

**U.S. District Court
District of Columbia (Washington, DC)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:10-cv-01224-EGS**

AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION v.
UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND
SECURITY et al

Assigned to: Judge Emmet G. Sullivan

Case: 1:10-cv-00353-RCL

Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 07/20/2010

Jury Demand: None

Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of
Information Act

Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff

**AMERICAN IMMIGRATION
LAWYERS ASSOCIATION**

represented by **Seth A. Watkins**
STEP TOE & JOHNSON, LLP
1330 Connecticut Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20036
(202) 429-3000
Fax: (202) 429-3902
Email: sethwatkins@steptoe.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Houda Morad
STEP TOE & JOHNSON, LLP
1330 Connecticut Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20036
(202) 862-5774
Email: hmorad@steptoe.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

**UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF
HOMELAND SECURITY**

represented by **David Cotter Rybicki**
U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE
555 4th Street, NW
Washington, DC 20530
(202) 353-4024
Email: david.rybicki@usdoj.gov
TERMINATED: 10/06/2011
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marian L. Borum
U.S. ATTORNEY'S OFFICE
Civil Division
555 Fourth Street, NW
Washington, DC 20530
(202) 514-6531
Fax: (202) 514-8780
Email: Marian.L.Borum@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

**UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP
AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES**

represented by **David Cotter Rybicki**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 10/06/2011
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Marian L. Borum
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
07/20/2010	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Filing fee \$ 350, receipt number 4616031364) filed by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>11</u> Civil Cover Sheet)(jf,) (Entered: 07/20/2010)
07/20/2010		SUMMONS (4) Issued as to UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY, U.S. Attorney and U.S. Attorney General. (jf,) (Entered: 07/20/2010)
07/20/2010	<u>2</u>	LCvR 7.1 CERTIFICATE OF DISCLOSURE of Corporate Affiliations and Financial Interests NONE by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION. (jf,) (Entered: 07/20/2010)
07/20/2010	<u>3</u>	SUMMONS Returned Executed by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION. UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES served on 7/20/2010, answer due 8/19/2010; UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY served on 7/20/2010, answer due 8/19/2010. (Watkins, Seth) (Entered: 07/20/2010)
07/27/2010	<u>4</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by David Cotter Rybicki on behalf of UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Rybicki, David) (Entered: 07/27/2010)
08/13/2010	<u>5</u>	NOTICE OF RELATED CASE by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION. Case related to Case No. 10-00353. (Watkins, Seth) (Entered: 08/13/2010)
08/17/2010	<u>6</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer <i>or Otherwise to Respond to the Complaint</i> by UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Rybicki, David) (Entered: 08/17/2010)
08/20/2010		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>6</u> defendants' motion for an extension of time to answer or otherwise to respond to the complaint. Defendants shall answer or otherwise respond to <u>1</u> the complaint by no later than September 20, 2010. Plaintiff shall file its reply by no later than September 27, 2010. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on August 20, 2010. (lcegs2) (Entered: 08/20/2010)
08/20/2010		Set/Reset Deadlines: Answer due by 9/20/2010, Replies due by 9/27/2010. (clv,) (Entered: 08/20/2010)
09/15/2010	<u>7</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer <i>or Otherwise to Respond to the Complaint</i> by UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Rybicki, David) (Entered: 09/15/2010)
09/17/2010		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>7</u> the motion for an extension of time to answer or otherwise respond to <u>1</u> the complaint. The defendants shall answer or otherwise respond to the complaint by no later than October 4, 2010. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on September 17, 2010. (lcegs2) (Entered: 09/17/2010)
09/21/2010		Set/Reset Deadlines: Answer due by 10/4/2010, (clv,) (Entered: 09/21/2010)

10/04/2010	<u>8</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint, by UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY.(Rybicki, David) (Entered: 10/04/2010)
10/27/2010	<u>9</u>	NOTICE <i>JOINT PROPOSAL CONCERNING CASE MANAGEMENT</i> by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION (Watkins, Seth) (Entered: 10/27/2010)
11/01/2010		MINUTE ORDER. Upon consideration of <u>9</u> the parties' joint proposal, the Court hereby ORDERS that defendants shall file their dispositive motion and produce all responsive records by no later than December 6, 2010. Plaintiff shall file an opposition to defendants' motion, and plaintiff's cross-motion, by no later than January 14, 2011. Defendants' opposition to plaintiff's cross-motion, as well as any reply in support of defendants' dispositive motion, shall be filed by no later than February 14, 2011. Plaintiff's reply in support of its cross-motion shall be filed by no later than March 14, 2011. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on November 1, 2010. (lcegs2) (Entered: 11/01/2010)
11/02/2010		Set/Reset Deadlines: defendant's dispositive motion and all responsive records due by 12/6/10; plaintiff's opposition to defendants' motion, and plaintiff's cross-motion due by 1/14/11; defendant's opposition to plaintiff's cross-motion, and reply in support of defendants' dispositive motion due by 2/14/2011; Plaintiff's reply in support of its cross-motion due by 3/14/2011. (clv,) (Entered: 11/02/2010)
12/03/2010	<u>10</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>Move for Summary Judgment</i> by UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Rybicki, David) (Entered: 12/03/2010)
12/08/2010		MINUTE ORDER granting defendants' motion for an extension of time to file their dispositive motion. Defendants shall file their dispositive motion by no later than December 10, 2010. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on December 8, 2010. (lcegs2) (Entered: 12/08/2010)
12/09/2010		Set/Reset Deadlines: Dispositive Motions due by 12/10/2010. (clv,) (Entered: 12/09/2010)
12/10/2010	<u>11</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment by UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order, # <u>2</u> Memorandum in Support, # <u>3</u> Statement of Facts, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Def.'s Exhs. A-X, # <u>5</u> Declaration of Jill A. Eggleston)(Rybicki, David) (Entered: 12/10/2010)
01/14/2011	<u>12</u>	Unopposed MOTION for Order to <i>File Exhibits Under Seal</i> by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Notice of Exhibits Under Seal, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Watkins, Seth) (Entered: 01/14/2011)
01/14/2011	<u>13</u>	Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order, # <u>2</u> Memorandum in Support, # <u>3</u> Statement of Facts of Plaintiff, # <u>4</u> Statement of Facts - Response to Defendants', # <u>5</u> Declaration of Seth A. Watkins, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 13, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 14, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 16, # <u>19</u> Exhibit 17, # <u>20</u> Exhibit 18)(Watkins, Seth) (Additional attachment(s) added on 1/18/2011: # <u>21</u> Exhibit 7 (SEALED), # <u>22</u> Exhibit 8 (SEALED), # <u>23</u> Exhibit 15 (SEALED)) (jf,). (Entered: 01/14/2011)
01/17/2011		MINUTE ORDER. Upon consideration of <u>12</u> the motion to file Exhibit 7, Exhibit 8, and Exhibit 15 to plaintiff's cross-motion for summary judgment under seal, the Court hereby ORDERS the parties to provide the Court with joint proposed redacted versions of the three exhibits in question. The parties shall submit a sealed filing with the Court including their joint proposed redactions by no later than January 31, 2011. In the event that the parties are unable to reach an agreement regarding the appropriate redactions, the parties shall jointly submit a sealed filing by that date that includes (1) one copy of the exhibits reflecting all agreed-upon redactions; and (2) two separate copies of the exhibits reflecting the additional

		redactions proposed by each side. The parties are cautioned, however, that given the strong presumption in favor of public access to judicial records, see, e.g., <i>Nixon v. Warner Commc'ns, Inc.</i> , 435 U.S. 589, 597 ("It is clear that the courts of this country recognize a general right to inspect and copy public records and documents, including judicial records and documents."), that redactions shall be made solely to the extent necessary to preserve the confidential or proprietary nature of the relevant information. Any party that abuses the redaction process may be sanctioned by the Court. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on January 17, 2011. (lcegs2) (Entered: 01/17/2011)
01/18/2011	<u>14</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>11</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION. (Watkins, Seth) (Entered: 01/18/2011)
01/18/2011		Set/Reset Deadlines: Parties joint proposed redactions due by 1/31/2011. (clv,) (Entered: 01/18/2011)
01/31/2011	<u>15</u>	NOTICE of Filing Joint Response Under Seal by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION (Watkins, Seth) (Entered: 01/31/2011)
01/31/2011	<u>16</u>	SEALED Joint Response to Minute Order on Motion to File Exhibits Under Seal filed by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION, UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY. (This document is SEALED and only available to authorized persons.) (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 15 – various pages illegible)(zjf,) Modified on 2/2/2011 (zjf,). (Entered: 02/01/2011)
02/03/2011		MINUTE ORDER. Upon consideration of <u>16</u> the parties' joint response filed on January 31, 2011, the <u>12</u> motion to file exhibits under seal is hereby DENIED as moot. The plaintiff is directed to file unsealed copies of Exhibit 7, Exhibit 8, and Exhibit 15 to plaintiff's cross-motion for summary judgment. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on February 3, 2011. (lcegs2) (Entered: 02/03/2011)
02/13/2011	<u>17</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply & Opposition to Plaintiff's Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment by UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Rybicki, David) (Entered: 02/13/2011)
02/17/2011	<u>18</u>	NOTICE of Filing Unsealed Copies of Exhibits by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION re <u>13</u> Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 15)(Watkins, Seth) (Entered: 02/17/2011)
02/24/2011	<u>19</u>	Consent MOTION to Withdraw Defendants' <u>11</u> Motion for Summary Judgment & To Stay Further Summary-Judgment Briefing by UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Rybicki, David) Modified on 2/25/2011 to add docket link (jf,). Added MOTION to Stay on 2/25/2011 (jf,). (Entered: 02/24/2011)
02/25/2011		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>19</u> the consent motion to withdraw defendants' motion for summary judgment and to stay further summary-judgment briefing. It is FURTHER ORDERED that plaintiff's motion for summary judgment is DENIED without prejudice; and it is FURTHER ORDERED that defendants shall conclude their renewed search for documents, provide updated Vaughn indices and supporting declarations, and produce all responsive, non-exempt records by no later than March 28, 2011; and it is FURTHER ORDERED that plaintiff shall file its renewed motion for summary judgment by no later than April 18, 2011; and it is FURTHER ORDERED that defendants shall file their cross-motion for summary judgment and opposition to plaintiff's motion for summary judgment by no later than May 9, 2011; and it is FURTHER ORDERED plaintiff shall file a reply in support of its motion for summary judgment and its opposition to defendants' cross-motion for summary judgment by no later than May 30, 2011; and it is FURTHER ORDERED that defendants shall file a reply in support of its cross-motion for summary judgment by no later than June 20, 2011. Signed by

		Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on February 25, 2011. (lcegs2) (Entered: 02/25/2011)
02/28/2011		Set/Reset Deadlines: plaintiff's renewed motion for summary judgment due by 4/18/11; defendant's cross motions and oppositions due by 5/9/2011; plaintiff's reply and response to cross motions due by 5/30/2011; Defendant's reply to cross motions due by 6/20/2011. (clv,) (Entered: 02/28/2011)
03/24/2011	<u>20</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>Complete Renewed Search for Documents</i> by UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Rybicki, David) (Entered: 03/24/2011)
03/29/2011		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>20</u> the consent motion for an extension of time. It is FURTHER ORDERED that defendants shall conclude their renewed search for documents, provide updated Vaughn indices and supporting declarations, and produce all responsive, non-exempt records by no later than April 27, 2011; and it is FURTHER ORDERED that plaintiff shall file its renewed motion for summary judgment by no later than May 18, 2011; and it is FURTHER ORDERED that defendants shall file their cross-motion for summary judgment and opposition to plaintiff's motion for summary judgment by no later than June 8, 2011; and it is FURTHER ORDERED plaintiff shall file a reply in support of its motion for summary judgment and its opposition to defendants' cross-motion for summary judgment by no later than June 29, 2011; and it is FURTHER ORDERED that defendants shall file a reply in support of its cross-motion for summary judgment by no later than July 11, 2011. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on March 29, 2011. (lcegs2) (Entered: 03/29/2011)
03/30/2011		Set/Reset Deadlines: defendant's updated Vaughn indices and supporting declarations, and produce all responsive, non-exempt records due by 4/27/11; Motions for summary judgment due by 5/18/11; cross motions and responses due by 6/8/11; reply and response due by 6/29/11; reply due by 7/11/11. (clv,) (Entered: 03/30/2011)
04/07/2011	<u>21</u>	Consent MOTION to Stay <i>Further Proceedings in the Event of a Federal Government Shutdown</i> by UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Rybicki, David) (Entered: 04/07/2011)
04/26/2011	<u>22</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>Complete Renewed Search for Documents</i> by UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order, # <u>2</u> Declaration of Jill Eggleston)(Rybicki, David) (Entered: 04/26/2011)
04/28/2011		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>22</u> the consent motion for an extension of time. It is FURTHER ORDERED that defendants shall conclude their renewed search for documents, provide updated Vaughn indices and supporting declarations, and produce all responsive, non-exempt records by no later than May 9, 2011; and it is FURTHER ORDERED that plaintiff shall file its renewed motion for summary judgment by no later than May 30, 2011; and it is FURTHER ORDERED that defendants shall file their cross-motion for summary judgment and opposition to plaintiff's motion for summary judgment by no later than June 20, 2011; and it is FURTHER ORDERED plaintiff shall file a reply in support of its motion for summary judgment and its opposition to defendants' cross-motion for summary judgment by no later than July 11, 2011; and it is FURTHER ORDERED that defendants shall file a reply in support of its cross-motion for summary judgment by no later than July 21, 2011. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on April 28, 2011. (lcegs2) (Entered: 04/28/2011)
04/29/2011		Set/Reset Deadlines: Non-Exempt Records due by 5/9/11; Summary Judgment motions due by 5/30/2011; reply and Response to Motion for Summary Judgment due by 6/20/2011; Response and Reply to Motion for Summary Judgment due by 7/11/2011; reply due by 7/21/11. (clv,) (Entered: 04/29/2011)
05/31/2011	<u>23</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order, # <u>2</u> Memorandum in Support,

		# <u>3</u> Declaration of Seth A. Watkins, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 13, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 14, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 15, # <u>19</u> Exhibit 16, # <u>20</u> Exhibit 17, # <u>21</u> Exhibit 18, # <u>22</u> Exhibit 19, # <u>23</u> Exhibit 20, # <u>24</u> Exhibit 21, # <u>25</u> Exhibit 22, # <u>26</u> Exhibit 23, # <u>27</u> Exhibit 24, # <u>28</u> Exhibit 25, # <u>29</u> Exhibit 26, # <u>30</u> Exhibit 27, # <u>31</u> Exhibit 28, # <u>32</u> Exhibit 29, # <u>33</u> Exhibit 30, # <u>34</u> Exhibit 31, # <u>35</u> Statement of Facts Not in Dispute)(Watkins, Seth) (Entered: 05/31/2011)
06/07/2011		MINUTE ORDER denying <u>21</u> the consent motion to stay further proceedings in the event of a federal government shutdown as moot. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on June 7, 2011. (lcegs2) (Entered: 06/07/2011)
06/13/2011	<u>24</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>Cross-Move for Summary Judgment & Oppose Pl.'s Motion for Summary Judgment</i> by UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Rybicki, David) (Entered: 06/13/2011)
06/15/2011		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>24</u> the consent motion for an extension of time. It is FURTHER ORDERED that defendants shall file their cross-motion for summary judgment and opposition to plaintiff's motion for summary judgment by no later than June 27, 2011; and it is FURTHER ORDERED plaintiff shall file a reply in support of its motion for summary judgment and its opposition to defendants' cross-motion for summary judgment by no later than July 18, 2011; and it is FURTHER ORDERED that defendants shall file a reply in support of its cross-motion for summary judgment by no later than July 28, 2011. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on June 15, 2011. (lcegs2) (Entered: 06/15/2011)
06/15/2011		Set/Reset Deadlines: Cross Motions and response due by 6/27/2011. Reply and Response to Cross Motions due by 7/18/2011. Reply to Cross Motions due by 7/28/2011. (Entered: 06/15/2011)
06/27/2011	<u>25</u>	Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment by UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order, # <u>2</u> Memorandum in Support, # <u>3</u> Statement of Facts, # <u>4</u> Statement of Facts Defs.' Opposition to Pl.'s Statement of Facts, # <u>5</u> Declaration Substitute Decl. of Jill Eggleston w/ Exhs. A-Z)(Rybicki, David) Modified on 7/26/2011 to correct docket text (jf,). (Entered: 06/27/2011)
06/27/2011	<u>26</u>	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>23</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration Substitute Decl. of Jill Eggleston, # <u>2</u> Statement of Facts, # <u>3</u> Statement of Facts Defs.' Opposition to Plaintiff's Statement of Facts)(Rybicki, David) (Entered: 06/27/2011)
06/28/2011		ORDER denying <u>17</u> Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as moot. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on June 28, 2011. (lcegs2) (Entered: 06/28/2011)
07/13/2011	<u>27</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>Reply in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment and Oppose Defendants Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment</i> by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Watkins, Seth) (Entered: 07/14/2011)
07/18/2011		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>27</u> the consent motion for an extension of time. Plaintiff shall file its opposition to <u>25</u> defendants' cross-motion and reply in support of <u>23</u> plaintiff's motion for summary judgment by no later than July 25, 2011. Defendants shall file a reply in support of their <u>25</u> cross-motion for summary judgment by no later than August 4, 2011. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on July 18, 2011. (lcegs2) (Entered: 07/18/2011)
07/18/2011		Set/Reset Deadlines: Reply to Motion for Summary Judgment due by 7/25/11; Response to Cross Motions due by 7/25/2011. Reply to Cross Motions due by 8/4/2011. (clv,) (Entered: 07/18/2011)

07/25/2011	<u>28</u>	REPLY to opposition to re <u>23</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment , <i>Plaintiffs Reply Memorandum in Support of Its Motion for Summary Judgment filed by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Plaintiffs Response to Defendants Statement of Material Facts Not in Genuine Dispute and Plaintiffs Statement of Genuine Material Issues)(Watkins, Seth) Modified on 7/26/2011 to correct docket text (jf,). (Entered: 07/25/2011)</i>
07/25/2011	29	Memorandum in opposition to re <u>25</u> Cross MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION. (See Docket Entry <u>28</u> to view document) (jf,) (Entered: 07/26/2011)
08/04/2011	<u>30</u>	REPLY to opposition to motion re <u>23</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY. (Rybicki, David) (Entered: 08/04/2011)
08/09/2011	<u>31</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Houda Morad on behalf of AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION (Morad, Houda) (Entered: 08/09/2011)
10/06/2011	<u>32</u>	NOTICE OF SUBSTITUTION OF COUNSEL by Marian L. Borum on behalf of All Defendants Substituting for attorney David C. Rybicki (Borum, Marian) (Entered: 10/06/2011)
03/30/2012	<u>33</u>	ORDER granting in part and denying in part <u>23</u> plaintiff's motion for summary judgment and denying <u>25</u> defendants' cross-motion for summary judgment. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on March 30, 2012. (lcegs2) (Entered: 03/30/2012)
03/30/2012	<u>34</u>	MEMORANDUM OPINION. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on March 30, 2012. (lcegs2) (Entered: 03/30/2012)
03/31/2012		MINUTE ORDER. For the reasons stated in <u>34</u> the Court's Memorandum Opinion and <u>33</u> Order issued March 30, 2012, <u>25</u> defendants' cross-motion for summary judgment is hereby denied. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on March 31, 2012. (lcegs2) (Entered: 03/31/2012)
04/03/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: defendant's Vaughn Affidavits due by 4/30/2011. Status Report due by 5/31/2012 (clv,) (Entered: 04/03/2012)
04/24/2012	<u>35</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Defendants' revised Vaughn</i> by UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Borum, Marian) (Entered: 04/24/2012)
04/25/2012		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>35</u> defendants' consent motion for enlargement of time. Defendants shall file their revised Vaughn affidavits by no later than May 22, 2012. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on April 25, 2012. (lcegs2) (Entered: 04/25/2012)
04/25/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: defendant's revised Vaughn affidavits due by 5/22/2012. (clv,) (Entered: 04/25/2012)
05/22/2012	<u>36</u>	NOTICE <i>to the Court</i> by UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit)(Borum, Marian) (Entered: 05/22/2012)
05/31/2012	<u>37</u>	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File a Joint Recommendation for Further Proceedings</i> by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Watkins, Seth) (Entered: 05/31/2012)
06/02/2012		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>37</u> joint motion for enlargement of time. The parties shall file their joint recommendation for further proceedings by no later than June 15, 2012. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on June 2, 2012. (lcegs2) (Entered: 06/02/2012)
06/04/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: parties joint recommendation for further proceedings due by 6/15/2012. (clv,) (Entered: 06/04/2012)

06/15/2012	<u>38</u>	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File a Joint Recommendation for Further Proceedings</i> by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Watkins, Seth) (Entered: 06/15/2012)
06/21/2012		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>38</u> Joint Motion for Enlargement of Time. The parties shall file their joint recommendation for further proceedings by no later than July 15, 2012. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on June 21, 2012. (lcegs2) (Entered: 06/21/2012)
06/21/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: parties joint recommendations for further proceedings due by 7/15/2012. (clv,) (Entered: 06/21/2012)
07/16/2012	<u>39</u>	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File a Joint Recommendation for Further Proceedings</i> by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Watkins, Seth) (Entered: 07/16/2012)
07/17/2012		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>39</u> joint motion for enlargement of time. The parties shall file a joint recommendation for further proceedings by no later than August 15, 2012. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on July 17, 2012. (lcegs2) (Entered: 07/17/2012)
07/17/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: parties joint recommendations for further proceedings due by 8/15/2012. (tcb) (Entered: 07/17/2012)
08/15/2012	<u>40</u>	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File a Joint Recommendation for Further Proceedings</i> by UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Borum, Marian) (Entered: 08/15/2012)
08/17/2012		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>40</u> joint motion for an extension of time. The parties shall file a joint recommendation for further proceedings by no later than September 14, 2012. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on August 17, 2012. (lcegs2) (Entered: 08/17/2012)
08/21/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: Status Report due by 9/14/2012 (clv,) (Entered: 08/21/2012)
09/14/2012	<u>41</u>	Joint MOTION for Briefing Schedule <i>and JOINT RECOMMENDATION FOR FURTHER PROCEEDINGS</i> by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Watkins, Seth) (Entered: 09/14/2012)
09/18/2012		MINUTE ORDER. In light of the <u>41</u> Joint Recommendation for Further Proceedings, in which the parties state that they have reached agreement with respect to all but four documents withheld from disclosure, identified as Documents 2, 6, 9 and 10, the court enters the following briefing schedule: Defendants shall file revised Vaughn affidavits with a brief of no more than 10 pages concerning Documents 2, 6, 9 and 10 justifying the sufficiency of the affidavits by no later than October 15, 2012, and plaintiff shall file a responsive brief of no more than 10 pages by no later than October 30, 2012. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on September 18, 2012. (lcegs4) (Entered: 09/18/2012)
09/18/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: Defendant's revised Vaughn affidavits with a brief due by 10/15/2012. Plaintiff's Responses due by 10/30/2012 (clv,) (Entered: 09/18/2012)
10/15/2012	<u>42</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Revised Vaughn Submissions and Supporting Brief</i> by UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Borum, Marian) (Entered: 10/15/2012)
10/17/2012		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>42</u> defendants' consent motion for extension of time. Defendants shall file revised Vaughn affidavits with a brief of no more than 10 pages concerning Documents 2, 6, 9 and 10 justifying the sufficiency of the affidavits by no later than November 14, 2012. Plaintiff shall file a responsive brief of no more than 10 pages by no later than November 29, 2012. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on October 17, 2012. (lcegs4) (Entered: 10/17/2012)
10/17/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: Revised Vaughn affidavits due by 11/14/2012. Responses due by 11/29/2012 (clv,) (Entered: 10/17/2012)

11/14/2012	<u>43</u>	NOTICE <i>to the Court</i> by UNITED STATES CITIZENSHIP AND IMMIGRATION SERVICES, UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY (Borum, Marian) (Entered: 11/14/2012)
12/13/2012	<u>44</u>	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Plaintiff's Request for Attorneys Fees and Costs</i> by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Morad, Houda) (Entered: 12/13/2012)
12/18/2012		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>44</u> Joint Motion for Enlargement of Time. AILA shall file its request for attorneys' fees and costs by no later than January 14, 2013. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on December 18, 2012. (lcegs2) (Entered: 12/18/2012)
12/18/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: AILA request for attorneys; fees and costs is due by 1/14/2013. (clv,) (Entered: 12/18/2012)
01/14/2013	<u>45</u>	Joint MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>File Plaintiff's Request for Attorneys Fees and Costs</i> by AMERICAN IMMIGRATION LAWYERS ASSOCIATION (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Watkins, Seth) (Entered: 01/14/2013)
01/15/2013		MINUTE ORDER granting <u>45</u> joint motion for enlargement of time for plaintiff to file its request for attorney's fees and costs. Plaintiff shall file its request by no later than February 13, 2013. Signed by Judge Emmet G. Sullivan on January 15, 2013. (lcegs4) (Entered: 01/15/2013)
01/16/2013		Set/Reset Deadlines: Plaintiff's request for attorney's fees and costs due by 2/13/2013. (clv,) (Entered: 01/16/2013)