

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK
UNITED STATES COURTHOUSE
500 PEARL STREET
NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10007-1581
(212) 805-6325

9/23/13

CHAMBERS OF
COLLEEN MCMAHON
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

TO ALL COUNSEL IN: Amy Velez, et al., v. Novartis Corporation, et al.,
(04 Civ. 9194) (CM)

FROM: Judge McMahon

RE: Dr. Gelfand

DATE: September 23, 2013

Counsel:

I have heard from Dr. Gelfand. He tells me that repeated efforts to get some information from you have resulted in no answers; he wants to know if he should give up preparing his second year's report and simply submit a bill.

I would appreciate it if someone would get back to Dr. Gelfand with the information he seeks. I realize that you all have moved on, but you agreed to a three year monitoring procedure and no one has applied to end it prematurely, so I expect you to live up to your bargain.



Colleen McMahon