

CLOSED, MANADR

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT, CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
(Western Division - Los Angeles)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 2:06-cv-04791-PA**

Mustafa Aziz et al v. Alberto Gonzales et al
Assigned to: Judge Percy Anderson
Cause: 08:1446 Application for Naturalization Hearing

Date Filed: 08/01/2006
Date Terminated: 01/08/2007
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 890 Other Statutory
Actions
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff

Mustafa Aziz
TERMINATED: 10/03/2006

represented by **Cecillia D Wang**
ACLU Foundation Immigrants Rights
Project
39 Drumm Street
San Francisco, CA 94111
415-343-0775
Email: cwang@aclu.org
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lucas Guttentag
ACLU Foundation Immigrants Rights
Project
39 Drumm Street
San Francisco, CA 94111
415-343-0775
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Mark D Rosenbaum
ACLU Foundation of Southern California
1616 Beverly Blvd
Los Angeles, CA 90026-5752
213-977-9500
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ranjana Natarajan
ACLU Foundation of Southern California
1616 Beverly Boulevard
Los Angeles, CA 90026
213-977-9500
Email: rnatarajan@aclu-sc.org

LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Yousuf Bhaghani

represented by **Cecilia D Wang**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lucas Guttentag
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Mark D Rosenbaum
ACLU Foundation of Southern California
1616 Beverly Boulevard
P O Box 26907
Los Angeles, CA 90026-5752
213-977-9500
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ranjana Natarajan
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Samina Khwaja

TERMINATED: 10/03/2006

represented by **Cecilia D Wang**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lucas Guttentag
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Mark D Rosenbaum
ACLU Foundation of Southern California
1616 Beverly Blvd
P O Box 26907
Los Angeles, CA 90026-5752
213-977-9500
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ranjana Natarajan
(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Kolood Al-Kafaji
TERMINATED: 10/03/2006

represented by **Cecilia D Wang**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lucas Guttentag
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Mark D Rosenbaum
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ranjana Natarajan
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Ibrahim Batliwala

represented by **Cecilia D Wang**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lucas Guttentag
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Mark D Rosenbaum
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ranjana Natarajan
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Imran Chaudhry
TERMINATED: 10/03/2006

represented by **Cecilia D Wang**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lucas Guttentag
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Mark D Rosenbaum
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ranjana Natarajan
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Lamia El Feky
TERMINATED: 10/03/2006

represented by **Cecilia D Wang**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lucas Guttentag
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Mark D Rosenbaum
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ranjana Natarajan
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Muhammad Malik
TERMINATED: 10/03/2006

represented by **Cecilia D Wang**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lucas Guttentag
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Mark D Rosenbaum
(See above for address)

*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Ranjana Natarajan
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Plaintiff

Mustafa Osman
TERMINATED: 10/03/2006

represented by **Cecilia D Wang**
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Lucas Guttentag
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Mark D Rosenbaum
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Ranjana Natarajan
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Plaintiff

Sami Trad
*individually and on behalf of all those
similarly situated*

represented by **Cecilia D Wang**
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Lucas Guttentag
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Mark D Rosenbaum
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Ranjana Natarajan
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

Defendant

Alberto Gonzales
*in his official capacity as Attorney General
of the United States*

represented by **Kevin B Finn**
AUSA - Office of US Attorney
Civil Division
300 North Los Angeles Street, Suite 7516
Los Angeles, CA 90012
213-894-6739
Email: USACAC.Civil@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Michael Chertoff
*in his official capacity as Secretary of the
United States Department of Homeland
Security*

represented by **Kevin B Finn**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Emilio T Gonzalez
*in his official capacity as Director of
United States Citizenship and Immigration
Services*

represented by **Kevin B Finn**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Jane Arellano
*in her official capacity as Field Director of
the Los Angeles District of United States
Citizenship and Immigration Services*

represented by **Kevin B Finn**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Robert S Mueller, III
*in his official capacity as Director of the
Federal Bureau of Investigation*

represented by **Kevin B Finn**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
08/01/2006	1	COMPLAINT against defendants Alberto Gonzales, Michael Chertoff, Emilio T Gonzalez, Jane Arellano, Robert S Mueller, III. (No Filing fee required) filed by plaintiffs Samina Khwaja, Kolood Al-Kafaji, Ibrahim Batliwala, Imran Chaudhry, Mustafa Aziz, Lamia El Feky, Muhammad Malik, Mustafa Osman, Sami Trad, Yousuf Bhaghani.(jag,) (Entered: 08/07/2006)
08/01/2006		FAX number for Attorney Ranjana Natarajan, Mark D Rosenbaum is 213-250-3919. (jag,) (Entered: 08/07/2006)
08/01/2006		FAX number for Attorney Lucas Guttentag, Cecillia D Wang is 415-395-0950.

		(jag,) (Entered: 08/07/2006)
08/01/2006	2	NOTICE of Interested Parties filed by Plaintiffs Samina Khwaja, Kolood Al-Kafaji, Ibrahim Batliwala, Imran Chaudhry, Mustafa Aziz, Lamia El Feky, Muhammad Malik, Mustafa Osman, Sami Trad, Yousuf Bhaghani. (jag,) (Entered: 08/07/2006)
08/01/2006	3	STATEMENT of Related Case(s) filed by plaintiffs Samina Khwaja, Kolood Al-Kafaji, Ibrahim Batliwala, Imran Chaudhry, Mustafa Aziz, Lamia El Feky, Muhammad Malik, Mustafa Osman, Sami Trad, Yousuf Bhaghani. Related Case (s): n/a (jag,) (Entered: 08/07/2006)
08/01/2006	4	NOTICE TO PARTIES OF ADR PILOT PROGRAM filed.(jag,) (Entered: 08/07/2006)
08/01/2006		Summons Issued re Complaint - (Discovery),[1] as to Alberto Gonzales, Michael Chertoff, Emilio T Gonzalez. (bg,) (Entered: 08/07/2006)
08/07/2006	5	STANDING ORDER by Judge Percy Anderson: This action has been assigned to the calendar of Judge Percy Anderson. All counsel are ordered to familiarize themselves with the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and the Local Rules of the Central District of California. See document for further details. (gk,) (Entered: 08/10/2006)
08/24/2006	6	PROOF OF SERVICE Executed by Plaintiffs upon Emilio T. Gonzales, in his official capacity as Director of U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, served on 8/2/2006, answer due 10/1/2006. The Summons and Complaint were served by personal, by Federal statute. Service accepted by Jonathan Katz, Associate Counsel, authorized to accept service. Original Summons not returned. (gk,) (Entered: 08/25/2006)
08/24/2006	7	PROOF OF SERVICE Executed by Plaintiffs upon Michael Chertoff, in his official capacity as Secretary of the U.S. Department of Homeland Security, served on 8/2/2006, answer due 10/1/2006. The Summons and Complaint were served by personal, by Federal statute. Service accepted by Jonathan Katz, Associate Counsel, authorized to accept service. Original Summons not attached. (gk,) (Entered: 08/25/2006)
08/24/2006	8	PROOF OF SERVICE Executed by Plaintiffs upon Jane Arellano, in her official capacity as Field Director of the Los Angeles District of U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, served on 8/2/2006, answer due 10/1/2006. The Summons and Complaint were served by personal service, by Federal statute. Service accepted by Jonathan Katz, Associate Counsel, authorized to accept service. Original Summons not attached. (gk,) (Entered: 08/25/2006)
08/24/2006	9	PROOF OF SERVICE Executed by Plaintiffs upon Alberto Gonzales, in his official capacity as Attorney General of the United States, served on 8/2/2006, answer due 10/1/2006. The Summons and Complaint were served by personal service, by Federal statute. Service accepted by Genoveve Ortega, Legal Clerk, authorized to accept service on behalf of U.S. Attorney. Original Summons not returned. (gk,) Modified on 8/25/2006 (gk,). (Entered: 08/25/2006)
08/24/2006	10	PROOF OF SERVICE Executed by Plaintiffs upon Robert S. Mueller, III served

		on 8/3/2006, answer due 10/2/2006. The Summons and Complaint were served by substituted service, by State statute. Service accepted by Deno "Doe," hispanic male, 40 years old, black hair, brown eyes, 5 feet 8 inches, 165 pounds, person in charge and by first class mail on 8/3/2006. Original Summons not returned. (gk,) (Entered: 08/25/2006)
10/03/2006	11	STIPULATION AND ORDER by Judge Percy Anderson that the claims of Mustafa Aziz, Muhammad Malik, Lamia El Feky, Imran Chaudhry, Mustafa Osman, Kolood Al-Kafaji, and Samina Omar Khwaja only, are dismissed without prejudice, with each party to bear its own costs and fees, including attorney fees.(gk,) (Entered: 10/04/2006)
10/18/2006	12	STIPULATION to Extend Time for Defendants to Answer; ORDER by Judge Percy Anderson that Defendants Alberto Gonzales; Michael Chertoff; Emilio T Gonzalez; Jane Arellano; Robert S Mueller, III shall respond to the Complaint on or before 11/1/2006. (jp) (Entered: 10/19/2006)
11/01/2006	14	ANSWER to Complaint [1] filed by Federal Defendants Alberto Gonzales, Michael Chertoff, Emilio T. Gonzalez, Jane Arellano, Robert S. Mueller, III. (gk,) (Entered: 11/06/2006)
11/03/2006	13	SCHEDULING MEETING OF COUNSEL by Judge Percy Anderson: Set Hearings: Scheduling Conference set for 12/11/2006 10:30 AM before Judge Percy Anderson. Counsel shall meet at least 21 days in advance of the Scheduling Conference to prepare a jointly signed report for the court to be submitted no less than 14 days before the Scheduling Conference. See document for details.(gk,) (Entered: 11/03/2006)
11/28/2006	15	JOINT REPORT of Rule 26(f)initial meeting Discovery Plan filed; estimated length of trial 4 to 5 days. (et) (Entered: 12/01/2006)
12/11/2006	16	MINUTES OF Scheduling Conference held before Judge Percy Anderson: Plaintiffs are ordered to show cause, in writing, why their class allegations should not be stricken for failure to timely file a Motion for Class Certification; Set Deadlines: Response to Order to Show Cause due by 1/8/2007. The Court further orders the parties to show cause, in writing, no later than 1/8/2007, why this matter should not be remanded with specific instructions directing CIS to complete the remaining named Petitioners' applications for naturalization, including issuance of certificates of naturalization if appropriate, within 60 days of the remand. In their response to the order to show cause, Defendants shall address why the Court should not order that all necessary background checks for the Petitioners be completed in a timely manner, so as to permit adjudication of the applications within 60 days. Court Reporter: Bridget Montero. (gk,) (Entered: 12/15/2006)
12/14/2006	19	Mail Returned addressed to Mark D. Rosenbaum, ACLU Foundation of Southern California re 13 Scheduling Meeting of Counsel, undeliverable mail, attempted - not known. (gk,) (Entered: 01/12/2007)
01/08/2007	18	STIPULATION AND ORDER by Judge Percy Anderson that Plaintiffs withdraw their class action allegations, Complaint paragraphs 75-79, and their requests for class-wide relief, and dismiss this case as set forth below under Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 23(e). Plaintiffs Ibrahim Batliwala, Yusuf

		Bhaghani and Sammy Trad agree to dismiss their claims without prejudice. Defendant U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Service ("CIS") agrees to adjudicate Ibrahim Batliwala's application for citizenship within ten days of the date of entry of this order. CIS intends to grant Mr. Batliwala's application and swear him in as a U.S. citizen no later than 2/28/2007, provided that no negative information is discovered between the time of dismissal and the oath ceremony. CIS also agrees to adjudicate Mr. Trad's and Mr. Bhaghani's applications for citizenship within 30 days of the date of entry of this order. (Made JS-6. Case Terminated.)(gk,) (Entered: 01/10/2007)
01/09/2007	17	TRANSCRIPT filed for proceedings held on 12/11/06. Court Reporter: Bridget R. Montero. (dbu,) (Entered: 01/09/2007)
01/24/2007	20	STIPULATION AND ORDER by Judge Percy Anderson that on or before 2/24/2007, Plaintiffs may file an Application for Attorney Fees with the Court, and a Notice of Application to the Clerk to Tax Costs and lodge a Bill of Costs with the Clerk of the Court. (gk,) (Entered: 01/25/2007)
02/26/2007	21	STIPULATION Re Settlement of Attorney Fees and Costs. (gk,) (Entered: 03/12/2007)

PACER Service Center			
Transaction Receipt			
09/10/2007 10:36:59			
PACER Login:	hs0328	Client Code:	ddalton
Description:	Docket Report	Search Criteria:	2:06-cv-04791-PA
Billable Pages:	5	Cost:	0.40

PACER Login:	hs0328	Client Code:	ddalton
Description:	Docket Report	Search Criteria:	2:06-cv-04791-PA
Billable Pages:	5	Cost:	0.40