

CLOSED, USMJ_Flanagan

U.S. District Court
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA (Eastern Division)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 4:98-cv-00136-H

Santana, et al v. Sears, Roebuck & Co.
Assigned to: Judge Malcolm J. Howard
Demand: \$0
Cause: 42:2000 Job Discrimination (Race)

Date Filed: 09/16/1998
Jury Demand: Plaintiff
Nature of Suit: 442 Civil Rights: Jobs
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Plaintiff

Plaintiff

**Equal Employment Opportunity
Commission**
TERMINATED: 12/16/1998

represented by **Erania Ebron-Fubara**
E.E.O.C.
129 W. Trade St.
Suite 400
Charlotte, NC 28202
704-344-6682
TERMINATED: 12/16/1998
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Mindy E. Weinstein
E. E. O. C.
Charlotte District Office
129 W. Trade Street, Suite 400
Charlotte, NC 28202-2799
704-344-6886
TERMINATED: 12/16/1998
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rosemary J. Fox
E.E.O.C.
129 W. Trade St.
Suite 400
Charlotte, NC 28202
704-344-6878
TERMINATED: 12/16/1998
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Francisco G. Santana
TERMINATED: 09/05/2001

represented by **David P. Voerman**
P.O. Box 12485
New Bern, NC 28561-2485
252-638-5611
TERMINATED: 09/05/2001

*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Plaintiff

**Equal Employment Opportunity
Commission**

represented by **Erانيا Ebron-Fubara**
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Mindy E. Weinstein
E. E. O. C.
129 W. Trade St.
Suite 400
Charlotte, NC 29202-2799
704-344-6886
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Mindy E. Weinstein
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Rosemary J. Fox
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

Defendant

Sears, Roebuck & Co.

represented by **Amy K. Reynolds**
Kilpatrick, Stockton LLP
3500 One First Union Center
Charlotte, NC 28202-6001
704-338-5000
*TERMINATED: 08/17/2001
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

James B. Spears, Jr.
Ogletree, Deakins, Nash, Smoak &
Stewart, P.C.
201 South College St., Suite 2300
Charlotte, NC 27244
US
704-342-2588
Fax: 342-4379
Email: jim.spears@ogletreedeakins.com

*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Stephen D. Dellinger

Ogletree, Deakins, Nash, Smoak &
Stewart, P.C.

201 South College St., Suite 2300
Charlotte, NC 27244

US

704-342-2588

Email:

steve.dellinger@ogletreedeakins.com

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
09/16/1998	1	Complaint filed alleging failure or refusal to hire based on national origin, Mexican, in violation of Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964. JURY DEMAND. (ll) (Entered: 09/18/1998)
09/16/1998		(ll) (Entered: 09/18/1998)
09/16/1998	2	Request for Waiver of Service as to Sears, Roebuck & Co. (**Not signed or dated by counsel and therefore not FILED) (ll) (Entered: 09/18/1998)
10/26/1998	3	Motion to intervene by Francisco G. Santana , cs. (response due 11/18/98) (dh) (Entered: 10/27/1998)
11/23/1998	4	Answer to Complaint by Sears, Roebuck & Co. (dh) (Entered: 11/23/1998)
11/23/1998		Motion(s) submitted: [3-1] motion to intervene by Francisco G. Santana submitted. CASE FILE TO JUDGE HOWARD FOR CONSIDERATION. (dh) (Entered: 11/23/1998)
12/16/1998	5	Order granting [3-1] motion to intervene by Francisco G. Santana signed by Malcolm J. Howard. cys served. (dh) (Entered: 12/16/1998)
12/16/1998	6	Request for Discovery Plan: Discovery Plan due by 1/5/99 (dh) (Entered: 12/16/1998)
12/31/1998		Letter on left side of case file - Parties have been given permission from USMJ Dixon to file discovery plan by 1/11/99. (ll) (Entered: 12/31/1998)
01/11/1999	7	Discovery Plan filed by Sears, Roebuck & Co., Francisco G. Santana (dh) (Entered: 01/13/1999)
01/13/1999		Case submitted to: USMJ Dixon [7-1] discovery submitted. CASE FILE TO USMJ DIXON FOR ENTRY OF SCHEDULING ORDER. (dh) (Entered: 01/13/1999)

01/22/1999	8	Order on Scheduling by Magistrate Wallace W. Dixon setting Discovery cutoff 6/1/99 Deadline for filing of all motions 7/1/99 Jury Trial scheduled for 10/18/99 before Judge Malcolm J. Howard Place: Greenville, NC No. of Interrogs. 25 No. of Depositions 10. Cys. served. Cal. cy. (ll) (Entered: 01/22/1999)
02/11/1999	9	Waiver of Service of Summons Returned Executed as to Sears, Roebuck & Co. 9/23/98 Answer due on 11/23/98 for Sears, Roebuck & Co. (ll) (Entered: 02/18/1999)
06/01/1999	10	Unopposed Motion by Sears, Roebuck & Co. to extend time for discovery period to July 16, 1999 . w/cs. (ll) (Entered: 06/01/1999)
06/01/1999		Motion(s) referred: referred [10-1] motion to extend time for discovery period to July 16, 1999 to USMJ Wallace W. Dixon. Case file to USMJ Dixon for consideration. (ll) (Entered: 06/01/1999)
06/08/1999	11	Order granting [10-1] motion to extend time for discovery period to July 16, 1999, reset discovery due for 7/16/99 reset motion filing deadline for 8/3/99 reset Jury trial before Judge Malcolm J. Howard for 11/1/99 Greenville, NC signed by Wallace W. Dixon, USMJ. Cys. served. Cal. cy. (ll) (Entered: 06/11/1999)
07/23/1999	12	Unopposed Motion by Equal Employment Opp to extend time for discovery . w/cs. (ll) (Entered: 07/23/1999)
07/23/1999		Motion(s) referred: referred [12-1] motion to extend time for discovery to USMJ Wallace W. Dixon. Case file to USMJ Dixon for consideration. (ll) (Entered: 07/23/1999)
07/26/1999		Letter dated July 22, 1999 From: David P. Voerman Re: Vacation Plans in Nov. Mr. Voerman advises the court of his vacation planned for November 12, 1999 through November 21, 1999 in Canada. Mr. Voerman seeks assistance in alerting the judges and calendaring clerks regarding his planned vacation. cy to Judge Howard. (dh) (Entered: 07/28/1999)
07/29/1999	13	Order granting [12-1] motion to extend time for discovery, reset discovery due for 8/16/99 , reset motion filing deadline for 8/31/99 signed by Wallace W. Dixon, USMJ. Cys. served. (ll) (Entered: 07/29/1999)
08/17/1999		Case submitted to: Wallace W. Dixon, USMJ for consideration of proposed Consent Protective Order submitted by parties. (ll) (Entered: 08/17/1999)
08/23/1999	14	Consent Protective Order re: confidentiality of discovery material. signed by Wallace W. Dixon, USMJ. Cys. served. (ll) (Entered: 08/23/1999)
08/31/1999	15	Motion by Sears, Roebuck & Co. for summary judgment , cs. w/attachments. (response due 9/23/99) (dh) (Entered: 09/03/1999)
08/31/1999	16	Memorandum by Sears, Roebuck & Co. in support of [15-1] motion for summary judgment, cs. (dh) (Entered: 09/03/1999)
09/01/1999		Pre-trial conference set at 10:00 10/21/99 before USMJ Louise W. Flanagan in G'ville at courthouse annex. (dh) (Entered: 09/01/1999)
09/01/1999		Jury trial set at 10:00 11/1/99 before Judge Malcolm J. Howard in G'ville. (dh) Modified on 09/01/1999 (Entered: 09/01/1999)

09/07/1999	17	Motion by EEOC to extend time to respond to defendant's motion for summary judgment . w/cs. Cy. to USMJ Dixon w/po. (ll) (Entered: 09/10/1999)
09/10/1999	18	Order granting [17-1] motion to extend time to respond to defendant's motion for summary judgment, Response to reset to 10/6/99 for [15-1] motion for summary judgment , reset Jury trial before Judge Malcolm J. Howard for 2/7/00 signed by Wallace W. Dixon, USMJ. Cys. served. Cal. cy. (ll) (Entered: 09/10/1999)
10/04/1999	19	Motion by EEOC to extend time for two-days to and including Oct. 8, 1999 to respond to deft's motion for summary judgment , cs. cy to Clerk w/p.o. (dh) (Entered: 10/12/1999)
10/08/1999	20	Order granting [19-1] motion by pla. to extend time for two-days to and including Oct. 8, 1999 to respond to deft's motion for summary judgment, Response to motion reset to 10/8/99 for [15-1] motion for summary judgment signed by David W. Daniel, Clerk. cys served 10/8/99. (dh) (Entered: 10/12/1999)
10/08/1999	22	Affidavit of Erania Ebron-Fubara by EEOC Re: [21-1] motion response. w/ attachments. (ll) (Entered: 10/19/1999)
10/12/1999	23	Memorandum by Francisco G. Santana in opposition to [15-1] motion for summary judgment. w/cs. Reply due on 10/29/99. (ll) (Entered: 10/19/1999)
10/12/1999	24	Affidavit of Francisco G. Santana by Francisco G. Santana Re: [21-1] motion response. w/attachments. (ll) (Entered: 10/19/1999)
10/18/1999	21	Response by EEOC to [15-1] motion for summary judgment. w/cs and attachments. Reply due on 10/27/99. (ll) (Entered: 10/19/1999)
10/19/1999	25	Document filed by defendant Sears, Roebuck & Co. titled: Defendant's Notice of Intent To File Its Reply To Plaintiffs' Responses To Defendant's Motion For Summary Judgment, cs. (dh) (Entered: 10/28/1999)
10/21/1999	26	Motion by Sears, Roebuck & Co. to exceed the ten page limit imposed on replies , cs. cy faxed to Clerk 10/28/99. (dh) (Entered: 10/28/1999)
10/25/1999	27	Reply by Sears, Roebuck & Co. to response to [15-1] motion for summary judgment, cs. (dh) Modified on 10/28/1999 (Entered: 10/28/1999)
10/25/1999	28	Document filed by defendant Sears, Roebuck & Co. titled: Defendant's Supplement To Its Motion For Summary Judgment, cs. w/attachments. (dh) Modified on 10/28/1999 (Entered: 10/28/1999)
10/28/1999		Motion(s) submitted: [15-1] motion for summary judgment submitted. CASE FILE TO JUDGE HOWARD FOR CONSIDERATION. (dh) (Entered: 10/28/1999)
10/29/1999	29	Order granting [26-1] motion to exceed the ten page limit imposed on replies signed by David W. Daniel, Clerk. cys served by mail. Telephoned counsel. (dh) Modified on 10/29/1999 (Entered: 10/29/1999)
12/08/1999		Pre-trial conference set at 1/20/00 before USMJ Louise W. Flanagan at courthouse annex. (dh) (Entered: 12/09/1999)
12/08/1999		Jury trial set at 2/7/00 before Judge Malcolm J. Howard in G'ville. (dh) (Entered: 12/09/1999)

01/12/2000		Updated docket sheet to Magistrate Judge Flanagan for pretrial conference scheduled for 1/20/00. (ll) (Entered: 01/12/2000)
01/18/2000	28	Faxed Motion by Francisco G. Santana to continue pretrial and trial , cs. cy to Judge Howard. Original to follow in the mail. (dh) (Entered: 01/19/2000)
01/18/2000	29	Order granting [28-1] motion to continue pretrial and trial, reset Jury trial before Judge Malcolm J. Howard for 3/6/00 in G'ville The clerk is directed to reset the pretrial accordingly. cys served by mail. Telephoned counsel. signed by Malcolm J. Howard, US Judge. (dh) (Entered: 01/19/2000)
01/31/2000	30	Unopposed Motion by Sears, Roebuck & Co. for a date certain for trial . w/cs. Cy. to Judge Howard w/po. (ll) (Entered: 01/31/2000)
02/03/2000	31	(**VACATED - SEE #43 ORDER OF 5/31/01**) Order mooting [30-1] motion for a date certain for trial, granting [15-1] motion for summary judgment. The court grants defendant's motion for summary judgment. The clerk is directed to close this case. cys served. signed by Maclcolm J. Howard, US Judge. OB Ref: CIV OB# 62, P-104. (dh) Modified on 05/31/2001 (Entered: 02/03/2000)
02/03/2000	32	(**VACATED ON 5/31/01 - SEE #43 ORDER) Judgment for Sears, Roebuck & Co. against Francisco G. Santana, EEOC. IT IS ORDERED AND ADJUDGED defendant's motion for summary judgment is granted and this case is closed. cys served. signed by David W. Daniel, Clerk. OB Ref: CIV OB# 62, P-105 (dh) Modified on 05/31/2001 (Entered: 02/03/2000)
02/03/2000		Case closed. Non-Permanent. (dh) (Entered: 02/03/2000)
02/14/2000	33	Bill of costs from defendants in the amount of \$4,075.89, w/attachments. (dh) (Entered: 03/03/2000)
03/03/2000		Bill of Costs submitted to Clerk for consideration. (dh) (Entered: 03/03/2000)
03/31/2000		Case file to appeal clerk. (ja) (Entered: 03/31/2000)
03/31/2000	35	Notice of appeal by EEOC (rp) (Entered: 04/24/2000)
04/04/2000	36	Notice of appeal by Francisco G. Santana (rp) (Entered: 04/24/2000)
04/07/2000		USCA appeal fees received: APPEAL FEE \$ 105.00 RECEIPT # 37186 (rp) (Entered: 04/24/2000)
04/12/2000	34	Order granting in part, denying in part [33-1] Bill of Costs. The defendant is ALLOWED \$2,931.55 in court reporting fees, \$80.00 in witness fees, and \$394.50 copy fees for a total award of \$3,406.05. signed by David W. Daniel, Clerk. OB Ref: CIV OB #63, p. 80. Cys. served. (ll) (Entered: 04/12/2000)
04/24/2000		Notice of Appellate Action to USCA and counsel re: [36-1] appeal by Francisco G. Santana, [35-1] appeal by EEOC Appeal Pkg. mailed consisting of Dkting Statement, Transm. Sheet and Index (rp) (Entered: 04/24/2000)
05/01/2000	37	Order THE COURT CONSOLIDATES THESE CASES FOR PURPOSES OF BRIEFING AND ORAL ARGUMENT signed by Patricia S. Connor. (rp) (Entered: 05/01/2000)

05/16/2000	38	Judgment for Sears, Roebuck & Co. against Francisco G. Santana, EEOC. IT IS ORDERED AND ADJUDGED defendant shall have and recover of the plaintiffs the sum of \$3,406.05 in costs. signed by David W. Daniel, Clerk. OB Ref: CIV OB #63, p. 108. Cys. served. (ll) (Entered: 05/16/2000)
06/14/2000		Certificate to USCA and counsel re: [36-1] appeal, [35-1] appeal certifying that the record in this case is complete for purposes of the appeal. Cy. to Judge (rp) (Entered: 06/14/2000)
12/12/2000		24 HOUR RECORD Transmitted record on appeal to U.S. Court of Appeals: [36-1] appeal by Francisco G. Santana, [35-1] appeal by EEOC (rp) (Entered: 12/12/2000)
03/20/2001	39	Opinion from USCA Re: [36-1] appeal, [35-1] appeal - REVERSED AND REMANDED (rp) (Entered: 03/20/2001)
05/02/2001		THE MANDATE IN THIS CASE WILL NOT ISSUE AT THE SCHEDULED TIME BECAUSE A TIMELY PETITION FOR REHEARING HAS BEEN FILED AND A TIMELY PETITION FOR REHEARING EN BANC HAS BEEN FILED (rp) (Entered: 05/02/2001)
05/14/2001		Record on appeal returned from U.S. Court of Appeals: [36-1] appeal by Francisco G. Santana, [35-1] appeal by EEOC (rp) (Entered: 05/14/2001)
05/15/2001	40	Order IT IS ORDERED THAT THE PETITION FOR REHEARING AND REHEARING EN BANC IS DENIED signed by Patricia S. Connor. (rp) (Entered: 05/15/2001)
05/24/2001	41	Certified copy of judgment of USCA Re: [36-1] appeal, [35-1] appeal - THE COURT REVERSED AND REMANDED THE JUDGMENT OF THE DISTRICT COURT (rp) (Entered: 05/24/2001)
05/24/2001		**Remove appeal flag - no further appeals pending (rp) (Entered: 05/24/2001)
05/24/2001	42	Order THE COURT AWARDS EEOC \$578 IN COSTS signed by Patricia S. Connor. (rp) (Entered: 05/24/2001)
05/29/2001		Case submitted to: Judge Howard [41-1] submitted. CASE FILE TO JUDGE HOWARD FOR CONSIDERATION. (dh) (Entered: 05/29/2001)
05/31/2001	43	Order - In accordance with the order of the Fourth Circuit, this court's February 3, 2000 is hereby vacated; vacating [31-1] order , set Jury trial before Judge Malcolm J. Howard for 10:00 a.m. on 8/20/01 in Greenville. signed by Malcolm J. Howard, USDJ. OB Ref: CIV OB #66, p. 96. Cys. served. Cal. cy. (ll) Modified on 05/31/2001 (Entered: 05/31/2001)
05/31/2001		Case reopened. (ll) (Entered: 05/31/2001)
06/21/2001		Pre-trial conference set at 9:30 8/7/01 before USMJ Louise W. Flanagan at courthouse annex. (dh) (Entered: 06/21/2001)
06/21/2001		Jury trial set at 10:00 8/20/01 before Judge Malcolm J. Howard in G'ville. (dh) (Entered: 06/21/2001)
07/09/2001	44	Motion by Amy K. Reynolds co-counsel for deft. Sears, Roebuck & Co. to withdraw as counsel of record , cs. (response due 8/1/01) (dh) (Entered: 07/09/2001)

		07/11/2001)
07/16/2001	45	Joint motion by EEOC, Francisco G. Santana, Sears, Roebuck & Co. to continue pretrial and trial , cs. cy to Judge Howard. (dh) (Entered: 07/17/2001)
07/17/2001	46	Order granting [45-1] joint motion to continue pretrial and trial, reset Jury trial before Judge Malcolm J. Howard for 10/15/01 The clerk shall reschedule pretrial accordingly. ccys served. calendar copy. signed by Malcolm J. Howard, US Judge. (dh) (Entered: 07/17/2001)
07/23/2001	47	Notice of attorney appearance for Sears, Roebuck & Co. by Stephen D. Dellinger. w/cs. (ll) (Entered: 07/24/2001)
08/08/2001		Motion(s) referred: referred [44-1] motion to withdraw as counsel of record to USMJ William A. Webb. CASE FILE TO USMJ WEBB FOR CONSIDERATION. (dh) (Entered: 08/08/2001)
08/08/2001		(dh) (Entered: 08/08/2001)
08/08/2001	48	Document filed by plaintiff Francisco G. Santana titled: Objections To Defendant's Request For Admission, cs. (dh) (Entered: 08/09/2001)
08/13/2001		Pre-trial conference set at 10:00 10/3/01 before USMJ Louise W. Flanagan at courthouse annex. (dh) (Entered: 08/13/2001)
08/13/2001		Jury trial set at 10:00 a.m. on 10/16/01 before Judge Malcolm J. Howard in G'ville. (dh) (Entered: 08/13/2001)
08/13/2001	49	Order Reassigning Magistrate Judge - The magistrate judge designation shall be changed to the Honorable Louise W. Flanagan. The Honorable Malcolm J. Howard shall remain as the presiding district judge. All future pleadings should reflect the revised case number of: 4:98-CV-136-H4. signed by David W. Daniel, Clerk. Cys. served. (ll) (Entered: 08/13/2001)
08/13/2001		(ll) (Entered: 08/13/2001)
08/13/2001		Motion(s) referred: referred [44-1] motion to withdraw as counsel of record to USMJ Louise W. Flanagan. Case file to USMJ Flanagan for consideration. (ll) (Entered: 08/13/2001)
08/17/2001	50	Order granting [44-1] motion to withdraw as counsel of record, for Amy K. Reynolds to withdraw as attorney (Terminated attorney Amy K. Reynolds for Sears, Roebuck & Co. signed by Louise W. Flanagan, USMJ. Cys. served. (ll) (Entered: 08/17/2001)
09/04/2001	51	Stipulation of dismissal by plaintiff/intervenor Santana and Sears, Roebuck and Co. - stipulate that Plaintiff Santana dismisses with prejudice his individual claims against Sears, Roebuck and Co. Further, Santana dismisses with prejudice all claims for damages against Sear, Roebuck and Co., including but not limited to all claims for backpay, past and/or future pecuniary losses, past and/or future nonpecuniary losses, compensatory damages, emotional pain and suffering damages and/or punitive damages. (dh) (Entered: 09/05/2001)
09/28/2001		Case submitted to: Louise W. Flanagan, USMJ [0-0] pre-trial conference scheduled for 10/3/01. (ll) (Entered: 09/28/2001)

10/01/2001		CASE FILE RETURNED from: Judge Flanagan's chambers. (ll) (Entered: 10/01/2001)
10/01/2001		Telephoned counsel and advised there was no need for counsel to come to the Pretrial Conf. on 10/3/01 since the parties have submitted a proposed Consent Decree. (ll) (Entered: 10/01/2001)
10/01/2001		Case submitted to: Judge Howard for consideration of proposed Consent Decree submitted by parties. (ll) (Entered: 10/01/2001)
10/10/2001	52	Consent (Decree) judgment for EEOC against Sears, Roebuck & Co. (See document for terms of decree.) signed by Malcolm J. Howard, USDJ. OB Ref: CIV OB #67, p. 58. Cys. served. (ll) (Entered: 10/10/2001)
10/10/2001		Case closed. Permanent. (ll) (Entered: 10/10/2001)

PACER Service Center

Transaction Receipt

05/22/2007 12:50:06

PACER Login:	hs0328	Client Code:	eeoc
Description:	Docket Report	Search Criteria:	4:98-cv-00136-H
Billable Pages:	5	Cost:	0.40