

STAYED,CLOSED,ECF

**U.S. District Court
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:04-cv-09194-CM**

Velez et al v. Novartis Corporation et al
Assigned to: Judge Colleen McMahon
Demand: \$9,999,000
Cause: 42:2000e-2e Job Discrimination (Unlawful Employment Practices)

Date Filed: 11/19/2004
Date Terminated: 11/30/2010
Jury Demand: Plaintiff
Nature of Suit: 442 Civil Rights: Jobs
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Amy Velez

*Individually and on behlf of others
simiarly situated*

represented by **Angela Corridan**
Sanford, Wittels &Heisler, L.L.P.
1666 Connecticut Avenue
Suite 310
Washington, DC 20009
(202) 742-7780
TERMINATED: 09/17/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David W. Sanford
Sanford Heisler, LLP (DC)
1666 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.
Suite 300
Washington, DC 20009
(202) 499-5199
Fax: (202) 499-5201
Email: dsanford@sanfordheisler.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Felicia M Medina
Sanford Heisler, LLP (SF)
555 Montgomery Street, Suite 820
San Francisco, CA 94111
(415) 795-2020
Email: fmedina@sanfordheisler.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jeremy Heisler
Sanford Heisler, LLP
1350 Avenue Of The Americas, 31st Floor
New York, NY 10019
(646) 723-2947
Fax: (646) 723-2948
Email: jheisler@sanfordheisler.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine M. Kimpel
Sanford Heisler, LLP (DC)
1666 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.
Suite 300
Washington, DC 20009
(202) 742-7788
Fax: (202) 742-7776
Email: kkimpel@sanfordheisler.com
LEAD ATTORNEY

PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine Leong
Sanford Heisler, LLP (DC)
1666 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.
Suite 300
Washington, DC 20009
(202) 499-5200
Fax: (202) 499-5199
Email: kleong@sanfordheisler.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa A. Goldblatt
Sanford Heisler, LLP (DC)
1666 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.
Suite 300
Washington, DC 20009
202-942-9136
Fax: 202-628-8189
Email: lgoldblatt@nydclaw.com
TERMINATED: 03/07/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven Lance Wittels
Sanford Heisler, LLP
1350 Avenue Of The Americas, 31st Floor
New York, NY 10019
(646)723-2947
Fax: (646)723-2948
Email: slw@wittelslaw.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sharon Eubanks
Sanford Heisler, LLP (DC)
1666 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.
Suite 300
Washington, DC 20009
(202)-742-7789
Fax: (202)-742-7776
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shayna Michelle Bloom
Sanford Wittels & Heisler, LLP
1666 Connecticut Avenue, North West
Suite 310
Washington, DC 20009
(202) 742-7782
Fax: (202) 742-7776
Email: sbloom@nydclaw.com
TERMINATED: 10/30/2008
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Sonia Klinger
Individually and on behalf of others
similarly situated
TERMINATED: 02/07/2006

represented by **Jeremy Heisler**
(See above for address)

Steven Lance Wittels
(See above for address)

Plaintiff

Penni Zelinkoff

*Individually and on behalf of others
similarly situated*

represented by **Angela Corridan**
Sanford, Wittels & Heisler, L.L.P.
950 Third Avenue
10th Floor
New York, NY 10022
(646) 723-2947
Fax: (646) 723-2948
TERMINATED: 09/17/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David W. Sanford

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Felicia M Medina

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jeremy Heisler

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine M. Kimpel

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine Leong

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa A. Goldblatt

(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/07/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven Lance Wittels

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sharon Eubanks

(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shayna Michelle Bloom

(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 10/30/2008
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Minel Hider Tobertga
Individually and on behalf of others
similarly situated

represented by **Angela Corridan**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/17/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David W. Sanford
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Felicia M Medina
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jeremy Heisler
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine M. Kimpel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine Leong
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa A. Goldblatt
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/07/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven Lance Wittels
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sharon Eubanks
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shayna Michelle Bloom
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 10/30/2008
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Michelle Williams
Individually and on behalf of others
similarly situated

represented by **Angela Corridan**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/17/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David W. Sanford

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Felicia M Medina
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jeremy Heisler
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine M. Kimpel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine Leong
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa A. Goldblatt
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/07/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven Lance Wittels
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sharon Eubanks
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shayna Michelle Bloom
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 10/30/2008
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Stephanie Cates
TERMINATED: 02/27/2006

represented by **Jeremy Heisler**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Steven Lance Wittels
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Lori Horton

represented by **Angela Corridan**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/17/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David W. Sanford
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Felicia M Medina
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine M. Kimpel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine Leong
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa A. Goldblatt
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/07/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jeremy Heisler
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sharon Eubanks
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shayna Michelle Bloom
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 10/30/2008
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Steven Lance Wittels
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Karen Liggins

represented by **Angela Corridan**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/17/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David W. Sanford
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Felicia M Medina
(See above for address)

*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Katherine M. Kimpel
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Katherine Leong
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Jeremy Heisler
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sharon Eubanks
(See above for address)
*PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Shayna Michelle Bloom
(See above for address)
*TERMINATED: 10/30/2008
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Steven Lance Wittels
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Wendy Pinson

represented by **Angela Corridan**
(See above for address)
*TERMINATED: 09/17/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

David W. Sanford
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Felicia M Medina
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Katherine M. Kimpel
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Katherine Leong
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE*

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa A. Goldblatt

(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/07/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jeremy Heisler

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sharon Eubanks

(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shayna Michelle Bloom

(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 10/30/2008
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Steven Lance Wittels

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Roberta VonLintel

represented by **Angela Corridan**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/17/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David W. Sanford

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Felicia M Medina

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine M. Kimpel

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine Leong

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa A. Goldblatt

(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/07/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jeremy Heisler

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sharon Eubanks
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shayna Michelle Bloom
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 10/30/2008
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Steven Lance Wittels
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Holly Waters

represented by **Angela Corridan**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/17/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David W. Sanford
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Felicia M Medina
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine M. Kimpel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine Leong
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa A. Goldblatt
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/07/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jeremy Heisler
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sharon Eubanks
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shayna Michelle Bloom
(See above for address)

TERMINATED: 10/30/2008
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Steven Lance Wittels
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Jennifer Waxman-Recht

represented by **Angela Corridan**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/17/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David W. Sanford
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Felicia M Medina
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine M. Kimpel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine Leong
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa A. Goldblatt
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/07/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jeremy Heisler
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sharon Eubanks
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shayna Michelle Bloom
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 10/30/2008
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Steven Lance Wittels
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Kelly Corbett

represented by **Angela Corridan**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/17/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David W. Sanford
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Felicia M Medina
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine M. Kimpel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine Leong
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa A. Goldblatt
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/07/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven Lance Wittels
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jeremy Heisler
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sharon Eubanks
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shayna Michelle Bloom
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 10/30/2008
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Marta Deyne

represented by **Angela Corridan**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/17/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David W. Sanford
(See above for address)

*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Felicia M Medina
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Katherine M. Kimpel
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Katherine Leong
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Lisa A. Goldblatt
(See above for address)
*TERMINATED: 03/07/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY*

Steven Lance Wittels
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Jeremy Heisler
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sharon Eubanks
(See above for address)
*PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Shayna Michelle Bloom
(See above for address)
*TERMINATED: 10/30/2008
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Plaintiff

Joan Durkin

represented by **Angela Corridan**
(See above for address)
*TERMINATED: 09/17/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

David W. Sanford
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Felicia M Medina
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE*

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine M. Kimpel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine Leong
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa A. Goldblatt
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/07/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven Lance Wittels
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jeremy Heisler
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sharon Eubanks
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shayna Michelle Bloom
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 10/30/2008
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Sue Earl
TERMINATED: 09/17/2009

represented by **Angela Corridan**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/17/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David W. Sanford
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine M. Kimpel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa A. Goldblatt
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/07/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven Lance Wittels

(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jeremy Heisler
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shayna Michelle Bloom
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 10/30/2008
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Jamie Holland

represented by **Angela Corridan**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/17/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David W. Sanford
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Felicia M Medina
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine M. Kimpel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine Leong
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa A. Goldblatt
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/07/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven Lance Wittels
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jeremy Heisler
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sharon Eubanks
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shayna Michelle Bloom
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 10/30/2008
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Maryanne Jacoby

represented by **Angela Corridan**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/17/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David W. Sanford
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Felicia M Medina
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine M. Kimpel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine Leong
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa A. Goldblatt
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/07/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven Lance Wittels
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jeremy Heisler
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sharon Eubanks
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shayna Michelle Bloom
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 10/30/2008
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Simona Lopes

represented by

Angela Corridan
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/17/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David W. Sanford
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Felicia M Medina
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine M. Kimpel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Katherine Leong
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Lisa A. Goldblatt
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/07/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven Lance Wittels
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jeremy Heisler
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sharon Eubanks
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shayna Michelle Bloom
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 10/30/2008
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Ashley Narmour
TERMINATED: 09/17/2009

represented by **Angela Corridan**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 09/17/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

David W. Sanford
(See above for address)

*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Katherine M. Kimpel
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Lisa A. Goldblatt
(See above for address)
*TERMINATED: 03/07/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY*

Steven Lance Wittels
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Jeremy Heisler
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shayna Michelle Bloom
(See above for address)
*TERMINATED: 10/30/2008
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Plaintiff

Catherine White

represented by **Angela Corridan**
(See above for address)
*TERMINATED: 09/17/2009
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

David W. Sanford
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Felicia M Medina
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Katherine M. Kimpel
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Katherine Leong
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Lisa A. Goldblatt
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/07/2007

LEAD ATTORNEY

Steven Lance Wittels
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jeremy Heisler
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sharon Eubanks
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shayna Michelle Bloom
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 10/30/2008
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Novartis Corporation
TERMINATED: 07/31/2007

represented by **Aaron R. Gelb**
Vedder, Price, P.C. (Chicago)
222 North Lasalle Street
Suite 2600
Chicago, IL 60601
(312)-609-7500
Fax: (312)-609-5005
Email: agelb@vedderprice.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Charles Benno Wolf
Vedder, Price, Kaufman, Kammholz & Day
805 Third Avenue
New York, NY 10022
(312)-609-7888
Fax: (312)-609-5005
Email: cwolf@vedderprice.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jonathan Alan Wexler
Vedder Price P.C. (NY)
1633 Broadway, 31st Floor
New York, NY 10019
212 407 7732
Fax: 212 407 7799
Email: jwexler@vedderprice.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Richard H. Schnadig
Vedder, Price, P.C. (Chicago)
222 North Lasalle Street
Suite 2600
Chicago, IL 60601
(312)-609-7810
Fax: (312)-609-5005

Email: rschnadig@vedderprice.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sara Jeanine Kagay
Vedder, Price, P.C. (Chicago)
222 North Lasalle Street
Suite 2600
Chicago, IL 60601
(312)-609-7500
Fax: (312)-609-5005
Email: skagay@vedderprice.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Thomas G. Abram
Vedder, Price, P.C. (Chicago)
222 North Lasalle Street
Suite 2600
Chicago, IL 60601
(312)-609-7500
Fax: (312)-609-5005
Email: tabram@vedderprice.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Vincent R Fitzpatrick
White & Case LLP (NY)
1155 Avenue of the Americas
Suite 1444
New York, NY 10036
(212)-819-8569
Fax: (212)-819-8113
Email: vfitzpatrick@whitecase.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Alison Ruth Kirshner
Paul Hastings LLP (NY)
200 Park Avenue
New York, NY 10166
(212) 318-6000
Fax: (212) 752-2279
Email: alisonkirshner@paulhastings.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Heather McDevitt
White & Case LLP (NY)
1155 Ave of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
(212) 819-8937
Fax: (212) 354-8113
Email: hmcdevitt@whitecase.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jack Pace
White & Case LLP (NY)
1155 Ave of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
(212) 819-8200
Fax: (212) 354-8113
Email: jpace@whitecase.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation

represented by **Aaron R. Gelb**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Charles Benno Wolf
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Elizabeth N. Hall
Vedder, Price, P.C. (Chicago)
222 North LaSalle Street
Suite 2600
Chicago, IL 60601
(312) 609-7500
Fax: (312) 609-5005
Email: ehall@vedderprice.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Evan R Chesler
Cravath, Swaine & Moore LLP
825 Eighth Avenue
New York, NY 10019
(212) 474-1000
Fax: (212) 474-3700
Email: echesler@cravath.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jonathan Alan Wexler
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Richard H. Schnadig
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sara Jeanine Kagay
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Thomas G. Abram
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Amy Louise Bess
Vedder Price P.C. (NY)
1633 Broadway, 31st Floor
New York, NY 10019
(202)-312-3361
Fax: (202)-312-3322
Email: abess@vedderprice.com
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Richard H. Schnadig
(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant**Thomas Ebeling**

TERMINATED: 04/09/2009

represented by **Andrea S. Christensen**
 United States Attorney's Office
 Southern District of New York
 One St. Andrew's Plaza
 New York, NY 10007
 (212)-836-8000
 Fax: (212)-836-8689
 Email: achristensen@kayescholer.com
LEAD ATTORNEY

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
11/19/2004	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Novartis Corporation, Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Filing Fee \$ 150.00, Receipt Number 527025) Document filed by Sonia Klinger, Minel Tobertga Hider, Amy Velez, Michelle Williams, Penni Zelinkoff.(gf,) Additional attachment(s) added on 11/24/2004 (gf,). (Entered: 11/22/2004)
11/19/2004		SUMMONS ISSUED as to Novartis Corporation, Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (gf,) (Entered: 11/22/2004)
11/19/2004	<u>2</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Jeremy Heisler on behalf of Sonia Klinger, Minel Tobertga Hider, Amy Velez, Michelle Williams, Penni Zelinkoff (gf,) Additional attachment(s) added on 11/24/2004 (gf,). (Entered: 11/22/2004)
11/19/2004		Magistrate Judge Frank Maas is so designated. (gf,) (Entered: 11/22/2004)
11/19/2004		Case Designated ECF. (gf,) (Entered: 11/22/2004)
02/23/2005	<u>3</u>	AMENDED COMPLAINT against Novartis Corporation, Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. Document filed by Stephanie Cates, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta Vonlintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Michelle Williams, Amy Velez, Sonia Klinger, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Tobertga Hider.(dle,) (Entered: 02/24/2005)
03/07/2005	<u>4</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Jonathan A. Wexler dated 3/1/05 re: counsel for dfts request that the time for dfts to respond to the amended complaint be extended to 4/18/05. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 3/4/05) (dle,) (Entered: 03/10/2005)
03/07/2005		Set Answer Due Date purs. to <u>4</u> Endorsed Letter, as to Novartis Corporation answer due on 4/18/2005; Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation answer due on 4/18/2005. (dle,) (Entered: 03/10/2005)
03/30/2005	<u>5</u>	MOTION pursuant to Rule 1.3(c) of the Local Rules of the U.S. District Courts for the Southern and Eastern Districts of New York for an Order allowing the admission of Charles B. Wolf, Richard H. Schnadig, Thomas G. Abram, Aaron R. Gelb and Sara J. Kagay as attorneys Pro Hac Vice to argue or try this case in whole or in part as counsel or advocate. Affidavit of Jonathan A. Wexler in support and proposed Order attached. Document filed by Novartis Corporation, Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. Return Date set for 4/15/2005 10:00 AM. (yv,) Modified on 4/6/2005 (yv,). (Entered: 04/06/2005)
04/04/2005	<u>6</u>	MOTION pursuant to Rule 1.3(c) of the Local Rules of the U.S. District Courts for the Southern and Eastern Districts of New York for an Order allowing the admission of Charles B. Wolf, Richard H. Schnadig, Thomas G. Abram, Aaron R. Gelb and Sara J. Kagay as attorneys Pro Hac Vice for defendant. Affidavit of Jonathan A. Wexler in support attached. Document filed by Novartis Corporation, Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. Return Date set for 4/15/2005 10:00 AM. (yv,) Modified on 4/11/2005 (yv,). Modified on 4/11/2005 (yv,). (Entered: 04/11/2005)
04/19/2005	<u>7</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment. Document filed by Novartis Corporation, Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. Responses due by 5/2/2005 Return Date set

		for 5/16/2005 09:30 AM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> # <u>2</u> # <u>3</u> # <u>4</u> # <u>5</u> # <u>6</u> # <u>7</u> # <u>8</u> # <u>9</u> # <u>10</u>)(Wexler, Jonathan) (Entered: 04/19/2005)
04/19/2005	<u>8</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>7</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Novartis Corporation, Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Wexler, Jonathan) (Entered: 04/19/2005)
04/20/2005	<u>9</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY–RULE 7.1 DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. Document filed by Novartis Corporation, Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Wexler, Jonathan) Modified on 4/20/2005 (jp,). (Entered: 04/20/2005)
04/20/2005	<u>10</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – ANSWER to Amended Complaint. Document filed by Novartis Corporation, Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. Related document: <u>3</u> Amended Complaint, filed by Michelle Williams,, Amy Velez,, Sonia Klinger,, Penni Zelinkoff,, Minel Tobertga Hider,, Jennifer Waxman–Recht,, Karen Liggins,, Lori Horton,, Holly Waters,, Stephanie Cates,, Wendy Pinson,, Roberta Vonlintel,. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Wexler, Jonathan) Modified on 4/20/2005 (kg). Modified on 4/20/2005 (kg,). (Entered: 04/20/2005)
04/20/2005	<u>11</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – RULE 7.1 DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. Document filed by Novartis Corporation, Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Wexler, Jonathan) Modified on 4/20/2005 (kg). (Entered: 04/20/2005)
04/20/2005		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE–FILE DOCUMENT – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Note to Attorney Jonathan Wexler to RE–FILE Document <u>10</u> Answer to Amended Complaint. ERROR(S): Party Selection Error. (kg) (Entered: 04/20/2005)
04/20/2005		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE–FILE DOCUMENT – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Note to Attorney Jonathan Wexler to RE–FILE Document <u>11</u> Rule 7.1 Disclosure Statement. ERROR(S): Party Selection Error. (kg) (Entered: 04/20/2005)
04/20/2005	<u>12</u>	RULE 7.1 DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. Document filed by Novartis Corporation.(Wexler, Jonathan) (Entered: 04/20/2005)
04/20/2005	<u>13</u>	ANSWER to Amended Complaint. Document filed by Novartis Corporation. Related document: <u>3</u> Amended Complaint, filed by Michelle Williams,, Amy Velez,, Sonia Klinger,, Penni Zelinkoff,, Minel Tobertga Hider,, Jennifer Waxman–Recht,, Karen Liggins,, Lori Horton,, Holly Waters,, Stephanie Cates,, Wendy Pinson,, Roberta Vonlintel,. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Wexler, Jonathan) (Entered: 04/20/2005)
04/20/2005	<u>14</u>	RULE 7.1 DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Wexler, Jonathan) (Entered: 04/20/2005)
04/20/2005	<u>15</u>	ANSWER to Amended Complaint. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. Related document: <u>3</u> Amended Complaint, filed by Michelle Williams,, Amy Velez,, Sonia Klinger,, Penni Zelinkoff,, Minel Tobertga Hider,, Jennifer Waxman–Recht,, Karen Liggins,, Lori Horton,, Holly Waters,, Stephanie Cates,, Wendy Pinson,, Roberta Vonlintel,. (Attachments: # <u>1</u>)(Wexler, Jonathan) (Entered: 04/20/2005)
04/20/2005	<u>16</u>	ORDER granting <u>5</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, granting <u>6</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice . (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 4/16/05) (jco,) (Entered: 04/22/2005)
05/04/2005	<u>17</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER: plaintiffs' opposition to defendants' motion for summary judgment due by 5/9/2005. Reply due by 5/23/2005. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 5/3/05) (kw,) (Entered: 05/05/2005)
05/09/2005	<u>18</u>	OPPOSITION BRIEF re: <u>7</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Amy Velez, Stephanie Cates, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta Vonlintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Sonia Klinger, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Tobertga Hider.(Wittels, Steven) (Entered: 05/09/2005)

05/09/2005	<u>19</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>7</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Amy Velez, Stephanie Cates, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta Vonlintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Sonia Klinger, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Tobertga Hider. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit of Sonia Klinger in Support of Opposition# <u>2</u> Exhibit B in Support of Opposition# <u>3</u> Responses to Statement of Uncontested Material Facts# <u>4</u> Statement of Contested Material Facts)(Wittels, Steven) (Entered: 05/09/2005)
05/09/2005	20	MOTION for an order, admitting David W. Sanford and Lisa A. Goldblatt to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Amy Velez, Stephanie Cates, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta Vonlintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Sonia Klinger, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Tobertga Hider. Return Date set for 5/20/2005 at 10:00 AM. (sac,) (Entered: 05/10/2005)
05/16/2005	<u>21</u>	ORDER withdrawing without prejudice <u>7</u> Motion for Summary Judgment to renewing the motion at a subsequent date. Plaintiffs are to serve document demands and interrogatories on the limited issue of the relationship between defendant Novartis Corporation and its subsidiary and co-defendant, Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation, no later than 5/27/05. The parties are to appear before the Court for an interim status conference in this matter on Friday, 10/14/05 at 10:30 a.m. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 5/13/05) (yv,) (Entered: 05/17/2005)
05/16/2005		Set/Reset Hearings: Status Conference set for 10/14/2005 at 10:30 AM before Judge Gerard E. Lynch. (yv,) (Entered: 05/17/2005)
05/16/2005	<u>22</u>	CASE MANAGEMENT PLAN: Amended pleadings may be filed until 6/3/2005. Joinder of additional parties must be accomplished by 6/3/2005. The motion for class certification is to be served and filed by 3/31/2006. Answering papers are to be served and filed by 4/30/2006. Reply papers are to be served and filed by 5/31/2006. All fact discovery related to class certification is to be completed by 11/30/2005. First request for production of documents relating to class certification, if any, to be served by 6/30/05. Interrogatories relating to class certification pursuant to Local Rule 33.3(a) of the Civil Rules of the Southern District of New York to be served by 6/30/05. Experts, if any, in support of class certification are to be designated by plaintiffs by 10/31/05, and any reports furnished by 11/30/05. Any experts by defendants in opposition to class certification shall be designated by 11/30/05, and any reports furnished by 1/15/06. Experts may de deposed, but such depositions must occur by 1/31/06. The parties are to appear before the Court for an interim status conference in this matter on Friday, 10/14/2005 at 10:30 AM (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 5/13/05) (yv,) (Entered: 05/17/2005)
05/31/2005	<u>23</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER plaintiffs' memo in support of opposition to defendants' motion shall be no more than 30 pages; and defendants' reply to plaintiffs' memo in support of opposition shall be no more than 15 pages. So Ordered.(Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 5/11/05) (jco,) (Entered: 06/02/2005)
06/01/2005	<u>24</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER that the parties time to serve their initial disclosures purs. to Rule 26(a)(1) of the FRCP is extended to and including 6/24/05. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 5/31/05) (dle,) (Entered: 06/03/2005)
06/03/2005	<u>25</u>	Second AMENDED COMPLAINT amending <u>3</u> Amended Complaint, against Thomas Ebeling, Novartis Corporation, Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.Document filed by Michelle Williams, Amy Velez, Stephanie Cates, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta Vonlintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Sonia Klinger, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Tobertga Hider. Related document: <u>3</u> Amended Complaint, filed by Michelle Williams,, Amy Velez,, Sonia Klinger,, Penni Zelinkoff,, Minel Tobertga Hider,, Jennifer Waxman-Recht,, Karen Liggins,, Lori Horton,, Holly Waters,, Stephanie Cates,, Wendy Pinson,, Roberta Vonlintel,(kw,) (Entered: 06/06/2005)
06/03/2005		Set Answer Due Date purs. to <u>25</u> Amended Complaint as to Novartis Corporation answer due on 6/13/2005; Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation answer due on

		6/13/2005. (kw,) (Entered: 06/06/2005)
06/17/2005	<u>26</u>	STIPULATION ; that the time by which dfts Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corp. and Novartis Corp. must respond to plaintiffs' First Set of Requests for Production of Documents to dfts, and plaintiffs' First Set of Interrogatories to Dfts, is extended to and including 7/27/05; dfts Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corp. Novartis Corp. must respond to the Second Amended Class Action Complaint is extended to 7/24/05. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 6/15/05) (pl,) (Entered: 06/20/2005)
06/24/2005	<u>27</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Heather McDevitt on behalf of Novartis Corporation (McDevitt, Heather) (Entered: 06/24/2005)
06/24/2005	<u>28</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Vincent R Fitzpatrick on behalf of Novartis Corporation (Fitzpatrick, Vincent) (Entered: 06/24/2005)
07/25/2005	<u>29</u>	ANSWER to Amended Complaint. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. Related document: <u>25</u> Amended Complaint,, filed by Michelle Williams,, Amy Velez,, Sonia Klinger,, Penni Zelinkoff,, Minel Tobertga Hider,, Jennifer Waxman–Recht,, Karen Liggins,, Lori Horton,, Holly Waters,, Stephanie Cates,, Wendy Pinson,, Roberta Vonlintel.,(Wexler, Jonathan) (Entered: 07/25/2005)
07/25/2005	<u>30</u>	ANSWER to Amended Complaint. Document filed by Novartis Corporation. Related document: <u>25</u> Amended Complaint,, filed by Michelle Williams,, Amy Velez,, Sonia Klinger,, Penni Zelinkoff,, Minel Tobertga Hider,, Jennifer Waxman–Recht,, Karen Liggins,, Lori Horton,, Holly Waters,, Stephanie Cates,, Wendy Pinson,, Roberta Vonlintel.,(McDevitt, Heather) (Entered: 07/25/2005)
07/26/2005	<u>31</u>	STIPULATION OF DISMISSAL; that Class Rep. Fonna Martin hereby dismisses her claims without prejudice against Novartis Corp, Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corp. and Thomas Ebeling. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 7/25/05) (pl,) Modified on 7/27/2005 (pl,). (Entered: 07/27/2005)
07/26/2005	<u>32</u>	ORDER; granting 20 Motion for David W. Sanford and Lisa A. Goldblatt to Appear Pro Hac Vice . (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 7/25/05) (pl,) (Entered: 07/27/2005)
07/26/2005		Transmission to Attorney Admissions Clerk. Transmitted re: <u>32</u> Order on Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, to the Attorney Admissions Clerk for updating of Attorney Information. (pl,) (Entered: 07/27/2005)
08/31/2005	<u>33</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Jack Pace on behalf of Novartis Corporation (Pace, Jack) (Entered: 08/31/2005)
09/07/2005	<u>34</u>	STIPULATION TO FILE THIRD AMENDED CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 9/6/05) (sac,) (Entered: 09/08/2005)
09/09/2005	<u>35</u>	THIRD AMENDED COMPLAINT amending <u>25</u> Amended Complaint,, against Thomas Ebeling, Novartis Corporation, Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.Document filed by Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Dutkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Mary Anne Jacoby, Simona Lopez, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Michelle Williams, Amy Velez, Stephanie Cates, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta Vonlintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Sonia Klinger, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Tobertga Hider. Related document: <u>25</u> Amended Complaint,, filed by Michelle Williams,, Amy Velez,, Sonia Klinger,, Penni Zelinkoff,, Minel Tobertga Hider,, Jennifer Waxman–Recht,, Karen Liggins,, Lori Horton,, Holly Waters,, Stephanie Cates,, Wendy Pinson,, Roberta Vonlintel.,(cd,) Additional attachment(s) added on 9/20/2005 (cd,). (Entered: 09/13/2005)
10/11/2005	<u>36</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – (DOCUMENT WAS NAMED INCRRRECTLY) – PROPOSED MOTION for Leave to Appear By telephone. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Dutkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Mary Anne Jacoby, Simona Lopez, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Stephanie Cates, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta Vonlintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Sonia Klinger, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Tobertga Hider. Return Date set for 10/13/2005 12:00 PM. (Wittels, Steven) Modified on 10/18/2005 (gf,).

		(Entered: 10/11/2005)
10/12/2005	<u>37</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear By Telephone. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Dutkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Mary Anne Jacoby, Simona Lopez, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Stephanie Cates, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta Vonlintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Sonia Klinger, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Tobertga Hider. Return Date set for 10/13/2005 12:00 PM. (Wittels, Steven) (Entered: 10/12/2005)
10/14/2005	<u>38</u>	REVISED CASE MANAGEMENT PLAN: Amended Pleadings due by 8/18/2005. Joinder of Parties due by 6/3/2005. Discovery due by 2/28/2006. Status Conference set for 2/3/2006 11:30 AM before Judge Gerard E. Lynch. Additional discovery deadlines are as set forth in this Order. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 10/14/05) (pl,) (Entered: 10/20/2005)
10/19/2005	<u>39</u>	CASE MANAGEMENT PLAN: Motions due by 8/15/2006. Responses due by 9/29/2006 Replies due by 11/10/2006. Discovery due by 2/28/2006. Status Conference set for 2/3/2006 11:30 AM before Judge Gerard E. Lynch. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 10/14/05) (db,) (Entered: 10/20/2005)
10/21/2005	<u>40</u>	JOINT MOTION for Protective Order <i>Joint Motion for Entry of Stipulated Protective Order</i> . Document filed by Novartis Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Stipulated Protective Order)(Kirshner, Alison) (Entered: 10/21/2005)
10/27/2005	<u>41</u>	STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER...regarding procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of confidential material.... (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 10/25/05) (cd,) (Entered: 10/28/2005)
11/21/2005	<u>42</u>	CASE MANAGEMENT PLAN: Status Conference set for 2/3/2006 11:30 AM before Judge Gerard E. Lynch. Discovery due by 2/28/2006. Responses due by 5/1/2006 Motions due by 8/15/2006. Replies due by 11/10/2006. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 10/14/2005) (jmi,) (Entered: 11/21/2005)
12/07/2005	<u>43</u>	ORDER for the pro hac vice appearance of Laura Fentomiller for plaintiffs. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 12/2/05) (cd,) (Entered: 12/08/2005)
12/07/2005		Transmission to Attorney Admissions Clerk. Transmitted re: <u>43</u> Order, to the Attorney Admissions Clerk for updating of Attorney Information. (cd,) (Entered: 12/08/2005)
12/16/2005	<u>44</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Amended Complaint,,, Thomas Ebeling served on 11/4/2005, answer due 11/25/2005. Service was accepted by Unknown, Guard. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Michelle Williams; Kelly Corbett; Marta Deyne; Joan Dutkin; Sue Earl; Jamie Holland; Mary Anne Jacoby; Simona Lopez; Ashley Narmour; Catherine White; Amy Velez; Stephanie Cates; Lori Horton; Karen Liggins; Wendy Pinson; Roberta Vonlintel; Holly Waters; Jennifer Waxman–Recht; Sonia Klinger; Penni Zelinkoff; Minel Tobertga Hider. (Wittels, Steven) (Entered: 12/16/2005)
12/19/2005	<u>45</u>	MOTION (1) Judicial Finding that Plaintiffs have validly served Defendant Thomas Ebeling, or alternatively (2) An Order Directing E–mail or Mail Service on Defendant Ebeling. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Dutkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Mary Anne Jacoby, Simona Lopez, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Stephanie Cates, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta Vonlintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Sonia Klinger, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Tobertga Hider. (Wittels, Steven) (Entered: 12/19/2005)
12/19/2005	<u>46</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>45</u> MOTION (1) Judicial Finding that Plaintiffs have validly served Defendant Thomas Ebeling, or alternatively (2) An Order Directing E–mail or Mail Service on Defendant Ebeling.. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Dutkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Mary Anne Jacoby, Simona Lopez, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Stephanie Cates, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta Vonlintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Sonia Klinger, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Tobertga Hider. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Supplement Affirmation of Jeremy

		Heisler# <u>2</u> Exhibit Exhibit A to Heisler Aff# <u>3</u> Exhibit Exhibit B to Heisler Aff# <u>4</u> Exhibit Exhibit C to Heisler Aff# <u>5</u> Exhibit Exhibit D to Heisler Aff# <u>6</u> Exhibit Exhibit E to Heisler Aff)(Wittels, Steven) (Entered: 12/19/2005)
01/12/2006	<u>47</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER that the date for Thomas Ebeling's opposition to plaintiffs' motion for a judicial finding that plaintiffs have validly served dft Thomas Ebeling or alternatively an order under CPLR 308(5) directing that e-mail or mail service on Ebeling is sufficient shall be adjourned from 1/9/06 until 2/10/06 with a reply due by 2/21/06. Counsel for Thomas Ebeling will hand deliver his opposition to counsel for plaintiffs on or before 2/10/06 at 5:00 p.m. Plaintiffs will hand deliver its reply to counsel for Mr. Ebeling on or before 2/21/06 at 5:00 p.m. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 1/12/06) (dle,) (Entered: 01/12/2006)
02/02/2006	<u>48</u>	ORDER; re: granting <u>37</u> MOTION for Leave to Appear By Telephone. filed by Michelle Williams,, Amy Velez,, Sonia Klinger,, Penni Zelinkoff,, Minel Hider Tobertga,, Jennifer Waxman-Recht,, Karen Liggins,, Lori Horton,, Holly Waters,, Stephanie Cates,, Wendy Pinson,, Roberta VonLintel,, Ashley Narmour,, Catherine White,, Kelly Corbett,, Sue Earl,, Jamie Holland,, Joan Durkin,, Simona Lopes,, Maryanne Jacoby,, Marta Deyne, (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 2/2/06) (pl,) (Entered: 02/03/2006)
02/07/2006	<u>49</u>	REVISED CIVIL CASE MANAGEMENT PLAN: Amended Pleadings due by 8/18/2005. Joinder of Parties due by 6/3/2005. Discovery due by 4/28/2006. Status Conference set for 5/5/2006 10:30 AM before Judge Gerard E. Lynch. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 2/3/06) (jco,) (Entered: 02/08/2006)
02/07/2006	<u>50</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER OF DISMISSAL pursuant to F.R.C.P. 41, that Class Representative Sonia Klinger hereby dismisses her claims with prejudice against Novartis Corporation, Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation and Thomas Ebeling. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 2/7/06) (jco,) (Entered: 02/08/2006)
02/10/2006	<u>51</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>45</u> MOTION (1) Judicial Finding that Plaintiffs have validly served Defendant Thomas Ebeling, or alternatively (2) An Order Directing E-mail or Mail Service on Defendant Ebeling.. Document filed by Thomas Ebeling. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 - Affidavit of Kortright Mullin# <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 - Affidavit of Theodias Sankey# <u>3</u> Cassandra Porter's Certificate of Service)(Norber, Dan) (Entered: 02/10/2006)
02/21/2006	<u>52</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>45</u> MOTION (1) Judicial Finding that Plaintiffs have validly served Defendant Thomas Ebeling, or alternatively (2) An Order Directing E-mail or Mail Service on Defendant Ebeling.. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Wittels, Steven) (Entered: 02/21/2006)
02/21/2006	<u>53</u>	REPLY AFFIRMATION of Jeremy Heisler in Support re: <u>45</u> MOTION (1) Judicial Finding that Plaintiffs have validly served Defendant Thomas Ebeling, or alternatively (2) An Order Directing E-mail or Mail Service on Defendant Ebeling.. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Exhibit A)(Wittels, Steven) (Entered: 02/21/2006)
02/27/2006	<u>54</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER OF DISMISSAL pursuant to F.R.C.P. 41, that Class Representative Stephanie Cates hereby dismisses her claims with prejudice against Novartis Corporation, Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation and Thoams Ebeling. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 2/22/06) (jco,) (Entered: 02/27/2006)
03/09/2006	<u>55</u>	STIPULATION TO FILE FOURTH AMENDED CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT: Plaintiffs may file a fourth amended class action complaint, which is identical to the third amended class action complaint except that all references in

		the third amended class action complaint to Sonia Klinger and Stephanie Cates have been removed. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 3/8/2006) (lb,) (Entered: 03/09/2006)
03/13/2006	<u>56</u>	FOURTH AMENDED COMPLAINT amending <u>35</u> Amended Complaint,, against Thomas Ebeling, Novartis Corporation, Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. Related document: <u>35</u> Amended Complaint,, filed by Michelle Williams,, Amy Velez,, Sonia Klinger,, Penni Zelinkoff,, Minel Hider Tobertga,, Jennifer Waxman–Recht,, Karen Liggins,, Lori Horton,, Holly Waters,, Stephanie Cates,, Wendy Pinson,, Roberta VonLintel,, Ashley Narmour,, Catherine White,, Kelly Corbett,, Sue Earl,, Jamie Holland,, Joan Durkin,, Simona Lopes,, Maryanne Jacoby,, Marta Deyne,,(sac,) (Entered: 03/14/2006)
03/20/2006	<u>57</u>	ANSWER to Amended Complaint. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. Related document: <u>56</u> Amended Complaint,, filed by Michelle Williams,, Amy Velez,, Penni Zelinkoff,, Minel Hider Tobertga,, Jennifer Waxman–Recht,, Lori Horton,, Holly Waters,, Wendy Pinson,, Roberta VonLintel,, Ashley Narmour,, Catherine White,, Kelly Corbett,, Sue Earl,, Jamie Holland,, Joan Durkin,, Simona Lopes,, Maryanne Jacoby,, Marta Deyne,, (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit of Service)(Wexler, Jonathan) (Entered: 03/20/2006)
03/31/2006	<u>59</u>	ANSWER to Amended Complaint. Document filed by Novartis Corporation. Related document: <u>56</u> Amended Complaint,, filed by Michelle Williams,, Amy Velez,, Penni Zelinkoff,, Minel Hider Tobertga,, Jennifer Waxman–Recht,, Lori Horton,, Holly Waters,, Wendy Pinson,, Roberta VonLintel,, Ashley Narmour,, Catherine White,, Kelly Corbett,, Sue Earl,, Jamie Holland,, Joan Durkin,, Simona Lopes,, Maryanne Jacoby,, Marta Deyne,,(Fitzpatrick, Vincent) (Entered: 03/31/2006)
04/04/2006	<u>60</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by David W. Sanford on behalf of Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga (Sanford, David) (Entered: 04/04/2006)
04/05/2006	<u>61</u>	OPINION AND ORDER re: <u>45</u> MOTION (1) Judicial Finding that Plaintiffs have validly served Defendant Thomas Ebeling, or alternatively (2) An Order Directing E–mail or Mail Service on Defendant Ebeling. Ebeling has been properly served, and plaintiffs' motion is GRANTED. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 4/4/06) (kco,) (Entered: 04/06/2006)
04/14/2006	62	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Jeremy Heisler dated 4/7/06 re: Counsel writes to request that Your Honor endorse the briefing schedule as follows: 5/18/06: Plaintiffs' opposition to defendant Novartis Corporation's Motion for summary judgment due; 6/18/06: Defendant Novartis Corporation's reply to plaintiffs' opposition due. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 4/7/06) (jco,) (Entered: 04/14/2006)
04/20/2006	<u>63</u>	ANSWER to Amended Complaint. Document filed by Thomas Ebeling. Related document: <u>56</u> Amended Complaint,, filed by Michelle Williams,, Amy Velez,, Penni Zelinkoff,, Minel Hider Tobertga,, Jennifer Waxman–Recht,, Lori Horton,, Holly Waters,, Wendy Pinson,, Roberta VonLintel,, Ashley Narmour,, Catherine White,, Kelly Corbett,, Sue Earl,, Jamie Holland,, Joan Durkin,, Simona Lopes,, Maryanne Jacoby,, Marta Deyne,,(Christensen, Andrea) (Entered: 04/20/2006)
05/02/2006	<u>64</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear By Telephone. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 05/02/2006)

05/10/2006	<u>65</u>	MOTION for Leave to File Amended Answer. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Wexler, Jonathan) (Entered: 05/10/2006)
05/10/2006	<u>66</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>65</u> MOTION for Leave to File Amended Answer.. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Wexler, Jonathan) (Entered: 05/10/2006)
05/23/2006	<u>67</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Jeremy Heisler dated 5/22/06 re: a request for the following briefing schedule: opposition papers due by 5/30/06 and reply papers due by 7/10/06. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 5/22/06) (kco,) (Entered: 05/23/2006)
05/23/2006	<u>68</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Jeremy Heisler dated 5/22/06 re: a request for the following briefing schedule: opposition papers due by 6/2/06 and reply papers due by 6/12/06. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 5/22/06) (kco,) (Entered: 05/23/2006)
05/23/2006	<u>69</u>	REVISED CIVIL CASE MANAGEMENT PLAN: Amended Pleadings due by 8/18/2006. Joinder of Parties due by 6/3/2006. Motions due by 1/15/2007. Responses due by 2/28/2007 Replies due by 3/11/2007. Status Conference set for 10/6/2006 at 11:00 AM before Judge Gerard E. Lynch. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 5/22/06) (kco,) (Entered: 05/23/2006)
06/12/2006	<u>72</u>	ORDER that the clerk of the court is respectfully directed to clsoe the motions doc. #64 and #65 for all internal statistical purposes. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 6/9/06) (dle,) (Entered: 06/12/2006)
06/29/2006	<u>73</u>	MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages / <i>Motion to Expand Page Limits</i> . Document filed by Novartis Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(McDevitt, Heather) (Entered: 06/29/2006)
07/06/2006	<u>74</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER, Plaintiffs and Defendant Novartis Corporation, by and through their undersigned counsel, hereby stipulate and agree that the deadline for Novartis Corporation's reply memorandum of law in further support of its motion for summary judgment willbe extended from July 10, 2006 to and including July 24, 2006. Motions due by 7/24/2006. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 6/30/2006) (jmi,) (Entered: 07/06/2006)
07/24/2006	<u>75</u>	ORDER granting <u>73</u> Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages. . (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 7/24/06) (kco,) (Entered: 07/25/2006)
07/24/2006	<u>76</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Richard H. Schnadig dated 7/20/06 re: a request for an extension of the class certification fact discovery cutoff date, currently set for 7/28/06 to and including 9/13/2006. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 7/24/06) (kco,) (Entered: 07/25/2006)
07/25/2006	<u>77</u>	NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by David W. Sanford on behalf of all plaintiffs. New Address: Sanford, Wittels &Heisler, LLP, 1666 Connecticut Ave NW, Suite 310, Washington, DC, USA 20009, 202-742-7777. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 07/25/2006)
07/27/2006	<u>79</u>	MOTION for Angela Corridan to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. Proposed Order attached. (db,) (Entered: 07/28/2006)
08/24/2006	<u>80</u>	MOTION for Angela Corridan to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. Proposed Order attached. (db,) (Entered: 08/24/2006)

08/30/2006	<u>81</u>	NOTICE of Designation of Plaintiffs' Expert Witnesses. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 08/30/2006)
08/31/2006	<u>82</u>	ORDER granting <u>80</u> Motion for Angela Corridan to Appear Pro Hac Vice . So Ordered.(Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 8/31/06) (jco,) (Entered: 08/31/2006)
08/31/2006		Transmission to Attorney Admissions Clerk. Transmitted re: <u>82</u> Order on Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, to the Attorney Admissions Clerk for updating of Attorney Information. (jco,) (Entered: 08/31/2006)
10/24/2006	<u>83</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – MOTION for Laura Christine Fentonmiller to Withdraw as Attorney. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum in Support of Motion)(Sanford, David) Modified on 10/25/2006 (kg,). (Entered: 10/24/2006)
10/25/2006		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Note to Attorney David W. Sanford to RE-FILE Document <u>83</u> MOTION for Laura Christine Fentonmiller to Withdraw as Attorney. ERROR(S): Filing Error of Attachment #1. Supporting Memorandum of Law must be filed individually. Event Code located under Responses and Replies. (kg) (Entered: 10/25/2006)
10/25/2006	<u>84</u>	ORDER: Having fully considered attorney Laura C. Fentonmiller's Motion to Withdraw as Counsel for Plaintiffs, it is this 25th day of October 2006 hereby: Ordered that Laura C. Fentonmiller's Motion to withdraw is GRANTED. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 10/25/06) (js,) (Entered: 10/26/2006)
10/31/2006	<u>85</u>	MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 10/31/2006)
11/06/2006	<u>86</u>	ORDER granting <u>85</u> Plaintiff's Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages . (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 11/6/2006) (lb,) (Entered: 11/07/2006)
01/11/2007	<u>87</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Jonathan E. Lynch dated 1/10/07 re: a request for a one day extension of time as set forth below: motions due 1/16/2007, responses due by 3/1/2007, and reply papers due by 3/12/2007. ENDORSEMENTS: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 1/10/07) (kco,) (Entered: 01/11/2007)
01/11/2007		Set Deadlines: Motions due by 1/16/2007. Responses due by 3/1/2007. Replies due by 3/12/2007. (kco,) (Entered: 01/11/2007)
01/16/2007	<u>88</u>	MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/16/2007)
01/16/2007	<u>89</u>	MOTION to Certify Class. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/16/2007)

01/16/2007	<u>90</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>89</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Ex 1 – O'Hagan Day 1 Dep# <u>2</u> Exhibit Ex 2 – O'Hagan Day 2 Dep# <u>3</u> Exhibit Ex 3 – O'Hagan Day 3 Dep Excerpts# <u>4</u> Exhibit Ex 4 – DiCindio Dep Excerpts# <u>5</u> Exhibit Ex 5 – Freire Dep Excerpts# <u>6</u> Exhibit Ex 6 – Perkins Dep Excerpts# <u>7</u> Exhibit Ex 7 – Anhalt Dep Excerpts# <u>8</u> Exhibit Ex 8 – Ebeling Dep Excerpts# <u>9</u> Exhibit Ex 9 – Corbett Dep Excerpts# <u>10</u> Exhibit Ex 10 – Deyne Dep Excerpts# <u>11</u> Exhibit Ex 11 – Durkin Dep Excerpts# <u>12</u> Exhibit Ex 12 – Holland Dep Excerpts# <u>13</u> Exhibit Ex 13 – Horton Dep Excerpts# <u>14</u> Exhibit Ex 14 – Jacoby Dep Excerpts# <u>15</u> Exhibit Ex 15 – Liggins Dep Excerpts# <u>16</u> Exhibit Ex 16 – Lopes Dep Excerpts# <u>17</u> Exhibit Ex 17 – Pinson Dep Excerpts# <u>18</u> Exhibit Ex 18 – Recht Dep Excerpts# <u>19</u> Exhibit Ex 19 – Tobertga Dep Excerpts# <u>20</u> Exhibit Ex 20 – Velez Dep Excerpts# <u>21</u> Exhibit Ex 21 – VonLintel Dep Excerpts# <u>22</u> Exhibit Ex 22 – Waters Dep Excerpts# <u>23</u> Exhibit Ex 23 – White Dep Excerpts# <u>24</u> Exhibit Ex 24 – Williams Dep Excerpts# <u>25</u> Exhibit Ex 25 – Zelinkoff Dep Excerpts# <u>26</u> Exhibit Ex 26 – Merkelson Dep Excerpts# <u>27</u> Exhibit Ex 27 – Declarations – Defranze-Wilmesher# <u>28</u> Exhibit Ex 28 – Declarations – Markowitz-Allen# <u>29</u> Exhibit Ex 29 – Declarations – Meyer-Beck# <u>30</u> Exhibit Ex 30 – Declarations – Peldiak-Bruce# <u>31</u> Exhibit Ex 31 – Declarations – Frank-Houlmont# <u>32</u> Exhibit Ex 32 – Declarations – Joslin-Lewis# <u>33</u> Exhibit Ex 33 – Declarations – Zykan-Gesler# <u>34</u> Exhibit Ex 34 – Lopes Declaration# <u>35</u> Exhibit Ex 35 – Chart of Declarations# <u>36</u> Exhibit Ex 36 – Martin Report# <u>37</u> Exhibit Ex 37 – Lanier Report# <u>38</u> Exhibit Ex 38 – Lanier Declaration# <u>39</u> Exhibit Ex 39 – Lanier Dep Excerpts# <u>40</u> Exhibit Ex 40 – Ask Ebeling# <u>41</u> Exhibit Ex 41 – Lanier Report Table 4# <u>42</u> Exhibit Ex 42 – Deyne Declaration# <u>43</u> Appendix App. A Sanford Dec.# <u>44</u> Appendix App. B Morris Dec.# <u>45</u> Appendix App. C Westlaw Cases Volume 1# <u>46</u> Appendix App. D Westlaw Cases Volume 2# <u>47</u> Appendix App. E Westlaw Cases Volume 3# <u>48</u> Appendix App. F Westlaw Cases Volume 4)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/16/2007)
01/18/2007	<u>91</u>	ORDER granting <u>88</u> Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages. The page limit for the plaintiffs' memorandum of law in support of their motion for class certification is extended from 50 pages to 52 pages. The page limit for the defendants' memorandum of law in opposition to plaintiff's motion for class certification is extended from 50 pages to 52 pages. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 1/17/07) (kco) (Entered: 01/19/2007)
01/24/2007	<u>92</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Jonathan A. Wexler dated 1/18/07 re: a request that the briefing schedule be modified as follows: opposition papers due by 3/22/07 and reply papers due by 4/9/07. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 1/19/07) (kco) (Entered: 01/25/2007)
01/24/2007		Set Deadlines as to <u>89</u> MOTION to Certify Class. Responses due by 3/22/2007 and Replies due by 4/9/2007. (kco) (Entered: 01/25/2007)
02/28/2007	<u>93</u>	CONSENT MOTION for Lisa Goldblatt to Withdraw as Attorney. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 02/28/2007)
02/28/2007	<u>94</u>	CONSENT MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>93</u> CONSENT MOTION for Lisa Goldblatt to Withdraw as Attorney.. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 02/28/2007)
03/07/2007	<u>95</u>	ORDER granting <u>93</u> Motion to Withdraw as Attorney. Attorney Lisa A. Goldblatt terminated. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 3/7/2007) (jmi) (Entered: 03/07/2007)

		03/08/2007)
03/08/2007	<u>96</u>	ORDER: The Court is advised that plts' motion for Angela Corridan to appear pro hac vice, Doc#79, appears as an open motion on certain internal reports. The docket entry is a duplicate of Doc#80, dated 8/24/2006, which was granted by order dated 8/31/2006 (Doc.#82.) Accordingly, The Clerk of the Court is respectfully directe to close the motion (Doc.#79) for all internal statistical purposes. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 3/7/2007) (jar) (Entered: 03/09/2007)
03/22/2007	<u>97</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>89</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Novartis Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1)(Fitzpatrick, Vincent) (Entered: 03/22/2007)
03/22/2007	<u>98</u>	DECLARATION of Vincent R. FitzPatrick in Opposition re: <u>89</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Novartis Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Fitzpatrick, Vincent) (Entered: 03/22/2007)
03/22/2007	<u>99</u>	BRIEF <i>In Opposition To Class Certification</i> . Document filed by Thomas Ebeling, Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation And Thomas Ebling's Brief In Opposition To Class Certification Part 2# <u>2</u> Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation And Thomas Ebling's Brief In Opposition To Class Certification Part 3)(Wexler, Jonathan) (Entered: 03/22/2007)
03/22/2007	<u>100</u>	NOTICE of Of Filing Of Appendix To Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation And Thomas Ebeling's Brief In Opposition To Class Certification re: <u>99</u> Brief,. Document filed by Thomas Ebeling, Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix Appendix Table of Contents and Exhibit 1-5# <u>2</u> Appendix Exhibit 6-10# <u>3</u> Appendix Exhibit 11 Part 1# <u>4</u> Appendix Exhibit 11 Part 2# <u>5</u> Appendix Exhibit 12-13# <u>6</u> Appendix Exhibit 14 Part 1# <u>7</u> Appendix Exhibit 14 Part 2# <u>8</u> Appendix Exhibit 14 Part 3# <u>9</u> Appendix Exhibit 14 Part 4# <u>10</u> Appendix Exhibit 14 Part 5# <u>11</u> Appendix Exhibit 14 Part 6# <u>12</u> Appendix Exhibit 14 Part 7# <u>13</u> Appendix Exhibit 15-18# <u>14</u> Appendix Exhibit 18-21# <u>15</u> Appendix Exhibit 22 Part 1# <u>16</u> Appendix Exhibit 22 Part 2# <u>17</u> Appendix Exhibit 22 Part 3# <u>18</u> Appendix Exhibit 22 Part 4# <u>19</u> Appendix Exhibit 23 Part 1# <u>20</u> Appendix Exhibit 23 Part 2# <u>21</u> Appendix Exhibit 23 Part 3# <u>22</u> Appendix Exhibit 23 Part 4# <u>23</u> Appendix Exhibit 23 Part 5# <u>24</u> Appendix Exhibit 24 Part 1# <u>25</u> Appendix Exhibit 24 Part 2# <u>26</u> Appendix Exhibit 24 Part 3-25# <u>27</u> Appendix Exhibit 26-27 Part 1# <u>28</u> Appendix Exhibit 26-27 Part 2# <u>29</u> Appendix Exhibit 28-29# <u>30</u> Appendix Exhibit 30# <u>31</u> Appendix Exhibit 31# <u>32</u> Appendix Exhibit 32-35# <u>33</u> Appendix Exhibit 36 Part 1# <u>34</u> Appendix Exhibit 36 Part 2# <u>35</u> Appendix Exhibit 36 Part 3# <u>36</u> Appendix Exhibit 36 Part 4.1# <u>37</u> Appendix Exhibit 36 Part 4.2# <u>38</u> Appendix Exhibit 36 Part 4.3# <u>39</u> Appendix Exhibit 36 Part 5.1# <u>40</u> Appendix Exhibit 36 Part 5.2# <u>41</u> Exhibit 36 Part 5.3# <u>42</u> Appendix Exhibit 36 Part 5.4# <u>43</u> Appendix Exhibit 36 Part 6# <u>44</u> Appendix Exhibit 36 Part 7# <u>45</u> Appendix Exhibit 36 Part 8# <u>46</u> Appendix Exhibit 36 Part 9# <u>47</u> Appendix Exhibit 36 Part 10# <u>48</u> Appendix Exhibit 37 Part 1# <u>49</u> Appendix Exhibit 37 Part 2# <u>50</u> Appendix Exhibit 38 Part 1# <u>51</u> Appendix Exhibit 38 Part 2# <u>52</u> Appendix Exhibit 38 Part 3# <u>53</u> Appendix Exhibit 38 Part 4# <u>54</u> Appendix Exhibit 39# <u>55</u> Appendix Exhibit 40 Part 1# <u>56</u> Appendix Exhibit 40 Part 2# <u>57</u> Appendix Exhibit 40 Part 3# <u>58</u> Appendix Exhibit 40 Part 4# <u>59</u> Appendix Exhibit 41 Part 1# <u>60</u> Appendix Exhibit 41 Part 2)(Wexler, Jonathan) (Entered: 03/22/2007)
04/04/2007	<u>101</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Angela Corridan dated 4/4/07 re: Request an extension of seven days to file their reply so that plaintiff's reply is to be served and filed by April 16, 2007. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 4/4/07) (js) (Entered: 04/05/2007)
04/04/2007		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Replies due by 4/16/2007. (js) (Entered: 04/05/2007)
04/16/2007	<u>102</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>89</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix G# <u>2</u> Exhibit 43# <u>3</u> Exhibit 44)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 04/16/2007)

04/16/2007	<u>103</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>89</u> MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix A)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 04/16/2007)
07/31/2007	<u>104</u>	OPINION AND ORDER # 94991 :Defendant Novartis Corporation's motion for summary judgment (Doc.# 7) is granted. As to the remaining defendants, plaintiffs have demonstrated that their proposed class and its representatives satisfy the requirements of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23(a) and 23(b). Accordingly, plaintiffs' motion for class certification (Doc. # 89) is granted. Amy Velez, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga, Michelle Williams, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Karen Liggins, Lori Horton, Holly Waters, Wendy Pinson, Roberta Vonlinter, Catherine White, Kelly Corbett, Jamie Holland, Joan Durkin, Simona Lopes, Maryanne Jacoby, and Marta Deyne are appointed as class representatives. The firm of Sanford, Wittels &Heisler, LLP, is appointed as lead counsel for the class. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 7/31/2007) (jmi) Modified on 8/3/2007 (rw). (Entered: 08/01/2007)
08/16/2007	<u>105</u>	AMENDED OPINION AND ORDER #94991, defendant Norvatis Corporation's motion for summary judgment (doc #7) is granted. As to the remaining defendants, plaintiffs have demonstrated that their proposed class and its representatives satisfy the requirements of FRCP 23(a) and 23(b). Accordingly, plaintiffs' motion for class certification (doc #89) is granted. Amy Velez, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Toerga, Michelle Williams, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Karen Liggins, Lori Horton, Holly Waters, Wendy Pinson, Roberta Vonlintel, Catherine White, Kelly Corbett, Jamie Holland, Joan Durkin, Simona Lopes, Maryanne Jacoby, and Marta Deyne are appointed as class representatives. The firm of Sanford, Wittels &Heisler, LLP, is appointed as lead counsel for the class. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 8/16/07) (cd) Modified on 8/21/2007 (Martin, Leslie). (Entered: 08/17/2007)
09/13/2007	<u>106</u>	RULE 26(f) DISCOVERY PLAN REPORT.Document filed by Michelle Williams, Thomas Ebeling, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 09/13/2007)
09/26/2007	<u>107</u>	REVISED CASE MANAGEMENT PLAN: The case is to be tried by a jury. Dispositive Motions due by 7/1/2008. Responses must be served by 8/4/2008, Replies must be served by 9/8/2008. All Fact Discovery due by 5/5/2008. Counsel do not consent to trial by a U.S. Magistrate Judge. Interim Status Conference set for 5/8/2008 at 10:00 AM before Judge Gerard E. Lynch. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 9/25/07) (tro) (Entered: 09/26/2007)
11/16/2007	<u>108</u>	ORDER: Accordingly, defendants' request that class counsel be prohibited from communicating with class members pending provision of formal notice is DENIED. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 11/16/07) (js) (Entered: 11/19/2007)
12/07/2007	<u>109</u>	NOTICE OF COURT APPROVAL OF CLASS CERTIFICATION OF SEX (FEMALE) DISCRIMINATION CLASS ACTION LAWSUIT AGAINST NOVARTIS: Procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of this action. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 12/4/07) (db) (Entered: 12/07/2007)
01/17/2008	<u>110</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Richard H. Schnadig dated 12/21/07 re: The parties request the following case management plan – Fact Discovery due 6/6/08; Plaintiffs Expert Reports due 7/7/08, Defendants due 8/8/08; Expert Depositions due 9/15/08; Dispositive Motions due 11/19/08, Oppositions due 12/19/08, replies due 1/15/09; and the Interim Status Conference adjourned until 6/13/08 at 11:30 a.m. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Discovery due by 6/6/2008. Status Conference set for 6/13/2008 at 11:30 AM in Courtroom 6B, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Gerard E. Lynch. Deposition due by 9/15/2008. Motions due by 11/19/2008. Responses due

		by 12/19/2008, Replies due by 1/15/2009.) (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 1/16/08) (db) (Entered: 01/17/2008)
01/28/2008	<u>111</u>	MANDATE of USCA (Certified Copy) USCA Case Number 07-3481-mv. Petitioners, through counsel move, pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23 (f), for leave to appeal the district court's order granting Respondents motion for class certification. Upon due consideration, it is hereby ORDERED that the petition is DENIED because an immediate appeal is unwarranted. See Sumitomo Copper Litig v. Credit Lyonnais Rouse, Ltd., 262 F. 3d 134, 139-40 (2d Cir. 2001). Catherine O'Hagan Wolfe, Clerk USCA. Issued As Mandate: 1/24/2008. (nd) (nd). (Entered: 01/28/2008)
01/28/2008		Transmission of USCA Mandate/Order to the District Judge re: <u>111</u> USCA Mandate Non-Dismissal,, (nd) (Entered: 01/28/2008)
03/24/2008	<u>112</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Richard H. Schnadig dated 3/17/08 re: Both parties join for the purpose of seeking a revision in Your Honor's Case Management Plan dated December 21, 2007. The revisions essentially postpone all critical dates by three months and the proposal is occasioned by two central circumstances. Fact discovery completed: 9/8/08. Plaintiffs' expert reports due 10/6/08. Defendant expert reports due 11/6/08. The parties shall appear for a status conference before the Court on September 18, 2008, at 2:00 p.m. Expert depositions to be completed by 12/15/08. Dispositive motions to be filed by 2/19/09. Oppositions to be filed by 3/19/09. Replies to be filed by 4/15/08. If this schedule is adopted, Your Honor may wish to reconsider whether we need to attend an interim status conference currently set for June 13, 2008 at 11:30 a.m. which is adjourned until September 18, 2008 at 2:00 p.m.. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 3/24/08) (js) (Entered: 03/25/2008)
03/24/2008	<u>113</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Richard Schnadig dated 3/17/08 re: Request for the schedule set below. ENDORSEMENT: So ordered, the parties shall appear for a status conference before the Court on 9/18/08, at 2pm. (Fact Discovery due by 9/8/2008. Status Conference set for 9/18/2008 at 02:00 PM before Judge Gerard E. Lynch. Dispositive Motions due by 2/19/2009. Responses due by 3/19/2009. Replies due by 4/15/2009.) (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 3/24/08) (cd) (Entered: 03/25/2008)
07/21/2008	<u>114</u>	MOTION for Elizabeth N. Hall to Appear Pro Hac Vice; w/ attch. Affidavit in support. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. Return Date set for 8/12/2008 at 10:00 AM.(pl) (Entered: 07/21/2008)
07/24/2008	<u>115</u>	ORDER granting <u>114</u> Motion for Elizabeth N. Hall to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 7/24/2008) (jpo) (Entered: 07/25/2008)
07/24/2008		Transmission to Attorney Admissions Clerk. Transmitted re: <u>115</u> Order on Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, to the Attorney Admissions Clerk for updating of Attorney Information. (jpo) (Entered: 07/25/2008)
07/28/2008		CASHIERS OFFICE REMARK on <u>115</u> Order on Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice in the amount of \$25.00, paid on 7/21/08, Receipt Number 657189. (Quintero, Marcos) (Entered: 07/28/2008)
07/29/2008	<u>116</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Richard Schnadig dated 7/22/08 re: Request to extend discovery to 10/17/08 and to adjourn the 9/18/08 status conference. ENDORSEMENT: So ordered, conference set for 10/24/08, at 11 am. (Discovery due by 10/17/2008. Status Conference reset for 10/24/2008 at 11:00 AM before Judge Gerard E. Lynch.) (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 7/29/08) (cd) (Entered: 07/29/2008)
08/08/2008	<u>117</u>	MOTION for Shayna Bloom to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(dle) (Entered: 08/12/2008)

08/08/2008	<u>118</u>	MOTION for Katherine M. Kimpel to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(dle) (Entered: 08/12/2008)
08/14/2008	<u>119</u>	ORDER ADMITTING ATTORNEY Elizabeth N. Hall PRO HAC VICE for defendant Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 8/14/08) (cd) (Entered: 08/15/2008)
08/14/2008		Transmission to Attorney Admissions Clerk. Transmitted re: <u>119</u> Order Admitting Attorney Pro Hac Vice, to the Attorney Admissions Clerk for updating of Attorney Information. (cd) (Entered: 08/15/2008)
08/18/2008	<u>120</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT granting <u>118</u> Motion for Katherine M. Kimpel to Appear Pro Hac Vice. ENDORSEMENT: Granted. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 8/15/08) (tro) (Entered: 08/18/2008)
08/18/2008	<u>121</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT granting <u>117</u> Motion for Shayna Bloom to Appear Pro Hac Vice. ENDORSEMENT: Granted. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 8/15/08) (tro) (Entered: 08/18/2008)
08/18/2008		Transmission to Attorney Admissions Clerk. Transmitted re: <u>120</u> Order on Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, <u>121</u> Order on Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, to the Attorney Admissions Clerk for updating of Attorney Information. (tro) (Entered: 08/18/2008)
08/19/2008		CASHIERS OFFICE REMARK on <u>117</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, <u>118</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, in the amount of \$50.00, paid on 8/11/08, Receipt Number 659506. (Quintero, Marcos) (Entered: 08/19/2008)
09/30/2008	<u>122</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from David Sanford dated 9/29/08 re: Counsel requests that the court approve the following schedule: Fact discovery completed: October 24, 2008; Status conference before Judge Lynch: October 24, 2008 at 11 a.m.; Plaintiffs expert reports due: November 17, 2008; Defendants expert reports due: December 19, 2008; Expert depositions to be completed: January 28, 2009; Dispositive motions to be filed: March 19, 2009; Oppositions to be filed: April 19, 2009; Replies to be filed: May 15, 2009. ENDORSEMENT: So ordered., (Deposition due by 1/28/2009., Discovery due by 10/24/2008., Motions due by 3/19/2009., Replies due by 5/15/2009., Responses due by 4/19/2009, Status Conference set for 10/24/2008 at 11:00 AM before Judge Gerard E. Lynch.) (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 9/30/08) (mme) (Entered: 09/30/2008)
10/23/2008	<u>123</u>	FILING ERROR – ELECTRONIC FILING FOR NON-ECF DOCUMENT (Stipulation and Order) – MOTION for Shayna Michelle Bloom to Withdraw as Attorney for Plaintiffs. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) Modified on 10/24/2008 (jar). (Entered: 10/23/2008)
10/23/2008		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – NON-ECF DOCUMENT ERROR. Note to Attorney David Sanford to E-MAIL Document No. <u>123</u> Stipulation and Order to judgments@nysd.uscourts.gov. This document is not filed via ECF. (jar) (Entered: 10/24/2008)
10/30/2008	<u>124</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER, For the reasons set forth in this stipulation and order, counsel for all parties respectfully stipulate that attorney Shayna Bloom should be allowed to withdraw from the above captioned case. Attorney Shayna Michelle Bloom terminated. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 10/30/08) (mme) (Entered: 10/30/2008)
10/31/2008	<u>125</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerald E. Lynch from David Sanford dated 10/10/2008 re: Requesting an informal conference pursuant to Local Civil Rule 37.2 preferably on 10/31/2008 at 11:00 a.m. when the Court has scheduled a status conference. ENDORSEMENT: There is no suggestion here that CEO Costa

		did anything to favor Moatazedi's career. To the extent that being selected for the ride—along with Costa extended to Moatazedi that was not made available to similarly situated women, the relevant person to depose is whoever selected Moatazedi ; there is no suggestion that that was Costa. Finally, that Costa signed a situated denial of plaintiffs claims gives no basis to conclude that he has any first hand knowledge of anything relevant to this case. There is thus no basis for deposing him. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 10/30/2008) (jpo) (Entered: 11/03/2008)
11/10/2008	<u>126</u>	ORDER that the trial in this case will begin on 10/5/09 at 9:30 a.m. Pretrial submissions shall be submitted by 8/31/09. The parties are reminded to review the Court's local rules and individual practices, which are available on the Internet at http://www.nysd.uscourts.gov , before preparing and filing any submissions. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 11/7/08) (dle) (Entered: 11/10/2008)
12/01/2008	<u>127</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Expert Reports</i> . Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 12/01/2008)
12/02/2008	<u>128</u>	AMENDED MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Expert Reports</i> . Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 12/02/2008)
12/10/2008	<u>129</u>	MEMO ENDORSED ON Plaintiffs' Amended Unopposed Motion for Seven Day Extension to Expert Report Deadlines as follows: the time for plaintiffs to serve its Expert Report is extended to and including 12/8/08 and the time for defendant Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation to file its Expert Report is extended to and including 1/16/09. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 12/8/08) (dle) (Entered: 12/11/2008)
02/25/2009	<u>130</u>	ORDER: 1. Expert depositions shall be completed by March 16, 2009; written damages discovery shall be served by April 3, 2009; damages discovery shall be completed by August 31, 2009. 2. Dispositive motions shall be served and filed by April 2, 2009; opposition papers shall be served and filed by April 30, 2009; reply papers, if any, shall be served and filed by May 22, 2009; and, 3. The parties shall appear before the Court for a post-discovery conference on Tuesday, June 30, 2009, at 11 :00 a.m. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 2/20/09) (js) (Entered: 02/25/2009)
03/31/2009	<u>131</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Richard H. Schnadig dated 3/31/2009 re: Counsel respectfully request permission to file a Memorandum of Law in support of NPC's dispositive motion in excess of 25 pages. Counsel estimates is will not exceed 29 pages. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 3/31/2009) (jfe) (Entered: 03/31/2009)
04/02/2009	<u>132</u>	FILING ERROR – WRONG EVENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU (Partial Summary Judgment) – MOTION for Summary Judgment (<i>Partial</i>). Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Schnadig, Richard) Modified on 4/3/2009 (jar). (Entered: 04/02/2009)
04/02/2009	<u>133</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>132</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment (<i>Partial</i>).. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Schnadig, Richard) Modified on 4/3/2009 (jar). (Entered: 04/02/2009)
04/02/2009	<u>134</u>	RULE 56.1 STATEMENT. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 04/02/2009)
04/02/2009	<u>135</u>	NOTICE of Of Filing re: <u>134</u> Rule 56.1 Statement. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 04/02/2009)

04/02/2009		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT - EVENT TYPE ERROR. Note to Attorney Richard Schnadig to RE-FILE Document <u>132</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment (<i>Partial</i>). Use the event type Partial Summary Judgment found under the event list Motions. (jar) (Entered: 04/03/2009)
04/02/2009		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT - DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Note to Attorney Richard Schnadig to RE-FILE Document <u>133</u> Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion. ERROR(S): A document cannot be linked to a filing error. Re-file and link to correctly re-filed motion. (jar) (Entered: 04/03/2009)
04/03/2009	<u>136</u>	MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 04/03/2009)
04/03/2009	<u>137</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>136</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 04/03/2009)
04/09/2009	<u>138</u>	STIPULATION OF DISMISSAL: Amy Velez, et al., hereby dismiss their claims against Thomas Ebeling without prejudice. Each party agrees that it will bear its own fees and costs associated with the case against Mr. Ebeling. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 4/9/09) (tro) (Entered: 04/09/2009)
04/28/2009	<u>139</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 04/28/2009)
04/30/2009	<u>140</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on PLAINTIFFS' UNOPPOSED MOTION FOR PLAINTIFFS' SEVEN DAY EXTENSION OF DISPOSITIVE MOTION BRIEFING SCHEDULE AND A FURTHER EXTENSION FOR DEFENDANT'S RESPONSE: The time for plaintiffs to serve its opposition brief in response to defendant's motion for partial summary judgment is extended to and including 5/7/2009 and the time for defendant NPC to file its reply brief in support of its motion for partial summary judgment is extended to and including 6/12/2009. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 4/30/2009) (jpo) Modified on 6/11/2009 (jpo). (Entered: 04/30/2009)
05/07/2009	<u>141</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>136</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 05/07/2009)
05/07/2009	<u>142</u>	AFFIDAVIT of Plaintiffs in Opposition re: <u>136</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 05/07/2009)
05/08/2009	<u>143</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from David Sanford dated 5/7/2009 re: Counsel writes to request that Your Honor allow Plaintiffs to file an Appendix to both their Memorandum in Opposition to Defendant Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation's Motion for Partial Summary Judgment and their Response to Defendant's Local Civil Rule 56.1 Statement manually with the Court. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 5/7/2009) (jfe) (Entered: 05/08/2009)
06/12/2009	<u>144</u>	MOTION to Strike <i>Plaintiffs' Response To Defendant's Local Civil Rule 56.1 Statement And Plaintiffs' Statement Of Additional Material Facts To Be Tried By A Fact Finder</i> . Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 06/12/2009)

06/12/2009	<u>145</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>144</u> MOTION to Strike <i>Plaintiffs' Response To Defendant's Local Civil Rule 56.1 Statement And Plaintiffs' Statement Of Additional Material Facts To Be Tried By A Fact Finder.</i> . Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 06/12/2009)
06/12/2009	<u>146</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY (See document #147) – REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>136</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Schnadig, Richard) Modified on 6/15/2009 (jar). (Entered: 06/12/2009)
06/12/2009	<u>147</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>136</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix Part 1, # <u>2</u> Appendix Part 2, # <u>3</u> Appendix Part 3, # <u>4</u> Appendix Part 4)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 06/12/2009)
06/12/2009	<u>148</u>	RESPONSE <i>To Plaintiff's Statement Of Additional Material Facts To Be Tried By A Factfinder.</i> Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 06/12/2009)
06/26/2009	<u>149</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>144</u> MOTION to Strike <i>Plaintiffs' Response To Defendant's Local Civil Rule 56.1 Statement And Plaintiffs' Statement Of Additional Material Facts To Be Tried By A Fact Finder.</i> . Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 06/26/2009)
07/14/2009	<u>150</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>144</u> MOTION to Strike <i>Plaintiffs' Response To Defendant's Local Civil Rule 56.1 Statement And Plaintiffs' Statement Of Additional Material Facts To Be Tried By A Fact Finder.</i> . Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 07/14/2009)
07/20/2009	<u>151</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Elizabeth N. Hall dated 7/14/2009 re: Requesting permission to file a reply memorandum of law in further support of NPC's motion to strike of 11 pages, instead of 10. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 7/20/2009) (jpo) (Entered: 07/20/2009)
07/22/2009	<u>152</u>	MOTION to Strike Document No. [Attachment 2 to Document No. 147]. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 07/22/2009)
07/22/2009	<u>153</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>152</u> MOTION to Strike Document No. [Attachment 2 to Document No. 147]. MOTION to Strike Document No. [Attachment 2 to Document No. 147].. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 07/22/2009)
07/23/2009	<u>154</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re: <u>152</u> MOTION to Strike Document No. [Attachment 2 to Document No. 147]. MOTION to Strike Document No. [Attachment 2 to Document No. 147].. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 07/23/2009)
07/29/2009	<u>155</u>	ORDER that the trial which was scheduled to begin on 10/5/09 is hereby adjourned indefinitely. The deadline for pretrial submissions, which was 8/31/09, is accordingly also adjourned indefinitely. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 7/28/09) (cd) (Entered: 07/29/2009)
08/04/2009	<u>156</u>	MOTION to Expedite <i>Review of Defendant's Summary Judgment Motion and Other Attendant Motions.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes,

		Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 08/04/2009)
08/04/2009	<u>157</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>156</u> MOTION to Expedite <i>Review of Defendant's Summary Judgment Motion and Other Attendant Motions.</i> . Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 08/04/2009)
08/11/2009	<u>158</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Richard H. Schnadig dated 8/7/2009 re: Counsel writes on behalf of both parties to obtain minor clarification and modification of the 7/29/2009 Order: (1) The cutoff date for damage discovery is currently 8/31/2009. The parties have agreed to propose a new date of 12/31/2009; (2) Some additional witnesses have been disclosed by both parties with attendant document production, the parties propose a new merits cutoff date of 12/31/2009. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 8/10/2009) (tve) (Entered: 08/11/2009)
09/11/2009	<u>159</u>	FILING ERROR – ELECTRONIC FILING FOR NON-ECF DOCUMENT (Stipulation) – MOTION for Angela M. Corridan to Withdraw as Attorney. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) Modified on 9/14/2009 (jar). (Entered: 09/11/2009)
09/11/2009	<u>160</u>	FILING ERROR – ELECTRONIC FILING FOR NON-ECF DOCUMENT (Stipulation) – CONSENT MOTION to Dismiss <i>Claims of Ashley Narmour with Prejudice</i> . Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) Modified on 9/14/2009 (jar). (Entered: 09/11/2009)
09/11/2009	<u>161</u>	FILING ERROR – ELECTRONIC FILING FOR NON-ECF DOCUMENT (Stipulation) – CONSENT MOTION to Dismiss <i>Claims of Sue Earl with Prejudice</i> . Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) Modified on 9/14/2009 (jar). (Entered: 09/11/2009)
09/11/2009		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – NON-ECF DOCUMENT ERROR. Note to Attorney David Sanford to E-MAIL Document No. <u>159</u> Stipulation and Order to judgments@nysd.uscourts.gov. This document is not filed via ECF. (jar) (Entered: 09/14/2009)
09/11/2009		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – NON-ECF DOCUMENT ERROR. Note to Attorney David Sanford to E-MAIL Document No. <u>160</u> Stipulation of Dismissal to judgments@nysd.uscourts.gov. This document is not filed via ECF. (jar) (Entered: 09/14/2009)
09/11/2009		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – NON-ECF DOCUMENT ERROR. Note to Attorney David Sanford to E-MAIL Document No. <u>161</u> Stipulation of Dismissal to judgments@nysd.uscourts.gov. This document is not filed via ECF. (jar) (Entered: 09/14/2009)
09/17/2009	<u>162</u>	STIPULATION OF DISMISSAL: The Class Representative Sue Earl hereby dismisses her claims with prejudice against Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 9/16/09) (tro) (Entered: 09/17/2009)
09/17/2009	<u>163</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER: Attorney Angela M. Corridan should be allowed to withdraw as Counsel for Plaintiffs for the following reasons: Defendant consents to said withdrawal; Mr. Corridan has left the firm of Sanford Wittels and Heisler,

		LLP, which continues to represent Plaintiffs in this matter; Attorney David W. Sanford of Sanford Wittels & Heisler, LLP continues to serve as lead counsel for Plaintiffs; Plaintiff will not be prejudiced in any way by the granting of this motion. Attorney Angela Corridan terminated. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 9/16/09) (tro) (Entered: 09/17/2009)
09/17/2009	<u>164</u>	STIPULATION OF DISMISSAL: The Class Representative Ashely Narmour hereby dismisses her claims with prejudice against Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 9/16/09) (tro) (Entered: 09/17/2009)
10/01/2009	<u>165</u>	NOTICE OF CASE REASSIGNMENT to Judge Colleen McMahon. Judge Gerard E. Lynch is no longer assigned to the case. (ldi) (Entered: 10/02/2009)
10/08/2009	<u>166</u>	MOTION to Withdraw <i>Their Motion for Expedited Review</i> . Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 10/08/2009)
10/09/2009	<u>167</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on PLAINTIFF'S NOTICE OF WITHDRAWAL OF THEIR MOTION FOR EXPEDITED REVIEW. ENDORSEMENT: The motion is withdrawn. Do not ever file such a motion again. However, I am already reviewing your papers. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 10/9/2009) (jpo) (Entered: 10/09/2009)
10/13/2009	<u>168</u>	MOTION to Stay re: <u>142</u> Affidavit in Opposition to Motion, <u>154</u> Response to Motion, <u>150</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>147</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>149</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion., <u>144</u> MOTION to Strike <i>Plaintiffs' Response To Defendant's Local Civil Rule 56.1 Statement And Plaintiffs' Statement Of Additional Material Facts To Be Tried By A Fact Finder.</i> , <u>148</u> Response, <u>153</u> Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>145</u> Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>152</u> MOTION to Strike Document No. [Attachment 2 to Document No. 147]. MOTION to Strike Document No. [Attachment 2 to Document No. 147]., <u>141</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion, <u>134</u> Rule 56.1 Statement, <u>137</u> Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>135</u> Notice (Other). Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 10/13/2009)
10/13/2009	<u>169</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>168</u> MOTION to Stay re: <u>142</u> Affidavit in Opposition to Motion, <u>154</u> Response to Motion, <u>150</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>147</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>149</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion., <u>144</u> MOTI MOTION to Stay re: <u>142</u> Affidavit in Opposition to Motion, <u>154</u> Response to Motion, <u>150</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>147</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>149</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion., <u>144</u> MOTI MOTION to Stay re: <u>142</u> Affidavit in Opposition to Motion, <u>154</u> Response to Motion, <u>150</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>147</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>149</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion., <u>144</u> MOTI MOTION to Stay re: <u>142</u> Affidavit in Opposition to Motion, <u>154</u> Response to Motion, <u>150</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>147</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>149</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion., <u>144</u> MOTI MOTION to Stay re: <u>142</u> Affidavit in Opposition to Motion, <u>154</u> Response to Motion, <u>150</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>147</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>149</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion., <u>144</u> MOTI. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 10/13/2009)

10/13/2009	<u>170</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Colleen McMahon from Richard H. Schnadig dated 10/13/09 re: Counsel write on behalf of both parties write to update the court of the case's current status, more importantly the parties seek a status conference as soon as convenient to, among other things, obtain a revised scheduling order and to possibly p. ENDORSEMENT: Conference; Wednesday, Oct. 21, 2009 at 2:30 pm. I am happy to convene a conference but (1) I will not extend the discovery deadline (2) Your "new" witnesses are already more than I will allow for the entire trial. Get used to the new ball game. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 10/13/09) (tro) (Entered: 10/13/2009)
10/15/2009	<u>171</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re: <u>168</u> MOTION to Stay re: <u>142</u> Affidavit in Opposition to Motion, <u>154</u> Response to Motion, <u>150</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>147</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>149</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion, <u>144</u> MOTI MOTION to Stay re: <u>142</u> Affidavit in Opposition to Motion, <u>154</u> Response to Motion, <u>150</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>147</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>149</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion, <u>144</u> MOTI MOTION to Stay re: <u>142</u> Affidavit in Opposition to Motion, <u>154</u> Response to Motion, <u>150</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>147</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>149</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion, <u>144</u> MOTI MOTION to Stay re: <u>142</u> Affidavit in Opposition to Motion, <u>154</u> Response to Motion, <u>150</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>147</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>149</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion, <u>144</u> MOTI MOTION to Stay re: <u>142</u> Affidavit in Opposition to Motion, <u>154</u> Response to Motion, <u>150</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>147</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>149</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion, <u>144</u> MOTI. Document filed by Novartis Corporation. (Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 10/15/2009)
10/15/2009	<u>172</u>	MOTION for Katherine Leong to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(dle) Modified on 10/16/2009 (dle). (Entered: 10/16/2009)
10/19/2009	<u>173</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>168</u> MOTION to Stay re: <u>142</u> Affidavit in Opposition to Motion, <u>154</u> Response to Motion, <u>150</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>147</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>149</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion, <u>144</u> MOTI MOTION to Stay re: <u>142</u> Affidavit in Opposition to Motion, <u>154</u> Response to Motion, <u>150</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>147</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>149</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion, <u>144</u> MOTI MOTION to Stay re: <u>142</u> Affidavit in Opposition to Motion, <u>154</u> Response to Motion, <u>150</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>147</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>149</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion, <u>144</u> MOTI MOTION to Stay re: <u>142</u> Affidavit in Opposition to Motion, <u>154</u> Response to Motion, <u>150</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>147</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>149</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion, <u>144</u> MOTI MOTION to Stay re: <u>142</u> Affidavit in Opposition to Motion, <u>154</u> Response to Motion, <u>150</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>147</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>149</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion, <u>144</u> MOTI. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 10/19/2009)
10/20/2009		CASHIERS OFFICE REMARK on <u>172</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, in the amount of \$25.00, paid on 10/15/2009, Receipt Number 702850. (jd) (Entered: 10/20/2009)
10/20/2009	<u>174</u>	MEMORANDUM DECISION AND ORDER (1) DISMISSING CLASS-WIDE CLAIMS WITH RESPECT TO PROMOTIONS WITHIN THE SALES FORCE

		("LEVELING" PROMOTIONS); (2) DENYING DEFENDANT'S MOTION TO STRIKE PLAINTIFFS' RULE 56.1 STATEMENT; (3) GRANTING PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO STRIKE EXHIBIT D TO DEFENDANT'S REPLY BRIEF; (4) DENYING DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT DISMISSING THE CLASS CLAIMS WITH RESPECT TO PAY DISCRIMINATION AND PREGNANCY DISCRIMINATION REGARDING PROMOTIONS AND WORKING CONDITIONS; AND (5) DENYING AS MOOT PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO SUSPEND CONSIDERATION OF DEFENDANT'S MOTION FOR PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT: The motion for partial summary judgment is denied. Plaintiffs' motion to suspend consideration of that motion is therefore denied as moot. The Clerk of the Court is directed to close out the motions at Docket Nos. 136, 144,152 and 168. This constitutes the opinion and order of the Court. BY ECF TO ALL COUNSEL (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 10/20/2009) (jmi) (Entered: 10/21/2009)
10/20/2009	<u>175</u>	ORDER granting <u>172</u> Motion for Katherine Leong to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Sue Earl, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Ashley Narmour, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 10/20/2009) (jmi) (Entered: 10/21/2009)
10/21/2009		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Colleen McMahon: Scheduling Conference held on 10/21/2009. All discovery must be completed by 12/31/09, as per Judge Lynch's 8/11/09 order. Both parties may continue to take depositions until 12/31/09. Any discovery disputes will be referred to a magistrate judge. Final joint pretrial order must be prepared in accordance with Judge McMahon's Individual practices and filed on 1/29/10. Final pretrial conference and trial date to be scheduled. Trial will be 5 weeks, not longer. Trial will not be bifurcated. (mro) (Entered: 11/02/2009)
10/22/2009	<u>176</u>	ORDER FOR ADMISSION PRO HAC VICE ON WRITTEN MOTION: Katherine Leong is admitted to practice pro hac vice as counsel for plaintiffs in this case in the USDC for the SDNY. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 10/21/09) (dle) (Entered: 10/22/2009)
10/22/2009		Transmission to Attorney Admissions Clerk. Transmitted re: <u>176</u> Order Admitting Attorney Pro Hac Vice, to the Attorney Admissions Clerk for updating of Attorney Information. (dle) (Entered: 10/22/2009)
10/22/2009	<u>177</u>	LETTER addressed to All Counsel in Velez v. Novartis (04 Civ. 9194) (CM) from Judge Colleen McMahon dated 10/22/2009 re: Mindful of our mutual scheduling problems, I consulted my clerks and my calendar yesterday after our conference. I am setting the following trial schedule: Pretrial Order In Limine Motions Due January 29, 2010. Final Pretrial Conference is on February 24 – 25, 2010 and Jury Selection and Trial on April 7, 2010. (jpo) (Entered: 10/22/2009)
10/22/2009		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Motions due by 1/29/2010. Pretrial Order due by 1/29/2010. (jpo) (Entered: 10/22/2009)
11/12/2009	<u>178</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Frank Maas from Richard H. Schnadig dated 11/5/09 re: lead counsel for Novartis write to inform you of a dispute over Plaintiffs' belated and recent designation of two additional expert witnesses after the deadline for completion of expert discovery and to request a conference to resolve this dispute if the court determines a conference to be appropriate. A brief, informal conference between counsel failed to resolve the issue. ENDORSEMENT: So far as I am concerned, plaintiff still has time to designate experts—or had time when it designated these witnesses. If Defendants find it necessary to designate new expert in response, be my guest just get the report in by December. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 11/10/09) (pl) (Entered: 11/13/2009)
12/15/2009	<u>179</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Colleen McMahon from David Sanford dated 12/14/2009 re: the parties wish to depose Dr. Outtz on 1/14/2010. ENDORSEMENT: OK – no problem – take the time necessary. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 12/14/2009) (jar) (Entered: 12/15/2009)

12/21/2009	<u>180</u>	MOTION for Sanctions <i>and to Strike Witnesses Contacted by Defendant in Violation of New York Rule of Professional Conduct 4.2</i> . Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 12/21/2009)
12/21/2009	<u>181</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>180</u> MOTION for Sanctions <i>and to Strike Witnesses Contacted by Defendant in Violation of New York Rule of Professional Conduct 4.2</i> .. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1: Sanford Declaration, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2-Velez EEOC Charge, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3-Correspondence Regarding Jennifer Blum, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4-R. Schnadig's Letter of 9-15-09, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5-Siegel Declaration, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6-Tsai Transcript, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7-Schneider-Falk Transcript, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8-Durkin EEOC Charge, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9-Plaintiffs' Initial Disclosures, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10-Defendant's Initial Disclosures, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 11-T. Abram Letter of 12-7-09, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 12: Beale Transcript, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 13: Beale 2003 Annual Performance Review, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 14-Goetz Resume, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 15-Goetz Transcript)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 12/21/2009)
01/04/2010	<u>182</u>	OPPOSITION BRIEF <i>TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR SANCTIONS AND TO STRIKE WITNESSES CONTACTED BY DEFENDANT IN VIOLATION OF NEW YORK RULE OF PROFESSIONAL CONDUCT 4.2</i> . Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G - Part 1, # <u>8</u> Exhibit G - Part 2, # <u>9</u> Exhibit Part 3, # <u>10</u> Exhibit G - Part 4)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/04/2010)
01/07/2010	<u>183</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>180</u> MOTION for Sanctions <i>and to Strike Witnesses Contacted by Defendant in Violation of New York Rule of Professional Conduct 4.2</i> .. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 - Sanford Declaration, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 - Blum Deposition Excerpt)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/07/2010)
01/08/2010	<u>184</u>	LETTER addressed to All Counsel in Velez v. Novartis from Judge Colleen McMahon dated 1/7/2010. re: Demonstratives may abide the final pretrial conference; they do not need to be created now. But they must be shown to your opponent before I will let the jury see them. 2. You can use electronic demonstratives in closing, not in opening. Deposition designations, objections thereto and counter-designations and objections thereto are all part of the Pre-Trial Order. Please understand that Plaintiffs will have time for a rebuttal case without reserving it-that is, the party with the burden of proof can put on a rebuttal case without counting it toward the eight trial days-but I will have to have a proffer on any proposed rebuttal evidence and will disallow it if it is not truly rebuttal. No more than think lots of deposition testimony is a waste of time and energy at a jury trial-but it is your call. Counts against your time. And please remember: no deposition testimony will be admitted from witnesses who testify (it ends up being duplicative, you can use inconsistent statements to impeach) or from witnesses who are within the court's subpoena power (I enforce this rules strictly, since I disfavor testimony by deposition at a trial). I do not sit on Fridays. We start as soon as I have all the jurors in the morning, but that is generally 9:45. I give one hour for lunch and I take a short break in the morning and in the afternoon. We end between 4:30 and 5 PM. The five weeks takes into account that Friday is my calendar day. This means your two weeks is a total of eight trial days. All other provisions as set forth in this letter. (js) (Entered: 01/08/2010)
01/14/2010	<u>185</u>	MOTION for Felicia M. Medina to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton,

		Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(mbe) (Entered: 01/20/2010)
01/22/2010	<u>186</u>	ORDER FOR ADMISSION PRO HAC VICE ON WRITTEN MOTION granting <u>185</u> Motion for Felicia Medina to Appear Pro Hac Vice for plaintiffs.. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 1/22/10) (cd) (Entered: 01/22/2010)
01/22/2010		Transmission to Attorney Admissions Clerk. Transmitted re: <u>186</u> Order on Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, to the Attorney Admissions Clerk for updating of Attorney Information. (cd) (Entered: 01/22/2010)
01/26/2010	<u>187</u>	ORDER denying <u>180</u> Motion for Sanctions. Plaintiffs' motion for sanctions and to strike the testimony of Ms. Tsai is denied. The parties would be well-advised to focus on preparing for trial and stop wasting their time and the Court's time with motions like this. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 1/25/2010) BY ECF TO ALL COUNSEL.(jmi) (Entered: 01/26/2010)
01/27/2010		CASHIERS OFFICE REMARK on <u>185</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, in the amount of \$25.00, paid on 01/14/2010, Receipt Number 892098. (jd) (Entered: 01/27/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>188</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Evidence And Testimony Concerning Events Which Allegedly Occured After The Close Of The Class Period</i> . Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Schnadig, Richard) Modified on 2/1/2010 (db). (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>189</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>188</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Evidence And Testimony Concerning Events Which Allegedly Occured After The Close Of The Class Period</i> . Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Schnadig, Richard) Modified on 2/1/2010 (db). (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>190</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Evidence And Testimony Concerning Events Which Allegedly Occured After The Close Of The Class Period</i> . Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>191</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>190</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Evidence And Testimony Concerning Events Which Allegedly Occured After The Close Of The Class Period</i> .. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>192</u>	PROPOSED VOIR DIRE QUESTIONS. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>193</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Plaintiffs' Evidence Of Defendant's Financial Condition Or Size To Support Their Claim On The Merits</i> . Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>194</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>193</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Plaintiffs' Evidence Of Defendant's Financial Condition Or Size To Support Their Claim On The Merits</i> .. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>195</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Defendant from Offering Evidence or Argument about Witnesses' Involvement in Unrelated Lawsuits</i> . Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>196</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>195</u> MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Defendant from Offering Evidence or Argument about Witnesses' Involvement in Unrelated Lawsuits</i> .. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider

		Tobertga. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>197</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>To Bar Certain Plaintiff Expert Testimony</i> . Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>198</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>197</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Bar Certain Plaintiff Expert Testimony</i> .. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>199</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>To Bar The Report And Testimony Of Plaintiffs' expert Deborah L. Rhode</i> . Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>200</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>199</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Bar The Report And Testimony Of Plaintiffs' expert Deborah L. Rhode</i> .. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>201</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Evidence And Testimony Evidence Regarding Discrimination Claims By Non-Class Members Against NPC Managers Simmons And Duhart And An Assault Claim By A Class Member Claim Against Joe Colonello</i> . Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>202</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>201</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Evidence And Testimony Evidence Regarding Discrimination Claims By Non-Class Members Against NPC Managers Simmons And Duhart And An Assault Claim By A Class Member Claim Against Joe Colonello</i> .. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>203</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Evidence And Testimony Concerning Alleged Harassing Or Disparaging Comments By Coworker Bob Lloyd</i> . Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>204</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>203</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Evidence And Testimony Concerning Alleged Harassing Or Disparaging Comments By Coworker Bob Lloyd</i> .. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>205</u>	PROPOSED VOIR DIRE QUESTIONS. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>206</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Evidence And Testimony Evidence Regarding Marjorie Salame's Sexual Assault</i> . Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>207</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>206</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Evidence And Testimony Evidence Regarding Marjorie Salame's Sexual Assault</i> .. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>208</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Unfounded Evidence Regarding Human Resources' Response To Complaints</i> . Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>209</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>208</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Unfounded Evidence Regarding Human Resources' Response To Complaints</i> .. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>210</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Evidence Of Alleged Discrimination Other Than Certified Claims</i> . Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical

		Corporation.(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>211</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>210</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Evidence Of Alleged Discrimination Other Than Certified Claims..</i> Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>212</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Documents And Testimony Concerning Internal Complaints Of Discrimination, Harassment Or Hostile Work Environment Regarding Non-Testifying Witnesses.</i> Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>213</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Evidence or Argument About After Acquired Evidence.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>214</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>213</u> MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Evidence or Argument About After Acquired Evidence..</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>215</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>212</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Documents And Testimony Concerning Internal Complaints Of Discrimination, Harassment Or Hostile Work Environment Regarding Non-Testifying Witnesses..</i> Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix Part 1, # <u>2</u> Appendix Part 2, # <u>3</u> Appendix Part 3, # <u>4</u> Appendix Part 4, # <u>5</u> Appendix Part 5, # <u>6</u> Appendix Part 6)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>216</u>	REQUEST TO CHARGE. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>217</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Testimony and Evidence of Plaintiff Terri Kelly's Family and Medical History.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>218</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>217</u> MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Testimony and Evidence of Plaintiff Terri Kelly's Family and Medical History..</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>219</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Defendant Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation from Offering Evidence or Making Argument About Statements Made to Prospective Employers.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>220</u>	PRETRIAL MEMORANDUM. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order Part 1, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order Part 2, # <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order Part 3)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>221</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>219</u> MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Defendant Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation from Offering Evidence or</i>

		<i>Making Argument About Statements Made to Prospective Employers..</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 – T. Blum Candidate Screening, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 – R. Ryan Job Application)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>222</u>	MOTION to Withdraw <u>189</u> Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>190</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Evidence And Testimony Concerning Events Which Allegedly Occured After The Close Of The Class Period.</i> , <u>191</u> Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>188</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Evidence And Testimony Concerning Events Which Allegedly Occured After The Close Of The Class Period.</i> Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>223</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Evidence And Testimony Concerning Events Which Allegedly Ocurred After The Close Of The Class Period.</i> Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>224</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>223</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Evidence And Testimony Concerning Events Which Allegedly Occurred After The Close Of The Class Period.</i> Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>225</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude the Testimony of Dr. Kevin Murphy.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>226</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>225</u> MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude the Testimony of Dr. Kevin Murphy.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A – Order of 11-12-09, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B – Endorsed Letter of 8-11-09, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C – Letter to the Court of 10-29-09, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D – Letter to the Court of 11-5-09, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E – Letter to the Court of 11-10-09, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F – Letter to the Court of 12-14-09, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G – Order of 12-15-09, # <u>8</u> Exhibit H – Letter from Defense Counsel to Plaintiffs' Counsel of 12-18-09, # <u>9</u> Errata I – Sanford Declaration, # <u>10</u> Exhibit J – Letter from Defense Counsel to Plaintiffs' Counsel of 1-7-10, # <u>11</u> Exhibit K – Correspondence from Plaintiffs' Counsel to Defense Counsel of 1-7-10, # <u>12</u> Exhibit L – Correspondence from Defense Counsel to Plaintiffs' Counsel 1-14-10, # <u>13</u> Exhibit M – Correspondence from Plaintiffs' Counsel to Defense Counsel 1-15-10, # <u>14</u> Exhibit N – Correspondence Between the Parties 1-19-10)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>227</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Hearsay And Evidence Lacking Foundation.</i> Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>228</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>227</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Hearsay And Evidence Lacking Foundation.</i> Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix, # <u>2</u> Supplement Part 1, # <u>3</u> Supplement Part 2, # <u>4</u> Supplement Part 3, # <u>5</u> Supplement Part 4, # <u>6</u> Supplement Part 5, # <u>7</u> Supplement Part 6, # <u>8</u> Supplement Part 7, # <u>9</u> Supplement Part 8, # <u>10</u> Supplement Part 9)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>229</u>	AMENDED MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Defendant from Offering Evidence or Argument About Witnesses' Involvement in Unrelated Lawsuits.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer

		Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>230</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>229</u> AMENDED MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Defendant from Offering Evidence or Argument About Witnesses' Involvement in Unrelated Lawsuits.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 – Salame Deposition Excerpts, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 – Stark Deposition Excerpts, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3 – Corbett Deposition Excerpts)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>231</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Unverified Interrogatory Responses.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>232</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>231</u> MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Unverified Interrogatory Responses.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>233</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Defendant from Introducing Evidence or Making Any Argument Based on Plaintiffs' Decision Not to Call Certain Class Representatives and Class Members at Trial.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>234</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>233</u> MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Defendant from Introducing Evidence or Making Any Argument Based on Plaintiffs' Decision Not to Call Certain Class Representatives and Class Members at Trial.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>235</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Evidence or Argument About Internal Investigations of Barbara Stark and Terri Kelly.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>236</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>235</u> MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Evidence or Argument About Internal Investigations of Barbara Stark and Terri Kelly.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 – Counter–Exhibits, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 – Stark Deposition Excerpts, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3 – Kelly Deposition Excerpts, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4 – NPCX 003081413)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>237</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Defendant Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation from Offering Evidence or Making Argument About Irrelevant and Prejudicial Personal Information of Plaintiffs.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff,

		Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>238</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>237</u> MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Defendant Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation from Offering Evidence or Making Argument About Irrelevant and Prejudicial Personal Information of Plaintiffs.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 – Borsia Deposition Excerpts, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 – Corbett Deposition Excerpts, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3 – Spring Deposition Excerpts, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4 – CafePharma Posting, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5 – Holland Deposition Excerpts, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6 – E-mail of 5-21-07, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7 – Stark Deposition Excerpts)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>239</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Cross-Examination or Argument About Claims Not Pursued by Class Representative Kelly Corbett.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>240</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>239</u> MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Cross-Examination or Argument About Claims Not Pursued by Class Representative Kelly Corbett.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 – Counter-Designations)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>241</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude the Testimony of Dr. Kevin Murphy.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>242</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>241</u> MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude the Testimony of Dr. Kevin Murphy.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 13, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 14, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 16, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 17, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 18, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 19)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/29/2010	<u>243</u>	PROPOSED JURY INSTRUCTIONS. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/29/2010)
01/31/2010	<u>244</u>	MOTION to Withdraw <i>Docket Nos. 195-196 and 225-226.</i> , MOTION to Amend/Correct <i>Docket No. 242.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/31/2010)
01/31/2010	<u>245</u>	AMENDED MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>241</u> MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude the Testimony of Dr. Kevin Murphy.</i> Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni

		Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 13, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 14, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 16, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 17, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 18, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 19)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 01/31/2010)
02/01/2010	<u>246</u>	MOTION for Sharon Eubanks to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(mro) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	<u>247</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>213</u> MOTION in Limine to Preclude Evidence or Argument About After Acquired Evidence.. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	<u>248</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>217</u> MOTION in Limine to Preclude Testimony and Evidence of Plaintiff Terri Kelly's Family and Medical History.. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	<u>249</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>233</u> MOTION in Limine to Preclude Defendant from Introducing Evidence or Making Any Argument Based on Plaintiffs' Decision Not to Call Certain Class Representatives and Class Members at Trial.. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	<u>250</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>235</u> MOTION in Limine to Preclude Evidence or Argument About Internal Investigations of Barbara Stark and Terri Kelly.. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	<u>251</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>208</u> MOTION in Limine To Exclude Unfounded Evidence Regarding Human Resources' Response To Complaints.. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	<u>252</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>201</u> MOTION in Limine To Exclude Evidence And Testimony Evidence Regarding Discrimination Claims By Non-Class Members Against NPC Managers Simmons And Duhart And An Assault Claim By A Class Member Claim Against Joe Colonello.. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	<u>253</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>219</u> MOTION in Limine to Preclude Defendant Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation from Offering Evidence or Making Argument About Statements Made to Prospective Employers.. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	<u>254</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>229</u> AMENDED MOTION in Limine to Preclude Defendant from Offering Evidence or Argument About Witnesses' Involvement in Unrelated Lawsuits.. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	<u>255</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>206</u> MOTION in Limine To Exclude Evidence And Testimony Evidence Regarding Marjorie Salame's Sexual Assault.. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan

		Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G, # <u>8</u> Exhibit H, # <u>9</u> Exhibit I, # <u>10</u> Exhibit J)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	<u>256</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>239</u> MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude Cross-Examination or Argument About Claims Not Pursued by Class Representative Kelly Corbett</i> .. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	<u>257</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>212</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Documents And Testimony Concerning Internal Complaints Of Discrimination, Harassment Or Hostile Work Environment Regarding Non-Testifying Witnesses</i> .. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	<u>258</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>241</u> MOTION in Limine <i>to Preclude the Testimony of Dr. Kevin Murphy</i> .. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	<u>259</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>193</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Plaintiffs' Evidence Of Defendant's Financial Condition Or Size To Support Their Claim On The Merits</i> .. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	<u>260</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>190</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Evidence And Testimony Concerning Events Which Allegedly Occured After The Close Of The Class Period</i> .. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	<u>261</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>210</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Evidence Of Alleged Discrimination Other Than Certified Claims</i> .. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	<u>262</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>203</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Evidence And Testimony Concerning Alleged Harassing Or Disparaging Comments By Coworker Bob Lloyd</i> .. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	<u>263</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>197</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Bar Certain Plaintiff Expert Testimony</i> .. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff,

		Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit B, # <u>2</u> Exhibit C, # <u>3</u> Exhibit D, # <u>4</u> Exhibit E)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	<u>264</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>199</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Bar The Report And Testimony Of Plaintiffs' expert Deborah L. Rhode.</i> . Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	<u>265</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>227</u> MOTION in Limine <i>To Exclude Hearsay And Evidence Lacking Foundation.</i> . Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/04/2010		CASHIERS OFFICE REMARK on <u>246</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, in the amount of \$25.00, paid on 02/01/2010, Receipt Number 893431. (jd) (Entered: 02/04/2010)
02/04/2010	<u>266</u>	ORDER FOR ADMISSION PRO HAC VICE ON WRITTEN MOTION: granting <u>246</u> Motion for Sharon Eubanks to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 2/4/2010) (tve) (Entered: 02/04/2010)
02/04/2010	<u>267</u>	AMENDED CALENDAR NOTICE: Final Pretrial Conference set for 3/23/2010 at 09:30 AM in Courtroom 14C, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Colleen McMahon. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 2/4/2010) (tve) (Entered: 02/04/2010)
02/11/2010	<u>268</u>	MEMORANDUM ENDORSEMENT re: DEFENDANT'S MOTION TO WITHDRAW NON-CONFORMING DOCUMENTS AND SUBSTITUTE CONFORMING DOCUMENTS: ORDER granting <u>222</u> Motion to Withdraw. ENDORSEMENT: Fine. Granted. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 2/11/10) (db) (Entered: 02/11/2010)
02/11/2010	<u>269</u>	MEMORANDUM ENDORSEMENT re: PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO WITHDRAW DOCKET NOS. 195-196 AND 225-226 AND TO AMEND DOCKET NO. 242. ORDER granting <u>244</u> Motion to Withdraw ; granting <u>244</u> Motion to Amend/Correct. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 2/11/10) (db) (Entered: 02/11/2010)
02/25/2010	<u>270</u>	RULINGS ON MOTIONS IN LIMINE, regarding the Court's, rulings on the motions in limine, that have been resolved in the manner that is set forth in this Order. This disposes of all pending in limine motions. The Clerk of the Court is directed to mark the following motions "decided" and remove them from the Court's docket: Docket Nos. 193, 197, 199,201,203,206,208,210,212,213,217,219,223,227,229,231,233,235,237,239 and 241. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 2/25/10) By ECF To All Parties..(pl) (Entered: 02/25/2010)
03/16/2010	<u>271</u>	MOTION for Amy L. Bess to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(mro) (Entered: 03/18/2010)
03/17/2010	<u>272</u>	ORDER granting <u>271</u> Motion for Amy L. Bess to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 3/17/2010) (jmi) (Entered: 03/18/2010)
03/19/2010		CASHIERS OFFICE REMARK on <u>271</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice in the amount of \$25.00, paid on 03/16/2010, Receipt Number 897078. (jd) (Entered: 03/19/2010)
03/19/2010	<u>273</u>	ORDER: I hereby authorize the following attorneys(s) (see order) to bring the General Purpose Computing Device(s) into the Courthouse for use in the trial or proceeding in the above captioned action, which is anticipated to begin on

		3/23/2010 and conclude on 3/24/2010. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 3/18/2010) (jar) (Entered: 03/19/2010)
03/19/2010	<u>274</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Colleen McMahon from David W. Sanford dated 3/19/2010 re: request that the Court excuse one of the Plaintiffs' trial counsel, Steven Wittels, from appearing at next week's pre-trial conference of 3/23-24/2010. ENDORSEMENT: Request granted. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 3/19/2010) (jar) (Entered: 03/19/2010)
03/22/2010	<u>275</u>	NOTICE TO PARTIES: I will give defendant a total of four hours to interpose and argue objections to the plaintiffs' proposed exhibits. The four hours includes time that plaintiffs' counsel spends opposing the objections. At the end of four hours of dealing with plaintiffs' exhibits, every item we have not yet discussed will be admitted. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 3/22/2010) (jar) (Entered: 03/22/2010)
03/23/2010		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Colleen McMahon: Final Pretrial Conference held on 3/23/2010. Decision: Final Pretrial conference held. Proposed trial exhibits ruled upon. Jury selection to commence April 7. (Submitted by George Turner). (Court Reporter Steve). (mde) (Entered: 03/24/2010)
03/23/2010		Set/Reset Hearings: Jury Selection set for 4/7/2010 at 9:30AM before Judge Colleen McMahon. (mde) (Entered: 03/24/2010)
03/25/2010	<u>276</u>	NOTICE TO PARTIES, that at the final pretrial conference, I said that we would not be sitting on Monday, April 12, but I had my dates wrong. My commitment is on Tuesday, April 13, not Monday, April 12. So, the day on which nothing will happen is Tuesday, April 13. We will be in session on Monday, April 12. Everything else that I said at the final pretrial conference about the schedule of trial proceedings remains in effect. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 3/25/10) By ECF TO ALL COUNSEL.(pl) (Entered: 03/25/2010)
03/29/2010	<u>277</u>	TRIAL BRIEF <i>Regarding Disparate Impact and Treatment, Back and Front Pay and Compensatory Damages</i> . Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 03/29/2010)
03/29/2010	<u>278</u>	TRIAL BRIEF <i>on Trial Management Plan</i> . Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 03/29/2010)
03/30/2010	279	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on March 23, 2010 at 10:00 am before Judge Colleen McMahon. (eef) (Entered: 03/30/2010)
03/31/2010	<u>280</u>	ORDER CONCERNING TRIAL PROCEDURE: The Court is relieved to see that we are finally all on the same page (more or less) concerning what gets tried to the Court and what gets tried to the jury. Everyone now agrees that we will submit the issues of disparate treatment (pattern or practice discrimination), compensatory damages for the testifying named plaintiffs, and punitive damages for the class as a whole to the jury. If the jury concludes that defendant is liable for disparate treatment discrimination, the verdict sheet will direct it to answer YES or NO to a question regarding the propriety of an award of punitive damages. Evidence concerning Novartis' financial condition (to which I hope the parties can stipulate) will be submitted to the jury only if the answer is YES. Unless defendant can concretely identify some "additional evidence" not appropriately admitted in connection with the disparate treatment claims that the Court must hear before determining liability on a disparate impact theory, the Court expects all evidence relating to Novartis' liability under either theory to be presented during the jury trial. While the jury is deliberating, you will argue your respective disparate impact cases to me, based on the evidence previously admitted. Obviously I will await the jury's ruling on disparate treatment before ruling on disparate impact, but you will have your verdict on liability under a disparate impact theory within days after the jury's verdict on disparate treatment. Evidence relating to class-wide front and back pay awards for the class will not come in while the jury is in the box.

		<p>However, that evidence will be heard while the jury is deliberating. The Court will render its verdict relatively quickly after the delivery of the jury's verdict on those claims that are triable to it. Potential claimants against those funds will have to make their case before a United States Magistrate Judge in a subsequent remedial phase. The Court will also refer any individual compensatory damages claims (for pain and suffering) to a United States Magistrate Judge for hearing following a period for notice and opportunity to opt out. In short, this Court intends to handle the entire trial except for the damages claims of non-testifying individual class members – liability under disparate treatment and disparate impact theories, compensatory damages to the testifying class members, punitive damages for the class, and class-wide back pay and front pay – in April and May 2010. I understand that this may lead to the introduction of unnecessary evidence during jury deliberations – for example, if the jury decides against the plaintiffs on their disparate treatment promotion claim and the Court decides against them on their disparate impact promotion claim, I will have heard evidence about back and front pay that I might not otherwise have needed to hear. However, my calendar does not permit me the luxury of postponing the portions of the trial that will result in verdicts delivered by the Court. I must move on to other matters come June 1. The procedure here outlined is designed to allow me to address all the issues I must address prior to that date. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 3/31/2010) (jfe) (Entered: 03/31/2010)</p>
04/01/2010	<u>281</u>	<p>MEMORANDUM TO COUNSEL, that the Court has reviewed the parties' proposed order regarding the bringing of electronic devices into the courtroom. As of today, April 1, 2010, the bringing of cell phones, Blackberries and other personal electronic devices ("PEDs") is governed by Standing Order M-10-468 (the "Standing Order"), and only by the Standing Order. A copy of the Standing Order is available on the Local Rules page of the SDNY's website. In sum, you need to submit a revised proposed order. The order should (1) NOT include any requests for cell phones, Blackberries or other PEDs, which are governed by the Standing Order; (2) include proposed laptops—if the number of laptops proposed by either side exceeds 3, you must also submit written justification for the extra laptops; and (3) include the additional devices (e.g., cables, screens, etc.) that you have proposed—I will approve that technology. Additional relief as set forth in this Order. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 4/1/10) By ECF To All Parties.(pl) Modified on 4/8/2010 (pl). (Entered: 04/01/2010)</p>
04/05/2010	<u>282</u>	<p>ORDER: IN THE MATTER OF AN APPLICATION TO BRING AN ELECTRONIC DEVICE(S) INTO THE DANIEL PATRICK MOYNIHAN UNITED STATES COURTHOUSE FOR USE IN A TRIAL OR PROCEEDING: I hereby authorize the following attorneys to bring the General Purpose Computing Device(s) (GPCD) into the Courthouse for use in a trial or proceeding in the action entitled Velez v. Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation, No. 04 cv 9194 (CM), which is anticipated to begin on April 7, 2010. Brian Turner and Raymond McLeod will arrive with the electronic eviden equipment listed below on April 5 and/or 6, 2010...The individuals identified or member of their respective firms with a NY State Attorneys' Passin this Order must present a copy of this Order when entering the Courthouse. Their bringing of the equipment into the building constitutes a certification by them that the electronic device(s) lack (a) the capacity to make or record images or sounds or to send or receive wireless transmissions, and (b) one or more infrared ports or, alternatively, that any such capability or ports have been disabled. They shall not use or permit the use of such equipment to make or record images or sounds or to send or receive wireless transmissions. They shall comply in all respects with the requirements printed on the reverse side of this page.This order does not authorize any attorney or law firm to bring more than three GPCDs into the Courthouse. SO ORDERED.Dated:4/5/2010. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 4/5/2010). (mde) (Entered: 04/05/2010)</p>
04/06/2010	<u>283</u>	<p>ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge McMahon from David Sanford dated 4/6/2010 re: request permission to use high-speed wired internet access for the duration of the trial.... ENDORSEMENT: Permission granted. Today is fine.. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 4/6/2010). (mde) (Entered: 04/06/2010)</p>
04/06/2010	<u>284</u>	<p>RULING ON DAVID MOATAZEDI DEPOSITION TESTIMONY: Therefore, the inference plaintiffs would ask the jury to draw from the fact that Moatazedi was</p>

		asked to do the ride along – namely, that Costa promoted his career because of their encounter – is not a permissible inference. If plaintiffs are able to muster any evidence that Mr. Costa ever said so much as one word to promote Moatazed's career prospects, they should show it to me now. Alternatively, if they have evidence about Costa's practices in connection with ride alongs (i.e., did he always ride along with male representatives rather than female), they should show it to me to put this portion of the deposition into context. Otherwise, the evidence about the ride-along does not appear to be relevant. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 4/6/2010) (jpo) (Entered: 04/06/2010)
04/13/2010	<u>285</u>	SEALED DOCUMENT placed in vault.(nm) (Entered: 04/13/2010)
04/26/2010	<u>286</u>	TRIAL MEMORANDUM. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 04/26/2010)
04/27/2010	<u>287</u>	MOTION for Judgment as a Matter of Law. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 04/27/2010)
04/27/2010	<u>288</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>287</u> MOTION for Judgment as a Matter of Law.. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 04/27/2010)
05/06/2010	<u>289</u>	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 4/8/10 before Judge Colleen McMahon. (pl) (Entered: 05/07/2010)
05/13/2010	<u>290</u>	PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 05/13/2010)
05/13/2010	<u>291</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation.(Schnadig, Richard) Modified on 5/14/2010 (KA). (Entered: 05/13/2010)
05/13/2010	<u>292</u>	PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 13, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 14, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 15, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 16, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 17, # <u>19</u> Exhibit 18, # <u>20</u> Exhibit 19, # <u>21</u> Exhibit 20, # <u>22</u> Exhibit 21, # <u>23</u> Exhibit 22, # <u>24</u> Exhibit 23, # <u>25</u> Exhibit 24, # <u>26</u> Exhibit 25, # <u>27</u> Exhibit 26, # <u>28</u> Exhibit 27, # <u>29</u> Exhibit 28, # <u>30</u> Exhibit 29, # <u>31</u> Exhibit 30, # <u>32</u> Exhibit 31, # <u>33</u> Exhibit 32, # <u>34</u> Exhibit 33, # <u>35</u> Exhibit 34, # <u>36</u> Exhibit 35, # <u>37</u> Exhibit 36, # <u>38</u> Exhibit 37, # <u>39</u> Exhibit 38, # <u>40</u> Exhibit 39)(Schnadig, Richard) (Entered: 05/13/2010)
05/21/2010	<u>293</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Evan R Chesler on behalf of Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation (Chesler, Evan) (Entered: 05/21/2010)
05/24/2010		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Colleen McMahon: Scheduling Conference held on 5/24/2010. Decision: Scheduling Conference held.Parties to advise the court regarding proposed schedule for further proceedings. (Submitted by George Turner). (mde) (Entered: 05/25/2010)
07/14/2010	<u>294</u>	JOINT MOTION to Approve – Preliminary Approval of Settlement Agreement. Document filed by Michelle Williams, Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Maryanne Jacoby, Simona Lopes, Catherine White, Amy Velez, Lori Horton, Karen Liggins, Wendy Pinson, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Penni Zelinkoff, Minel Hider Tobertga. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix Settlement Agreement and Release, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Exhibit A: Notice of

		Pendency of Class Action Proposed Settlement and Settlement Hearing, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Exhibit B: Claim Form, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Exhibit C: Media Release, # <u>5</u> Text of Proposed Order Proposed Order Preliminarily Approving Settlement)(Sanford, David) (Entered: 07/14/2010)
07/14/2010	<u>295</u>	ORDER PRELIMINARILY APPROVING SETTLEMENT: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED AS FOLLOWS: The Court preliminarily approves the Settlement Agreement as being fair, reasonable and adequate, subject to the right of any Class Member to challenge the fairness, reasonableness or adequacy of the Settlement Agreement and to show cause, if any exists why a final judgment dismissing this case and all released claims and awarding attorneys' fees and expenses to Class Counsel, should not be entered following a Final Fairness Hearing. The Class is certified for settlement purposes pursuant to Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 23(b)(2) and (b)(3) as set forth within this Order. Pursuant to Rule 23(g) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, the Court appoints as Class Counsel, David Sanford, Esq., Katherine M. Kimpel, Esq., Steven L. Wittels, Esq., and Grant Morris, Esq., of Counsel, of SANFORD WITTELS & HEISLER, LLP to represent the Settlement Class for purposes of the Settlement. The Court hereby approves the substance, form and manner of the Notice of Proposed Class Action Settlement (the "Notice"), including the Claim Form, attached respectively, as Exhibits A and B to the Settlement Agreement. The Claims Administrator is directed to mail the Notice and Claim Form to the Class, pursuant to the Settlement Agreement following the entry of this Order, no later than September 9, 2010. Based on the deadlines set forth in the Settlement Agreement, a Final Fairness Hearing ("Settlement Hearing") shall take place on Friday, November 19, 2010 at the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York, United States Courthouse, Courtroom 14C, 500 Pearl St., New York, NY 10007, before the Honorable Colleen McMahon. A Claims Administrator will be appointed by Judge McMahon and shall perform the duties set forth in the Settlement Agreement. The Court orders that, pending Final Approval, each member of the Settlement Class is preliminarily enjoined from commencing, prosecuting or maintaining in any court other than this Court any claim, action or other proceeding that challenges or seeks review of or relief from any order, judgment, act, decision or ruling of this Court in connection with this Settlement Agreement. As of the date hereof, all proceedings in this case are stayed until further order of this Court, except as may be necessary to implement the Settlement Agreement. (Signed by Judge P. Kevin Castel on 7/14/2010) (jfe) (jfe). (Entered: 07/14/2010)
07/14/2010		Case Stayed (jfe) (Entered: 07/14/2010)
07/30/2010	296	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on May 12, 13, 14, 17, 18, 2010 before Judge Colleen McMahon. (ajc) (Entered: 08/02/2010)
07/30/2010	297	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on April 8, 12, 13, 14, 15, 2010 before Judge Colleen McMahon. (ajc) (Entered: 08/02/2010)
07/30/2010	298	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on May 5, 6, 7, 10, 11, 2010 before Judge Colleen McMahon. (ajc) (Entered: 08/02/2010)
07/30/2010	299	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on April 22, 23, 26, 27, 2010 before Judge Colleen McMahon. (ajc) (Entered: 08/02/2010)
07/30/2010	301	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on April 28, 29 and May 3, 4, 2010 before Judge Colleen McMahon. (ama) (Entered: 08/02/2010)
08/02/2010	300	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on April 19, 20, 21, 2010 before Judge Colleen McMahon. (ajc) (Entered: 08/02/2010)
08/05/2010	<u>302</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Colleen McMahon from David Sanford dated 8/4/2010 re: Requesting to amend the Notice of Pendency of Class Action. ENDORSEMENT: Amendment granted – File the amended forms with the Court. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 8/5/2010) (jpo) (Entered: 08/05/2010)
08/09/2010	<u>303</u>	NOTICE of Pendency of Class Action Proposed Settlement and Settlement Hearing (Amended) re: <u>302</u> Endorsed Letter, Set Deadlines/Hearings,.. Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Amended Claim Form, # <u>2</u> [Proposed] Amended Preliminary Approval Order)(Chesler, Evan)

		(Entered: 08/09/2010)
08/30/2010	<u>304</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Colleen McMahon from David Sanford dated 8/30/2010 re: The parties wish to delete paragraph 2(b)(iv) on page 8 of the notice, which was included in error. ENDORSEMENT: Could you please file the revised notice? Easier for the Clerk's Office. The amendment is fine. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 8/30/2010) (jpo) Modified on 9/17/2010 (jpo). (Entered: 08/31/2010)
08/31/2010	<u>305</u>	NOTICE of Pendency of Class Action Proposed Settlement and Settlement Hearing (Second Amended) re: <u>304</u> Endorsed Letter, Set Deadlines/Hearings,,. Document filed by Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Lori Horton, Maryanne Jacoby, Karen Liggins, Simona Lopes, Wendy Pinson, Minel Hider Tobertga, Amy Velez, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Catherine White, Michelle Williams, Penni Zelinkoff. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 08/31/2010)
11/04/2010	<u>306</u>	CONSENT MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages. Document filed by Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Lori Horton, Maryanne Jacoby, Karen Liggins, Simona Lopes, Wendy Pinson, Minel Hider Tobertga, Amy Velez, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Catherine White, Michelle Williams, Penni Zelinkoff.(Sanford, David) (Entered: 11/04/2010)
11/08/2010	<u>307</u>	MEMO-ENDORSEMENT re: granting <u>306</u> Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages. ENDORSEMENT: OK. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 11/8/10) (pl) (Entered: 11/08/2010)
11/15/2010	<u>308</u>	MOTION for Final Certification of Settlement Class; and (2) Final Approval of Settlement, Service Payments to Class Representatives and Class Members, and Attorneys' Fees and Expenses. Document filed by Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Lori Horton, Maryanne Jacoby, Karen Liggins, Simona Lopes, Wendy Pinson, Minel Hider Tobertga, Amy Velez, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Catherine White, Michelle Williams, Penni Zelinkoff.(Sanford, David) Modified on 11/16/2010 (KA). (Entered: 11/15/2010)
11/15/2010	<u>309</u>	DECLARATION of David W. Sanford and Katherine M. Kimpel in Support re: <u>308</u> MOTION for Final Certification of Settlement Class; and (2) Final Approval of Settlement, Service Payments to Class Representatives and Class Members, and Attorneys' Fees and Expenses. MOTION for Settlement (1) <i>Final Certification of Settlement Class; and (2) Final Approval of Settlement, Service Payments to Class Representatives and Class Members, and Attorneys' Fees and Expenses.</i> MOTION for Settlement (1) <i>Final Certification of Settlement Class; and (2) Final Approval of Settlement, Service Payments to Class Representatives and Class Members, and Attorneys' Fees and Expenses.</i> . Document filed by Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Lori Horton, Maryanne Jacoby, Karen Liggins, Simona Lopes, Wendy Pinson, Minel Hider Tobertga, Amy Velez, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Catherine White, Michelle Williams, Penni Zelinkoff. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A – Back Pay Damages Report of Louis R. Lanier, Ph.D., # <u>2</u> Exhibit B – Settlement Agreement and Release, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C – Preliminary Approval Order, # <u>4</u> Exhibit E – Catalogue of Costs and Expenses)(Sanford, David) Modified on 11/16/2010 (KA). (Entered: 11/15/2010)
11/15/2010	<u>310</u>	DECLARATION of Stacy L. Roe in Support re: <u>308</u> MOTION for Final Certification of Settlement Class; and (2) Final Approval of Settlement, Service Payments to Class Representatives and Class Members, and Attorneys' Fees and Expenses. MOTION for Settlement (1) <i>Final Certification of Settlement Class; and (2) Final Approval of Settlement, Service Payments to Class Representatives and Class Members, and Attorneys' Fees and Expenses.</i> MOTION for Settlement (1) <i>Final Certification of Settlement Class; and (2) Final Approval of Settlement, Service Payments to Class Representatives and Class Members, and Attorneys' Fees and Expenses.</i> . Document filed by Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Lori Horton, Maryanne Jacoby, Karen Liggins, Simona Lopes, Wendy Pinson, Minel Hider Tobertga, Amy Velez, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman-Recht, Catherine White, Michelle Williams, Penni

		Zelinkoff. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A – Class Notice, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B – Postage Statement)(Sanford, David) Modified on 11/16/2010 (KA). (Entered: 11/15/2010)
11/15/2010	<u>311</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>308</u> MOTION for Final Certification of Settlement Class; and (2) Final Approval of Settlement, Service Payments to Class Representatives and Class Members, and Attorneys' Fees and Expenses. MOTION for Settlement (1) <i>Final Certification of Settlement Class; and (2) Final Approval of Settlement, Service Payments to Class Representatives and Class Members, and Attorneys' Fees and Expenses.</i> MOTION for Settlement (1) <i>Final Certification of Settlement Class; and (2) Final Approval of Settlement, Service Payments to Class Representatives and Class Members, and Attorneys' Fees and Expenses.</i> . Document filed by Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Lori Horton, Maryanne Jacoby, Karen Liggins, Simona Lopes, Wendy Pinson, Minel Hider Tobertga, Amy Velez, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Catherine White, Michelle Williams, Penni Zelinkoff. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix of Unreported Cases)(Sanford, David) Modified on 11/16/2010 (KA). (Entered: 11/15/2010)
11/15/2010	<u>312</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE. Document filed by Kelly Corbett, Marta Deyne, Joan Durkin, Jamie Holland, Lori Horton, Maryanne Jacoby, Karen Liggins, Simona Lopes, Wendy Pinson, Minel Hider Tobertga, Amy Velez, Roberta VonLintel, Holly Waters, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Catherine White, Michelle Williams, Penni Zelinkoff. (Sanford, David) (Entered: 11/15/2010)
11/30/2010	<u>313</u>	FINAL JUDGMENT AND ORDER OF APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT AND DISMISSAL WITH PREJUDICE #10/2094 in favor of Amy Velez, Catherine White, Holly Waters, Jamie Holland, Jennifer Waxman–Recht, Joan Durkin, Karen Liggins, Kelly Corbett, Lori Horton, Marta Deyne, Maryanne Jacoby, Michelle Williams, Minel Hider Tobertga, Penni Zelinkoff, Roberta VonLintel, Simona Lopes, Wendy Pinson against Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation in the amount of \$ 152,500.00. The Class Action is hereby DISMISSED WITH PREJUDICE. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 11/30/10) (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Notice of Right to Appeal)(dt) (Entered: 11/30/2010)
11/30/2010	<u>314</u>	DECISION APPROVING CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT: The road to this Settlement was long, arduous, risky and expensive. The Settlement is, by all measures, excellent. For the reasons set forth in this opinion, the Court certifies the Settlement Class as final; approve the Settlement; awards the requested compensatory damages and service fees to the Named Plaintiffs, Testifying Witnesses and Class Member Deponents, and grants the application for attorneys' fees and expenses. I am also appointing The Hon. William B. Wetzel (ret.) as the Claims Adjudicator, and Dr. Neal A. Gelfand as the Court Monitor. Judgment is being entered simultaneously with the dissemination of this opinion (1) dismissing this action with prejudice; and (2) requiring that all materials marked as containing Confidential or Highly Confidential Information pursuant to the Protective Order entered in the Civil Action be returned to the producing party or destroyed. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 11/30/2010) (lnl) (Entered: 11/30/2010)
12/01/2010	315	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on November 19, 2010 before Judge Colleen McMahon. (mro) (Entered: 12/01/2010)
04/08/2011	<u>316</u>	ORDER APPROVING CERTAIN MODIFICATIONS TO CLAIMS ADMINISTRATION PROCESS AND SETTLEMENT PAYMENTS: It is hereby ordered that the Claims Administrator will provide to the parties within the deadline set forth in Settlement Agreement Paragraph 10.32 the list of settlement award recipients based on the current class member list, which includes some individuals who are not class members as defined in the Settlement Agreement. As soon as practicable thereafter, the parties will provide to the Claims Administrator agreed upon adjustments to the individual settlement awards that will ensure correct payments to all bona fide class members based on Part X of the Settlement Agreement ("Individual Monetary Payments to Settlement Class Members and Claims Process"). The Claims Administrator will distribute the adjusted amounts to the bona fide class members within the deadline set forth in Settlement Agreement Paragraph 10.33, as further set forth in this Order. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 4/8/2011) (jpo) (Entered: 04/08/2011)

05/23/2011	<u>317</u>	ORDER APPROVING FORMS OF NOTICE OF CLASS LIST ERROR AND ELIGIBILITY FOR SETTLEMENT, pursuant to the final decretal paragraph of the April 8, 2011 Order, that the forms of Notice are approved in all respects. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 5/23/2011) (Inl) (Entered: 05/23/2011)
06/01/2011	<u>318</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to TO ALL COUNSEL IN: Velez v. Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corp. 04 Civ. 9194(CM) from Judge Colleen McMahon dated 6/1/2011 re: Recent Letter from Class Member and another matters. ENDORSEMENT: I have considered the matter in light of this unforeseen development, but I can discern no basis to find someone new to perform the job to which he was appointed. However, I want you to think about whether this somehow disqualifies him for the position. Please let me know if I need to do anything on either of the above-mentioned issues. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 6/1/2011) (jfe) (Entered: 06/01/2011)
09/08/2011	<u>319</u>	SEALED MATERIALS DISPOSED: Document(s) 70 and 71 were disposed since no party retrieved the material(s) within 30 days of the date indicated. The sealed record(s) were destroyed on 09/08/2011.(mps) (Entered: 09/08/2011)
09/14/2011	<u>320</u>	SEALED MATERIALS DISPOSED: Document(s) 58 and 78 were disposed since no party retrieved the material(s) within 30 days of the date indicated. The sealed record(s) were destroyed on 09/14/2011.(mps) (Entered: 09/14/2011)
01/24/2012	<u>321</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Colleen McMahon from Katherine M. Kimpel dated 1/23/2012 re: In light of the above, Class Counsel respectfully requests that the Court extend the deadline for the Parties to submit the Compliance Report, and either a joint statement of agreement as to Novartis's compliance or a statement by Class Counsel identifying areas of Novartis's alleged non-compliance, to the Compliance Master, with a confidential courtesy copy to the Court, to February 27, 2012. ENDORSEMENT: OK (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 1/24/2012) (djc) (Entered: 01/24/2012)
06/27/2012	<u>322</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Colleen McMahon from Katherine M. Kimpel dated 6/26/12 re: Counsel writes on behalf of the parties regarding a proposed modification to the handling of any remainder left over from the portion of the Settlement Fund dedicated to Compliance Monitor fees and costs as set forth in Settlement Agreement Paragraphs 7.43 and 9.6. The parties propose that any remainder should be first utilized to cover claims from class members who the parties agree were otherwise unable to collect their portion of the settlement due to no fault of their own. ENDORSEMENT: This is fine with me. The compliance monitor's informal (oral) report to me is excellent! Keep up the good work! (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 6/27/2012) (mro) (Entered: 06/27/2012)
01/30/2013	<u>323</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Colleen McMahon from Katherine M. Kimpel dated 1/29/2013 re: counsel for Plaintiff writes that the Parties will provide the Court with a confidential courtesy copy of all materials provided to the Compliance Master, pursuant to SA Paragraph 7.44 and the Protective Order. However, due to unexpected delay arising from extenuating personal circumstances involving Ms. Kimpel's family, Class Counsel respectfully requests that the Court extend the deadline in the Settlement Agreement for the Parties joint submission to the Compliance Master by one-month, to February 27, 2013. ENDORSEMENT: Fine. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 1/30/2013) (pl) (Entered: 01/30/2013)
09/23/2013	<u>324</u>	LETTER addressed to TO ALL COUNSEL IN: Amy Velez, et al., v. Novartis Corporation, et al., from Judge Colleen McMahon dated 9/23/2013 re: Dr. Gelfand. I have heard from Dr. Gelfand. He tells me that repeated efforts to get some information from you have resulted in no answers; he wants to know if he should give up preparing his second year's report and simply submit a bill. I would appreciate it if someone would get back to Dr. Gelfand with the information he seeks. I realize that you all have moved on, but you agreed to a three year monitoring procedure and no one has applied to end it prematurely, so I expect you to live up to your bargain. (rsh) (Entered: 09/23/2013)
01/30/2014	<u>325</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Colleen McMahon from Katherine M. Kimpel and Lindsay Timlin dated 1/29/2014 re: The parties jointly request a short extension of the deadline for submission to the Compliance Master until February

		14, 2014. ENDORSEMENT: I am OK with whatever schedule you set. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 1/30/2014) (ft) (Entered: 01/30/2014)
04/02/2014	<u>326</u>	LETTER addressed to All Counsel in Amy Velez, et al., v. Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation, from Judge Colleen McMahon, dated 4/2/2014 re: Dr. Gelfand. Thanks for your work as compliance monitor, and congratulations to the parties and counsel for the professional way in which this matter has been handled since the settlement was reached... (ja) (Entered: 04/02/2014)
04/28/2014	<u>327</u>	NOTICE of ("Notice Of Joint Motion To Conclude Monitoring Period And Programmatic Relief Obligations"). Document filed by Novartis Pharmaceutical Corporation. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A to Joint Notice of Motion, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B to Joint Notice of Motion, # <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order)(McAtee, Darin) (Entered: 04/28/2014)
04/29/2014	<u>328</u>	ORDER CONCLUDING MONITORING PERIOD AND PROGRAMMATIC RELIEF OBLIGATIONS: It is hereby ORDERED: The Court confirms that Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation's compliance with the programmatic relief terms of the Settlement Agreement is satisfactory to the Court; The Court terminates the programmatic relief monitoring period for the relief described in the Settlement Agreement; and The Court terminates Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation's obligations, including all reporting obligations to Class Counsel and the Compliance Master, with respect to the programmatic relief described in the Settlement Agreement. Congratulations to all parties on a job well done! (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 4/29/2014) (ja) (Entered: 04/29/2014)