

**U.S. District Court
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:10-cv-05236-RJS**

Goodman v. City of New York et al
Assigned to: Judge Richard J. Sullivan
Cause: 42:1983 Civil Rights (Employment Discrimination)

Date Filed: 07/09/2010
Date Terminated: 01/21/2014
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 442 Civil Rights: Jobs
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

David Goodman

represented by **Arastu Kabeer Chaudhury**
U.S. Attorney Office SDNY
86 Chambers Street
New York, NY 10007
(212) 637-2633
Fax: (212) 637-2750
Email: arastu.chaudhury@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Tara Marie La Morte
U.S. Attorney's Office, SDNY (Chambers
Street)
86 Chambers Street
New York, NY 10007
(212) 637-2746
Fax: (212) 637-2730
Email: tara.lamorte2@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Michael Doherty

represented by **Arastu Kabeer Chaudhury**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Tara Marie La Morte
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Robert D. Black

represented by **Arastu Kabeer Chaudhury**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Tara Marie La Morte
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

City of New York

represented by **Alexis Downs**
New York City Law Department
100 Church Street, Room 4-114

New York, NY 10007
212-356-2507
Fax: 212-356-1148
Email: adowns@law.nyc.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Alicia Hayley Welch
NYC Law Department, Office of the
Corporation Counsel (NYC)
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
(212)-788-6760
Fax: (212)-788-0940
Email: aliciahwelch@gmail.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Keri Reid McNally
New York City Law Department
100 Church Street, 3rd Fl.
Room 3-310
New York, NY 10007
(212) 788-0922
Fax: (212) 788-8877
Email: kerimcnally@me.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Benjamin Eldridge Stockman
Corporation Counsel Office City of New
York
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
(212)-788-1177
Fax: (212)-788-9776
Email: bstockma@law.nyc.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kathleen Marie Comfrey
NYC Law Department, Office of the
Corporation Counsel (NYC)
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
212-848-4178
Fax: 646-848-4178
Email: kcomfrey@law.nyc.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Keith Michael Snow
NYC Law Department, Office of the
Corporation Counsel (NYC)
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
212 788-0581
Fax: 212 788-8900
Email: ksnow@law.nyc.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Laura C. Rowntree
Morgan Lewis & Bockius, LLP (NY)
101 Park Avenue
New York, NY 10178
(212)-309-6817
Fax: (212) 309-6001

Email: laura.rowntree@morganlewis.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

New York City Police Department

represented by **Alexis Downs**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Alicia Hayley Welch
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Keri Reid McNally
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Benjamin Eldridge Stockman
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kathleen Marie Comfrey
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Keith Michael Snow
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Laura C. Rowntree
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

New York City Police Pension Fund

represented by **Alexis Downs**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Alicia Hayley Welch
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Keri Reid McNally
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Benjamin Eldridge Stockman
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kathleen Marie Comfrey
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Keith Michael Snow
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Laura C. Rowntree

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Counter Claimant

New York City Police Department
TERMINATED: 02/22/2012

represented by **Alexis Downs**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Alicia Hayley Welch
(See above for address)

Benjamin Eldridge Stockman
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kathleen Marie Comfrey
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Keith Michael Snow
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Keri Reid McNally
(See above for address)

Counter Claimant

City of New York
TERMINATED: 02/22/2012

represented by **Alexis Downs**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Alicia Hayley Welch
(See above for address)

Benjamin Eldridge Stockman
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kathleen Marie Comfrey
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Keith Michael Snow
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Keri Reid McNally
(See above for address)

Counter Claimant

New York City Police Pension Fund
TERMINATED: 02/22/2012

represented by **Alexis Downs**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Alicia Hayley Welch
(See above for address)

Benjamin Eldridge Stockman
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kathleen Marie Comfrey
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Keith Michael Snow
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Keri Reid McNally
(See above for address)

V.

Counter Defendant

David Goodman
TERMINATED: 02/22/2012

represented by **Tara Marie La Morte**
(See above for address)

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
07/09/2010	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. Document filed by David Goodman.(mro) (mro). (Entered: 07/09/2010)
07/09/2010		SUMMONS ISSUED as to City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (mro) (Entered: 07/09/2010)
07/09/2010		Magistrate Judge Henry B. Pitman is so designated. (mro) (Entered: 07/09/2010)
07/09/2010		Case Designated ECF. (mro) (Entered: 07/09/2010)
07/20/2010	<u>2</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Alicia Hayley Welch on behalf of City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund (Welch, Alicia) (Entered: 07/20/2010)
07/29/2010	<u>3</u>	ENDORSED LETTER: addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Alicia H. Welch dated 7/28/2010 re: Accordingly, defendants respectfully request an extension of time until September 3, 2010 to respond to the complaint. ENDORSEMENT: This request is GRANTED. It is hereby ordered that Defendants must answer or otherwise respond to the complaint by no later than September 3, 2010. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 7/28/2010) (js) (Entered: 07/29/2010)
08/02/2010	<u>4</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint. City of New York served on 7/16/2010, answer due 9/3/2010. Service was accepted by Dimitri Aronov. Document filed by David Goodman. (La Morte, Tara) (Entered: 08/02/2010)
08/02/2010	<u>5</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint. New York City Police Department served on 7/16/2010, answer due 9/3/2010. Service was accepted by Dimitri Aronov. Document filed by David Goodman. (La Morte, Tara) (Entered: 08/02/2010)
08/02/2010	<u>6</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint. New York City Police Pension Fund served on 7/14/2010, answer due 9/3/2010. Service was accepted by Steven Welsome. Document filed by David Goodman. (La Morte, Tara) (Entered: 08/02/2010)
08/19/2010	<u>7</u>	ORDER: Initial Status Conference set for 9/8/2010 at 09:30 AM in Courtroom 21C, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Richard J. Sullivan. By 9/1/2010 at 4:00 p.m., the parties shall jointly submit a status letter, not to exceed fives pages. By Wednesday, 9/1/2010 at 4:00 p.m., the parties shall submit to the Court a proposed case management plan and scheduling order. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 8/19/2010) (tro) (Entered: 08/20/2010)
08/26/2010	<u>8</u>	ORDER: The Court is in receipt of a letter, dated August 25, 2010, from Defendants, requesting leave to file a motion to dismiss the complaint. Pursuant to the Court's Individual Practices, Rule 2A, Plaintiff shall respond to this letter by no later than

		August 30, 2010. Plaintiff shall email his letter to sullivannysdchambers@nysd.uscourts.gov. The initial conference scheduled for Wednesday, September 8, 2010 shall also serve as a pre-motion conference. The conference, however, shall take place at 3:00 p.m., rather than at 9:30 am. Given Defendants' contemplated motion to dismiss, the parties shall not make the submissions described in the Court's August 19, 2010 Order at this time. (Initial Conference/Pre-Motion Conference set for 9/8/2010 at 03:00 PM before Judge Richard J. Sullivan.) (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 8/25/10) (db) (Entered: 08/26/2010)
09/09/2010	<u>9</u>	ORDER: As stated on the record at today's conference, the parties shall adhere to the following schedule with respect to Defendants' motion to dismiss: (1) Defendants shall file their motion and supporting papers by October 8, 2010; (2) Plaintiff shall file his opposition papers by November 8, 2010; and (3) Defendants shall file their reply papers by no later than November 19, 2010. The parties are reminded to follow the Court's Individual Practices, Rule 2, with regard to motion papers. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 9/8/2010) (jpo) (Entered: 09/09/2010)
10/04/2010	10	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on September 8, 2010 4:00 p.m. before Judge Richard J. Sullivan. (ajc) (Entered: 10/06/2010)
10/08/2010	<u>11</u>	FIRST MOTION to Dismiss (<i>Notice of Motion</i>). Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. Responses due by 11/8/2010(Welch, Alicia) (Entered: 10/08/2010)
10/08/2010	<u>12</u>	FIRST MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>11</u> FIRST MOTION to Dismiss (<i>Notice of Motion</i>).. Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Welch, Alicia) (Entered: 10/08/2010)
10/08/2010	<u>13</u>	DECLARATION of Assistant Corporation Counsel Alicia H. Welch in Support re: <u>11</u> FIRST MOTION to Dismiss (<i>Notice of Motion</i>).. Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A-H)(Welch, Alicia) (Entered: 10/08/2010)
11/08/2010	<u>14</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>11</u> FIRST MOTION to Dismiss (<i>Notice of Motion</i>).. Document filed by David Goodman. (La Morte, Tara) (Entered: 11/08/2010)
11/19/2010	<u>15</u>	FIRST REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>11</u> FIRST MOTION to Dismiss (<i>Notice of Motion</i>).. Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Welch, Alicia) (Entered: 11/19/2010)
06/14/2011	<u>16</u>	ORDER: Given the similarity of the legal issues presented by these cases, and the fact that the parties in each action are represented by the same counsel, Defendants' motion to dismiss the Doherty action is DEEMED MADE. The Court will therefore construe the parties' briefing on the Goodman motion to dismiss as applying equally to Defendant's motion to dismiss the Doherty action. If either party to the Doherty action wishes to supplement the submissions it made in the Goodman action, it may do so by July 8, 2011. Additionally, the status conference in the Doherty action, currently scheduled for July 15, 2011, at 10:30 a.m., is adjourned until Friday, July 22,2011, at 2:30p.m. At that time, the Court will hear argument from the parties on Defendants' motions. Finally, the parties in the Doherty action need not submit a joint letter or proposed case management plan in advance of the conference. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 6/13/2011) (jpo) (Entered: 06/14/2011)
07/07/2011	<u>17</u>	ORDER. IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the oral argument currently scheduled for July 22, 2011, is rescheduled for Wednesday, July 20, 2011, at 10:00 a.m. in Courtroom 21C. (Oral Argument set for 7/20/2011 at 10:00 AM in Courtroom 21C, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Richard J. Sullivan.) (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 7/6/2011) (rjm) (Entered: 07/07/2011)
07/11/2011	<u>18</u>	ORDER: It is hereby ordered that Plaintiff Doherty may submit a response to defendants' supplemental briefing by July 22, 2011, and Defendants may submit reply papers by August 1, 2011. Additionally, the oral argument scheduled for July 20, 2011, is adjourned until Friday, August 19, 2011, at 2:00 p.m. in Courtroom 21C. So

		Ordered (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 7/11/2011) (js) (Entered: 07/11/2011)
09/26/2011	<u>19</u>	For the foregoing reasons, Defendants motions to dismiss are denied. Accordingly, It is hereby ordered that, by October 19, 2011, the parties shall submit a joint letter, not to exceed five pages, providing the following information in separate paragraphs: (1) a brief description of any discovery that has already taken place, and that which will be necessary for the parties to engage in meaningful settlement negotiations; (2) a list of all prior settlement discussions, including the date, the parties involved, and the approximate duration of such discussions, if any; and (3) the estimated length of trial IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that, by October 19, 2011, the parties shall submit a proposed case management plan and scheduling order, which is available at www.nysd.uscourts.gov/judge/sullivan. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the parties shall appear for a status conference on October 28, 2011, at 9:30 a.m. in Courtroom 21 C of the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York, 500 Pearl Street, New York, New York. The Clerk of Court is respectfully directed to terminate the motions located at Doc. No. 11 in Goodman v. NYC, 10 Civ. 5236, and at Doc. No. 11 in Doherty v. NYC, 11 Civ. 3432. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 9/26/2011) (js) (Entered: 09/26/2011)
09/26/2011		Set/Reset Deadlines:, Set/Reset Hearings:(Status Conference set for 10/28/2011 at 09:30 AM in Courtroom 21C, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Richard J. Sullivan.) (js) (Entered: 09/26/2011)
10/05/2011	<u>20</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Diana Goell Voigt dated 10/5/11 re: Counsel for the City Defendants writes to request an extension of time from 10/11/11 to 10/14/11 to serve and file their response to the complaints. ENDORSEMENT: So ordered. City of New York answer due 10/14/2011; New York City Police Department answer due 10/14/2011; New York City Police Pension Fund answer due 10/14/2011. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 10/5/2011) (mro) (Entered: 10/06/2011)
10/14/2011	<u>21</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Keri Reid McNally on behalf of City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund (McNally, Keri) (Entered: 10/14/2011)
10/14/2011	<u>22</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint., COUNTERCLAIM against David Goodman. Document filed by New York City Police Department, City of New York, New York City Police Pension Fund.(McNally, Keri) (Entered: 10/14/2011)
10/17/2011	<u>23</u>	ORDER OF AUTOMATIC REFERRAL TO MEDIATION (See M-10-468 Order filed January 3, 2011). Please reference the following when corresponding with the Mediation Office. E-mail MediationOffice@nysd.uscourts.gov, telephone (212) 805-0643, and facsimile (212) 805-0647. Mediator to be Assigned by 10/27/2011. Mediator Expertise Request due by 10/24/2011. (Signed by Judge Loretta A. Preska on 01/03/2011) (sc) (Entered: 10/17/2011)
10/21/2011		NOTICE OF MEDIATOR ASSIGNMENT – Notice of assignment of mediator. Mediator Schedule due by 11/21/2011.(ms) (Entered: 10/21/2011)
10/28/2011	<u>24</u>	CASE MANAGEMENT PLAN AND SCHEDULING ORDER: All parties do not consent to disposition of this case by a Magistrate Judge, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 636(c). This case is not to be tried to a jury. Deposition due by 4/6/2012. All Discovery due by 4/6/2012. Referral to the Southern District's Mediation Program. Parties have conferred and their present best estimate of the length of trial is 2 days, and as further set forth. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 10/28/2011) (rjm) (Entered: 10/31/2011)
11/10/2011	<u>25</u>	ORDER: that the parties shall appear for a pre-motion conference on Wednesday, November 30, 2011, at 2:30 p.m. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 11/10/2011) (pl) (Entered: 11/10/2011)
11/28/2011	<u>26</u>	ORDER: Pre-Motion Conference rescheduled for 12/9/2011 at 03:00 PM before Judge Richard J. Sullivan. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 11/28/2011) (ft) (Entered: 11/28/2011)

12/07/2011	<u>27</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: Argument held on 8/19/2011 before Judge Richard J. Sullivan. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Tara Jones, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 1/3/2012. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 1/12/2012. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 3/9/2012.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 12/07/2011)
12/07/2011	<u>28</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a Argument proceeding held on 8/19/11 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 12/07/2011)
12/09/2011	<u>29</u>	ORDER: As stated on the record at the December 9, 2011 conference, briefing on Plaintiffs' motion to dismiss Defendants' counterclaims shall adhere to the following schedule. Additionally, as stated on the record, all discovery deadlines are extended by thirty days. The post-discovery conference currently scheduled for April 20,2012, is adjourned until May 23, 2012, at 11:00 a.m. Motions due by 12/16/2011. Responses due by 1/13/2012 Replies due by 1/23/2012. Oral Argument set for 2/22/2012 at 10:30 AM before Judge Richard J. Sullivan. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 12/9/2011) (rdz) (Entered: 12/12/2011)
12/09/2011	<u>30</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Keri R. McNally dated 12/9/2011 re: The Mediation Office has asked the parties to secure the Court's written authorization to appoint the Goodman mediator to the Doherty matter and allow both cases to be mediated together. Thank you in advance for your consideration of this request. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 12/9/2011) (rdz) (Entered: 12/12/2011)
12/09/2011		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Sullivan: Status Conference held on 12/9/2011. The conference lasted approximately twenty minutes. (mro) (Entered: 12/12/2011)
12/09/2011		Transmission to Mediation Clerk. Transmitted re: <u>30</u> Endorsed Letter,, to the Mediation Clerk for case processing. (rdz) (Entered: 12/12/2011)
12/16/2011	<u>31</u>	MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>or for failure to state a claim for relief, Defendants' counterclaims</i> . Document filed by David Goodman. Responses due by 1/13/2012(La Morte, Tara) (Entered: 12/16/2011)
12/16/2011	<u>32</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>31</u> MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>or for failure to state a claim for relief, Defendants' counterclaims</i> .. Document filed by David Goodman. (La Morte, Tara) (Entered: 12/16/2011)
12/16/2011	<u>33</u>	DECLARATION of Tara M. La Morte in Support re: <u>31</u> MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>or for failure to state a claim for relief, Defendants' counterclaims</i> .. Document filed by David Goodman. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10)(La Morte, Tara) (Entered: 12/16/2011)
01/10/2012	<u>34</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Tara M. La Morte dated 1/10/12 re: Counsel for the plaintiffs requests that the Court enter a partial stay of discovery on defendants' counterclaims. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. Discovery is hereby stayed on Defendants' counterclaims pending resolution of Plaintiffs' motion to dismiss. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 1/10/2012 ***as per Chambers) (mro) (Entered: 01/11/2012)
01/13/2012	<u>35</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>31</u> MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>or for failure to state a claim for relief, Defendants' counterclaims</i> .. Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit of Keri R. McNally)(McNally, Keri) (Entered: 01/13/2012)
01/21/2012	<u>36</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J Sullivan from Tara M LaMorte dated 1/20/2012 re: Request for a 2 page extension o the 10 page limit for plaintiff's

		reply memorandum. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 1/20/2012) (cd) (Entered: 01/23/2012)
01/23/2012	<u>37</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>31</u> MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>or for failure to state a claim for relief, Defendants' counterclaims..</i> Document filed by David Goodman. (La Morte, Tara) (Entered: 01/23/2012)
01/23/2012	<u>38</u>	REPLY AFFIDAVIT of Tara M. La Morte in Support re: <u>31</u> MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>or for failure to state a claim for relief, Defendants' counterclaims..</i> Document filed by David Goodman. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 13, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 14)(La Morte, Tara) (Entered: 01/23/2012)
02/01/2012	<u>39</u>	STIPULATION AND PROTECTIVE ORDER...regarding procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of confidential material... (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 2/1/2012) (lmb) (Entered: 02/01/2012)
02/22/2012	<u>40</u>	ORDER: For the reasons set forth on the record at the February 22, 2012 conference, the Court has revised the discovery schedule in the above-captioned matters. Accordingly, the mediation previously scheduled to be held by March 3, 2012 shall take place on or before May 2, 2012. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 2/22/2012) (mro) (Entered: 02/23/2012)
02/22/2012	<u>41</u>	ORDER granting <u>31</u> Motion to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction. For the reasons set forth on the record at the February 22, 2012 conference, Plaintiffs' motion to dismiss Defendants' counterclaims is HEREBY GRANTED. The Clerk of the Court is respectfully directed to terminate the motion located at Doc. No. 27 in Case No. 11 Civ. 3432 and the motion located at Doc. No. 31 in Case No.10 Civ. 5236. Additionally, the Court is in receipt of a joint letter from the parties, dated February 17, 2012, regarding three discovery issues requiring the Court's attention. For the reasons stated on the record at the February 22, 2012 conference, Defendants' objection to Plaintiffs' Request for Production 19 is OVERRULED; Defendants' objections to Plaintiffs' discovery "Requests for Production 27 and 28 and Interrogatories 3 and 4" are SUSTAINED. Finally, the parties requested a "60 day extension of the discovery deadlines" in the above-captioned matters. The Court grants the parties' request. Accordingly, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the post-discovery conference scheduled for May 23, 2012 is adjourned and rescheduled for July 27, 2012 at 10:00 a.m. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the existing discovery schedule shall be amended as follows: (1) deadlines for fact discovery and scheduling a mediation shall change from March 3, 2012 to May 2, 2012; (2) the deadline to identify experts and make Rule 26(b)(2) disclosures shall change from March 19, 2012 to May 18, 2012; (3) the deadline to disclose and serve rebuttal expert reports shall change from April 16, 2012 to June 15, 2012; and (4) the deadlines for concluding all discovery and for submitting pre-motion letters shall change from May 7, 2012 to July 6, 2012. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 2/22/2012) (mro) (Entered: 02/23/2012)
02/22/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: (Discovery due by 7/6/2012., Fact Discovery due by 5/2/2012.), Set/Reset Hearings:(Status Conference set for 7/27/2012 at 10:00 AM before Judge Richard J. Sullivan.) (mro) (Entered: 02/23/2012)
02/22/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Sullivan: Oral Argument held on 2/22/2012 re: <u>31</u> MOTION to Dismiss for Lack of Jurisdiction <i>or for failure to state a claim for relief, Defendants' counterclaims.</i> filed by David Goodman. (jfe) (Entered: 02/24/2012)
02/27/2012	<u>42</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: Conference held on 10/28/2011 before Judge Richard J. Sullivan. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Carol Ganley, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 3/22/2012. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 4/2/2012. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 6/1/2012.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 02/27/2012)
02/27/2012	<u>43</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a Conference proceeding held on 10/28/2011 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this

		transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 02/27/2012)
04/24/2012	<u>44</u>	ORDER: The Court is in receipt of Plaintiffs' letter, dated 4/23/2012, requesting an extension of the discovery deadlines in this action in light of (1) "Plaintiffs' intention to seek leave to file a motion to amend Goodman's Complaint," (2) the amount of discovery remaining to be completed," and (3) "counsel's current trial schedule." Although Plaintiffs proposed that "the parties be permitted to continue discovery pending the Court's disposition of Plaintiffs' pre-motion letter," Plaintiffs proposed no date by which they would submit their pre-motion letter and no date by which discovery would be extended. Accordingly, Plaintiffs' request is DENIED without prejudice for renewal. Should Plaintiffs renew their request, they should indicate the date by which they intend to submit their pre-motion letter and propose an amended discovery schedule. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 4/23/2012) (tro) (Entered: 04/24/2012)
04/25/2012	<u>45</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Tara M. La Morte dated 4/25/2012 re: The parties propose the following deadlines: Deadline to submit pre-motion letter: 5/2/12. Fact discovery deadline for individual claims: 6/25/12. Deadline to identify and make expert disclosures for individual claims: 7/11/12. Deadline to serve rebuttal expert reports for individual claims: 8/8/12. Deadline for expert discovery and submitting pre-motion letters for individual claims: 8/29/12. Postponement of July 27 post-discovery conference: To be set by the Court. ENDORSEMENT: Plaintiffs' request is GRANTED. The Court adopts Plaintiffs' proposed schedule. Additionally, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the post-discovery conference scheduled for July 27, 2012 is adjourned until Wednesday, September 19, 2012 at 10:00 a.m. (Expert Discovery due by 8/29/2012., Fact Discovery due by 6/25/2012., Status Conference set for 9/19/2012 at 10:00 AM before Judge Richard J. Sullivan.) (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 4/25/2012) (jfe) (Entered: 04/26/2012)
05/04/2012	<u>46</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J Sullivan from Keri Reid McNally dated 5/4/2012 re: We respectfully request that the Court issue an order confirming that the deadline for scheduling mediation-like the fact discovery deadline-has been adjourned to June 25, 2012. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 5/4/2012) (cd) (Entered: 05/04/2012)
05/08/2012	<u>47</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 12/9/2011 before Judge Richard J. Sullivan. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Ann Hairston, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 6/1/2012. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 6/11/2012. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 8/9/2012.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 05/08/2012)
05/08/2012	<u>48</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 12/9/11 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 05/08/2012)
05/14/2012	<u>49</u>	ORDER: The Court is in receipt of Plaintiffs' letter, dated May 2, 2012, requesting leave "to amend the Complaint to add class allegations," and Defendants' letter, dated May 14, 2012, opposing Plaintiffs' request. Accordingly, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the parties appear for a pre-motion conference on June 1, 2012 at 9:30a.m. in Courtroom 21C. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 5/14/2012) (js) (Entered: 05/15/2012)
05/31/2012	<u>50</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Arastu Kabeer Chaudhury on behalf of David Goodman (Chaudhury, Arastu) (Entered: 05/31/2012)
06/01/2012	<u>51</u>	ORDER: Accordingly, after considering the parties' respective arguments, and for the reasons stated on the record at the June 1, 2012 conference, the Court grants Plaintiffs' request as to all three topics listed above. Also as stated on the record at the June 1,

		2012 conference, counsel for Defendants shall submit a letter to the Court no later than Tuesday, June 5, 2012, indicating whether it thinks briefing is necessary on Plaintiffs' contemplated motion to amend the Complaint to add class allegations. However, after considering the comprehensive arguments the parties set forth in their pre-motion letters and made at the June 1, 2012 conference, and as stated on the record at that conference, the Court is likely to grant Plaintiffs' contemplated motion. Additionally, for the reasons stated on the record at the June 1, 2012 conference, the Court denies Defendants' request that the Court certify any of the issues contained in its September 26, 2011 Order for immediate interlocutory appeal under 28 U.S.C. § 1292(b). (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 6/1/2012) (lmb) (Entered: 06/01/2012)
06/01/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Sullivan: Pre-Motion Conference held on 6/1/2012. (jfe) (Entered: 06/05/2012)
06/06/2012	<u>52</u>	ORDER: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED the parties shall adhere to the following briefing and oral argument schedule: June 15, 2012 – Plaintiffs shall submit their motion for leave to amend the Complaints and their accompanying brief, and Defendants shall submit their cross-motion regarding their request for interlocutory appeal and their accompanying brief; June 29, 2012 – The parties shall submit their respective opposition briefs; July 6, 2012 – Plaintiffs shall submit their respective reply briefs; and July 25, 2012 – The parties shall appear for oral argument regarding their respective motions at 10:00 a.m. in Courtroom 21C. Additionally, in their June 5 Letter, Defendants request "that the Court reconsider its ruling at the June 1, 2012 conference that the discovery [P]laintiffs requested concerning overtime predictions, forecasts, budgets, and expenditures, NYPD-wide and within [P]laintiffs' commands is relevant and [D]efendants must respond to the requests." For the reasons stated on the record at the June 1, 2012 conference, and in light of the fact that Defendants have failed to cite to any "controlling decisions or factual matters that were put before" the Court at the conference but that were overlooked, the Court DENIES Defendants' request for reconsideration. (Cross Motions due by 6/15/2012., Motions due by 6/15/2012., Responses due by 6/29/2012, Replies due by 7/6/2012., Oral Argument set for 7/25/2012 at 10:00 AM in Courtroom 21C, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Richard J. Sullivan.) (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 6/6/2012) (jfe) (Entered: 06/06/2012)
06/13/2012	<u>53</u>	NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Arastu Kabeer Chaudhury on behalf of David Goodman. New Address: U.S. Attorney's Office, SDNY, 86 Chambers Street, Third Floor, New York, New York, USA 10007, 212-637-2633. (Chaudhury, Arastu) (Entered: 06/13/2012)
06/14/2012	<u>54</u>	ORDER: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the parties shall adhere to the following revised deadlines and dates: Oral argument on the parties' pending motions by 7/31/12 at 2:30 p.m. Fact discovery deadline for individual claims by 7/31/12. Deadline to schedule mediation with the S.D.N.Y. Mediation Office by 7/31/12. Deadline to identify and make expert disclosures for individual claims by 8/17/12. Deadline to serve rebuttal expert reports for individual claims by 9/14/12. Deadline for expert discovery by 10/5/12. Deadline for submitting pre-motion letters for individual claims by 10/5/12. Post-discovery conference by 10/26/12 at 10:00 a.m. (Expert Discovery due by 10/5/2012., Fact Discovery due by 7/31/2012., Oral Argument set for 7/31/2012 at 02:30 PM before Judge Richard J. Sullivan., Status Conference set for 10/26/2012 at 10:00 AM before Judge Richard J. Sullivan.) (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 6/13/2012) (jfe) (Entered: 06/14/2012)
06/14/2012		Set/Reset Mediation Case Tracking Deadlines: Mediator Schedule due by 7/31/2012. (jge) (Entered: 06/25/2012)
06/15/2012	<u>55</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appeal <i>September 26, 2011 Interlocutory Order</i> Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. Return Date set for 7/31/2012 at 02:30 PM.(McNally, Keri) (Entered: 06/15/2012)
06/15/2012	<u>56</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>55</u> MOTION for Leave to Appeal <i>September 26, 2011 Interlocutory Order</i> . Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (McNally, Keri) (Entered: 06/15/2012)

06/15/2012	<u>57</u>	MOTION to Amend/Correct <u>1</u> Complaint <i>pursuant to Rule 15(a) to add Class Action</i> . Document filed by David Goodman. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1: First Amended Complaint)(Chaudhury, Arastu) (Entered: 06/15/2012)
06/15/2012	<u>58</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>57</u> MOTION to Amend/Correct <u>1</u> Complaint <i>pursuant to Rule 15(a) to add Class Action</i> .. Document filed by David Goodman. (Chaudhury, Arastu) (Entered: 06/15/2012)
06/15/2012	<u>59</u>	DECLARATION of Arastu K. Chaudhury in Support re: <u>57</u> MOTION to Amend/Correct <u>1</u> Complaint <i>pursuant to Rule 15(a) to add Class Action</i> .. Document filed by David Goodman. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A: Original Complaint, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B: Court's September 26, 2011 Memorandum and Order, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C: Parties' Joint Letter to the Court, Dated February 17, 2012)(Chaudhury, Arastu) (Entered: 06/15/2012)
06/29/2012	<u>60</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>55</u> MOTION for Leave to Appeal <i>September 26, 2011 Interlocutory Order</i> . Document filed by David Goodman. (La Morte, Tara) (Entered: 06/29/2012)
06/29/2012	<u>61</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>57</u> MOTION to Amend/Correct <u>1</u> Complaint <i>pursuant to Rule 15(a) to add Class Action</i> .. Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (McNally, Keri) (Entered: 06/29/2012)
06/29/2012	<u>62</u>	DECLARATION of Keri R. McNally in Opposition re: <u>57</u> MOTION to Amend/Correct <u>1</u> Complaint <i>pursuant to Rule 15(a) to add Class Action</i> .. Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D)(McNally, Keri) (Entered: 06/29/2012)
07/06/2012	<u>63</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>57</u> MOTION to Amend/Correct <u>1</u> Complaint <i>pursuant to Rule 15(a) to add Class Action</i> .. Document filed by David Goodman. (Chaudhury, Arastu) (Entered: 07/06/2012)
07/06/2012	<u>64</u>	DECLARATION of Arastu K. Chaudhury, supplementing his June 15, 2012 Declaration in Support re: <u>57</u> MOTION to Amend/Correct <u>1</u> Complaint <i>pursuant to Rule 15(a) to add Class Action</i> .. Document filed by David Goodman. (Chaudhury, Arastu) (Entered: 07/06/2012)
07/06/2012	<u>65</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>55</u> MOTION for Leave to Appeal <i>September 26, 2011 Interlocutory Order</i> . Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (McNally, Keri) (Entered: 07/06/2012)
07/13/2012	<u>66</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Tara M. La Morte dated 7/13/2012 re: We write to advise the Court of a minor correction to Goodman's proposed amended complaint, and ask for the Court's assistance with respect to scheduling a mediation date for these cases. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 7/13/2012) (ama) (Entered: 07/13/2012)
07/24/2012	<u>67</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J Sullivan from Keri Reid McNally dated 7/23/2012 re: Request to extend time for discovery and for the post discovery conference. ENDORSEMENT: Defendants' request is GRANTED. IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the post discovery conference scheduled for October 26, 2012 is adjourned until Friday, December 7, 2012, at 10:30 a.m. (Expert Discovery due by 11/5/2012. Fact Discovery due by 8/31/2012. Status Conference set for 12/7/2012 at 10:30 AM before Judge Richard J. Sullivan.) (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 7/24/2012) (cd) (Entered: 07/24/2012)
07/24/2012	<u>68</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERNCE held on 6/1/2012 before Judge Richard J. Sullivan. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Thomas Murray, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 8/17/2012. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 8/27/2012. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 10/25/2012.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 07/24/2012)

07/24/2012	<u>69</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 6/1/12 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 07/24/2012)
07/24/2012	<u>70</u>	ORDER: 7/31/2012 Oral Argument reset for 7/30/2012 at 02:30 PM before Judge Richard J. Sullivan. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 7/24/2012) (cd) (Entered: 07/24/2012)
07/30/2012	<u>71</u>	ORDER: For the reasons stated on the record at the July 30, 2012 conference (the "conference"), the Court: (1) GRANTS Plaintiff Goodman's motion for leave to amend the Complaint to add class allegations; and (2) DENIES, without prejudice to renewal, Plaintiffs' motion for interlocutory appeal of this Court's Memorandum and Order, dated September 26, 2011. The Clerk of the Court is respectfully directed to terminate the motions located at Doc. Nos. 55 and 57 in Goodman v. City of New York, No. 10 Civ. 5236 (RJS), and the motion located at Doc. No. 49 in Doherty v. City of New York, No. 11 Civ. 3432 (RJS). Also as stated on the record at the conference, Plaintiff Goodman shall file his amended complaint no later than August 3, 2012. Lastly, and also as stated on the record at the conference, the parties shall submit, no later than August 13, 2012, a joint letter with a proposed revised discovery plan in light of the Court's ruling on Plaintiff Goodman's motion to amend the complaint.. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 7/30/2012) (js) (Entered: 07/31/2012)
07/30/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: Amended Pleadings due by 8/3/2012. (js) (Entered: 07/31/2012)
07/30/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Sullivan: Oral Argument held on 7/30/2012 re: <u>55</u> MOTION for Leave to Appeal <i>September 26, 2011 Interlocutory Order</i> filed by New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund, City of New York, <u>57</u> MOTION to Amend/Correct <u>1</u> Complaint pursuant to Rule 15(a) to add Class Action. filed by David Goodman. (djc) (Entered: 08/07/2012)
08/02/2012	<u>72</u>	FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT – CLASS ACTION amending <u>1</u> Complaint against City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. Document filed by David Goodman, Michael Doherty, Robert D. Black. Related document: <u>1</u> Complaint filed by David Goodman. (djc) (Entered: 08/07/2012)
08/13/2012	<u>73</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J Sullivan from Arastu K. Chaudhury and Keri Reid McNally dated 8/13/2012 re: counsel writes on behalf of all parties that pursuant to the Court's July 30, 2012 Order, the parties in the above-referenced action, after meeting and conferring on the matter, jointly submit the following proposed schedule for fact and expert discovery, class certification briefing, and dispositive motions as follows: By February 1, 2013, the parties shall complete all fact and expert discovery, except for discovery concerning records of the overtime and night shift differential compensation earned by the putative damages sub-class members, which primarily relates to post-certification damage determinations and, therefore, is not necessary to complete prior to the class certification stage. By February 1, 2013, the Plaintiffs shall file their motions for class certification and partial summary judgment. By March 8, 2013, the Defendants shall file their oppositions to Plaintiffs' motions for class certification and partial summary judgment as well as file Defendants' cross-motion for summary judgment. By April 5, 2013, Plaintiffs shall file their replies in support of class certification and partial summary judgment as well as their opposition to Defendants' cross-motion for summary judgment. By June 28, 2013, the parties shall complete any outstanding discovery concerning records of the overtime and night shift differential compensation earned by the damages sub-class members. Additional relief as set forth in this Order. ENDORSEMENT: The Court adopts the schedule set forth above. In addition, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the parties shall appear for oral argument on their contemplated motions on May 29, 2013 at 10:00 a.m. (Motions due by 2/1/2013., Responses due by 3/8/2013, Replies due by 4/26/2013.), (Oral Argument set for 5/29/2013 at 10:00 AM before Judge Richard J. Sullivan.) (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 8/13/2012) (pl) Modified on 8/13/2012 (pl). (Entered: 08/13/2012)

08/13/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: Discovery due by 6/28/2013. Expert Discovery due by 2/1/2013. Fact Discovery due by 2/1/2013. (pl) (Entered: 08/13/2012)
08/22/2012	<u>74</u>	ENDORSED LETTER: addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Keri Reid McNally dated 8/22/2012 re: Defendants request a short extension of time, to next Monday, August 27, 2012, to file their Answer. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. City of New York answer due 8/27/2012; New York City Police Department answer due 8/27/2012; New York City Police Pension Fund answer due 8/27/2012. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 8/22/2012) (js) (Entered: 08/22/2012)
08/27/2012	<u>75</u>	ANSWER to <u>72</u> Amended Complaint,. Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund.(McNally, Keri) (Entered: 08/27/2012)
10/19/2012	<u>76</u>	ENDORSED LETTER: addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Tara M. Lamorte dated 10/18/2012 re: Counsel requests that the Court permit the parties to schedule the mediation in January 2013. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 10/18/2012) (js) (Entered: 10/19/2012)
10/19/2012	<u>77</u>	CONFIDENTIALITY STIPULATION AND PROTECTIVE ORDER...regarding procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of confidential material... Notwithstanding any other provision, no document be filed with the Clerk under seal without a further Order of this Court addressing the specific documents to be sealed. Any application to seal shall be accompanied by an affidavit or affidavits and a memorandum of law, demonstrating that the standards for sealing have been met and specifically addressing Lugosch v. Pyramid Co. of Onondaga, 435 F.3d 110, 119 20 (2d Cir. 2006) and any other controlling authority. Nothing herein is intended to alter or modify the applicability of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 5.2 to this case. The redactions expressly authorized by Rule 5.2 may be made without further application to the Court. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 10/19/2012) (ft) (Entered: 10/19/2012)
10/24/2012	<u>78</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: MOTION held on 7/30/2012 before Judge Richard J. Sullivan. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Steven Griffing, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 11/19/2012. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 11/29/2012. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 1/25/2013.(Moya, Goretti) (Entered: 10/24/2012)
10/24/2012	<u>79</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a MOTION proceeding held on 7/30/2012 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(Moya, Goretti) (Entered: 10/24/2012)
11/30/2012	<u>80</u>	ORDER: In light of the revised discovery schedule set forth in the Court's August 13, 2012 Order in Goodman v. City of New York, 10 Civ. 5236 (RJS), IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the post-discovery conference scheduled for December 7, 2012 in both of the above-captioned cases is adjourned sine die. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 11/30/2012) (lmb) (Entered: 11/30/2012)
12/18/2012		MEDIATOR SESSION SCHEDULED First Mediation Session scheduled for 1/28/13 at 10:00 a.m. at 40 Foley Square.(jno) (Entered: 12/18/2012)
01/11/2013	<u>81</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Keri Reid McNally dated 1/10/2013 re: Defendants write to request a two-week extension of time for defendants to serve a rebuttal expert report. Plaintiffs served their expert disclosures and report on December 14, 2012, and defendants' rebuttal report, if any is due by January 11, 2013 under the scheduling order that is currently in place. Plaintiffs consent to the two-week extension that defendants seek, which would bring the deadline to January 25, 2013. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 1/10/2013) (ago) (Entered: 01/11/2013)

01/28/2013	<u>82</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Keri Reid McNally dated 1/25/13 re: Counsel for the defendants writes to request an additional three-day extension of time for defendants to serve rebuttal expert report. ENDORSEMENT: So ordered. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 1/28/2013) (mro) (Entered: 01/28/2013)
01/28/2013		Mediator Session Held on 01/28/2013 at 40 Foley Square.(ms) (Entered: 01/28/2013)
01/29/2013	<u>83</u>	REVISED SCHEDULING ORDER: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the briefing schedule set on August 13, 2012, shall be MODIFIED AND AMENDED as follows: 1. By March 4, 2013, the Plaintiffs shall file their motions for class certification and partial summary judgment. 2. By April 8, 2013, the Defendants shall file their oppositions to Plaintiffs' motions for class certification and partial summary judgment as well as file Defendants' cross-motion for summary judgment. 3. By May 6, 2013, Plaintiffs shall file their replies in support of class certification and partial summary judgment as well as their opposition to Defendants' cross-motion for summary judgment. 4. By May 27, 2013, Defendants shall file their reply in support of their cross-motion for summary judgment. 5. The parties shall appear for oral argument on their contemplated motions on Friday, June 28, 2013 at 2:30 p.m. (Motions due by 3/4/2013. Cross Motions due by 4/8/2013. Responses due by 5/6/2013. Replies due by 5/27/2013. Oral Argument set for 6/28/2013 at 02:30 PM before Judge Richard J. Sullivan.) (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 1/28/2013) (rjm) (Entered: 01/29/2013)
02/27/2013	<u>84</u>	REVISED SCHEDULING ORDER: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the briefing schedule set on January 29, 2013, shall be MODIFIED AND AMENDED as follows: By April 3, 2013, the Plaintiffs shall file their motions for class certification and partial summary judgment. By May 8, 2013, the Defendants shall file their oppositions to Plaintiffs' motions for class certification and partial summary judgment as well as file Defendants' cross-motion for summary judgment. By June 5, 2013, Plaintiffs shall file their replies in support of class certification and partial summary judgment as well as their opposition to Defendants' cross-motion for summary judgment. By June 26, 2013, Defendants shall file their reply in support of their cross-motion for summary judgment. The parties shall appear for oral argument on their contemplated motions on July 17, 2013. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 2/27/2013) (mro) Modified on 2/28/2013 (mro). (Entered: 02/27/2013)
03/11/2013	<u>85</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER: WHEREAS, the claims asserted in the Complaint were incorporated in the First Amended Complaint filed in Goodman, et al. v. City of New York, et al., 10 Civ. 5236 (RJS) (the "USERRA Putative Class Action") on August 2, 2012, effectively consolidating this action with the USERRA Putative Class Action; WHEREAS, there is now no need to maintain a separate action with respect to the claims alleged in Plaintiff Michael Doherty's Complaint in this action; The parties hereby stipulate and agree to the following: Any discovery exchanged by the parties in the above-captioned action shall be deemed exchanged in the USERRA Putative Class Action. Any submission made by the parties is deemed a submission in the USERRA Putative Class Action. Any determination of the Court in the above-captioned action not inconsistent with those made in the USERRA Putative Class Action shall be deemed a determination in the USERRA Putative Class Action. The above-referenced civil action is voluntarily dismissed pursuant to Rule 41 (a)(1)(A)(ii) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 3/8/2013) (mro) Modified on 3/13/2013 (mro). (Entered: 03/12/2013)
04/03/2013	<u>86</u>	REVISED SCHEDULING ORDER: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the briefing schedule set on February 27, 2013, shall be MODIFIED AND AMENDED as follows: 1. By May 3, 2013, the Plaintiffs shall file their motions for class certification and partial summary judgment. 2. By June 7, 2013, the Defendants shall file their oppositions to Plaintiffs' motions for class certification and partial summary judgment as well as file Defendants' cross-motion for summary judgment. 3. By July 3, 2013, Plaintiffs shall file their replies in support of class certification and partial summary judgment as well as their opposition to defendants' cross-motion for summary judgment. 4. By July 24, 2013, Defendants shall file their reply in support of their cross-motion for summary judgment. 5. The parties shall appear for oral argument on their contemplated motions on September 11, 2013 at 4:00 p.m. in Courtroom 905 at 40 Foley Square. 6. This will be the final extension of the motion briefing schedule. Motions due by 5/3/2013. Cross Motions due by 6/7/2013. Responses due by 7/3/2013

		Replies due by 7/24/2013. Oral Argument set for 9/11/2013 at 04:00 PM in Courtroom 905, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Richard J. Sullivan. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 4/2/2013) (ago) (Entered: 04/03/2013)
04/22/2013	<u>87</u>	REVISED SCHEDULING ORDER: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the briefing schedule set forth in the Court's Revised Scheduling Order, dated April 2, 2013, shall be extended as follows: 1. By June 3, 2013, Plaintiffs shall file their motions for class certification and partial summary judgment. 2. By July 8, 2013, Defendants shall file their opposition to Plaintiffs' motions for class certification and partial summary judgment as well as their own cross-motion for summary judgment. 3. By August 5, 2013, Plaintiffs shall file their replies in support of class certification and partial summary judgment as well as their opposition to Defendants' cross-motion for summary judgment. 4. By August 26, 2013, Defendants shall file their reply in support of their cross-motion for summary judgment. 5. As previously ordered, the parties shall appear for oral argument on these motions on September 11, 2013 at 4:00 p.m. in Courtroom 905 at 40 Foley Square. SO ORDERED. Motions due by 6/3/2013. Cross Motions due by 7/8/2013. Responses due by 7/8/2013 Replies due by 8/26/2013. Oral Argument set for 9/11/2013 at 04:00 PM in Courtroom 905, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Richard J. Sullivan. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 4/22/2013) (ama) (Entered: 04/23/2013)
05/30/2013	<u>89</u>	REVISED SCHEDULING ORDER: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the briefing schedule set forth in the Court's Revised Scheduling Order, dated April 22, 2013, shall be extended as follows. The parties shall appear for oral argument on these motions in Courtroom 905 at 40 Foley Square on a date to be determined by the Court in the event that motions for class certification and summary judgment are filed on or before June 17, 2013. SO ORDERED. Motions due by 6/17/2013. Cross Motions due by 7/22/2013. Responses due by 8/19/2013 Replies due by 9/9/2013. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 5/30/2013) (ama) (Entered: 05/31/2013)
06/17/2013	<u>90</u>	MOTION to Certify Class <i>conditionally for settlement purposes, for preliminary approval of the settlement agreement, and for approval of the forms of class notice,</i> . Document filed by Robert D. Black, Michael Doherty, David Goodman.(Chaudhury, Arastu) (Entered: 06/17/2013)
06/17/2013	<u>91</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>90</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>conditionally for settlement purposes, for preliminary approval of the settlement agreement, and for approval of the forms of class notice,</i> .. Document filed by Robert D. Black, Michael Doherty, David Goodman. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A – Settlement Agreement, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B – Proposed Preliminary Order)(Chaudhury, Arastu) (Entered: 06/17/2013)
06/17/2013	<u>92</u>	DECLARATION of Tara M. La Morte in Support re: <u>90</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>conditionally for settlement purposes, for preliminary approval of the settlement agreement, and for approval of the forms of class notice,</i> .. Document filed by Robert D. Black, Michael Doherty, David Goodman. (Chaudhury, Arastu) (Entered: 06/17/2013)
06/20/2013	<u>93</u>	ORDER: On June 17, 2013, Plaintiffs filed their unopposed motion for conditional certification of a settlement class, preliminary approval of the proposed settlement agreement, and approval of the forms of class notice (the "Motion"), as well as a supporting memorandum of law and declaration. (Doc. Nos. 90–92.) Fairness Hearing set for 6/28/2013 at 02:30 PM before Judge Richard J. Sullivan, and as further set forth in this document. The Court is also attaching copies of the proposed notice forms that include certain proposed edits and questions entered by the Court in track-changes. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT the parties consider these edits and questions and submit an updated version of the notice forms on or before June 25, 2013 by filing them on ECF and emailing a copy to the Court. The parties shall also be prepared to discuss the notice forms at the June 28 hearing. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 6/20/2013) (cd) (Entered: 06/21/2013)
06/25/2013	<u>94</u>	FILING ERROR – ELECTRONIC FILING OF NON-ECF DOCUMENT – STATUS REPORT. <i>Updated Forms of Class Notice Filed Pursuant to Court's June 20, 2013 Order.</i> Document filed by Robert D. Black, Michael Doherty, David Goodman.(Chaudhury, Arastu) Modified on 6/26/2013 (ka). (Entered: 06/25/2013)

06/25/2013	<u>96</u>	ORDER: The Court is in receipt of the attached letter from Plaintiffs, dated June 25, 2013, concerning certain revisions that have been made to the proposed settlement agreement and class notice forms and responding to some of the Court's questions concerning the fairness of that proposed settlement agreement. The letter indicates that some of the changes made by the parties will require adjustments to the order approving the proposed settlement agreement. Accordingly, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT the parties shall file an updated version of the proposed order for conditional certification, preliminary approval of the settlement agreement, approval of the forms of class notice and scheduling of a fairness hearing (currently, Doc. No. 91-2) by filing it on ECF on or before June 26, 2013 and emailing a Microsoft Word version of the proposed order to chambers. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 6/25/2013) (mro) (Entered: 06/26/2013)
06/26/2013		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT - NON-ECF DOCUMENT ERROR. Note to Attorney Arastu Kabeer Chaudhury to E-MAIL to judgments@nysd.uscourts.gov., Document No. 94 Notice of Proposed Class Action Settlement. This document is not filed via ECF. (ka) (Entered: 06/26/2013)
06/26/2013	<u>95</u>	NOTICE of Revised Proposed Preliminary Order in Response to Court's Order dated June 25, 2013 re: <u>90</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>conditionally for settlement purposes, for preliminary approval of the settlement agreement, and for approval of the forms of class notice...</i> Document filed by Robert D. Black, Michael Doherty, David Goodman. (La Morte, Tara) (Entered: 06/26/2013)
06/28/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Sullivan: Fairness Hearing held on 6/28/2013. The Court held a fairness hearing concerning the parties' motion for preliminary class certification and preliminary approval of the settlement agreement on June 28, 2013 in Courtroom 905 at 40 Foley Square. Counsel for Plaintiffs present. Counsel for Defendants present. Court reporter present. The Court inquired as to various aspects of the proposed agreement, and found the parties' proposed preliminary class certification and settlement agreement to be fair and reasonable. The parties were instructed to provide updated versions of all relevant documents to the Court. (lmb) (Entered: 07/03/2013)
07/02/2013	<u>97</u>	ORDER CONDITIONALLY CERTIFYING THE SETTLEMENT CLASS AND SETTLEMENT SUB-CLASSES, PRELIMINARILY APPROVING THE SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT, APPROVING FORMS OF CLASS NOTICE AND SCHEDULING A FAIRNESS HEARING: granting <u>90</u> Motion to Certify Class. On this 2nd day of July, 2013, the Court considered Plaintiffs' Unopposed Motion for Conditional Certification of the Settlement Class and Sub-Classes, Preliminary Approval of the Settlement Agreement, and Approval of the Forms of Class Notice (the "Motion"). All capitalized terms used in this Preliminary Order shall have the meaning as defined in the Settlement Agreement (the "Agreement"), which is incorporated herein by reference. After consideration of the Motion, the Agreement, and the exhibits attached thereto, as well as discussions with counsel held at a conference on June 28, 2013, this Court hereby concludes that the Motion should be GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 7/02/2013) (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B) (ama) (Entered: 07/02/2013)
07/02/2013		Set/Reset Deadlines:, Set/Reset Hearings:(Fairness Hearing set for 1/13/2014 at 04:30 PM in Courtroom 905, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Richard J. Sullivan.) (ama) (Entered: 07/02/2013)
07/26/2013	<u>98</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 6/28/2013 before Judge Richard J. Sullivan. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Vincent Bologna, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 8/19/2013. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 8/29/2013. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 10/28/2013.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 07/26/2013)
07/26/2013	<u>99</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 6/28/2013 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar

		days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 07/26/2013)
10/08/2013	<u>100</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Benjamin Eldridge Stockman on behalf of City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Stockman, Benjamin) (Entered: 10/08/2013)
11/19/2013	<u>101</u>	NOTICE of of Filing of Opt-Out Forms. Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Lashley, Victor, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Vasquez, Daniel, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Pasquarella, Paul, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Wilhelm, Joseph, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Casano, David, # <u>6</u> Exhibit Xuereb, Steven, # <u>7</u> Exhibit Prioriello, Mario, # <u>8</u> Exhibit Drogan, Thomas, # <u>9</u> Exhibit Dolan, Michael, # <u>10</u> Exhibit Felipe, Jeffrey, # <u>11</u> Exhibit Esposito, Pasquale, # <u>12</u> Exhibit Lamarca, Dan, # <u>13</u> Exhibit Lonecke, Richard)(Stockman, Benjamin) (Entered: 11/19/2013)
11/22/2013	<u>102</u>	NOTICE of of Filing of Opt-Out Forms. Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit McNamee, Lawrence, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Aguayo, Floriano)(Stockman, Benjamin) (Entered: 11/22/2013)
12/04/2013	<u>103</u>	NOTICE of Filing of Opt-Out Forms. Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Maldonado, Daliris, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Suhrhoff, Robert)(Stockman, Benjamin) (Entered: 12/04/2013)
12/16/2013	<u>104</u>	NOTICE of Filing of Objections. Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Blaize, Desmond, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Brown, Lynn, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Harms, Cathleen, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Hernandez, Harold, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Kwalwasser, Robert, # <u>6</u> Exhibit Lugo, Thomas, # <u>7</u> Exhibit Rickard, Kathleen, # <u>8</u> Exhibit Twitty, Theophlise)(Stockman, Benjamin) (Entered: 12/16/2013)
12/30/2013	<u>105</u>	MOTION to Approve Settlement Agreement -- Final Approval. Document filed by Robert D. Black, Michael Doherty, David Goodman. Return Date set for 1/13/2014 at 04:30 PM.(Chaudhury, Arastu) (Entered: 12/30/2013)
12/30/2013	<u>106</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>105</u> MOTION to Approve Settlement Agreement -- Final Approval.. Document filed by Robert D. Black, Michael Doherty, David Goodman. (Chaudhury, Arastu) (Entered: 12/30/2013)
12/30/2013	<u>107</u>	DECLARATION of Tara M. La Morte in Support re: <u>105</u> MOTION to Approve Settlement Agreement -- Final Approval.. Document filed by Robert D. Black, Michael Doherty, David Goodman. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7)(Chaudhury, Arastu) (Entered: 12/30/2013)
12/30/2013	<u>108</u>	DECLARATION of Juliette E.A. Deen in Support re: <u>105</u> MOTION to Approve Settlement Agreement -- Final Approval.. Document filed by Robert D. Black, Michael Doherty, David Goodman. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G, # <u>8</u> Exhibit H)(Chaudhury, Arastu) (Entered: 12/30/2013)
12/30/2013	<u>109</u>	DECLARATION of Chief Actuary of the New York City Retirement Systems, Robert C. North, Jr. in Support re: <u>105</u> MOTION to Approve Settlement Agreement -- Final Approval.. Document filed by Robert D. Black, Michael Doherty, David Goodman. (Chaudhury, Arastu) (Entered: 12/30/2013)
01/13/2014		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Sullivan: Fairness Hearing held on 1/13/2014 concerning the parties' motion for approval of the final class settlement on 1/13/14 in Courtroom 905 at 40 Foley Square. Counsel for the plaintiffs was present with class representatives. Counsel for the defendants was present. The court reporter was present. The Court inquired as to various aspects of the proposed final class settlement agreement and reviewed objections to the settlement. Class member, Robert Kwalwasser, addressed the Court with his objection to the settlement agreement. (sc) Modified on 2/14/2014 (Landers, Rigoberto). (Entered: 01/14/2014)
01/14/2014	<u>110</u>	FINAL ORDER APPROVING CLASS SETTLEMENT granting <u>105</u> Motion to Approve Settlement. For the reasons stated on the record at the Fairness Hearing and the reasons stated below, Plaintiffs' Motion is GRANTED. The "Effective Date" of the

		Agreement shall occur upon expiration of sixty days following the entry of this Final Order, or, if any appeal is filed, when the mandate has issued following resolution of the appeal. Defendants shall comply with the terms of the Agreement no later than one (1) year after the Effective Date. This deadline may be extended only by a written agreement between the Settlement Class Counsel and Defendants' counsel and approval of the Court. All Settlement Class Members who did not opt out are hereby permanently enjoined from pursuing and/or seeking to reopen claims released by the Agreement. This Court retains jurisdiction of all matters relating to the modification, interpretation, implementation, effectuation, enforcement, and administration of the Agreement and this Final Order, which jurisdiction may be called upon by filing a motion to enforce based upon an alleged failure to comply with the terms of the Agreement. In addition, the Parties may make a motion to conduct discovery under the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure for the purpose of determining compliance with this Agreement or defending against a claim of non-compliance. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 1/14/2014) (mro) (Main Document 110 replaced on 1/15/2014) (ama). (Entered: 01/15/2014)
01/21/2014	<u>111</u>	ORDER: The Clerk of the Court is respectfully requested to close this case. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 1/17/2014) (ama) (Entered: 01/21/2014)
01/21/2014		Terminate Transcript Deadlines (ama) (Entered: 01/21/2014)
02/13/2014	<u>112</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: HEARING held on 1/13/2014 before Judge Richard J. Sullivan. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Martha Drevis, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 3/10/2014. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 3/20/2014. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 5/19/2014.(Rodriguez, Somari) (Entered: 02/13/2014)
02/13/2014	<u>113</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a HEARING proceeding held on 1/13/14 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(Rodriguez, Somari) (Entered: 02/13/2014)
06/30/2014	<u>114</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Periodic Report served on Tara LaMorte and Arastu Chaudhury on 6/30/14. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Stockman, Benjamin) (Entered: 06/30/2014)
12/17/2014	<u>115</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Keith Michael Snow on behalf of City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Snow, Keith) (Entered: 12/17/2014)
12/31/2014	<u>116</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Quarterly Report served on US on December 31, 2014. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Snow, Keith) (Entered: 12/31/2014)
01/30/2015	<u>117</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Alexis Downs on behalf of City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Downs, Alexis) (Entered: 01/30/2015)
02/04/2015	<u>118</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Laura C. Rowntree on behalf of City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Rowntree, Laura) (Entered: 02/04/2015)
03/17/2015	<u>119</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Laura C. Rowntree dated March 17, 2015. Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund.(Rowntree, Laura) (Entered: 03/17/2015)

03/17/2015	<u>120</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by and between the attorneys for plaintiffs and defendants, that the deadline for defendants to comply with the terms of the Settlement Agreement shall be extended from March 17, 2015 to May 1, 2015, in accordance with the Final Order Approving Class Settlement dated January 14, 2014 (Docket No. 110). (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 3/17/2015) (mro) (Entered: 03/18/2015)
04/23/2015	<u>121</u>	ORDER: The Court is in receipt of the attached letter from Ivan Fragoso, dated September 29, 2014 and received in chambers on September 30, 2014 via mail. The Court sent the item for docketing, but has recently learned that it was never made available to the parties. Accordingly, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT the parties shall respond to the statements made in the letter by April 30, 2015. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 4/23/2015) (mro) Modified on 4/24/2015 (mro). (mro). (Entered: 04/24/2015)
04/24/2015	<u>122</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Laura C. Rowntree dated April 24, 2015 re: Order dated April 24, 2015 and its attachment. Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Attachment reflecting redactions)(Rowntree, Laura) (Entered: 04/24/2015)
04/29/2015	<u>123</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>and Approval of Proposed Letters to Potential and Existing Class Members</i> addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Laura C. Rowntree dated April 29, 2015. Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund.(Rowntree, Laura) (Entered: 04/29/2015)
04/30/2015	<u>124</u>	AMENDED LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>and Approval of Proposed Letters to Potential and Existing Class Members</i> addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Laura C. Rowntree dated April 29, 2015. Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund.(Snow, Keith) (Entered: 04/30/2015)
04/30/2015	<u>125</u>	ORDER granting <u>123</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT the letters proposed in Exhibits A and B may issue to the individuals identified in this submission. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED THAT the time to comply with the settlement agreement in this action is extended to September 1, 2015. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 4/30/2015) (mro) (Entered: 05/01/2015)
04/30/2015	<u>126</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by and between the attorneys for plaintiffs and defendants, that the deadline for defendants to comply with the terms of the Settlement Agreement shall be extended from May 1, 2015 to [September 1, 2015], in accordance with the Final Order Approving Class Settlement dated January 14, 2014 (Dkt. No. 110). (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 4/30/2015) (mro) (Entered: 05/01/2015)
08/31/2015	<u>127</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Laura C. Rowntree dated August 31, 2015. Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Rowntree, Laura) (Entered: 08/31/2015)
09/01/2015	<u>128</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by and between the attorneys for plaintiffs and defendants, that the deadline for defendants to comply with the terms of the Settlement Agreement shall be extended from September 1, 2015 to March 1, 2016, in accordance with the Final Order Approving Class Settlement dated January 14, 2014 (Dkt. No. 110). (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 9/1/2015) (mro) (Entered: 09/01/2015)
01/15/2016	<u>129</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Kathleen Marie Comfrey on behalf of City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Comfrey, Kathleen) (Entered: 01/15/2016)
02/26/2016	<u>130</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to Extend March 1, 2016 deadline for compliance with terms of Settlement Agreement</i> addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Kathleen M. Comfrey dated 2-26-2016. Document filed by New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund.(Comfrey, Kathleen) (Entered: 02/26/2016)

02/29/2016	<u>131</u>	LETTER RESPONSE in Opposition to Motion addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Arastu K. Chaudhury dated February 29, 2016 re: <u>130</u> LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to Extend March 1, 2016 deadline for compliance with terms of Settlement Agreement</i> addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Kathleen M. Comfrey dated 2-26-2016. . Document filed by Robert D. Black, Michael Doherty, David Goodman. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Chaudhury, Arastu) (Entered: 02/29/2016)
03/01/2016	<u>132</u>	LETTER REPLY to Response to Motion addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Kathleen M. Comfrey dated 3-01-2016 re: <u>130</u> LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to Extend March 1, 2016 deadline for compliance with terms of Settlement Agreement</i> addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Kathleen M. Comfrey dated 2-26-2016. <i>Request to Court to hold decision in abeyance.</i> Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Comfrey, Kathleen) (Entered: 03/01/2016)
03/01/2016	<u>133</u>	ORDER granting <u>130</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time: that by April 15, 2016, Defendants shall complete all outstanding pension benefit calculations in a manner consistent with the Settlement Agreement; By May 15, 2016, Defendants shall obtain all necessary approvals from the Office of the Actuary related to the Police Pension Fund's calculations identified in Paragraph 1 above; and By June 15, 2016, Defendants shall obtain all the necessary approvals from the Office of the Comptroller related to the interest payments owed the class members pursuant to the Settlement Agreement. The Clerk of the Court is respectfully directed to terminate the motion located at docket number 130. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 3/1/2016) (tn) (Entered: 03/01/2016)
04/13/2016	<u>134</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time addressed to Judge Richard J. Sullivan from Kathleen M. Comfrey dated April 13, 2016. Document filed by City of New York, New York City Police Department, New York City Police Pension Fund. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Comfrey, Kathleen) (Entered: 04/13/2016)
04/13/2016	<u>135</u>	ORDER granting <u>134</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the deadlines set forth in the Court's Order, dated March 1, 2016, docket number 133, shall be extended as follows: 1. By April 29, 2016, Defendants shall complete all outstanding pension benefit calculations in a manner consistent with the Settlement Agreement; 2. By May 27, 2016, Defendants shall shall obtain all necessary approvals from the Office of the Actuary related to the Police Pension Fund's calculations identified in Paragraph 1 above; and 3. By June 29, 2016, Defendants shall obtain all necessary approvals from the Office of the Comptroller related to the interest payments owed the class members pursuant to the Settlement Agreement. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Sullivan on 4/13/2016) (mro) (Entered: 04/13/2016)