

U.S. District Court
United States District Court for the Southern District of New York (Foley Square)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:01-cv-06558-GEL

Hnot, et al v. Willis Group, et al
Assigned to: Judge Gerard E. Lynch
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman (Settlement)
Demand: \$0
Related Case: 1:06-cv-15295-RMB-DCF
Cause: 42:2000e Job Discrimination (Employment)

Date Filed: 07/19/2001
Date Terminated: 02/25/2008
Jury Demand: Plaintiff
Nature of Suit: 442 Civil Rights: Jobs
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Shelley Hnot

on behalf of himself and all similarly situated persons

represented by **Avi Lew**

Warsaw Burstein Cohen Schlesinger & Kuh, LLP
555 Fifth Avenue
New York, NY 10017
(212)-984-7725
Fax: (212) 972-9150
Email: alew@wbcsk.com
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jessica Glick Lyn

Cohen, Milstein, Hausfeld & Toll, PLLC
825 Third Ave, 30th Floor
New York, NY 10022
(212) 838-7797
TERMINATED: 05/03/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Lawrence John Profeta

New York City Office of Corporation Counsel
100 Church Street, Room 6-210
New York, NY 10007
(212)-788-0954
Fax: (212)-788-0940
Email: lprofeta@law.nyc.gov
TERMINATED: 01/30/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Linda P. Nussbaum

Kaplan Fox & Kilsheimer LLP (NYC)
850 Third Avenue
14th Floor
New York, NY 10022
(212) 687-1980
Fax: (212) 687-7714
Email: lnussbaum@nussbaumllp.com
TERMINATED: 05/03/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Christine Webber

Cohen Milstein Sellers & Toll (Philadelphia)
255 South 17th Street
Suite 1307
Philadelphia, PA 19103
(202) 408-4616
Fax: (202) 408-4699

Email: cwebber@cohenmilstein.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joseph M. Sellers
Cohen Milstein Sellers & Toll PLLC (DC)
1100 New York Avenue, N.W.
Suite 500, West Tower
Washington, DC 20005
(202) 408-4600
Fax: (202)-408-4699
Email: jsellers@cohenmilstein.com
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Llezie Green Coleman
Cohen Milstein Sellers & Toll PLLC (DC)
1100 New York Avenue, N.W.
Suite 500, West Tower
Washington, DC 20005
(202)-408-4653
Fax: (202)-408-4699
Email: lgreen@cohenmilstein.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Martin R. Lee
Warshaw Burstein Cohen Schlesinger
& Kuh, LLP
555 Fifth Avenue
New York, NY 10017
(212) 984 7868
Fax: 212 972 9150
Email: mlee@wbcsk.com

Plaintiff

Maria Traverso
*on behalf of herself and all similarly
situated persons*
TERMINATED: 03/16/2004

represented by **Jessica Glick Lyn**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 05/03/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Linda P. Nussbaum
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 05/03/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY

Martin R. Lee
(See above for address)

Plaintiff

Teresa Jimenez
*on behalf of themselves and all similarly
situated persons.*
TERMINATED: 03/16/2004

represented by **Lawrence John Profeta**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 01/30/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Martin R. Lee
(See above for address)

Linda P. Nussbaum
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 05/03/2007
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Margaret Mahon
*on behalf of themselves and all similarly
situated persons.*
TERMINATED: 09/17/2004

represented by **Lawrence John Profeta**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 01/30/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Martin R. Lee
(See above for address)

Linda P. Nussbaum
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 05/03/2007
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Heidi Scheller
*on behalf of themselves and all similarly
situated persons.*

represented by **Avi Lew**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Lawrence John Profeta
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 01/30/2007
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Christine Webber
(See above for address)

Joseph M. Sellers
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Llezie Green Coleman
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Martin R. Lee
(See above for address)

Linda P. Nussbaum
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 05/03/2007
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Willis Group Holdings Ltd.

represented by **Bettina Barasch Plevan**
Proskauer Rose LLP (New York)
1585 Broadway
New York , NY 10036
(212) 969-3065
Fax: (212) 969-2900
Email: Bplevan@proskauer.com
LEAD ATTORNEY

Myron D. Rumeld
Proskauer Rose LLP (New York)
1585 Broadway
New York , NY 10036
(212) 969-3000
Fax: (212) 969-2900

Email: mrumeld@proskauer.com
LEAD ATTORNEY

Defendant

Willis North America Inc.

represented by **Bettina Barasch Plevan**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Myron D. Rumeld
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Defendant

Willis of Massachusetts

represented by **Bettina Barasch Plevan**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Myron D. Rumeld
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Willis of New Jersey

represented by **Bettina Barasch Plevan**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Myron D. Rumeld
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Willis of NY

represented by **Bettina Barasch Plevan**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Myron D. Rumeld
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Intervenor Plaintiff

Adrienne Cronas

represented by **Avi Lew**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Robert Lloyd Herbst
Beldock Levine & Hoffman LLP
99 Park Ave (16 Fl.)
New York , NY 10016
212 490-0400
Fax: 212 557 0565
Email: rherbst@blhny.com
LEAD ATTORNEY

Martin R. Lee
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
07/19/2001	1	CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT filed. Summons issued and Notice pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 636(c). FILING FEE \$ 150.00 RECEIPT # 412007. (jco) Modified on

		07/23/2001 (Entered: 07/23/2001)
07/19/2001		Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman is so designated. (jco) (Entered: 07/23/2001)
10/02/2001	2	FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT by Shelley Hnot, Maria Traverso, Teresa Jimenez, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller (Answer due 10/15/01 for Willis North, for Willis Group); amending [1-1] complaint; Summons issued. (pl) (Entered: 10/04/2001)
10/02/2001	2	DEMAND for jury trial by Shelley Hnot, Maria Traverso, Teresa Jimenez, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller . (pl) (Entered: 10/04/2001)
10/17/2001	3	WAIVER OF SERVICE of summons returned executed as to Willis Group, Willis North mailed on 10/5/01 . Answer due on 12/4/01 for Willis Group, for Willis North . (bai) (Entered: 10/19/2001)
12/26/2001	5	NOTICE OF MOTION by Shelley Hnot, Maria Traverso, Teresa Jimenez, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller for an order, purs. to Rule 1.3(c) of the Local Civil Rules, admitting Christine E. Webber pro hac vice on behalf of plttfs . No return date indicated. Affidavits of Susan R. Schwaiger, and of Christine E. Webber; and proposed order are attached. (sn) (Entered: 12/28/2001)
12/27/2001	4	STIPULATION and ORDER, reset answer to complaint due for 1/8/02 for Willis North, for Willis Group . (signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch) (ae) (Entered: 12/27/2001)
01/08/2002	6	ORDER; granting [5-1] motion for an order, purs. to Rule 1.3(c) of the Local Civil Rules, admitting Christine E. Webber pro hac vice on behalf of plttfs . (signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch); Copies mailed. (docmt forwarded to atty admissions clerk) (dj) (Entered: 01/09/2002)
01/09/2002	7	RULE 1.9 CERTIFICATE filed by Willis Group, Willis North . (bai) (Entered: 01/10/2002)
01/09/2002	8	ANSWER TO THE FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT by Willis Group, Willis North (Attorney Bettina B. Plevan from the Firm: Proskauer Rose LLP). (bai) (Entered: 01/10/2002)
01/09/2002	9	NOTICE OF MOTION by Shelley Hnot, Maria Traverso for an order pursuant to Rule 1.3 of the Local Rules of USDC/SDNY admitting Jessica Glick Lyn to appear pro hac vice as counsel for palintiffs . Return date not indicated. Declaration of Susan R. Schwaiger in support attached with Affidavit of Jessica G. Lyn in support of motion attached. (bai) (Entered: 01/10/2002)
01/10/2002	10	AMENDED CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Notice of pro hac vice motion by First-class mail on 1/9/02 to Bettina B. Plevan, Esq., of Proskauer Rose LLP. (dj) (Entered: 01/11/2002)
01/29/2002	11	AMENDED ANSWER to Complaint by Willis Group, Willis North: amends [8-1] complaint answer. (jco) (Entered: 01/31/2002)
01/30/2002	12	ORDER; that Joseph M. Sellers is hereby granted admission pro hac vice of the U.S.D.C. for the S.D.N.Y., for the purpose of appearing in this action, pursuant to Rule 1.3(c) of the Local Rules of the U.S.D.C. for the S.D. N.Y.; Joseph M. Sellers is required to notify the Court immediately of any matter that affects his standing at the Bar of any court . (signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch); Copies mailed; forwarded this document to the Attorney Admission Clerk. (pl) (Entered: 02/04/2002)
02/01/2002	13	ORDER; Joseph M. Sellers is granted admission pro hac vice for the purpose of appearing in this action purs. to Rule 1.3(c) of the Local Rules, SDNY . (signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch); Copies mailed. (Forwarded to Attorney Admissions Clerk) (sn) (Entered: 02/04/2002)
07/02/2002	14	STIPULATION and ORDER; regarding procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of "confidential materials" . (signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch) (jco) (Entered: 07/03/2002)
08/02/2002	15	ORDER; That at the 9/11/02 ptrlcnf the Court granted the [9-1] motion for an order pursuant to Rule 1.3 of the Local Rules of USDC/SDNY admitting Jessica Glick Lyn

		to appear pro hac vice as counsel for plttffs. (signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch); Copies mailed. (tp) Modified on 08/06/2002 (Entered: 08/05/2002)
08/07/2002	16	ORDER, for Jessica Glick to appear pro hac vice . (signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch); Copies mailed. (Sent to the Attorney Admissions Clerk). (kw) (Entered: 08/09/2002)
09/09/2002	17	NOTICE OF MOTION by Shelley Hnot, Maria Traverso, Teresa Jimenez, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller to compel discovery of Nationwide Computerized Database ; Return Date not indicated. (djc) (Entered: 09/13/2002)
11/19/2002	18	STIPULATION and ORDER; regarding amending the caption of this action and amending the complaint . (signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch) (pl) (Entered: 11/22/2002)
11/27/2002	19	Case Management Plan: date by which plttffs may file motions to join additional parties or amend pleading: 12/31/02. Date by which dft s will produce copies of written complaints of sex discrimination: 11/22/02. Date by which dfts will produce computerized employee database for the Northeast region: 12/3/02. Date by which all non-expert discovery is to be completed: 9/30/03. Date by which class certification experts, if any, will be designated by the parties: 6/15/03 these reports will be exchanged simultaneously by the parties: 8/1/03. A status conference will be held on 9/26/03 at 10:00 a.m. All other procedures and deadlines are as further set forth in said order. (signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch) (db) (Entered: 12/04/2002)
12/02/2002	20	ORDER; denying [17-1] motion to compel discovery of Nationwide Computerized Database. For the reasons stated on the record at a conference before the Court on 11/13/02, this motion was effectively denied without prejudice to renew. As such, the Clerk of the Court is respectfully directed to close out this motion in all internal reports. (signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch); (jco) (Entered: 12/06/2002)
12/31/2002	21	Transcript of record of proceedings before Judge Gerard E. Lynch for the date(s) of 11/13/02. (dt) (Entered: 01/02/2003)
10/22/2003	22	STIPULATION and ORDER, defendants are permitted to serve and file the attached Second Amended Answer to the First Amended Complaint ; (signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch); (docmt not attached) (djc) (Entered: 10/27/2003)
10/24/2003	23	SECOND AMENDED ANSWER by Willis Group, Willis North, Willis of New York, Willis of New Jersey and Willis of Massachusetts to [2-1] amended complaint. (Attorney Myron D. Rumeld, Bettina B. Plevan from the Firm: Proskauer, Rose, L.L.P.). (db) Modified on 10/28/2003 (Entered: 10/28/2003)
11/05/2003	24	Revised Case Management Plan: Non-expert discovery is to be completed by 2/28/04. (See document for further related discovery schedule). (signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch); (kw) (Entered: 11/09/2003)
11/20/2003	25	RESPONSE by Willis Group, Willis North to [17-1] motion to compel discovery of Nationwide Computerized Database (yv) (Entered: 11/22/2003)
11/20/2003	26	AFFIDAVIT of Joan Gustafson Haworth, Ph.D. by Willis Group, Willis North. (yv) (Entered: 11/22/2003)
11/20/2003	27	AFFIDAVIT of Kristin S. Rozic by Willis Group, Willis North in support of [25-1] motion response . (yv) (Entered: 11/22/2003)
11/24/2003	28	REPLY in support to Motion re: 17 Motion to Compel. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Teresa Jimenez, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller, Maria Traverso. (pl,) (Entered: 12/03/2003)
12/08/2003	29	Offer of Judgment. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc. (yv,) (Entered: 12/23/2003)
12/08/2003	30	Offer of Judgment. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc. (yv,) (Entered: 12/23/2003)
12/08/2003	31	Acceptance of Offer of Judgment. Document filed by Teresa Jimenez. (yv,) (Entered: 12/23/2003)

12/08/2003	32	Acceptance of Offer of Judgment. Document filed by Maria Traverso. (yv,) (Entered: 12/23/2003)
12/31/2003	34	ORDER/Acceptance of Offer of Judgment: plaintiff Maria accepts the Offer of Judgment made by defendants in the amount of \$75,000. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 12/9/03) (kw,) (Entered: 01/21/2004)
01/07/2004	33	NOTICE of plaintiffs Renewed request to compel discovery of Nationwide computerized database. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Teresa Jimenez, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller, Maria Traverso. (kw,) (Entered: 01/08/2004)
01/13/2004	35	ORDER The plaintiffs' renewed motion to compel discovery of a nationwide computerbase is denied. The Clerk of Court is respectfully requested to close out that motion (Dkt. No. 33) on internal reports. Plaintiffs' motion for class certification shall be submitted by 6/1/2004; defendants' opposition shall be submitted by 8/3/2004; plaintiffs' reply shall be submitted by 9/3/2004. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 1/9/2004) (jsa). (Entered: 01/27/2004)
01/13/2004		Set Deadlines/Hearings: (See doc. #35) Plaintiff's motion for class certification due by 6/1/2004. Defendants' opposition due by 8/3/2004. Plaintiffs' reply due by 8/3/2004 (ae,) (Entered: 01/29/2004)
03/16/2004	36	JUDGMENT #04,0496 in favor of plaintiff, Maria Traverso and against defendants Willis Group et.al., in the amount of \$ 75,000. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 03/9/04) (jf,) (Entered: 03/16/2004)
03/16/2004	37	JUDGMENT #04,0497 in favor of plaintiff, Teresa Jimenez against defendants in the amount of \$ 75,000. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 03/09/04) (jf,) (Entered: 03/16/2004)
03/17/2004		Mailed notice of Right to Appeal to Attorney(s) of Record: Martin R. Lee, Jessica Glick Lyn, Linda P. Nussbaum, Bettina Barasch Plevan, Myron D. Rumeld. (snu) (Entered: 03/17/2004)
03/19/2004	38	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on January 9, 2003 before Judge Gerard E. Lynch.(djc,) (Entered: 03/19/2004)
03/30/2004	39	ORDER, regarding issues concerning the parties' joint submission dated 3/15/04 granting an additional three hours of deposition. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 3/24/04) (tp,) (Entered: 04/01/2004)
05/11/2004	40	STIPULATION AND ORDER, that plntf Mahon will not provide a declaration etc re plntfs' motion for class certification, if any, as further set forth in this document. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 5/10/04) (cd,) (Entered: 05/12/2004)
05/20/2004	41	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Lynch from Christine E. Webber dated 5/17/2004 re: extension of deadline for motion for class certification be extended to 6/11/2004. Defendants opposition due on 8/20/2004 and plaintiff's reply due on 9/20/2004. Request granted. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 5/18/2004) (jsa,) (Entered: 05/21/2004)
05/20/2004		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Motions due by 6/11/2004. Replies due by 9/20/2004. Responses due by 8/20/2004 (jsa,) (Entered: 05/21/2004)
06/04/2004	42	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support Of Plaintiffs' Motion For Leave To Amend The Complaint. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Teresa Jimenez, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller, Maria Traverso. (jmi,) (Entered: 06/08/2004)
06/04/2004	43	MOTION For Leave to Amend/Correct Complaint. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Teresa Jimenez, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller, Maria Traverso. (jmi,) (Entered: 06/08/2004)
06/14/2004	44	MOTION to Certify Class; attached are papers in support. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Teresa Jimenez, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller. (cd,) (Entered: 06/16/2004)
06/14/2004	45	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 44 MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Teresa Jimenez, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller, Maria Traverso. (cd,) (Entered: 06/16/2004)

06/15/2004	46	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge George E. Lynch from Jeremy M. Brown dated 6/14/04 re: counsel for defendants request one additional day from 6/14/04 to 6/15/04 in which to file their opposition brief. Application GRANTED. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 6/14/04) (db,) (Entered: 06/17/2004)
06/16/2004	47	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Affidavit of Jeremy M. Brown served on plaintiffs' counsel on 6/15/04. Service was made by MAIL. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller. (jco,) (Entered: 06/17/2004)
06/21/2004	48	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Lynch from Christine Webber dated 6/14/04: granting plntf's request for leave to submit a memo of 33 pages, instead of 25 pages established by your standing rules. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 6/15/04) (cd,) (Entered: 06/24/2004)
06/29/2004	49	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 43 MOTION to Amend/Correct.. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc.. (jmi,) (Entered: 07/07/2004)
06/29/2004	50	AFFIDAVIT of Jeremy M. Brown, ESQ. in Support Of Defendants' Opposition To Plaintiffs' re: 43 MOTION to Amend/Correct.. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc.. (jmi,) (Entered: 07/07/2004)
07/07/2004	51	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support of 43 MOTION to Amend/Correct. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller. (db,) (Entered: 07/08/2004)
07/07/2004	52	DECLARATION of Christine Webber. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller. (db,) (Entered: 07/08/2004)
07/15/2004	55	MOTION for an Order pursuant to F.R.C.P. granting Summary Judgment. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc. (jco,) (Entered: 07/16/2004)
08/10/2004	57	MEMORANDUM AND OPINION # 90470; for the reasons set forth on this Opinion, plttfs motion to amend the complaint is granted with respect to the deletion of certain class representatives and the addition of causes of action based on state law, and denied with respect to the addition of the words "or equivalents" in describing the victims alleged discrimination and retaliation. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 8/10/2004) (jp,) (Entered: 08/11/2004)
08/20/2004	58	DECLARATION of Bettina B. Plevan in Opposition re: 44 MOTION to Certify Class. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc. (jco,) (Entered: 08/23/2004)
08/20/2004	59	DECLARATION of Paul F. White in Opposition re: 44 MOTION to Certify Class. (jco,) (Entered: 08/23/2004)
08/20/2004	60	AFFIDAVIT of Joan Gustafson Haworth, Ph.D. (jco,) (Entered: 08/23/2004)
08/20/2004	61	DECLARATION of Debora A. Dias` in Opposition re: 44 MOTION to Certify Class. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc. (jco,) (Entered: 08/23/2004)
08/20/2004	62	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 44 MOTION to Certify Class. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc. (jco,) (Entered: 08/23/2004)
08/20/2004	63	AFFIDAVIT of Kristin S. Rozic in Opposition re: 44 MOTION to Certify Class. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc. (jco,) (Entered: 08/23/2004)
08/23/2004	66	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Jeremy M. Brown dated 8/16/04 re: defendant requests permission to file a memorandum of fifty (50) pages instead of twenty-five (25). Application GRANTED. Though in light of the fact that plaintiff's memorandum was only thirty-three (33) pages long, counsel are particularly reminded that concision enhances persuasiveness. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 8/16/04) (db,) (Entered: 08/24/2004)

08/23/2004	67	MOTION for Summary Judgment Dismissing Plaintiff Hnot's Claims In Their Entirety, With Prejudice, and awarding Attorney's Fees And Costs And Such Other Relief As The Court May Deem Just And Proper.. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc.. (jmi,) (Entered: 08/25/2004)
09/17/2004	68	SECOND AMENDED COMPLAINT amending 2 Amended Complaint against Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY, Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc..Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller. Related document: 2 Amended Complaint filed by Shelley Hnot, Maria Traverso, Teresa Jimenez, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller.(djc,) (Entered: 09/17/2004)
09/17/2004		Set Answer Due Date re: 68 Amended Complaint, as to Willis Group Holdings Ltd. answer due on 9/27/2004; Willis North America Inc. answer due on 9/27/2004. (djc,) (Entered: 09/17/2004)
09/20/2004	69	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Bettina B. Plevan dated 9/10/04. Granting the request for a briefing schedule as follows: Plaintiffs' opposition to summary judgment on behalf of Heidi Scheller to be filed on 9/30/04, with defendant's reply on 10/15/04. Plaintiffs' opposition to summary judgment on behalf of Shelley Hnot would be filed on 11/1/04, with defendant's reply on 11/22/04. Plaintiffs' reply in support of Class Certification would be filed on 9/20/04 as originally scheduled. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 9/16/04) (kw,) (Entered: 09/23/2004)
09/20/2004	70	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Christine E. Webber dated 9/16/04. Granting plaintiffs' request for leave to submit a reply brief of no more than 40 page. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 9/16/04) (kw,) (Entered: 09/23/2004)
09/29/2004	71	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 44 MOTION to Certify Class. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller. (kw,) (Entered: 09/30/2004)
09/29/2004	72	DECLARATION of Mark R. Killingsworth, D. Phil in Support re: 44 MOTION to Certify Class. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller. (kw,) (Entered: 09/30/2004)
09/29/2004	73	DECLARATION of Christine Webber in Support re: 44 MOTION to Certify Class. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller. (kw,) (Entered: 09/30/2004)
10/12/2004	76	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Lawrence J. Profeta dated 9/29/04 re: granting Plaintiffs' leave to submit a memorandum of no more than 33 pages. Defendants are permitted leave to submit a reply memorandum of no more than fifteen pages. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 9/29/04) (sac,) Modified on 10/14/2004 (sac,). (Entered: 10/14/2004)
10/15/2004	78	RULE 7.1 DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. Document filed by Willis of NY.(ps,) (Entered: 10/19/2004)
10/15/2004	79	RULE 7.1 DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. Document filed by Willis of New Jersey.(ps,) (Entered: 10/19/2004)
10/15/2004	80	RULE 7.1 DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. Document filed by Willis of Massachusetts.(ps,) (Entered: 10/19/2004)
10/15/2004	81	THIRD AMENDED ANSWER to SECOND Amended Complaint. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of NY, Willis of New Jersey. Related document: 68 Amended Complaint, filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller.(ps,) (Entered: 10/19/2004)
11/01/2004	85	DECLARATION of Shelley Hnot in Opposition re: 55 MOTION for Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Shelley Hnot. (jmi,) (Entered: 11/08/2004)
11/12/2004	86	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Lynch from Christine E. Webber dated 11/1/2004 re: plaintiff requesting leave to file a memorandum in opposition of 30 pages and Willis may submit a reply brief of up to 20 pages. Application granted. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 11/1/2004) (jsa,) (Entered: 11/15/2004)
11/12/2004	87	AMENDMENT TO STIPULATION AND AGREED PROTECTIVE ORDER; that in order to expedite the flow of electronic discovery and protect adequately for

		electronic discovery material produced by dfts that contains or may contain information protected by the atty-client privilege or atty work-product doctrine, the parties hereby amend the stipulation and agreed protective order dated 7/2/02 as set forth in this Order. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 11/3/04) (pl,) (Entered: 11/22/2004)
11/18/2004	88	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Jeremy M. Brown dated 11/16/04 re: granting dfts requests for an extension until 12/6/04 to file their reply brief in support of their motion for summary judgment. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 11/16/04) (pl,) (Entered: 11/30/2004)
03/21/2005	90	OPINION AND ORDER # 91386. PLaintiffs have demonstrated that their proposed class and its representatives satisfy the requirements of Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23(a) and 23(b). Accordingly, plaintiff's motion for class certification is granted. Hnot and Scheller are appointed as class representatives and Cohen, Milstein, Hausfeld and Toll,P.L.L.C. and Warshaw, Burstein, Schlesinger,&Kuh L.L.P. are appointed as co-lead counsel for the class. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 3/18/2005) (jsa,) (Entered: 03/22/2005)
04/08/2005	92	OPINION AND ORDER # 91474. Defendants' motion for summary judgment is granted with respect to plaintiff's constructive discharge claim, and with respect to any pay disparity claims accruing prior to September 11, 1998. Defendants' motion for summary judgment is denied with respect to plaintiff's pay disparity claims arising after that date. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 4/5/2005) (jsa,) (Entered: 04/11/2005)
04/11/2005	91	OPINION AND ORDER # 91475. Defendants' motion for summary judgment is denied with respect to all of plaintiff's timely claims of sex discrimination in violation of Title VII and state law, regarding compensation disparities, failure to promote, demotion and retaliation. Defendants' motion is granted as to all claims with respect to pay disparity and failure to promote claims that are time barred. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 4/5/2005) (jsa,) Modified on 4/11/2005 (jsa,). (Entered: 04/11/2005)
05/25/2005	93	ORDER REFERRING CASE TO MAGISTRATE JUDGE. Order that case be referred to the Clerk of Court for assignment to a Magistrate Judge for settlement. Referred to Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 5/11/05) (kw,) (Entered: 05/27/2005)
06/13/2005		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Debra C. Freeman : Telephone Conference held on 6/13/2005. Next T/C set for 8/10/05 at 10:00 a.m. Tentative settlement date set for 8/17/05 at 11:00 a.m. (kw,) (Entered: 06/22/2005)
08/15/2005		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Debra C. Freeman : Settlement Conference held on 8/15/2005. (djc,) (Entered: 08/30/2005)
08/17/2005		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Debra C. Freeman : Settlement Conference held on 8/17/2005. (djc,) (Entered: 08/30/2005)
09/16/2005	94	ORDER of USCA (Certified Copy) USCA Case Number 05-8009-cv. Appellants move pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(f) for an interlocutory appeal of the district court's order granting Appellees' motion for class certification. Upon due consideration, it is ORDERED that the Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(f) petition is denied because an immediate appeal is not warranted. See Sumitomo Copper Litigation V. Credit Lyonnais Rouse, Ltd., 262 F.3d 134, 139-40 (2d Cir. 2001). Roseann B. MacKechnie, Clerk USCA. Certified: 9/15/2005. (nd,) (Entered: 09/19/2005)
09/19/2005	95	ORDER: Plaintiff Scheller's request for clarification of the Court's opinion and order of 4/5/2005 is denied. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 8/10/2005) (lb,) (Entered: 09/21/2005)
10/07/2005	96	MANDATE of USCA (Certified Copy) USCA Case Number 05-8009-cv. Appellants move pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(f) for an interlocutory appeal of the district court's order granting Appellees' motion for class certification. Upon due consideration, it is ORDERED that the Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(f) petition is denied because an immediate appeal is not warranted. See Sumitomo Copper Litigation V. Credit Lyonnais Rouse, Ltd., 262 F.3d 134, 139-40 (2d Cir. 2001). Roseann B.

		MacKechnie, Clerk USCA. Issued As Mandate: 10/6/2005. (nd,) (Entered: 10/11/2005)
10/11/2005		Transmission of USCA Mandate/Order to the District Judge re: 96 USCA Mandate Non-Dismissal,, (nd,) (Entered: 10/11/2005)
11/16/2005	97	MOTION to Modify Class Certification Order. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Maria Traverso, Teresa Jimenez, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller. (jmi,) (Entered: 11/17/2005)
11/16/2005	98	DECLARATION of Christine E. Webber in Support re: 97 MOTION to Modify Class Certification Order.. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Maria Traverso, Teresa Jimenez, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller. (jmi,) (Entered: 11/17/2005)
11/16/2005	99	DECLARATION of Imelda Rama in Support re: 97 MOTION to Modify Class Certification Order.. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Maria Traverso, Teresa Jimenez, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller. (jmi,) (Entered: 11/17/2005)
11/16/2005	100	DECLARATION of Martin R. Lee in Support re: 97 MOTION to Modify Class Certification Order.. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Maria Traverso, Teresa Jimenez, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller. (jmi,) (Entered: 11/17/2005)
11/18/2005	101	STIPULATION AND ORDER: for plaintiffs and defendants tha Plaintiff Scheller's claim for constructive discharge pursuant to state law(s) and her compensation claim under Massachusetts law for period before September 11, 1998 is hereby dismissed pursuant to the Court's Opinion and Order dated April 5, 2005 from which Plaintiff Scheller retains her right to appeal.So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 10/31/2005) (jmi,) (Entered: 11/18/2005)
11/22/2005	102	DECLARATION of Martin R. Lee in Support re: 97 MOTION to Modify Class Certification Order.. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller. (djc,) (Entered: 11/23/2005)
12/02/2005	103	OPPOSITION/RESPONSE to Motion re: 97 MOTION to Modify Class Certification Order.. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (djc,) (Entered: 12/05/2005)
12/02/2005	104	DECLARATION of Jeremy M. Brown in Opposition re: 97 MOTION to Modify Class Certification Order.. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (djc,) (Entered: 12/05/2005)
12/02/2005	105	DECLARATION of Paul F. White in Support of Opposititon to Plaintiffs'Motion to Modify Class Certification Order. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (djc,) (Entered: 12/05/2005)
12/09/2005	106	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E.Lynch from Jeremy M. Brown dated 12/7/05 re: a request that the following schedule be approved: Motions due by 12/9/2005. Responses due by 12/21/2005. Replies due by 1/13/2006. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 12/7/05) (kco,) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/09/2005	107	MOTION for an order, granting Summary Judgment to defendants and dismissing Plaintiff Scheller's Pay Disparity Claim Under to New York Law in its entirety, with prejudice, and awarding attorney's fees and costs. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (sac,) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/09/2005	108	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 107 MOTION for Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (sac,) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/09/2005	109	RULE 56.1 STATEMENT. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (sac,) (Entered: 12/12/2005)

12/09/2005	110	AFFIDAVIT of Kristin S. Rozic in Support re: 107 MOTION for Summary Judgment. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (sac,) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/09/2005	111	MOTION for an order, granting Sanctions and awarding attorney's fees and costs. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (sac,) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/09/2005	112	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 111 MOTION for an order, granting Sanctions. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (sac,) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/09/2005	113	AFFIDAVIT of Kristin S. Rozic in Support re: 111 MOTION for Sanctions.. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (sac,) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/09/2005	114	REPLY re: 97 MOTION to Modify Class Certification Order. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller. (sac,) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/09/2005	115	SECOND DECLARATION of Christine E. Webber in Support re: 97 MOTION to Modify Class Certification Order.. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller. (sac,) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/22/2005	116	AFFIDAVIT of Martin R. Lee in Opposition re: 107 MOTION for Summary Judgment., 111 MOTION for Sanctions.. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller. (djc,) (Entered: 12/27/2005)
12/22/2005	117	RULE 56.1 STATEMENT. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller. (djc,) (Entered: 12/27/2005)
12/22/2005	118	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 107 MOTION for Summary Judgment, 111 MOTION for Sanctions. Document filed by Heidi Scheller. (djc,) (Entered: 12/27/2005)
01/13/2006	119	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 111 MOTION for Sanctions., 107 MOTION for Summary Judgment. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd et al. (cd,) (Entered: 01/19/2006)
01/13/2006	120	DECLARATION of Kristin Rozic in Support re: 119 Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd.. (cd,) (Entered: 01/19/2006)
07/25/2006	<u>121</u>	OPINION AND ORDER #93411 re: 111 MOTION for Sanctions, is denied. filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of NY., Willis of New Jersey., Willis of Massachusetts., 107 MOTION for Summary Judgment. filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of NY., Willis of New Jersey., Willis of Massachusetts, is granted, plaintiff's pay dispaity claim under the New York Human Right Law is Dismissed. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 7/24/2006) (jmi,) Modified on 7/28/2006 (lb,). (Entered: 07/26/2006)
08/01/2006	122	MOTION to Intervene. Attached is Affirmation of Rosalind S. Fink in Support Document filed by Adrienne Cronas. (djc,) (Entered: 08/02/2006)
08/01/2006	123	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 122 MOTION to Intervene. Document filed by Adrienne Cronas. (djc,) (Entered: 08/02/2006)
08/17/2006	<u>124</u>	OPINION AND ORDER # 93556 re: 97 MOTION to Modify Class Certification Order filed by Shelley Hnot., Maria Traverso., Teresa Jimenez., Margaret Mahon., Heidi Scheller. Since plaintiffs have failed to establish a sufficient basis to amend the RCMP, to compel further discovery, or to modify the class certification order, their motion (doc #97) is DENIED. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 8/17/2006) (lb,) Modified on 8/18/2006 (rw,). (Entered: 08/17/2006)
08/30/2006	125	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Robert Herbst dated 8/21/06 re: counsel requests the following briefing schedule for motion to intervene: 9/1/06 for dfts' opposition papers to be served and 9/21/06 for reply. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 8/28/06) (dle,) (Entered: 08/30/2006)

08/30/2006		Set/Reset Deadlines as to 122 MOTION to Intervene.. Responses due by 9/1/2006 Replies due by 9/21/2006. (dle,) (Entered: 08/30/2006)
09/06/2006	126	DEFENDANTS' MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition to Adrienne Cronas' Motion to Intervene. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (rw,) (Entered: 09/06/2006)
09/06/2006	127	DECLARATION of BETTINA B. PLEVAN, ESQ. in Opposition to Adrienne Cronas' Motion to Intervene. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (rw,) (Entered: 09/06/2006)
09/21/2006	129	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 122 MOTION to Intervene. Document filed by Adrienne Cronas. (jco,) (Entered: 09/22/2006)
09/21/2006	130	DECLARATION of Christine E. Webber in Support of plaintiffs' reply in support of 122 MOTION to Intervene. Document filed by Adrienne Cronas. (jco,) (Entered: 09/22/2006)
09/21/2006	131	CERTIFICATION of Spencer Freedman in Support re: 122 MOTION to Intervene. Document filed by Adrienne Cronas. (jar,) (Entered: 09/22/2006)
09/26/2006	132	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Spencer Freedman dated 9/21/06 re: Counsel writes to request permission to file a reply memorandum of law of approximately 19 pages. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 9/21/06) (jco,) (Entered: 09/27/2006)
10/06/2006	133	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Jeremy M. Brown dated 9/29/2006 re: defendants request permission to file a 5–page sur–reply letter brief. ENDORSEMENT: Denied. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 10/4/2006) (lb,) (Entered: 10/10/2006)
11/30/2006	<u>134</u>	OPINION AND ORDER # 93992 re: 122 MOTION to Intervene filed by Adrienne Cronas. Having considered the totality of the circumstances, the Court denies as untimely Cronas's motion to intervene pursuant to F.R.C.P. 24(a) and (b). The Court therefore also denies Cronas's request to be appointed a class representative, her request to appoint her attorney as co–class counsel, and her requests to expand the class period and re–open discovery. As Cronas is not yet a party to this or any related action, her request to be considered a "party" for purposes of the confidentiality stipulation and order in the Hnot litigation is also denied, without prejudice to renewal at a later date. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 11/30/06) (jco,) Modified on 12/12/2006 (jco,). Modified on 3/14/2007 (rw). (Entered: 12/06/2006)
12/19/2006	135	NOTICE OF APPEAL from <u>134</u> Memorandum & Opinion. Document filed by Adrienne Cronas. Filing fee \$ 455.00, receipt number E 600589. Copies of Notice of Appeal mailed to Attorney(s) of Record: Proskauer Rose LLP. (nd,) (Entered: 12/19/2006)
12/19/2006		Transmission of Notice of Appeal to the District Judge re: 135 Notice of Appeal. (nd,) (Entered: 12/19/2006)
12/19/2006		Transmission of Notice of Appeal and Certified Copy of Docket Sheet to US Court of Appeals re: 135 Notice of Appeal. (nd,) (Entered: 12/19/2006)
12/20/2006	136	ORDER; Joint Pretrial Order due by 5/1/2007. The parties shall appear for Trial on 6/11/2007, @9:30 a.m. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 12/18/06) (pl,) (Entered: 12/20/2006)
01/12/2007	137	MOTION to Vacate the Court's prior Order granting class certification and awarding atty's fees and costs. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd.(cd) (Entered: 01/16/2007)
01/30/2007	138	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Avi Lew dated 1/26/2007 re: Plaintiffs are requesting leave to submit a memorandum of 40 pages, instead of the 25 pages, Willis consents to this request, and has requested that the number of pages permitted for their reply brief be enlarged to 20 pages. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 1/26/2007)

		(lb) (Entered: 01/31/2007)
01/31/2007	139	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Lynch from Christine Webber dated 1/19/07 re request that that plntfs' oppositon to Willis motion to decertify be fld on 2/2/07, and deft's reply be fld on 2/12/07: so ordered. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 1/23/07) (cd) (Entered: 01/31/2007)
01/31/2007		Set/Reset Deadlines as to 137 MOTION to Vacate.. Responses due by 2/2/2007 Replies due by 2/12/2007. (cd) (Entered: 01/31/2007)
02/07/2007	<u>141</u>	Appeal Record Sent to USCA (Index). Notice that the Original index to the record on Appeal for 135 Notice of Appeal filed by Adrienne Cronas USCA Case Number 06-5761-cv, 3 Copies of the index, Certified Clerk Certificate and Certified Docket Sheet were transmitted to the U.S. Court of Appeals. (tp) Additional attachment(s) added on 2/8/2007 (Pisarczyk, Thomas). (Entered: 02/07/2007)
02/13/2007	142	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 137 MOTION to Vacate.. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (jmi) (Entered: 02/16/2007)
02/27/2007	143	ORDER: It is hereby ordered that defendants file their expert report by 3/13/2007. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 2/23/2007) (lb) (Entered: 02/28/2007)
03/06/2007	144	ORDER that plaintiffs must file their expert report by 3/13/07; dfts must file their expert report by 3/20/07. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 3/6/07) (dle) (Entered: 03/07/2007)
03/09/2007	<u>145</u>	OPINION AND ORDER # 94401: Plaintiffs' class was properly certified under Rule 23. Accordingly, defendants' motion to vacate the class certification order is DENIED. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 3/8/07) (js) Modified on 3/13/2007 (Wilson, Richard). (Entered: 03/12/2007)
03/21/2007	<u>146</u>	FILING ERROR – ELECTRONIC FILING IN NON-ECF CASE – CROSS MOTION to Intervene (Seeking Relief from Order Denying Intervention Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 60(b)). Document filed by Adrienne Cronas.(Herbst, Robert) Modified on 3/22/2007 (KA). (Entered: 03/21/2007)
03/21/2007	<u>147</u>	FILING ERROR – ELECTRONIC FILING IN NON-ECF CASE – MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>146</u> CROSS MOTION to Intervene (Seeking Relief from Order Denying Intervention Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 60(b)). Document filed by Adrienne Cronas. (Herbst, Robert) Modified on 3/22/2007 (KA). (Entered: 03/21/2007)
03/21/2007	<u>148</u>	FILING ERROR – ELECTRONIC FILING IN NON-ECF CASE – AFFIRMATION of Robert L. Herbst in Support re: <u>146</u> CROSS MOTION to Intervene(Seeking Relief from Order Denying Intervention Pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 60(b)). Document filed by Adrienne Cronas. (Herbst, Robert) Modified on 3/22/2007 (KA). (Entered: 03/21/2007)
03/22/2007		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – NON-ECF CASE ERROR. Note to Attorney Robert Lloyd Herbst to MANUALLY RE-FILE Document Motion for intervention, Document No. 146. This case is not ECF. (KA) (Entered: 03/22/2007)
03/22/2007		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – NON-ECF CASE ERROR. Note to Attorney Robert Lloyd Herbst to MANUALLY RE-FILE Document Memorandum of Law in support of motion, Document No. 147. This case is not ECF. (KA) (Entered: 03/22/2007)
03/22/2007		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – NON-ECF CASE ERROR. Note to Attorney Robert Lloyd Herbst to MANUALLY RE-FILE Document Affirmation in support of motion, Document No. 148. This case is not ECF. (KA) (Entered: 03/22/2007)
03/27/2007	149	ORDER that no additional expert discovery beyond that already specifically authorized by this order or by a prior order of the court will be permitted. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 3/20/07) (cd) (Entered: 03/28/2007)

04/23/2007	150	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Gerard E. Lynch from Myron D. Rumeld dated 4/19/2007 re: request an extention of the submission of motions challenging admissablity deadline, until 5/22/2007, with respect to the testimony of the parties' experts. Endorsement: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 4/19/2007) (jar) (Entered: 04/24/2007)
05/01/2007	151	MOTION in Limine to admit the original deposition testimony of Dominic Giusto and James Murphy. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Adrienne Cronas, Heidi Scheller.(djc) (Entered: 05/02/2007)
05/01/2007	152	MOTION for an Order, in Limine to Bar Testimony from Witnesses Defts. Failed to Identify in Response to Interrogatory No. 1. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Maria Traverso, Teresa Jimenez, Adrienne Cronas, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller.(tro) (Entered: 05/02/2007)
05/01/2007	153	MOTION for an Order, in Limine to Strike Willis' Improper Counter-Designations of Deposition Testimony. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Maria Traverso, Teresa Jimenez, Adrienne Cronas, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller.(tro) (Entered: 05/02/2007)
05/01/2007	154	MOTION for an Order, for Linda Nussbaum and Jessica Glick Lyn to Withdraw as Attorney. Document filed by Maria Traverso, Margaret Mahon, Heidi Scheller.(tro) (Entered: 05/02/2007)
05/01/2007	156	(TRIAL) MEMORANDUM OF LAW. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (jeh) (Entered: 05/07/2007)
05/01/2007	157	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support of Motion Limine of Defts. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (jeh) (Entered: 05/07/2007)
05/01/2007	158	DECLARATION of Jeremy M. Brown in Support of Defts' Motions in Limine. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (jeh) (Entered: 05/08/2007)
05/01/2007	159	PROPOSED VOIR DIRE QUESTIONS. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY.(jeh) (Entered: 05/08/2007)
05/01/2007	160	PROPOSED VOIR DIRE QUESTIONS. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Adrienne Cronas, Heidi Scheller.(jeh) (Entered: 05/08/2007)
05/01/2007	161	PROPOSED JURY INSTRUCTIONS. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY.(jeh) (Entered: 05/08/2007)
05/01/2007	162	PROPOSED JURY INSTRUCTIONS. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Adrienne Cronas, Heidi Scheller.(jeh) (Entered: 05/08/2007)
05/03/2007	155	MEMO ENDORSEMENT granting 154 MOTION for Linda Nussbaum and Jessica Glick Lyn to Withdraw as Attorney. filed by Margaret Mahon, Maria Traverso, Heidi Scheller. Trial is scheduled to commence in this case on 6/11/07. Withdrawal of Ms. Nussbaum and Ms. Lyn will not result in a delay of this litigation. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 5/2/07) (cd) (Entered: 05/04/2007)
05/08/2007	163	Plaintiffs' Opposition to 153 MOTION in Limine. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Adrienne Cronas, Heidi Scheller. (jpo) Modified on 5/9/2007 (Polanco, Juan). (Entered: 05/09/2007)
05/08/2007	164	Plaintiffs Objection to 161 Defendants Proposed Jury Instructions. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Adrienne Cronas, Heidi Scheller. (jpo) (Entered: 05/09/2007)
05/08/2007	165	PLAINTIFFS' REBUTTAL to Defendants Trial Brief. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Adrienne Cronas, Heidi Scheller. (jpo) (Entered: 05/09/2007)
05/08/2007	166	DECLARATION of Christine E. Webber in support of plaintiffs opposition to Defendants motion in Limine. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Adrienne Cronas, Heidi Scheller. (jpo) (Entered: 05/09/2007)

05/08/2007	167	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 152 MOTION in Limine. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (laq) (Entered: 05/09/2007)
05/08/2007	168	DEFENDANTS' OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS PROPOSED VOIR DIRE. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (laq) (Entered: 05/09/2007)
05/08/2007	169	DEFENDANTS' OBJECTIONS TO PLAINTIFFS' PROPOSED JURY INSTRUCTIONS. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (laq) (Entered: 05/09/2007)
05/08/2007	170	DECLARATION of Jeremy M. Brown in Support OF DEFENDANTS' MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO LIMINE. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (laq) (Entered: 05/09/2007)
05/21/2007	171	ORDER plaintiff seek to preclude testimony by proposed defense witnesses Russell Merriam, Darlene Oliver, and Cindy Pramuk, on the ground that these witnesses were not disclosed in defendants' March 4, 2002, reponses to an interrogatory seeking the identities of all persons with knowledge of the facts relating to the complaint or defendants' answer. The motion will be denied.... SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 5/18/2007) (jmi) (Entered: 05/23/2007)
05/22/2007	172	DECLARATION of Bettina B. Pelvan in Support of the Willis' Group Motion in Limine to Preclude the Proposed Testimony of Dr. Eugene Borgida. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (tro) (Entered: 05/24/2007)
05/22/2007	173	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support of Deft's Motion in Limine to Preclude the Proposed Testimony of Dr. Eugene Borgida. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (tro) (Entered: 05/24/2007)
05/29/2007	174	DECLARATION of Christine E. Webber in Support of Plaintiffs' Opposition to Defendants' Motion in Limine to Proclude the Proposed Testimony of Dr. Eugene Borgida. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller. (djc) (Entered: 05/31/2007)
05/29/2007	175	RESPONSE/Opposition to Willis' Motion in Limine to Preclude the Proposed Testimony of Dr. Eugene Borgida. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Adrienne Cronas, Heidi Scheller. (djc) (Entered: 05/31/2007)
06/01/2007	<u>176</u>	OPINION AND ORDER #94744: Defendants argue that Borgida's testimony is not sufficiently tied to the facts of this case, or in the alternative, that his testimony is unfairly prejudicial. Defendants motion will be DENIED. Finally the Court is constrained to note the disappointingly tendentious quality of defendants briefing of these issues. Defendants correctly note that some Court's have excluded Borgida's testimony. Defendant's motion to exclude the testimony of Eugene Borgida is DENIED. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 6/1/07) (js) (Entered: 06/04/2007)
06/05/2007	<u>177</u>	MANDATE of USCA (Certified Copy) as to 135 Notice of Appeal filed by Adrienne Cronas USCA Case Number 06-5761. Ordered, Adjudged and Decreed that the judgment of the District Court is AFFIRMED. Catherine O'Hara Wolfe, Clerk USCA. Issued As Mandate: 6/5/2007. (nd) (Entered: 06/06/2007)
06/06/2007		Transmission of USCA Mandate/Order to the District Judge re: <u>177</u> USCA Mandate., (nd) (Entered: 06/06/2007)
06/06/2007	178	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE that Llezlie Lloren Green of the law firm Cohen, Milstein Hausfeld & Toll, P.L.L.C. appeared on behalf of the plaintiffs. document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller (jpo) (Entered: 06/11/2007)
06/13/2007	179	ORDER that the court has now reviewed the remaining objections to proposed excerpts not ruled on at the last conference, relating to the deposition testimony of the witnesses Dias, Sicard and Windrow. All objections are OVERRULED, except for

		the objections to pages 186–190 of Sicard's deposition, which is sustained. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 6/12/07) (dle) (Entered: 06/18/2007)
06/21/2007	180	ORDER; the objection to the testimony at pp. 146–150 is overruled because the answer, though lengthy, is responsive to the question. The objections to the testimony at pp. 364–375 are overruled because the testimony is relevant to Mr. Murphy's state of mind.....The objection that the testimony is speculative is also overruled. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 6/15/07) (kco) (Entered: 06/25/2007)
06/27/2007	181	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 6/11/07 before Judge Gerard E. Lynch. (jbe) (Entered: 06/27/2007)
08/06/2007	182	ORDER denying 151 Motion in Limine. Plaintiff's motion was denied as moot by order of the Court dated 5/18/2007. Accordingly the Clerk of the Court is respectfully directed to close the motion for all internal statistical purposes. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 8/2/07) (kco) (Entered: 08/07/2007)
08/06/2007	183	ORDER: The Court is advised that the plaintiffs' motion to withdraw counsel (Doc. #154) appears as an open motion on certain internal reports. Plaintiffs' motion was granted on May 2, 2007. (Doc. #155) Accordingly, the Clerk of the Court is respectfully directed to close the motion (Doc. #154) for all internal statistical purposes. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 8/2/2007) (jpo) (Entered: 08/07/2007)
08/09/2007	184	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 6/18, 6/19, 6/20, 6/21, 6/22, 2007 before Judge Gerard E. Lynch. (jbe) (Entered: 08/09/2007)
08/24/2007	185	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support of petition for award of atty fees and expenses. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller. (jp) (Entered: 08/28/2007)
08/24/2007	186	DECLARATION of Wayne N. Outten in Support of petition for award of atty fees and expenses. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller. (jp) (Entered: 08/28/2007)
08/24/2007	187	DECLARATION of Christine E. Webber. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller. (jp) (Entered: 08/28/2007)
08/24/2007	188	DECLARATION of Martin R. Lee. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller. (jp) (Entered: 08/28/2007)
10/11/2007	<u>189</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER: 1) Defendants shall submit their response to plaintiff's petition for attorneys fees by 11/2/07. 2) Plaintiffs shall submit their reply by 11/12/07. Set Deadlines: Responses due by 11/2/2007. Replies due by 11/12/2007. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 10/11/07) (db) (Entered: 10/11/2007)
10/18/2007	190	MOTION for an Order for PRELIMINARY APPROVAL OF CONSENT DECREE. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller. (jco) (Entered: 10/19/2007)
10/18/2007	191	NOTICE of PROPOSED CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT AND FAIRNESS HEARING. (jco) (Entered: 10/19/2007)
10/22/2007	<u>192</u>	ORDER that upon consideration of Plaintiffs' Motion for Preliminary Approval of the Proposed Consent Decree and the entire record herein, it is this 19th day of October, 2007 Ordered: The terms of the proposed Consent Decree are fair, reasonable and adequate to the class as a whole, and thus preliminary approval is hereby GRANTED. The proposed Notice summarizing the terms of the Consent Decree and attached thereto as Ex. B, is approved. Rust Consulting is hereby appointed Settlement Administrator, with their fees to be paid by Defendant. Within four days after the date of this Order, the Settlement Administrator shall send by certified mail, postage prepaid, to each person on the Class Notice List, a copy of the Notice as further set forth in this order. The Final Fairness Hearing will be held on 11/19/07 at 10:00 a.m. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 10/22/07) (dle) (Entered: 10/22/2007)
11/01/2007	193	SUPPLEMENTAL PETITION/ MOTION for Attorney Fees and Expenses. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller.(djc) (Entered: 11/05/2007)

11/01/2007	194	SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION of Martin R. Lee in Support re: 193 MOTION for Attorney Fees. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller. (djc) (Entered: 11/05/2007)
11/01/2007	195	SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION of Christine E. Webber in Support re: 193 MOTION for Attorney Fees. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller. (djc) (Entered: 11/05/2007)
11/02/2007	196	MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN OPPOSITION TO PLAINTIFFS' PETITION FOR AWARD FO ATTORNEYS' FEES AND EXPENSES. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (pl) (Entered: 11/05/2007)
11/02/2007	197	DECLARATION of Bettina B. Plevan in Opposition TO PLAINTIFFS' PETITION FOR AWARD FO ATTORNEYS' FEES AND EXPENSES. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (pl) (Entered: 11/05/2007)
11/13/2007	199	DECLARATION of Heidi Scheller in Support re: 193 MOTION for Attorney Fees. Document filed by Shelley Hnot. (djc) (Entered: 11/15/2007)
11/13/2007	200	REPLY to Defendants' Opposition to Plaintiffs' Petition for an Award of Attorneys' Fees and Expenses. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller. (djc) (Entered: 11/15/2007)
11/13/2007	201	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 193 MOTION for Attorney Fees.. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Heidi Scheller. (djc) (Entered: 11/15/2007)
11/13/2007	202	REPLY declaration of Christine E. Webber. Document filed by Shelley Hnot. (djc) (Entered: 11/15/2007)
11/14/2007	203	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Objection to the Consent Decree filed by class member Adrienne Cronas served on Christine E. Webber, Esq., Cohen, Milstein, Hausfeld &Toll, P.L.L.C. and Martin R. Lee, Esq, Warshaw Burstein Cohen Schlesinger &Kuh, LLP on 11/14/07. Service was made by via facsimile. Document filed by Willis Group Holdings Ltd., Willis North America Inc., Willis of Massachusetts, Willis of New Jersey, Willis of NY. (ae) (Entered: 11/19/2007)
11/20/2007	204	RESPONSE to Objection to Proposed Consent Decree. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Adrienne Cronas, Heidi Scheller. (djc) (Entered: 11/20/2007)
12/12/2007	205	SUPPLEMENTAL RESPONSE TO OBJECTION TO CONSENT DECREE. Document filed by Shelley Hnot, Adrienne Cronas, Heidi Scheller. (djc) (Entered: 12/13/2007)
02/25/2008	<u>207</u>	ORDER AND JUDGMENT upon consideration of plaintiff's motion for Final Approval of the Consent Decree, and the entire record herein, Pursuant to Rule 54(b) of the F.R.C.P., the Court finds that there is not just reason for delay and therefore directs entry of this Final Order and Judgment as a final judgment. Without in any way affecting the finality of this Final Order and Judgment, the Court hereby retains jurisdiction over this action as set forth in the Consent Decree. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 2/22/08) (jco) Modified on 3/5/2008 (ml). (Entered: 03/04/2008)
02/26/2008	206	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 2/21/2008 before Judge Gerard E. Lynch. (wb) (Entered: 02/26/2008)
04/07/2008	<u>209</u>	MEMORANDUM AND OPINION # 95934: For the foregoing reasons, plaintiffs' petition for award of attorney's fees and expenses is granted in part. Plaintiffs' request fees are reduced by \$63,585 for the Cohen firm and by \$3,352 for the Warshaw firm for excessive billing for paralegal time. The award for the Warshaw firm is reduced by \$49,519 for time spent on plaintiff Mahon after May 10, 2004. Plaintiffs are directed to calculate appropriate reductions implementing the Court's ruling with respect to excessive staffing of depositions, and to submit an explanation of the calculation and a proposed judgment for a fee award consistent with this Opinion. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 4/7/08) (js) Modified on 4/8/2008 (rw). (Entered: 04/08/2008)

04/29/2008	<u>210</u>	CONSENT JUDGMENT # 08,0725 FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES AND EXPENSES in favor of Cohen Milstein Hausfeld &Toll, PLLC in the amount of \$ 2,551,037.92 and in favor of Warshaw Burstein Cohen Schlesinger &Kuh, LLP in the amount of \$ 1,706,908.83. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch on 4/29/08) (Attachments: # <u>1</u> notice of right to appeal)(ml) (Entered: 05/02/2008)
------------	------------	--