

(DTBx),CLOSED,DISCOVERY,MANADR,PROTORD

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT for the CENTRAL DISTRICT OF
CALIFORNIA (Eastern Division – Riverside)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 5:10-cv-00894-VAP-DTB**

Tarek Hamdi v. United States Citizenship and Immigration
Service et al
Assigned to: Judge Virginia A. Phillips
Referred to: Magistrate Judge David T. Bristow
Case in other court: 9th CCA, 12-55794
Cause: 08:1446 Application for Naturalization Hearing

Date Filed: 06/16/2010
Date Terminated: 02/28/2012
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 462 Naturalization
Application
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff

Tarek Hamdi

represented by **Ahilan T Arulanantham**
ACLU Foundation of Southern California
1313 West Eighth Street
Los Angeles, CA 90017
213-977-5236
Fax: 213-977-5297
Email: aarulanantham@aclu-sc.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Bardis Vakili
ACLU of Southern California
2100 N. Broadway Suite 209
Santa Ana, CA 92706
714-450-3962
Fax: 714-543-5240
Email: bvakili@aclu-sc.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Belinda Escobosa Helzer
ACLU Foundation of Southern California
2100 North Broadway Suite 209
Santa Ana, CA 92706
714-450-3962
Fax: 714-543-5240
Email: bescobosahelzer@aclu-sc.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Hector O Villagra
ACLU Foundation of Southern California
1313 West 8th Street
Los Angeles, CA 90017
213-977-9500
Fax: 213-977-5297
Email: hvillagra@aclu-sc.org
TERMINATED: 03/25/2011
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jennifer L Pasquarella
ACLU Foundation of Southern California
1313 West 8th Street
Los Angeles, CA 90017
213-977-9500
Fax: 213-977-5297
Email: jpasquarella@aclu-sc.org
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lucero Chavez
ACLU Foundation of Southern California

2100 N. Broadway, Suite 209
Santa Ana, CA 92706
714-450-3962
Fax: 714-543-5240
Email: LChavez@aclu-sc.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

**United States Citizenship and
Immigration Service**

represented by **Jeffrey Michael Bauer**
US Department of Justice
Immigration Litigation Division
P O Box 868 Ben Franklin Station
Washington, DC 20044
202-532-4786
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Assistant US Attorney LA-CV
AUSA – Office of US Attorney
Civil Division
300 North Los Angeles Street Suite 7516
Los Angeles, CA 90012
213-894-2879
Email: USACAC.Civil@usdoj.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Christopher W Hollis
US Department of Justice
Office of Immigration Litigation District
Court Section
Ben Franklin Station
PO Box 868
Washington, DC 20044
202-305-0899
Fax: 202-616-8962
Email: christopher.hollis@usdoj.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Department of Homeland Security

represented by **Jeffrey Michael Bauer**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Assistant US Attorney LA-CV
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Christopher W Hollis
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Irene Martin
*Director, San Bernardino Field Office,
United States Citizenship and
Immigration Service, in her official
capacity*

represented by **Jeffrey Michael Bauer**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Assistant US Attorney LA-CV
(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Christopher W Hollis
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Jane Arellano
Director, Los Angeles Office, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service, in her official capacity

represented by **Jeffrey Michael Bauer**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Assistant US Attorney LA-CV
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Christopher W Hollis
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Alejandro Mayorkas
Director, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service, in his official capacity

represented by **Jeffrey Michael Bauer**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Assistant US Attorney LA-CV
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Christopher W Hollis
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Janet Napolitano
Secretary, Department of Homeland Security, in her official capacity

represented by **Jeffrey Michael Bauer**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Assistant US Attorney LA-CV
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Christopher W Hollis
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
06/16/2010	<u>1</u>	PETITION filed against Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service De Novo Review of Denial of Application for Naturalization and Request for a Hearing Pursuant to 8 USC 1421(c).(Filing fee \$ 350.), filed by plaintiff Tarek Hamdi.(mrgo) (Additional attachment(s) added on 6/28/2010: # <u>1</u> Summons, # <u>2</u> CV-18, # <u>3</u> Civil Cover Sheet) (mrgo). (Entered: 06/18/2010)
06/16/2010		60 DAY Summons Issued re Petition (case opening), Petition (case opening) <u>1</u> as to defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (mrgo) (Entered: 06/18/2010)

06/16/2010	<u>2</u>	NOTICE of Interested Parties filed by plaintiff Tarek Hamdi, (mrgo) (mrgo). (Entered: 06/18/2010)
06/16/2010	<u>3</u>	NOTICE of Related Case(s) filed by plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. Related Case(s): none. (mrgo) (mrgo). (Entered: 06/18/2010)
06/16/2010	<u>4</u>	NOTICE TO PARTIES OF ADR PROGRAM filed.(mrgo) (mrgo). (Entered: 06/18/2010)
06/22/2010	<u>5</u>	APPLICATION to Seal Exhibits A–H of Plaintiff's Petition for De Novo Review of Denial of Application for Naturalization and Request for a Hearing Pursuant to 8 USC 1421(c) filed by plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. Lodged Order. (ad) (Entered: 06/24/2010)
06/24/2010		CLERKS E–MAIL RE LOCAL RULE 3–2 TO COUNSEL on 6/24/10 addressed to aarulanantham@aclu–sc.org, hvillagra@aclu–sc.org, jpasquarella@aclu–sc.org,. COURT REQUIRES YOUR IMMEDIATE RESPONSE. Pursuant to Local Rule 3–2, you are required to e–mail, within 24 hours of filing, a Filed stamped copy of your complaint and other civil case initiating documents, in PDF format to the Court. To date, we have not received the PDF images of your filing. Please do so within 24 hours or this matter will be referred to the Chief Judge for further proceedings. (mrgo) (Entered: 06/24/2010)
06/24/2010		PDF DOCUMENTS RECEIVED RE LOCAL RULE 3–2. The following PDF Documents were received by the Court on 6/24/10: Petition, civil cover sheet, CV–18, summons, notice of related cases and certificate of interested parties. (mrgo) (Entered: 06/28/2010)
06/25/2010	<u>6</u>	ORDER by Judge Virginia A. Phillips: granting plaintiff's <u>5</u> Application for Order Sealing Exhibits A–H of Plaintiff's Petition for De Novo Review of Denial of Application for Naturalization and Request for a Hearing Pursuant to 8 USC 1421(c). (mrgo) (Entered: 06/28/2010)
06/25/2010	<u>7</u>	SEALED DOCUMENT–EXHIBITS A–H Filed re Plaintiff's Petition (case opening) <u>1</u> . (mrgo) (Entered: 06/28/2010)
06/28/2010		PDF DOCUMENTS ATTACHED TO DOCKET RE LOCAL RULE 3–2. The following PDF Documents were attached to the Court docket on 6/28/10: Petition, civil cover sheet, CV–18, summons, notice of related cases and certificate of interested parties. (mrgo) (Entered: 06/28/2010)
07/23/2010	<u>8</u>	PROOF OF SERVICE Executed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi, upon Defendant All Defendants. Service of the Summons and Complaint were executed upon the United States Attorneys Office by delivering a copy to Patricia Myles. Executed upon the Attorney Generals Office of the United States by delivering a copy to illegible (receipt attached). Executed upon the officer agency or corporation by delivering a copy to Frances Adams (DHS). Service was executed in compliance with Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. Due diligence declaration attached. Registered or certified mail return receipt attached. Original Summons NOT returned. (Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/23/2010)
07/27/2010	<u>9</u>	NOTICE of Appearance filed by attorney Jeffrey Michael Bauer on behalf of Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service (Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 07/27/2010)
08/30/2010	<u>10</u>	ANSWER to Petition (case opening), Petition (case opening) <u>1</u> filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service.(Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 08/30/2010)
09/03/2010	<u>11</u>	ORDER SETTING SCHEDULING CONFERENCE by Judge Virginia A. Phillips: Scheduling Conference set for 11/22/2010 at 01:30 PM before Judge Virginia A. Phillips. (am) (Entered: 09/03/2010)
11/01/2010	<u>12</u>	JOINT ADR PROGRAM QUESTIONNAIRE filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi.(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 11/01/2010)

11/01/2010	<u>13</u>	NOTICE AND REQUEST of Settlement Procedure Selection (Sp1); parties request to Appear Before John McDermott for settlement proceedings. Filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi.(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 11/01/2010)
11/01/2010	<u>14</u>	JOINT REPORT Rule 26(f) Discovery Plan ; estimated length of trial 3 days, filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi.. (Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 11/01/2010)
11/03/2010	<u>15</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents RE: Notice/Request of Settlement Procedure Settlement (Sp 1) – (ADR–1) <u>13</u> . The following error(s) was found: Proposed Document was not submitted as a separate attachment. In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. You need not take any action in response to this notice unless and until the court directs you to do so. (mrgo) (Entered: 11/03/2010)
11/22/2010	<u>16</u>	MINUTES OF Scheduling Conference held before Judge Virginia A. Phillips. Last date to conduct settlement conference is 5/27/2011. The parties shall file a joint report no later than 10 days after the settlement conference regarding the progress of mediation. The parties elect to proceed with Settlement Procedure No. 1., to appear before Magistrate Judge Bristow.Court Reporter: Theresa Lanza. (mrgo) (Entered: 11/23/2010)
11/22/2010	<u>17</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER by Judge Virginia A. Phillips.(Discovery cut–off 5/27/2011., Motions due by 7/11/2011. Last date to conduct settlement conference is 5/27/2011. Bench Trial set for 8/23/2011 at 08:30 AM before Judge Virginia A. Phillips. Pretrial Conference set for 8/15/2011 at 02:30 PM before Judge Virginia A. Phillips.) (mrgo) (Entered: 11/23/2010)
01/26/2011	<u>18</u>	ORDER RE SETTLEMENT CONFERENCE by Magistrate Judge David T Bristow. (Settlement Conference set for 5/25/2011 at 09:30 AM before Magistrate Judge David T Bristow.) (mrgo) (Entered: 01/27/2011)
02/11/2011	<u>19</u>	NOTICE Of Filing of Stipulated Protective Order filed by defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 02/11/2011)
02/14/2011	<u>20</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents RE: Notice (Other) <u>19</u> . The following error(s) was found: Proposed Document was not submitted as a separate attachment. The document attached to this entry is a proposed stipulated Protective Order and not a Notice of Filing. The proposed document should be attached to a Notice of Lodging. In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. You need not take any action in response to this notice unless and until the court directs you to do so. (mrgo) (Entered: 02/14/2011)
02/15/2011	<u>21</u>	RESPONSE BY THE COURT TO NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES IN ELECTRONICALLY FILED DOCUMENTS by Deputy Clerk. The document is stricken and counsel is ordered to file an amended or corrected document within 24 hours of issuance of this notice. The Court ORDERS document No. 19, STRICKEN. Filer's attention is drawn to General Order 08–11, Section VI "Proposed Orders, Proposed Judgments, or Other Proposed Documents that Require a Judge's Signature." Filer may re–file its Stipulation for Protective Order and upload a proposed order to the Court's docket, that will be separately sent to the Chamber's e–mail at:vap_chambers@cacd.uscourts.gov RE: Notice (Other) <u>19</u> (am) (Entered: 02/15/2011)
02/16/2011	<u>22</u>	NOTICE OF LODGING filed <i>Stipulated (Proposed) Protective Order</i> re Response By Court to Notice of Deficiencies (G–112B), Response By Court to Notice of Deficiencies (G–112B), Response By Court to Notice of Deficiencies (G–112B) <u>21</u> , Scheduling Conference, Set/Reset Deadlines,, <u>16</u> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 02/16/2011)
02/28/2011	<u>23</u>	MINUTE ORDER IN CHAMBERS by Judge Virginia A. Phillips: The parties proposed Stipulation and Protective Order has been referred by the District Judge to the Magistrate Judge for consideration. The parties are advised that the Court declines to issue the proposed protective order to which they have stipulated for the

		following reasons: 1. Proposed 9 is inappropriate as phrased, since the Court shall make orders regarding the sealing of records pursuant to Local Rule 79–5.1 (as the parties note in proposed 15). As such, proposed paragraphs 8 and 9 should be revised to conform with Local Rule 79–5.1, if not stricken. (am) (Entered: 03/02/2011)
03/07/2011	<u>24</u>	NOTICE OF LODGING filed (<i>Proposed</i>) <i>Stipulated Protective Order</i> re Minutes of In Chambers Order/Directive – no proceeding held,, <u>23</u> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 03/07/2011)
03/25/2011	<u>25</u>	NOTICE of Change of Attorney Information for attorney Hector O Villagra counsel for Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi.Hector O. Villagra is no longer attorney of record for the aforementioned party in this case for the reason indicated in the G–06 Notice. Filed by plaintiff Tarek Hamdi (Villagra, Hector) (Entered: 03/25/2011)
03/25/2011	<u>26</u>	NOTICE of Change of Attorney Information for attorney Belinda Escobosa Helzer counsel for Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. Adding Belinda Escobosa Helzer as attorney as counsel of record for Tarek Hamdi for the reason indicated in the G–06 Notice. Filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi (Escobosa Helzer, Belinda) (Entered: 03/25/2011)
04/01/2011	<u>27</u>	STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER by Magistrate Judge David T Bristow (am) (Entered: 04/01/2011)
04/28/2011	<u>28</u>	NOTICE of Appearance filed by attorney Christopher W Hollis on behalf of Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service (Hollis, Christopher) (Entered: 04/28/2011)
04/28/2011	<u>29</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION to Compel Discovery of Withheld information, MOTION for Protective Order for From having to provide documents and testimony filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. Motion set for hearing on 5/19/2011 at 10:00 AM before Magistrate Judge David T Bristow. (Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 04/28/2011)
04/28/2011	<u>30</u>	JOINT STIPULATION to MOTION to Compel Discovery of Withheld information MOTION for Protective Order for From having to provide documents and testimony <u>29</u> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A – Standing Order, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B – Govt's Privilege Log, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C – Arellano Declaration, # <u>4</u> Proposed Order Plaintiff's, # <u>5</u> Proposed Order Defendant's)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 04/28/2011)
05/05/2011	<u>31</u>	MINUTES (IN CHAMBERS): ORDER by Magistrate Judge David T Bristow: The Court is in receipt of Plaintiffs Motion to Compel Discovery and defendants Motion for a Protective Order filed April 28, 2011. Oppositions to the Motions are due on or before May 25, 2011. Replies to the Oppositions to the Motions are due on or before June 1, 2011. The Motions will be taken under submission as of the date the Replies are due and/or filed, and will be decided on the papers without oral argument. See Local Rule 7–15. Accordingly, the hearings noticed for May 19, 2011, are ordered off calendar. <u>29</u> (am) (Entered: 05/05/2011)
05/13/2011	<u>32</u>	Joint STIPULATION for Order Modifying Case Management and Scheduling Order filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 05/13/2011)
05/19/2011	<u>33</u>	Joint STIPULATION for Order Re: Settlement Conference filed by defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 05/19/2011)
05/19/2011	<u>34</u>	STIPULATED MODIFIED SCHEDULING ORDER by Judge Virginia A. Phillips: The prior dates set forth in the Courts November 23, 2010 Order (Dkt. No. 17) are vacated, and the Court enters this case management and scheduling order setting the dates as follows: a. Discovery cut–off July 27, 2011; b. Summary judgment motions due August 29, 2011; c. Hearing on summary judgment motions

		September 26, 2011, 2:00 pm; d. Pretrial conference October 24, 2011, at 2:30 p.m.; and e. Court Trial November 1, 2011, at 8:30 a.m. before Judge Virginia A. Phillips. (am) (Entered: 05/20/2011)
05/20/2011	<u>35</u>	STIPULATED ORDER by Judge Virginia A. Phillips: Good cause having been shown and for the reasons set forth in the parties Stipulation Re Settlement Conference, the Court hereby cancels the scheduling conference currently set for Thursday, May 26, 2011. The clerk is directed to remove the conference from the Courts calendar. (am) (Entered: 05/20/2011)
05/25/2011	<u>36</u>	MEMORANDUM in Opposition to MOTION to Compel Discovery of Withheld information MOTION for Protective Order for From having to provide documents and testimony <u>29</u> filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration)(Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 05/25/2011)
05/25/2011	<u>37</u>	Opposition in opposition re: MOTION to Compel Discovery of Withheld information MOTION for Protective Order for From having to provide documents and testimony <u>29</u> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration Pasquarella iso)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/25/2011)
06/01/2011	<u>38</u>	REPLY Re: MOTION to Compel Discovery of Withheld information MOTION for Protective Order for From having to provide documents and testimony <u>29</u> filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 06/01/2011)
06/01/2011	<u>39</u>	REPLY Opposition MOTION to Compel Discovery of Withheld information MOTION for Protective Order for From having to provide documents and testimony <u>29</u> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration Declaration of Belinda Escobosa Helzer in Support of Plaintiff's Reply to Defendants' Supplemental Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion to Compel)(Escobosa Helzer, Belinda) (Entered: 06/01/2011)
06/22/2011	<u>40</u>	ORDER by Magistrate Judge David T Bristow re: <u>29</u> Motion to Compel; and <u>29</u> Motion for Protective Order re MOTION to Compel Discovery of Withheld information MOTION for Protective Order for From having to provide documents and testimony <u>29</u> . In view of the foregoing rulings, plaintiffs Motion to Compel Discovery and defendants Motion for Protective Order are each granted in part and denied in part as follows: (see document for specifics). (mrgo) (Entered: 06/22/2011)
07/05/2011	<u>41</u>	NOTICE OF LODGING filed (<i>privileged documents for in camera review</i>) re Order on Motion to Compel, Order on Motion for Protective Order,, <u>40</u> (Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 07/05/2011)
07/05/2011	<u>42</u>	REQUEST for Consideration of Request that, if Court finds any documents are not privileged, the Court allow an appropriate amount of time for Defendants to file a motion for review of such finding filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Hollis, Christopher) (Entered: 07/05/2011)
07/05/2011	<u>43</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service, re REQUEST for Consideration of Request that, if Court finds any documents are not privileged, the Court allow an appropriate amount of time for Defendants to file a motion for review of such finding <u>42</u> served on 7/5/11. (Hollis, Christopher) (Entered: 07/05/2011)
07/08/2011	<u>44</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION for Reconsideration re Order on Motion to Compel, Order on Motion for Protective Order,, <u>40</u> filed by plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. Motion set for hearing on 7/21/2011 at 10:00 AM before Magistrate Judge David T Bristow. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum, # <u>2</u> Declaration, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Dec Ex A, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Dec Ex B, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Dec Ex C, # <u>6</u> Exhibit Dec Ex D, # <u>7</u> Exhibit Dec Ex E, # <u>8</u> Proposed Order)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/08/2011)

07/08/2011	<u>45</u>	STIPULATION for Reconsideration re Order on Motion to Compel, Order on Motion for Protective Order,, <u>40</u> filed by plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/08/2011)
07/13/2011	<u>46</u>	STIPULATED MODIFIED SCHEDULING ORDER FOR SHORTENED TIME ON PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR RECONSIDERATION HEARING by Magistrate Judge David T Bristow: Good cause having been shown and for the reasons set forth in the parties Joint Stipulation to Shorten Time on Plaintiffs Motion for Reconsideration, the stipulation is hereby GRANTED. The parties shall comply with the following briefing schedule: a. July 15, 2011: Last day to file opposition to Plaintiffs Motion for Reconsideration b. July 18, 2011: Last day to file reply to opposition to Plaintiffs Motion for Reconsideration c. July 21, 2011: Hearing on Motion for Reconsideration. (am) (Entered: 07/13/2011)
07/15/2011	<u>47</u>	MEMORANDUM in Opposition to MOTION for Reconsideration re Order on Motion to Compel, Order on Motion for Protective Order,, <u>40</u> MOTION for Reconsideration re Order on Motion to Compel, Order on Motion for Protective Order,, <u>40</u> <u>44</u> filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration (With Exhibits), # <u>2</u> Proposed Order)(Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 07/15/2011)
07/15/2011	<u>48</u>	Joint STIPULATION to Reschedule Entire Case Schedule filed by plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/15/2011)
07/17/2011	<u>51</u>	STIPULATED MODIFIED SCHEDULING ORDER by Judge Virginia A. Phillips: Second Stipulation to Modify Scheduling Order <u>48</u> is GRANTED. a. Discovery cut-off: September 27, 2011; b. Summary judgment motions due: October 28, 2011; c. Hearing on summary judgment motions: November 28, 2011, at 2:00pm; d. Pretrial conference: January 23, 2012, at 2:30pm; e. Trial: January 31, 2012, at 9:00am. IT SO ORDERED. (ad) (Entered: 07/19/2011)
07/18/2011	<u>49</u>	REPLY in support of MOTION for Reconsideration re Order on Motion to Compel, Order on Motion for Protective Order,, <u>40</u> MOTION for Reconsideration re Order on Motion to Compel, Order on Motion for Protective Order,, <u>40</u> <u>44</u> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration Pasquarella iso)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/18/2011)
07/18/2011	<u>50</u>	MINUTES (IN CHAMBERS) ORDER re REVIEW OF DOCUMENTS LODGED BY DEFENDANTS FOR IN CAMERA REVIEW by Magistrate Judge David T Bristow: denying <u>42</u> Request for Consideration. In accordance with the Courts June 22, 2011 Order, defendants have lodged for in camera review documents that were withheld from discovery on the basis of the deliberative process privilege and/or the law enforcement privilege. Based on the Courts in camera review of these documents and the governing legal principles, the Court now rules as follows. (See document for specifics) (mrgo) (Entered: 07/19/2011)
07/21/2011	<u>55</u>	MINUTES OF Motion Hearing held before Magistrate Judge David T Bristow: RE PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR RECONSIDERATION OF ORDER RE: PLAINTIFFS MOTION TO COMPEL DISCOVERY AND DEFENDANTS MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER: Having reviewed and considered the contentions of the parties as reflected in the parties filings and during oral argument, the Court now rules as follows: Plaintiffs Motion is hereby GRANTED in part and DENIED in part. Specifically, the Court concludes that the policies, procedures, practices, and training that address or relate to defendants interpretation of the terms association(s), membership(s), and affiliation(s) could reasonably lead to the discovery of admissible evidence, particularly in light of defendants contention that plaintiff lacks good moral character because of his association with Benevolence International Foundation and Care International. See Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b)(1). As such, within ten (10) days of the service date of this Order, defendants are ordered to produce to plaintiff those documents that are responsive to plaintiffs First Set of Requests for Production of Documents Nos. 7 and 11 (subcategories a, b, and i only) as each of these requests appear to directly request information regarding an applicants association with or contribution of money to organizations similar to Benevolence International Foundation and Care International. Further, plaintiff shall be permitted to seek testimony regarding this

		information at the depositions of the Rule 30(b)(6) representative and Irene Martin. Plaintiffs Motion for Reconsideration is DENIED in all other respects. <u>44</u> Court Recorder: RS-4 7-21-11. (am) (Entered: 07/27/2011)
07/25/2011	<u>52</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION to Compel Further answers to deposition questions & further responses to P's Interrogatories filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. Motion set for hearing on 8/11/2011 at 10:00 AM before Magistrate Judge David T Bristow. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Joint Stipulation re MTC, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Def's Ex A - Arellano, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Def's Ex B - Kielsmeier, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Def's Ex C - Miramontes, # <u>5</u> Proposed Order P's PORD MTC, # <u>6</u> Proposed Order Def's PORD MTC)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/25/2011)
07/25/2011	<u>53</u>	STIPULATION to Reschedule Hearing on Motion to Compel filed by plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order To Shorten Time)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/25/2011)
07/25/2011	<u>54</u>	MINUTE ORDER IN CHAMBERS RE REVIEW OF DOCUMENTS LODGED BY DEFENDANTS FOR IN CAMERA REVIEW by Magistrate Judge David T Bristow: Accordingly, within 14 days of the service date of this Order, defendants are ORDERED to produce GOV000340 to plaintiff. However, if defendants timely object to this Order pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 72(a), then compliance with it shall be stayed pending the District Courts ruling on the objections. (am) (Entered: 07/26/2011)
07/29/2011	<u>56</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION for Review of and Objections to Magistrate Judge's Order of July 18, 2011 filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. Motion set for hearing on 8/22/2011 at 02:00 PM before Judge Virginia A. Phillips. (Hollis, Christopher) (Entered: 07/29/2011)
08/01/2011	<u>57</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents RE: MOTION for Review of and Objections to Magistrate Judge's Order of July 18, 2011 <u>56</u> . The following error(s) was found: Hearing information is missing, incorrect, or not timely. The next available motion dates for Judge Virginia A. Phillips are 8/29/11, 9/12/11 and 9/19/11 at 2:00 PM. In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. You need not take any action in response to this notice unless and until the court directs you to do so. (am) (Entered: 08/01/2011)
08/01/2011	<u>58</u>	NOTICE OF LODGING filed (<i>privileged documents for in camera review</i>) re MOTION for Review of and Objections to Magistrate Judge's Order of July 18, 2011 <u>56</u> (Hollis, Christopher) (Entered: 08/01/2011)
08/01/2011	<u>59</u>	RESPONSE BY THE COURT TO NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES IN ELECTRONICALLY FILED DOCUMENTS RE: MOTION for Review of and Objections to Magistrate Judge's Order of July 18, 2011 <u>56</u> . The hearings re Motion or Report and Recommendation deadlines originally scheduled have been rescheduled(Motion reset for hearing on 8/29/2011 at 02:00 PM before Judge Virginia A. Phillips.) (mrgo) (Entered: 08/01/2011)
08/01/2011	<u>60</u>	MINUTES OF TELEPHONIC CONFERENCE held before Magistrate Judge David T Bristow: The Court ordered the parties to meet and confer regarding the pending discovery dispute and were ordered to advise the Court as to any remaining issues. Court Recorder: RS-4 8-1-11. (ad) (Entered: 08/04/2011)
08/04/2011	<u>61</u>	MINUTE ORDER IN CHAMBERS by Judge Virginia A. Phillips JOINT STIPULATION TO SHORTEN TIME FOR HEARING OF PLAINTIFFS MOTION TO COMPEL DISCOVERY <u>53</u> : The Court has read and considered the parties Joint Stipulation and hereby DENIES the same. The Motion to Compel will be taken under submission as of the date the Reply is due and/or filed, and will be decided on the papers without oral argument. (ad) (Entered: 08/04/2011)
08/08/2011	<u>62</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION for Review of July 27, 2011 Discovery Order filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and

		Immigration Service. Motion set for hearing on 9/12/2011 at 02:00 PM before Judge Virginia A. Phillips. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 08/08/2011)
08/08/2011	<u>63</u>	EX PARTE APPLICATION for Discovery regarding Stay of July 27, 2011 Discovery Order Pending Motion For Review filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 08/08/2011)
08/08/2011	<u>64</u>	Objection in opposition re: MOTION for Review of and Objections to Magistrate Judge's Order of July 18, 2011 <u>56</u> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 08/08/2011)
08/09/2011	<u>65</u>	Joint STIPULATION for Discovery as to Plaintiffs Interrogatories and questioning of USCIS Officer Osuna filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi.(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 08/09/2011)
08/11/2011	<u>66</u>	MEMORANDUM in Opposition to MOTION to Compel Further answers to deposition questions & further responses to P's Interrogatories <u>52</u> filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 08/11/2011)
08/15/2011	<u>67</u>	REPLY in support of MOTION for Review of and Objections to Magistrate Judge's Order of July 18, 2011 <u>56</u> filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Hollis, Christopher) (Entered: 08/15/2011)
08/15/2011	<u>68</u>	REPLY IN SUPPORT OF MOTION to Compel Further answers to deposition questions & further responses to P's Interrogatories <u>52</u> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B, # <u>4</u> Exhibit C-E)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 08/15/2011)
08/19/2011	<u>69</u>	ORDER by Magistrate Judge David T Bristow: granting <u>63</u> Ex Parte Application for Stay of the Court's 7/27/11, Order pending a motion for review. (mrgo) (Entered: 08/19/2011)
08/22/2011	<u>70</u>	Response in Opposition re: MOTION for Review of July 27, 2011 Discovery Order <u>62</u> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 08/22/2011)
08/27/2011	<u>71</u>	REPLY in support of MOTION for Review of July 27, 2011 Discovery Order <u>62</u> filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 08/27/2011)
09/01/2011	<u>72</u>	NOTICE OF ERRATA filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. correcting MOTION for Review of July 27, 2011 Discovery Order <u>62</u> <i>Joint Notice of Errata Regarding Caption of Defendants' Notice of Motion for Review of Magistrate Judge Bristow's Discovery Order Entered July 27, 2011</i> (Hollis, Christopher) (Entered: 09/01/2011)
09/12/2011	<u>73</u>	MINUTES OF Motion Hearing held before Judge Virginia A. Phillips RE: MOTION for Review of and Objections to Magistrate Judge's Order of July 18, 2011 <u>56</u> , MOTION for Review of July 27, 2011 Discovery Order <u>62</u> . The Court issues a tentative ruling, hears oral argument and takes the matter(s) under submission. Court Reporter: Phyllis Preston. (mrgo) (Entered: 09/13/2011)
09/19/2011	<u>74</u>	JOINT STIPULATION AND ORDER ON DEPOSITION SCHEDULING AND PENDING DISCOVERY MATTERS filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi (Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 09/19/2011)
09/20/2011	<u>75</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents RE: Miscellaneous Document <u>74</u> . The following error(s) was found: Proposed Document was not submitted as a separate attachment. This is a proposed

		document because there is an order contained within the stipulation. A proposed document such as this should be a separate attachment to a Notice of Lodging.. In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. You need not take any action in response to this notice unless and until the court directs you to do so. (mrgo) (Entered: 09/20/2011)
09/20/2011	<u>76</u>	RESPONSE BY THE COURT TO NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES IN ELECTRONICALLY FILED DOCUMENTS; ORDER by Deputy Clerk: The document is stricken and counsel is ordered to file an amended or corrected document within 48 hours of issuance of this Response. Pursuant to the General Order governing electronic filing, GO 10-07, Section 6 (page 21), Proposed orders or other proposed documents that are not filed with a main document, such as a proposed judgment or proposed findings of fact, shall be electronically filed as an attachment to a Notice of Lodging. RE: Joint Stipulation and Order <u>74</u> . (ad) (Entered: 09/20/2011)
09/20/2011	<u>77</u>	Joint STIPULATION for Order on Deposition Scheduling and Pending Discovery Matters filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order re Parties' Joint Stipulation re Deposition Scheduling and Pending Discovery Matters)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 09/20/2011)
09/28/2011	<u>78</u>	MINUTES (IN CHAMBERS) ORDER by Judge Virginia A. Phillips: granting in part and denying in part defendants' <u>56</u> Motion for Review; granting defendants' <u>62</u> Motion for Review. (See document for specifics) (mrgo) (Entered: 09/29/2011)
09/29/2011	<u>79</u>	ORDER RE PARTIES JOINT STIPULATION RE DEPOSITION SCHEDULING AND PENDINGDISCOVERY MATTERS by Judge Virginia A. Phillips: THE COURT, having considered the parties joint stipulation, APPROVES the parties stipulation. (am) (Entered: 09/29/2011)
10/11/2011	<u>80</u>	MINUTE ORDER IN CHAMBERS by Magistrate Judge David T Bristow re: MOTION to Compel Further answers to deposition questions & further responses to P's Interrogatories <u>52</u> . Currently pending before this Court is plaintiffs Motion to Compel Further Answers to Deposition Questions and Further Responses to Plaintiffs First Set of Interrogatories (Motion) filed July 25, 2011. However, the Court notes that the District Courts September 28, 2011, Minute Order may impact the resolution of this discovery dispute. Specifically, defendants filed two Motions for Review of the Courts previous discovery Orders. On September 28, 2011, the District Court issued a Minute Order granting in part and denying in part defendants first Motion for Review and granting defendants second Motion for Review. The District Courts September 28, 2011, Minute Order appears to address many of the issues currently pending in this Motion. In light of the District Courts Minute Order, the Court hereby ORDERS further briefly solely addressing the impact of the District Courts September 28, 2011, Minute Order as it relates to the currently pending Motion. Therefore, the parties are ORDERED to file simultaneous letter briefs not to exceed six (6) pages due on October 25, 2011. No responsive briefs shall be filed. (mrgo) (Entered: 10/12/2011)
10/25/2011	<u>81</u>	SUPPLEMENTAL LETTER BRIEF filed by PLAINTIFF Tarek Hamdi. regarding Minutes of In Chambers Order/Directive – no proceeding held,,,,, <u>80</u> . (Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 10/25/2011)
10/25/2011	<u>82</u>	SUPPLEMENT to MOTION to Compel Further answers to deposition questions & further responses to P's Interrogatories <u>52</u> <i>Supplement to Opposition Filed Pursuant to Court's 10/12 Order (Dkt. No. 80)</i> filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 10/25/2011)
10/26/2011	<u>83</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents RE: Brief (non-motion non-appeal) <u>81</u> , Supplement(Motion related), Supplement(Motion related) <u>82</u> . The following error(s) was found: Title page is missing. In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. You need not take any action in response to this notice unless and until the court directs you to do so. (am) (Entered: 10/26/2011)

10/27/2011	<u>84</u>	RESPONSE BY THE COURT TO NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES IN ELECTRONICALLY FILED DOCUMENTS. The document is accepted as filed. Pursuant to the Minutes issued by the Honorable David T. Bristow (Dkt. No. 80), the Court requested the parties to file simultaneous letter briefs as mentioned therein. RE: Brief (non-motion non-appeal) <u>81</u> , Supplement(Motion related), Supplement(Motion related) <u>82</u> . (mrgr) (Entered: 10/28/2011)
10/28/2011	<u>85</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION for Summary Judgment as to all Counts in Petition filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. Motion set for hearing on 11/28/2011 at 02:00 PM before Judge Virginia A. Phillips. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Robert Osuna, # <u>2</u> Declaration Of Jeffrey M. Bauer, # <u>3</u> Exhibit A, # <u>4</u> Exhibit B, # <u>5</u> Exhibit C, # <u>6</u> Exhibit D, # <u>7</u> Exhibit E, # <u>8</u> Exhibit F, # <u>9</u> Exhibit G, # <u>10</u> Exhibit H, # <u>11</u> Exhibit I, # <u>12</u> Exhibit J, # <u>13</u> Exhibit K, # <u>14</u> Exhibit L, # <u>15</u> Exhibit M, # <u>16</u> Exhibit N, # <u>17</u> Exhibit Statement Of Uncontroverted Facts and Conclusions of Law, # <u>18</u> Proposed Order (Judgment))(Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 10/28/2011)
11/07/2011	<u>86</u>	Opposition in opposition re: MOTION for Summary Judgment as to all Counts in Petition <u>85</u> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Evidentiary Objections, # <u>2</u> Request for Judicial Notice, # <u>3</u> Proposed Order, # <u>4</u> Statement of Genuine Issues, # <u>5</u> Declaration Belinda Escobosa Helzer Declaration, # <u>6</u> Exhibit A-E, # <u>7</u> Exhibit F pt. 1, # <u>8</u> Exhibit F pt. 2, # <u>9</u> Exhibit F pt. 3, # <u>10</u> Exhibit G - N, # <u>11</u> Exhibit O - T)(Escobosa Helzer, Belinda) (Entered: 11/07/2011)
11/08/2011	<u>87</u>	NOTICE OF ERRATA filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. correcting Objection/Opposition (Motion related), Objection/Opposition (Motion related) <u>86</u> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Request for Judicial Notice, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A - C)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 11/08/2011)
11/14/2011	<u>88</u>	REPLY in support of MOTION for Summary Judgment as to all Counts in Petition <u>85</u> filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Defendants' Responses to Plaintiff's Evidentiary Objections Lodged in Support of Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment)(Hollis, Christopher) (Entered: 11/14/2011)
11/16/2011	<u>89</u>	MINUTES (IN CHAMBERS): ORDER RE PLAINTIFFS MOTION TO COMPEL FURTHER DISCOVERY RESPONSES (DKT. NO. 52) by Magistrate Judge David T Bristow: Thus, this matter is now ready for decision. For the reasons discussed below, particularly in light of the District Judges September 28, 2011 Minute Order, plaintiffs Motion is GRANTED in part and DENIED in part. <u>52</u> (am) (Entered: 11/17/2011)
11/22/2011	<u>90</u>	NOTICE of Change of Attorney Information for attorney Belinda Escobosa Helzer counsel for Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. Changing Address to 2100 N. Broadway, Suite 209, Santa Ana, CA 92706. Changing Fax Number to (714) 543-5240. Filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi (Escobosa Helzer, Belinda) (Entered: 11/22/2011)
11/27/2011	<u>91</u>	NOTICE OF ERRATA filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. correcting Objection/Opposition (Motion related), Objection/Opposition (Motion related) <u>86</u> <i>Regarding Docket Numbers 86-4 through 86-11</i> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Corrected Statement of Genuine Issues of Material Fact in Support of Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment, # <u>2</u> Declaration Corrected Declaration of Belinda Escobosa Helzer in Support of Plaintiff's Opposition to Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment, # <u>3</u> Exhibit A, # <u>4</u> Exhibit B, # <u>5</u> Exhibit C, # <u>6</u> Exhibit D, # <u>7</u> Exhibit E, # <u>8</u> Exhibit F part 1, # <u>9</u> Exhibit F part 2, # <u>10</u> Exhibit F part 3, # <u>11</u> Exhibit F part 4, # <u>12</u> Exhibit F part 5, # <u>13</u> Exhibit G, # <u>14</u> Exhibit H, # <u>15</u> Exhibit I, # <u>16</u> Exhibit J, # <u>17</u> Exhibit K, # <u>18</u> Exhibit L, # <u>19</u> Exhibit M, # <u>20</u> Exhibit N, # <u>21</u> Exhibit O, # <u>22</u> Exhibit P, # <u>23</u> Exhibit Q, # <u>24</u> Exhibit R, # <u>25</u> Exhibit S, # <u>26</u> Exhibit T)(Escobosa Helzer, Belinda) (Entered: 11/27/2011)
11/28/2011	<u>92</u>	MINUTES OF DEFENDANTS MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT <u>85</u> held before Judge Virginia A. Phillips: Court issues a tentative ruling, hears oral argument and takes the matter under submission. Court Reporter: Phyllis Preston. Tape #: N/A. (ad) (Entered: 11/29/2011)

12/14/2011	<u>93</u>	ORDER by Judge Virginia A. Phillips: granting in part and denying in part defendants' <u>85</u> Motion for Summary Judgment. (See document for specifics) (mrgo) (Entered: 12/14/2011)
12/27/2011	<u>94</u>	NOTICE of Change of Attorney Information for attorney Bardis Vakili counsel for Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. Adding Bardis Vakili as attorney as counsel of record for Tarek Hamdi for the reason indicated in the G-06 Notice. Filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi (Vakili, Bardis) (Entered: 12/27/2011)
12/29/2011	<u>95</u>	NOTICE of Change of Attorney Information for attorney Lucero Chavez counsel for Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. Adding Lucero Chavez as attorney as counsel of record for Tarek Hamdi for the reason indicated in the G-06 Notice. Filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi (Chavez, Lucero) (Entered: 12/29/2011)
12/30/2011	<u>96</u>	Witness List filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service.. (Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 12/30/2011)
12/30/2011	<u>97</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION IN LIMINE to Exclude Testimony of Stacy Tolchin filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. Motion set for hearing on 1/23/2012 at 02:30 PM before Judge Virginia A. Phillips. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Proposed Order)(Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 12/30/2011)
12/30/2011	<u>98</u>	MEMORANDUM of CONTENTIONS of FACT and LAW filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 12/30/2011)
12/30/2011	<u>99</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION IN LIMINE #1 to Exclude Testimony of Elias Valdez filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. Motion set for hearing on 1/23/2012 at 02:30 PM before Judge Virginia A. Phillips. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration iso Motion in Limine #1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Ex A - Valdez Depo, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Ex B - Valdez Exhibit, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Ex C - RFA, # <u>5</u> Proposed Order)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 12/30/2011)
12/30/2011	<u>100</u>	Joint Exhibit List filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi.. (Escobosa Helzer, Belinda) (Entered: 12/30/2011)
12/30/2011	<u>101</u>	Witness List filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi.. (Escobosa Helzer, Belinda) (Entered: 12/30/2011)
12/30/2011	<u>102</u>	MEMORANDUM of CONTENTIONS of FACT and LAW filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Escobosa Helzer, Belinda) (Entered: 12/30/2011)
12/30/2011	<u>103</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION IN LIMINE #2 to Exclude Testimony of Michael Caputo filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. Motion set for hearing on 1/23/2012 at 02:30 PM before Judge Virginia A. Phillips. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration Vakili iso MIL #2, # <u>2</u> Exhibit To Vakili Dec, # <u>3</u> Proposed Order)(Vakili, Bardis) (Entered: 12/30/2011)
12/30/2011	<u>104</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION IN LIMINE (#2) to Exclude Testimony of Mustafa Umar filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. Motion set for hearing on 1/23/2012 at 02:30 PM before Judge Virginia A. Phillips. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Proposed Order)(Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 12/30/2011)
01/06/2012	<u>105</u>	OPPOSITION to MOTION IN LIMINE (#2) to Exclude Testimony of Mustafa Umar MOTION IN LIMINE (#2) to Exclude Testimony of Mustafa Umar <u>104</u> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration iso Opp to MIL with Exhibits)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 01/06/2012)
01/06/2012	<u>106</u>	MEMORANDUM in Opposition to MOTION IN LIMINE #1 to Exclude Testimony of Elias Valdez <u>99</u> filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed

		Order)(Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 01/06/2012)
01/06/2012	<u>107</u>	MEMORANDUM in Opposition to MOTION IN LIMINE #2 to Exclude Testimony of Michael Caputo <u>103</u> filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Jeffrey M. Bauer, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B, # <u>4</u> Exhibit C, # <u>5</u> Proposed Order)(Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 01/06/2012)
01/06/2012	<u>108</u>	Opposition In Opposition to Defendants' Motion in Limine re: MOTION IN LIMINE to Exclude Testimony of Stacy Tolchin <u>97</u> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Ahilan Arulanantham in Support of Plaintiff Opposition to Defendants' Motion in Limine to Exclude Testimony of Stacy Tolchin, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A)(Arulanantham, Ahilan) (Entered: 01/06/2012)
01/10/2012	<u>109</u>	NOTICE OF ERRATA filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. correcting Witness List <u>101</u> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Plaintiff-Petitioner's Witness List)(Escobosa Helzer, Belinda) (Entered: 01/10/2012)
01/13/2012	<u>110</u>	REPLY in support of MOTION IN LIMINE to Exclude Testimony of Stacy Tolchin <u>97</u> filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Hollis, Christopher) (Entered: 01/13/2012)
01/13/2012	<u>111</u>	REPLY in support of MOTION IN LIMINE (#2) to Exclude Testimony of Mustafa Umar MOTION IN LIMINE (#2) to Exclude Testimony of Mustafa Umar <u>104</u> filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Hollis, Christopher) (Entered: 01/13/2012)
01/13/2012	<u>112</u>	NOTICE OF LODGING Proposed Pretrial Conference Order Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi, Defendant United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. <i>et al.</i> , (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order Pretrial Conference Order, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B)(Escobosa Helzer, Belinda) (Entered: 01/13/2012)
01/13/2012	<u>113</u>	REPLY IN SUPPORT OF MOTION IN LIMINE #1 to Exclude Testimony of Elias Valdez <u>99</u> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 01/13/2012)
01/13/2012	<u>114</u>	REPLY IN SUPPORT OF MOTION IN LIMINE #2 to Exclude Testimony of Michael Caputo <u>103</u> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Bardis Vakili in support of Motion in Limine No. 2, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A)(Vakili, Bardis) (Entered: 01/13/2012)
01/23/2012	<u>121</u>	MINUTES OF Plaintiffs Motion-In-Limine (1) Motion To Exclude Defendants Witness Elias Valdez From Testifying At Trial (ECF 99) (2) Motion No. 2, to Exclude Oral and Written Testimony (ECF 103) Defendants Motion-In-Limine (1) Motion in Limine to Exclude the Testimony at Trial of Stacy Tolchin (ECF 97) (2) Motion in Limine to Exclude the Testimony at Trial of Mustafa Umar (ECF 104) PRETRIAL CONFERENCE WAS HELD before Judge Virginia A. Phillips: Plaintiffs Motions are both DENIED, for the reasons as stated on the record (Nos. ECF 99 and 103) Defendants Motion as to Stacy Tolchin (ECF 97) is GRANTED, and Defendants motion as to Mustafa Umar (ECF 104) is DENIED, for the reasons as stated on the record. The Pretrial Conference regularly set in this matter for today was held. Counsel for both sides announced ready to proceed in this matter, set for a Court Trial on January 31, 2012, at 9:00 a.m., in Courtroom No. 2. The estimated length of trial is approximately 3 days. Revised Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law are due lodged by no later than January 25, 2012, at 4:00 p.m. (Pacific Time)Court Reporter: Phyllis Preston. (am) (Entered: 01/31/2012)
01/25/2012	<u>115</u>	TRIAL BRIEF filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service.. (Hollis, Christopher) (Entered: 01/25/2012)
01/25/2012	<u>116</u>	NOTICE filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. <i>Notice of Lodging of Defendants' Proposed Findings of Fact</i>

		<i>and Conclusions of Law</i> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Defendants' Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law)(Hollis, Christopher) (Entered: 01/25/2012)
01/25/2012	<u>117</u>	NOTICE OF LODGING filed re Notice (Other), Notice (Other) <u>116</u> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order Findings of Fact & Conclusions of Law)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 01/25/2012)
01/25/2012	<u>118</u>	TRIAL BRIEF filed by plaintiff Tarek Hamdi.. (Escobosa Helzer, Belinda) (Entered: 01/25/2012)
01/25/2012	<u>119</u>	Amended Joint Exhibit List filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi.. (Escobosa Helzer, Belinda) (Entered: 01/25/2012)
01/25/2012	<u>120</u>	NOTICE OF LODGING Proposed Pretrial Conference Order Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Pretrial Conference Order)(Escobosa Helzer, Belinda) (Entered: 01/25/2012)
02/01/2012	<u>122</u>	REQUEST FOR JUDICIAL NOTICE <i>AT TRIAL</i> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D)(Escobosa Helzer, Belinda) (Entered: 02/01/2012)
02/01/2012	<u>123</u>	MINUTES OF COURT TRIAL (1st Day) held before Judge Virginia A. Phillips: Opening statements made. Witnesses called, sworn and testified. Exhibits identified and admitted. Case continued to 2/2/2012 at 9:00AM. Court Reporter: Theresa Lanza. (ad) (Entered: 02/02/2012)
02/02/2012	<u>124</u>	MINUTES OF Court Trial (2nd Day) held and completed before Judge Virginia A. Phillips: Witnesses called, sworn and testified. Exhibits identified and admitted. Closing arguments made. Filed Witness and Exhibit List. Case submitted. Counsel stipulate to the return of exhibits upon the conclusion of trial. Exhibit Release Form prepared and filed. Case is submitted. Lodged deposition transcripts to be returned to the proffering party at the conclusion of the Courts ruling. Court Reporter: Theresa Lanza. (am) (Entered: 02/02/2012)
02/02/2012	<u>125</u>	RECEIPT FOR RELEASE OF EXHIBITS to Counsel Upon Verdict/Judgment at Trial; Pursuant to stip of counsel and/or by Order of the Court, all exhibits listed on Joint exhibits list are returned to counsel for respective party(ies). (am) (Entered: 02/15/2012)
02/02/2012	<u>126</u>	JOINT Exhibit List filed by plaintiffs and defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Tarek Hamdi, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service.. (am) (Entered: 02/15/2012)
02/02/2012	<u>127</u>	Witness List filed by defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service.. (am) (Entered: 02/15/2012)
02/02/2012	<u>128</u>	Witness List filed by defendant Tarek Hamdi.. (am) (Entered: 02/15/2012)
02/25/2012	<u>130</u>	FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW signed by Judge Virginia A. Phillips.(See document for specifics) (mrgo) (Entered: 02/28/2012)
02/28/2012	<u>129</u>	ORDER AND JUDGMENT by Judge Virginia A. Phillips, Related to: Petition (case opening) <u>1</u> . Pursuant to the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law issued herewith, the Court hereby finds Petitioner Tarek Hamdi statutorily eligible for naturalization under the Immigration and Naturalization Act, and ORDERS that Respondents GRANT Petitioner's application for naturalization. The Court FURTHER ORDERS Respondents to prepare the appropriate documents for the Court to administer the oath of allegiance and forward such documents to the Clerk of Court in order that the Court may administer such oath to Petitioner. (MD JS-6, Case Terminated). (mrgo) (Entered: 02/28/2012)
03/08/2012	<u>131</u>	Joint STIPULATION for Extension of Time to File Motion for Attorney Fees filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 03/08/2012)

03/14/2012	<u>132</u>	ORDER ON JOINT STIPULATION SETTING BRIEFING SCHEDULE FOR PETITIONERS MOTION FOR ATTORNEYS FEES AND COSTS UNDER THE EQUAL ACCESS TO JUSTICE ACT. by Judge Virginia A. Phillips: Good cause having been shown in the parties joint stipulation, the Court orders as follows: The deadline for Petitioner to file for attorneys fees and costs will be set under the Equal Access to Justice Act (EAJA), not the Local Rules. Petitioner will notice the motion for a hearing at least sixty (60) days from the filing of the motion; Respondents will file their opposition to the motion within twenty-eight (28) days after the filing of the motion; and Petitioner will file his reply in support of the motion within fourteen (14) days after the filing of Respondents opposition. <u>131</u> (am) (Entered: 03/15/2012)
04/30/2012	<u>133</u>	NOTICE OF APPEAL to the 9th CCA filed by Defendants/Respondents Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. Appeal of Judgment,, <u>129</u> , Findings of Fact & Conclusions of Law <u>130</u> (Appeal fee FEE WAIVED.) (Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 04/30/2012)
05/01/2012	<u>134</u>	NOTIFICATION by Circuit Court of Appellate Docket Number 12-55794, 9th CCA regarding Notice of Appeal to 9th Circuit Court of Appeals <u>133</u> as to Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (mat) (Entered: 05/01/2012)
05/03/2012	<u>135</u>	MINUTES OF TELEPHONIC STATUS CONFERENCE RE PLAINTIFFS APPLICATION FOR NATURALIZATION held before Judge Virginia A. Phillips: The Court sets the naturalization ceremony for Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi, to be held before this Court on Thursday, May 10, 2012, at 10:00am. Court Reporter: Phyllis Preston. Tape #: N/A. (ad) (Entered: 05/04/2012)
05/03/2012	<u>136</u>	ORDER from 9th CCA filed re: Notice of Appeal to 9th Circuit Court of Appeals, <u>133</u> filed by United States Citizenship and Immigration Service, Jane Arellano, Alejandro Mayorkas, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Janet Napolitano, CCA # 12-55794. The motion filed by the government on 5/2/12 for voluntary dismissal of this appeal is granted. This appeal is dismissed. This order served on the district court shall constitute the mandate of this court. Order received in this district on 5/3/12. (car) (Entered: 05/08/2012)
05/25/2012	<u>137</u>	Joint STIPULATION to Reschedule Attorneys' Fees Filing Deadline filed by plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/25/2012)
05/31/2012	<u>138</u>	ORDER RE JOINT STIPULATION FOR FILING DEADLINE FOR PETITIONERS MOTION FOR ATTORNEYS FEES AND COSTS UNDER THE EQUAL ACCESS TO JUSTICE ACT. by Judge Virginia A. Phillips: Good cause having been shown in the parties joint stipulation, the stipulation is hereby GRANTED. The deadline for Petitioner to file for attorneys fees and costs will be June 22, 2012. <u>137</u> (am) (Entered: 06/01/2012)
06/22/2012	<u>139</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION for Attorney Fees filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. Motion set for hearing on 8/27/2012 at 02:00 PM before Judge Virginia A. Phillips. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum, # <u>2</u> Proposed Order)(Arulanantham, Ahilan) (Entered: 06/22/2012)
06/22/2012	<u>140</u>	DECLARATION of Hamdi, Arulanantham, Van der Hout, Sobel in support of MOTION for Attorney Fees <u>139</u> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration Hamdi, # <u>2</u> Declaration Arulanantham, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Ex 1-3 Combined CV's, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Ex 4 Attorney time Records, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Ex 5 Rate Chart, # <u>6</u> Exhibit Ex 6 Costs, # <u>7</u> Declaration Van Der Hout, # <u>8</u> Declaration Sobel, # <u>9</u> Exhibit Ex 1 - Sobel Resume, # <u>10</u> Exhibit Ex 2 - Garret, # <u>11</u> Exhibit Ex 3 - MALDEF, # <u>12</u> Exhibit Ex 4 - Skadden Rates, # <u>13</u> Exhibit Ex 5 - Skadden, # <u>14</u> Exhibit Ex 6 - Cal Dis Rights, # <u>15</u> Exhibit Ex 7 - O'Melveny, # <u>16</u> Exhibit Ex 8 - Quinn Emmanuel, # <u>17</u> Exhibit Ex 9 - Barsky Short, # <u>18</u> Exhibit Ex 10 - Eric Gibbs, # <u>19</u> Exhibit Ex 11 - Holtz Bingham, # <u>20</u> Exhibit Ex 12 - Shawn Parks, # <u>21</u> Exhibit Ex 13 - Atkins)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 06/22/2012)

06/22/2012	<u>141</u>	<i>Supplement (Table of Contents & Table of Authorities)</i> re: MOTION for Attorney Fees <u>139</u> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Table of Contents and Table of Authorities)(Arulanantham, Ahilan) (Entered: 06/22/2012)
06/25/2012	<u>142</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents RE: Miscellaneous Document <u>141</u> . The following error(s) was found: Incorrect event selected. The correct event is: Supplement (Motion related). In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. You need not take any action in response to this notice unless and until the court directs you to do so. (am) (Entered: 06/25/2012)
06/25/2012	<u>143</u>	NOTICE OF ERRATA filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. correcting Declaration (Motion related), Declaration (Motion related), Declaration (Motion related), Declaration (Motion related) <u>140</u> , Miscellaneous Document <u>141</u> , MOTION for Attorney Fees <u>139</u> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Notice of Motion & Motion, # <u>2</u> Memorandum iso Atty's Fees, # <u>3</u> Proposed Order, # <u>4</u> Declaration iso Atty's Fees, # <u>5</u> Hamdi Dec, # <u>6</u> Arulanantham Dec, # <u>7</u> Exhibit Ex 1-3 CV's of 3 Attys, # <u>8</u> Exhibit Ex 4 -Atty Time Records, # <u>9</u> Exhibit Ex 5-6 Summary chart & Costs, # <u>10</u> Van der Hout Dec, # <u>11</u> Sobel Dec, # <u>12</u> Exhibit Sobel Ex1 - CV, # <u>13</u> Exhibit Sobel Ex2 - Garrett, # <u>14</u> Exhibit Sobel Ex3pt1 - MALDEF, # <u>15</u> Exhibit Sobel Ex3pt2 - MALDEF, # <u>16</u> Exhibit Sobel Ex4 - Skadden Rates, # <u>17</u> Exhibit Sobel Ex5 - Skadden, # <u>18</u> Exhibit Sobel Ex6 - CA Dis Rights, # <u>19</u> Exhibit Sobel Ex7 - O'Melveny, # <u>20</u> Exhibit Sobel Ex8 - Quinn Emanuel, # <u>21</u> Exhibit Sobel Ex9 - Barsky Short, # <u>22</u> Exhibit Sobel Ex10 - eric Gibbs, # <u>23</u> Exhibit Sobel Ex11 - Holtz Bingham, # <u>24</u> Exhibit Sobel Ex 12 - Shawn parks, # <u>25</u> Exhibit Sobel Ex13 - Atkins)(Arulanantham, Ahilan) (Entered: 06/25/2012)
06/27/2012	<u>144</u>	MINUTE ORDER IN CHAMBERS REQUIRING THE RE-FILING OF PETITIONER'S MOTION FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES by Judge Virginia A. Phillips re: MOTION for Attorney Fees <u>139</u> . The Court hereby ORDERS Petitioner to re-file his Motion for Attorneys' Fees, incorporating any corrections made in his Notice of Errata, and complying with all applicable Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, Local Rules of Central District of California, and provisions of the Court's Standing Order. (mrgo) (Entered: 06/28/2012)
06/29/2012	<u>145</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION for Attorney Fees filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. Motion set for hearing on 8/27/2012 at 02:00 PM before Judge Virginia A. Phillips. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum Points and Authorities, # <u>2</u> Proposed Order, # <u>3</u> Declaration ISO Motion, # <u>4</u> Declaration Hamdi, # <u>5</u> Declaration Arulanantham, # <u>6</u> Exhibit AA Ex 1-3 Atty CVs Combined, # <u>7</u> Exhibit AA Ex 4 Atty time records, # <u>8</u> Exhibit AA Ex 56 Summary Chart & Costs, # <u>9</u> Declaration Van der Hout, # <u>10</u> Declaration Sobel, # <u>11</u> Exhibit CS Ex 1 Resume, # <u>12</u> Exhibit CS Ex 2 Garrett, # <u>13</u> Exhibit CS Ex 3pt1 MALDEF, # <u>14</u> Exhibit CS Ex 3pt2 MALDEF, # <u>15</u> Exhibit CS Ex 4 Skadden Fees, # <u>16</u> Exhibit CS Ex 5 Skadden, # <u>17</u> Exhibit CS Ex 6 CalDisRights, # <u>18</u> Exhibit CS Ex 7 O'Melveny, # <u>19</u> Exhibit CS Ex 8 Quinn Emanuel, # <u>20</u> Exhibit CS Ex 9 Barsky Short, # <u>21</u> Exhibit CS Ex 10 Eric Gibbs, # <u>22</u> Exhibit CS Ex 11 Holtz Bingham, # <u>23</u> Exhibit CS Ex 12 Shawn Parks, # <u>24</u> Exhibit CS Ex 13 Atkins)(Arulanantham, Ahilan) (Entered: 06/29/2012)
07/03/2012	<u>146</u>	NOTICE OF ERRATA filed by Petitioner Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/03/2012)
07/05/2012	<u>147</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents RE: Notice of Errata <u>146</u> . The following error(s) was found: Incorrect event selected. The correct event is: "Motion and Related Filings" - Responses/Replies/Other Motion Related Documents - [Motion Related Document] . In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. You need not take any action in response to this notice unless and until the court directs you to do so. (ad) (Entered: 07/05/2012)
07/20/2012	<u>148</u>	OPPOSITION to MOTION for Attorney Fees <u>145</u> filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Jeffrey M. Bauer, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B, #

		<u>4</u> Exhibit C, # <u>5</u> Exhibit D, # <u>6</u> Exhibit E, # <u>7</u> Exhibit F, # <u>8</u> Proposed Order)(Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 07/20/2012)
07/26/2012	<u>149</u>	TRANSCRIPT for proceedings held on 11/28/11. Court Reporter: Phyllis Preston, email: stenojag@aol.com. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Notice of Intent to Redact due within 7 days of this date. Redaction Request due 8/16/2012. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 8/26/2012. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 10/24/2012. (Preston, Phyllis) (Entered: 07/26/2012)
07/26/2012	150	NOTICE OF FILING TRANSCRIPT filed for proceedings 11-28-11 re Transcript <u>149</u> THERE IS NO PDF DOCUMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ENTRY.(Preston, Phyllis) TEXT ONLY ENTRY (Entered: 07/26/2012)
07/26/2012	<u>151</u>	NOTICE of Evidentiary Support filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Bauer, Jeffrey) (Entered: 07/26/2012)
07/30/2012	<u>153</u>	ORDER by Judge Virginia A. Phillips. The document is accepted as filed RE: Notice of Deficiency in Electronically Filed Documents (G-112), <u>147</u> , <u>146</u> , Miscellaneous Document <u>141</u> (cys) (Entered: 08/01/2012)
07/31/2012	<u>152</u>	Joint STIPULATION for Extension of Time to File Reply as to MOTION for Attorney Fees <u>145</u> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/31/2012)
08/01/2012	<u>154</u>	ORDER by Judge Virginia A. Phillips: The deadline for Plaintiff to file his reply brief in support of his motion for attorneys' fees and costs will be August 10, 2012 <u>152</u> . (cys) (Entered: 08/02/2012)
08/10/2012	<u>155</u>	REPLY in support of MOTION for Attorney Fees <u>145</u> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration Transmittal Dec & Ex A Caputo Dec, # <u>2</u> Declaration Ex B Pasquarella Dec & Exhibits, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Ex C – DHS yearbook Statistics, # <u>4</u> Declaration Ex D – Rubalcava Dec, # <u>5</u> Proposed Order)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 08/10/2012)
08/27/2012	<u>156</u>	MINUTES OF Motion Hearing RE PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR ATTORNEYS FEES (ECF No. 145) held before Judge Virginia A. Phillips: Court issues a tentative ruling, hears oral argument and takes the matter under submission Court Reporter: Phyllis Preston. (am) (Entered: 08/29/2012)
08/27/2012	158	Notice of Electronic Filing re Order on Motion for Attorney Fees, <u>157</u> , Motion Hearing <u>156</u> e-mailed to jeffrey.bauer@usdoj.gov bounced due to 550 5.1.1 RESOLVER.ADR.RecipNotFound; not found. The primary e-mail address associated with the attorney record has been deleted. Pursuant to the General Order and Local Rules it is the attorneys obligation to maintain all personal contact information including e-mail address in the CM/ECF system. THERE IS NO PDF DOCUMENT ASSOCIATED WITH THIS ENTRY.(tyw) TEXT ONLY ENTRY (Entered: 08/30/2012)
08/29/2012	<u>157</u>	MINUTES (IN CHAMBERS): ORDER GRANTING PETITIONER'S MOTION FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES (DOC. NO. 145) by Judge Virginia A. Phillips: For the foregoing reasons, Hamdi's Motion for Attorneys' Fees is GRANTED; fees and costs will be awarded, subject to the hourly rate limit established in the EAJA and the Court's evaluation of the reasonableness of the time devoted to various tasks connected with this litigation. <u>145</u> (am) (Entered: 08/29/2012)
09/24/2012	<u>159</u>	Objections Opposition re: MOTION for Attorney Fees <u>145</u> <i>Defendants' Line-Item Objections to Plaintiff's Motion for Costs and Fees Under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. 2412</i> filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Hollis, Christopher) (Entered: 09/24/2012)
10/08/2012	<u>160</u>	RESPONSE IN SUPPORT of <i>Plaintiff's Responses to Defendants' Line-Item Objections to Plaintiff's Motion for Atty Fees</i> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 10/08/2012)

10/08/2012	<u>161</u>	DECLARATION re Response in Support of Motion <u>160</u> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A through G)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 10/08/2012)
10/11/2012	<u>162</u>	NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES in Electronically Filed Documents RE: Declaration <u>161</u> . The following error(s) was found: Incorrect event selected. The correct event is: "Motions and Related Filings" – Responses/Replies/Other Motion Related Documents. In response to this notice the court may order (1) an amended or correct document to be filed (2) the document stricken or (3) take other action as the court deems appropriate. You need not take any action in response to this notice unless and until the court directs you to do so. (ad) (Entered: 10/11/2012)
10/17/2012	<u>163</u>	RESPONSE BY THE COURT TO NOTICE TO FILER OF DEFICIENCIES IN ELECTRONICALLY FILED DOCUMENTS. ORDER by Deputy Clerk of Court: The document is accepted as filed RE: Declaration <u>161</u> . (ad) (Entered: 10/17/2012)
12/05/2012	<u>164</u>	MINUTE ORDER IN CHAMBERS SETTING AMOUNT OF ATTORNEYS' FEES AWARD by Judge Virginia A. Phillips: For the foregoing reasons, Hamdi is hereby awarded \$60,266.92 in fees. The Court directs Hamdi to submit a bill of costs to the Clerk for taxable costs. The Court further directs Hamdi to submit a request for non-taxable costs to the Court, within 20 days of the date of this Order. (am) (Entered: 12/06/2012)
12/19/2012	<u>165</u>	RECEIPT FOR RELEASE OF EXHIBITS Rcpt of exhibits upon: AUSA; Released Exhibits:Depositions; Receiver: Fleurneua Foronda. (am) (Entered: 12/20/2012)
12/20/2012	<u>166</u>	APPLICATION to the Clerk to Tax Costs against Defendants United States Citizenship and Immigration Service filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. Application set for hearing on 1/4/2013 at 10:00 AM before Clerk of Court. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Bill of Costs, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B, # <u>4</u> Exhibit C, # <u>5</u> Exhibit D, # <u>6</u> Exhibit E)(Escobosa Helzer, Belinda) (Entered: 12/20/2012)
12/21/2012	<u>167</u>	Plaintiff's Request for Non-Taxable Costs filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D part 1, # <u>5</u> Exhibit D part 2, # <u>6</u> Exhibit E, # <u>7</u> Exhibit F)(Escobosa Helzer, Belinda) (Entered: 12/21/2012)
01/02/2013	<u>168</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION for Reconsideration re Minutes of In Chambers Order/Directive – no proceeding held, <u>164</u> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. Motion set for hearing on 2/4/2013 at 02:00 PM before Judge Virginia A. Phillips. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum, # <u>2</u> Proposed Order)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 01/02/2013)
01/08/2013	<u>169</u>	NOTICE OF MOTION AND Joint MOTION to Reschedule Hearing Date on Plaintiff's Motion for Reconsideration of Minute Order Setting Amount of Attorneys' Fees Award filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Hollis, Christopher) (Entered: 01/08/2013)
01/10/2013	<u>170</u>	MINUTES (IN CHAMBERS) ORDER by Judge Virginia A. Phillips (1) VACATING FEBRUARY 4, 2012 HEARING and (2) DENYING AS MOOT JOINT MOTION TO RESCHEDULE HEARING DATE: COUNSEL ARE NOTIFIED that on the Court's own motion, Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi's Motion for Reconsideration <u>168</u> set for hearing on February 4, 2013, at 2:00pm, is hereby taken off calendar. This matter is appropriate for resolution with a hearing pursuant to Local Rule 7-15 and will stand submitted on the papers timely filed. Accordingly, the Joint Motion to Reschedule Hearing Date on Plaintiff's Motion for Reconsideration of Minute Order Setting Amount of Attorney's Fees Award from February 4, 2013 to February 11, 2013 <u>169</u> is DENIED as moot. IT IS SO ORDERED. (ad) (Entered: 01/10/2013)
01/14/2013	<u>171</u>	OPPOSITION to MOTION for Reconsideration re Minutes of In Chambers Order/Directive – no proceeding held, <u>164</u> MOTION for Reconsideration re Minutes of In Chambers Order/Directive – no proceeding held, <u>164</u> <u>168</u> <i>Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for Reconsideration of Minute Order</i>

		<i>Setting Amount of Attorneys' Fees Award</i> filed by Defendants Jane Arellano, Department of Homeland Security, Irene Martin, Alejandro Mayorkas, Janet Napolitano, United States Citizenship and Immigration Service. (Hollis, Christopher) (Entered: 01/14/2013)
01/18/2013	<u>172</u>	REPLY in support of MOTION for Reconsideration re Minutes of In Chambers Order/Directive – no proceeding held, <u>164</u> MOTION for Reconsideration re Minutes of In Chambers Order/Directive – no proceeding held, <u>164 168</u> filed by Plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 01/18/2013)
02/15/2013	<u>173</u>	MINUTES (IN CHAMBERS) ORDER by Judge Virginia A. Phillips GRANTING Plaintiff's <u>168</u> Motion for Reconsideration: (see document image for specifics). For the reasons set forth above, the Court GRANTS Hamdis Motion, in part. Hamdi is hereby awarded \$229,823.38 in fees. IT IS SO ORDERED. (ad) (Entered: 02/19/2013)
04/12/2013	<u>174</u>	BILL OF COSTS. Costs Taxed in amount of \$ 12,836.76 in favor of Tarek Hamdi and against Defendants, USCIS (mb) (Entered: 04/15/2013)
05/03/2013	<u>175</u>	NOTICE of Request for Order Regarding Plaintiff's Request for Non-Taxable Costs filed by plaintiff Tarek Hamdi. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Pasquarella, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/03/2013)
05/20/2013	<u>176</u>	ORDER RE: NON-TAXABLE COSTS by Judge Virginia A. Phillips: THE COURT, having considered Plaintiffs unopposed Request for Non-Taxable Costs (Dkt. 167), awards \$7, 827.09 in non-taxable costs to Plaintiff.) <u>175</u> (am) (Entered: 05/20/2013)