" Tanzin, William Gale, Francisco Artousa, Steven LNU, Michael LNU, Michael Rutkowski. Although federal law imposes limits on the investigative tactics federal officials may employ in seeking to keep this nation safe, it also establishes limits on the manner in which an individual may vindicate his rights should those tactics cross the line. For the reasons stated, the law does not permit Plaintiffs to seek damages against the Agents in their personal capacities either under Bivens or RFRA. Accordingly, the Agents' motion to dismiss is GRANTED and the claims against FNU Tanzin, Sanya Garcia, Francisco Artusa, John LNU, Michael Rutowski, William Gale, John C. Harley III, Steven LNU, Michael LNU, Gregg Grossoehmig, Weysan Dun, James C. Langenberg, John Does 1-6 and 9-13 in their personal capacities are dismissed. The Court on its own motion also dismisses all personal capacity

		claims against John Does 7 and 8. See Hecht v. Commerce Clearing House, Inc., 897 F.2d 21, 26 n.6 (2d Cir. 1990). As previously noted, this opinion does not address the viability of Plaintiffs' official capacity claims and thus expresses no opinion on the merits of their arguments concerning the manner in which individuals are added to the No Fly List or the mechanisms for challenging such inclusion. The parties are directed to submit a joint letter to the Court within 30 days advising how they wish to proceed with respect to those claims. (As further set forth in this Order.) (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 9/3/2015) (kko) Modified on 9/3/2015 (soh). (Entered: 09/03/2015)
10/05/2015	105	LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Robert N. Shwartz dated October 5, 2015 re: official capacity claims. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shinwari, Muhammad Tanvir.(Shwartz, Robert) (Entered: 10/05/2015)
12/14/2015	106	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: 105 Letter re: Official capacity claims, filed by Awais Sajjad, Muhammad Tanvir, Naveed Shinwari, Jameel Algibhah. ENDORSEMENT: On December 11, 2015, the Second Circuit Court of Appeals denied a petition to rehear en bane the panel decision in Turkmen v. Hasty, on which this Court relied in its September 3, 2015 Opinion & Order. In light of this development, the parties shall submit a joint letter no later than December 18, 2015 indicating whether they still plan to submit a proposed order and judgment to the Court and, if so, when they expect to make such a submission. So ordered. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 12/14/2015) (spo) (Entered: 12/15/2015)
12/18/2015	107	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Naz Ahmad on behalf of Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shinwari, Muhammad Tanvir. (Ahmad, Naz) (Entered: 12/18/2015)
12/18/2015	108	LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Shayana Kadidal dated 12/18/2015 re: Joint letter submitting competing proposed orders and judgments from Plaintiffs and Defendants. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Francisco Artousa, Rand Beers, James Comey, John Doe, John Doe 10, John Does 1-9, 11-13, Weysan Dun, William Gale, Sanya Garcia, Gregg Grossoehmig, John C. Harley III, Eric H. Holder, Jeh C. Johnson, John LNU, Michael LNU, Steven LNU, James C. Langenberg, Loretta E. Lynch, Christopher M. Piehota, John S. Pistole, Michael Rutkowski, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shinwari, Muhammad Tanvir, "John" Tanzin. (Attachments: # 1 Plaintiffs' proposed order, # 2 Government's proposed order)(Kadidal, Shayana) (Entered: 12/18/2015)

12/28/2015	109	ORDER: The Court agrees with Defendants that Plaintiffs' proposed order is unnecessarily overinclusive. To the extent members of the public seek information regarding why Plaintiffs agreed to voluntarily dismiss their official capacity claims without prejudice, they may review the December 18 letter and other filings made in this lawsuit. The Court currently takes no position regarding the viability of Plaintiffs' possible motion for attorneys' fees and costs. Because the parties agree that Plaintiffs' official capacity claims against Defendants may be dismissed without prejudice, the Court so dismisses them. The Clerk of Court is respectfully directed to enter final judgment in favor of Defendants. Plaintiffs may have until January 29, 2016 to move for attorneys' fees and costs. If no motion is filed by that date, this action will be terminated on the docket. (As further set forth in this Order.) (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 12/28/2015) (spo) (Entered: 12/28/2015)
01/29/2016	110	NOTICE of (letter responding to Dec. 28, 2015 order of Court setting deadline for Plaintiffs to move for attorneys' fees and costs). Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shinwari, Muhammad Tanvir. (Kadidal, Shayana) (Entered: 01/29/2016)
02/01/2016	111	ORDER: On September 3, 2015, the Court dismissed Plaintiffs' individual capacity claims against Defendants FNU Tanzin, Sanya Garcia, Francisco Artusa, John LNU, Michael Rutkowski, William Gale, John C. Harley III, Steven LNU, Michael LNU, Gregg Grossoehmig, Weysan Dun, James C. Langenberg, and John Does 1-13. See Dkt. 104. On December 28, 2015, the Court-on consent of the parties-dismissed without prejudice Plaintiffs' remaining official capacity claims. See Dkt. 109. The December 28 Order noted that unless Plaintiffs moved for attorneys' fees and costs by January 29, 2016, "this action will be terminated on the docket." Id. at 3. On January 29, 2016, Plaintiffs informed the Court that they "will not seek an award of fees and costs at this stage of the litigation." Dkt. 110. The Clerk of Court is accordingly respectfully directed to enter final judgment in favor of Defendants and to terminate this action. (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 2/1/2016) (cf) (Entered: 02/01/2016)
02/01/2016		Terminate Transcript Deadlines (cf) (Entered: 02/01/2016)
02/01/2016		Transmission to Judgments and Orders Clerk. Transmitted re: 111 Order to the Judgments and Orders Clerk. (cf) (Entered: 02/16/2016)
02/17/2016	112	CLERK'S JUDGMENT: That for the reasons stated in the Court's Order dated February 1, 2016, final judgment is hereby entered in favor of Defendants and the action is terminated. (Signed by Clerk of Court Ruby Krajick on 2/17/2016) (Attachments: # 1 Notice ofr

		Right to Appeal, # 2 Notice of Right to Appeal)(dt) (Entered: 02/17/2016)
04/18/2016	113	NOTICE OF APPEAL from 112 Clerk's Judgment,. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shinwari, Muhammad Tanvir. Filing fee \$ 505.00, receipt number 0208-12196892. Form C and Form D are due within 14 days to the Court of Appeals, Second Circuit. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit A - 2-17-16 Judgment)(Cowan, Jennifer) (Entered: 04/18/2016)
04/18/2016		Transmission of Notice of Appeal and Certified Copy of Docket Sheet to US Court of Appeals re: 113 Notice of Appeal,. (nd) (Entered: 04/18/2016)
04/18/2016		Appeal Record Sent to USCA (Electronic File). Certified Indexed record on Appeal Electronic Files for 113 Notice of Appeal, filed by Awais Sajjad, Muhammad Tanvir, Naveed Shinwari, Jameel Algibhah were transmitted to the U.S. Court of Appeals. (nd) (Entered: 04/18/2016)
05/02/2018	114	OPINION of USCA (Certified) as to 113 Notice of Appeal, filed by Awais Sajjad, Muhammad Tanvir, Naveed Shinwari, Jameel Algibhah. USCA Case Number 16-1176. For the reasons stated in the attached opinion, we reverse the judgment of the District Court and remand for further proceedings. Catherine O'Hagan Wolfe, Clerk USCA for the Second Circuit. Certified: 05/02/2018. (nd) (Entered: 05/02/2018)
05/02/2018		Transmission of USCA Opinion to the District Judge re: 114 USCA Opinion. (nd) (Entered: 05/02/2018)
06/25/2018	115	AMENDED OPINION of USCA (Certified) as to 113 Notice of Appeal, filed by Awais Sajjad, Muhammad Tanvir, Naveed Shinwari, Jameel Algibhah. USCA Case Number 16-1176. PlaintiffsAppellants Muhammad Tanvir, Jameel Algibah, and Naveed Shinwari ("Plaintiffs") appeal from a February 17, 2016 final judgment of the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York (Abrams, J.), dismissing their complaint against senior federal law enforcement officials and 25 named and unnamed federal law enforcement officers. The complaint alleged, inter alia, that in retaliation for Plaintiffs' refusal to serve as informants, federal officers improperly placed or retained Plaintiffs' names on the "No Fly List," in violation of Plaintiffs' rights under the First Amendment and the Religious Freedom Restoration Act, 42 U.S.C. § 2000bb et seq. ("RFRA"). The complaint sought (1) injunctive and declaratory relief against all defendants in their official capacities for various constitutional and statutory violations, and (2) compensatory and punitive damages from federal law enforcement officers in their individual capacities for violations of

		their rights under the First Amendment and RFRA. After the parties agreed to stay the official capacity claims, the district court dismissed Plaintiffs' individual capacity claims. As relevant here, the district court held that RFRA does not permit the recovery of money damages against federal officers sued in their individual capacities. Plaintiffs appeal that RFRA determination only. Because we disagree with the district court, and hold that RFRA permits a plaintiff to recover money damages against federal officers sued in their individual capacities for violations of RFRA's substantive protections, we reverse the district court's judgment and remand for further proceedings. REVERSED and REMANDED.. Catherine O'Hagan Wolfe, Clerk USCA for the Second Circuit. Certified: 06/25/2018. (nd) (Entered: 06/25/2018)
01/16/2019	116	LETTER addressed to Judge Ronnie Abrams from Rushmi Bhaskaran dated January 16, 2019 re: withdrawal as counsel for Plaintiffs. Document filed by Jameel Algibhah, Awais Sajjad, Naveed Shinwari, Muhammad Tanvir.(Bhaskaran, Rushmi) (Entered: 01/16/2019)
01/17/2019	117	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: 116 Letter filed by Awais Sajjad, Muhammad Tanvir, Naveed Shinwari, Jameel Algibhah. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Attorney Rushmi Bhaskaran terminated.) (Signed by Judge Ronnie Abrams on 1/17/2019) (rro) (Entered: 01/17/2019)
02/19/2020	118	Supreme Court Record Request as to 113 Notice of Appeal, filed by Awais Sajjad, Muhammad Tanvir, Naveed Shinwari, Jameel Algibhah. USCA Case Number 16-1176; SCUS Case Number 19-0071. (tp) (Entered: 02/20/2020)
02/20/2020		Appeal Record Sent to SCUS (Electronic File). Certified Indexed record on Appeal Electronic Files for 118 Appeal Remark USCA Case Number 16-1176; SCUS Case Number 19-0071, were transmitted to the Supreme Court of the United States. (tp) Modified on 2/20/2020 (tp). (Entered: 02/20/2020)

PACER Service Center

Transaction Receipt

01/14/2021 11:15:59

PACER Login:	CRClearinghouse	Client Code:	Hill
Description:	Docket Report	Search Criteria:	1:13-cv-06951-RA
Billable Pages:	22	Cost:	2.20

