

**U.S. District Court
California Northern District (Oakland)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 4:07-cv-00693-JSW**

Shubert et al v. Bush et al
Assigned to: Hon. Jeffrey S. White
Lead case: [3:06-md-01791-VRW](#)
Member case: [\(View Member Case\)](#)

Case in other court: 9th Circuit, 10-15638

Eastern District of New York, 1:06-02282

Cause: 42:1981 Civil Rights

Plaintiff

Virginia Shubert

Date Filed: 02/02/2007
Jury Demand: Plaintiff
Nature of Suit: 440 Civil Rights: Other
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

represented by **Matthew Delmont Brinckerhoff**
Emery Celli Brinckerhoff & Abady LLP
75 Rockefeller Plaza, 20th Floor
New York, NY 10019
212-763-5000
Fax: 212-763-5001
Email: mbrinckerhoff@ecbalaw.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Adam R Pulver
U.S. Department of Labor
Office of the Solicitor
200 Constitution Ave NW
N-2474
Washington, DC 20210
(202) 693-5740
Email: pulver.adam.r@dol.gov (*Inactive*)
TERMINATED: 06/28/2013
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ilann Margalit Maazel
Emery Celli Brinckerhoff & Abady LLP
600 Fifth Avenue
10th Floor
New York, NY 10020
212-763-5000
Fax: 212-763-5001
Email: imaazel@ecbalaw.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Noha Arafa

represented by **Matthew Delmont Brinckerhoff**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Adam R Pulver
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/28/2013
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ilann Margalit Maazel
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Sarah Dranoff

represented by **Matthew Delmont Brinckerhoff**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Adam R Pulver
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/28/2013
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ilann Margalit Maazel
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Hilary Botein
individually and on behalf of all others
similarly situated

represented by **Matthew Delmont Brinckerhoff**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Adam R Pulver
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/28/2013
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ilann Margalit Maazel
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

All Plaintiffs

represented by **Adam R Pulver**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 06/28/2013
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Cindy Ann Cohn
Electronic Frontier Foundation
815 Eddy Street
San Francisco, CA 94109
415-436-9333
Fax: 415-436-9993
Email: cindy@eff.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ilann Margalit Maazel
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

George W. Bush

represented by **Alexander Kenneth Haas**
King Spalding LLP
1700 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Suite 200
Washington, DC 20006

202-626-5502
Fax:
Email: ahaas@kslaw.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Anthony Joseph Coppolino
U.S. Department of Justice, Civil Division
20 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W. Room
6102
Washington, DC 20530
(202) 514-4782dc
Email: tony.coppolino@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Michael V. Hayden

represented by **Alexander Kenneth Haas**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Anthony Joseph Coppolino
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

James R. Whitman
U.S. Department of Justice
Civil Division, Torts Branch
1425 New York Ave., N.W.
Washington, DC 20005
202-616-4169
Fax: 202-416-4314
Email: james.whitman@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Keith B. Alexander

represented by **Alexander Kenneth Haas**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Anthony Joseph Coppolino
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

James J. Gilligan
USDOJ, Civil Division, Federal Programs
Branch
20 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W.
Room 6102
Washington, DC 20530
202-514-4782
Fax: 202-616-8470
Email: james.gilligan@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

James R. Whitman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marcia Berman
U.S. Dept. of Justice, Civil Division
Federal Programs Branch

20 Massachusetts Ave., N.W.
Room 7204
Washington, DC 20530
202-514-3330
Fax: 202-616-8470
Email: marcia.berman@usdoj.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rodney Patton
U.S. Department of Justice
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch
20 Massachusetts Avenue, N.W.
Room 7320
Washington, DC 20530
United Sta
202-305-7919
Fax: 202-305-2685
Email: Rodney.Patton@usdoj.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Alberto Gonzales

represented by **Alexander Kenneth Haas**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Anthony Joseph Coppelino
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

James R. Whitman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

John Ashcroft

represented by **Alexander Kenneth Haas**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

James R. Whitman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

United States of America

represented by **Anthony Joseph Coppelino**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

James J. Gilligan
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Paul Edward Ahern
U.S. Department of Justice
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch
20 Massachusetts Avenue NW
Washington, DC 20530

(202) 305-0633
Email: Paul.Ahern@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marcia Berman
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rodney Patton
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

President Barack Obama

represented by **Anthony Joseph Coppolino**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

James J. Gilligan
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marcia Berman
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rodney Patton
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Attorney General Eric H. Holder

represented by **Anthony Joseph Coppolino**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

James J. Gilligan
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marcia Berman
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rodney Patton
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
02/02/2007	<u>1</u>	Case transferred in from the Eastern District of New York; Case Number 1:06-cv2282 FB-MDG. Original file certified copy of transfer order and docket sheet received.. Filed by Sarah Dranoff, Hilary Botein, Virginia Shubert, Noha Arafa. (gsa, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 2/2/2007) Additional attachment(s) added on 2/5/2007 (gsa, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 02/05/2007)
02/02/2007		CASE DESIGNATED for Electronic Filing. (gsa, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 2/2/2007) (Entered: 02/05/2007)

03/20/2007	<u>2</u>	IT IS SO ORDERED AS MODIFIED: Pursuant to the stipulation: On or before 5/18/2007, the Government may file a dispositive motion and any assertion of the military and state secrets privilege in Shubert v. Bush, on or before 6/29/2007, Plaintiffs may file opposition to the dispositive motion; on or before 7/20/2007, the Government may file a reply brief in support of its dispositive motion. Oral argument on the dispositive motion has been set for 8/16/2007 at 2:00 PM. Signed by Chief Judge Vaughn R Walker on 3/20/2007. (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 3/20/2007) (Entered: 03/20/2007)
05/09/2007	<u>3</u>	STIPULATION <i>and Proposed Order to Extend Briefing and Hearing Schedule in Shubert v. Bush, Case No. 07-00693</i> filed by Government Defendants in their official capacity by George W. Bush, Michael V. Hayden, Keith B. Alexander, Alberto Gonzales. (Coppolino, Anthony) (Filed on 5/9/2007) (Entered: 05/09/2007)
05/14/2007	<u>4</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER GRANTING to extend briefing and hearing schedule in Shubert v. Bush re <u>3</u> Stipulation, filed by Alberto Gonzales,, George W. Bush,, Keith B. Alexander,, Michael V. Hayden. On or 5/25/2007, the Government will file a dispositive motion, opposition to be filed on or before 7/13/2007, any reply in support of the dispositive motion shall be filed on or before 8/3/2007. The hearing is set for 8/30/2007 at 2:00 PM. Signed by Chief Judge Vaughn R Walker on 5/11/2007. (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 5/14/2007) (Entered: 05/14/2007)
06/22/2007	<u>5</u>	Memorandum in Opposition re (253 in M:06-cv-01791-VRW) MOTION to Dismiss <i>or, in the Alternative, for Summary Judgment on State Secrets Grounds</i> filed byDennis P. Riordan. (Pulgram, Laurence) (Filed on 6/22/2007) (Entered: 06/22/2007)
06/22/2007	<u>6</u>	Declaration of Candace J. Morey in Support of (315 in M:06-cv-01791-VRW) Memorandum in Opposition <i>to Motion to Dismiss or In the Alternative for Summary Judgment by the United States</i> filed byDennis P. Riordan. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A-Z# <u>2</u> Exhibit AA-II# <u>3</u> Exhibit JJ-KK)(Morey, Candace) (Filed on 6/22/2007) (Entered: 06/22/2007)
06/23/2007	<u>7</u>	Memorandum in Opposition re (273 in M:06-cv-01791-VRW) MOTION to Dismiss <i>Plaintiffs' Master Consolidated Complaint</i> filed byElaine Spielfogel-Landis(on behalf of herself and all others similarly situated). (Himmelstein, Barry) (Filed on 6/23/2007) (Entered: 06/23/2007)
06/23/2007	<u>8</u>	Appendix re (6 in 3:07-cv-00464-VRW, 5 in 3:07-cv-01187-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-06254-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-05576-VRW, 5 in 3:06-cv-07934-VRW, 4 in 3:07-cv-02029-VRW, 5 in 3:06-cv-06434-VRW, 6 in 3:06-cv-05269-VRW, 67 in 3:06-cv-03596-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-06570-VRW, 13 in 3:06-cv-06224-VRW, 5 in 3:06-cv-06294-VRW, 70 in 3:06-cv-03574-VRW, 6 in 3:06-cv-05268-VRW, 12 in 3:06-cv-06387-VRW, 5 in 3:07-cv-01323-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-05066-VRW, 13 in 3:06-cv-06222-VRW, 5 in 3:06-cv-06435-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-05063-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-06253-VRW, 7 in 3:07-cv-01396-VRW, 7 in 3:07-cv-00693-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-06295-VRW, 8 in 3:06-cv-06313-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-05065-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-05067-VRW, 5 in 3:06-cv-05452-VRW, 6 in 3:06-cv-05340-VRW, 319 in M:06-cv-01791-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-05064-VRW, 32 in 3:06-cv-03467-VRW, 5 in 3:07-cv-01326-VRW, 9 in 3:07-cv-00109-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-06225-VRW, 5 in 3:07-cv-01242-VRW, 5 in 3:06-cv-06388-VRW, 13 in 3:07-cv-01324-VRW, 351 in 3:06-cv-00672-VRW, 6 in 3:06-cv-05267-VRW, 5 in 3:06-cv-06385-VRW, 6 in 3:06-cv-05341-VRW, 5 in 3:07-cv-01243-VRW, 8 in 3:06-cv-05485-VRW, 7 in 3:06-cv-05343-VRW, 4 in 3:06-cv-06924-VRW, 4 in 3:07-cv-02538-VRW, 14 in 3:06-cv-04221-VRW) Memorandum in Opposition, <i>to Verizon's Motion to Dismiss Master Complaint</i> filed byElaine Spielfogel-Landis(on behalf of herself and all others similarly situated). (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Tabs 4-12# <u>2</u> Exhibit Tabs 13-20)(Himmelstein, Barry) (Filed on 6/23/2007) (Entered: 06/23/2007)
07/12/2007	<u>9</u>	STIPULATION <i>and Order to Extend Deadlines for Motion to Dismiss and Related Briefing in Shubert v. Bush, Case No. 07-693</i> by Sarah Dranoff, Hilary Botein, Virginia Shubert, Noha Arafa. (Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 7/12/2007) (Entered: 07/12/2007)
07/13/2007	<u>10</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER re <u>9</u> filed by Hilary Botein, Virginia Shubert, Sarah Dranoff, Noha Arafa. On or before 7/20/2007, Plaintiffs will file an opposition to the Government's dispositive motion in Shubert v Bush, C07-0693. On or before

		8/16/2007, the Government will file a reply brief in support of its dispositive motion. Signed by Chief Judge Vaughn R Walker on 7/13/2007. (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 7/13/2007) (Entered: 07/13/2007)
07/19/2007	<u>11</u>	Memorandum in Opposition to <i>Defendants' Motion to Dismiss</i> filed by Sarah Dranoff, Hilary Botein, Virginia Shubert, Noha Arafa. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Part 2 of Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion to Dismiss)(Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 7/19/2007) (Entered: 07/19/2007)
07/19/2007	<u>12</u>	AFFIDAVIT in Opposition <i>Declaration of Ilann M. Maazel Pursuant to Rule 56(f) in Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Dismiss or for Summary Judgment</i> filed by Sarah Dranoff, Hilary Botein, Virginia Shubert, Noha Arafa. (Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 7/19/2007) (Entered: 07/19/2007)
08/30/2007	<u>13</u>	Minute Entry: Motions Hearing held on 8/30/2007 before Chief Judge Vaughn R Walker. PROCEEDINGS:1. Verizon's Motion to Dismiss for Lack of Personal Jurisdiction. 2. Verizon's Motion to Dismiss Complaint in Chulsky, Riordan and Bready. 3. Verizon's Motion to Dismiss Plaintiffs Master Complaint.4. United States' Motion to Dismiss Complaints on State Secrets Grounds (Chulsky, Riordan, Bready). 4. United States' Motion to Dismiss in Shubert. 5. United States' Motion to Intervene – granted. RESULTS:The Court heard argument from counsel. The Court took the matter(s) under–submission.Court to issue written ruling. (Court Reporter Kathy Powell.) (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Date Filed: 8/30/2007). (Entered: 09/04/2007) (Entered: 09/04/2007)
09/21/2007	<u>14</u>	MOTION Plaintiffs' Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence; Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence filed by All Plaintiffs'. Motion Hearing set for 10/25/2007 02:00 PM in Courtroom 6, 17th Floor, San Francisco. (Cohn, Cindy) (Filed on 9/21/2007) (Entered: 09/21/2007)
09/21/2007	<u>15</u>	Declaration of Cindy A. Cohn in Support of <u>14</u> Plaintiffs' Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence filed by All Plaintiffs'. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A# <u>2</u> Exhibit B# <u>3</u> Exhibit C)(Cohn, Cindy) (Filed on 9/21/2007) Modified on 10/1/2007 (gsa, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 09/21/2007)
09/21/2007	<u>16</u>	Proposed Order [<i>Proposed</i>] <i>Interim Order to Preserve Evidence</i> by All Plaintiffs'. (Cohn, Cindy) (Filed on 9/21/2007) (Entered: 09/21/2007)
10/01/2007	<u>17</u>	Cover sheet of TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings held on 8/30/2007 before Judge Vaughn R. Walker. Court Reporter: Katherine A. Powell. Complete transcript is in MDL 06–1791 VRW. (gsa, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 10/1/2007) (jlm, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 10/02/2007)
10/03/2007	<u>18</u>	MOTION to Amend/Correct <u>14</u> MOTION Plaintiffs' Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence; Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence filed by All Plaintiffs'. Motion Hearing set for 11/15/2007 02:00 PM in Courtroom 6, 17th Floor, San Francisco. (Cohn, Cindy) (Filed on 10/3/2007) (Entered: 10/03/2007)
10/25/2007	<u>19</u>	Memorandum in Opposition re <u>14</u> MOTION Plaintiffs' Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence; Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence, <u>18</u> MOTION to Amend/Correct <u>14</u> MOTION Plaintiffs' Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence; Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence MOTION to Amend/Correct <u>14</u> MOTION Plaintiffs' Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence; Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence filed by George W. Bush, Michael V. Hayden, Keith B. Alexander, Alberto Gonzales, John Ashcroft. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Coppolino Declaration & Exhibits Thereto)(Haas, Alexander) (Filed on 10/25/2007) (Entered: 10/25/2007)
10/25/2007	<u>20</u>	NOTICE by George W. Bush, Michael V. Hayden, Keith B. Alexander, Alberto Gonzales, John Ashcroft re <u>19</u> Memorandum in Opposition,, of <i>Lodging of Classified Supplement & accompanying Declaration</i> (Haas, Alexander) (Filed on 10/25/2007) (Entered: 10/25/2007)
11/02/2007	<u>21</u>	RESPONSE in Support re <u>14</u> MOTION Plaintiffs' Motion for Order to Preserve Evidence; Plaintiffs' Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Motion for

		Order to Preserve Evidence filed by All Plaintiffs'. (Cohn, Cindy) (Filed on 11/2/2007) (Entered: 11/02/2007)
12/14/2007	<u>22</u>	NOTICE by George W. Bush, Michael V. Hayden, Keith B. Alexander, Alberto Gonzales, John Ashcroft of <i>Manual Filing</i> (Haas, Alexander) (Filed on 12/14/2007) (Entered: 12/14/2007)
03/25/2008	<u>23</u>	REVISED PRACTICE AND PROCEDURE ORDER re (370 in M:06-cv-01791-VRW) Order filed September 10, 2007 signed by Judge Vaughn R Walker on 3-24-08. (vrwlc3, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 3/25/2008) (Entered: 03/25/2008)
11/06/2008	<u>24</u>	Transcript of Proceedings held on 9-12-2008, before Judge Vaughn R. Walker. Court Reporter/Transcriber Debra L. Pas, Telephone number (415) 431-1477. Per General Order No. 59 and Judicial Conference policy, this transcript may be viewed only at the Clerks Office public terminal or may be purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber until the deadline for the Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Any Notice of Intent to Request Redaction, if required, is due no later than 5 business days from date of this filing. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 2/2/2009. (Pas, Debra) (Filed on 11/6/2008) (Entered: 11/06/2008)
05/05/2009	<u>25</u>	Letter from Ilann M. Maazel to Judge Vaughn R. Walker re 9th circuit authority. (Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 5/5/2009) (Entered: 05/05/2009)
05/14/2009	<u>26</u>	ORDER re <u>25</u> Letter filed by Hilary Botein, Virginia Shubert, Sarah Dranoff, Noha Arafa. Signed by Judge Vaughn R Walker on 5/14/2009. (vrwlc3, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 5/14/2009) (Entered: 05/14/2009)
07/31/2009	<u>27</u>	CASE MANAGEMENT STATEMENT <i>Joint Request to Schedule Case Management Conference</i> filed by United States of America. (Coppolino, Anthony) (Filed on 7/31/2009) (Entered: 07/31/2009)
07/31/2009	<u>29</u>	ERRONEOUS DOCKET ENTRY – Please ignore NOTICE OF APPEAL. Filing fee \$ 455. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> 2nd part of Notice of Appeal)(gsa, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 7/31/2009) Modified on 8/7/2009 (gsa, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 08/05/2009)
08/05/2009	<u>28</u>	CLERKS NOTICE : PER COUNSEL'S REQUEST, Case Management Conference has been scheduled in this case for September 3, 2009 at 3:30 p.m. Parties joint case management statement shall be due one week prior to the conference. Counsel for the plaintiffs and the defendants has been granted leave to appear telephonically. The clerk shall initiate the call. Parties requesting a continuance shall submit a stipulation and proposed order. If parties are unable to reach a stipulation, the requesting party shall submit an exparte application with a proposed order. Case Management Conference set for 9/3/2009 03:30 PM. Case Management Statement due by 8/27/2009. (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 8/5/2009) (Entered: 08/05/2009)
08/27/2009	<u>30</u>	CASE MANAGEMENT STATEMENT <i>Joint Case Management Statement</i> filed by United States of America. (Coppolino, Anthony) (Filed on 8/27/2009) (Entered: 08/27/2009)
09/03/2009		Set/Reset Hearings: Case Management Conference reset for 9/10/2009 03:30 PM. (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/3/2009) (Entered: 09/08/2009)
09/10/2009	<u>31</u>	Minute Entry: Case Management Conference (Telephonic) held on 9/10/2009 before Chief Judge Vaughn R Walker. Attorneys : For Plaintiff(s): Ilann Maazel (by phone). Cindy Cohn. For Defendant(s): Anthony Coppolino (by phone). James Whitman (phone). Govt to File Motion: 10/8/2009. Opposition: 11/5/2009. Reply: 11/19/2009. Hearing: 12/15/2009 at 10:00 AM. (Court Reporter not reported.) (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Date Filed: 9/10/2009) (Entered: 09/16/2009)
10/02/2009	<u>32</u>	STIPULATION to <i>Extend Time to Renew Motion to Dismiss and For Summary Judgment</i> by United States of America. (Ahern, Paul) (Filed on 10/2/2009) (Entered: 10/02/2009)
10/07/2009	<u>33</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER granting doc <u>32</u> in C07-0693 Shubert v Bush filed by United States of America. The government defendants' renewed motion to dismiss and

		for summary judgment shall be filed no later than 10/20/2009. The plaintiffs' opposition to that motion shall be filed no later than 11/24/2009. Reply shall be filed no later than 12/4/2009. The hearing shall remain set for 12/15/2009 at 10:00 AM. Signed by Judge Vaughn R Walker on 10/7/2009. (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 10/7/2009) (Entered: 10/07/2009)
10/16/2009	<u>34</u>	STIPULATION (<i>Second</i>) to Extend Time to Renew Motion to Dismiss and for Summary Judgment by United States of America. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 1)(Ahern, Paul) (Filed on 10/16/2009) (Entered: 10/16/2009)
10/22/2009	<u>35</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER re <u>34</u> Stipulation filed by United States of America. Govt to file motion no later than 10/27/2009. Opposition due no later than 12/2/2009. Reply due no later than 12/8/2009. Hearing on Govt Defendants motion to dismiss and for summary judgment 12/15/2009 at 10:00 AM. Signed by Judge Vaughn R Walker on 10/21/2009. (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 10/22/2009) (Entered: 10/22/2009)
10/26/2009	<u>36</u>	STIPULATION (<i>Third</i>) to Extend Time to Renew Motion to Dismiss and for Summary Judgment by United States of America. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Ahern, Paul) (Filed on 10/26/2009) (Entered: 10/26/2009)
10/29/2009	<u>37</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER. Government's motion due 10/30/09; plaintiffs' opposition due 12/04/09; reply due 12/08/09; hearing 12/15/09 at 10:00 am. Signed by Judge Vaughn R Walker on 10/28/09. (vrwlc3, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 10/29/2009) (Entered: 10/29/2009)
10/30/2009	<u>38</u>	MOTION to Dismiss <i>and for Summary Judgment</i> filed by United States of America. Motion Hearing set for 12/15/2009 10:00 AM in Courtroom 6, 17th Floor, San Francisco. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, Public Declaration of Dennis C. Blair, Director of National Intelligence, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, Public Declaration of Keith B. Alexander, Director of the National Security Agency, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, Policies and Procedures Governing Invocation of the State Secrets Privilege)(Ahern, Paul) (Filed on 10/30/2009) (Entered: 10/30/2009)
10/30/2009	<u>39</u>	NOTICE by United States of America re <u>38</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>and for Summary Judgment of Lodging of In Camera, Ex Parte Classified Declaration of Dennis C. Blair, Director of National Intelligence</i> (Ahern, Paul) (Filed on 10/30/2009) (Entered: 10/30/2009)
10/30/2009	<u>40</u>	NOTICE by United States of America re <u>38</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>and for Summary Judgment of Lodging of In Camera, Ex Parte Classified Declaration of Lieutenant General Keith B. Alexander, Director of the National Security Agency</i> (Ahern, Paul) (Filed on 10/30/2009) (Entered: 10/30/2009)
10/30/2009	<u>41</u>	NOTICE by United States of America re <u>38</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>and for Summary Judgment of Lodging of In Camera, Ex Parte Classified Supplemental Memorandum of Points and Authorities</i> (Ahern, Paul) (Filed on 10/30/2009) (Entered: 10/30/2009)
11/03/2009	<u>42</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER re doc <u>36</u> THIRD STIPULATION TO EXTEND TIME TO FILE RENEWED MOTION TO DISMISS AND FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT filed by United States of America. Signed by Judge Vaughn R Walker on 11/2/2009. (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 11/3/2009) (Entered: 11/03/2009)
11/20/2009		NOTICE of Hearing on Motion : The 12/15/2009 hearing on the United States' motion to dismiss and for summary judgment, doc #38 has been moved from 10:00 AM to 02:00 PM in Courtroom 6, 17th Floor, San Francisco. (cgk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 11/20/2009) (Entered: 11/20/2009)
12/03/2009	<u>43</u>	Memorandum in Opposition re <u>38</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>and for Summary Judgment</i> filed by Noha Arafa, Hilary Botein, Sarah Dranoff, Virginia Shubert. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E)(Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 12/3/2009) (Entered: 12/03/2009)
12/08/2009	<u>44</u>	Reply Memorandum re <u>38</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>and for Summary Judgment</i> filed by United States of America. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1)(Ahern, Paul) (Filed on 12/8/2009) (Entered: 12/08/2009)
12/15/2009	<u>45</u>	Minute Entry: Motion Hearing held on 12/15/2009 before Chief Judge Vaughn R Walker re doc <u>38</u> MOTION to Dismiss and for Summary Judgment filed by United

		States of America ; the court submitted the matter, the court to issue order. (Court Reporter Jim Yeomans.) (cgg, COURT STAFF) (Date Filed: 12/15/2009) (Entered: 12/16/2009)
01/21/2010	<u>46</u>	ORDER by Judge Vaughn R. Walker granting (680) Motion to Dismiss in case M:06-cv-01791-VRW; granting (38) Motion to Dismiss in case 3:07-cv-00693-VRW; granting Motion to Dismiss in 3:08-cv-4373 VRW. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix) (hfk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 1/21/2010) (Entered: 01/21/2010)
01/25/2010	<u>47</u>	JUDGMENT. IT IS ORDERED AND ADJUDGED that in accordance with the Court's January 21, 2010 Order, judgment is hereby entered in member case Shubert et al v Bush et al, No C 07-0693 in favor of defendants and against plaintiffs. (cgg, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 1/25/2010) (Entered: 01/25/2010)
02/04/2010	<u>48</u>	ORDER re (Doc #46 in 3:07-cv-00693-VRW, Doc #703 in M:06-cv-01791-VRW) 1/21/2010 Order on Motion to Dismiss. Signed by Judge Vaughn R. Walker on 2/4/2010. (hfk, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 2/4/2010) (Entered: 02/04/2010)
03/19/2010	<u>49</u>	NOTICE OF APPEAL as to (46 in 3:07-cv-00693-VRW) Order on Motion to Dismiss (47 in 3:07-cv-00693-VRW) Judgment by Virginia Shubert. Appeal Fee \$455, Receipt Number 34611043712. (far, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 3/19/2010) (Entered: 03/22/2010)
03/22/2010	<u>50</u>	Copy of Notice of Appeal and Docket sheet mailed to all counsel (Attachments: # <u>1</u> docket sheet)(far, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 3/22/2010) (Entered: 03/22/2010)
03/23/2010	<u>51</u>	Copy of Notice of Appeal and Docket sheet mailed to all counsel (Attachments: # <u>1</u> docket sheet, # <u>2</u> cover letter, # <u>3</u> USCA appeal notification form)(far, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 3/23/2010) (Entered: 03/23/2010)
04/26/2010	<u>52</u>	USCA Case Number 10-15638 9th Circuit for <u>49</u> Notice of Appeal filed by Virginia Shubert. (far, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 4/26/2010) (Entered: 04/26/2010)
05/03/2010	<u>53</u>	TRANSCRIPT DESIGNATION AND ORDERING FORM for proceedings held on 12/15/09 before Judge Walker. (far, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 5/3/2010) (Entered: 05/04/2010)
05/21/2010	<u>54</u>	Transcript of Proceedings held on 12/15/09, before Judge Vaughn R. Walker. Court Reporter/Transcriber James Yeomans, Telephone number (415) 863-5179. Per General Order No. 59 and Judicial Conference policy, this transcript may be viewed only at the Clerks Office public terminal or may be purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber until the deadline for the Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Any Notice of Intent to Request Redaction, if required, is due no later than 5 business days from date of this filing. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 8/19/2010. (jjy, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 5/21/2010) (Entered: 05/21/2010)
06/11/2010	<u>55</u>	CLERKS NOTICE Advising Counsel of Change in MDL Master Case Number Format (rcs, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 6/11/2010) (Entered: 06/11/2010)
04/06/2011	<u>56</u>	ORDER of USCA (far, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 4/6/2011) (Entered: 04/06/2011)
01/12/2012	<u>60</u>	USCA Memorandum as to <u>49</u> Notice of Appeal filed by Virginia Shubert (rcs, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 1/12/2012) (Entered: 05/14/2012)
02/01/2012	<u>57</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Adam Pulver (Pulver, Adam) (Filed on 2/1/2012) (Entered: 02/01/2012)
02/23/2012	<u>58</u>	MANDATE of USCA (far, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 2/23/2012) (Entered: 02/23/2012)
02/23/2012	<u>59</u>	CLERKS Letter Spreading Mandate to Counsel (far, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 2/23/2012) (Entered: 02/23/2012)
05/21/2012	<u>61</u>	STIPULATION WITH PROPOSED ORDER <i>Stipulation to Toll Defendants' Response to Second Amended Complaint</i> filed by Keith B. Alexander, United States of America, Barack Obama, Eric H. Holder. (Coppolino, Anthony) (Filed on 5/21/2012) (Entered: 05/21/2012)

08/20/2012	<u>62</u>	Letter from Adam Pulver <i>Requesting Judge Assignment</i> . (Pulver, Adam) (Filed on 8/20/2012) (Entered: 08/20/2012)
09/05/2012	<u>63</u>	Letter from Ilann M. Maazel <i>to Judge Wilken</i> . (Pulver, Adam) (Filed on 9/5/2012) (Entered: 09/05/2012)
09/06/2012	<u>64</u>	ORDER REASSIGNING CASE. Case reassigned to Hon. Yvonne Gonzalez-Rogers. Hon. Vaughn R. Walker no longer assigned to the case. Signed by Executive Committee on 9/6/12. (ha, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/6/2012) Modified on 9/7/2012 (jlm, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 09/06/2012)
09/06/2012	<u>65</u>	REASSIGNMENT ORDER OF JUDGE YVONNE GONZALEZ ROGERS. Signed by Judge Yvonne Gonzalez Rogers on 9/6/12. (fs, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/6/2012) (Entered: 09/11/2012)
09/17/2012	<u>66</u>	ORDER REASSIGNING CASE. Case reassigned to Judge Hon. Jeffrey S. White for all further proceedings. Judge Hon. Yvonne Gonzalez Rogers no longer assigned to the case. Signed by Judge Jeffrey S. White, on 09/17/2012. (jlm, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/17/2012) (Entered: 09/18/2012)
09/24/2012	<u>67</u>	STIPULATION WITH PROPOSED ORDER <i>Stipulation and Request to Reset Hearing Date; Set Briefing Schedule</i> filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Coppolino, Anthony) (Filed on 9/24/2012) (Entered: 09/24/2012)
09/25/2012	<u>68</u>	ORDER GRANTING AS MODIFIED <u>67</u> STIPULATION RE: Request to Reset Hearing Date; Set Briefing Schedule. Responses due by 10/18/2012. Replies due by 10/26/2012. Motion Hearing set for 12/14/2012 09:00 AM in Courtroom 11, 19th Floor, San Francisco before Hon. Jeffrey S. White.. Signed by Judge JEFFREY S. WHITE on 9/25/12. (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/25/2012) (Entered: 09/25/2012)
09/28/2012	<u>69</u>	Third MOTION to Dismiss <i>and for Summary Judgment</i> filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. Motion Hearing set for 12/14/2012 09:00 AM in Courtroom 11, 19th Floor, San Francisco before Hon. Jeffrey S. White. Responses due by 10/18/2012. Replies due by 10/26/2012. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Ex. A – DNI Public Declaration, # <u>2</u> Ex. B – NSA Public Declaration)(Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 9/28/2012) (Entered: 09/28/2012)
09/28/2012	<u>70</u>	NOTICE by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America re <u>69</u> Third MOTION to Dismiss <i>and for Summary Judgment Notice of Lodging of Classified DNI Declaration</i> (Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 9/28/2012) (Entered: 09/28/2012)
09/28/2012	<u>71</u>	NOTICE by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America re <u>69</u> Third MOTION to Dismiss <i>and for Summary Judgment Notice of Lodging of Classified NSA Declaration</i> (Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 9/28/2012) (Entered: 09/28/2012)
10/02/2012	<u>72</u>	STIPULATION WITH PROPOSED ORDER <i>and Request to Set Briefing Schedule</i> filed by All Plaintiffs. (Cohn, Cindy) (Filed on 10/2/2012) (Entered: 10/02/2012)
10/03/2012	<u>73</u>	ORDER DENYING STIPULATION TO RESET BRIEFING SCHEDULE. Signed by Judge JEFFREY S. WHITE on 10/3/12. (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 10/3/2012) (Entered: 10/03/2012)
10/16/2012	<u>74</u>	STIPULATION WITH PROPOSED ORDER <i>TO DEEM CERTAIN DOCUMENTS FILED</i> filed by All Plaintiffs, Noha Arafa, Hilary Botein, Sarah Dranoff, Virginia Shubert. (Pulver, Adam) (Filed on 10/16/2012) (Entered: 10/16/2012)
10/17/2012	<u>75</u>	ORDER GRANTING <u>74</u> STIPULATION TO DEEM CERTAIN DOCUMENTS FILED. Signed by Judge Jeffrey S. White on 10/17/12. (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 10/17/2012) (Entered: 10/17/2012)
10/18/2012	<u>76</u>	RESPONSE (re <u>69</u> Third MOTION to Dismiss <i>and for Summary Judgment</i>) filed by Noha Arafa, Hilary Botein, Sarah Dranoff, Virginia Shubert. (Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 10/18/2012) (Entered: 10/18/2012)

10/18/2012	<u>77</u>	DECLARATION of Ilann M. Maazel in Opposition to <u>69</u> Third MOTION to Dismiss <i>and for Summary Judgment</i> filed by Noha Arafa, Hilary Botein, Sarah Dranoff, Virginia Shubert. (Related document(s) <u>69</u>) (Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 10/18/2012) (Entered: 10/18/2012)
10/24/2012	<u>78</u>	STIPULATION WITH PROPOSED ORDER for <i>Extension of Time for Govt. Defs. to File their Reply in Supp. of Summ. Judgment</i> filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 10/24/2012) (Entered: 10/24/2012)
10/25/2012	<u>79</u>	ORDER GRANTING (78 in 3:07-cv-00693-JSW) STIPULATION for Extension of Time for Govt. Defs. to File their Reply in Supp. of Summ. Judgment. Replies due by 11/2/2012.. Signed by Judge Jeffrey S. White on 10/25/12. (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 10/25/2012) (Entered: 10/25/2012)
11/02/2012	<u>80</u>	REPLY (re <u>69</u> Third MOTION to Dismiss <i>and for Summary Judgment</i>) <i>Government Defendants' Reply in Support of Third Motion to Dismiss and for Summary Judgment</i> filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Coppolino, Anthony) (Filed on 11/2/2012) (Entered: 11/02/2012)
12/12/2012	<u>81</u>	NOTICE OF QUESTIONS FOR HEARING. Signed by Judge Jeffrey S. White on December 12, 2012. (jswlc2, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 12/12/2012) (Entered: 12/12/2012)
12/14/2012	<u>82</u>	Minute Entry: Motion Hearing held on 12/14/2012 before Jeffrey S. White (Date Filed: 12/14/2012). (Court Reporter Joan Columbini.) (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Date Filed: 12/14/2012) (Entered: 12/14/2012)
12/21/2012	<u>83</u>	Transcript of Proceedings held on December 14, 2012, before Judge Jeffrey S. White. Court Reporter/Transcriber Joan Marie Columbini, CSR, RPR, Telephone number 415-255-6842. Per General Order No. 59 and Judicial Conference policy, this transcript may be viewed only at the Clerks Office public terminal or may be purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber until the deadline for the Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Any Notice of Intent to Request Redaction, if required, is due no later than 5 business days from date of this filing. Redaction Request due 1/11/2013. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 1/22/2013. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 3/21/2013. (Columbini, Joan) (Filed on 12/21/2012) (Entered: 12/21/2012)
02/13/2013	<u>84</u>	STATEMENT OF RECENT DECISION pursuant to Civil Local Rule 7-3.d filed by Noha Arafa, Hilary Botein, Sarah Dranoff, Virginia Shubert. (Pulver, Adam) (Filed on 2/13/2013) (Entered: 02/13/2013)
02/27/2013	<u>85</u>	STATEMENT OF RECENT DECISION pursuant to Civil Local Rule 7-3.d filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Clapper v. Amnesty International)(Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 2/27/2013) (Entered: 02/27/2013)
02/27/2013	<u>86</u>	STATEMENT OF RECENT DECISION pursuant to Civil Local Rule 7-3.d filed by Noha Arafa, Hilary Botein, Sarah Dranoff, Virginia Shubert. (Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 2/27/2013) (Entered: 02/27/2013)
02/27/2013	<u>87</u>	ORDER RE ADDITIONAL BRIEFING. Signed by Judge Jeffrey S. White on February 27, 2013. (jswlc2, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 2/27/2013) (Entered: 02/27/2013)
03/06/2013	<u>88</u>	Supplemental Brief by <i>Govt. Defs. Addressing Clapper v. Amnesty Int'l</i> filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 3/6/2013) (Entered: 03/06/2013)
03/13/2013	<u>89</u>	Supplemental Brief re <u>87</u> Order filed by All Plaintiffs. (Related document(s) <u>87</u>) (Pulver, Adam) (Filed on 3/13/2013) (Entered: 03/13/2013)
06/07/2013	<u>90</u>	NOTICE by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America re <u>69</u> Third MOTION to Dismiss <i>and for Summary Judgment Notice and Request that the Court Hold the Pending Cross-Motions for Summary Judgment in Abeyance</i> (Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 6/7/2013) (Entered: 06/07/2013)

06/14/2013	<u>91</u>	RESPONSE to re <u>90</u> Notice (Other), <i>Opposition to Defendants' Motion for a Stay</i> by All Plaintiffs. (Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 6/14/2013) (Entered: 06/14/2013)
06/14/2013	<u>92</u>	DECLARATION of Ilann Maazel in Opposition to <u>90</u> Notice (Other), <i>Defendants' Motion for a Stay</i> filed by All Plaintiffs. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A-P)(Related document(s) <u>90</u>) (Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 6/14/2013) (Entered: 06/14/2013)
06/19/2013	<u>93</u>	Response re <u>91</u> Response (Non Motion) <i>Government Defendants' Response to Plaintiffs' Opposition to Defendants' June 7, 2013 Notice</i> by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Coppolino, Anthony) (Filed on 6/19/2013) (Entered: 06/19/2013)
06/28/2013	<u>94</u>	Notice to Withdraw as Attorney filed by Noha Arafa, Hilary Botein, Sarah Dranoff, Virginia Shubert. Responses due by 7/12/2013. Replies due by 7/19/2013. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit)(Pulver, Adam) (Filed on 6/28/2013) Modified on 7/2/2013 (hdjS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 06/28/2013)
07/08/2013	<u>95</u>	ORDER by Judge Jeffrey S. White GRANTING IN PART and DEFERRING RULING IN PART <u>69</u> Defendants' Motion to Dismiss and for Summary Judgment. (jswlc2, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 7/8/2013) (Entered: 07/08/2013)
07/08/2013		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Case Management Statement due by 8/16/2013. Case Management Conference set for 8/23/2013 01:30 PM in Courtroom 11, 19th Floor, San Francisco. (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 7/8/2013) (Entered: 07/08/2013)
07/08/2013	<u>96</u>	DOCUMENT ENTERED IN WRONG CASE – PLEASE DISREGARD (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 7/8/2013) Modified on 7/8/2013 (jjoS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 07/08/2013)
07/16/2013	<u>97</u>	MOTION for Reconsideration re <u>95</u> Order on Motion to Dismiss filed by All Plaintiffs. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 7/16/2013) (Entered: 07/16/2013)
07/23/2013	<u>98</u>	AMENDED ORDER. Signed by Judge Jeffrey S. White on July 23, 2013. (jswlc2, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 7/23/2013) (Entered: 07/23/2013)
07/30/2013	<u>99</u>	STIPULATION WITH PROPOSED ORDER <i>to Continue Case Management Conference</i> filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 7/30/2013) (Entered: 07/30/2013)
08/05/2013	<u>100</u>	ORDER GRANTING <u>99</u> Stipulation to Continue Case Management Conference. Case Management Statement due by 9/20/2013. Case Management Conference set for 9/27/2013 01:30 PM in Courtroom 11, 19th Floor, San Francisco. Signed by Judge Jeffrey S. White on August 5, 2013. (jswlc3, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 8/5/2013) (Entered: 08/05/2013)
09/18/2013	<u>101</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by James R. Whitman (Whitman, James) (Filed on 9/18/2013) (Entered: 09/18/2013)
09/20/2013	<u>102</u>	CASE MANAGEMENT STATEMENT <i>Joint</i> filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 9/20/2013) (Entered: 09/20/2013)
09/30/2013	<u>103</u>	Minute Entry: Status Conference held (Date Filed: 9/30/2013). (Court Reporter Debra Pas.) (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Date Filed: 9/30/2013) (Entered: 09/30/2013)
09/30/2013	<u>104</u>	AMENDED Minute Entry: (CORRECTION OF BRIEFING SCHEDULE) Status Conference held (Date Filed: 9/30/2013). (Court Reporter Debra Pas.) (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/30/2013) (Entered: 09/30/2013)
12/20/2013	<u>105</u>	Supplemental Brief of <i>Govt. Defs. on Threshold Legal Issues as Ordered by the Court at the Sept. 27, 2013 Case Management Conference</i> filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 12/20/2013) (Entered: 12/20/2013)
12/20/2013	<u>106</u>	Declaration of James R. Clapper in Support of <u>105</u> Supplemental Brief, filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Related document(s) <u>105</u>) (Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 12/20/2013) (Entered: 12/20/2013)

12/20/2013	<u>107</u>	Declaration of Frances J. Fleisch, National Security Agency in Support of <u>105</u> Supplemental Brief, filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Related document(s) <u>105</u>) (Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 12/20/2013) (Entered: 12/20/2013)
12/20/2013	<u>108</u>	NOTICE by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America re <u>105</u> Supplemental Brief, of <i>Lodging of In Camera, Ex Parte Classified Declaration of James R. Clapper, Director of National Intelligence</i> (Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 12/20/2013) (Entered: 12/20/2013)
12/20/2013	<u>109</u>	NOTICE by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America re <u>105</u> Supplemental Brief, of <i>Lodging of In Camera, Ex Parte Classified Declaration of Frances J. Fleisch, Acting Deputy Director of the National Security Agency</i> (Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 12/20/2013) (Entered: 12/20/2013)
12/20/2013	<u>110</u>	NOTICE by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America of <i>Filing Declassified Declarations</i> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> 2007 Declaration of J. Michael McConnell, Director of National Intelligence, filed in Jewel v. NSA and Shubert v. Obama, # <u>2</u> 2007 Declaration of Lt. Gen. Keith B. Alexander, Director, National Security Agency, filed in Jewel v. NSA and Shubert v. Obama, # <u>3</u> 2009 Declaration of Dennis C. Blair, Director of National Intelligence, filed in Jewel v. NSA, # <u>4</u> 2009 Declaration of Dennis C. Blair, Director of National Intelligence, filed in Shubert v. Obama, # <u>5</u> 2009 Declaration of Deborah A. Bonanni, National Security Agency, filed in Jewel v. NSA, # <u>6</u> 2009 Declaration of Lt. Gen. Keith B. Alexander, Director, National Security Agency, filed in Shubert v. Obama, # <u>7</u> 2012 Declaration of James R. Clapper, Director of National Intelligence, filed in Jewel v. NSA and Shubert v. Obama, # <u>8</u> 2012 Declaration of Frances J. Fleisch, National Security Agency, filed in Jewel v. NSA and Shubert v. Obama)(Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 12/20/2013) (Entered: 12/20/2013)
01/13/2014	<u>111</u>	Response to <i>Defendant's Public Declarations</i> by All Plaintiffs. (Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 1/13/2014) (Entered: 01/13/2014)
02/12/2014	<u>112</u>	Supplemental Brief <i>Plaintiffs' Responses to the Court's Four Questions</i> filed by Noha Arafa, Hilary Botein, Sarah Dranoff, Virginia Shubert. (Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 2/12/2014) (Entered: 02/12/2014)
03/07/2014	<u>113</u>	RESPONSE to <i>Court's Threshold Questions (Government Defendants' Reply on Threshold Legal Issues as Ordered by the Court at the September 27, 2013, Status Conference)</i> by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Gilligan, James) (Filed on 3/7/2014) (Entered: 03/07/2014)
03/11/2014	<u>114</u>	ERRATA re <u>113</u> Response (Non Motion), <i>Gvt. Defs.' Reply on Threshold Legal Issues as Ordered by the Court at the Sept. 27, 2013 Status Conference</i> by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Corrected Gvt. Defs.' Reply on Threshold Legal Issues as Ordered by the Court)(Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 3/11/2014) (Entered: 03/11/2014)
03/26/2014	<u>115</u>	RESPONSE to <i>the Court's Question About Rule 11 Certifications</i> by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 3/26/2014) (Entered: 03/26/2014)
04/01/2014	<u>116</u>	ORDER RE UNDER SEAL DOCUMENTS. Signed by Judge JEFFREY S. WHITE on 4/1/14. (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 4/1/2014) (Entered: 04/01/2014)
04/17/2014	<u>117</u>	Unopposed REQUEST Concerning Briefing Set Forth in March 19, 2014 Order (Jewel Doc. #95), filed by Noha Arafa, Hilary Botein, Sarah Dranoff, Virginia Shubert. (Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 4/17/2014) Modified on 4/18/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 04/17/2014)
05/09/2014	<u>118</u>	Brief re Compliance with Preservation Orders, filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 5/9/2014) Modified on 5/12/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). Modified on 6/4/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 05/09/2014)
05/09/2014	<u>119</u>	[REDACTED] Classified Declaration of Miriam P., National Security Agency Ex Parte, In Camera Submission, filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack

		Obama, United States of America. (Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 5/9/2014) Modified on 5/12/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). Modified on 5/12/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 05/09/2014)
05/09/2014	<u>120</u>	Declaration of Anthony J. Coppolino, filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 5/9/2014) Modified on 5/12/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 05/09/2014)
05/09/2014	<u>121</u>	NOTICE of Lodging of Classified NSA Declaration for In Camera, Ex Parte Review, filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America (Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 5/9/2014) Modified on 5/12/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 05/09/2014)
06/02/2014	<u>122</u>	STIPULATION WITH PROPOSED ORDER CONCERNING BRIEFING SCHEDULE, filed by Noha Arafa, Hilary Botein, Sarah Dranoff, Virginia Shubert. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 6/2/2014) Modified on 6/3/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). Modified on 6/3/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 06/02/2014)
06/03/2014	<u>123</u>	ORDER by Judge Jeffrey S. White granting <u>122</u> Stipulation CONCERNING BRIEFING SCHEDULE (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 6/3/2014) (Entered: 06/03/2014)
06/05/2014	<u>124</u>	Brief re <u>118</u> <i>Plaintiffs' Brief Concerning The Government's Violation, of the Court's Preservation Orders</i> , filed by Noha Arafa, Hilary Botein, Sarah Dranoff, Virginia Shubert. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order re: The Government's Violation of the Court's Preservation Orders)(Related document(s) <u>118</u>) (Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 6/5/2014) Modified on 6/6/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 06/05/2014)
06/05/2014	<u>125</u>	ORDER RE EMERGENCY APPLICATION TO ENFORCE THE COURT'S TEMPORARY RESTRAINING ORDER. Signed by Judge Jeffrey S. White on 6/5/14. (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 6/5/2014) (Entered: 06/05/2014)
06/05/2014	<u>126</u>	Emergency MOTION to Stay re <u>125</u> Order <i>Emergency Motion to Stay the Court's June 5, 2014 Order</i> filed by Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. Responses due by 6/6/2014. Replies due by 6/13/2014. (Coppolino, Anthony) (Filed on 6/5/2014) (Entered: 06/05/2014)
06/06/2014	<u>127</u>	ORDER SETTING HEARING. APPLICATION TO ENFORCE Temporary Restraining Order Hearing set for 6/6/2014 02:00 PM.. Signed by Judge JEFFREY S. WHITE on 6/6/14. (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 6/6/2014) Modified on 6/6/2014 (jjoS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 06/06/2014)
06/06/2014	<u>128</u>	NOTICE of Phone Number for Government Counsel for Emergency Hearing re <u>127</u> Order, filed by Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America (Coppolino, Anthony) (Filed on 6/6/2014) Modified on 6/9/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 06/06/2014)
06/06/2014	<u>129</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to File Opposition to Plalintiffs' Emergency Motion to Enforce Court's Temporary Restraining Order, filed by Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Coppolino, Anthony) (Filed on 6/6/2014) Modified on 6/9/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 06/06/2014)
06/13/2014	<u>130</u>	Letter to Judge Jeffrey S. White re Telephonic Hearing Held on 06/06/14, from Marica Berman, dated 06/12/14. (kc, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 6/13/2014) (jlmS, COURT STAFF). Modified on 8/5/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 06/16/2014)
06/13/2014	<u>131</u>	ORDER RE REQUEST by Judge Jeffrey S. White, signed on 06/13/14. (kc, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 6/13/2014) (jlmS, COURT STAFF). Modified on 8/5/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 06/16/2014)
06/23/2014	<u>132</u>	ORDER by Judge Jeffrey S. White, signed on 06/23/14. (jlmS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 6/23/2014) (Additional attachment(s) added on 8/5/2014: # <u>1</u> Main Document) (jlmS, COURT STAFF). Modified on 8/5/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). (Additional attachment(s) added on 8/7/2014: # <u>4</u> Main Document) (jlm, COURT STAFF). Modified on 8/7/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). ***DOCUMENT UNSEALED BY

		ORDER OF THE COURT, PLEASE SEE DOCUMENT NO. <u>143</u> *** (Entered: 06/23/2014)
06/23/2014	<u>133</u>	RESPONSE to <u>131</u> Order, filed by Virginia Shubert (jlmS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 6/23/2014) (Additional attachment(s) added on 8/5/2014: # <u>1</u> Main Document) (jlmS, COURT STAFF). Modified on 8/5/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). (Additional attachment(s) added on 8/7/2014: # <u>3</u> Main Document) (jlm, COURT STAFF). Modified on 8/7/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). ***DOCUMENT UNSEALED BY ORDER OF THE COURT, PLEASE SEE DOCUMENT NO. <u>143</u> *** (Entered: 06/23/2014)
06/27/2014	<u>134</u>	Reply Memorandum re Compliance With Preservation Orders, filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of James J. Gilligan, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B, # <u>4</u> Exhibit C, # <u>5</u> Exhibit D, # <u>6</u> Exhibit E, # <u>7</u> Exhibit F)(Gilligan, James) (Filed on 6/27/2014) Modified on 6/30/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 06/27/2014)
06/30/2014	<u>135</u>	ERRATA to <u>134</u> Reply Memorandum, filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit (Corrected Government Defendants' Reply Brief Regarding Compliance With Preservation Orders))(Gilligan, James) (Filed on 6/30/2014) Modified on 7/1/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 06/30/2014)
06/30/2014	<u>136</u>	Administrative Motion to File Under Seal <i>Response to June 23, 2014 Order</i> filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Marcia Berman, # <u>2</u> Proposed Order, # <u>3</u> Document to be filed under seal)(Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 6/30/2014) (Entered: 06/30/2014)
07/02/2014	<u>137</u>	ORDER by Judge JEFFREY S. WHITE granting <u>136</u> Administrative Motion to File Under Seal (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 7/2/2014) (Entered: 07/02/2014)
07/11/2014	<u>138</u>	ORDER by Judge Jeffrey S. White, signed on 07/11/14. (jlmS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 7/11/2014) Modified on 8/7/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). ***DOCUMENT UNSEALED BY ORDER OF THE COURT, PLEASE SEE DOCUMENT NO. <u>143</u> *** Modified on 5/12/2016 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 07/11/2014)
07/23/2014	<u>139</u>	NOTICE of Change of Address, filed by All Plaintiffs, Noha Arafa, Hilary Botein, Sarah Dranoff (Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 7/23/2014) Modified on 7/24/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 07/23/2014)
07/24/2014	<u>140</u>	Final Brief re <u>134</u> Reply Memorandum re Compliance With Preservation Orders(Pursuant to the Court's June 6, 2014 Order), filed by Noha Arafa, Hilary Botein, Sarah Dranoff, Virginia Shubert. (Related document(s) <u>134</u>) (Maazel, Ilann) (Filed on 7/24/2014) Modified on 7/25/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 07/24/2014)
07/28/2014	<u>141</u>	Administrative Motion to File Under Seal re <i>Response to the Court's Order of July 11, 2014</i> , filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration, # <u>2</u> Proposed Order, # <u>3</u> Response to Court's Order)(Berman, Marcia) (Filed on 7/28/2014) Modified on 7/29/2014 (jlmS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 07/28/2014)
08/04/2014	<u>142</u>	ORDER by Judge Jeffrey S. White GRANTING <u>141</u> Administrative Motion to File Under Seal Response to Court's Order of July 11, 2014. (jswlc3, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 8/4/2014) (Entered: 08/04/2014)
08/05/2014	<u>143</u>	ORDER GRANTING ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION TO UNSEAL. Signed by Judge JEFFREY S. WHITE on 8/5/14. (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 8/5/2014) (Entered: 08/05/2014)
08/11/2014	<u>144</u>	CORRECTED ORDER GRANTING PLAINTIFFS' ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION TO UNSEAL. Signed by Judge JEFFREY S. WHITE on 8/11/14. (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 8/11/2014) (Entered: 08/11/2014)
09/30/2014	<u>145</u>	ORDER GRANTING MOTION FOR EXCESS PAGES; DENYING REQUEST TO STRIKE CROSS-MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT; SETTING BRIEFING SCHEDULE AND CONTINUING HEARING. Signed by Judge

		JEFFREY S. WHITE on 9/30/14. (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/30/2014) (Entered: 09/30/2014)
02/10/2015	<u>146</u>	ORDER DENYING PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT AND GRANTING DEFENDANTS MOTION FOR PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT. Signed by Judge JEFFREY S. WHITE on 2/10/15. (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 2/10/2015) (Entered: 02/10/2015)
05/20/2015	<u>147</u>	ORDER GRANTING MOTION FOR ENTRY OF FINAL JUDGMENT ON FOURTH AMENDMENT CLAIM. Signed by Judge JEFFREY S. WHITE on 5/20/15. (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 5/20/2015) (Entered: 05/20/2015)
05/21/2015	<u>148</u>	JUDGMENT ON FOURTH AMENDMENT CLAIM. Signed by Judge Jeffrey S. White on 5/21/15. (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 5/21/2015) (Entered: 05/21/2015)
06/13/2017	<u>149</u>	Government Defendant's Opening Brief Regarding Preservation of Upstream Internet Communications Previously Acquired Under Section 702 of the Foreign Intelligence Surveillance Act by Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Exhibit)(Patton, Rodney) (Filed on 6/13/2017) Modified on 6/14/2017 (cjlS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 06/13/2017)
06/28/2017	<u>150</u>	Government Defendants' Notice of Filing by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America. (Gilligan, James) (Filed on 6/28/2017) Modified on 6/29/2017 (cjlS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 06/28/2017)
07/19/2017	<u>151</u>	ORDER RE PRESERVATION ISSUES. Signed by Judge Jeffrey S. White on July 19, 2017. (jswlc2S, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 7/19/2017) (Entered: 07/19/2017)
03/02/2018	<u>152</u>	[PROPOSED] Stipulated Protective Order filed by Keith B. Alexander, Eric H. Holder, Barack Obama, United States of America, All Plaintiffs. (Patton, Rodney) (Filed on 3/2/2018) Modified on 3/5/2018 (cjlS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 03/02/2018)
03/05/2018	<u>153</u>	STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER. Signed by Judge Jeffrey S. White on 3/5/18. (jjoS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 3/5/2018) (Entered: 03/05/2018)