

[Home](#)[PACER](#)[Opinions](#)[Help](#)

# General Docket

## United States Court of Appeals for the 10th Circuit

Current cases:

None

Docket as of December 23, 2004 3:03 pm

Page 1

Proceedings include all events.

03-1162 Soskin, et al v. Reinertson

VALENTIN SOSKIN  
Plaintiff - Appellant

Gregory R. Piche  
[COR LD NTC ret]  
Scott S. Barker  
[COR NTC ret]  
Holland & Hart  
P.O. Box 8749  
Denver, CO 80201-8749  
303/295-8000

Mark Silverstein  
[COR NTC ret]  
A.C.L.U. Foundation of Colorado  
400 Corona St.  
Denver, CO 80218

Stephen Masciocchi  
[COR NTC ret]  
Holland & Hart  
555 17th Street  
Suite 3200  
Denver, CO 80202

Lucas Guttentag  
[COR NTC ret]  
American Civil Liberties Union  
Immigrants' Rights Project  
405 14th St.  
#300  
Oakland, CA 94612  
510/625-2010 x 202

Marc Cohan  
[COR NTC ret]  
Mary R. Mannix  
[COR NTC ret]  
Anne H. Pearson

[COR NTC ret]  
Rebecca L. Scharf  
[COR NTC ret]  
Welfare Law Center, Inc.  
275 Seventh Ave.  
#1205  
New York, NY 10001  
212/633-6967

Linton Joaquin  
[COR NTC ret]  
Gabrielle Lessard  
[COR NTC ret]  
National Immigration Law Center  
3435 Wilshire Blvd.  
#2850  
Los Angeles, CA 90010  
213/639-3900

Docket as of December 23, 2004 3:03 pm

Page 2

Proceedings include all events.  
03-1162 Soskin, et al v. Reinertson

Tanya Broder  
[COR NTC ret]  
National Immigration Law Center  
405 14th St.  
#1400  
Oakland, CA 94612  
510/663-8282

Jane Perkins  
[COR NTC ret]  
National Health Law Program  
211 N. Columbia St.  
Chapel Hill, NC 27514  
919/968-6308

BEI DEI HOWE  
Plaintiff - Appellant

Gregory R. Piche  
(See above)

[COR LD NTC ret]  
Scott S. Barker  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Mark Silverstein  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Stephen Masciocchi

(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Lucas Guttentag  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Marc Cohan  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]  
Mary R. Mannix  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]  
Anne H. Pearson  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]  
Rebecca L. Scharf  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Linton Joaquin  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]  
Gabrielle Lessard  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Docket as of December 23, 2004 3:03 pm

Page 3

Proceedings include all events.  
03-1162 Soskin, et al v. Reinertson

Tanya Broder  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Jane Perkins  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

EVA ROSENTHAL  
Plaintiff - Appellant

Gregory R. Piche  
(See above)

[COR LD NTC ret]

Scott S. Barker  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Mark Silverstein  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Stephen Masciocchi  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Lucas Guttentag  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Marc Cohan  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Mary R. Mannix  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Anne H. Pearson  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Rebecca L. Scharf  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Linton Joaquin  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Gabrielle Lessard  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Tanya Broder  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Jane Perkins  
(See above)

Proceedings include all events.  
03-1162 Soskin, et al v. Reinertson

[COR NTC ret]

VATCHAGAN TATEVOSIAN  
Plaintiff - Appellant

Gregory R. Piche  
(See above)

[COR LD NTC ret]  
Scott S. Barker  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Mark Silverstein  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Stephen Masciocchi  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Lucas Guttentag  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Marc Cohan  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]  
Mary R. Mannix  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]  
Anne H. Pearson  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]  
Rebecca L. Scharf  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Linton Joaquin  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]  
Gabrielle Lessard  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Tanya Broder  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Jane Perkins  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

GINDA K. GELFAND  
Plaintiff - Appellant

Gregory R. Piche  
(See above)

[COR LD NTC ret]  
Scott S. Barker  
(See above)

Docket as of December 23, 2004 3:03 pm

Page 5

Proceedings include all events.  
03-1162 Soskin, et al v. Reinertson

[COR NTC ret]

Mark Silverstein  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Stephen Masciocchi  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Lucas Guttentag  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Marc Cohan  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Mary R. Mannix  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Anne H. Pearson  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Rebecca L. Scharf  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Linton Joaquin  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]  
Gabrielle Lessard  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Tanya Broder  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Jane Perkins  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

YAKOV GELFAND  
Plaintiff - Appellant

Gregory R. Piche  
(See above)

[COR LD NTC ret]  
Scott S. Barker  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Mark Silverstein  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Stephen Masciocchi

Docket as of December 23, 2004 3:03 pm

Page 6

Proceedings include all events.  
03-1162 Soskin, et al v. Reinertson

(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Lucas Guttentag  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Marc Cohan  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Mary R. Mannix  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]  
Anne H. Pearson  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]  
Rebecca L. Scharf  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Linton Joaquin  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]  
Gabrielle Lessard  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Tanya Broder  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Jane Perkins  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

DUBALE SHIBESHI  
Plaintiff - Appellant

Gregory R. Piche  
(See above)

[COR LD NTC ret]  
Scott S. Barker  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Mark Silverstein  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Stephen Masciocchi  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Lucas Guttentag  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Docket as of December 23, 2004 3:03 pm

Page 7

Proceedings include all events.  
03-1162 Soskin, et al v. Reinertson

Marc Cohan  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]  
Mary R. Mannix  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]  
Anne H. Pearson  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]  
Rebecca L. Scharf  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Linton Joaquin  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]  
Gabrielle Lessard  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Tanya Broder  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Jane Perkins  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

SARIN PERLMAN, on their own  
behalf and on behalf of all

Gregory R. Piche  
(See above)

others similarly situated  
Plaintiff - Appellant

[COR LD NTC ret]  
Scott S. Barker  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Mark Silverstein  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Stephen Masciocchi  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Lucas Guttentag  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Marc Cohan  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Mary R. Mannix  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Anne H. Pearson

Docket as of December 23, 2004 3:03 pm

Page 8

Proceedings include all events.

03-1162 Soskin, et al v. Reinertson

(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Rebecca L. Scharf  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Linton Joaquin  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Gabrielle Lessard  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Tanya Broder  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

Jane Perkins  
(See above)

[COR NTC ret]

v.

KAREN REINERTSON, in her official capacity as Executive Director of the Colorado Department of Health Care Policy and Financing  
Defendant - Appellee

Renny Fagan  
[COR NTC ret]  
Colorado Attorney General's Office  
Criminal Appeals  
1525 Sherman  
5th Floor  
Denver, CO 80203

Ann M. Hause  
[COR LD NTC ret]  
Colorado Department of Law  
1525 Sherman St.  
Denver, CO 80203  
303/866-5449

Docket as of December 23, 2004 3:03 pm

Page 9

Proceedings include all events.  
03-1162 Soskin, et al v. Reinertson

VALENTIN SOSKIN; BEI DEI HOWE; EVA ROSENTHAL; VATCHAGAN TATEVOSIAN; GINDA K. GELFAND; YAKOV GELFAND; DUBALE SHIBESHI; SARIN PERLMAN, on their own behalf and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs - Appellants,

v.

No. 03-1162

KAREN REINERTSON, in her official capacity as Executive Director of the Colorado Department of Health Care Policy and Financing,

Defendant - Appellee.

---

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Intervenor.

Docket as of December 23, 2004 3:03 pm

Page 10

Proceedings include all events.  
03-1162 Soskin, et al v. Reinertson

4/18/03 [1604870] Civil case docketed. Preliminary record filed.  
DATE RECEIVED: 4/17/03. Transcript order form due 4/28/03

for Charlotte Hoard pursuant to R.42.1. Docketing statement due 4/28/03 for Sarin Perlman, Dubale Shibeshi, Yakov Gelfand, Ginda K. Gelfand, Vatchagan Tatevosian, Eva Rosenthal, Bei Dei Howe and Valentin Soskin. Notice of appearance due 4/28/03 Karen Reinertson, Sarin Perlman, Dubale Shibeshi, Yakov Gelfand, Ginda K. Gelfand, Vatchagan Tatevosian, Eva Rosenthal, Bei Dei Howe and Valentin Soskin. (klp)

- 4/22/03 [1606126] Notice filed that the necessary transcript is already on file in district court. Notice due that record is complete 4/30/03 for Robert E. Blackburn. (gah)
- 4/22/03 [1606136] Deficient docketing statement filed (no attachments). Corrected docketing statement due 5/2/03 for appellants. (gah)
- 4/22/03 [1606565] Notice of appearance filed by Ann M. Hause and Ilene I. Wolf as attorneys for Karen Reinertson. CERT. OF INTERESTED PARTIES (y/n): n. (das)
- 4/24/03 [1606653] Appellant's motion filed by Appellants Valentin Soskin, Bei Dei Howe, Eva Rosenthal, Vatchagan Tatevosian, Ginda K. Gelfand, Yakov Gelfand, Dubale Shibeshi, and Sarin Perlman for injunction on appeal. [03-1162] Original and 3 copies. c/s: y (afw)
- 4/25/03 [1606963] Appellant's for motion for injunction submitted to court. (afw)
- 4/25/03 [1607155] Order filed by Judges Hartz and O'Brien granting appellant's motion for injunction pending appeal [1606653-1] and expediting case. This matter is set for oral argument the week of May 5, 2003. Parties' briefs shall be received by the court on or before 5:00 pm on 4/30/03. No extensions of time will be granted. Appellants' brief due 4/30/03 for Sarin Perlman, Dubale Shibeshi, Yakov Gelfand, Ginda K. Gelfand, Vatchagan Tatevosian, Eva Rosenthal, Bei Dei Howe, and Valentin Soskin. Appellee's brief due 4/30/03 for Karen Reinertson. Parties served by mail. (gah)
- 4/28/03 [1607399] Hearing set for May, 2003 Session, at Denver, Colorado. (ss)
- 4/28/03 [1607527] Notice of appearance filed by Mark Silverstein as attorney for Valentin Soskin, Bei Dei Howe, Eva Rosenthal, Vatchagan Tatevosian, Ginda K. Gelfand, Yakov Gelfand, Dubale Shibeshi, Sarin Perlman. CERT. OF

INTERESTED PARTIES (y/n): n (jet)

Docket as of December 23, 2004 3:03 pm

Page 11

Proceedings include all events.

03-1162 Soskin, et al v. Reinertson

4/28/03 [1607680] Notice of appearance filed by Renny Fagan as attorney for Karen Reinertson. CERT. OF INTERESTED PARTIES (y/n): n (jet)

4/28/03 [1607739] Filed notice record is complete 4/25/03. (gah)

4/28/03 [1607770] Docketing statement filed by Valentin Soskin, Bei Dei Howe, Eva Rosenthal, Vatchagan Tatevosian, Ginda K. Gelfand, Yakov Gelfand, Dubale Shibeshi, and Sarin Perlman. Original and 4 copies. c/s: y. (gah)

4/28/03 [1608230] Notice of appearance filed by Renny Fagan as attorney for Karen Reinertson. CERT. OF INTERESTED PARTIES (y/n): n (jet)

4/30/03 [1608286] Appellee's brief filed by Karen Reinertson. Original and 7 copies. c/s: y. Served on 4/30/03. Oral Argument? yes. Appendix filed. Original and one copy. Appendix Pages: 123. (CD-ROM copy of brief/appendix also filed- 2 copies). (gah)

4/30/03 [1608395] Appellant's Unopposed Motion to Expand Time Allowed for Oral Argument filed and submitted to panel. (ss)

4/30/03 [1608809] Appellants brief filed by Valentin Soskin, Bei Dei Howe, Eva Rosenthal, Vatchagan Tatevosian, Ginda K. Gelfand, Yakov Gelfand, Dubale Shibeshi, Sarin Perlman and submitted to court. Original and 7 copies. c/s: y. Oral Argument? y. Appendix filed. Original and 1 appendix copy. Appendix Pages: 476. (klp)

5/2/03 [1608746] Order filed by Judges Kelly, Henry, Hartz - The court grants appellant's motion for additional argument time, In Part, the parties shall have up to 20 minutes per side for oral argument on Weds., May 7, 2003. Parties served by mail. (ss)

- 5/2/03 [1609295] Appendix (Corrected) filed by Appellants Valentin Soskin, Bei Dei Howe, Eva Rosenthal, Vatchagan Tatevosian, Ginda K. Gelfand, Yakov Gelfand, Dubale Shibeshi and Sarin Perlman. Original and 1 copy. Appendix pages: 476 c/s: y. (klp)
- 5/2/03 [1609298] Certificate of service of appendix filed by Appellants. (klp)
- 5/7/03 [1610128] Notice of appearance filed by Linton Joaquin, Lucas Guttentag as attorneys for Valentin Soskin, Bei Dei Howe, Eva Rosenthal, Vatchagan Tatevosian, Ginda K. Gelfand, Yakov Gelfand, Dubale Shibeshi, Sarin Perlman. CERT. OF INTERESTED PARTIES (y/n): n (jet)

Docket as of December 23, 2004 3:03 pm

Page 12

Proceedings include all events.  
03-1162 Soskin, et al v. Reinertson

- 5/7/03 [1610135] Notice of appearance filed by Rebecca L. Scharf, Marc Cohan as attorneys for Valentin Soskin, Bei Dei Howe, Eva Rosenthal, Vatchagan Tatevosian, Ginda K. Gelfand, Yakov Gelfand, Dubale Shibeshi, Sarin Perlman. CERT. OF INTERESTED PARTIES (y/n): n (jet)
- 5/7/03 [1610148] Case argued by Lucas Guttentag and Marc Cohan for appellants; and Renny Fagan for appellee; Submitted to Judges Kelly, Henry, Hartz. (ss)
- 5/29/03 [1615878] Notice of appearance filed by Eric D. Miller and Thomas M. Bondy as attorneys for United States. CERT. OF INTERESTED PARTIES (y/n): n. (klp)
- 5/29/03 [1615880] Intervenor's brief filed by United States. Original and 7 copies. c/s: y. Served on 5/28/03. (klp)
- 5/29/03 [1615884] Intervenor's brief filed by United States submitted to court. (klp)
- 6/6/03 [1618249] Appellants' Brief in Response to Brief for the United States as Intervenor received from Valentin Soskin, Bei Dei Howe, Eva Rosenthal, Vatchagan Tatevosian, Ginda K. Gelfand, Yakov Gelfand, Dubale Shibeshi and Sarin Perlman, but not filed. Original and 7 copies. c/s: y. (klp)

6/9/03 [1618254] Appellants' Brief in Response to Brief for the United States as Intervenor submitted to court. (klp)

6/13/03 [1620082] Appellee's motion to strike or in the alternative motion for leave to file a response to appellants' brief in response to brief for the United States as intervenor filed by Karen Reinertson. Original and 3 copies. c/s: y. (jal)

6/13/03 [1620108] Brief in support of appellee's motion to strike ..... filed by Appellee Karen Reinertson. Original and 7 copies. c/s: y. (jal)

6/16/03 [1620111] Motion to strike or in the alternative motion for leave to file a response to appellant's brief in response to brief for the United States as intervenor and the brief in support submitted to court. (jal)

6/17/03 [1620888] Appellants' response to appellee's motion to strike filed and submitted to court. Original and 3 copies. c/s: y. (gah)

6/19/03 [1621388] Order filed by Judges Kelly, Henry and Hartz construing appellants' brief in response to brief for the U.S. as intervenor as a motion to file the brief and granting as construed. Clerk directed to file the brief. (Brief was filed in as of the date received.) Parties served by mail. (klp)

Docket as of December 23, 2004 3:03 pm

Page 13

Proceedings include all events.

03-1162 Soskin, et al v. Reinertson

6/19/03 [1621404] Appellants' brief in response to brief for the United States as Intervenor filed by Appellants Valentin Soskin, Bei Dei Howe, Eva Rosenthal, Vatchagan Tatevosian, Ginda K. Gelfand, Yakov Gelfand, Dubale Shibeshi and Sarin Perlman. Original and 7 copies. c/s: y. Oral Argument? n. (See order of 6/19/03 permitting this brief to be filed.)

(klp)

6/26/03 [1622938] Appellants' supplemental authority filed by Valentin Soskin, Bei Dei Howe, Eva Rosenthal, Vatchagan Tatevosian, Ginda K. Gelfand, Yakov Gelfand, Dubale

Shibeshi, Sarin Perlman and submitted to court. Original and 7 copies. c/s: y. (jal)

- 1/12/04 [1677183] Order filed by Judges Kelly, Henry, and Hartz (as contained in the court's opiion) vacating court order that granting injunction pending appeal [1607155-2]. (gah)
- 1/12/04 [1677184] Terminated on the Merits after Oral Hearing; Affirmed (in part), Reversed (in part), and Remanded; Written, Signed, Published. Kelly; Henry, dissenting; Hartz, authoring judge. Parties served by mail on 1/12/04. (gah)
- 1/23/04 [1680481] Appellants' unopposed motion for clarificaiton, or in the alternative, for extension of time to file petition for rehearing. Original and 3 copies. c/s: y. (klp)
- 1/26/04 [1680548] Appellants' motion for clarification or in the alternative for extension of time to file petition for rehearing submitted to court. (klp)
- 1/27/04 [1681151] Order filed by Judges Kelly, Henry, and Hartz regarding appellants' unopposed motion for clarification or in the alternative motion to extend time to file petition for rehearing. Any petition for rehearing is due 2/25/04. Parties served by mail. (klp)
- 2/25/04 [1688902] Petition for rehearing in banc filed by Valentin Soskin, Bei Dei Howe, Eva Rosenthal, Vatchagan Tatevosian, Ginda K. Gelfand, Yakov Gelfand, Dubale Shibeshi, and Sarin Perlman. Original and 18 copies. c/s: y. (klp)
- 2/26/04 [1688903] Document [1688902-1] Petition for rehearing in banc filed by Appellants Valentin Soskin, Bei Dei Howe, Eva Rosenthal, Vatchagan Tatevosian, Ginda K. Gelfand, Yakov Gelfand, Dubale Shibeshi, Sarin Perlman submitted to panel. (klp)
- 3/1/04 [1689684] Order filed by Judges Kelly, Henry, and Hartz - appellee shall file a response to appellants' petition for rehearing en banc within ten days of the date of this order. Response due 3/15/04 for Karen Reinertson. Parties served by mail. (gah)

Proceedings include all events.

03-1162 Soskin, et al v. Reinertson

3/8/04 [1691758] Appellee's motion to to extend time to file response to petition for rehearing en banc until 3/19/04 filed by Karen Reinertson and submitted to court. (gah)

3/12/04 [1692895] Order filed by Judges Kelly, Henry, and Hartz granting appellee's motion to extend time to file response [1691758-1]. Response due 3/19/04 for Karen Reinertson. Parties served by mail. (gah)

3/15/04 [1693557] Appellee's motion to to extend time to file response to petition for rehearing en banc until 3/26/04 filed by Karen Reinertson and submitted to court. (gah)

3/15/04 [1693660] Notice of appearance filed by Roger Craig Green as attorney for United States. CERT. OF INTERESTED PARTIES (y/n): n. (gah)

3/15/04 [1693679] Response filed by United States to petition for rehearing en banc and submitted to court. Original and 18 copies. c/s: y. (gah)

3/17/04 [1694127] Order filed by Judges Kelly, Henry, and Hartz granting appellee's motion to extend time to file response [1693557-1]. Response due 3/26/04 for Karen Reinertson. Parties served by mail. (gah)

3/26/04 [1696731] Appellee's response filed by Karen Reinertson to petition for rehearing in banc. Original and 18 copies. c/s: y. (klp)

3/29/04 [1696732] Appellee's response filed by Karen Reinertson document [1696731-1] submitted to court. (klp)

3/29/04 [1696988] Notice of Withdrawal received from Karen Reinertson, but not filed. (The notice was not signed by withdrawing counsel.) Original and 3 copies. c/s: y. (klp)

3/30/04 [1697382] Amended notice of withdrawal filed by Ilene Wolf Moore (for Karen Reinertson). Original and 3 copies. c/s: y. (klp)

5/25/04 [1711556] Order filed by Judges Kelly, Henry and Hartz denying appellants' petition for rehearing en banc. Judges Seymour, Henry, Lucero and Murphy would grant rehearing en

banc [1688902-1]. (jal)

6/2/04 [1713314] Mandate issued. Mandate receipt due 7/2/04. (jal)

6/4/04 [1714529] Mandate receipt filed. (jaz)

9/1/04 [1736930] Case file closed. Shipment to records center due  
9/1/06 (erb)

Docket as of December 23, 2004 3:03 pm

Page 15

---

<b>PACER Service Center</b>			
<b>Transaction Receipt</b>			
06/25/2007 18:06:27			
<b>PACER Login:</b>	wu0079	<b>Client Code:</b>	Woodruff
<b>Description:</b>	dkt report	<b>Case Number:</b>	03-1162
<b>Billable Pages:</b>	15	<b>Cost:</b>	1.20

---