IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE SIXTH CIRCUIT

USAMA JAMIL HAMAMA, ET AL., Petitioners-Appellees,

V.

Thomas Homan, Deputy Director and Senior Official Performing the Duties of the Director, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement, et al., *Respondents-Appellants*.

On Appeal from the U.S. District Court for the Eastern District of Michigan D.C. No. 2:17-cv-11910

BRIEF OF NUMEROUS SCHOLARS AND RESEARCHERS AS AMICI CURIAE IN SUPPORT OF PETITIONERS-APPELLEES

Jill M. Wheaton Dykema Gossett PLLC 2723 S. State St., Ste. 400 Ann Arbor, MI 48104 (734) 214-7629 jwheaton@dykema.com

Counsel for Amici Curiae

Nina Rabin (AZ Bar 025246) Dorien Ediger-Seto (AZ Bar 034192) James E. Rogers College of Law University of Arizona 1145 N. Mountain Ave. Tucson, AZ 85729 (520) 621-9206

rabin@email.arizona.edu

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| STATE | MENT OF INTEREST OF AMICUS CURIAE1 |
|--------|--|
| INTROI | OUCTION3 |
| ARGUN | MENT4 |
| I. | Prolonged Detention Causes Distinctive and Irreparable Harms to Detainees |
| | A. Physical Harms of Prolonged Detention4 |
| | B. Psychological Harms of Prolonged Detention |
| | C. Economic Harms of Prolonged Detention |
| | D. Legal Harms of Prolonged Detention |
| II. | Prolonged Detention Harms the Families of Detainees, Including U.SCitizen Children |
| III. | Prolonged Detention Harms Society |
| CONCL | USION |
| CERTIF | FICATE OF COMPLIANCE27 |

TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

Cases

| Barker v. Wingo, 407 U.S. 514 (1972) | 15, 17 |
|---|--------|
| Davis v. Ayala, 135 S. Ct. 2187 (2015) | 11 |
| Nat'l Ctr. for Immigrants Rights, Inc. v. INS, 743 F.2d 1365 (9th Cir. 1984) | 16 |
| Statutes | |
| 8 U.S.C. § 1226 | 2 |
| 8 U.S.C. § 1231 | 2 |
| Regulations | |
| Separate Representation for Custody and Bond Proceedings, 79 Fed. Reg. 55659, (proposed Sept. 17, 2014) (to be codified at 8 C.F.R. pt. 1003) | 17 |
| Standards To Prevent, Detect, and Respond to Sexual Abuse and Assault in Confinement Facilities, 79 Fed. Reg. 13100, 13104 (Mar. 7, 2014) (codified at 6 C.F.R. pt. 115) | 8 |
| 79 Fed. Reg. 13100 | 8 |
| Other Authorities | |
| ACLU, Fatal Neglect: How ICE Ignores Deaths In Det. (2016) | 5 |
| ACLU, Shutting Down the Profiteers: Why and How the Dep't of Homeland Sec. Should Stop Using Private Prisons (Sept. 2016) | |
| Admin. On Children, Youth & Families, U.S. Dep't of Health & Human Servs., ACYF-CB-IM-15-02, Case Planning and Service Delivery for Families with Parents and Legal Guardians who are Detained or Deported by Immigration Enf't (Feb. 20, 2015) | 23 |

| Ajay Chaudry et al., The Urban Inst., Facing Our Future: Children in the Aftermath of Immigration Enf't (2010) |
|--|
| Alex Friedmann, 32 Deaths at CCA-operated Immigration Det. Facilities Include at Least 7 Suicides, Prison Legal News (June 20, 2015), http://tinyurl.com/jfb8bde |
| Allen Keller et al., Mental Health of Detained Asylum Seekers, 362 Lancet 1721 (2003) |
| Am. Bar Ass'n, Comm'n on Immigration, Reforming the Immigration Sy.: Proposals to Promote Independence, Fairness, Efficiency, and Professionalism in the Adjudication of Removal Cases 5-8 (2010) |
| Caitlin Dickerson, <i>Trump Plan Would Curtail Protection for Detained Immigrants</i> , N.Y. Times (Apr. 13, 2017), https://www.nytimes.com/2017/04/13/us/detained-immigrants-may-face-harsher-conditions-under-trump.html |
| Caitlin Patler, Solitary Confinement Practices In a Subset of U.S. Immigrant Detention, Journal of Population Research (forthcoming 2018) |
| Caitlin Patler, UCLA Inst. for Research on Labor and Emp't, <i>The Economic Impacts of Long-Term Immigration Detention in Southern California</i> (2015) |
| Caitlin Patler & Nicholas Branic, Legal Status and Patterns of Family Visitation During Immigration Det., 3 Russell Sage Journal of the Social Sciences (2017) |
| Caitlin Patler & Tanya M. Golash-Boza, <i>The Fiscal and Human Costs of Immigrant Detention and Deportation in the United States</i> , 11 Sociology Compass (2017) |
| Craig Haney, Mental Health Issues in Long-Term Solitary and "Supermax" Confinement, 49 Crime & Delinquency 124, 124-56 (2003) |
| Ctr. for Victims of Torture et al., <i>Tortured & Detained: Survivor Stories of U.S. Immigration Detention</i> 5 (2013) |

| David Kaiser & Lovisa Stannow, Immigrant Detainees: The New Sex Abuse Crisis, NYR Daily (Nov. 23, 2011) |
|---|
| Detention Watch Network, Expose and Close: One Year Later: The Absence of Accountability in Immigration Det. (2013) |
| Dora Schriro, U.S. Immigration Customs Enforcement, <i>Immigration Detention Overview and Recommendations</i> (2009) |
| Emily Ryo, Fostering Legal Cynicism through Immigration Detention, 90 Southern California Law Review 999 (2017)3, 10, 13, 19, 20 |
| Emily Ryo, Detained: A Study of Immigration Bond Hearings, 50 Law & Soc'y Rev. 117 (2016) |
| Erika Eichelberger, <i>Watchdog: Feds Are Muzzling Us for Reporting Alleged Immigrant Detainee Sex Abuse</i> , Mother Jones (Mar. 19, 2014, 10:02 AM), http://www.motherjones.com/politics/2014/03/ice-sexual-abuse-immigrant-detention-oversight |
| Geoffrey Heeren, <i>Pulling Teeth: The State of Mandatory Immigration</i> Det., 45 Harv. C.R-C.L. L. Rev. 601 (2010) |
| Heather Koball, et al., Migration Policy Inst. & Urban Inst., <i>Health</i> and Social Service Needs of U.SCitizen Children with Detained or Deported Immigrant Parents (2015), http://tinyurl.com/hxz721, 22 |
| Human Impact Partners, Family Unity, Family Health: How Family- Focused Immigration Reform Will Mean Better Health for Children and Families (2013) |
| Human Rights First, <i>Ailing Justice – New Jersey: Inadequate Health Care, Indifference, and Indefinite Confinement in Immigration Detention</i> (2018), https://www.humanrightsfirst.org/sites/default/files/Ailing-Justice-NJ.pdf |
| Human Rights First, <i>Jails and Jumpsuits: Transforming the U.S. Immigration Detention System – A Two-Year Review</i> (2011) |

| Impede Hearings for Immigrant Detainees in the United States (2011) | 20 |
|---|---------|
| Human Rights Watch, Detained and At Risk: Sexual Abuse and Harassment in United States Immigration Detention (Aug. 25, 2010) | 6 |
| Human Rights Watch, "Do You See How Much I'm Suffering Here?": Abuse Against Transgender Women In US Immigration Detention (Mar. 23, 2016) | 7 |
| Human Rights Watch, Jailing Refugees: Arbitrary Detention of Refugees in the US Who Fail to Adjust to Permanent Resident Status (2009) | 16 |
| Human Rights Watch, <i>US: Deaths in Immigration Detention</i> (July 7, 2016) | 5 |
| Human Rights Watch, Systemic Indifference: Dangerous & Substandard Medical Care in Immigration Detention 52 (2017) | 5, 6, 9 |
| Ian Urbina & Catherine Rentz, <i>Immigrants Held in Solitary Cells</i> , <i>Often for Weeks</i> , N.Y. Times, Mar. 24, 2013 | 9 |
| Ingrid V. Eagly & Steven Shafer, A Nat'l Study of Access to Counsel in Immigration Court, 164 U. Pa. L. Rev. 1 (2015) | 17, 18 |
| Jaya Ramji-Nogales et al., Refugee Roulette: Disparities in Asylum Adjudication, 60 Stan. L. Rev. 295 (2007) | 18 |
| John Marshall Law School, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enf'ts New Directive on Segregation: Why We Need Further Protections (2014) | 12 |
| Joshua Breisblatt, <i>The President's FY 2016 Budget Department of Homeland Security</i> , Nat'l Immigration Forum (Feb. 6, 2015), http://tinyurl.com/h4lmo3w | 24 |
| Juan E. Mendez , Interim Rep. of the Special Rapporteur of the Human Rights Council on Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or | |

| Degrading Treatment or Punishment, U.N. Doc. A/68/295 (Aug. 9, 2013) | 10 |
|--|----|
| Kalina Brabeck & Qingwen Xu, The Impact of Det. and Deportation on Latino Immigrant Children and Families: A Quantitative Exploration, 32 Hisp. J. of Behav. Sci. 341 (2010) | 22 |
| Kalina Brabeck et. al, <i>The Psychosocial Impact of Det. and Deportation on U.S. Migrant Children and Families</i> , 84 Am. J. of Orthopsychiatry 495 (2013) | 22 |
| Kyle Kim, <i>Immigrants Held in Remote ICE Facilities Struggle to Find Legal Aid Before They're Deported</i> , L.A. Times (Sept. 28, 2017), http://www.latimes.com/projects/la-na-access-to-counseldeportation/ | 18 |
| Leticia Miranda, <i>Dialing with Dollars: How County Jails Profit From Immigrant Detainees</i> , The Nation (May 15, 2014), https://www.thenation.com/article/dialing-dollars-how-county-jails-profit-immigrant-detainees/ | |
| Letter from Cmty. Initiatives for Visiting Immigrants in Confinement to Thomas D. Homan, Director, U.S. Immigration & Customs Enf't et al. 3 (Apr. 11, 2017), http://www.endisolation.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/05/CIVIC_SexualAssault_Complaint.pdf | 8 |
| Lisa Christensen Gee et al., Inst. on Taxation and Econ. Policy, Undocumented Immigrants' State and Local Tax Contributions (2017) | 25 |
| Manfred Nowak, Interim Rep. of the Special Rapporteur of the Human Rights Council on Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, U.N. Doc. A/63/175 (July 28, 2008) | 11 |
| Marjorie S. Zatz & Nancy Rodriguez, <i>Dreams and Nightmares:</i> Immigration Policy, Youth, and Families (2015) | 22 |
| Nat'l Prison Rape Elimination Comm'n, National Prison Rape Elimination Comm'n Report (2009) | 7 |

| Nat'l Immigrant Justice Ctr., Isolated in Detention: Limited Access to Legal Counsel in Immigration Detention Facilities Jeopardizes a Fair Day in Court (2010) | 19, 20 |
|---|--------|
| Nat'l Immigrant Justice Ctr., "What Kind of Miracle" – the Systemic Violation of Immigrants' Right to Counsel at the Cibola County Correctional Center (2017) | 19 |
| Nat'l Immigrant Justice Ctr. & Physicians for Human Rights, <i>Invisible</i> in <i>Isolation: The Use of Segregation and Solitary Confinement in Immigration Detention</i> (2012) | 9, 11 |
| Nat'l Immigration Forum, <i>Department of Homeland Security Fiscal Year (FY) 2017 Omnibus Appropriations</i> (May 9, 2017), https://tinyurl.com/y7vpdt9l | 24 |
| Nat'l Public Radio Latino USA, <i>The Strange Death of Jose de Jesus</i> , July 15, 2016 | 11 |
| N.J. Advocates for Immigrant Detainees, <i>Isolated In Essex:</i> Punishing Immigrants Through Solitary Confinement (June 2016) | 10 |
| N.Y. Lawyers for the Public Interest, <i>Detained and Denied:</i> Healthcare Access in Immigration Detention (2017) | 5, 6 |
| Nina Rabin, Disappearing Parents: Immigration Enf't and the Child Welfare System, 44 Conn. L. Rev. 99 (2011) | 23 |
| Nina Rabin, Unseen Prisoners: Women in Immigration Det. Facilities in Arizona, 23 Geo. Immigr. L.J. 695 (2009) | 20 |
| Office of Det. Oversight, U.S. Dep't of Homeland Sec., Compliance Inspection of Adelanto Correctional Facility (2012) | 5 |
| Office of Inspector Gen., U.S. Dep't of Homeland Sec., Mgmt. of Mental Health Cases in Immigration Det. (2011) | 14 |
| Org. of Am. States, Inter-American Comm'n. on Human Rights, Report on Immigration in the United States: Detention and Due | 20 |
| Process (2010) | 20 |

| Patrick G. Lee, <i>Immigrants in Detention Centers are Often Hundreds</i> of Miles From Legal Help, ProPublica (May 16, 2017), https://www.propublica.org/article/immigrants-in-detention- centers-are-often-hundreds-of-miles-from-legal-help | |
|--|--|
| Peter L. Markowitz et al., Steering Comm. of the N.Y. Immigrant Representation Study Report, <i>Accessing Justice: The Availability And Adequacy of Counsel In Removal Proceedings</i> , 33 Cardozo L. Rev. 357 (2011) | |
| Physicians for Human Rights, <i>Punishment Before Justice: Indefinite</i> Detention in the US (2011) | |
| Physicians for Human Rights & Bellevue/NYU Program for Survivors of Torture, From Persecution to Prison: The Health Consequences of Det. for Asylum Seekers (2003) | |
| Press Release, Cmty. Initiatives for Visiting Immigrants in Confinement, Watchdog Organization Files Civil Rights Complaint Alleging Rising Sexual Abuse, Assault, and Harassment in U.S. Immigration Detention Facilities (Apr. 11, 2017), http://www.endisolation.org/sexual-assault | |
| Press Release, U.S. Immigration & Customs Enf't, Dallas-area ICE detainee passes away at local hospital (April 12, 2018) | |
| Press Release, U.S. Immigration & Customs Enf't, Houston-Area Detainee Passes Away At Local Hospital (Sept. 18, 2017) | |
| Press Release, U.S. Immigration & Customs Enf't, New Immigration Det. Reform Initiatives (Oct. 6, 2009) | |
| Project South, Imprisoned Justice: Inside Two Georgia Immigrant Detention Centers (2017) | |
| Ruben Loyo & Carolyn Corrado, N.Y.U. Sch. of Law Immigrant Rights Clinic, Locked Up But Not Forgotten: Opening Access to Family & Cmty. in the Immigration Det. Sys. (2010) | |

| Sarah Rogerson, Lack of Detained Parents' Access to the Family Justice System and the Unjust Severance of the Parent- | 22 |
|---|------------|
| Child Relationship, 47 Family L.Q. 141 (2013) | 23 |
| Seth F. Wessler, <i>Nearly 250K Deportations of Parents of U.S.</i> Citizens in Just over Two Years, Colorlines (Dec. 17, 2012, 9:45 AM), http://tinyurl.com/gnv7vye | 21 |
| Seth F. Wessler, Applied Research Ctr., Shattered Families: The Perilous Intersection of Immigration Enf't and the Child Welfare Sys. (2011) | 21, 23 |
| S. Appropriations Comm., FY2017 Additional Appropriations for the Department of Homeland Security, https://tinyurl.com/ybm5cpq2 | 21 |
| Southern Poverty Law Center et al, Shadow Prisons: Immigration Detention in the South (Nov. 2016) | 10, 12, 13 |
| Spencer Woodman, <i>Exclusive: ICE put detained immigrants in solitary confinement for hunger striking</i> , The Verge (Feb. 27, 2017, 9:33 AM), https://www.theverge.com/2017/2/27/14728978/immigrant-deportation-hunger-strike-solitary-confinement-ice-trump | 10 |
| Spencer Woodman, <i>ICE Detainees are Asking to be Put in Solitary Confinement for Their Own Safety</i> , The Verge (March 10, 2017, 12:02 PM) https://www.theverge.com/2017/3/10/14873244/ice-immigrant-detention-solitary-trump-corecivic-geo | 9 |
| The Strange Death of Jose de Jesus, National Public Radio Latino USA (July 15, 2006), http://tinyurl.com/zdqv8wr | |
| Stuart Grassian, <i>Psychiatric Effects of Solitary Confinement</i> , 22 Wash. U. J.L. & Pol'y 325 (2006) | 11 |
| Susan Bibler Coutin, Confined Within: National Territories as Zones of Confinement, Political Geography (2010) | 21 |
| Susan S.Y. Li, et al., <i>The Relationship Between Post-Migration Stress</i> and <i>Psychological Disorders in Refugees and Asylum Seekers</i> , 18 Current Psychiatry Reps, no. 82 (2016) | 12, 14 |

| Tanya Golash-Boza, <i>Immigration Nation: Raids, Dets., and Deportations in Post-9/11 America</i> , 8 Soc'ys Without Borders (2012) | 5, 15 |
|--|-------|
| Todd R. Clear, Imprisoning Cmtys: How Mass Incarceration Makes Disadvantaged Neighborhoods Worse (2007) | 22 |
| TRAC Immigration, New Data on 637 Det. Facilities Used by ICE in FY2015 (Apr. 12, 2016), http://tinyurl.com/hdjzlgj | 24 |
| U.S. Dep't of Homeland Sec., <i>Budget-in-Brief: Fiscal Year 2016</i> 13 (2015), https://www.dhs.gov/publication/fy-2016-budget-brief | 24 |
| U.S. Gov't Accountability Office, GAO-07-875, Alien Det. Standards: Telephone Access Problems Were Pervasive at Detention Facilities; Other Deficiencies Did Not Show a Pattern of Noncompliance (2007) | 19 |
| U.S. Gov't Accountability Office, GAO-14-38, Immigration Det.: Additional Actions Could Strengthen DHS Efforts to Address Sexual Abuse (2013) | 7 |
| U.S. Gov't Accountability Office, GAO-15-26, Alts. to Detention: Improved Data Collection and Analyses Needed to Better Assess Program Effectiveness (Nov. 2014) | 24 |
| U.S. Gov't Accountability Office, GAO-16-231, Report to the Ranking Member, Committee on Homeland Sec., House of Representatives: Immigration Det.: Additional Actions Needed to Strengthen Mgmt. and Oversight of Detainee Medical Care (Feb. 2016) | 6 |
| U.S. Immigration & Customs Enf't, Facilitating Parental Interests in the Course of Civil Immigration Enf't Activities Directive (Aug. 23, 2013), http://tinyurl.com/j2p755s | 23 |
| U.S. Immigration & Customs Enforcement, 11065.1, Review of the Use of Segregation for ICE Detainees (2013) | 11 |
| Vera Inst. of Justice, Solitary Confinement: Common Misconceptions and Emerging Safe Alts. (May 2015) | 11 |

| Victoria Kline, Instituto para las Mujeres en la Migración, Where Do We Go From Here? Challenges Facing Transnational Migrant | |
|---|----|
| Families Between the US and Mexico (2013) | 24 |
| Wendy Cervantes & Yali Lincroft, <i>The Impact of Immigration Enf't on Child Welfare</i> (2010) | 23 |
| Women's Refugee Comm'n, Torn Apart by Immigration Enforcement: Parental Rights and Immigration Detention 10 (2010) | 23 |
| Women's Refugee Comm'n, Politicized Neglect: A Report from Etowah County Det. Center (2012) | |

STATEMENT OF INTEREST OF AMICUS CURIAE¹

Amici curiae are scholars and researchers in sociology, criminology, anthropology, psychology, geography, public health, medicine, Latin American Studies, and law, whose work relates to incarceration and detention, migrant populations, and the effect of U.S. immigration detention and removal policies on migrant populations. The amici curiae—who joined this brief as individuals, not as representatives of any institutions with which they are affiliated—are²:

Prof. Nina Rabin

Prof. Dorien Ediger-Seto

Prof. Todd R. Clear

Prof. Nestor Rodriguez

Prof. Tanya Boza

Prof. Jacqueline Hagan

Prof. Irene Bloemraad

Prof. Marjorie S. Zatz, PhD

Prof. Jonathan Simon

Prof. Rubén G. Rumbaut

Prof. Jonathan Xavier Inda

Prof. David FitzGerald

Prof. Keramet Reiter

Prof. Susan Bibler Coutin

Prof. Robert Koulish

Prof. Craig Haney

Prof. Cecilia Menjívar

Prof. Ramiro Martinez, Jr.

Prof. Tim Dunn

¹ The parties have consented to the filing of this *amicus* brief. No counsel for a party authored the brief in whole or in part. No party, counsel for a party, or any person other than *amici* and their counsel made a monetary contribution intended to fund the preparation or submission of the brief.

² Additional information on the amici is attached at Exhibit 1.

Prof. Josiah Heyman

Prof. Luis H. Zayas, PhD

Prof. Carola Suárez-Orozco, Ph.D.

Prof. Katie Dingeman

Prof. David Hernández

Prof. Susan Terrio

Prof. Nancy Hiemstra

Prof. Krista Perreira, PhD

Prof. Deborah A. Boehm

Prof. Jenna M. Loyd

Dr. Giselle Hass, ABAP

Prof. Joanna Dreby

Prof. Leo R. Chavez

Prof. Leisy J. Abrego

Prof. Leah Schmalzbauer

Prof. Ruth Gomberg-Muñoz

Dr. Alexa Koenig

Connie McGuire, PhD

Prof. Amalia Pallares

Prof. Alison Mountz

Prof. Mona Lynch

Prof. Sara Wakefield

Prof. Caitlin Patler

Prof. Emily Ryo

Prof. Kathryn Abrams

At issue is whether the District Court properly ordered that bond hearings be conducted for all class members detained by the government for longer than six months pursuant to one of the general immigration detention statutes (i.e. 8 U.S.C. §§ 1226(a), 1226(c), or 1231(a)). *Amici's* objective is not to discuss the legality of those statutes, or the preliminary injunction requiring custody reviews, but to provide the Court with an empirically grounded understanding of the distinctive harms that such prolonged detention creates and exacerbates. As scholars and

academics who have dedicated their professional lives to studying these and related matters, *Amici* are uniquely positioned to address these issues and strongly urge this Court to uphold the District Court's preliminary injunction. Both parties have consented to the filing of this brief.³

INTRODUCTION

Research demonstrates the profound negative impact prolonged incarceration⁴ has on immigrant detainees. Regardless of the statutory provision justifying a continued detention, when detention becomes prolonged, it both exacerbates the physical, mental, societal, and economic harms of transitory detention, and presents unique harms and risks of its own. Immigrants held in prolonged detention suffer physically and psychologically from substandard medical and mental health care, isolation, and increased risk of physical and sexual assault. Detainees' financial and legal interests are harmed as a result of long-term

³ No counsel for a party authored this brief in whole or in part, and no such counsel or party made a monetary contribution intended to fund the preparation or submission of this brief. No person other than the *amici* or their counsel made a monetary contribution intended to fund its preparation or submission.

⁴ Despite the legal distinction between immigrant detention and confinement as punishment for a crime, the reality of "immigration detention appears indistinguishable from criminal incarceration from the detainees' perspective." Emily Ryo, *Fostering Legal Cynicism through Immigration Detention*, 90 Southern California Law Review 999, 1029 (2017). *See also id.* at 1025 ("47% of the detainees stated that immigration detention was worse than prison/jail; 40% stated that prison/jail was worse than immigration detention; and 13% stated that the two were about the same). Therefore, this brief uses the terms "prolonged incarceration" and "prolonged detention" interchangeably.

detention. Further, prolonged incarceration destabilizes families and communities, harming society, causing lasting harm to a generation of children impacted by their family members' prolonged detention, and costing taxpayers millions of dollars.

ARGUMENT

I. Prolonged Incarceration Causes Distinctive and Irreparable Harms to Detainees.

While detention for any length of time is detrimental, individuals subject to prolonged detention suffer four types of harms—physical, psychological, economic, and legal—that differ in degree and kind from those suffered by short-term detainees.

A. Physical Harms of Prolonged Incarceration.

Long-term detainees suffer from insufficient medical care, sexual assault, the excessive use of solitary confinement, and generally poor conditions that take an increasing toll the longer one remains in custody.

Insufficient Medical Care. Numerous studies and reports have documented insufficient medical care in immigration detention facilities. A 2009 investigation led by Department of Homeland Security Special Advisor Dr. Dora Schriro identified, inter alia, systematic failures to provide adequate medical care in immigration detention facilities, and a wide disparity in the availability and quality

of care between facilities.⁵ In response to that Report, the government in 2009 announced an initiative to improve accountability and safety in detention facilities.⁶

However, in the nine years since, many of the problems continue.⁷ From October 2003 through April 2018, ICE has acknowledged the death in custody of 179 detainees.⁸ An independent medical records review of 18 of these cases concluded "substandard medical care and violations of applicable detention

⁵ Dora Schriro, U.S. Immigration & Customs Enf't, *Immigration Det. Overview and Recommendations* 25 (2009).

⁶ Press Release, U.S. Immigration & Customs Enf't, New Immigration Det. Reform Initiatives (10/6/09).

Medical and Mental Health Care Services in Immigration Detention (2018) (documenting inhumane conditions and inadequate medical and mental health care in New Jersey immigration detention centers); Human Rights Watch, Systemic Indifference: Dangerous & Substandard Medical Care in Immigration Detention 52 (2017) (comprehensively reporting on sub-standard medical care in immigration detention); N.Y. Lawyers for the Public Interest, Detained and Denied: Healthcare Access in Immigration Detention 2 (2017); Detention Watch Network, Expose and Close: One Year Later: The Absence of Accountability in Immigration Detention (2013); Human Rights First, Jails and Jumpsuits: Transforming the U.S. Immigration Det. System—A Two-Year Review (2011); Tanya Golash-Boza, Immigration Nation: Raids, Dets., and Deportations in Post-9/11 America, 8 Soc'ys Without Borders 313 (2012); Geoffrey Heeren, Pulling Teeth: The State of Mandatory Immigration Det., 45 Harv. C.R-C.L. L. Rev. 601, 602-03, 622 (2010).

⁸ Fiscal year 2017 saw 12 deaths in ICE custody, an average of one per month. Press Release, U.S. Immigration & Customs Enf't, Houston-Area Detainee Passes Away At Local Hospital (9/18/17). Four people have died in ICE custody in fiscal year 2018 so far. Press Release, U.S. Immigration & Customs Enf't, Dallas-area ICE detainee passes away at local hospital (4/12/18).

standards...probably contributed to the deaths of 7 of the 18 detainees." Other reports have found endemic deficiencies in the quality of care in immigrant detention, including underqualified medical providers; inappropriate denials, delays, and refusals of requests for critical medical care; and inadequate record-keeping. ¹⁰

A February 2016 Government Accountability Office (GAO) audit of ICE's management and oversight of immigration detention facility standards concluded that ICE still lacks adequate processes for tracking and addressing complaints of inadequate medical treatment.¹¹

Increased Risk of Sexual Abuse and Assault. Prolonged detention also increases the risk of sexual abuse and assault. Incidents of sexual abuse in the detention system are well documented.¹² In 2009, the National Prison Rape

⁹ Human Rights Watch, *US: Deaths in Immigration Det.* (7/7/16); *see also* ACLU, *Fatal Neglect: How ICE Ignores Deaths In Detention* 3 (2016) ("[i]n nearly half of the death reviews produced by ICE, the documentation suggests that failure to comply with ICE medical standards contributed"); Office of Det. Oversight, U.S. Dep't of Homeland Sec., Compliance Inspection of Adelanto Correctional Facility 2 (2012) (finding "egregious errors" by medical staff led to detainee's death).

¹⁰ Systemic Indifference, at 52; NY. Lawyers for Public Interest, at 2; Ailing Justice, at 6-7.

¹¹ GAO-16-231, Report to the Ranking Member, Committee on Homeland Sec., House of Representatives: Immigration Det.: Additional Actions Needed to Strengthen Management and Oversight of Detainee Medical Care (Feb. 2016).

¹² See, e.g., David Kaiser & Lovisa Stannow, *Immigrant Detainees: The New Sex Abuse Crisis*, NYR Daily (11/23/11); Human Rights Watch, *Detained and At*

Elimination Commission found that immigration detainees are especially vulnerable to sexual abuse due to several factors, including isolation, inadequate investigative procedures, and that they are "confined by the same agency with the power to deport them" and as such, often fear retaliatory deportation for reporting misconduct.¹³ These risks are more acute for certain subpopulations, including transgender detainees.¹⁴

In 2013, the GAO conducted a study on sexual abuse and assault in immigration detention facilities and found that ICE did not maintain complete records regarding sexual abuse and assault incidents, and that up to 40% of sexual abuse and assault allegations were not reported to ICE headquarters as required by agency procedures. The report substantiated 15 incidents of sexual assault in ICE facilities from October 2009 through March 2013 —almost certainly a gross understatement of actual incidents given the lack of

Risk: Sexual Abuse and Harassment in United States Immigration Detention

Risk: Sexual Abuse and Harassment in United States Immigration Detention (8/25/10).

¹³ National Prison Rape Elimination Comm'n Report 177-81 (2009).

¹⁴ Human Rights Watch, "Do You See How Much I'm Suffering Here?": Abuse Against Transgender Women in U.S. Immigration Detention 14 (3/23/16) ("[T]hree out of fifteen substantiated incidents of sexual assault in U.S. immigration detention facilities involved transgender women").

¹⁵ GAO-14-38, *Immigration Det.: Additional Actions Could Strengthen DHS Efforts to Address Sexual Abuse* 25 (2013).

¹⁶ *Id.* at 1, 19.

¹⁷ *Id.* at 60-62.

documentation.

In another review of government data, DHS Office of the Inspector General records reveal that between January 2010 and July 2016, the OIG received "33,126 complaints of sexual and/or physical abuse against DHS component agencies." Of the 14,693 complaints lodged against ICE, 19 the OIG investigated just 173.20

In 2014, nearly a decade after passage of the Prison Rape Elimination Act (PREA), DHS issued regulations implementing the Act's protections against sexual abuse in custody.²¹ However, the regulations will not be enforced at facilities operated by local sheriffs or private contractors—which together house the vast majority of ICE detainees—until the underlying detention contracts are renegotiated.²² As a result, it may be years before long-term detainees will be fully covered by the PREA regulations. Informal barriers to preventing and reporting sexual abuse in DHS facilities—such as retaliatory loss of privileges—may also

¹⁸ Letter from Cmty. Initiatives for Visiting Immigrants in Confinement to Thomas D. Homan, Director, U.S. Immigration & Customs Enf't (4/11/17).

¹⁹ *Id.* at 4.

²⁰ Press Release, Cmty. Initiatives for Visiting Immigrants in Confinement, Watchdog Organization Files Civil Rights Complaint Alleging Rising Sexual Abuse, Assault, and Harassment in U.S. Immigration Detention Facilities (4/11/17).

²¹ Standards To Prevent, Detect, and Respond to Sexual Abuse and Assault in Confinement Facilities, 79 Fed. Reg. 13100 (3/7/14).

²² 79 Fed. Reg. at 13104 n.6.

allow abuse to remain hidden.²³

Frequent Reliance on and Abusive Use of Solitary Confinement. Another serious risk to the health and safety of long-term detainees is the use of solitary confinement, which ICE typically calls "segregation." As of 2013, an average of 300 immigrants were held in solitary confinement at the 50 largest detention facilities on any given day. While the Schriro Report raised concerns about the use of segregation "to detain special populations whose unique medical, mental health, and protective custody requirements cannot be accommodated in general population housing" in 2009, 25 recent reports reveal ICE continues to misuse solitary as long-term treatment for suicidal or mentally ill detainees. 26

Segregation is also overused for disciplinary purposes, often in ways that

²³ Erika Eichelberger, *Watchdog: Feds Are Muzzling Us for Reporting Alleged Immigrant Detainee Sex Abuse*, Mother Jones (3/19/14).

²⁴ Ian Urbina & Catherine Rentz, *Immigrants Held in Solitary Cells, Often for Weeks*, N.Y. Times, 3/24/13, at A1.

²⁵ Schriro, at 21; *See also*, Nat'l Immigrant Justice Ctr. & Physicians for Human Rights, *Invisible in Isolation: The Use of Segregation and Solitary Confinement in Immigration Detention* 4 (2012) (documenting similar findings on a national scale).

²⁶ Systemic Indifference at 40. See also Spencer Woodman, ICE Detainees are Asking to be Put in Solitary Confinement for Their Own Safety, The Verge (3/10/17) (documenting widespread use of solitary confinement in immigration detention centers). A recent analysis of FOIA data from ICE on all cases of solitary confinement in the San Francisco and Los Angeles areas from September 2013 to September 2016 found solitary confinement continues to be used in many facilities. Caitlin Patler, Solitary Confinement Practices in a Subset of U.S. Immigrant Detention, Journal of Population Research (forthcoming 2018).

violate ICE's own policies. One report found a detention facility in New Jersey overused solitary confinement by "stacking" disciplinary charges (charging multiple offenses for a single incident) and imposing solitary confinement during prehearing detention before any finding of misconduct.²⁷ Solitary confinement has also been used to punish detainees participating in hunger strikes in protest of detention center conditions, or for assisting other detainees to file grievances.²⁸ Detainees have even been sent to solitary confinement due to lack of bed space in the general housing population.²⁹

It is well established that this type of isolation exacerbates physical and mental health problems.³⁰ Solitary confinement can lead to a combination of

N.J. Advocates for Immigrant Detainees, *Isolated In Essex: Punishing Immigrants Through Solitary Confinement* 23-24 (June 2016).

Spencer Woodman, Exclusive: ICE put detained immigrants in solitary confinement for hunger striking, The Verge (9/27/17). See also Southern Poverty Law Center, Shadow Prisons: Immigration Detention in the South 8 (Nov. 2016) (review of six immigration detention facilities in the southern United States); Ailing Justice at 6 ("While facility staff stated that the most common reason for segregation is violence towards other detainees or staff, detainees reported being placed in segregation for filing grievances or requesting medical assistance, participating in hunger strikes, or not standing during count. Many people said they feared that they would be placed in segregation in retaliation for speaking to our group"); Ryo, at 1033.

²⁹ Shadow Prisons, at 32.

³⁰ Juan E. Mendez, Interim Rep. of the Special Rapporteur of the Human Rights Council on Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, U.N. Doc. A/68/295 (8/9/13); Craig Haney, Mental Health Issues in

symptoms referred to as "prison psychosis," including hypersensitivity to external stimuli, hallucinations, panic attacks, obsessive thoughts, paranoia, and lack of impulse control.³¹ Solitary confinement can lead to severe symptoms, even among those with no prior history of mental illness.³² Suicide and self-harm are also more common in solitary confinement than general prison populations.³³ Because solitary confinement can exacerbate existing mental health conditions, the United Nations Special Rapporteur on Torture believes that solitary confinement constitutes cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment.³⁴

In 2013, ICE acknowledged the problem, establishing procedures for reviewing detainees placed in segregation and outlining stricter requirements for

Long-Term Solitary and "Supermax" Confinement, 49 Crime & Delinquency 124, 124-56 (2003).

³¹ *Invisible in Isolation, supra*, at 12.

³² Stuart Grassian, *Psychiatric Effects of Solitary Confinement*, 22 Wash. U. J.L. & Pol'y 325, 328 (2006).

Wera Inst. of Justice, Solitary Confinement: Common Misconceptions and Emerging Safe Alternatives, 17-18 (May 2015) (reporting that 69% of suicides among incarcerated individuals in California in 2006 took place in segregated housing); see also The Strange Death of Jose de Jesus, National Public Radio Latino USA (7/15/16) (chronicling suicide of detainee in isolation who was taken off suicide watch 24 hours after prior suicide attempt); Davis v. Ayala, 135 S. Ct. 2187, 2210 (2015) (Kennedy, J., concurring) ("[R]esearch still confirms what this Court suggested over a century ago: Years on end of near-total isolation exact a terrible price.").

³⁴ Manfred Nowak, *Interim Rep. of the Special Rapporteur of the Human Rights Council on Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment*, U.N. Doc. A/63/175 (7/28/08).

disciplinary segregation.³⁵ However, the revised standards suffer from compliance problems, including that not all facilities' contracts require compliance with the updated procedures.³⁶ ICE has resisted attempts to make those contracts and inspection reports publicly available,³⁷ and DHS recently disbanded the office responsible for implementing the segregation directive.³⁸

B. Psychological Harms of Prolonged Detention.

People in detention for prolonged periods suffer severe and lasting psychological harms. All detainees face uncertainty about when or whether they will be released, which frequently leads to high rates of anxiety, despair, and depression.³⁹ When detention is prolonged, these feelings become more pronounced and often manifest as diagnosable mental health conditions.⁴⁰ A longitudinal study of asylum seekers detained in the United States found that symptoms of depression, anxiety and PTSD all improved in those released from detention, while symptoms deteriorated in those who remained detained, despite

³⁵ U.S. Immigration & Customs Enf't, 11065.1, *Review of the Use of Segregation for ICE Detainees* (2013).

³⁶ John Marshall Law School, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enf'ts New Directive on Segregation: Why We Need Further Protections 7 (2014).

³⁷ Shadow Prisons, at 9.

³⁸ Caitlin Dickerson, *Trump Plan Would Curtail Protection for Detained Immigrants*, N.Y. Times (4/13/17).

³⁹ Physicians for Human Rights, *Punishment Before Justice: Indefinite Detention in the U.S.* 11 (2011).

⁴⁰ *Id*. at 16.

there being no difference in symptom severity between the groups at baseline.⁴¹ Another study concluded that detention without a definite endpoint—the characteristic of all prolonged incarceration for immigrant detainees, including every class member—results in "physical, social and emotional problems [that] continue to plague individuals long after their release..."

The mental toll of detention is exacerbated in facilities that have physical infrastructures and program offerings generally designed for inmates who are expected to remain in custody for a year or less. Many detainees have described being detained for prolonged periods under these conditions as difficult to bear. Detained immigrants have reported conditions that can lead to rapid mental and physical decline, including lack of outdoor recreation areas, activities, and

⁴¹ Susan S.Y. Li, et al., *The Relationship Between Post-Migration Stress and Psychological Disorders in Refugees and Asylum Seekers*, 18 Current Psychiatry Reps, no. 82, 2016, at 3.

⁴² Punishment Before Justice, at 17. See also Ryo, at 1031 ("Given this psychological burden [due to the indefinite nature of detention], José B. concluded: 'You know, I would have preferred to get ten years in prison than another year in detention."").

⁴³ Physicians for Human Rights & Bellevue/NYU Program for Survivors of Torture, *From Persecution to Prison: The Health Consequences of Det. for Asylum Seekers* 10-14, 126 (2003) (immigrant detainees "reported feeling degraded and being treated like criminals" and described the negative impact this treatment had on their mental health).

⁴⁴ *Id.*; see also Women's Refugee Comm'n, Politicized Neglect: A Report from Etowah County Detention Center 5 (2012).

religious accommodations.⁴⁵ Other aspects of detention that may negatively impact mental health include the lack of access to legal services, proximity to others experiencing high levels of distress, lack of agency, lack of control over case processing times, and separation from family.⁴⁶

Nor are detention facilities equipped to provide quality mental health care to long-term detainees. In fact, detention facilities often use solitary confinement to respond to individuals with mental health needs rather than providing care. A 2011 DHS Inspector General report found that the ICE Health Service Corps, which provides direct care and arranges for outside health care services to detainees, staffed "only 18 of the nearly 250 detention centers nationwide and has limited oversight and monitoring for mental health cases across immigration detention centers." This report raised serious concerns about ICE's capacity to provide detainees with proper treatment. The high rate of suicides among detainees

⁴⁵ Shadow Prisons, at 6.

⁴⁶ Li et al., at 3.

⁴⁷ Office of Inspector Gen., U.S. Dep't of Homeland Sec., *Mgmt. of Mental Health Cases in Immigration Det.* 1 (2011).

⁴⁸ *Id.* This concern is even greater for detainees with pre-existing mental illnesses who either go untreated or receive "one size fits all" medication. *See id.* at 5 (noting that the Health Service Corps lacks a mechanism for screening and tracking mental health conditions of detainees).

underscores the urgent nature of these concerns.⁴⁹ One psychologist reviewing the conditions at a New Jersey detention center concluded that the facility's suicide watch system itself "appears to act as a contributor to suicide, with one woman even stating, 'If they put me in the suicide room, I'll kill myself."⁵⁰

While all long-term detainees face the prospect of lasting psychological harm, ⁵¹ asylum-seekers and other torture and trauma survivors confront particularly severe mental health challenges. One study of detained asylum-seekers found that 77% showed clinically significant symptoms of anxiety, 86% exhibited symptoms of depression, and 50% suffered from symptoms of PTSD. ⁵² Of these, 26% reported thoughts of suicide while in detention, and just under 3% reported attempting suicide. ⁵³

C. Economic Harms of Prolonged Detention.

"The time spent in jail awaiting trial...often means loss of a job; it disrupts

⁴⁹ Alex Friedmann, 32 Deaths at CCA-operated Immigration Det. Facilities Include at Least 7 Suicides, Prison Legal News (6/20/15).

⁵⁰ Ailing Justice, at 10.

⁵¹ See, e.g., Golash-Boza, at 65 (recounting how substandard medical care during prolonged detention resulted in an immigrant suffering serious health problems); Heeren, at 601-03, 622 (same).

⁵² Allen Keller et al., *Mental Health of Detained Asylum Seekers*, 362 Lancet 1721, 1722 (2003).

⁵³ Conversely, detainees who exhibited symptoms of anxiety, depression, and PTSD while detained showed significant improvement after release. *Id.*; *see also* Ctr. for Victims of Torture et al., *Tortured & Detained: Survivor Stories of U.S. Immigration Detention* 5 (2013) at 12.

family life; and it enforces idleness....The time spent in jail is simply dead time...." *Barker v. Wingo*, 407 U.S. 514, 532-33 (1972). The economic hardship imposed from being unable to work for long periods of time is clear.⁵⁴ Immigrants in extended detention almost invariably lose their jobs, and thus income for necessities, including food and shelter for their families. Some also lose their homes through foreclosure.⁵⁵ For those fortunate enough to be able to hire a lawyer, the inability to work while incurring legal expenses compounds the economic harm.⁵⁶

A recent study surveyed 562 individuals in California who had been detained for six months or longer. Approximately 90% were employed in the six months prior to their detention; based on their pre-detention earnings, the estimated lost wages for the sample due to detention was \$43,357 per day.⁵⁷ As a

⁵⁴ Ajay Chaudry et al., The Urban Inst., *Facing Our Future: Children in the Aftermath of Immigration Enf't* 27 (2010) (noting families "generally lose[] a breadwinner" during immigration detention); Human Rights Watch, *Jailing Refugees: Arbitrary Detention of Refugees in the US Who Fail to Adjust to Permanent Resident Status* 36 (2009) (noting detention of refugees "results in loss of jobs").

⁵⁵ Heeren, at 622 (immigrant lost home as result of three-year detention); *see also* Chaudry, at 29-31.

⁵⁶ Nat'l Ctr. for Immigrants Rights, Inc. v. INS, 743 F.2d 1365, 1369 (9th Cir. 1984) (the "hardship from being unable to work . . . to pay for legal representation is beyond question").

⁵⁷ Caitlin Patler, UCLA Inst. for Research on Labor and Emp't, *The Economic Impacts of Long-Term Immigration Detention in Southern California* (2015). *See also* Caitlin Patler & Tanya M. Golash-Boza, *The Fiscal and Human Costs of*

consequence of lost wages, families of detained immigrants suffer substantial financial instability. The same study documented that 63% of family members had difficulty paying mortgage, rent, or utilities.⁵⁸ Over one-third of families had trouble paying for food.⁵⁹

Due to the stigma associated with detention, an individual's ability to work can also extend past their release. Employers may avoid hiring formerly detained immigrants because they are afraid of administrative complications with ICE.⁶⁰

D. Legal Harms of Prolonged Detention.

Prolonged detention inflicts substantial harm on an individual's access to and exercise of legal rights, including the "ability to gather evidence, contact witnesses, or otherwise prepare his defense." *Barker*, 407 U.S. at 533. The vast majority of detainees—86% nationally—lack counsel in immigration proceedings. ⁶¹ Long-term detainees are at a distinct disadvantage as many are held

Immigrant Detention and Deportation in the United States, 11 Sociology Compass, 2017, at 1-9.

⁵⁸ Patler, *The Economic Impacts of Long-Term Immigration Detention*, at 4.

⁵⁹ *Id.* at 4.

⁶⁰ See Chaudry et al., at 28.

⁶¹ See Ingrid V. Eagly & Steven Shafer, A National Study of Access to Counsel in Immigration Court, 164 U. Pa. L. Rev., no. 1, 2015, at 8. See also Separate Representation for Custody and Bond Proceedings, 79 Fed. Reg. 55659, 55659-60 (proposed 9/17/14) (to be codified at 8 C.F.R. pt. 1003) ("Of the 265,708 initial case completions for detained aliens from FY 2011 to FY 2013, 210,633 aliens, or 79 percent, were unrepresented.").

in remote locations far from legal services, with limited ability to seek or pay for representation.⁶²

Recent studies document the dramatic difference a lawyer makes: detained immigrants with counsel obtained a successful outcome in 21% of cases, ten-and-a-half times greater than the 2% rate for their *pro se* counterparts.⁶³ A nationwide study concluded that whether an asylum seeker is represented is the single most important factor affecting their outcome.⁶⁴ In the context of bond itself, one study

⁶² See e.g., Jails and Jumpsuits, at 31 (almost 40% of ICE detention bed space is located more than 60 miles from an urban center); Peter L. Markowitz et al., Steering Comm. of the N.Y. Immigrant Representation Study Report, Accessing Justice: The Availability And Adequacy of Counsel In Removal Proceedings, 33 Cardozo L. Rev. 357, 369 (2011) (study of detainees in New York concluded representation rates for detainees transferred out of state were "dismal"); ABA, Comm'n on Immigration, Reforming the Immigration System: Proposals to Promote Independence, Fairness, Efficiency, and Professionalism in the Adjudication of Removal Cases 5-9 (2010) ("remote facilities...and the practice of transferring detainees from one facility to another, often more remote, location without notice stand in the way of retaining counsel for many detainees"); Kyle Kim, Immigrants Held in Remote ICE Facilities Struggle to Find Legal Aid Before They're Deported, L.A. Times (9/29/17) ("About 30% of detained immigrants are held in facilities more than 100 miles from the nearest government-listed legal aid resource....Of these, the median distance between the facilities and the nearest government-listed legal aid was 56 miles.").

⁶³ Eagly & Shafer, at 50 fig. 14; *see also* Markowitz et al., at 363 (from 2005 to 2011 non-detained immigrants with lawyers had successful outcomes 74% of the time, vs. only 3 % for those without counsel); ABA Comm'n, at 5-8 ("[T]he disparity in outcomes of immigration proceedings depending on whether noncitizens are unrepresented or represented is striking.").

⁶⁴ Jaya Ramji-Nogales et al., *Refugee Roulette: Disparities in Asylum Adjudication*, 60 Stan. L. Rev. 295, 340 (2007) ("Represented asylum seekers were

revealed that "the odds of being granted bond are more than 3.5 times higher for detainees represented by attorneys than those who appeared *pro se*, net of other relevant factors." ⁶⁵

Irrespective of whether a detainee has legal counsel, the circumstances of long-term detention render effective representation difficult, if not impossible.⁶⁶ One major obstacle is the limited access to telephones in most detention facilities.⁶⁷ Assuming a detainee is able to locate counsel, the detainee must often pay to make phone calls, a cost many find prohibitive.⁶⁸ A national survey of detention facilities

granted asylum at a rate of 45.6%, almost three times as high as the 16.3% grant rate for those without legal counsel."); see also ABA Comm'n at 5-8.

⁶⁵ Emily Ryo, *Detained: A Study of Immigration Bond Hearings*, 50 Law & Soc'y Rev. 117, 119 (2016)

⁶⁶ See, e.g., Project South, *Imprisoned Justice: Inside Two Georgia Immigrant Detention Centers* 28-30, 42-43 (2017) (describing severe restrictions on confidential attorney visitation, mail problems, and a lack of phone access in two facilities); Nat'l Immigrant Justice Ctr., "What Kind of Miracle..." – the Systemic Violation of Immigrants' Right to Counsel at the Cibola County Correctional Center 2 (2017).

⁶⁷ See Nat'l Immigrant Justice Ctr., Isolated in Detention: Limited Access to Legal Counsel in Immigration Detention Facilities Jeopardizes a Fair Day in Court 4 (2010) (reporting widespread problems with phone access); see also GAO-07-875, Alien Det. Standards: Telephone Access Problems Were Pervasive at Detention Facilities; Other Deficiencies Did Not Show a Pattern of Noncompliance 15-17 (2007) (discussing deficiencies with phone system).

⁶⁸ See, e.g., Ruben Loyo & Carolyn Corrado, N.Y.U. Sch. of Law Immigrant Rights Clinic, Locked Up But Not Forgotten: Opening Access to Family & Community in the Immigration Detention System 23 (2010); Leticia Miranda, Dialing with Dollars: How County Jails Profit From Immigrant Detainees, The Nation (5/15/14); Ryo, Fostering Legal Cynicism, at 1039-40

found that many prohibited private calls between lawyers and their detained clients, and in several cases, even leaving messages was impossible.⁶⁹ Mail communication is also slow, costly, and an unreliable means of communication for long-term detainees, who are frequently transferred from one facility to another: between 1998 and 2010, 52% of detainees were transferred at least once, and 46% were moved multiple times.⁷⁰ With no reliable mail forwarding, mail intended for detainees is often returned or lost. Furthermore, despite standards requiring access to legal resources, those actually provided are often inadequate.⁷¹ When detainees struggle to obtain the assistance necessary to mount an effective defense, the result

⁶⁹ *Isolated in Detention*, at 9.

⁷⁰ See Human Rights Watch, A Costly Move: Far and Frequent Transfers Impede Hearings for Immigrant Detainees in the United States 1, 17 (2011). See also Patrick G. Lee, Immigrants in Detention Centers are Often Hundreds of Miles From Legal Help, ProPublica (5/16/17) (detainee transferred between five detention facilities in four states before ICE held him in a facility four hours from his attorney's office, where access to legal phone calls was sometimes limited to 15 minutes per call due to high demand).

⁷¹ See Schriro, at 23; Org. of Am. States, Inter-American Comm'n. on Human Rights, Report on Immigration in the United States: Detention and Due Process 117 (2010); Nina Rabin, Unseen Prisoners: Women in Immigration Detention Facilities in Arizona, 23 Geo. Immigr. L.J. 695, 728 (2009) (finding multiple Arizona detention facilities fail to comply with detention standards providing for access to legal resources like law libraries); Fostering Legal Cynicism, at 1038 ("with respect to materials available through the detention facility law libraries, about 37% of detainees found it "difficult/very difficult" to access hard copies of legal materials, and 39% found it "difficult/very difficult" to access electronic legal materials"); Id., at 1040 ("detainees found that they often lacked the basic foundation necessary to understand the legal materials found at the law libraries, and the libraries did not offer basic materials or assistance that would enable them to develop this foundational knowledge.")

is an overall increase in the total time spent in detention. The prolonged struggle also results in detainees abandoning meritorious claims because they cannot stand the continued toll of detention.⁷²

II. Prolonged Detention Harms the Families of Detainees, Including U.S.-Citizen Children.

Prolonged detention adversely affects detainees' families, especially children, many of whom are U.S. citizens.⁷³ Between 1998 and 2010, detained immigrants were transported an average of 370 miles to a detention facility, making regular contact with their families virtually impossible.⁷⁴ A recent study of immigration detention visitation found that visits were less likely for detainees at privately-contracted facilities than public ones, suggesting that both restrictive visitation policies and geography undermine detainee access to family visits.⁷⁵

⁷² Susan Bibler Coutin, *Confined Within: National Territories as Zones of Confinement*, Political Geography 29, 204 (2010) (detained who won his case but gave up during the government's appeal because of the prolonged detention).

One report estimated that between one-fifth and one-quarter of the 3.7 million people deported between 2003 and 2013 had U.S. citizen children. Heather Koball et al., Migration Policy Inst. & Urban Inst., *Health and Social Service Needs of U.S.-Citizen Children with Detained or Deported Immigrant Parents* (2015); see also Seth F. Wessler, *Nearly 250K Deportations of Parents of U.S. Citizens in Just over Two Years*, Colorlines (12/17/12).

⁷⁴ Seth F. Wessler, Applied Research Ctr., *Shattered Families: The Perilous Intersection of Immigration Enforcement and the Child Welfare System* 5 (2011); *see also* Loyo & Corrado, at 1, 9.

⁷⁵ Caitlin Patler & Nicholas Branic, *Legal Status and Patterns of Family Visitation During Immigration Detention*, 3 Russell Sage J. of the Soc. Scis.

Children suffer the most acute effects. Increased anxiety, stress, and depression have been documented in children with a parent detained.⁷⁶ An Urban Institute study found that children whose parent or parents were held in immigration detention for long periods were more likely to exhibit adverse changes in sleeping habits and behavior, including increased anger and withdrawal, as compared with children who were reunited with their parents within a month of apprehension.⁷⁷ The harmful effects extend to children's well-being in other areas, including academic performance.⁷⁸ Recent research indicates that immigration detention is one of multiple factors that combine to make impacted children more prone to behavioral and emotional problems throughout their lives.⁷⁹

^{(2017).} See also Schriro, at 23-24; Loyo & Corrado, at 12 fig.1; Jails and Jumpsuits, at 9.

⁷⁶ Marjorie S. Zatz & Nancy Rodriguez, *Dreams and Nightmares: Immigration Policy, Youth, and Families* 86 (2015) (summarizing this research); *see also* Koball et al., at 5 (children with detained or deported parents "refused to eat, pulled out their hair, or had persistent stomachaches or headaches. Others turned to more self-destructive outlets such as cutting themselves or abusing substances.")

⁷⁷ Chaudry et al., at 43. (Ten parents in the population tracked by the Urban Institute study were detained up to one month and 18 parents were detained longer than one month.)

⁷⁸ Kalina Brabeck & Qingwen Xu, *The Impact of Det. and Deportation on Latino Immigrant Children and Families: A Quantitative Exploration*, 32 Hisp. J. of Behav. Sci. 341 (2010); Todd R. Clear, *Imprisoning Communities: How Mass Incarceration Makes Disadvantaged Neighborhoods Worse* 97 (2007).

⁷⁹ Kalina Brabeck et. al, *The Psychosocial Impact of Detention and Deportation on U.S. Migrant Children and Families*, 84 Am. J. of Orthopsychiatry 495, 498-99 (2013) (summarizing this research); Human Impact Partners, *Family*

For some parents, prolonged detention has resulted in their children being removed from the family entirely and placed in foster care. A 2011 study estimated that at least 5,100 children whose parents had been either detained or deported were living in foster care. ⁸⁰ In addition, detained parents struggle to meet court mandates set by the child welfare system, including visits and parenting classes. ⁸¹ Due to state and federal timelines established to ensure permanent homes for children in government custody, detainees may lose their parental rights as a result of prolonged detention. ⁸² While ICE has taken some steps to address this, ⁸³ the Department of Health & Human Services has noted that child welfare agencies continue to regularly encounter children whose parents are subject to prolonged detention. ⁸⁴

Unity, Family Health: How Family-Focused Immigration Reform Will Mean Better Health for Children and Families (2013).

⁸⁰ Wessler, Applied Research Ctr., at 4.

⁸¹ Nina Rabin, *Disappearing Parents: Immigration Enforcement and the Child Welfare System*, 44 Conn. L. Rev. 99, 140 (2011).

⁸² Id.; see also Wessler, Applied Research Ctr., at 8; Sarah Rogerson, Lack of Detained Parents' Access to the Family Justice System and the Unjust Severance of the Parent-Child Relationship, 47 Family L.Q. 141, 141-72 (2013); Women's Refugee Comm'n, Torn Apart by Immigration Enforcement: Parental Rights and Immigration Detention 10 (2010); Wendy Cervantes & Yali Lincroft, The Impact of Immigration Enforcement on Child Welfare 6 (2010).

⁸³ U.S. Immigration & Customs Enf't, Facilitating Parental Interests in the Course of Civil Immigration Enforcement Activities Directive (8/23/13).

⁸⁴ Admin. On Children, Youth & Families, U.S. Dep't of Health & Human Servs., ACYF-CB-IM-15-02, Case Planning and Service Delivery for Families

III. Prolonged Detention Harms Society.

The costs of prolonged detention are staggering. Between FY 1995 and FY 2016, the average daily immigration detention population grew from 7,475 to 32,985. A total of 367,774 individuals were in ICE custody at some point during FY 2015. To detain this extraordinary number, DHS requested \$2.407 billion in its FY 2016 budget proposal. This amounts to more than \$6.5 million per day, at an estimated daily cost of \$158 per detainee. Funding—and detention space—increased in FY 2017, when ICE was appropriated over \$2.5 billion to detain 39,324 people on any given day. The staggering is staggering. Between FY 1995 and FY 2016 to detain an estimated of 367,774 individuals were in ICE custody at some point during FY 2015. The staggering is staggering in ICE and FY 2016 budget proposal. The staggering is staggering in ICE and FY 2016 budget proposal. The staggering is staggering in ICE and FY 2016 budget proposal. The staggering is staggering in ICE and FY 2016 budget proposal. The staggering is staggering in ICE and FY 2016 budget proposal. The staggering is staggering in ICE and FY 2016 budget proposal. The staggering is staggering in ICE and FY 2016 budget proposal. The staggering is staggering in ICE and FY 2016 budget proposal. The staggering is staggering in ICE and FY 2016 budget proposal. The staggering is staggering in ICE and FY 2016 budget proposal in ICE and

with Parents and Legal Guardians who are Detained or Deported by Immigration Enforcement (2/20/15); see also Victoria Kline, Instituto para las Mujeres en la Migración, Where Do We Go From Here? Challenges Facing Transnational Migrant Families Between the US and Mexico 31-32 (2013).

⁸⁵ ACLU, Shutting Down the Profiteers: Why and How the Department of Homeland Security Should Stop Using Private Prisons 7-8 (Sept. 2016) (noting the population in June 2016 was closer to 37,000).

⁸⁶ TRAC Immigration, New Data on 637 Detention Facilities Used by ICE in FY2015 (4/12/16).

⁸⁷ U.S. Dep't of Homeland Sec., *Budget-in-Brief: Fiscal Year 2016* 13 (2015); Joshua Breisblatt, *The President's FY 2016 Budget Department of Homeland Security*, Nat'l Immigration Forum (2/6/15).

⁸⁸ GAO-15-26, Alternatives to Detention: Improved Data Collection and Analyses Needed to Better Assess Program Effectiveness 9-12, 19 (Nov. 2014).

⁸⁹ Nat'l Immigration Forum, *Department of Homeland Security Fiscal Year* (FY) 2017 Omnibus Appropriations (5/9/17).

⁹⁰ S. Appropriations Comm., FY2017 Additional Appropriations for the Department of Homeland Security.

Detaining productive, contributing members of society also imposes opportunity costs. Immigrants, regardless of status, pay property and sales taxes, and many pay income taxes. A 2017 study found that households headed by unauthorized immigrants—not including authorized immigrants—contributed approximately \$11.74 billion in state and local taxes. Prolonged detention compromises these substantial revenues, which in Michigan alone amount to \$86,692,000 each year.

CONCLUSION

As the research attests, prolonged detention enacts enormous harm on immigrant detainees, their family members, and society as a whole. The District Court's preliminary injunction requiring individualized review of class members' detention should be affirmed.

Dated: April 19, 2018 Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Jill M. Wheaton
Jill M. Wheaton
Dykema Gossett PLLC
2723 S. State St., Ste. 400
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
(734) 214-7629
jwheaton@dykema.com

⁹¹ Lisa Christensen Gee et al., Inst. on Taxation and Econ. Policy, *Undocumented Immigrants' State and Local Tax Contributions* 2 (2017).

⁹² *Id.* at 6 (considering personal income taxes, property taxes, and sales taxes).

⁹³ *Id.* at 3 table 1.

Nina Rabin (AZ Bar # 025246)
Dorien Ediger-Seto (AZ Bar # 034192)
JAMES E. ROGERS
COLLEGE OF LAW,
UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA
1145 N. Mountain Ave.
Tucson, AZ 85719
(520) 621-9206
rabin@email.arizona.edu

Counsel for Amici Curiae

<u>CERTIFICATION OF COMPLIANCE WITH TYPE-VOLUME</u> LIMITATION, TYPEFACE, AND TYPE STYLE REQUIREMENTS

- 1. This brief complies with the type-volume limitation of Fed. R. App. P. 32(a)(7)(B) because:
 - X This brief contains 6,203 words, excluding the parts of the brief exempted by Fed. R. App. P. 32(a)(7)(B)(iii).
- 2. This brief complies with the typeface requirements of Fed. R. App. P. 32(a)(5) and the type style requirements of Fed. R. App. P. 32(a)(6) because:
 - X This brief has been prepared in a proportionally spaced typeface using Microsoft Word with 14 Times New Roman.

Dated: April 19, 2018 Respectfully submitted,

DYKEMA GOSSETT PLLC

By: /s/Jill M. Wheaton

Jill M. Wheaton (P49921)

2723 S. State St., Ste. 400

Ann Arbor, MI 48104

(734) 214-7629

jwheaton@dykema.com

Attorney for Defendants-Appellees

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on April 19, 2018, I electronically filed the foregoing paper with the Clerk of the Court using the ECF system which will send notification of such filing to all ECF participants.

By: /s/ Jill M. Wheaton

Jill M. Wheaton (P49921)
Counsel for Defendant - Appellee
DYKEMA GOSSETT PLLC
2723 South State Street, Suite 400
Ann Arbor, MI 48104
(734) 214-7629
jwheaton@dykema.com

EXHIBIT 1.

Amici Curiae

(institutions provided by identification purposes only)

1. Nina Rabin

Director, Bacon Immigration Law and Policy Program

James E. Rogers

College of Law Univ. of Arizona

1145 N. Mountain Ave.

Tucson, AZ 85719

2. Dorien Ediger-Seto

Fellow, Bacon Immigration Law and Policy Program

James E. Rogers

College of Law Univ. of Arizona

1145 N. Mountain Ave.

Tucson, AZ 85719

3. Prof. Todd R. Clear

University Professor of Criminal Justice

Rutgers University

123 Washington Street

Newark, NJ 07102

4. Prof. Nestor P. Rodriguez

Professor of Sociology

Dept. of Sociology

University of Texas at Austin 305 E. 23rd Street, A1700, CLA 3.306

Austin, TX 78712

5. Prof. Tanya Golash Boza

Associate Professor

School of Social Sciences,

Humanities and Arts

University of California, Merced

5200 North Lake Road

Chicago, IL 60660

6. Prof. Jacqueline M. Hagan

Professor of Sociology

Department of Sociology

University of North Carolina

at Chapel Hill

Chapel Hill, NC 27599

7. Prof. Irene Bloemraad Department of Sociology University of California, Berkeley 410 Barrows Hall Berkeley, CA 94720-1980

8. Prof. Marjorie S. Zatz, Ph.D. Vice Provost and Graduate Dean Professor of Sociology University of California, Merced 5200 N. Lake Rd., Merced CA 95343

Pro. Jonathan Simon Adrian A. Kragen Professor of Law Faculty Director, Center for the Study of Law & Society University of California Berkeley, School of Law Berkely, CA 94720

Prof. Ruben G. Rumbaut Distinguished Professor of Sociology, Criminology, Law and Society University of California, Irvine Irvine, CA 92697

11. Prof. Jonathan Xavier Inda Chair, Department of Latina/Latino Studies University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign 1207 W. Oregon Street, M/C 136 Urbana, IL 61801

Prof. David FitzGerald Professor of Sociology Co-Director of the Center for Comparative Immigration Studies University of California, San Diego

13. Prof. Keramet Reiter Assistant Professor Criminology, Law and Society and School of Law University of California, Irvine 3373 Social Ecology II Irvine, CA 92697-7080

14. Prof. Susan Bibler Coutin

Professor of Criminology,

Law & Society and Anthropology

Dept. of Criminology, Law & Society

School of Social Ecology

University of California, Irvine

Irvine, CA 92697

15. Prof. Robert Koulish, Ph.D.

Director, MLAW Programs

College of Behavioral and Social Sciences

Joel J. Feller Research Professor

University of Maryland

College Park, MD 20742

16. Prof. Craig Haney

Distinguished Professor of

Psychology, and UC Presidential

Chair, 2015-2018

Co-Director, UC Criminal Justice & Health Consortium

Department of Psychology

University of California, Santa Cruz

Santa Cruz, California 95064

17. Prof. Cecilia Menjívar

Foundation Distinguished Professor

Co-Director, Center for Migration Research

Department of Sociology

University of Kansas

18. Prof. Ramiro Martinez, Jr.

Criminology, Criminal Justice,

Sociology and Anthropology

Northeastern University

360 Huntington Avenue

Boston, MA 02115

19. Prof. Tim Dunn

Professor, Dept. of Sociology

Salisbury University

Salisbury, MD 21801

20. Prof. Josiah Heyman

Director, Center for Interamerican & Border Studies

Professor of Anthropology &

Endowed Professor of Border Trade Issues

University of Texas, El Paso

Old Main, Room 108

El Paso, TX 79968

21. Luis H. Zayas, PhD

Dean and Robert Lee Sutherland Chair in Mental Health and Social Policy |

Steve Hicks School of Social Work

Professor of Psychiatry | Dell Medical School

The University of Texas at Austin

1925 San Jacinto Blvd., D3500, Austin, TX 78712

22. Carola Suárez-Orozco, Ph.D.

Professor of Human Development and Psychology, UCLA

Co-Director, Institute for Immigration, Globalization & Education

Co-Founder, Re-Imagining Migration

1041B Moore Hall, Box 951521

Los Angeles, CA 90005-1521

23. Prof. Katie Dingeman

Assistant Professor

Department of Sociology

California State University, Los Angeles

5151 State University Drive, Los Angeles, CA 90032

24. Prof. David Manuel Hernandez

Assistant Professor

Dept. of Spanish, Latina/o, and Latin American Studies

50 College Street

Mount Holyoke College

South Hadley, MA 01075

25. Prof. Susan Terrio

Dept. of Anthropology & Dept. of French

Georgetown University

Car Barn, Suite 308

3520 Prospect Street, N.W.

Washington, D.C. 20057

26. Prof. Nancy Hiemstra

Assistant Professor of Migration Studies

Department of Women's, Gender, and Sexuality Studies

Stony Brook University

Stony Brook, NY 11794

27. Prof. Krista Perreira, PhD

Professor of Social Medicine

University of North Carolina of Chapel Hill

Chapel Hill, NC 27599

28. Prof. Deborah A. Boehm

Associate Professor, Anthropology and GRI/Women's Studies

University of Nevada, Reno

Gender, Race, and Identity Program

Reno, NV 895570046

29. Dr. Jenna M. Loyd

Assistant Professor

Department of Geography

University of Wisconsin-Madison

Madison, WI 53706

30. Dr. Giselle Hass, ABAP

Clinical and Forensic Psychologist

5225 Wisconsin Ave., NW, Suite 513

Washington, D.C. 20015

31. Prof. Joanna Dreby

Associate Professor

Dept. of Sociology

University at Albany, State University of New York

Arts and Sciences 327

1400 Washington Avenue

Albany, NY 12222

32. Prof. Leo R. Chavez

Department of Anthropology

University of California, Irvine

Irvine, CA 92697

33. Prof. Leisy J. Abrego

Associate Professor, Chicana and Chicano Studies

University of California, Los Angeles

7357 Bunche Hall

Los Angeles, CA

34. Prof. Leah Schmalzbauer

Professor of Sociology and American Studies

Chair, Department of Anthropology and Sociology

Amherst College

35. Prof. Ruth Gomberg-Muñoz

Associate Professor and Undergraduate Program Director Department of Anthropology Loyola University Chicago 1032 W. Sheridan Rd. Chicago, IL 60660

36. Dr. Alexa Koenig

Executive Director, Human Rights Center & Lecturer University of California, Berkely School of Law Boalt Hall Berkeley, CA 94720

37. Connie McGuire, PhD

Cultural Anthropologist Specialist, UCI Community Resilience Projects & Department of Family Medicine University of California, Irvine

38. Prof. Amalia Pallares

Associate Professor, Political Science, Latin American & Latino Studies University of Illinois, Chicago 301 South Morgan Street 1525 University Hall Chicago, IL 60607

39. Caitlin Patler, PhD

Assistant Professor of Sociology University of California, Davis

40. Prof. Alison Mountz

Canada Research Cahir in Global Migration Director, International Migration Research Centre Wilfid Laurier University West Waterloo, Ontario Canada

41. Mona Lynch

Professor & Chancellor's Fellow Criminology, Law & Society, School of Law (by courtesy) University of California, Irvine

42. Dr. Sara Wakefield Associate Professor School of Criminal Justice Rutgers University, Newark

43. Emily Ryo Associate Professor of Law and Sociology University of Southern California Gould School of Law 699 Exposition Blvd. Los Angeles, CA 90089

Prof. Kathryn Abrams Professor of Law University of California, Berkeley Boalt Hall Berkeley, CA 94720