

**U.S. District Court
Eastern District of New York (Brooklyn)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:18-cv-04167-ILG-JO**

Young Advocates For Fair Education v. Cuomo et al
Assigned to: Judge I. Leo Glasser
Referred to: Magistrate Judge James Orenstein
Cause: 28:1343 Violation of Civil Rights

Date Filed: 07/23/2018
Date Terminated: 01/17/2019
Jury Demand: Plaintiff
Nature of Suit: 950 Constitutional – State Statute
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Young Advocates For Fair Education

represented by **Renita Sharma**
Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan LLP
51 Madison Avenue, 22nd Floor
New York, NY 10010
212-849-7000
Fax: 212-849-7100
Email: renitasharma@quinnemanuel.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Samuel Coulter Kitchens
Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan, LLP
51 Madison Ave
22nd Floor
New York, NY 10010
UNITED STA
212-849-7000
Fax: 212-849-7100
Email: samuelkitchens@quinnemanuel.com
TERMINATED: 12/07/2018
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Thomas Alexander Bridges
Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan, LLP
51 Madison Avenue
22nd Floor
New York, NY 10010
212-849-7060
Fax: 212-849-7100
Email: thomasbridges@quinnemanuel.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Eric Hui-Chieh Huang
Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan LLP
51 Madison Ave
22nd Floor
New York, NY 10010
(212)849-7000
Fax: (212)849-7100
Email: erichuang@quinnemanuel.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Andrew Cuomo
*in his official capacity as Governor of the
State of New York*

represented by **Andrew Stuart Amer**
Office of the NY Attorney General
28 Liberty Street
New York, NY 10005
212-416-6127

Fax: 212-416-6009
Email: andrew.amer@ag.ny.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Monica Anne Connell
Office of the New York State Attorney
General
28 Liberty Street
New York, NY 10005
212-416-8965
Fax: 212-416-6009
Email: Monica.Connell@ag.ny.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Yan Fu
New York Attorney General
28 Liberty Street
New York, NY 10005
212-416-8582
Fax: 212-416-6009
Email: yfu@ag.ny.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Betty Rosa
*in her official capacity as Chancellor of
the Board of Regents of the State of New
York*

represented by **Andrew Stuart Amer**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Monica Anne Connell
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Yan Fu
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

MaryEllen Elia
*in her official capacity as Commissioner
of the New York State Education
Department*

represented by **Andrew Stuart Amer**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Monica Anne Connell
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Yan Fu
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Amicus

**Parents for Education and Religious
Liberties in Schools**

Amicus

The Center for Educational Equity

represented by **Andrew J. Ceresney**
Debevoise & Plimpton LLP
919 Third Avenue
New York, NY 10022
212-909-6947

Fax: 212-909-6836
Email: aceresney@debevoise.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Amicus

Footsteps, Inc.

represented by **William B. Michael**
Paul, Weiss, Rifkind, Wharton & Garrison
LLP
1285 Avenue Of The Americas
New York, NY 10019
212-373-3000
Fax: 212-757-3990
Email: wmichael@paulweiss.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

| Date Filed | # | Docket Text |
|------------|----------|---|
| 07/23/2018 | <u>1</u> | COMPLAINT against Andrew Cuomo, MaryEllen Elia, Betty Rosa filing fee \$ 400, receipt number 0207-10601325 Was the Disclosure Statement on Civil Cover Sheet completed -NO., filed by Young Advocates For Fair Education. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Civil Cover Sheet, # <u>2</u> Proposed Summons to Andrew Cuomo, # <u>3</u> Proposed Summons to Betty Rosa, # <u>4</u> Proposed Summons to MaryEllen Elia, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 1 - Felder Amendment, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 2 - NYSED Guidelines, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 3 - Census, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 4 - UJA Report, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 5 - Article, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 6 - UJA Special Report, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 7 - Article, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 8 - Article, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 9 - Article, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 10 - Article, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 11 - Ami Article, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 12 - Departure Lounge Article, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 13 - Senate Bill No. S8992, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 14 - Flanagan Statement, # <u>19</u> Exhibit 15 - Article, # <u>20</u> Exhibit 16 - Article, # <u>21</u> Exhibit 17 - Article) (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 07/23/2018) |
| 07/23/2018 | <u>2</u> | NOTICE of Appearance by Samuel Coulter Kitchens on behalf of Young Advocates For Fair Education (aty to be noticed) (Kitchens, Samuel) (Entered: 07/23/2018) |
| 07/23/2018 | <u>3</u> | NOTICE of Appearance by Thomas Alexander Bridges on behalf of Young Advocates For Fair Education (aty to be noticed) (Bridges, Thomas) (Entered: 07/23/2018) |
| 07/23/2018 | | Case Assigned to Judge I. Leo Glasser and Magistrate Judge James Orenstein. Please download and review the Individual Practices of the assigned Judges, located on our website . Attorneys are responsible for providing courtesy copies to judges where their Individual Practices require such. (Williams, Erica) (Entered: 07/24/2018) |
| 07/23/2018 | <u>4</u> | Summons Issued as to Andrew Cuomo, MaryEllen Elia, Betty Rosa. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Summons2, # <u>2</u> Summons3) (Williams, Erica) (Entered: 07/24/2018) |
| 07/24/2018 | <u>5</u> | In accordance with Rule 73 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and Local Rule 73.1, the parties are notified that <i>if</i> all parties consent a United States magistrate judge of this court is available to conduct all proceedings in this civil action including a (jury or nonjury) trial and to order the entry of a final judgment. Attached to the Notice is a blank copy of the consent form that should be filled out, signed and filed electronically only if all parties wish to consent. The form may also be accessed at the following link: http://www.uscourts.gov/uscourts/FormsAndFees/Forms/AO085.pdf . You may withhold your consent without adverse substantive consequences. Do NOT return or file the consent unless all parties have signed the consent. (Williams, Erica) (Entered: 07/24/2018) |
| 07/24/2018 | <u>6</u> | This attorney case opening filing has been checked for quality control. See the attachment for corrections that were made, if any. (Williams, Erica) (Entered: 07/24/2018) |
| 07/25/2018 | <u>7</u> | SUMMONS Returned Executed by Young Advocates For Fair Education. Andrew Cuomo served on 7/24/2018, answer due 8/14/2018. (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 07/25/2018) |

| | | |
|------------|-----------|--|
| 07/25/2018 | <u>8</u> | SUMMONS Returned Executed by Young Advocates For Fair Education. Betty Rosa served on 7/25/2018, answer due 8/15/2018. (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 07/25/2018) |
| 07/25/2018 | <u>9</u> | SUMMONS Returned Executed by Young Advocates For Fair Education. MaryEllen Elia served on 7/25/2018, answer due 8/15/2018. (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 07/25/2018) |
| 08/02/2018 | <u>10</u> | SUMMONS Returned Executed by Young Advocates For Fair Education. Andrew Cuomo served on 8/2/2018, answer due 8/23/2018. (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 08/02/2018) |
| 08/03/2018 | <u>11</u> | Letter MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer re <u>1</u> Complaint,,, by Andrew Cuomo, MaryEllen Elia, Betty Rosa. (Connell, Monica) (Entered: 08/03/2018) |
| 08/03/2018 | | ORDER re: <u>11</u> Letter MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer -- The plaintiff is respectfully directed to respond to the defendants' letter motion by August 8, 2018. Ordered by Magistrate Judge James Orenstein on 8/3/2018. (Salvador, Anjali) (Entered: 08/03/2018) |
| 08/08/2018 | <u>12</u> | Letter <i>Responding to Defendants' Motion for Extension of Time</i> by Young Advocates For Fair Education (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 08/08/2018) |
| 08/08/2018 | <u>13</u> | NOTICE of Appearance by Andrew Stuart Amer on behalf of Andrew Cuomo, MaryEllen Elia, Betty Rosa (aty to be noticed) (Amer, Andrew) (Entered: 08/08/2018) |
| 08/08/2018 | | ORDER granting <u>11</u> Motion for Extension of Time to Answer -- On consent, <i>see</i> Docket Entry <u>12</u> , I extend the defendants' time to answer the Complaint to October 2, 2018. With respect to the scheduling for the preliminary injunction motion, I defer to the assigned district judge. Ordered by Magistrate Judge James Orenstein on 8/8/2018. (Salvador, Anjali) (Entered: 08/08/2018) |
| 08/09/2018 | <u>14</u> | SCHEDULING ORDER -- I order the parties to appear for an initial discovery planning conference in Courtroom 11D South of the United States Courthouse, 225 Cadman Plaza East, Brooklyn, New York on October 4, 2018 at 9:30 a.m. No later than October 2, 2018, the parties must submit, by means of electronic filing on the court's ECF (Electronic Case Filing) system, a joint proposed discovery plan. Each party's counsel must be personally prepared to discuss all factual and legal issues in the case, including the possibility of settlement; otherwise, the client must attend in person as well. SEE ATTACHED ORDER. Ordered by Magistrate Judge James Orenstein on 8/9/2018. (Salvador, Anjali) (Guy, Alicia). Modified on 8/9/2018 (Guy, Alicia). (Entered: 08/09/2018) |
| 08/20/2018 | <u>15</u> | Letter <i>Regarding Briefing For Plaintiff's Anticipated Motion for a Preliminary Injunction</i> by Young Advocates For Fair Education (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 08/20/2018) |
| 08/22/2018 | <u>16</u> | ORDER approving the proposed amended motion briefing schedule <u>15</u> . Ordered by Judge I. Leo Glasser on 8/21/2018. (Kessler, Stanley) (Entered: 08/22/2018) |
| 08/24/2018 | <u>17</u> | Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction by Young Advocates For Fair Education. (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 08/24/2018) |
| 08/24/2018 | <u>18</u> | Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction by Young Advocates For Fair Education. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum in Support of YAFFED's Motion for a Preliminary Injunction) (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 08/24/2018) |
| 08/24/2018 | <u>19</u> | DECLARATION re <u>18</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction of <i>Naftuli Moster</i> by Young Advocates For Fair Education (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit) (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 08/24/2018) |
| 08/24/2018 | <u>20</u> | DECLARATION re <u>18</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction of <i>Chaim Widger</i> by Young Advocates For Fair Education (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 08/24/2018) |
| 08/24/2018 | <u>21</u> | DECLARATION re <u>18</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction of <i>Pesach Eisen</i> by Young Advocates For Fair Education (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 08/24/2018) |
| 08/24/2018 | <u>22</u> | DECLARATION re <u>18</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction of <i>Thomas Bridges</i> by Young Advocates For Fair Education (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>13</u> |

| | | |
|------------|-----------|---|
| | | Exhibit 13, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 14, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 15, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 16, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 17, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 18, # <u>19</u> Exhibit 19, # <u>20</u> Exhibit 20, # <u>21</u> Exhibit 21, # <u>22</u> Exhibit 22, # <u>23</u> Exhibit 23, # <u>24</u> Exhibit 24, # <u>25</u> Exhibit 25, # <u>26</u> Exhibit 26, # <u>27</u> Exhibit 27, # <u>28</u> Exhibit 28, # <u>29</u> Exhibit 29, # <u>30</u> Exhibit 30) (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 08/24/2018) |
| 08/27/2018 | <u>23</u> | NOTICE of Appearance by Yan Fu on behalf of Andrew Cuomo, MaryEllen Elia, Betty Rosa (aty to be noticed) (Fu, Yan) (Entered: 08/27/2018) |
| 09/13/2018 | <u>24</u> | Letter dated 9/3/2018 from Rabbi Yoel Loeb to Judge I. Leo Glasser. (Kessler, Stanley) (Entered: 09/13/2018) |
| 09/13/2018 | <u>25</u> | Letter MOTION for Leave to File <i>Amended Declarations in Support of Motion for Preliminary Injunction</i> by Young Advocates For Fair Education. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A – Amended Widger Declaration, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B – Amended Moster Declaration, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C – Redline Widger Declaration, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D – Redline Moster Declaration) (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 09/13/2018) |
| 09/14/2018 | <u>26</u> | ORDER granting <u>25</u> Motion for Leave to File Amended Declarations. Ordered by Judge I. Leo Glasser on 9/14/2018. (Kessler, Stanley) (Entered: 09/14/2018) |
| 09/17/2018 | <u>27</u> | AFFIDAVIT/DECLARATION in Support re <u>17</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction . <i>Amended Declaration of Naftuli Moster in Support of Plaintiff's Motion for Preliminary Injunction (Amending Dkt 19)</i> filed by Young Advocates For Fair Education. (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 09/17/2018) |
| 09/17/2018 | <u>28</u> | AFFIDAVIT/DECLARATION in Support re <u>17</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction . <i>Amended Declaration of Chaim Widger (Amending Dkt 20)</i> filed by Young Advocates For Fair Education. (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 09/17/2018) |
| 09/18/2018 | | SCHEDULING ORDER: Due to a conflict in the Court's calendar, the initial discovery planning conference previously scheduled for October 4, 2018, is rescheduled for October 5, 2018, at 11:30 a.m. in Courtroom 11D South. Ordered by Magistrate Judge James Orenstein on 9/18/2018. (Guy, Alicia) (Entered: 09/18/2018) |
| 09/24/2018 | <u>29</u> | Unsigned letter concerning Rabbi Yoel Teitelbaum received by fax in Judge I. Leo Glasser's chambers on 9/21/2018. (Kessler, Stanley) (Entered: 09/24/2018) |
| 09/27/2018 | <u>30</u> | Letter <i>to the Honorable I. Leo Glaser and to the Honorable James Orenstein regarding consent request to file an amicus brief</i> by Parents for Education and Religious Liberties in Schools (Steinlight, Stephen) (Entered: 09/27/2018) |
| 10/01/2018 | <u>31</u> | ORDER granting the application <u>30</u> for leave to file an amicus curiae brief in opposition to plaintiffs' motion for a preliminary injunction. Ordered by Judge I. Leo Glasser on 9/28/2018. (Kessler, Stanley) (Entered: 10/01/2018) |
| 10/02/2018 | <u>32</u> | MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>and Failure to State a Claim</i> by Andrew Cuomo, MaryEllen Elia, Betty Rosa. (Amer, Andrew) (Entered: 10/02/2018) |
| 10/02/2018 | <u>33</u> | AFFIDAVIT/DECLARATION in Support re <u>32</u> MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>and Failure to State a Claim</i> filed by Andrew Cuomo, MaryEllen Elia, Betty Rosa. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Ex A – Statute (old version), # <u>2</u> Exhibit Ex B – Statute (current version)) (Amer, Andrew) (Entered: 10/02/2018) |
| 10/02/2018 | <u>34</u> | MEMORANDUM in Support re <u>32</u> MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>and Failure to State a Claim</i> filed by Andrew Cuomo, MaryEllen Elia, Betty Rosa. (Amer, Andrew) (Entered: 10/02/2018) |
| 10/02/2018 | <u>35</u> | Proposed Scheduling Order / <i>Joint Discovery Plan</i> by Young Advocates For Fair Education (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 10/02/2018) |
| 10/05/2018 | <u>36</u> | Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge James Orenstein:Initial Conference Hearing held on 10/5/2018. Scheduling: (1) The next status conference will be held on February 12, 2019, at 9:30 a.m. (2) A pretrial conference will be held on April 26, 2019, at 9:30 a.m. Summary: As set forth on the record, after hearing the arguments of counsel I denied the defendants' request to stay all discovery. The ruling is of course without prejudice to any party's right to seek a protective order as to any specific discovery demand. I will enter a separate case management and scheduling order that contemplates the completion of all discovery within six months. Rather than wait to set an overall discovery deadline until the resolution of an omnibus discovery |

| | | |
|------------|-----------|---|
| | | motion, I directed the parties to promptly raise any discovery dispute that they cannot resolve on consent as a letter motion pursuant to Local Civil Rule 37.3, with the respondent submitting a letter in opposition three business days later, and with no replies or sur-replies absent advance permission. (Orenstein, James) (Entered: 10/05/2018) |
| 10/05/2018 | <u>37</u> | SCHEDULING ORDER: Deadline for all Rule 26(a)(1) disclosures: October 5, 2018. First request for production of documents and first request for interrogatories due by: November 2, 2018. Deadline for joinder of additional parties and amendment of pleadings: December 3, 2018. Status Conference (with joint status report due two business days in advance): February 12, 2019, at 9:30 a.m. All discovery, including all expert disclosures under Rule 26(a)(2), if any, to be completed by: April 5, 2019. Pretrial Conference (<i>ex parte</i> statements of settlement position due via email two business days in advance): April 26, 2019, at 9:30 a.m. Dispositive motion process started by: June 7, 2019. Joint pretrial order due by: July 5, 2019. SEE ATTACHED ORDER. Ordered by Magistrate Judge James Orenstein on 10/5/2018. (Orenstein, James) (Entered: 10/05/2018) |
| 10/05/2018 | <u>38</u> | AFFIDAVIT/DECLARATION in Opposition re <u>18</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction , <u>17</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction filed by Andrew Cuomo, MaryEllen Elia, Betty Rosa. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A – Statute (old version), # <u>2</u> Exhibit B – Statute (current version)) (Amer, Andrew) (Entered: 10/05/2018) |
| 10/05/2018 | <u>39</u> | AFFIDAVIT/DECLARATION in Opposition re <u>18</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction , <u>17</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction filed by Andrew Cuomo, MaryEllen Elia, Betty Rosa. (Amer, Andrew) (Entered: 10/05/2018) |
| 10/05/2018 | <u>40</u> | MEMORANDUM in Opposition re <u>18</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction , <u>17</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction filed by Andrew Cuomo, MaryEllen Elia, Betty Rosa. (Amer, Andrew) (Entered: 10/05/2018) |
| 10/05/2018 | <u>41</u> | MEMORANDUM in Opposition re <u>18</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction by <i>Amici Curiae</i> filed by Parents for Education and Religious Liberties in Schools. (Schick, Avi) (Entered: 10/05/2018) |
| 10/05/2018 | <u>42</u> | DECLARATION of <i>Dr. Adina Schick</i> by Parents for Education and Religious Liberties in Schools (Schick, Avi) (Entered: 10/05/2018) |
| 10/05/2018 | <u>43</u> | DECLARATION of <i>Rabbi Avrohom Schwartz</i> by Parents for Education and Religious Liberties in Schools (Schick, Avi) (Entered: 10/05/2018) |
| 10/05/2018 | <u>44</u> | DECLARATION of <i>Professor Aaron D. Twerski</i> by Parents for Education and Religious Liberties in Schools (Schick, Avi) (Entered: 10/05/2018) |
| 10/05/2018 | <u>45</u> | DECLARATION of <i>Richard Altabe</i> by Parents for Education and Religious Liberties in Schools (Schick, Avi) (Entered: 10/05/2018) |
| 10/05/2018 | <u>46</u> | DECLARATION of <i>Rabbi Yaacov Sebbag</i> by Parents for Education and Religious Liberties in Schools (Schick, Avi) (Entered: 10/05/2018) |
| 10/16/2018 | <u>47</u> | MEMORANDUM in Opposition re <u>32</u> MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction and Failure to State a Claim filed by Young Advocates For Fair Education. (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 10/16/2018) |
| 10/16/2018 | <u>48</u> | AFFIDAVIT/DECLARATION in Opposition re <u>32</u> MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction and Failure to State a Claim filed by Young Advocates For Fair Education. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4) (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 10/16/2018) |
| 10/19/2018 | <u>49</u> | REPLY in Support re <u>17</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction filed by Young Advocates For Fair Education. (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 10/19/2018) |
| 10/24/2018 | <u>50</u> | NOTICE of Appearance by Andrew J. Ceresney on behalf of The Center for Educational Equity (aty to be noticed) (Ceresney, Andrew) (Entered: 10/24/2018) |
| 10/24/2018 | <u>51</u> | Letter MOTION for Leave to File Document <i>Amicus Briefs</i> by The Center for Educational Equity, Footsteps, Inc.. (Michael, William) (Entered: 10/24/2018) |

| | | |
|------------|-----------|---|
| 10/25/2018 | <u>52</u> | RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>51</u> Letter MOTION for Leave to File Document <i>Amicus Briefs</i> filed by Andrew Cuomo, MaryEllen Elia, Betty Rosa. (Amer, Andrew) (Entered: 10/25/2018) |
| 10/25/2018 | <u>53</u> | REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>51</u> Letter MOTION for Leave to File Document <i>Amicus Briefs</i> filed by Footsteps, Inc., The Center for Educational Equity. (Michael, William) (Entered: 10/25/2018) |
| 10/26/2018 | <u>54</u> | REPLY in Support re <u>32</u> MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>and Failure to State a Claim</i> filed by Andrew Cuomo, MaryEllen Elia, Betty Rosa. (Amer, Andrew) (Entered: 10/26/2018) |
| 10/30/2018 | <u>55</u> | ORDER granting the motion <u>51</u> for leave to file amicus briefs. Ordered by Judge I. Leo Glasser on 10/30/2018. (Kessler, Stanley) (Entered: 10/30/2018) |
| 11/08/2018 | <u>56</u> | Letter <i>to the Hon. I. Leo Glasser</i> by Parents for Education and Religious Liberties in Schools (Schick, Avi) (Entered: 11/08/2018) |
| 11/09/2018 | <u>57</u> | Letter <i>in response to PEARLS amici letter (Doc No. 56)</i> by Young Advocates For Fair Education (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 11/09/2018) |
| 11/09/2018 | <u>58</u> | MEMORANDUM in Support re <u>18</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction , <u>17</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction / <i>Brief of Amicus Curiae</i> filed by Footsteps, Inc.. (Michael, William) (Entered: 11/09/2018) |
| 11/09/2018 | <u>59</u> | MEMORANDUM in Support re <u>18</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction , <u>17</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction // <i>Brief of Amicus Curiae The Center for Educational Equity in Support of Plaintiff's Motion for a Preliminary Injunction</i> filed by The Center for Educational Equity. (Ceresney, Andrew) (Entered: 11/09/2018) |
| 11/21/2018 | <u>60</u> | MEMORANDUM in Opposition re <u>58</u> Memorandum in Support, <u>59</u> Memorandum in Support, filed by Andrew Cuomo, MaryEllen Elia, Betty Rosa. (Amer, Andrew) (Entered: 11/21/2018) |
| 12/03/2018 | <u>61</u> | NOTICE by Andrew Cuomo, MaryEllen Elia, Betty Rosa re <u>18</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction , <u>17</u> Notice of MOTION for Preliminary Injunction , <u>32</u> MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>and Failure to State a Claim Notice of Supplemental Authority</i> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A – Revised Substantial Equivalency Review and Determination Guidelines) (Fu, Yan) (Entered: 12/03/2018) |
| 12/06/2018 | <u>62</u> | MOTION to Withdraw as Attorney <i>by Samuel C. Kitchens for Plaintiffs Young Advocates For Fair Education</i> by Young Advocates For Fair Education. (Huang, Eric) (Entered: 12/06/2018) |
| 12/07/2018 | | ORDER granting <u>62</u> Motion to Withdraw as Attorney -- The application is granted; attorney Samuel C. Kitchens terminated. Ordered by Magistrate Judge James Orenstein on 12/7/2018. (Roantree, Bronwyn) (Entered: 12/07/2018) |
| 12/11/2018 | | NOTICE: Oral argument of plaintiff's motion for a preliminary injunction and defendants' motion for dismissal will be held on 1/9/2019 at 2:30 p.m. (Kessler, Stanley) (Entered: 12/11/2018) |
| 12/18/2018 | <u>63</u> | ORDER granting the request <u>56</u> of amici Parents for Educational and Religious Liberty in Schools, Agudath Israel of America, Torah Umesorah: National Society for Hebrew Day Schools, and United Jewish Organizations of Williamsburg for acceptance of the declaration of Professor Awi Federgruen. Ordered by Judge I. Leo Glasser on 12/14/2018. (Kessler, Stanley) (Entered: 12/18/2018) |
| 12/20/2018 | <u>64</u> | Letter <i>Request to Participate at Oral Argument</i> by Parents for Education and Religious Liberties in Schools (Schick, Avi) (Entered: 12/20/2018) |
| 12/27/2018 | <u>65</u> | ORDER granting the PEARLS Amicus request to participate in the oral argument set for 1/9/2019. Ordered by Judge I. Leo Glasser on 12/27/2018. (Kessler, Stanley) (Entered: 12/27/2018) |
| 01/07/2019 | <u>66</u> | NOTICE of Appearance by Renita Sharma on behalf of Young Advocates For Fair Education (aty to be noticed) (Sharma, Renita) (Entered: 01/07/2019) |

| | | |
|------------|-----------|--|
| 01/10/2019 | <u>67</u> | Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge I. Leo Glasser on 1/9/2019: Counsel for all parties present. Plaintiffs motion for a preliminary injunction and all defendants motion for dismissal were argued. Decision was reserved. (Court Reporter Linda Danelczyk.) (Kessler, Stanley) (Entered: 01/10/2019) |
| 01/16/2019 | <u>68</u> | MEMORANDUM & ORDER, For the foregoing reasons, Defendants' <u>32</u> Motion to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction is GRANTED; and YAFFED'S <u>17</u> and <u>18</u> Motions for Preliminary Injunction are therefore denied. Ordered by Judge I. Leo Glasser on 1/16/2019. Fwd. for jgt. (Layne, Monique) . (Entered: 01/16/2019) |
| 01/17/2019 | <u>69</u> | CLERK'S JUDGMENT, that pursuant to Rule 12(b)(1), Defendants' motion to dismiss is granted; and that YAFFEDs motion for a preliminary injunction is denied. Signed by Douglas C. Palmer, Clerk of Court, By J. Poveda, Deputy Clerk on 1/17/2019. (Layne, Monique) (Entered: 01/17/2019) |