

CLOSED, ECF, JURY, RAMIREZ

**U.S. District Court
Northern District of Texas (Dallas)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 3:04-cv-01892-N**

Equal Employment Opportunity Commission v. Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA Date Filed: 08/30/2004
Assigned to: Judge David C Godbey Date Terminated: 05/23/2008
Cause: 28:1331 Fed. Question: Employment Discrimination Jury Demand: Plaintiff
Nature of Suit: 442 Civil Rights: Jobs
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff

**Equal Employment Opportunity
Commission**

represented by **Suzanne M Anderson**
Equal Employment Opportunity
Commission
Dallas District Office
207 S Houston
3rd Floor
Dallas , TX 75202
214/253-2740
Fax: 214/253-2749 FAX
Email: suzanne.anderson@eeoc.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joel Philip Clark
EEOC
207 S Houston St
3rd Floor
Dallas , TX 75202
214/253-2743
Fax: 214/253-2749
Email: joel.clark@eeoc.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Robert A Canino , Jr
EEOC – Dallas District Office
207 S Houston
3rd Floor
Dallas , TX 75202
214/253-2750
Email: robert.canino@eeoc.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Ronetta J Francis
Equal Employment Opportunity
Commission
Dallas District Office
207 S Houston
3rd Floor
Dallas , TX 75202
214/253-2746
Fax: 214/253-2749 FAX
Email: Ronetta.Francis@eeoc.gov
TERMINATED: 10/04/2007

William C Backhaus
Equal Employment Opportunity
Commission
207 S Houston
3rd Floor
Dallas , TX 75202
214/253-2742

Fax: 214/253-2749 FAX
Email: william.backhaus@eeoc.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA

represented by **Ron W Chapman , Jr**
Ogletree Deakins Nash Smoak & Stewart
700 Preston Commons
8117 Preston Rd
Dallas , TX 75225-4324
214/987-3800
Fax: 214/987-3927 FAX
Email: ron.chapman@ogletreedeakins.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Denise C Villani
Ogletree Deakins Nash Smoak & Stewart
700 Preston Commons
8117 Preston Rd
Dallas , TX 75225-4324
214/987-3800
Fax: 214/987-3927 FAX
Email: denise.villani@ogletreedeakins.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Movant

Carol Cantu

represented by **Theodore Carl Anderson , III**
Kilgore & Kilgore
3109 Carlisle
Suite 200
Dallas , TX 75204
214/969-9099
Fax: 214/292-8758
Email: tca@kilgorelaw.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Movant

Linda Housholder

represented by **Theodore Carl Anderson , III**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Movant

Esmeralda Jimenez

represented by **Theodore Carl Anderson , III**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Movant

Heather Sooter

represented by **Theodore Carl Anderson , III**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
08/30/2004	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT with jury demand against Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA , filed by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission.(aat,) (Entered: 08/31/2004)
08/30/2004		***Magistrate Judge Ramirez chosen by random selection to handle matters that may be referred in this case. (aat,) (Entered: 08/31/2004)
08/30/2004	<u>2</u>	CERTIFICATE OF INTERESTED PERSONS/DISCLOSURE STATEMENT by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. (aat,) (Entered: 08/31/2004)
09/01/2004	<u>3</u>	Summons Issued as to Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA. (aat,) (Entered: 09/02/2004)
09/29/2004	<u>4</u>	ANSWER to Complaint by Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA.(svc,) (Entered: 09/30/2004)
10/04/2004	<u>5</u>	ORDER REQUIRING STATUS AND SCHEDULING CONFERENCE. The parties are directed to confer within 14 days of the date of this order and to report to the court within 14 days of the conference. (Signed by Judge David C Godbey on 10/4/04) (aat,) (Entered: 10/05/2004)
10/20/2004	<u>6</u>	NOTICE of designation of lead attorney by Ronetta J Francis on behalf of Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (aat,) (Entered: 10/21/2004)
10/28/2004	<u>7</u>	JOINT STATUS REPORT by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA. (aat,) (Entered: 10/29/2004)
11/04/2004	<u>8</u>	ORDER REGARDING INTENTION TO ADMINISTER CASE ELECTRONICALLY. The parties have agreed that this case is an appropriate candidate for the Court's Electronic Case Files (ECF) pilot project. The completed registration forms shall be submitted no later than 15 days from the date of this order. (Signed by Judge David C Godbey on 11/4/4) (aat,) (Entered: 11/05/2004)
11/04/2004	<u>9</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER: Docket call set for 3/6/2006 before Judge David C Godbey. (Signed by Judge David C Godbey on 11/4/4) (aat,) (Entered: 11/05/2004)
11/29/2004	<u>10</u>	Order Designating Case for ECF – see order for specifics. (Signed by Judge David C Godbey on 11/29/04) (dzh,) (Entered: 11/29/2004)
01/04/2005	<u>11</u>	MOTION to Intervene by Carol Cantu, Linda Housholder, Esmeralda Jimenez, Heather Sooter (aat,) (Entered: 01/05/2005)
01/24/2005	<u>12</u>	Defendant's RESPONSE to <u>11</u> MOTION to Intervene filed by Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA. (skt,) (Entered: 01/26/2005)
02/08/2005	<u>13</u>	***REFILED as doc. #14*** MOTION to Intervene <i>Reply</i> by Heather Sooter (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Exhibit A to Reply to Defendant's Response to Motion for Leave to Intervene# <u>2</u> Exhibit Exhibit B to Reply to Defendant's Response to Motion for Leave to Intervene# <u>3</u> Exhibit Exhibit C to Reply to Defendant's Response to Motion for Leave to Intervene# <u>4</u> Exhibit Exhibit D to Reply to Defendant's Response to Motion for Leave to Intervene)(Anderson, Theodore) Modified on 2/9/2005 (skt,). (Entered: 02/08/2005)

02/08/2005		NOTICE of Docket Text/Document Modification by Deputy Clerk regarding MOTION to Intervene/Reply document <u>13</u> ; Wrong docket event used, re-docketed using correct event. (skt,) (Entered: 02/09/2005)
02/08/2005	<u>14</u>	REPLY to Response to <u>11</u> MOTION to Intervene filed by Heather Sooter. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A# <u>2</u> Exhibit B# <u>3</u> Exhibit C# <u>4</u> Exhibit D)(skt,) (Entered: 02/09/2005)
03/09/2005	<u>15</u>	MOTION for Leave to File Its First Amended Answer by Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA (Chapman, Ron) (Entered: 03/09/2005)
03/09/2005	<u>16</u>	Vacation Letter as to Theodore Anderson for dates March 14 – March 18, 2005. (Anderson, Theodore) Modified on 3/10/2005 (skt,). (Entered: 03/09/2005)
03/11/2005	<u>17</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment by Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA (Chapman, Ron) (Entered: 03/11/2005)
03/11/2005	<u>18</u>	Memorandum in Support re <u>17</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA. (Chapman, Ron) (Entered: 03/11/2005)
03/11/2005	<u>19</u>	Appendix in Support re <u>17</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>and Brief in Support</i> filed by Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix # <u>2</u> Appendix # <u>3</u> Appendix # <u>4</u> Appendix)(Chapman, Ron) (Entered: 03/11/2005)
03/29/2005	<u>20</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>15</u> MOTION for Leave to File Its First Amended Answer filed by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Charge of Discrimination# <u>2</u> Exhibit Original Petition# <u>3</u> Exhibit LOD)(Francis, Ronetta) (Entered: 03/29/2005)
03/31/2005	<u>21</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition filed by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. (Francis, Ronetta) (Entered: 03/31/2005)
03/31/2005	<u>22</u>	Memorandum in Support re <u>21</u> Response in Opposition <i>Defendant's Motion For Summary Judgment</i> filed by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. (Francis, Ronetta) (Entered: 03/31/2005)
03/31/2005	<u>23</u>	Appendix in Support re <u>21</u> Response in Opposition <i>Defendants Motion For Summary Judgment</i> filed by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> # <u>2</u> # <u>3</u> # <u>4</u> # <u>5</u> # <u>6</u> # <u>7</u>)(Francis, Ronetta) (Entered: 03/31/2005)
04/13/2005	<u>24</u>	Memorandum in Support re <u>15</u> MOTION for Leave to File Its First Amended Answer filed by Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA. (Chapman, Ron) (Entered: 04/13/2005)
04/15/2005	<u>25</u>	***REDOCKETED***Memorandum in Support re <u>17</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA. (Chapman, Ron) Modified on 4/18/2005 (skt,). (Entered: 04/15/2005)
04/18/2005	<u>26</u>	Defendant's REPLY in Support of It's <u>17</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA. (skt,) (Entered: 04/18/2005)
04/18/2005		NOTICE of Docket Text/Document Modification by Deputy Clerk regarding Defendant's Memorandum in Support of Motion for Summary Judgment. Document <u>25</u> was docketed using the wrong event; it should have been docketed under reply to response to motion event; this document had been redocketed as <u>26</u> . (skt,) (Entered: 04/18/2005)

07/11/2005	<u>27</u>	Memorandum in Support re <u>11</u> MOTION to Intervene filed by Carol Cantu, Linda Housholder, Esmeralda Jimenez, Heather Sooter. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Anderson, Theodore) (Entered: 07/11/2005)
07/11/2005	<u>28</u>	Memorandum in Support re <u>22</u> Response in Support of Motion <i>Opposing Defendant's Motion For Summary Judgment</i> filed by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. (Francis, Ronetta) (Entered: 07/11/2005)
07/11/2005	<u>29</u>	Supplemental Document by Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA as to <u>18</u> Response in Support of Motion <i>for Summary Judgment</i> . (Chapman, Ron) (Entered: 07/11/2005)
08/26/2005	<u>30</u>	Agreed MOTION to Stay re <u>9</u> Scheduling Order <i>to Stay Discovery</i> by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA (Chapman, Ron) (Entered: 08/26/2005)
09/07/2005	<u>31</u>	Memorandum Opinion and Order. The Court grants the motion to amend and denies the motion to intervene and the motion for summary judgment. (See Order for specifics) (Signed by Judge David C Godbey on 9/7/05) (skt,) (Entered: 09/08/2005)
09/19/2005	<u>32</u>	ORDER denying as moot <u>30</u> Agreed Motion to Stay Discovery. (See Order for specifics) (Signed by Judge David C Godbey on 9/16/05) (skt,) (Entered: 09/19/2005)
09/20/2005	<u>33</u>	MOTION to Amend/Correct <u>31</u> Memorandum Opinion and Order <i>to Allow Interlocutory Appeal and to Stay Proceedings and Brief in Support</i> by Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A# <u>2</u> Exhibit B# <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Chapman, Ron) (Entered: 09/20/2005)
10/11/2005	<u>34</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition <i>to Defendant's Motion Seeking Interlocutory Appeal</i> filed by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. (Francis, Ronetta) (Entered: 10/11/2005)
10/11/2005	<u>35</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition <i>to Defendant's Motion Seeking Interlocutory Appeal and Incorporated Brief</i> filed by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. (Francis, Ronetta) (Entered: 10/11/2005)
10/25/2005	<u>36</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>33</u> MOTION to Amend/Correct <u>31</u> Memorandum Opinion and Order <i>to Allow Interlocutory Appeal and to Stay Proceedings and Brief in Support</i> filed by Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA. (Chapman, Ron) (Entered: 10/25/2005)
11/09/2005	<u>37</u>	PROOF of Service for Subpoena served on Kilgore & Kilgore, PLLC on 11/4/2005. (skt,) (Entered: 11/10/2005)
11/10/2005	<u>38</u>	Amended Memorandum Opinion and Order. The Court stays this action pending disposition by the Court of Appeals of any interlocutory appeal of the denial of JDC's motion for summary judgment. (See Order for specifics) (Signed by Judge David C Godbey on 11/10/05) (skt,) (Entered: 11/14/2005)
11/10/2005	<u>39</u>	PROOF of Service for Subpoena served on AAA on 11/8/05. (skt,) (Entered: 11/15/2005)
11/14/2005	<u>40</u>	PROOF of Service for Subpoena served on Jeff Cantu on behalf of Cantu Construction Company on 11/8/2005. (skt,) (Entered: 11/16/2005)

11/17/2005	<u>41</u>	Order Designating Case for ECF – see order for specifics. (Signed by Judge David C Godbey on 11/17/05) (skt,) (Entered: 11/17/2005)
02/01/2006		Appeal fee has been paid, receipt no. 227409, \$255.00 per <u>42</u> USCA Order, filed by Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA. (jmr) (Entered: 02/10/2006)
02/03/2006	<u>42</u>	USCA Order re <u>38</u> Memorandum Opinion and Order, filed by Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA. Leave to appeal from the interlocutory order of the U. S. District Court for the Northern District of Texas, Dallas, entered on November 14, 2005, is GRANTED. Also included is USCA letter with instructions on proceeding with the appeal (jmr) **PDF was incorrect and has been corrected. (Entered: 02/07/2006)
02/03/2006		Appeal number is 06–10090 re <u>42</u> Remark, <u>38</u> Memorandum Opinion and Order, filed by Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA. (jmr) (Entered: 02/07/2006)
02/03/2006		NOTICE OF APPEAL as to <u>38</u> Memorandum Opinion and Order, <u>42</u> USCA Order Granting Interlocutory Appeal by Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA. (jmr) Filing fee already paid. Modified on 9/12/2006 (jmr). (Entered: 09/12/2006)
02/08/2006	<u>43</u>	Transcript Order Form by attorney for Jefferson Dental: transcript not requested re Notice of Appeal. There were no hearings. (Chapman, Ron) Corrected text. Modified on 9/12/2006 (jmr). (Entered: 02/08/2006)
02/10/2006		NOTICE of Docket Text/Document Modification by Deputy Clerk regarding bad PDF in doc. <u>42</u> USCA Order. PDF has been corrected. (jmr) (Entered: 02/10/2006)
02/10/2006	<u>44</u>	ORDER...It is hereby ordered that all matters in this case are STAYED pending the resolution of defendant's interlocutory appeal. (Signed by Judge David C Godbey on 2/10/06) (svc,) (Entered: 02/10/2006)
02/13/2006		Certified record on appeal re <u>42</u> USCA Order, filed by Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA.: 3 vol. electronic record. (jmr) (Entered: 02/13/2006)
02/21/2006	<u>45</u>	Certified Record on Appeal transferred to Ron W. Chapman Jr. for Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA. 3 vol. electronic record. (jmr) (Entered: 02/21/2006)
04/04/2006	<u>46</u>	NOTICE of Transfer of the Appeals Record from Ron Chapman, attorney for Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA to Jennifer Goldsten, attorney for EEOC in Washington, DC, re <u>38</u> Memorandum Opinion and Order. (jmr) (Entered: 04/04/2006)
09/11/2006	<u>47</u>	NOTICE of Transfer from USCA5 of Appeal Record to Ron Chapman, attorney for Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA re Notice of Appeal. (jmr) (Entered: 09/12/2006)
05/29/2007		Appeal Record Returned: Electronic record has been recycled. (jmr) (Entered: 05/30/2007)
05/29/2007	<u>48</u>	Opinion of USCA (certified copy) in accordance with USCA judgment re Notice of Appeal filed by Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA. Reversed in part, Remand in part. See Opinion for specifics. (jmr) (Entered: 05/30/2007)
05/29/2007	<u>49</u>	JUDGMENT/MANDATE of USCA as to Notice of Appeal filed by Jefferson Dental Clinics, PA. Issued as Mandate: 5/21/07. The order of the District Court is reversed, and the cause is remanded to the District Court for further

		proceedings in accordance with the opinion of this Court... Appellee pay to appellant the costs on appeal. (jmr) (Entered: 05/30/2007)
05/29/2007	<u>50</u>	USCA BILL OF COSTS against Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. (jmr) (Entered: 05/30/2007)
08/13/2007	<u>51</u>	MOTION to Withdraw as Attorney by Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (Francis, Ronetta) (Entered: 08/13/2007)
10/04/2007	<u>52</u>	ORDER granting <u>51</u> Plaintiff's Motion to Withdraw and Substitute Counsel. Added attorney Suzanne M Anderson for Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. Attorney Ronetta J Francis terminated. (Signed by Judge David C Godbey on 10/4/07) (klm) (Entered: 10/05/2007)
01/25/2008	<u>53</u>	AMENDED SCHEDULING ORDER: Jury Trial set for 7/28/2008 before Judge David C Godbey. The setting is for a one week docket. See order for other deadlines. (Signed by Judge David C Godbey on January 25, 2008) (jyg) (Entered: 01/25/2008)
03/04/2008	<u>54</u>	NOTICE of Attorney Appearance by Joel Philip Clark on behalf of Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. (Clark, Joel) (Entered: 03/04/2008)
03/04/2008	<u>55</u>	NOTICE of Attorney Appearance by William C Backhaus on behalf of Equal Employment Opportunity Commission. (Backhaus, William) (Entered: 03/04/2008)
05/21/2008	<u>56</u>	CONSENT DECREE. (See Order for specifics) (Signed by Judge David C Godbey on 5/20/08) (skt) (Entered: 05/21/2008)
05/23/2008	<u>57</u>	ORDER OF ADMINISTRATIVE DISMISSAL: A Consent Decree was filed in this case on May 21, 2008. Accordingly, this case is administratively closed for statistical purposes without prejudice. (Signed by Judge David C Godbey on 5/23/2008) (axm) (Entered: 05/23/2008)