

**U.S. District Court
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:03-cv-09917-LAP-KNF**

LV et al v. New York City Department of Education et al
Assigned to: Judge Loretta A. Preska
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Kevin Nathaniel Fox
Related Case: [1:07-cv-08323-RJH](#)
Cause: 42:1983 Prisoner Civil Rights

Date Filed: 12/12/2003
Date Terminated: 04/10/2008
Jury Demand: Defendant
Nature of Suit: 440 Civil Rights: Other
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

LV

represented by **Elisa F. Hyman**
Friedman & Moses LLP
233 Broadway, Suite 901
New York, NY 10279
(212)-732-5800
Fax: (212)-608-3280
Email: elisahyman@gmail.com
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jeffrey Lance Nagel
Gibbons P.C. (NY)
One Pennsylvania Plaza, 37th Floor
New York, NY 10119
(212)-613-2061
Fax: (212)-554-9661
Email: jnagel@gibbonslaw.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joseph S. Genova
Milbank, Tweed, Hadley etc.
1 Chase Manhattan Plaza
New York, NY 10005
212/530-5000
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Randee J. Waldman
151 West 30th Street
5th Floor
New York, NY 10001
(212) 947-9779
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rebecca Caren Shore
Advocates for Children of New York, Inc,
(NYC)
151 West 30th Street, 5th Flr.
New York, NY 10001
(212) 822-9574
Fax: (212) 947-9790
Email: rshore@advocatesforchildren.org
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sonal Patel
Advocates for Children of New York, Inc,
(NYC)
151 West 30th Street, 5th Flr.
New York, NY 10001

(212)–822–9541
Fax: (212)–947–9790
Email: spatel@advocatesforchildren.org
LEAD ATTORNEY

Cynthia Margaret Godsoe
Advocates for Children of New York, Inc,
(NYC)
151 West 30th Street, 5th Flr.
New York, NY 10001
(212) 947–9779
Fax: (212) 947–9790
Email: cgodsoe@advocatesforchildren.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jeffrey Scott Dantowitz
Office of Corporation Counsel NYC
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
212–788–0939
Fax: 212–788–8877
Email: jdantowi@law.nyc.gov
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rachel Penski Fissell
Milbank, Tweed, Hadley & McCloy LLP
601 South Figueroa St.
Los Angeles, CA 90017
(212)–530–5661
Fax: (212)–822–5661
Email: rpenski@milbank.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shawn V. Morehead
Afra Health & Retirement Funds
261 Madison Avenue
New York, NY 10016
(212) 336–2000
Email: sjmorehead@yahoo.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

VSG

represented by **Elisa F. Hyman**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jeffrey Lance Nagel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joseph S. Genova
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Randee J. Waldman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sonal Patel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Cynthia Margaret Godsoe
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jeffrey Scott Dantowitz
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rachel Penski Fissell
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shawn V. Morehead
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

RC

represented by **Elisa F. Hyman**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jeffrey Lance Nagel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joseph S. Genova
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Randee J. Waldman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sonal Patel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Cynthia Margaret Godsoe
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jeffrey Scott Dantowitz
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rachel Penski Fissell
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shawn V. Morehead
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

AD

represented by **Elisa F. Hyman**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jeffrey Lance Nagel
(See above for address)

*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Joseph S. Genova
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Randee J. Waldman
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Sonal Patel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Cynthia Margaret Godsoe
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jeffrey Scott Dantowitz
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rachel Penski Fissell
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

NA

represented by **Elisa F. Hyman**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jeffrey Lance Nagel
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Joseph S. Genova
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Randee J. Waldman
(See above for address)
*LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Sonal Patel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Cynthia Margaret Godsoe
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rachel Penski Fissell
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

YG

represented by **Elisa F. Hyman**
(See above for address)

LEAD ATTORNEY

Jeffrey Lance Nagel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joseph S. Genova
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Randee J. Waldman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sonal Patel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Cynthia Margaret Godsoe
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rachel Penski Fissell
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

LO

represented by **Elisa F. Hyman**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Jeffrey Lance Nagel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joseph S. Genova
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Randee J. Waldman
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sonal Patel
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY

Cynthia Margaret Godsoe
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rachel Penski Fissell
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

New York City Department of Education

represented by **Jeffrey Scott Dantowitz**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

New York City Board of Education

represented by **Jeffrey Scott Dantowitz**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Joel Klein

*in his individual and official capacity as
Chancellor of the New York City School
District
TERMINATED: 01/24/2011*

represented by **Emily Sweet**
NYC Law Department, Office of the
Corporation Counsel (NYC)
100 Church Street
New York, NY 10007
(212) 788-1171
Fax: (212) 788-8877
Email: esweet@law.nyc.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jeffrey Scott Dantowitz
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Dennis M. Walcott

*in his individual and official capacity as
Chancellor of the New York City School
District*

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
12/12/2003	1	COMPLAINT against Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. (Filing Fee \$ 150.00, Receipt Number 494291) Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG.(cd,) (Entered: 12/23/2003)
12/12/2003		SUMMONS ISSUED as to Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. (cd,) (Entered: 12/23/2003)
12/12/2003		CASE REFERRED TO Judge John G. Koeltl as possibly similar to 1:03-cv-8519. (cd,) (Entered: 12/23/2003)
01/07/2004	2	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge John G. Koeltl from Emily Sweet dated 1/5/04. Application granted. Defendants' time to respond to the Complaint is extended to 1/22/04. (Signed by Judge John G. Koeltl on 1/5/04) (sac,) (Entered: 01/16/2004)
01/07/2004		Set Answer Due Date purs. to 2 Endorsed Letter as to Joel Klein answer due on 1/22/2004; New York City Board of Education answer due on 1/22/2004; New York City Department of Education answer due on 1/22/2004. (sac,) (Entered: 01/16/2004)
01/14/2004		CASE DECLINED AS NOT SIMILAR. Case referred as similar to 1:03-cv-8519 and declined by Judge John G. Koeltl and returned to wheel for assignment. (gf,) (Entered: 01/20/2004)
01/14/2004	3	NOTICE OF CASE ASSIGNMENT to Judge Richard J. Holwell. Judge Unassigned no longer assigned to the case. (gf,) (Entered: 01/20/2004)

01/14/2004		Magistrate Judge Kevin N. Fox is so designated. (gf,) (Entered: 01/20/2004)
01/14/2004	4	FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT amending 1 Complaint against Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education.Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. Related document: 1 Complaint filed by AD, LV, VSG, RC, NA, YG, LO.(tp,) Modified on 1/20/2004 (tp,). (Entered: 01/20/2004)
01/14/2004		Set Answer Due Date re: 4 Amended Complaint, as to Joel Klein answer due on 1/26/2004; New York City Board of Education answer due on 1/26/2004; New York City Department of Education answer due on 1/26/2004. (tp,) (Entered: 01/20/2004)
01/29/2004	5	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of MEMO ENDORSED LETTER DATED JANUARY 28, 2004 served on ELISA AYMAN, ESQ. and SONAL PATEL, ESQ. on 1/28/04. Service was made by FAX. Document filed by Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. (rw,) (Entered: 02/04/2004)
01/29/2004	6	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Holwell from Emily Sweet dated 1/28/2004 re: Defendants request that the time for the defendants to answer the complaint be extended to 2/9/2004. The application is granted.. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 1/28/2004) (jsa,) (Entered: 02/04/2004)
01/29/2004		Set Answer Due Date purs. to 6 Endorsed Letter, as to Joel Klein answer due on 2/9/2004; New York City Board of Education answer due on 2/9/2004; New York City Department of Education answer due on 2/9/2004. (jsa,) (Entered: 02/04/2004)
02/05/2004	7	MOTION to Certify Class of all persons who, now and in the future, obtain a favorable order or stip of settlement through an impartial due process hearing relating to a childs idenification, evaluation, educational placement or the provision of a free appropriate public education.. (NDB). Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. Return Date set for 3/4/2004 before Richard J. Holwell. (pa,) (Entered: 02/10/2004)
02/05/2004	8	DECLARATION of Matthew Lenaghan in Support re: 7 MOTION to Certify Class.(NDB). Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (pa,) (Entered: 02/10/2004)
02/05/2004	9	DECLARATION of Kim Sweet in Support re: 7 MOTION to Certify Class..(NDB) Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (pa,) (Entered: 02/10/2004)
02/05/2004	10	DECLARATION of Michael D. Hampden in Support re: 7 MOTION to Certify Class.(NDB). Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (pa,) (Entered: 02/10/2004)
02/05/2004	11	DECLARATION of Irene Hwang in Support re: 7 MOTION to Certify Class.(NDB). Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (pa,) (Entered: 02/10/2004)
02/05/2004	12	DECLARATION of Elisa Hyman in Support re: 7 MOTION to Certify Class.(NDB). Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (pa,) (Entered: 02/10/2004)
02/05/2004	13	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 7 MOTION to Certify Class. (NDB). Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (pa,) (Entered: 02/10/2004)
02/10/2004	14	ANSWER to Amended Complaint with JURY DEMAND. Document filed by Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. Related document: 4 Amended Complaint, filed by AD, LV, VSG, RC, NA, YG, LO.(gmo,) (Entered: 02/11/2004)
02/19/2004	15	ORDER RE SCHEDULING AND INITIAL PRETRIAL CONFERENCE:... If such a consent order is not filed within the time provided,... Initial Conference set for 3/26/2004 02:00 PM before Richard J. Holwell. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 2/17/2004) (jsa,) (Entered: 02/23/2004)

02/19/2004		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Initial Conference set for 3/26/2004 02:00 PM before Richard J. Holwell. (jsa,) (Entered: 02/23/2004)
02/23/2004	16	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Holwell from Emily Sweet dated 2/20/2004 re: extension of time to file response to plaintiff's motion for class certification. The request is granted. Defendant's time to respond is extended to 3/3/2004. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 2/20/2004) (jsa,) (Entered: 02/24/2004)
02/23/2004		Set/Reset Deadlines: Responses due by 3/3/2004 (jsa,) (Entered: 02/24/2004)
03/05/2004	17	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 7 MOTION to Certify Class and IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANT'S CROSS-MOTION TO DISMISS THE CLAIMS ASSERTED BY HR. Document filed by Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. (laq,) (Entered: 03/09/2004)
03/05/2004	18	CROSS-MOTION, for an Order, pursuant to FRCP 12(c), dismissing the claims asserted in this action by plaintiff HR on the ground that plaintiff HR lacks standing. Declaration of John Cahalin along with Exhibits are attached. Document filed by Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. (tp,) (Entered: 03/11/2004)
03/09/2004	19	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Holwell from Emily Sweet dated 3/3/2004 re: extension of time until 3/5/2004 to respond to plaintiff's motion for class certification. The application is granted. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 3/8/2004) (jsa,) (Entered: 03/11/2004)
03/09/2004		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Responses due by 3/5/2004 (jsa,) (Entered: 03/11/2004)
03/18/2004	20	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition To Defendants' Motion To Dismiss And In Further Support Of Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (jmi,) (Entered: 03/22/2004)
03/18/2004	21	DECLARATION of Sonal Y. Patel, ESQ. in Opposition To Defendants' Motion To Dismiss And In Further Support Of Plaintiffs' Motion For Class Certification. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (jmi,) (Entered: 03/22/2004)
03/24/2004	22	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Holwell from Emily Sweet dated 03/23/04 re: Granting counsel's request for a one-day extension of time for the parties to submit their joint scheduling report; (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 3/23/04) (dj,) (Entered: 03/26/2004)
03/26/2004	23	NOTICE OF MOTION to Intervene..permitting CW. SS. MG. ST. RZ. JP. and MC to intervene in this action and granting plttfs motion to amend the first amended compl..(nite dep. box) Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (pa,) (Entered: 03/29/2004)
03/26/2004	24	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 23 MOTION to Intervene..(nite dep. box) Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (pa,) (Entered: 03/29/2004)
03/26/2004	25	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support of a TRO and Preliminary Injunction on behalf of CW, SS and RLB (nite dep. box). Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (pa,) (Entered: 03/29/2004)
03/26/2004	26	DECLARATION of Sonal Y. Patel in Support re: 23 MOTION to Intervene..(nite dep. box) Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (pa,) (Entered: 03/29/2004)
03/30/2004		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Holwell : Telephone Conference held on 3/30/2004. (pl,) (Entered: 04/06/2004)
03/31/2004		MEMORANDUM TO THE DOCKET CLERK: both parties appeared in the Court of USDJ Holwell. For case summary and oral argument. The Court reserves decision and a hearing is scheduled for 4/14/04 at 10:30 a.m. (db,) (Entered: 04/05/2004)
03/31/2004		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Oral Argument set for 4/14/2004 10:30 AM before Richard J. Holwell. (db,) (Entered: 04/05/2004)

04/01/2004	27	AMENDED MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Application for a Temporary Restraining Order and Preliminary Injunction on Behalf of CW, SS and RLB.. Document filed by Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. (djc,) (Entered: 04/05/2004)
04/01/2004	28	DECLARATION of Linda Wernikoff in Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion for a TRO. Document filed by Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. (djc,) (Entered: 04/05/2004)
04/01/2004	29	DECLARATION of Emily Sweet in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for a Temporary Restraining order. Document filed by Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. (djc,) (Entered: 04/05/2004)
04/01/2004	30	DECLARATION of Janice L. Birnbaum of personal facts.. Document filed by New York City Department of Education. (djc,) (Entered: 04/05/2004)
04/03/2004	32	DECLARATION of CW in Support of motion for a temporary restraining order and preliminary injunction. Document filed by CW. (yv,) (Entered: 04/08/2004)
04/06/2004	31	MEMORANDUM TO THE DOCKET CLERK: that a telephone conference was held on 3/30/04 before Judge Richard J. Howell. (pl,) (Entered: 04/06/2004)
04/06/2004	33	Letter addressed to Judge Richard J. Holwell from Randee Waldman, Esq. dated 4/2/04 re: plaintiff letter brief in support of motion for TRO. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG.(kw,) (Entered: 04/08/2004)
04/14/2004	35	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Holwell from Elisa Hyman, Esq. dated 4/12/04. Granting parties' request that the hearing for preliminary injunction scheduled for 4/14/04 be adjourned for two weeks. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 4/12/04) (kw,) (Entered: 04/16/2004)
04/15/2004	34	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Order adjourning the preliminary injunction hearing served on New York City Department of Education, New York City Board of Education and Chancellor Joel Klein on 4/14/04. Service was made by facsimile. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (yv,) (Entered: 04/16/2004)
04/19/2004	36	ORDER; that a conference will be held on the issue of plaintiff's request for expedited discovery on Thursday, 4/22/04, @2:30 p.m. in Courtroom 17B. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 4/16/04) (pl,) (Entered: 04/21/2004)
04/21/2004	37	STIPULATION AND ORDER that dfts do not oppose plaintiffs' application for leave to file and serve their second amended complaint which was annexed as an exhibit to plaintiffs' and proposed intervenors' motion to intervene and amend the complaint; dfts reserve all defenses to the second amended complaint and their rights to move against the second amended complaint. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 4/19/04) (dle,) (Entered: 04/21/2004)
04/22/2004	39	MEMORANDUM TO THE DOCKET CLERK: Conference held. Both parties to exchange discovery material and inform the Court of any motions that arise. Next PTC set for 5/4/04 at 2:00 p.m. (yv,) (Entered: 04/26/2004)
04/22/2004		Set/Reset Hearings: Pretrial Conference set for 5/4/2004 at 02:00 PM before Richard J. Holwell. (yv,) (Entered: 04/26/2004)
04/26/2004	38	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 3/31/2004 before Judge Richard J. Holwell.(jmi,) (Entered: 04/26/2004)
05/05/2004	40	DECLARATION of Sally Mckay in Support re: 18 MOTION to Dismiss.. Document filed by Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. (jmi,) (Entered: 05/06/2004)
05/05/2004	41	MOTION to Dismiss. Document filed by Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. Return Date set for 5/27/2004 09:30 AM. (jmi,) (Entered: 05/06/2004)
05/05/2004	42	DECLARATION of John Cahalin in Support re: 41 MOTION to Dismiss.. Document filed by Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. (jmi,) (Entered: 05/06/2004)

05/05/2004	43	DEFENDANTS' MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support Of Their Partial Motion To Dismiss The Second Amended Complaint. Document filed by Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. (jmi,) (Entered: 05/06/2004)
05/06/2004	44	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard Holwell from Emily sweet dated 5/4/04 re: granting dfts request for a brief extension of the scheduled conference; the conference is hereby adjourned to Friday, 5/7/04 @3:30 p.m.. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 5/4/04) (pl,) (Entered: 05/10/2004)
05/06/2004		Set/Reset Scheduling Order Deadlines: Pretrial Conference reset for 5/7/2004 03:30 PM before Richard J. Holwell. (pl,) (Entered: 05/10/2004)
05/07/2004		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Holwell : Status Conference held on 5/7/2004. (kw,) (Entered: 05/11/2004)
05/07/2004		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Pretrial Conference set for 5/27/2004 03:30 PM before Richard J. Holwell. (kw,) (Entered: 05/11/2004)
05/07/2004		MEMORANDUM TO THE DOCKET CLERK: for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Holwell : Status Conference held on 5/7/2004. Discovery in progress on section of students in test locations. At next conference defendants to report to the Court on their findings. Next PTC set for 5/27/04 at 3:30 p.m. (kw,) (Entered: 05/11/2004)
05/13/2004	45	ORDER; that the Second Amended Complaint shall be and hereby is deemed served as of 4/15/04 and filed as of 4/16/04. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 5/12/04) (pl,) (Entered: 05/14/2004)
05/13/2004	46	SECOND AMENDED COMPLAINT amending 4 Amended Complaint, against Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. Related document: 4 Amended Complaint, filed by AD, LV, VSG, RC, NA, YG, LO.(jco,) (Entered: 05/19/2004)
05/17/2004	48	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 41 MOTION to Dismiss.. Document filed by LV. (jmi,) (Entered: 05/21/2004)
05/20/2004	47	DECLARATION of Matthew Lenaghan, Esq in Opposition re: 41 MOTION to Dismiss.. Document filed by LV. (jmi,) (Entered: 05/21/2004)
05/20/2004	49	DECLARATION of Karen Smith in Opposition re: 41 MOTION to Dismiss.. Document filed by LV. (jmi,) (Entered: 05/21/2004)
05/27/2004		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Holwell : Status Conference held on 5/27/2004. Discovery issues discussed. Next PTC set for 6/23/04 at 2:30 p.m. (jco,) (Entered: 06/02/2004)
06/07/2004	50	SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION of John Cahalin in Support re: 41 MOTION to Dismiss.. Document filed by Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. (dle,) (Entered: 06/07/2004)
06/07/2004	51	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 41 MOTION to Dismiss.. Document filed by Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. (dle,) (Entered: 06/07/2004)
06/14/2004	52	NOTICE of Appearance by Joseph S. Genova, Jeffrey Lance Nagel on behalf of AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG (jp,) (Entered: 06/15/2004)
06/23/2004		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Holwell : Status Conference held on 6/23/2004. Pretrial Conference set for 7/21/2004 at 2:00 PM before Richard J. Holwell. (sac,) (Entered: 06/25/2004)
06/25/2004	53	ORDER; a conference shall be held before Judge Holwell on July 21, 2004, at 2:00 p.m. at which the parties will advise the Court on the status of settlement discussions and discovery. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 06/23/04) (djc,) (Entered: 06/30/2004)

07/12/2004	54	ORDER REFERRING CASE TO MAGISTRATE JUDGE. Order that case be referred to the Clerk of Court for assignment to a Magistrate Judge for General Pretrial (includes scheduling, discovery, non-dispositive pretrial motions, and settlement). Referred to Magistrate Judge Kevin Nathaniel Fox. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 6/23/04) (ae,) (Entered: 07/13/2004)
07/21/2004	55	MEMORANDUM TO THE DOCKET CLERK: Status conference held on 7/21/2004. (jp,) (Entered: 07/22/2004)
07/21/2004		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Holwell : Status Conference held on 7/21/2004. (jp,) (Entered: 07/22/2004)
08/11/2004		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Holwell : Interim Pretrial Conference held on 8/11/2004. Settlement discussions ongoing. Next Pretrial Conference set for 9/10/2004 12:00 PM before Richard J. Holwell. (ja,) (Entered: 08/12/2004)
09/10/2004		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Holwell : Interim Pretrial Conference held on 9/10/2004. Parties are in settlement discussions; The parties will report on discussions on next conference. Next PTC set for 9/28/04 at 2:30 p.m. (jco,) (Entered: 09/13/2004)
09/16/2004	56	ORDER The parties shall take the following actions as directed by the Court at a 09/10/24 pretrial conference; Parties shall report to the court on 09/28/04 at 2:30 p.m regarding the status of settlement discussions. Withdrawing without prejudice re: 7 MOTION to Certify Class ; and shall re-file to include the claims of proposed intervenors CW, SS, MG MS, ST, RZ, JP and MC, whose motion to intervene is granted. The parties shall confer and propose to the Court on 09/28/04 a schedule for the expeditious completion of any necessary discovery and briefing of a re-filed motion for class certification. docmt filed by AD, LV, VSG, RC, NA, YG, LO (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 09/14/04); copies faxed by chambers (djc,) (Entered: 09/20/2004)
09/28/2004		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Holwell : Status Conference held on 9/28/2004. Settlement discussion ongoing; briefing schedule on plaintiff's class action motion set; parties to submit revised case management schedule. O/A hearing set for 12/7/04 at 5:00 p.m. (jco,) (Entered: 10/04/2004)
09/30/2004	57	SCHEDULING ORDER:Plaintiff's opening brief for the motion for clas certification shall be served and filed by 10/22/2004. Dft's Responses due by 11/17/2004. Replies due by 11/24/2004. Additional discovery deadlines are as set forth in this Order. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 9/28/04); Copies Faxed By Chambers (pl,) (Entered: 10/07/2004)
10/08/2004	58	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Holwell from Sarah Hechtman dated 10/5/04 re: the parties request an etension of time until Tuesday, 10/19 to jointly submit a proposed case management schedule. Application granted. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on Sarah Hechtman) Copies Faxed By Chambers.(sac,) (Entered: 10/13/2004)
10/22/2004	59	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Holwell from Emily Sweet dated 10/19/2004 re: plaintiff's motion papers for class certification to be served by 10/22/2004 ; 11/17/2004 defendants opposition papers to be served 11/24/2004 plaintiff's reply papers to be served; December Hearing date to be set: 4/30/2005 plaintiff to identify experts, 5/31/2005 defendants to identify experts 7/15/2005 notices to admit be served 11/30/2005 dispositive motions to be served 1/2006 pretrial motions to be served ; January/February 2006 trial. So ordered. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 10/22/2004) Copy faxerd to plaintiff's counsel by chambers.(jsa,) (Entered: 10/26/2004)
10/22/2004		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Admissions due by 7/15/2005. Expert Witness List due by 5/31/2005. Dispositive Motions due by 11/30/2005. Ready for Trial by 1/2/2006. (jsa,) (Entered: 10/26/2004)
10/25/2004	60	MOTION to Certify Class of all persons who have obtained, or will in the future obtain, for the benefit of a child with a disability, a favorable order by an IHO against, or stipulation of settlement placed on the record at an impartial due process hearing with, the NYC Dept. of Education, or who are children with disabilities

		who are the beneficiaries of such an order or stipulation of settlement and who fail to obtain, or who are at risk of failing to obtain, full and timely implementation of such order or settlement. DECLARATIONS OF Randee J. Waldman, Jeffrey L. Nagel, Matthew Lenaghan and Elisa Hyman attached. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (ps,) (Entered: 10/27/2004)
10/25/2004	61	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support of Plaintiffs' re: 60 MOTION to Certify Class. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (ps,) (Entered: 10/27/2004)
11/18/2004	<u>62</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: 60 MOTION to Certify Class. <i>Declaration of Service Included</i> . Document filed by New York City Department of Education. (Sweet, Emily) (Entered: 11/18/2004)
11/24/2004	63	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard H. Holwell from Sarah Hechtman dated 11/19/04 re: request that plaintiff's reply brief be extended to 12/10/04. Application GRANTED. The hearing is adjourned to 1/7/05 at 2:00 p.m. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 11/22/04) Copies Faxed by Chambers.(db,) (Entered: 11/30/2004)
11/24/2004		Set/Reset Deadlines as to 60 MOTION to Certify Class. Replies due by 12/10/2004. Motion Hearing set for 1/7/2005 at 02:00 PM before Richard J. Holwell. (db,) (Entered: 11/30/2004)
12/10/2004	64	ORDER that the pretrial conference scheduled for 1/7/05 at 11:00 a.m. is rescheduled to 1/7/05 at 4:00 p.m. in the courtroom of the Honorable Richard J. Holwell, Courtroom 17B, 500 Pearl Street. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 12/2/04) Copies faxed by chambers.(dle,) Modified on 12/14/2004 (kg,). (Entered: 12/13/2004)
12/10/2004		Set/Reset Hearings: Pretrial Conference set for 1/7/2005 04:00 PM before Richard J. Holwell. (dle,) (Entered: 12/13/2004)
12/13/2004	65	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support of re: 60 MOTION to Certify Class. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (kw,) (Entered: 12/15/2004)
12/13/2004	66	Declaration of Elisa Hyman, Esq. in Support re: 60 MOTION to Certify Class. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (kw,) (Entered: 12/15/2004)
01/10/2005	67	ORDER denying 41 Motion to Dismiss, denying 18 Motion to Dismiss for the reasons stated on the record on 1/6/05. Parties are directed to submit a jointly proposed, revised case management schedule by 1/21/05.. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 1/7/05) Copies faxed by chambers.(dle,) (Entered: 01/13/2005)
01/26/2005	68	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 1/6/05 before Judge Richard J. Holwell.(Martin, Leslie) (Entered: 01/26/2005)
01/28/2005	70	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard Holwell from Sarah B. Hechtman dated 1/20/05 re: granting the parties jointly – proposed schedule; deadline for completion of fact discovery, including interrogatories, requests for production of documents and depositions of fact witness; dispositive motions to be served by 2/28/06; pretrial motions to be served by April 2006. Additional deadlines are as set forth in this endorsed letter. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 1/20/05); (Copies faxed by chambers). (pl,) (Entered: 02/08/2005)
02/05/2005	69	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 1/6/05 before Judge Richard J. Holwell. (kj,) (Entered: 02/05/2005)
03/07/2005		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Holwell : Telephone Conference held on 3/7/2005. Defendant to submit proposed schedule for production of documents relating to implementation of orders by 3/14/05. Plaintiff's response, if any due by 3/16/05. Next Tele. conf. set for 3/17/05 at 11:00 a.m. Holwell, J. USDJ (ll,) (Entered: 03/15/2005)
03/28/2005		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Holwell : Telephone Conference held on 3/28/2005. Parties to submit letters to the Court on sampling

		proposal. (cd,) (Entered: 04/18/2005)
04/11/2005	71	LETTER addressed to Judge Richard Holwell from Elisa Hyman dated 4/6/05 re: in response to defendants' 4/1/05 submission. Document filed by AD, NA, YG, LO, LV, VSG, RC.(kw,) (Entered: 04/21/2005)
05/03/2005	72	ORDER dfts are directed to submit a written proposal to provide documents responsive to plaintiffs' document requests on the basis of a randomly selected sample as further set forth in this order; the proposal shall be submitted to the court and served upon opposing counsel by 5/13/05; plaintiffs shall submit and serve written comments or a counterproposal regarding dfts' sampling methodology and proposed production schedule by 5/23/05; parties shall confer during the week of 5/23/05 as further set forth in this order; in the event that the parties are unable to agree upon sampling methodology; the parties shall submit separate proposals to the court by 6/6/05; dfts' objections to interrogatory no. 2 are denied; a pretrial conference shall be held on 6/15/05 at 4:00 p.m. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 5/2/05) (dle,) (Entered: 05/04/2005)
05/03/2005		Set/Reset Hearings: Pretrial Conference set for 6/15/2005 04:00 PM before Richard J. Holwell. (dle,) (Entered: 05/04/2005)
06/06/2005	73	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Holwell from Jeffrey S. Dantowitz dated 6/3/05 re: Application GRANTED. The conference scheduled for 6/15/05 is adjourned to 7/12/05 at 4:30 p.m. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 6/3/05) Copies Mailed by Chambers.(db,) Modified on 6/7/2005 (db,). (Entered: 06/07/2005)
06/06/2005		Set/Reset Hearings: Pretrial Conference set for 7/12/2005 04:30 PM before Richard J. Holwell. (db,) (Entered: 06/07/2005)
06/08/2005	74	ORDER: defendants' letter application to be relieved of their obligation under paragraph 5 of the Court's 5/2/05 Order is denied. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 6/7/05) Copies Mailed FAXED By Chambers.(kw,) (Entered: 06/10/2005)
06/16/2005	<u>75</u>	FILING ERROR – ELECTRONIC FILING FOR NON–ECF CASE – NOTICE of Appearance by Cynthia Margaret Godsoe on behalf of all plaintiffs (Godsoe, Cynthia) Modified on 6/17/2005 (gf,). (Entered: 06/16/2005)
06/17/2005		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE–FILE DOCUMENT – NON–ECF CASE ERROR. Note to Attorney Cynthia Godsoe to MANUALLY RE–FILE Document Notice of Appearance, Document No. 75. This case is not ECF. (gf,) (Entered: 06/17/2005)
06/22/2005	76	NOTICE of Appearance by Cynthia Margaret Godsoe on behalf of AD, NA, YG, LO, LV, VSG, RC (mde,) (Entered: 06/28/2005)
06/29/2005		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Holwell : Status Conference held on 6/29/2005. Discovery issues discussed; settlement discussed; next ptc set for 8/11/05 at 12:30 pm. (dle,) (Entered: 07/05/2005)
08/11/2005		MEMORANDUM TO THE DOCKET CLERK: Status conference held before Judge Richard J. Holwell. Discovery issues discussed. Next pretrial conference set for 9/21/05 at 4:00 p.m. (yv,) (Entered: 08/15/2005)
08/11/2005		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Pretrial Conference set for 9/21/2005 at 04:00 PM before Richard J. Holwell. (yv,) (Entered: 08/15/2005)
08/16/2005	77	ORDER Pretrial Conference set for 9/21/2005 04:00 PM before Richard J. Holwell in courtroom 17B, 500 Pearl Street. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 8/11/05) (jco,) (Entered: 08/17/2005)
08/22/2005	78	ORDER. Defendants are directed to produce the Access Database by 9/2/05. Defendants are further directed to produce all documents relating to orders directing payment under the control of the BCA, subject to as further set forth in this Order. The parties shall submit a jointly proposed confidentiality order by 9/2/05. The parties shall set forth the agreed upon provisions, and provide alternate language for those provisions not subject to agreement (Signed by Judge Richard J.

		Holwell on 8/19/05) Copy faxed by Chambers.(yv,) (Entered: 08/23/2005)
09/12/2005	79	PROTECTIVE ORDER...regarding procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of confidential material.... (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 9/8/2005) Copies Mailed By Chambers.(lb,) (Entered: 09/13/2005)
09/19/2005	<u>80</u>	MEMORANDUM AND OPINION re: 60 MOTION to Certify Class filed by AD, LV, VSG, RC, NA, YG, LO. The Court grants plaintiffs' renewed motion 60 for class certification pursuant to Rule 23(a) and Rule 23(b)(2) and hereby certifies the case as set forth in this Order. The Court further appoints Advocates for Children and Milbank as class counsel pursuant to Rule 23(g)(1)(A). So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 9/15/05) (jco,) Modified on 9/20/2005 (jco,). (Entered: 09/20/2005)
09/22/2005	81	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard Holwell from Shawn V. Morehead dated 9/20/05 re: Counsel writes to request that the Court reschedule the conference to 9/29/05or 10/3/05. Conference rescheduled for Thursday, October 6 at 4:30 p.m. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 9/20/05) (jco,) (Entered: 09/23/2005)
09/22/2005		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Pretrial Conference set for 10/6/2005 04:30 PM before Judge Richard J. Holwell. (jco,) (Entered: 09/23/2005)
09/30/2005	82	ORDER: A Telephonic Pretrial Conference shall be held on 10/6/2005 at 12:00 PM. The plaintiff shall initiate the call to Chambers of the Honorable Richard J. Holwell. The Chambers telephone number is (212)805-0256. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 9/29/2005) (lb,) (Entered: 10/03/2005)
10/11/2005		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Holwell : Telephone Conference held on 10/11/2005. The Court resolved dispute on FERPA letter; the discovery dispute schedule as follows: plaintiffs letter due 10/13/05 at 5:00 p.m. Defendants reply due 10/17/05. PTC set for10/21/05 at 1:30 p.m. (db,) (Entered: 10/14/2005)
10/13/2005	83	ORDER: Plaintiffs will submit a letter to the Court on the parties discovery disputes by 10/13/05 at 5:00 p.m. Defendants will submit a response by 10/17/05 at 5:00 p.m. The parties will appear for a conference on Friday 10/21/05 at 1:30 p.m. in Courtroom of the Honorable Richard J. Hilwell, Courtroom 17B, 500 Pearl Street, New York, New York 10007. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 10/11/05) (js,) (Entered: 10/14/2005)
10/18/2005	84	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard Holwell from Elisa Hyman dated 10/13/2005 re: to request a one day extension of time to submit a letter to Your Honor, asdirected by Your Honor's order October 11, 2005..ENDORSEMENT: Application Granted. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 10/14/2005) (jmi,) (Entered: 10/19/2005)
10/18/2005	85	ENDORSED LETTER: addressed to Judge Richard J. Holwell from Jeffrey S. Dantowitz dated 10/14/2005 re: defendants are requesting that the conference be adjourned until 10/24/2005. ENDORSEMENT: Application granted. Next PTC 10/24/2005 at 12:00pm. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 10/17/2005) Copies Faxed By Chambers(lb,) (Entered: 10/19/2005)
10/31/2005	86	ORDER: The parties are directed to appear for a pretrial conference on 10/31/05, at 3:00 p.m., in the Courtroom of the Honorable Richard J. Holwell, Courtroom 17B, 500 Pearl Street, New York, New York 10007. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 10/25/05) (js,) (Entered: 10/31/2005)
11/03/2005		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Holwell : Status Conference held on 11/3/2005. Plaintiffs are directed to advise the Court by 11/14/05 as to the date on which they will submit a counter-porposed regarding a sampling methodology. (jco,) (Entered: 11/08/2005)
11/07/2005	87	ORDER; plaintiffs were directed to advise the Court by 11/14/05 as to the date on which they will submit a counter-proposal regarding a sampling methodology. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 11/3/05) (kco,) (Entered: 11/07/2005)

11/17/2005	88	ENDORSED LETTER: addressed to Judge Richard Holwell from Shawn V. Morehead dated 11/14/05 re: Requesting an additional ten business days to inform the Court of when plaintiffs will submit a counterproposal concerning sampling in the above entitled action. Defendants consent to this extension. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 11/15/05) (js,) (Entered: 11/18/2005)
01/19/2006	89	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Holwell from Shawn V. Morehead dated 1/12/06 re: a request for a four week extension to complete a counterproposal. ENDORSEMENT: Extension is granted to 2/13/2006. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 1/18/06) (kco,) (Entered: 01/20/2006)
02/21/2006	90	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Holwell from Shawn V. Morehead dated 2/10/2006 re: to request a six-week adjournment of all deadlines in this matter, including the Monday, February 13,2006 deadline for submission of Plaintiffs' sampling proposal. Defendants do not oppose this request.ENDORSEMENT: Application Granted. Sampling proposal to be submitted by 3/31/2006 (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 2/16/2006) (jmi,) (Entered: 02/21/2006)
04/04/2006	91	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Holwell from Shawn V. Morehead dated 3/30/2006 re: to request an extension of time. Some final materials from our expert. Extension until Friday, April 21,2006. Defnedants consent to this request. ENDORSEMENT: Application Granted. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 3/30/2006) (jmi,) (Entered: 04/04/2006)
05/09/2006	92	ORDER: The parties will appear for A conference on Thursday, June 22, 2006 at 2:00 p.m. in the Courtroom of the Hon. Richard J. Holwell, Courtroom 17B, 500 Pearl Street, New York, New York 10007. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 5/8/06) (js,) (Entered: 05/09/2006)
06/22/2006		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Holwell : Status Conference held on 6/22/2006. Case issues discussed; Next PTC set for 8/16/06 at 3:00 pm. (jmi,) (Entered: 07/07/2006)
08/24/2006	93	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard Holwell from Shawn V. Morehead dated 8/14/06. ENDORSEMENT: Conference adjourned to 9/13/06 at 3:00 p.m. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 8/22/06) (js,) (Entered: 08/24/2006)
09/27/2006	94	SCHEDULING ORDER: A telephonic conference regarding the status of this matter shall be held on 10/3/2006 at 4:30 PM before Judge Richard J. Holwell. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 9/26/06) (kco,) (Entered: 09/28/2006)
10/04/2006	97	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Holwell from Jeffrey S. Dantowitz dated 9/29/2006 re: a request that the conference be rescheduled. ENDORSEMENT: Conference adjourned to 10/3/2006 at 12:00 noon. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 9/29/06) (kco,) (Entered: 10/06/2006)
10/04/2006		Set Hearings: Telephone Conference is set for 10/3/2006 at 12:00 PM before Judge Richard J. Holwell. (kco,) (Entered: 10/06/2006)
10/05/2006	95	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 9/13/06 before Judge Richard J. Holwell. (jw,) (Entered: 10/05/2006)
10/06/2006	96	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 9/13/06 before Judge Richard J. Holwell. (jw,) (Entered: 10/06/2006)
10/10/2006	98	SCHEDULING ORDER: A conference will be held on 10/11/2006 at 11:00 a.m. Courtroom 17B, 500 Pearl Street, New York, New York 10007. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 10/3/2006) Copies Faxed By Chambers.(lb,) (Entered: 10/12/2006)
11/01/2006	99	ORDER;... resolution of discovery matters...; On or before 11/76/06, Defendants will submit to the Court a letter that sets forth the status of the production described in Paragraph 2, including the cost and number of person hours spent. A telephonic

		status conference is scheduled with the Court at 9:30 a.m. on November 8, 2006.....; See document for further discovery deadlines....; (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 10/30/06) (djc,) (Entered: 11/02/2006)
11/01/2006		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Status Conference set for 11/8/2006 09:30 AM before Judge Richard J. Holwell. (djc,) (Entered: 11/02/2006)
12/20/2006	100	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Holwell from Jeffrey S. Dantowitz dated 12/13/06 re: a request for an informal conference with the Court to address a discovery dispute concerning the deposition of Carmen Farina. ENDORSEMENT: Application denied. The deposition of Ms. Farina should proceed at a date mutually agreeable to the witness and the parties. If no agreement is reached as to timing, the Court will set the date. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 12/19/06) (kco,) (Entered: 12/20/2006)
12/22/2006	101	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Holwell from Shawn V. Morehead dated 12/19/2006 re: to we ask that the Court postpone the January 12,2007 conference until January 26, 2007 and order Defendants to produce these documents no later than January 24, 2007. Status Conference set for 1/26/2007 09:30 AM before Judge Richard J. Holwell. ENDORSEMENT: Application granted in part. Defendants shall provide responding document relating to (e) the 24 orders for which a limited production has already been made and (b)10 additional order selected by agreement. The status conference is adjourned to 1/26/07 at 9:30 a.m. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 12/21/2006) (jmi,) (Entered: 12/22/2006)
01/31/2007	102	ORDER; 1. Defendants shall begin production immediately of all documents concerning implementation of orders found in the central files of Region 9. Production shall not be delayed by defendants' ongoing analysis of the documents (other than a determination of responsiveness or privilege) or the search of documents in other locations. 2. Defendants shall submit a letter report on the status of production on 3/2/07. 3. After conferring w/ defendants, plaintiffs shall file a response on 3/7/07. 4. A telephone conference shall be held at 9:00 a.m. on 3/9/07. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 1/29/07) (ae) (Entered: 02/01/2007)
01/31/2007		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Telephone Conference set for 3/9/2007 09:00 AM before Judge Richard J. Holwell. (ae) (Entered: 02/01/2007)
04/20/2007		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Holwell : Status Conference held on 4/20/2007. The Court set a bench trial for Region 9 only on 11/5/2007, upon conclusion of the bench trial the Court will issue a judgment with respect to Region 9. The parties are directed to submit a joint proposed scheduling order to ensure that documentary and expert discovery, motions in limine, and will be ready for trial on 11/5. (jp) (Entered: 05/02/2007)
05/07/2007	103	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Holwell from Jeffrey S. Dantowitz dated 4/30/2007 re: to defendants respectfully request that he Court either (i) impose a moratorium on further proceedings until a date certain, and direct the parties to engage in settlement discussions to be concluded by that date, or (ii) adopt the position suggested by defendants in their letter of April 9, 2007(i.e., complaint Region 9 and then proceeding to Region 5, as selected by defendants). ENDORSEMENT: Application granted. The parties are urged to engage in meaningful settlement negotiations; however, the trial date stands. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 5/3/2007) (jmi) (Entered: 05/08/2007)
05/07/2007	104	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Holwell from Shawn Morehead dated 4/27/07 re: counsel for the parties request the following schedule: dfts will answer the second amended complaint dated 4/15/04 by 5/18/07; dfts will produce documents on a rolling basis; plaintiffs will serve requests for admission on a rolling basis, but no later than 8/3/07; parties will identify experts for issues on which they bear the burden of proof by 7/20/07; FRCP 26 expert disclosures shall be due 8/10/07; dfts FRCP 26 expert disclosures shall be due 8/31/07; parties shall complete fact depositions by 9/7/07; parties shall complete expert depositions by 9/21/07; parties shall submit a joint pretrial order to the court by 10/5/07; all other pretrial submissions will be filed by 10/15/07. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge

		Richard J. Holwell on 5/3/07) (dle) (Entered: 05/08/2007)
05/07/2007		Set/Reset Deadlines: Deposition due by 9/21/2007.,Pretrial Order due by 10/5/2007. (dle) (Entered: 05/08/2007)
05/14/2007	105	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 4/20/07 before Judge Richard J. Holwell. (tro) (Entered: 05/14/2007)
05/17/2007	106	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 4/20/07 before Judge Richard J. Holwell. (tro) (Entered: 05/17/2007)
05/21/2007	107	ANSWER to Second Amended Complaint. Document filed by New York City Department of Education, New York City Board of Education.(jmi) (Entered: 05/23/2007)
05/31/2007	108	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard Holwell from Douglas W. Henkin dated 5/25/2007 re: Parties jointly request that the Court adjourn the trial date no more than six weeks from the current 11/5/2007 date and that all other dates set forth in the parties joint letter of 4/27/2007 be adjourned six weeks. Endorsement: Trial is hereby adjourned four weeks to 12/3/207 and all other dates set forth in the parties' joint letter of 4/27/2007 are adjourned four weeks. No further adjournments shall be granted. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 5/29/2007) (jar) (Entered: 06/04/2007)
10/25/2007		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge David Hittner : Status Conference held on 10/25/2007; settlement nearly final. Tele/conf set for 11/20/07 at 3:00 pm. Trial date set for 1/14/08 at 10:00 am. (cd) (Entered: 11/01/2007)
10/25/2007		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Telephone Conference set for 11/20/2007 at 03:00 PM before Judge Richard J. Holwell. (cd) (Entered: 11/01/2007)
11/02/2007	110	ORDER: A telephonic pretrial conference set for 11/20/2007 at 03:00 PM before Judge Richard J. Holwell. The plaintiff shall initiate the call to Chambers of the Honorable Richard J. Holwell. The Chambers telephone number is (212) 805-0256. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 10/29/2007) Copies Faxed by Chambers.(mbe) (Entered: 11/05/2007)
12/11/2007	111	JOINT MOTION for Preliminary Approval of Settlement, MOTION FOR Approval of Notice, and Amendment of Class Definition. Document filed by AD, LV, VSG, RC.(djc) (Entered: 12/13/2007)
12/11/2007	112	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: 111 MOTION for Preliminary Injunction. MOTION to Approve of SETTLEMENT, APPROVAL OF NOTICE, AND AMENDMENT OF CLASS DEFINITION. Document filed by AD, NA, YG, LO, New York City Department of Education, New York City Board of Education, Joel Klein, LV, VSG, RC. (djc) (Entered: 12/13/2007)
12/28/2007	113	PRELIMINARY ORDER FOR NOTICE AND HEARING IN CONNECTION WITH SETTLEMENT PROCEEDINGS: The class is now defined as further set forth herein. Lead Plaintiffs AD, NA, YG and LO are removed as Lead Plaintiffs but retain any rights they may have as class members. A hearing pursuant to Rule 23(e) of the FRCP is hereby scheduled to be held before the Court on 4/4/08 at 10:00 a.m. The Court appoints The Garden City Group, Inc. as the Claims Administrator. For orders issued between the date of the entry of the Preliminary Order and January 31, 2008, the Defendants shall provide by 2/14/08 the Claims Administrator with a CD-ROM as further set forth in this order. The Court will consider comments and/or objections to the Settlement, including the Injunctive Relief, the Compensatory Relief, or the request for attorneys' fees and reimbursement of expenses only if such comments or objections and any supporting papers are filed in writing with the Clerk of the Court and copies of all such papers are served, on or before 3/21/08 on Shawn Morehead and Jeffrey Dantowitz on behalf of defendants. Attendance at the Settlement Fairness Hearing is not necessary, however, persons wishing to be heard orally with regard to the approval of the proposed settlement including the Injunctive Relief, and Compensatory Relief and/or the request for attorneys' fees are required to indicate in a written submission their intention to appear at the hearing and file such submission with the Clerk of the Court and copies of all such papers must be serve,

		on or before 3/21/08 upon Shawn Morehead and Jeffrey S. Dantowitz on behalf of the Defendants. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 12/27/07) Copies sent by chambers. (dle) Modified on 1/4/2008 (dle). (Entered: 01/04/2008)
03/26/2008	<u>114</u>	ORDER: The Court was impressed by the professionalism, experience, and independence of both proposed auditors. In the Court's view, DFs proprietary case management system and its experience in similar engagements will enable it to perform the functions required of the independent Auditor fairly, efficiently, and comprehensively. So Ordered (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 3/26/08) (js) (Entered: 03/26/2008)
03/26/2008	<u>115</u>	ORDER: As of today, the above-captioned case is hereby designated an ECF case. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 3/26/08) (js) (Entered: 03/26/2008)
03/26/2008		Case Designated ECF. (js) (Entered: 03/26/2008)
04/04/2008	<u>116</u>	MOTION to Approve the Settlement. Document filed by LV, VSG, RC.(Morehead, Shawn) (Entered: 04/04/2008)
04/04/2008	<u>117</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>116</u> MOTION to Approve the Settlement.. Document filed by LV, VSG, RC. (Morehead, Shawn) (Entered: 04/04/2008)
04/04/2008	<u>118</u>	DECLARATION of Shawn V. Morehead in Support re: <u>116</u> MOTION to Approve the Settlement.. Document filed by LV, VSG, RC. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C)(Morehead, Shawn) (Entered: 04/04/2008)
04/04/2008	<u>119</u>	DECLARATION of Jose C. Fraga in Support re: <u>116</u> MOTION to Approve the Settlement.. Document filed by NA, VSG, RC. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F)(Morehead, Shawn) (Entered: 04/04/2008)
04/10/2008	<u>120</u>	ORDER AND FINAL JUDGMENT: It is hereby ordered that the settlement set forth in the stipulation is approved as fair, reasonable and adequate, and the Class Members and the parties are directed to consummate the settlement in accordance with the terms and provisions of the Stipulation. This action is hereby dismissed with prejudice and without costs except as provided in the Stipulation as against the defendants. The injunctive relief is approved as fair and reasonable, and defendants are ordered to comply with the terms of the injunctive relief as set forth in the stipulation. The compensatory relief is approved as fair and reasonable, and defendants and the claims administrator are directed to administer the compensatory relief in accordance with the stipulation's terms and provisions. Plaintiffs are entitled to reasonable attorneys fees and reimbursement of expenses. In the event that the settlement does not become final, this order and final judgment shall be rendered null and void and shall be vacated and the action shall proceed as set forth in the stipulation. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 4/10/2008) (jpo) (Entered: 04/10/2008)
04/10/2008	<u>121</u>	JUDGMENT in favor of AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG against New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education, Joel Klein settling action. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 4/10/08) (Attachments: # <u>1</u> notice of right to appeal)(ml) (Entered: 04/11/2008)
06/18/2008	122	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 4/10/08 before Judge Richard J. Holwell. (ama) (Entered: 06/18/2008)
02/12/2009	<u>123</u>	FILING ERROR – ELECTRONIC FILING FOR NON–ECF DOCUMENT (LETTER) – MOTION to Substitute Attorney. Old Attorney: Shawn Morehead, New Attorney: Rebecca Shore. Document filed by AD, NA, YG, LO, LV, VSG, RC.(Morehead, Shawn) Modified on 2/13/2009 (jar). (Entered: 02/12/2009)
02/12/2009		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY THAT THE ATTEMPTED FILING OF Document No. <u>123</u> HAS BEEN REJECTED. Note to Attorney Shawn Morehead : THE CLERK'S OFFICE DOES NOT ACCEPT LETTERS FOR FILING, either through ECF or otherwise, except where the judge has ordered that a particular letter be docketed. Letters may be sent directly to a judge. (jar) (Entered: 02/13/2009)

02/25/2009	<u>124</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Rebecca Caren Shore on behalf of LV (Shore, Rebecca) (Entered: 02/25/2009)
03/06/2009	<u>125</u>	NOTICE of Substitution of Attorney. Old Attorney: Shawn V. Morehead, New Attorney: Rebecca Shore, Address: Advocates for Children of New York, 151 West 30th Street, 5th Floor, New York, New York, 10001, (212) 822-9574. Document filed by AD, NA, YG, LO, LV, VSG, RC. (Morehead, Shawn) (Entered: 03/06/2009)
06/26/2009	<u>126</u>	MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> . Document filed by AD, NA, YG, LO, LV, VSG, RC.(Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 06/26/2009)
06/26/2009	<u>127</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>126</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> .. Document filed by AD, NA, YG, LO, LV, VSG, RC. (Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 06/26/2009)
06/26/2009	<u>128</u>	DECLARATION of Rebecca Shore in Support re: <u>126</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> .. Document filed by AD, NA, YG, LO, LV, VSG, RC. (Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 06/26/2009)
06/26/2009	<u>129</u>	AFFIDAVIT of Miranda Johnson in Support re: <u>126</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> .. Document filed by AD, NA, YG, LO, LV, VSG, RC. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Johnson Decl. Ex. A. Part 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Johnson Decl. Ex. 1 Part 2 of 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Johnson Decl. Ex. B, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Johnson Decl. Exhibit C-Part 1, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Johnson Decl. Exhibit C-Part 2, # <u>6</u> Exhibit Johnson Decl. Exhibit C-Part 3, # <u>7</u> Exhibit Johnson Decl. Exhibit C-Part 4, # <u>8</u> Exhibit Johnson Decl. Exhibit C-Part 5, # <u>9</u> Exhibit Johnson Decl. Exhibit C-Part 6, # <u>10</u> Exhibit Johnson Decl. Exhibit C-Part 7, # <u>11</u> Exhibit Johnson Decl. Exhibit C-Part 8, # <u>12</u> Exhibit Johnson Decl. Exhibit D, # <u>13</u> Exhibit Johnson Decl. Exhibit E, # <u>14</u> Exhibit Johnson Decl. Exhibit F, # <u>15</u> Exhibit Johnson Decl. Exhibit G, # <u>16</u> Exhibit Johnson Decl. Exhibit H)(Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 06/26/2009)
06/26/2009	<u>130</u>	DECLARATION of Douglas W. Henkin in Support re: <u>126</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> .. Document filed by AD, NA, YG, LO, LV, VSG, RC. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. B-Part 1, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. B-Part 2, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. B-Part 3, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. B-Part 4, # <u>6</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. B-Part 5, # <u>7</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. B-Part 6, # <u>8</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. B-Part 7, # <u>9</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. B-Part 8, # <u>10</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. B-Part 9, # <u>11</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. B-Part 10, # <u>12</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. B-Part 11, # <u>13</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. B-Part 12, # <u>14</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. B-Part 13, # <u>15</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. B-Part 14, # <u>16</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. B-Part 15, # <u>17</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. C, # <u>18</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. D, # <u>19</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. E, # <u>20</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. F, # <u>21</u> Exhibit Henkin Decl. Ex. G)(Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 06/26/2009)
06/26/2009		Motion Not Referred: re: <u>126</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> . Filed by VSG, NA, YG, LO, RC, LV, AD. (rw) (Entered: 03/24/2010)
06/29/2009	<u>131</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of (1) Notice of Motion for an Award of Attorneys Fees and Costs; (2) Memorandum of Law in Support of Plaintiffs Application for an Award of Attorneys Fees and Costs; (3) Declaration of Miranda Johnson, dated June 26, 2009; (4) Declaration of Rebecca Shore, dated June 24, 2009; (5) Declaration of Douglas W. Henkin, dated June 26, 2009 served on Defendant on June 26, 2009. Service was made by Federal Express. Document filed by AD, NA, YG, LO, LV, VSG, RC. (Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 06/29/2009)
07/28/2009	<u>132</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard Holwell from Jeffrey S. Dantowitz dated 7/15/2009 re: Requesting that defendants' opposition papers will be served by July 31 and plaintiffs' reply papers will be served by August 21, with the return date of the motion adjourned to August 27, 2009. The parties agree that defendants may be permitted to submit an opposition brief of up to 40 pages in length and that plaintiffs may be permitted to submit a reply brief of up to 20 pages in length. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 7/23/2009) (jpo) (Entered: 07/28/2009)

07/31/2009	<u>133</u>	DECLARATION of Jeffrey S. Dantowitz in Opposition re: <u>126</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> .. Document filed by New York City Department of Education, New York City Board of Education, Joel Klein. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G)(Dantowitz, Jeffrey) (Entered: 07/31/2009)
07/31/2009	<u>134</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>126</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> .. Document filed by New York City Department of Education, New York City Board of Education, Joel Klein. (Dantowitz, Jeffrey) (Entered: 07/31/2009)
08/21/2009	<u>135</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>126</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> .. Document filed by AD, NA, YG, LO, LV, VSG, RC. (Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 08/21/2009)
08/21/2009	<u>136</u>	DECLARATION of Miranda Johnson in Support re: <u>126</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> .. Document filed by AD, NA, YG, LO, LV, VSG, RC. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Summary of AFC Attorney Travel Time at 50 per cent, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Hop Stop Travel Instructions, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Summary of AFC Attorney Travel Time, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Travel time for AFC Paralegals and Support Staff)(Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 08/21/2009)
08/21/2009	<u>137</u>	DECLARATION of Rebecca Shore in Support re: <u>126</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> .. Document filed by AD, NA, YG, LO, LV, VSG, RC. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Page from Paul Weiss website, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Page from Paul Weiss website, # <u>3</u> Exhibit December/January 2006 Volunteers for Legal Service newsletter)(Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 08/21/2009)
08/21/2009	<u>138</u>	DECLARATION of Joseph S. Genova in Support re: <u>126</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> .. Document filed by AD, NA, YG, LO, LV, VSG, RC. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Defendants' January 4, 2008 letter to the Court)(Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 08/21/2009)
03/31/2010	<u>139</u>	MEMORANDUM OPINION AND ORDER: #98784 For the reasons stated above, the Court grants plaintiffs motion for attorneys' fees <u>126</u> in the amount of \$1,238,403.09 (\$847,184.38 for the work performed by Milbank and \$391,218.71 for the work performed by AFC) and costs in the amount of \$123,964.45 (\$121,391.81 for expenses incurred by Milbank and \$2,572.64 for expenses incurred by AFC). (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 3/31/2010) (jpo) Modified on 4/2/2010 (ajc). (Entered: 04/01/2010)
06/29/2010	<u>140</u>	ORDER ASSIGNING DAYLIGHT'S DUTIES AND OBLIGATIONS TO ITS SUCCESSOR COMPANY NAVIGANT CONSULTING, INC, the Court orders the assignment of the Agreement and the responsibilities of the Independent Auditor outlined in the Stipulation from Daylight to Navigant pursuant to the 5/14/10 agreement assigning Daylight's duties to its successor company, Navigant. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 6/24/10) (cd) (Entered: 06/29/2010)
10/06/2010	<u>141</u>	ORDER. Pretrial Conference reset for 10/28/2010 at 10:30 AM in Courtroom 17B, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Richard J. Holwell. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 9/30/10) (djc) (Entered: 10/06/2010)
10/13/2010	<u>142</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Holwell from Rachel Penski dated 10/7/2010 re: Requesting an adjournment of a motion that Plaintiffs plan to file pending the conference scheduled for October 28, 2010 with the Court on said motion. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 10/12/2010) (jpo) (Entered: 10/13/2010)
10/14/2010	<u>143</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER: The Court will hold a conference on 10/28/10 at 10:30 am to discuss the motion Plaintiffs and the Class intend to file regarding defendants' failure to meet certain benchmarks under the parties' Stipulation and Agreement of Settlement of 12/11/07. (Status Conference set for 10/28/2010 at 10:30 AM before Judge Richard J. Holwell). (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 10/13/10) (djc) Modified on 10/14/2010 (djc). (Entered: 10/14/2010)
10/21/2010		***DELETED DOCUMENT. Deleted document number <u>144</u> Endorsed Letter. The document was incorrectly filed in this case. (js) (Entered: 10/21/2010)

10/21/2010	<u>144</u>	ENDORSED LETTER: addressed to Judge Richard J. Holwell from Rachel Penski dated 10/7/2010 re: Counsel writes on behalf of both parties in the above captioned action to request an adjournment of a motion that Plaintiffs plan to file pending the conference scheduled for October 29, 2010 with the Court on said motion. ENDORSEMENT: Next PTC 10/29/2010 at 11:30 a.m. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 10/18/2010) (js) (Entered: 10/21/2010)
11/05/2010	<u>145</u>	MOTION for Appointment of Special Master and Compensatory Relief. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order Appointing a Special Master and Compensatory Relief)(Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 11/05/2010)
11/05/2010	<u>146</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>145</u> MOTION for Appointment of Special Master and Compensatory Relief.. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Supplement Part 2 of Memorandum of Law, # <u>2</u> Supplement Part 3 of Memorandum of Law)(Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 11/05/2010)
11/05/2010	<u>147</u>	DECLARATION of Rebecca Shore in Support re: <u>145</u> MOTION for Appointment of Special Master and Compensatory Relief.. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 11/05/2010)
11/05/2010	<u>148</u>	DECLARATION of Rachel F. Penski in Support re: <u>145</u> MOTION for Appointment of Special Master and Compensatory Relief.. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B – Part 1 of 4, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B – Part 2 of 4, # <u>4</u> Exhibit B – Part 3 of 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit B – Part 4 of 4, # <u>6</u> Exhibit C, # <u>7</u> Exhibit D, # <u>8</u> Exhibit E, # <u>9</u> Exhibit F, # <u>10</u> Exhibit G, # <u>11</u> Exhibit H, # <u>12</u> Exhibit I, # <u>13</u> Exhibit J – Part 1 of 2, # <u>14</u> Exhibit J – Part 2 of 2, # <u>15</u> Exhibit K, # <u>16</u> Exhibit L, # <u>17</u> Exhibit M, # <u>18</u> Exhibit N, # <u>19</u> Exhibit O, # <u>20</u> Exhibit P, # <u>21</u> Exhibit Q – Part 1 of 2, # <u>22</u> Exhibit Q – Part 2 of 2, # <u>23</u> Exhibit R, # <u>24</u> Exhibit S, # <u>25</u> Exhibit T, # <u>26</u> Exhibit U, # <u>27</u> Exhibit V, # <u>28</u> Exhibit W, # <u>29</u> Exhibit X, # <u>30</u> Exhibit Y, # <u>31</u> Exhibit Z, # <u>32</u> Exhibit AA, # <u>33</u> Exhibit BB, # <u>34</u> Exhibit CC)(Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 11/05/2010)
11/05/2010	<u>149</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 11/05/2010)
11/05/2010	<u>150</u>	SEALED DOCUMENT placed in vault.(cb) (Entered: 11/08/2010)
11/19/2010	<u>151</u>	ORDER Motion by plaintiff, not to exceed 35 pages, due by 11/5/2010. Responses due by 1/5/2011, Replies due by 2/4/2011. Conference set for 3/10/2011 at 10:00 AM before Judge Richard J. Holwell.) (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 11/8/10) (cd) (Entered: 11/19/2010)
12/30/2010	<u>152</u>	FILING ERROR – ELECTRONIC FILING FOR NON–ECF DOCUMENT(LETTER) – MOTION for Extension of Time to File and to File Excess Pages. Document filed by Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education.(Dantowitz, Jeffrey) Modified on 1/3/2011 (ka). (Entered: 12/30/2010)
12/30/2010	<u>153</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re: <u>152</u> MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>and to File Excess Pages</i> .. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (Henkin, Douglas) (Entered: 12/30/2010)
01/03/2011		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY THAT THE ATTEMPTED FILING OF Document No. <u>152</u> HAS BEEN REJECTED. Note to Attorney Jeffrey Scott Dantowitz : THE CLERK'S OFFICE DOES NOT ACCEPT LETTERS FOR FILING, either through ECF or otherwise, except where the judge has ordered that a particular letter be docketed. Letters may be sent directly to a judge. (ka) (Entered: 01/03/2011)
01/13/2011	<u>154</u>	ORDER: In light of the Court's delay in entering this order, the Court expects that the parties will agree amongst themselves to a brief extension of the deadline for claimants to use their vouchers. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 1/12/2011) (jpo) (Entered: 01/13/2011)
01/13/2011	<u>155</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard Holwell from Jeffrey S. Dantowitz dated 12/30/2010 re: Requesting that the current briefing schedule be

		amended so that opposition papers would be due on January 24, 2011 and reply papers would be due February 23, 2011, and that the conference currently scheduled for March 10, 2011 be adjourned to a date in late March or April, that is convenient for the Court. ENDORSEMENT: The briefing schedule is modified as requested. No further extensions. The oral argument is adjourned until April 7, 2011 at 10:30 am. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 1/11/2011) (jpo) (Entered: 01/13/2011)
01/24/2011	<u>156</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Holwell from Rachel Penski Fissell dated 1/20/2011 re: Counsel writes to request that the Court amend the caption pursuant to F.R.C.P. 25(d) and substitute Ms. Black for Mr. Klein. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 1/21/2011) (jfe) (Entered: 01/24/2011)
01/24/2011	<u>157</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – (SEE DOCUMENT #162) – DECLARATION of Judy Nathan in Opposition re: <u>145</u> MOTION for Appointment of Special Master and Compensatory Relief.. Document filed by Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Feb, 11, 2009 memorandum, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Navigant analysis, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Notice of Intent to Appeal, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Dec. 23, 2008 memorandum, # <u>5</u> Exhibit July 13, 2009 memorandum)(Dantowitz, Jeffrey) Modified on 2/8/2011 (lb). (Entered: 01/24/2011)
01/24/2011	<u>158</u>	AFFIDAVIT of Stacey Reeves in Opposition re: <u>145</u> MOTION for Appointment of Special Master and Compensatory Relief.. Document filed by Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit information sheet, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Transmittal sheet, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Second letter, # <u>4</u> Exhibit March 11, 2009 memorandum, # <u>5</u> Exhibit July 13, 2009 memorandum, # <u>6</u> Exhibit Third letter, # <u>7</u> Exhibit Dec. 23, 2008 memorandum, # <u>8</u> Exhibit sample page of Navigant's analysis, # <u>9</u> Exhibit Aug. 18, 2010 email, # <u>10</u> Exhibit eport re: Paymnt Action Items)(Dantowitz, Jeffrey) (Entered: 01/24/2011)
01/24/2011	<u>159</u>	AFFIDAVIT of Veronica Conforme in Opposition re: <u>145</u> MOTION for Appointment of Special Master and Compensatory Relief.. Document filed by Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Sigall resume)(Dantowitz, Jeffrey) (Entered: 01/24/2011)
01/24/2011	<u>160</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>145</u> MOTION for Appointment of Special Master and Compensatory Relief.. Document filed by Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. (Dantowitz, Jeffrey) (Entered: 01/24/2011)
01/25/2011	<u>161</u>	AFFIDAVIT of Stacey Reeves (corrected) in Opposition re: <u>145</u> MOTION for Appointment of Special Master and Compensatory Relief.. Document filed by Joel Klein, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Information sheet, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Transmittal sheet, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Second letter, # <u>4</u> Exhibit March 11, 2009 memorandum, # <u>5</u> Exhibit July 13, 2009 memorandum, # <u>6</u> Exhibit Third letter, # <u>7</u> Exhibit Dec, 23, 2008 memorandum, # <u>8</u> Exhibit Sample page of Navigant's analysis, # <u>9</u> Exhibit Aug. 18, 2008 email, # <u>10</u> Exhibit DAITS report re Payment Action Items)(Dantowitz, Jeffrey) (Entered: 01/25/2011)
02/07/2011	<u>162</u>	DECLARATION of Judy Nathan in Opposition re: <u>145</u> MOTION for Appointment of Special Master and Compensatory Relief.. Document filed by Cathleen P. Black, New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit February 11, 2009 memorandum, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Navigant analysis, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Notice of Intent, # <u>4</u> Exhibit December 23, 2008 memorandum, # <u>5</u> Exhibit July 13, 2009 memorandum)(Dantowitz, Jeffrey) (Entered: 02/07/2011)
02/17/2011	<u>163</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Holwell from Rachel Penski Fissell dated 2/16/2011 re: Counsel respectfully request permission to file a reply brief up to 28 pages long as plaintiffs' reply memorandum of law in further support of plaintiffs' motion for appointment of a Special Master and Compensatory Relief. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on

		2/15/2011) (jfe) (Entered: 02/17/2011)
02/23/2011	<u>164</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>145</u> MOTION for Appointment of Special Master and Compensatory Relief.. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 02/23/2011)
02/23/2011	<u>165</u>	DECLARATION of James Reilly in Support re: <u>145</u> MOTION for Appointment of Special Master and Compensatory Relief.. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Exhibit E)(Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 02/23/2011)
02/23/2011	<u>166</u>	DECLARATION of Rebecca Shore in Support re: <u>145</u> MOTION for Appointment of Special Master and Compensatory Relief.. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit Exhibit F)(Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 02/23/2011)
02/23/2011	<u>167</u>	DECLARATION of Allison Guttu in Support re: <u>145</u> MOTION for Appointment of Special Master and Compensatory Relief.. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Exhibit E)(Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 02/23/2011)
02/23/2011	<u>168</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of (1) Reply Memorandum of Law in Further Support of Plaintiffs' Motion for Appointment of Special Master and Compensatory Relief; (2) Declaration of James Reilly, dated February 23, 2011; (3) Reply Declaration of Rebecca Shore, dated February 18, 2011; (4) Declaration of Allison Guttu, dated February 18, 2011 served on Jeffrey Dantowitz on February 23, 2011. Service was made by Federal Express. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 02/23/2011)
02/23/2011	<u>169</u>	SEALED DOCUMENT placed in vault.(mps) (Entered: 02/24/2011)
03/14/2011	<u>170</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Rachel Faye Penski on behalf of AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG (Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 03/14/2011)
03/14/2011	<u>171</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Rachel Faye Penski on behalf of AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG (Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 03/14/2011)
03/14/2011	<u>172</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Rachel Faye Penski on behalf of AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG (Penski, Rachel) (Entered: 03/14/2011)
04/08/2011	<u>173</u>	ORDER: The Court will hear oral argument regarding the pending motion to appoint a special master on 5/12/2011 at 10:30 a.m. The Court is in receipt of the parties' letters regarding the format of the proceedings. The parties may present any evidence, including live testimony, that they believe will assist the Court in reaching a decision. In the event that the parties wish to present testimony from any witness who has not previously been made available through the discovery process, this witness must be made available for deposition prior to the hearing. Set Deadlines/Hearing as to <u>145</u> MOTION for Appointment of Special Master and Compensatory Relief: (Motion Hearing set for 5/12/2011 at 10:30 AM before Judge Richard J. Holwell.) (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 4/7/2011) (tro) (Entered: 04/08/2011)
05/20/2011	<u>174</u>	SEALED DOCUMENT placed in vault.(nm) (Entered: 05/20/2011)
06/21/2011	<u>175</u>	ORDER: The Court will have an informal Conference set for 6/30/2011 at 01:30 PM before Judge Richard J. Holwell. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 6/21/2011) (rdz) (Entered: 06/21/2011)
06/30/2011		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Richard J. Holwell: Oral Argument held on 6/30/2011 The Court reviewed the structure of the school system with all parties. Next PTC set for 08/09/11 at 10:00 am. (pl) (Entered: 07/19/2011)
06/30/2011		Set/Reset Scheduling Order Deadlines: Pretrial Conference set for 8/9/2011 at 10:00 AM before Judge Richard J. Holwell. (pl) (Entered: 07/19/2011)

07/22/2011	<u>176</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Howell from Jeffrey S. Dantowitz dated 7/7/11 re: Counsel for defendant writes that the members of DOE's Implementation Unit will be available to meet with you anytime convenient to the Court during the week of July 25, 2011, except for July 26 (after 3pm) and July 29, 2011. ENDORSEMENT: The above conference shall be held on 8/9/11 at 11:00 a.m. So Ordered., (Status Conference set for 8/9/2011 at 11:00 AM before Judge Richard J. Holwell.) (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 7/19/11) (pl) Modified on 7/22/2011 (pl). (Entered: 07/22/2011)
09/01/2011	177	SEALED DOCUMENT placed in vault.(mps) (Entered: 09/01/2011)
09/01/2011	<u>178</u>	MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> . Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG.(Fissell, Rachel) (Entered: 09/01/2011)
09/01/2011	<u>179</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>178</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> .. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (Fissell, Rachel) (Entered: 09/01/2011)
09/01/2011	<u>180</u>	DECLARATION of Rachel Penski Fissell in Support re: <u>178</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> .. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit E-1, # <u>7</u> Exhibit F, # <u>8</u> Exhibit F-1, # <u>9</u> Exhibit G, # <u>10</u> Exhibit G-1, # <u>11</u> Exhibit H, # <u>12</u> Exhibit I, # <u>13</u> Exhibit J, # <u>14</u> Exhibit K, # <u>15</u> Exhibit L, # <u>16</u> Exhibit M, # <u>17</u> Exhibit N, # <u>18</u> Exhibit O)(Fissell, Rachel) (Entered: 09/01/2011)
09/01/2011	<u>181</u>	DECLARATION of Rebecca Shore in Support re: <u>178</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> .. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B)(Fissell, Rachel) (Entered: 09/01/2011)
09/01/2011	<u>182</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Notice of Motion for an Award of Attorneys' Fees and Costs; Memorandum of Law in Support of Plaintiffs' Second Application for an Award of Attorneys' Fees and Costs; Declaration of Rachel Penski Fissell in Support of Plaintiffs' Second Application for an Award of Attorneys' Fees and Costs, and exhibits thereto; Declaration of Rebecca Shore in Support of Plaintiffs' Second Application for an Award of Attorneys' Fees and Costs, and exhibits thereto served on Jeffrey Dantowitz on 9/1/2011. Service was accepted by Communications & Docketing Services – Service Window Desk, room 4-3131. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (Fissell, Rachel) (Entered: 09/01/2011)
09/07/2011	<u>183</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J. Holwell from Rachel Penski Fissell dated 8/25/2011 re: Counsel for the Plaintiffs writes to request that this Court order that Mr. Walcott be substituted for Ms. Black and that the caption of the case be modified accordingly. ENDORSEMENT: Application granted. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 9/6/2011) (ab) (Entered: 09/07/2011)
09/22/2011	<u>184</u>	DECLARATION of Jeffrey S. Dantowitz in Opposition re: <u>178</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> .. Document filed by New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education, Dennis M. Walcott. (Dantowitz, Jeffrey) (Entered: 09/22/2011)
09/22/2011	<u>185</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>178</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> .. Document filed by New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education, Dennis M. Walcott. (Dantowitz, Jeffrey) (Entered: 09/22/2011)
09/30/2011	<u>186</u>	ORDER: denying <u>145</u> Motion. A final informal conference to review the work of the DOE's Implementation Unit will be held on October 28,2011 at 2:00 PM. Plaintiffs' motion for the appointment of a special master was filed on November 5, 2010. The Court is not prepared to appoint a special master at least until it determines the likely success of the DOE's initiative. Consequently, the Court denies plaintiffs' pending motion <u>145</u> without prejudice to renew following the conclusion of the October 28 conference. Additional relief as set forth in this Order. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 9/30/2011) (pl) (Entered: 10/03/2011)

09/30/2011		Set/Reset Hearings: Status Conference set for 10/28/2011 at 02:00 PM before Judge Richard J. Holwell. (pl) (Entered: 10/03/2011)
10/06/2011	<u>187</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Richard J Holwell from Jeffrey Dantowitz dated 9/13/2011 re: Request to extend time to file opposition and reply papers as follows. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. Set Deadlines/Hearing as to <u>178</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> . (Response due by 9/22/2011, Reply due by 10/6/2011.) (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 10/4/2011) (cd) (Entered: 10/06/2011)
10/06/2011	<u>188</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>178</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> .. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (Fissell, Rachel) (Entered: 10/06/2011)
10/06/2011	<u>189</u>	DECLARATION of James Reilly in Support re: <u>178</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> .. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Class Notice, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Apr. 8, 2004 Defendants' Letter to Court, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Excerpt of May 12, 2011 Hearing Transcript)(Fissell, Rachel) (Entered: 10/06/2011)
10/06/2011	<u>190</u>	DECLARATION of Rebecca Shore in Support re: <u>178</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>and Costs</i> .. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (Fissell, Rachel) (Entered: 10/06/2011)
10/06/2011	<u>191</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of (1) Reply Memorandum of Law in Further Support of Plaintiffs Second Application for an Award of Attorneys Fees and Costs; (2) Declaration of James Reilly in Further Support of Plaintiffs Second Application for an Award of Attorneys Fees and Costs, dated October 6, 2011, with accompanying exhibits; and (3) Reply Declaration of Rebecca Shore in Further Support of Plaintiffs Second Application for an Award of Attorneys Fees and Costs, dated October 6, 2011 served on Jeffrey Dantowitz, Esq. on October 6, 2011. Service was made by ECF. Document filed by AD, LO, LV, NA, RC, VSG, YG. (Fissell, Rachel) (Entered: 10/06/2011)
11/04/2011	<u>192</u>	ORDER. The parties are directed to meet and confer in person, and in a spirit of cooperation, at a mutually convenient time prior to the November 10 conference, to discuss the defendants' November 3 submission and the issues raised in their recent submissions to the Court. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 11/4/2011) (rjm) (Entered: 11/04/2011)
11/29/2011	<u>193</u>	ORDER: Status Conference set for 1/26/2012 at 10:30 AM before Judge Richard J. Holwell. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 11/26/2011) (ft) (Entered: 11/29/2011)
04/25/2012	<u>194</u>	NOTICE OF CASE REASSIGNMENT to Judge Loretta A. Preska. Judge Richard J. Holwell is no longer assigned to the case. (pgu) (Entered: 04/25/2012)
05/03/2012		Received returned mail re: <u>194</u> Notice of Case Assignment/Reassignment. Mail was addressed to Ava Gordon at 24784 Outer Dr., Melvindale, MI 48122 and was returned for the following reason(s): Unable to find. (ft) (Entered: 05/03/2012)
08/03/2012	<u>195</u>	ORDER: The parties are directed to appear by telephone for a conference to be held August 20, 2012 at 2:00 p.m. regarding Plaintiffs' Second Application for an Award of Attorneys' Fees and Costs. The parties are directed to arrange themselves on a single conference line or dial-in and call in to chambers together on that date at that time. (Signed by Judge Loretta A. Preska on 8/3/2012) (js) (Entered: 08/03/2012)
08/20/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Loretta A. Preska: Telephone Conference held on 8/20/2012. (djc) (Entered: 08/28/2012)
09/30/2012	<u>196</u>	ORDER: granting <u>178</u> Motion for Attorney Fees. Plaintiffs' motion for an award of attorneys' fees and costs [dkt. no. 178] is GRANTED to the extent discussed at the Court's August 20, 2012, telephone conference and as set forth in the parties' forthcoming stipulation. (Signed by Judge Loretta A. Preska on 9/30/2012) (djc) (Entered: 10/01/2012)

10/24/2012	<u>197</u>	NOTICE of that defendants no longer appear in this matter by and through Assistant Corporation Counsel Emily Sweet. Document filed by New York City Board of Education, New York City Department of Education, Dennis M. Walcott. (Sweet, Emily) (Entered: 10/24/2012)
------------	------------	--