

APPEAL, CLOSED

**U.S. District Court
Eastern District of California - Live System (Sacramento)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 2:91-cv-01462-EJG-GGH**

Naranjo-Aguilera, et al v. U S Immigration, et al
Assigned to: Senior Judge Edward J. Garcia
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Gregory G. Hollows
Demand: \$0
Case in other court: 92-16653
92-16933
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 10/23/1991
Date Terminated: 06/30/1992
Nature of Suit: 440 Civil Rights: Other
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff**Francisco Naranjo-Aguilera**

represented by **Bruce Goldstein**
Farmworker Justice Fund Inc
2001 S Street NW
Suite 210
Washington, DC 20009
202-462-8192
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Charles Hammond Wheeler
National Immigration Law Center
1102 South Crenshaw Boulevard
Suite 101
Los Angeles, CA 90019
213-938-6452
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Douglas M Lehrman
Law Offices of Douglas M. Lehrman
428 J Street
Suite 200
Sacramento, CA 95814
916-442-5900
Fax: 916-442-2009
Email: dmlmail@sbcglobal.net
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Karen L Miksch
National Immigration Law Center
1102 South Crenshaw Boulevard
Suite 101

Los Angeles, CA 90019
213-938-6452
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kristine Poplawski
Farmworker Justice Fund Inc
2001 S Street NW
Suite 210
Washington, DC 20009
202-462-8192
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Richard S Kohn
California Rural Legal Assistance
631 Howard Street
Suite 300
San Francisco, CA 94105-3907
415-777-2752
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Stephen Allen Rosenbaum
California Rural Legal Assistance
631 Howard Street
Suite 300
San Francisco, CA 94105-3907
415-777-2752
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Susana T Salgado
California Rural Legal Assistance
631 Howard Street
Suite 300
San Francisco, CA 94105
415-777-2752
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

William C Kennedy
Legal Services of Northern California
515 12th Street
Sacramento, CA 95814
916-551-2150
Fax: 551-2196
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Candelario Orozco-Macias

represented by **Bruce Goldstein**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Charles Hammond Wheeler
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Douglas M Lehrman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Karen L Miksch
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kristine Poplawski
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Richard S Kohn
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Stephen Allen Rosenbaum
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Susana T Salgado
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

William C Kennedy
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Juventino Tafolla-Ramirez

represented by **Bruce Goldstein**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Charles Hammond Wheeler
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Douglas M Lehrman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Karen L Miksch
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kristine Poplawski
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Richard S Kohn
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Stephen Allen Rosenbaum
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Susana T Salgado
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

William C Kennedy
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Hector Orozco-Flores

represented by **Bruce Goldstein**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Charles Hammond Wheeler
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Douglas M Lehrman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Karen L Miksch
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kristine Poplawski
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Richard S Kohn
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Stephen Allen Rosenbaum
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Susana T Salgado
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

William C Kennedy
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Celestino Gaona

represented by **Bruce Goldstein**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Charles Hammond Wheeler
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Douglas M Lehrman
(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Karen L Miksch
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kristine Poplawski
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Richard S Kohn
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Stephen Allen Rosenbaum
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Susana T Salgado
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

William C Kennedy
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

**United States Immigration and
Naturalization Service**

represented by **Donald E Keener**
United States Department of Justice
Office of Immigration Litigation
P O Box 878
Ben Franklin Station
Washington, DC 20044
202-616-4886
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Glyndell E Williams
United States Attorney
501 I Street
Suite 10-100

Sacramento, CA 95814
 916-554-2700
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

William P Barr

Acting Attorney General of the United States

represented by **Donald E Keener**
 (See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Glyndell E Williams
 (See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
10/23/1991	1	COMPLAINT for Declaratory and Injunctive relief; Summons issued; fee status paid; Receipt # 136156; Notice re: Consent forms. (old) (Entered: 10/23/1991)
10/23/1991	2	ORDER setting scheduling conference for 10:30 2/14/92 before Judge Edward J Garcia (cc: all counsel) (old) (Entered: 10/23/1991)
02/03/1992	3	STATUS REPORT by federal defendants; hrg set 2/14/92 at 10:30 (old) (Entered: 02/04/1992)
02/04/1992	4	RETURN OF SERVICE executed upon defendant William P Barr on 10/30/91 (old) (Entered: 02/04/1992)
02/04/1992	5	RETURN OF SERVICE executed upon defendant U S Immigration on 10/30/91 (old) (Entered: 02/04/1992)
02/04/1992	6	RETURN OF SERVICE executed upon US Attorney General George L O'Connell on 12/6/91 (old) (Entered: 02/04/1992)
02/04/1992	7	STATUS REPORT by plaintiffs; hrg set 2/14/92 at 10:30 (old) (Entered: 02/04/1992)
02/13/1992	8	NOTICE by plaintiffs of association of attorney Stephen Allen Rosenbaum, Richard S Kohn, Susana T Salgado of California Rural Legas Assistance (old) (Entered: 02/18/1992)
03/04/1992	9	NOTICE of hearing ; Scheduling conf reset for 6/5/92 at 9:00 before EJG (cc: all counsel) (old) (Entered: 03/06/1992)
04/02/1992	10	ANSWER by defendant U S Immigration, defendant William P Barr (old) (Entered: 04/02/1992)
04/02/1992	11	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION by defendants U S Immigration, William P Barr for judgment on the pleadings; hrg 6/5/92 9:00 EJG (old) (Entered: 04/02/1992)

04/02/1992	12	MEMORANDUM by dfts U S Immigration, William P Barr IN SUPPORT of motion for judgment on the pleadings; hrg 6/5/92 9:00 EJG [11-1] (old) (Entered: 04/02/1992)
04/17/1992	13	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION by plaintiffs for class certification; hrg 6/5/92 9:00 EJG (old) (Entered: 04/20/1992)
04/17/1992	14	MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES by plaintiff IN SUPPORT of motion for class certification; hrg 6/5/92 9:00 EJG [13-1]; Exhibits 1 through 3 (old) (Entered: 04/20/1992)
05/12/1992		LODGED Pro hac vice application and order for Bruce Goldstein atty for pltf (old) (Entered: 05/12/1992)
05/20/1992	15	ORDER by Judge Edward J Garcia ORDERING: lodged pro hac vice application is GRANTED; for attorney Bruce Goldstein to appear pro hac vice for pltfs (cc: all counsel) (old) (Entered: 05/20/1992)
05/21/1992	16	OPPOSITION by plaintiffs to motion for judgment on the pleadings; hrg 6/5/92 9:00 EJG [11-1] (old) (Entered: 05/21/1992)
05/21/1992	16	NOTICE OF COUNTER-MOTION AND COUNTER-MOTION by plaintiffs for summary judgment; hrg 6/5/92 9:00 EJG (old) (Entered: 05/21/1992)
05/21/1992	17	EXHIBITS by plaintiffs IN SUPPORT of motion for summary judgment; hrg 6/5/92 9:00 EJG [16-1], of motion response [16-1] (old) (Entered: 05/21/1992)
05/22/1992	18	MEMORANDUM by defendants in opposition to motion for class certification; hrg 6/5/92 9:00 EJG [13-1] (old) (Entered: 05/26/1992)
05/26/1992		LODGED: stipulation and order on motion for summary judgment (old) (Entered: 05/29/1992)
06/01/1992	19	REPLY by plaintiff to response to motion for class certification; hrg 6/5/92 9:00 EJG [13-1] (old) (Entered: 06/02/1992)
06/01/1992	20	REPLY by defendants to response to motion for judgment on the pleadings; hrg 6/5/92 9:00 EJG [11-1], motion for summary judgment; hrg 6/5/92 9:00 EJG [16-1] (old) (Entered: 06/02/1992)
06/02/1992	22	MEMORANDUM by defendants IN OPPOSITION to motion for class certification; hrg 6/5/92 9:00 EJG [13-1] (old) (Entered: 06/03/1992)
06/02/1992	23	REPLY by defendant to response to motion for judgment on the pleadings; hrg 6/5/92 9:00 EJG [11-1] (old) (Entered: 06/03/1992)
06/02/1992	23	OPPOSITION by defendants to motion for summary judgment; hrg 6/5/92 9:00 EJG [16-1] (old) (Entered: 06/03/1992)
06/03/1992	21	STIPULATION and ORDER by Judge Edward J Garcia ORDERING: defendant's shall file their reply to plaintiff's opposition to defendant's motion for judgment on the pleadings ON OR BEFORE 6/1/92; plaintiff's shall file their reply to the defendant's opposition to plaintiff;s motion for class certification ON OR BEFORE 6/1/92 (cc: all counsel) (old) (Entered: 06/03/1992)

06/03/1992	24	REPLY by plaintiffs to response to motion for summary judgment; hrg 6/5/92 9:00 EJJ [16-1]; Exhibits 1 and 2 (old) (Entered: 06/04/1992)
06/04/1992	25	LETTER to court dated 6/1/92 from attorney for plaintiffs re Kristing Poplawski has left Farmworker Justice Fund and no longer represents the pltf's (old) (Entered: 06/05/1992)
06/10/1992	26	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION by defendants for permission to submit agreement on certain points and additional authority on class certification; hrg 6/15/92 4:00 EJJ (old) (Entered: 06/12/1992)
06/10/1992	27	NOTICE of Defendant's Agreement on certain points and additional authority on class certification by defendant U S Immigration, defendant William P Barr (old) (Entered: 06/16/1992)
06/15/1992	28	MINUTES of Motion Hearing of 6/15/92 GRANTING in part and DENYING in part motion for summary judgment; hrg 6/5/92 EJJ [16-1], that the motion for class certification; hrg 6/5/92 9:00 EJJ [13-1] is SUBMITTED, GRANTING in part and DENYING in part motion for judgment on the pleadings; hrg 6/5/92 9:00 EJJ [11-1]; order with specifics to follow (old) (Entered: 06/18/1992)
06/30/1992	29	MEMORANDUM, Opinion and Order: by Judge Edward J Garcia ORDERING: pltf's motion for class certification [13-1], is GRANTED; see instant order for certification of subclasses; as to pltf's APA claim EXCEPT insofar as it relates to eligibility requirement portion of 8 CFR section 210.3(d)(3), dft's motion for judgment on the pleadings [11-1] is GRANTED and pltf's counter-motion for summary judgment is DENIED; as to the eligibility requirement, dft's motion for judgment on the pleadings is DENIED and pltf's motion for summary judgment [16-1] is GRANTED; court has disposed of all pltf's claims; and Clerk directed to enter judgment accordingly terminating case (cc: all counsel) (old) (Entered: 06/30/1992)
06/30/1992	30	JUDGMENT ENTERED: 6/30/92 pursuant to court's order [29-1] for both parties on separate portions of claims (cc: all counsel) (old) (Entered: 06/30/1992)
08/31/1992	31	NOTICE OF APPEAL by defendant from Dist Court decision [29-1], [30-1] (fee status: waived) (old) (Entered: 09/02/1992)
09/14/1992	32	MAILED case information/docket fee payment notice, copy of Notice of Appeal and appealed 6/30/92 judgment to 9th Circuit Court of Appeals. Copy of appeal and certified copy of docket sheet to all parties (old) (Entered: 09/14/1992)
09/14/1992		APPEAL fee of \$105.00 paid; receipt numbers 140872 and 140873 [31-1] (old) (Entered: 09/14/1992)
09/14/1992	33	NOTICE OF APPEAL by plaintiff Francisco Naranjo-Aguilera, plaintiff Candelario Orozco-Macias, plaintiff Juventino Tafolla-Ramirez, plaintiff Hector Orozco-Flores, plaintiff Celestino Gaona from Dist. Court decision, [29-2] (fee status: paid Reciept 140872, 140873) (old) (Entered: 11/19/1992)
10/05/1992	34	NOTIFICATION by Circuit Court of Appellate Docket Number 92-16653 (old) (Entered: 10/06/1992)

10/06/1992	35	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION by plaintiff Francisco Naranjo-Aguilera, plaintiff Candelario Orozco-Macias, plaintiff Juventino Tafolla-Ramirez, plaintiff Hector Orozco-Flores, plaintiff Celestino Gaona for supplemental relief by plaintiffs set for 12/18/92 at 9:00 before EJJ (old) (Entered: 10/06/1992)
10/07/1992	36	TRANSCRIPT DESIGNATION and Ordering Form for dates: 6/15/92 (old) (Entered: 10/07/1992)
10/09/1992	37	TRANSCRIPT DESIGNATION and Ordering Form for dates: 6/15/92 (old) (Entered: 10/13/1992)
10/14/1992	38	TIME SCHEDULE ORDER from USCA; See order for more details (cc: all counsel) (old) (Entered: 10/19/1992)
10/16/1992	39	TRANSCRIPT of 6/15/92 at 4:00 (old) (Entered: 10/19/1992)
10/20/1992	40	CERTIFICATE of Record Transmitted to USCA (Notice sent) (old) (Entered: 10/20/1992)
11/19/1992	41	MAILED case information/docket fee payment notice, copy of Notice of Appeal and appealed 6/30/92 judgment and Certificate of Record to 9th Circuit Court of Appeals. Copy of appeal and certified of docket sheet to all parties. (old) (Entered: 11/19/1992)
11/30/1992	42	NOTIFICATION by Circuit Court of Appellate Docket Number 92-16933 (old) (Entered: 11/30/1992)
12/02/1992	43	CERTIFIED COPY of Appellate Court Order: TIME SCHEDULE ORDER: see order for more details (old) (Entered: 12/03/1992)
12/04/1992	44	NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION by defendant U S Immigration, defendant William P Barr to hold plaintiff's motion in abeyance set for 12/18/92 at 9:00 before EJJ (old) (Entered: 12/04/1992)
12/04/1992	45	MEMORANDUM by defendant U S Immigration, defendant William P Barr in SUPPORT of defendant's motion to hold plaintiff's motion in abeyance [44-1], in OPPOSITION of motion for supplemental relief by plaintiffs set for 12/18/92 at 9:00 before EJJ [35-1] (old) (Entered: 12/04/1992)
12/11/1992	46	REPLY by plaintiff Candelario Orozco-Macias, plaintiff Juventino Tafolla-Ramirez, plaintiff Hector Orozco-Flores, plaintiff Celestino Gaona to response to motion for supplemental relief by plaintiffs set for 12/18/92 at 9:00 before EJJ [35-1] (old) (Entered: 12/11/1992)
12/18/1992	47	MINUTES of Motion Hearing DENYING motion for supplemental relief by plaintiffs set for 12/18/92 at 9:00 before EJJ [35-1]; matter held in abeyance pending appeal (old) (Entered: 12/18/1992)
12/23/1992	48	ORDER by Judge Edward J Garcia finding the motion to hold plaintiff's motion in abeyance [44-1] moot, DENYING motion for supplemental relief by plaintiffs set for 12/18/92 at 9:00 before EJJ [35-1] (cc: all counsel) (old) (Entered: 12/23/1992)
01/08/1993	49	TRANSCRIPT of 12/18/92 (old) (Entered: 01/08/1993)

01/28/1994	50	CLERK'S record on appeal transmitted to Circuit; Original case file, consisting of two volumes clerk's files and two volumes reporter's transcripts, and copy of docket mailed to Circuit. (re: USCA #92-16653 and USCA #92-16933) (cc: all counsel) (old) (Entered: 01/28/1994)
02/07/1994	51	RECEIPT from USCA, Ninth Circuit acknowledgment of record on appeal on 2/1/94 (old) (Entered: 02/08/1994)
08/17/1994	52	CERTIFIED COPY of 9th Circuit Order judgment of the District Court [Appeal [33-1], District Court [Appeal [31-1] is vacated (cc: all counsel) (old) (Entered: 08/17/1994)
09/02/1994	53	NOTICE by plaintiff of change of address to CA Rural Legal Assistance 631 Howard St, Suite 300 San Francisco CA 94105-3907 (old) (Entered: 09/06/1994)
09/12/1994	54	NOTICE OF MOTION and MOTION to dismiss by defts US Imigration and William P Barr motion to be heard 10/21/94 at 9:00 am by Judge Edward J. Garcia (old) (Entered: 09/12/1994)
09/12/1994	55	MEMORANDUM by defendant U S Immigration, defendant William P Barr in support of [54-1] motion to dismiss complaint (old) (Entered: 09/12/1994)
09/21/1994	56	EX PARTE motion by plaintiffs Francisco Naranjo-Aguilera, Candelario Orozco-Macias, Juventino Tafolla-Ramirez, Hector Orozco-Flores, Celestino Gaona for a continuance of defendants' motion to dismiss the complaint (until after 10/21/94 at 9:00am) (old) (Entered: 09/23/1994)
09/21/1994		LODGED Order continuing defendants' motion to dismiss the complaint by plaintiff (old) (Entered: 09/23/1994)
09/26/1994	57	ORDER by Judge Edward J Garcia: GRANTING plaintiff's ex parte motion to reset hearing on defendant's motion to dismiss; CONTINUING motion to dismiss defts US Imigration and William P Barr [54-1] to 11/18/94 at 9:00am; plaintiffs' opposition brief due 11/4/94; defendants' reply due 11/11/94 (cc: all counsel) (old) (Entered: 09/26/1994)
09/26/1994	58	OPPOSITION by defendants U S Immigration, William P Barr to ex parte application for a continuance of defendants' motion to dismiss the complaint [56-1] (old) (Entered: 09/27/1994)
11/04/1994	59	MEMORANDUM by plaintiff Francisco Naranjo-Aguilera, plaintiff Candelario Orozco-Macias, plaintiff Juventino Tafolla-Ramirez, plaintiff Hector Orozco-Flores, plaintiff Celestino Gaona in opposition to defendants' motion to dismiss the complaint [54-1] (old) (Entered: 11/07/1994)
11/10/1994	60	REPLY MEMORANDUM by defendants U S Immigration, William P Barr in support of motion to dismiss by defts US Imigration and William P Barr [54-1] (old) (Entered: 11/15/1994)
11/14/1994	61	REPLY Memorandum in support of motion to dismiss the complaint by defendants U S Immigration and William P Barr [54-1] (old) (Entered: 11/16/1994)
11/21/1994	63	MINUTES of Proceedings regarding dismissal motion before Judge Edward J

		Garcia; C/R Latz 923-5447; COURT FINDS IT DOES NOT HAVE JURISDICTION; dismissal motion moot (old) (Entered: 11/23/1994)
11/22/1994	62	ORDER by Judge Edward J Garcia finding the motion to dismiss by defts US Imigration and William P Barr [54-1] moot since this action has not been remanded back to this court (cc: all counsel) (old) (Entered: 11/22/1994)
01/23/1995	64	TRANSCRIPT of 11/18/94 hearing on motion of dismissal before EJG by C/R Lori Latz (old) (Entered: 01/24/1995)

PACER Service Center

Transaction Receipt

09/06/2007 12:31:18

PACER Login:	hs0328	Client Code:	ddalton
Description:	Docket Report	Search Criteria:	2:91-cv-01462-EJG-GGH
Billable Pages:	7	Cost:	0.56