

**U.S. District Court  
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:17-cv-02990-GBD-DCF**

Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York et al v.  
Metropolitan Transportation Authority et al  
Assigned to: Judge George B. Daniels  
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman  
Cause: 42:12131 Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990

Date Filed: 04/25/2017  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 446 Civil Rights:  
Americans with Disabilities – Other  
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

**Plaintiff**

**Center for Independence of the  
Disabled, New York**  
*a nonprofit organization*

represented by **Maia Beth Goodell**  
Disability Rights Advocates  
655 Third Avenue, 14th Floor  
New York, NY 10017  
(212) 644-8644  
Fax: (212) 644-8636  
Email: [mgoodell@dralegal.org](mailto:mgoodell@dralegal.org)  
*TERMINATED: 11/21/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Daniel L. Brown**  
Sheppard, Mullin, Richter & Hampton  
30 Rockefeller Plaza  
New York, NY 10112  
(212)-332-3879  
Fax: (212)-332-3888  
Email: [dlbrown@sheppardmullin.com](mailto:dlbrown@sheppardmullin.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Emily Seelenfreund**  
Disability Rights Advocates (NYC)  
655 Third Avenue, 14th Floor  
New York, NY 10017  
(973)-986-2350  
Email: [eseelenfreund@dralegal.org](mailto:eseelenfreund@dralegal.org)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jelena Kolic**  
Disability Rights Advocates  
10 South LaSalle Street, 18th Fl.  
Chicago, IL 60613  
312-559-4660 Ext. 7560  
Fax: 212-644-8636  
Email: [jkolic@dralegal.org](mailto:jkolic@dralegal.org)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Rebecca Juliet Rodgers**  
Disability Rights Advocates (NYC)  
655 Third Avenue, 14th Floor  
New York, NY 10017  
212-644-8644  
Email: [rrodgers@dralegal.org](mailto:rrodgers@dralegal.org)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Seth Emmanuel Packrone**  
Disability Rights Advocates  
655 Third Avenue  
14th Floor  
New York, NY 10017  
(212) 644-8644  
Fax: 212-644-8636

Email: [spackrone@dralegal.org](mailto:spackrone@dralegal.org)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sid Wolinsky**  
Disability Rights Advocates  
2001 Center Street, 4th floor  
Berkley, CA 94704  
(510)-665-8644  
Fax: (510)-665-8511  
Email: [swolinsky@dralegal.org](mailto:swolinsky@dralegal.org)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Stuart John Seaborn**  
Disabilities Right Advocates  
2001 Center Street, 4th Floor  
Berkely, CA 94704  
(510) 665-8644  
Fax: (510)-665-8511  
Email: [sseaborn@dralegal.org](mailto:sseaborn@dralegal.org)  
*TERMINATED: 09/27/2017*

**Michelle Anne Caiola**  
Disabilities Right Advocates  
655 Third Avenue., 14th Floor  
New York, NY 10017  
(212) 644-8644  
Fax: (212) 644-8636  
Email: [mcaiola@dralegal.org](mailto:mcaiola@dralegal.org)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Brooklyn Center for Independence of  
the Disabled**  
*a nonprofit organization*

represented by **Maia Beth Goodell**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 11/21/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Daniel L. Brown**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Emily Seelenfreund**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jelena Kolic**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Rebecca Juliet Rodgers**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Seth Emmanuel Packrone**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sid Wolinsky**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Stuart John Seaborn**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 09/27/2017*

**Michelle Anne Caiola**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Bronx Independent Living Services**  
*a nonprofit organization*

represented by **Maia Beth Goodell**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 11/21/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Daniel L. Brown**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Emily Seelenfreund**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jelena Kolic**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Rebecca Juliet Rodgers**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Seth Emmanuel Packrone**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sid Wolinsky**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Stuart John Seaborn**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 09/27/2017*

**Michelle Anne Caiola**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Harlem Independent Living Center**  
*a nonprofit organization*

represented by **Maia Beth Goodell**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 11/21/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Daniel L. Brown**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Emily Seelenfreund**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jelena Kolic**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Rebecca Juliet Rodgers**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Seth Emmanuel Packrone**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sid Wolinsky**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Stuart John Seaborn**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 09/27/2017*

**Michelle Anne Caiola**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Disabled In Action of Metropolitan  
New York**  
*a nonprofit organization*

represented by **Maia Beth Goodell**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 11/21/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Daniel L. Brown**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Emily Seelenfreund**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jelena Kolic**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Rebecca Juliet Rodgers**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Seth Emmanuel Packrone**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sid Wolinsky**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Stuart John Seaborn**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 09/27/2017*

**Michelle Anne Caiola**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**New York Statewide Senior Action  
Council**  
*a nonprofit organization*

represented by **Maia Beth Goodell**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 11/21/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Daniel L. Brown**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Emily Seelenfreund**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jelena Kolic**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Rebecca Juliet Rodgers**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Seth Emmanuel Packrone**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sid Wolinsky**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Stuart John Seaborn**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 09/27/2017*

**Michelle Anne Caiola**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Sasha Blair–Goldensohn**  
*an individual*

represented by **Maia Beth Goodell**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 11/21/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Daniel L. Brown**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Emily Seelenfreund**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jelena Kolic**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Rebecca Juliet Rodgers**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Seth Emmanuel Packrone**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sid Wolinsky**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Stuart John Seaborn**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 09/27/2017*

**Michelle Anne Caiola**  
(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

**Plaintiff**

**Chris Pangilinan**  
*an individual*

represented by **Maia Beth Goodell**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 11/21/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Daniel L. Brown**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Emily Seelenfreund**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Jelena Kolic**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Rebecca Juliet Rodgers**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Seth Emmanuel Packrone**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sid Wolinsky**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Stuart John Seaborn**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 09/27/2017*

**Michelle Anne Caiola**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Dustin Jones**  
*an individual, on behalf of themselves and  
all others similarly situated*

represented by **Maia Beth Goodell**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 11/21/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Daniel L. Brown**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Emily Seelenfreund**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Rebecca Juliet Rodgers**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Seth Emmanuel Packrone**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sid Wolinsky**  
(See above for address)

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Stuart John Seaborn**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 09/27/2017*

**Michelle Anne Caiola**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

**Defendant**

**Metropolitan Transportation Authority**  
*a public benefit corporation*

represented by **Eamonn F. Foley**  
New York City Transit Authority  
130 Livingston Street,  
Brooklyn, NY 11201  
718-694-3905  
Fax: 718-694-1070  
Email: [Eamonn.Foley@nyct.com](mailto:Eamonn.Foley@nyct.com)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**James Luke Kerwin**  
New York City Transit Authority- Law  
Department  
130 Livingston Street  
Brooklyn, NY 00000  
718-694-3989  
Fax: 718-694-1070  
Email: [james.kerwin@nyct.com](mailto:james.kerwin@nyct.com)  
*TERMINATED: 07/17/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Helene Rachel Hechtkopf**  
Hoguet Newman Regal & Kenney, LLP  
60 East 42nd Street, 48th Floor  
New York, NY 10165  
212-689-8808  
Email: [hhechtkopf@hnrklaw.com](mailto:hhechtkopf@hnrklaw.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Ira Jonathan Lipton**  
Hoguet Newman Regal & Kenney  
One Grand Central Plaza  
60 East 42nd Street, 48th Floor  
New York  
New York, NY 10165  
212-689-8808  
Fax: 212-689-5101  
Email: [ilipton@hnrklaw.com](mailto:ilipton@hnrklaw.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Miriam Jerry Manber**  
Hoguet Newman Regal & Kenney, LLP  
60 East 42nd Street, 48th Floor  
New York, NY 10165  
212-689-8808  
Email: [mmanber@hnrklaw.com](mailto:mmanber@hnrklaw.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Steven Mark Silverberg**  
Hoguet Newman Regal & Kenney, LLP  
10 East 40th Street

New York, NY 10016  
212-689-8808  
Fax: 212-689-5101  
Email: [ssilverberg@hnrklaw.com](mailto:ssilverberg@hnrklaw.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**Veronique Hakim**  
*in her official capacity as interim  
executive director of the Metropolitan  
Transportation Authority*

represented by **Eamonn F. Foley**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**James Luke Kerwin**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 07/17/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Helene Rachel Hechtkopf**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Ira Jonathan Lipton**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Miriam Jerry Manber**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Steven Mark Silverberg**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**New York City Transit Authority**  
*a public benefit corporation*

represented by **Eamonn F. Foley**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**James Luke Kerwin**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 07/17/2019*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Helene Rachel Hechtkopf**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Ira Jonathan Lipton**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Miriam Jerry Manber**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Steven Mark Silverberg**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**Darryl C. Irick**  
*in his official capacity as acting president*

represented by **Eamonn F. Foley**  
(See above for address)



*LEAD ATTORNEY  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**James Luke Kerwin**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 07/17/2019  
LEAD ATTORNEY*

**Helene Rachel Hechtkopf**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Ira Jonathan Lipton**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Miriam Jerry Manber**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Steven Mark Silverberg**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**The City Of New York ,**  
*TERMINATED: 09/06/2017*

represented by **Martin John Bowe , Jr**  
NYC Law Department  
100 Church Street Room 3-212  
New York, NY 10007  
212 788-0878  
Fax: 2127880940  
Email: [mbowe@law.nyc.gov](mailto:mbowe@law.nyc.gov)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Mark Galen Toews**  
NYC Law Department  
100 Church Street Room 3-212  
New York, NY 10007  
(212) 356-0871  
Fax: (212)-788-8877  
Email: [mtoews@law.nyc.gov](mailto:mtoews@law.nyc.gov)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Miscellaneous**

**TransitCenter**

represented by **Lauren Kelley Ross**  
Akin Gump Strauss Hauer & Feld LLP  
(NYC)  
One Bryant Park  
New York, NY 10036  
212-872-7477  
Fax: 212-872-1002  
Email: [lkross@akingump.com](mailto:lkross@akingump.com)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Robert James Boller**  
Akin Gump Strauss Hauer & Feld LLP  
(NYC)  
One Bryant Park  
New York, NY 10036  
(212) 872-8170  
Fax: (212) 872-1002  
Email: [rboller@akingump.com](mailto:rboller@akingump.com)

*LEAD ATTORNEY  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
04/25/2017	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority, The City Of New York., (Filing Fee \$ 400.00, Receipt Number 0208-13580030) Document filed by New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Bronx Independent Living Services, Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Dustin Jones, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Chris Pangilinan, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York.(Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 04/25/2017)
04/25/2017	<u>2</u>	CIVIL COVER SHEET filed. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 04/25/2017)
04/25/2017	<u>3</u>	RULE 7.1 CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. No Corporate Parent. Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan.(Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 04/25/2017)
04/25/2017	<u>4</u>	RULE 7.1 CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. No Corporate Parent. Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan.(Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 04/25/2017)
04/25/2017	<u>5</u>	RULE 7.1 CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. No Corporate Parent. Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan.(Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 04/25/2017)
04/25/2017	<u>6</u>	RULE 7.1 CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. No Corporate Parent. Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan.(Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 04/25/2017)
04/25/2017	<u>7</u>	RULE 7.1 CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. No Corporate Parent. Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan.(Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 04/25/2017)
04/25/2017	<u>8</u>	RULE 7.1 CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. No Corporate Parent. Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan.(Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 04/25/2017)
04/25/2017	<u>9</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Metropolitan Transportation Authority, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,,. Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 04/25/2017)

04/25/2017	<u>10</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to New York City Transit Authority, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,,. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 04/25/2017)
04/25/2017	<u>11</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to The City of New York, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,,. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 04/25/2017)
04/25/2017	<u>12</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Veronique Hakim, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,,. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 04/25/2017)
04/25/2017	<u>13</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to Darryl C. Irick, Acting President, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,,. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 04/25/2017)
04/25/2017	<u>14</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Jelena Kolic on behalf of Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Kolic, Jelena) (Entered: 04/25/2017)
04/25/2017	<u>15</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Rebecca Juliet Rodgers on behalf of Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Rodgers, Rebecca) (Entered: 04/25/2017)
04/26/2017		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING PARTY MODIFICATION. Notice to attorney Michelle Anne Caiola. The party information for the following party/parties has been modified: Darryl C. Irick, New York City Transit Authority, Veronique Hakim, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, Dustin Jones, Chris Pangilinan, Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York. The information for the party/parties has been modified for the following reason/reasons: party text was omitted. (kl)</b> (Entered: 04/26/2017)
04/26/2017		CASE OPENING INITIAL ASSIGNMENT NOTICE: The above–entitled action is assigned to Judge Katherine B. Forrest. Please download and review the Individual Practices of the assigned District Judge, located at <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/District">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/District</a> . Attorneys are responsible for providing courtesy copies to judges where their Individual Practices require such. Please download and review the ECF Rules and Instructions, located at <a href="http://nysd.uscourts.gov/ecf_filing.php">http://nysd.uscourts.gov/ecf_filing.php</a> . (kl) (Entered: 04/26/2017)
04/26/2017		Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman is so designated. (kl) (Entered: 04/26/2017)
04/26/2017		Case Designated ECF. (kl) (Entered: 04/26/2017)
04/26/2017	<u>16</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to Metropolitan Transportation Authority. (kl) (Entered: 04/26/2017)

04/26/2017	<u>17</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to New York City Transit Authority. (kl) (Entered: 04/26/2017)
04/26/2017	<u>18</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to The City Of New York. (kl) (Entered: 04/26/2017)
04/26/2017	<u>19</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to Veronique Hakim. (kl) (Entered: 04/26/2017)
04/26/2017	<u>20</u>	ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to Darryl C. Irick. (kl) (Entered: 04/26/2017)
04/27/2017	<u>21</u>	ORDER: Initial Conference set for 6/12/2017 at 01:00 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 4/27/2017) (cla) (Entered: 04/27/2017)
04/28/2017	<u>22</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – MOTION</b> for Sidney M. Wolinsky to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208–13600430. <b>Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.</b> Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Wolinsky, Sid) Modified on 4/28/2017 (ma). (Entered: 04/28/2017)
04/28/2017	<u>23</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – MOTION</b> for Stuart J. Seaborn to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208–13600747. <b>Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.</b> Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Seaborn, Stuart) Modified on 4/28/2017 (ma). (Entered: 04/28/2017)
04/28/2017		<b>&gt;&gt;&gt;NOTICE REGARDING DEFICIENT MOTION TO APPEAR PRO HAC VICE. Notice to RE–FILE Document No. <u>23</u> MOTION for Stuart J. Seaborn to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208–13600747. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff., <u>22</u> MOTION for Sidney M. Wolinsky to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208–13600430. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff... The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): MISSING AFFIDAVIT OR DECLARATION PURSUANT TO LOCAL RULE 1.3;. Re–file the motion as a Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice – attach the correct signed PDF – select the correct named filer/filers – attach valid Certificates of Good Standing issued within the past 30 days – attach Proposed Order..</b> (ma) (Entered: 04/28/2017)
05/02/2017	<u>24</u>	MOTION for Sidney M. Wolinsky to Appear Pro Hac Vice . <b>Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.</b> Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Errata Certificate of Good Standing, # <u>2</u> Affidavit of Sidney Wolinsky, # <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Wolinsky, Sid) (Entered: 05/02/2017)
05/02/2017	<u>25</u>	MOTION for Stuart J. Seaborn to Appear Pro Hac Vice . <b>Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.</b> Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing, # <u>2</u> Affidavit of Stuart Seaborn, # <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Seaborn, Stuart) (Entered: 05/02/2017)

05/03/2017		<b>&gt;&gt;&gt;NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. <u>25</u> MOTION for Stuart J. Seaborn to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff., <u>24</u> MOTION for Sidney M. Wolinsky to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (bcu) (Entered: 05/03/2017)</b>
05/04/2017	<u>26</u>	ORDER FOR ADMISSION PRO HAC VICE: granting <u>24</u> Motion for Sidney M. Wolinsky to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 5/4/2017) (ap) (Entered: 05/04/2017)
05/05/2017	<u>27</u>	ORDER FOR ADMISSION PRO HAC VICE granting <u>25</u> Motion for Stuart J. Seaborn to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 5/5/2017) (mro) (Entered: 05/05/2017)
05/08/2017	<u>28</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by James Luke Kerwin on behalf of Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Kerwin, James) (Entered: 05/08/2017)
05/08/2017	<u>29</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,, Metropolitan Transportation Authority served on 5/2/2017, answer due 5/23/2017. Service was accepted by Jana Parker, Legal Clerk. Document filed by New York Statewide Senior Action Council; Bronx Independent Living Services; Sasha Blair-Goldensohn ; Dustin Jones; Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled; Chris Pangilinan; Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York ; Harlem Independent Living Center; Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 05/08/2017)
05/08/2017	<u>30</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,, New York City Transit Authority served on 5/2/2017, answer due 5/23/2017. Service was accepted by Laverne Sterling, Legal Clerk. Document filed by New York Statewide Senior Action Council; Bronx Independent Living Services; Sasha Blair-Goldensohn ; Dustin Jones; Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled; Chris Pangilinan; Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York ; Harlem Independent Living Center; Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 05/08/2017)
05/08/2017	<u>31</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,, The City Of New York, served on 5/2/2017, answer due 5/23/2017. Service was accepted by Betty Mazyck, Legal Clerk. Document filed by New York Statewide Senior Action Council; Bronx Independent Living Services; Sasha Blair-Goldensohn ; Dustin Jones; Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled; Chris Pangilinan; Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York ; Harlem Independent Living Center; Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 05/08/2017)
05/08/2017	<u>32</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,, Veronique Hakim served on 5/2/2017, answer due 5/23/2017. Service was accepted by Jana Parker, Legal Clerk. Document filed by New York Statewide Senior Action Council; Bronx Independent Living Services; Sasha Blair-Goldensohn ; Dustin Jones; Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled; Chris Pangilinan; Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York ; Harlem Independent Living Center; Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 05/08/2017)
05/08/2017	<u>33</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,, Darryl C. Irick served on 5/2/2017, answer due 5/23/2017. Service was accepted by Laverne Sterling, Legal Clerk. Document filed by New York Statewide Senior Action Council; Bronx Independent Living Services; Sasha Blair-Goldensohn ; Dustin Jones; Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled; Chris Pangilinan; Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York ; Harlem Independent Living Center; Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 05/08/2017)
05/11/2017	<u>34</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Daniel L. Brown on behalf of Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Brown, Daniel) (Entered: 05/11/2017)

05/16/2017	<u>35</u>	JOINT LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference <i>and to Extend Time to Answer Complaint</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from James L. Kerwin dated May 16, 2017. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority.(Kerwin, James) (Entered: 05/16/2017)
05/18/2017	<u>36</u>	ORDER granting <u>35</u> Letter Motion to Adjourn Conference. Ordered. 1. IPTC adjourned to 7/26/17 at 1pm. (I'm not available on your August 11 date). 2. Time to respond/answer extended to 8/21/17. (Initial Conference set for 7/26/2017 at 01:00 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 5/17/17) (yv) (Entered: 05/18/2017)
05/18/2017		Set/Reset Deadlines: Veronique Hakim answer due 8/21/2017; Metropolitan Transportation Authority answer due 8/21/2017; New York City Transit Authority answer due 8/21/2017. (yv) (Entered: 05/18/2017)
07/20/2017	<u>37</u>	JOINT PRE-CONFERENCE STATEMENT / <i>Proposed Scheduling Order</i> . Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority.(Kerwin, James) (Entered: 07/20/2017)
07/25/2017	<u>38</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Ira Jonathan Lipton on behalf of Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Lipton, Ira) (Entered: 07/25/2017)
07/25/2017	<u>39</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Helene Rachel Hechtkopf on behalf of Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Hechtkopf, Helene) (Entered: 07/25/2017)
07/26/2017	<u>40</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Eamonn F. Foley on behalf of Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Foley, Eamonn) (Entered: 07/26/2017)
07/26/2017	<u>41</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Mark Galen Toews on behalf of The City Of New York,. (Toews, Mark) (Entered: 07/26/2017)
07/26/2017		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Initial Pretrial Conference held on 7/26/2017. (jp) (Entered: 07/26/2017)
07/26/2017	<u>42</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER: Application to extend discovery based on rule 16 conference should by 9/15/2017. class cert. motion (R.23) 11/6/2017, 12/22/2017 and 1/25/2018. All parties do not consent to conducting all further proceedings before a United States Magistrate Judge, including motions and trial. 28 U.S.C. 636(c). Trial will not be before a jury. trial is anticipated to take 1 week. Motions due by 9/4/2018. Responses due by 9/25/2018 Replies due by 10/2/2018. Fact Discovery due by 6/21/2018. Expert Discovery due by 8/21/2018. Final Pretrial Conference set for 12/4/2018 at 01:00 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. Status Conference set for 10/20/2018 at 10:00 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. Joint Pretrial Order due by 11/28/2018. .Settlement discussions must occur in parallel to this (schedule will not be adjourned, except in very unusual situations, for settlement discussions). So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 7/26/2017) (js) Modified on 8/9/2017 (js). (Entered: 07/27/2017)
08/16/2017	<u>43</u>	LETTER MOTION to Stay <i>the action as against the City of New York</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Martin Bowe dated August 16, 2017. Document filed by The City Of New York,. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Bowe, Martin) (Entered: 08/16/2017)
08/17/2017		<b>***DELETED DOCUMENT. Deleted document number 44 So-Ordered Stipulation. The document was incorrectly filed in this case. (rjm)</b> (Entered: 09/08/2017)
08/17/2017	<u>54</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on PROPOSED STIPULATION. ENDORSEMENT: Ordered. I don't want to "stay" the action as to NYC. Either NYC is in or out. It sounds like you can dismiss subject to a tolling agreement that would allow either party to trigger it and refile the action. Let me know if that would work. Motions terminated: <u>43</u> LETTER MOTION to Stay the action as against the City of New York addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Martin Bowe dated August 16, 2017. Document filed by The City Of New York. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 8/17/2017) (rjm)

		(Entered: 09/08/2017)
08/18/2017	<u>45</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>of the City's time to respond to the complaint</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Martin Bowe dated August 18, 2017. Document filed by The City Of New York.,(Bowe, Martin) (Entered: 08/18/2017)
08/18/2017	<u>46</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Martin John Bowe, Jr on behalf of The City Of New York., (Bowe, Martin) (Entered: 08/18/2017)
08/21/2017	<u>47</u>	ORDER granting <u>45</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to respond to the Complaint. So Ordered.. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 8/21/2017) (js) (Entered: 08/21/2017)
08/21/2017		Set/Reset Deadlines: The City Of New York, answer due 9/6/2017. (js) (Entered: 08/21/2017)
08/21/2017	<u>48</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint,, Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority.(Hechtkopf, Helene) (Entered: 08/21/2017)
08/24/2017	<u>49</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: conference held on 7/26/2017 before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Andrew Walker, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 9/14/2017. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 9/25/2017. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 11/22/2017.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 08/24/2017)
08/24/2017	<u>50</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a conference proceeding held on 7/26/17 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 08/24/2017)
08/25/2017	<u>51</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Maia Beth Goodell on behalf of Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Goodell, Maia) (Entered: 08/25/2017)
09/01/2017	<u>52</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – ELECTRONIC FILING OF NON-ECF DOCUMENT – STIPULATION OF VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL</b> It is hereby stipulated and agreed by and between the parties and/or their respective counsel(s) that the above-captioned action is voluntarily dismissed, against the defendant(s) The City Of New York, pursuant to Rule 41(a)(1)(A)(ii) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. Document filed by The City Of New York.,(Bowe, Martin) Modified on 9/5/2017 (dt). (Entered: 09/01/2017)
09/05/2017		<b>***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO E-MAIL PDF. Note to Attorney Martin Bowe for noncompliance with Section 18.3 of the S.D.N.Y. Electronic Case Filing Rules &amp; Instructions. E-MAIL the PDF for Document <u>52</u> Stipulation of Voluntary Dismissal, to: judgments@nysd.uscourts.gov. (dt)</b> (Entered: 09/05/2017)
09/06/2017	<u>53</u>	STIPULATION OF DISMISSAL WITHOUT PREJUDICE: Now therefore, with the agreement of all Parties, this action is dismissed without prejudice as against City of New York. So Ordered (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 9/6/2017) (js) (Entered: 09/06/2017)
09/15/2017	<u>55</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Miriam Jerry Manber on behalf of Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 09/15/2017)
09/15/2017	<u>56</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Ira J. Lipton dated September 15, 2017. Document filed by

		Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority.(Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 09/15/2017)
09/15/2017	<u>57</u>	ORDER: granting <u>56</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery. So ordered. A new schedule with all dates shall issue shortly. Motions due by 10/16/2017. Response due by 11/6/2018. Reply due by 11/13/2017. Pretrial order due by 1/9/2018. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 9/15/2017) (ap) (Entered: 09/15/2017)
09/15/2017		Set/Reset Deadlines: Responses due by 11/6/2017. Replies due by 11/13/2017. (ap) (Entered: 09/15/2017)
09/19/2017	<u>58</u>	ORDER: The Court received the defendants' request to extend the discovery deadlines. (ECF No. 56.) The Court hereby sets out the following amended schedule: ( Expert Discovery due by 10/2/2018., Fact Discovery due by 7/31/2018., Motions due by 10/16/2018., Joint Pretrial Order due by 1/9/2019., Responses due by 11/6/2018, Replies due by 11/13/2018., Final Pretrial Conference set for 1/16/2019 at 01:00 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest., Telephone Conference set for 10/20/2017 at 10:00 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 9/19/2017) (js) (Entered: 09/19/2017)
09/19/2017	<u>59</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Steven Mark Silverberg on behalf of Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Silverberg, Steven) (Entered: 09/19/2017)
09/25/2017	<u>60</u>	MOTION for Stuart J. Seaborn to Withdraw as Attorney . Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan.(Seaborn, Stuart) (Entered: 09/25/2017)
09/27/2017	<u>61</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT: on re: <u>60</u> NOTICE OF MOTION TO WITHDRAWAL OF COUNSEL, for Stuart J. Seaborn to Withdraw as Attorney, filed by Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Harlem Independent Living Center, Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Chris Pangilinan, Dustin Jones, Bronx Independent Living Services. ENDORSEMENT: So ordered. Attorney Stuart John Seaborn terminated. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 9/27/2017) (ap) (Entered: 09/27/2017)
10/20/2017	<u>62</u>	ORDER. The Court held a telephonic status conference on October 20, 2017. The Court now clarifies the questions it posed about notice for a Rule 23(b)(2) class for purely injunctive and declaratory relief. While the Court may require that notice be provided to a (b)(2) class, Rule 23(c)(2)(A) makes such notice discretionary. The Court declines to require notice at this stage of the litigation. Should the parties reach a settlement or other final disposition, the Court will at that time, per Rule 23(e), determine if/what type of notice shall be provided. Furthermore, the Court misspoke when it referred to an "opt out" provision, given that the plaintiffs seek purely injunctive and declaratory relief. The Court will hold another telephonic status conference on this matter on Friday, January 19, 2018 at 4:30 p.m. The parties shall call Chambers (212-805-0276) from one line at that time. SO ORDERED. (Telephone Conference set for 1/19/2018 at 04:30 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 10/20/2017) (rjm) (Entered: 10/20/2017)
11/03/2017	<u>63</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER CERTIFYING CLASS:NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS STIPULATED AND SO ORDERED THAT: 1. The requirements of Rule 23(a) and 23(b)(2) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure having been met, this action is certified to proceed as a class action on behalf of all persons who use or seek to use the New York City subway system, and have a disability that requires them to use an elevator to access the subway system (the "Class"). 2. Sasha Blair-Goldensohn. Chris Pangilinan, and Dustin Jones are appointed representatives for the Class. 3. Disability Rights Advocates and Sheppard Mullin Richter & Hampton LLP are appointed counsel for the Class. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 11/3/2017) (js) (Entered: 11/06/2017)



01/18/2018	<u>64</u>	ORDER: The telephonic status conference currently scheduled for Friday, January 19, 2018 at 4:30 p.m. is rescheduled to Wednesday, January 24, 2018 at 2:30 p.m. Parties shall call Chambers (212-806-0276) from one line at that time. (Telephone Conference set for 1/24/2018 at 2:30 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 1/18/2018) (ap) (Entered: 01/18/2018)
01/24/2018	<u>65</u>	ORDER: The Court held a telephonic status conference on this matter on January 24, 2018. The next telephonic status conference is hereby scheduled for Friday, April 13, 2018 at 9:00 a.m. The parties shall call Chambers (212-805-0276) from one line at that time. (Telephone Conference set for 4/13/2018 at 9:00 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 1/24/2018) (ap) (Entered: 01/24/2018)
03/12/2018	<u>66</u>	PROTECTIVE ORDER PURSUANT TO F.R.E. 502(d): ORDERED that if, in connection with this litigation, a party inadvertently discloses information subject to a claim of attorney-client privilege or work-product protection ("Inadvertently Disclosed Information"), such disclosure shall not constitute or be deemed a waiver or forfeiture of any claim of privilege or work-product protection with respect to the Inadvertently Disclosed Information and its subject matter. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that if a disclosing party makes a claim of inadvertent disclosure, the receiving party shall, within five business days, return or destroy all copies of the Inadvertently Disclosed Information, and provide a certification of counsel that all such information has been returned or destroyed. Within five business days of the notification that such Inadvertently Disclosed Information has been returned or destroyed, the disclosing party shall produce a privilege log with respect to the Inadvertently Disclosed Information. The receiving party may move the Court for an Order compelling production of the Inadvertently Disclosed Information. The motion shall be filed under seal and shall not assert as a ground foretelling such an Order the fact or circumstances of the inadvertent production. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 3/12/2018) (ama) (Entered: 03/12/2018)
03/12/2018	<u>67</u>	NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Rebecca Juliet Rodgers on behalf of All Plaintiffs. New Address: Disability Rights Advocates, 655 Third Avenue, 14th Floor, New York, New York, USA 10017, 2126448644. (Rodgers, Rebecca) (Entered: 03/12/2018)
03/13/2018	<u>68</u>	NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Maia Beth Goodell on behalf of Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. New Address: Disability Rights Advocates, 655 Third Avenue, 14th Floor, New York, New York (NY), 10017, 2126448644. (Goodell, Maia) (Entered: 03/13/2018)
03/22/2018	<u>69</u>	NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Michelle Anne Caiola on behalf of All Plaintiffs. New Address: Disability Rights Advocates, 655 Third Avenue, 14th Floor, New York, New York, USA 10017, 2126448644. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 03/22/2018)
04/13/2018		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Telephonic Status Conference held on 4/13/2018. (jp) (Entered: 04/13/2018)
04/17/2018	<u>70</u>	ORDER: The Court held a telephonic status conference on this matter on April 13, 2018. As discussed in the conference: A proposed schedule for depositions shall be submitted to the Court not later than April 23, 2018; All document production shall be completed not later than May 4, 2018; A telephonic status conference shall be held in this matter on Friday, July 13, 2018 at 1:00 p.m. (Deposition due by 4/23/2018. Status Conference set for 7/13/2018 at 01:00 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 4/17/2018) (jwh) (Entered: 04/17/2018)
04/23/2018	<u>71</u>	JOINT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Proposed Schedule for Depositions</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Daniel L. Brown dated April 23, 2018. Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan.(Brown, Daniel) (Entered: 04/23/2018)

04/26/2018	<u>72</u>	ORDER granting <u>71</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 4/25/2018) (mml) (Entered: 04/26/2018)
04/30/2018	<u>73</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Ira J. Lipton dated April 30, 2018 re: Deposition Schedule. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority.(Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 04/30/2018)
04/30/2018	<u>74</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Ira J. Lipton dated April 30, 2018 re: Deposition Schedule – CORRECTED. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority.(Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 04/30/2018)
05/01/2018	<u>75</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>74</u> JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Ira J. Lipton dated April 30, 2018 re: Deposition Schedule – CORRECTED. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. ENDORSEMENT: So ordered. (Deposition due by 7/12/2018.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 5/1/2018) (rjm) (Entered: 05/01/2018)
05/02/2018	<u>76</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 1/24/2018 before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Samuel Mauro, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 5/23/2018. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 6/4/2018. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 7/31/2018.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 05/02/2018)
05/02/2018	<u>77</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 1/24/18 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 05/02/2018)
05/31/2018	<u>78</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Seth Emmanuel Packrone on behalf of Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Packrone, Seth) (Entered: 05/31/2018)
06/06/2018	<u>79</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Michelle Caiola dated June 6, 2018 re: Request to the Court to Compel Defendants to produce Mr. Andrew Byford, President of the New York City Transit Authority (NYCTA), to appear for deposition pursuant to a properly served notice dated May 16, 2018.. Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan.(Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 06/06/2018)
06/11/2018	<u>80</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Ira J. Lipton dated June 11, 2018 re: Plaintiff's motion to compel the deposition of NYCT President Andy Byford. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Andy Byford declaration)(Hechtkopf, Helene) (Entered: 06/11/2018)
06/14/2018	<u>81</u>	ORDER re: <u>80</u> Letter, filed by Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, Veronique Hakim, New York City Transit Authority. Before the Court is plaintiffs motion to compel defendants to produce Andrew Byford, President of the New York City Transit Authority, to appear for a deposition. Having carefully reviewed the submissions, the Court DENIES the motion. The material facts of the complaint will not be developed through this witness. While he is in possession of some relevant information, the facts needed to either prove liability or provide relief will not be drawn from his views or opinions but from the facts of what happened. There are other

		witnesses better positioned to provide relevant information in this matter. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 6/14/2018) (ne) (Entered: 06/14/2018)
06/27/2018	<u>82</u>	ORDER. The telephonic status conference set for July 13, 2018 is hereby rescheduled to Thursday, July 12, 2018 at 12:30 p.m. The parties are directed to call Chambers (212-805-0276) from one line at that time. SO ORDERED. (Status Conference set for 7/12/2018 at 12:30 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 6/27/2018) (rjm) (Entered: 06/27/2018)
07/12/2018	<u>83</u>	ORDER: The Court held a telephonic status conference on July 12, 2018 in the above captioned case. In accordance with the discussion had during that conference, the Court ordered as follows: 1. Fact discovery shall close on September 18, 2018 (but all requests for discovery shall be made on or before July 31, 2018); 2. Expert discovery shall close on October 16, 2018, initial expert reports shall be proffered not later than August 31, 2018, and rebuttal reports shall be provided not later than September 21, 2018; 3. The last date to file dispositive motions shall be October 30, 2018, with oppositions by November 20, 2018 and replies by December 4, 2018; 4. The joint pretrial order shall be filed not later than January 9, 2019; 5. The in-person final pretrial conference remains scheduled for January 16, 2018 at 1:00 p.m.; and 6. Trial shall commence on January 22, 2019. ( Discovery due by 7/31/2018. Expert Discovery due by 10/16/2018. Fact Discovery due by 9/18/2018. Motions due by 10/30/2018. joint Pretrial Order due by 1/9/2019. Responses due by 11/20/2018, Replies due by 12/4/2018., Final Pretrial Conference set for 1/16/2018 at 01:00 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 7/12/2018) (js) (Entered: 07/13/2018)
07/27/2018	<u>84</u>	ORDER: A telephonic status conference is hereby scheduled for Friday, September 21, 2018 at 3:30 p.m. The parties shall call Chambers (212-805-0276) from one line at that time. So Ordered. ( Telephone Conference set for 9/21/2018 at 03:30 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 7/27/2018) (js) (Entered: 07/30/2018)
08/14/2018	<u>85</u>	ORDER: The telephonic status conference that is currently scheduled for Friday, September 21, 2018, at 3:30 p.m. (see ECF No. 84) is hereby rescheduled to Friday, September 28, 2018, at 12:00 p.m. The parties shall provide Chambers with a call-in number ahead of the conference, unless the Court orders otherwise. So Ordered. ( Telephone Conference set for 9/28/2018 at 12:00 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 8/14/2018) (js) (Entered: 08/15/2018)
08/29/2018	<u>86</u>	MOTION for Emily Seelenfreund to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-15508296. <b>Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.</b> Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Signed Affidavit, # <u>2</u> Letter to Court, # <u>3</u> Pro Hac Vice Order for Admission, # <u>4</u> Certificate of Good Standing for Emily Seelenfreund)(Seelenfreund, Emily) (Entered: 08/29/2018)
08/29/2018		<b>&gt;&gt;&gt;NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. <u>86</u> MOTION for Emily Seelenfreund to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-15508296. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (bcu) (Entered: 08/29/2018)</b>
08/30/2018	<u>87</u>	ORDER FOR ADMISSION PRO HAC VICE granting <u>86</u> Motion for Emily Seelenfreund to Appear Pro Hac Vice. IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Applicant is admitted to practice Pro Hac Vice in the above captioned case in the United States District Court for the Southern District of New York. All attorneys appearing before this Court are subject to Local Rules of this Court, including the Rules governing discipline of attorneys. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 8/30/18) (yv) (Entered: 08/30/2018)

09/18/2018	<u>88</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to submit a letter–motion re Interrogatories</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Maia Goodell dated 9/18/2018. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan.(Goodell, Maia) (Entered: 09/18/2018)
09/18/2018	<u>89</u>	JOINT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to exchange rebuttal expert reports</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Ira J. Lipton dated September 18, 2018. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority.(Silverberg, Steven) (Entered: 09/18/2018)
09/19/2018	<u>90</u>	ORDER granting <u>88</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. SO ORDERED. Motions due by 9/26/2018. (Signed by Judge Loretta A. Preska on 9/19/2018) (cf) (Entered: 09/19/2018)
09/19/2018	<u>91</u>	ORDER granting <u>89</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Loretta A. Preska on 9/19/2018) (cf) (Entered: 09/19/2018)
09/20/2018		NOTICE OF CASE REASSIGNMENT to Judge Robert W. Sweet. Judge Katherine B. Forrest is no longer assigned to the case. (sjo) (Entered: 09/20/2018)
09/26/2018	<u>92</u>	MOTION to Compel MTA to Respond to Interrogatories . Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. Return Date set for 10/10/2018 at 12:00 PM.(Goodell, Maia) (Entered: 09/26/2018)
09/26/2018	<u>93</u>	DECLARATION of Maia Goodell in Support re: <u>92</u> MOTION to Compel MTA to Respond to Interrogatories .. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2)(Goodell, Maia) (Entered: 09/26/2018)
09/26/2018	<u>94</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>92</u> MOTION to Compel MTA to Respond to Interrogatories . . Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Goodell, Maia) (Entered: 09/26/2018)
10/03/2018	<u>95</u>	PROPOSED SCHEDULING ORDER. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Cover Letter accompanying Proposed Scheduling Order) (Silverberg, Steven) (Entered: 10/03/2018)
10/03/2018	<u>96</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>92</u> MOTION to Compel MTA to Respond to Interrogatories . . Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Hechtkopf, Helene) (Entered: 10/03/2018)
10/03/2018	<u>97</u>	DECLARATION of Helene R. Hechtkopf in Opposition re: <u>92</u> MOTION to Compel MTA to Respond to Interrogatories .. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Plaintiffs' first set of interrogatories, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Letter from M. Goodell to I. Lipton, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Excerpt from deposition of A. Suarez, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Excerpt from deposition of A. Stern)(Hechtkopf, Helene) (Entered: 10/03/2018)
10/05/2018	<u>98</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>92</u> MOTION to Compel MTA to Respond to Interrogatories . . Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York

		Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Goodell, Maia) (Entered: 10/05/2018)
10/05/2018	<u>99</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER: IT IS SO ORDERED THAT: The deadline for the exchange of rebuttal expert reports is October 12, 2018; The deadline for the completion of expert discovery is November 2, 2018; The briefing schedule for the submission of motions to preclude evidence pursuant to Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, 509 U.S. 579 (1993), if any, is as follows: a. Opening briefs filed by November 21, 2018; b. Opposition briefs filed by December 20, 2018; and c. Reply briefs filed by January 4, 2019. [Or, in the alternative, if the court prefers to consider Daubert motions as part of any dispositive motion practice] The briefing schedule for the submission of dispositive motions and motions to preclude evidence pursuant to Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, 509 U.S. 579 (1993), if any, is as follows: a. Opening briefs filed by November 30, 2018; b. Opposition briefs filed by January 4, 2019; and c. Reply briefs filed by January 25, 2019. (Motions due by 11/30/2018. Responses due by 1/4/2019 Replies due by 1/25/2019.) (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 10/4/2018) (anc) (Entered: 10/07/2018)
10/15/2018	<u>100</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER: NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS SO ORDERED THAT: The deadline for the completion of expert discovery is November 2, 2018; The briefing schedule for the submission of dispositive motions and motions to preclude evidence pursuant to Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharmaceuticals, 509 U.S. 579 (1993), if any, is as follows: Opening briefs filed by November 30, 2018; Opposition briefs filed by January 4, 2019; and Reply briefs filed by January 25, 2019. (Motions due by 11/30/2018. Responses due by 1/4/2019 Replies due by 1/25/2019. Expert Discovery due by 11/2/2018.) (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 10/11/2018) (jca) (Entered: 10/15/2018)
11/01/2018	<u>101</u>	LETTER MOTION for Discovery to <i>Quash Subpoenas</i> addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Maia Goodell dated November 1, 2018. Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. Return Date set for 11/14/2018 at 12:00 PM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2)(Goodell, Maia) (Entered: 11/01/2018)
11/02/2018	<u>102</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Maia Goodell dated November 2, 2018. Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan.(Goodell, Maia) (Entered: 11/02/2018)
11/02/2018	<u>103</u>	LETTER MOTION to Compel <i>deposition testimony and in opposition to Plaintiffs' motion to quash subpoenas</i> addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Helene R. Hechtkopf dated November 2, 2018. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. Return Date set for 11/14/2018 at 12:00 PM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Exhibit, # <u>3</u> Exhibit, # <u>4</u> Exhibit)(Silverberg, Steven) (Entered: 11/02/2018)
11/05/2018	<u>104</u>	ORDER: Plaintiff's motion to quash, dated November 2, 2018, shall be heard at 12:00PM on Wednesday, November 28, 2018 in Courtroom 18C, United States Courthouse, 500 Pearl Street. Papers are to be served in accordance with Local Civil Rule 6.1. It is so ordered. Set Deadlines/Hearing as to <u>101</u> LETTER MOTION for Discovery to <i>Quash Subpoenas</i> addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Maia Goodell dated November 1, 2018. (Motion Hearing set for 11/28/2018 at 12:00 PM in Courtroom 18C, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Robert W. Sweet.) (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 11/5/2018) (rro) (Entered: 11/05/2018)
11/07/2018	<u>105</u>	ORDER with respect to <u>103</u> Letter Motion to Compel. Defendant's motion to compel, dated November 2, 2018, shall be heard at 12:00 PM on Wednesday, November 28, 2018 in Courtroom 18C, United States Courthouse, 500 Pearl Street. Papers are to be served in accordance with Local Civil Rule 6.1. It is so ordered. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 11/5/2018) (js) (Entered: 11/07/2018)

11/08/2018	<u>106</u>	LETTER RESPONSE in Opposition to Motion addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Ira J. Lipton dated November 8, 2018 re: <u>102</u> LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Maia Goodell dated November 2, 2018. . Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9)(Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 11/08/2018)
11/13/2018	<u>107</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Maia Goodell dated November 13, 2018. Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit)(Goodell, Maia) (Entered: 11/13/2018)
11/16/2018	<u>108</u>	JOINT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to file Summary Judgment and Daubert Motions</i> addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Ira J. Lipton dated 11/16/2018. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority.(Lipton, Ira) (Entered: 11/16/2018)
11/20/2018	<u>109</u>	ORDER: granting <u>108</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 11/19/2018) (ama) (Entered: 11/20/2018)
11/28/2018		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Robert W. Sweet: Oral Argument held on 11/28/2018 re: <u>103</u> LETTER MOTION to Compel deposition testimony and in opposition to Plaintiffs' motion to quash subpoenas addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Helene R. Hechtkopf dated November 2, 2018. filed by Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, Veronique Hakim, New York City Transit Authority. Motion Granted. (Chan, Tsz) (Entered: 11/28/2018)
12/06/2018	<u>110</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: motion held on 11/28/2018 before Judge Robert W. Sweet. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Vincent Bologna, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 12/27/2018. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 1/7/2019. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 3/6/2019.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 12/06/2018)
12/06/2018	<u>111</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a motion proceeding held on 11/28/18 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 12/06/2018)
12/13/2018	<u>112</u>	PRETRIAL ORDER: (Pretrial Conference set for 1/15/2019 at 12:00 PM in Courtroom 18C, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Robert W. Sweet.) (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 12/13/2018) (js) (Entered: 12/13/2018)
12/18/2018	<u>113</u>	JOINT LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference <i>without date</i> addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Steven M. Silverberg dated December 18, 2018. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority.(Silverberg, Steven) (Entered: 12/18/2018)
12/20/2018	<u>114</u>	ORDER granting <u>113</u> Letter Motion to Adjourn Conference: So ordered. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 12/19/2018) (jwh) (Entered: 12/20/2018)
02/07/2019	<u>115</u>	LETTER MOTION for Discovery <i>seeking preclusion of Plaintiffs' three new experts</i> addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Ira J. Lipton dated February 7, 2019. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B)(Silverberg, Steven) (Entered: 02/07/2019)

02/14/2019	<u>116</u>	LETTER RESPONSE in Opposition to Motion addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Maia Goodell dated February 14, 2019 re: <u>115</u> LETTER MOTION for Discovery <i>seeking preclusion of Plaintiffs' three new experts</i> addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Ira J. Lipton dated February 7, 2019. . Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Goodell, Maia) (Entered: 02/14/2019)
02/19/2019	<u>117</u>	LETTER REPLY to Response to Motion addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Ira J. Lipton dated February 19, 2019 re: <u>115</u> LETTER MOTION for Discovery <i>seeking preclusion of Plaintiffs' three new experts</i> addressed to Judge Robert W. Sweet from Ira J. Lipton dated February 7, 2019. . Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 02/19/2019)
02/22/2019	<u>118</u>	ORDER: Defendant's motion to strike, dated February 07, 2019 shall be marked fully submitted on March 6, 2019 and taken on submission. It is so ordered. (Signed by Judge Robert W. Sweet on 2/21/2019) (ks) (Entered: 02/22/2019)
03/27/2019		<b>***DELETED DOCUMENT. Deleted document number 119 . The document was incorrectly filed in this case. (ne)</b> (Entered: 03/29/2019)
03/27/2019	<u>122</u>	DIRECTION TO THE BAR AND INTERIM ORDER OF REFERENCE: The Hon. Robert W. Sweet of this court having died on March 24, 2019; and Time being needed in order to effect the reassignment of the cases on his docket: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT, pending the reassignment of Judge Sweet's civil cases, all urgent matters should be taken either to the Magistrate Judge who is assigned to the case or to the District Judge sitting in Part I. In cases in which Judge Sweet did not sign an order of reference, this order operates as an interim order of reference to the Magistrate Judge for interim pre–trial supervision. Routine case management requests (such as, for extension of time) should be directed to the Magistrate Judge, not to the Part I Judge. Order that case be referred to the Clerk of Court for assignment to a Magistrate Judge for General Pretrial (includes scheduling, discovery, non–dispositive pretrial motions, and settlement). Referred to Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman. (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 3/27/2019) (ne) (Entered: 03/29/2019)
03/28/2019	<u>120</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Colleen McMahon from Maia Goodell dated March 28, 2019 re: Requesting a Trial Date be Set as Soon as a New Judge is Assigned. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan.(Goodell, Maia) (Entered: 03/28/2019)
03/28/2019	<u>121</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Colleen McMahon from Ira J. Lipton dated March 28, 2019 re: Response to Plaintiffs' March 28 Letter. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority.(Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 03/28/2019)
04/01/2019	<u>123</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Robert James Boller on behalf of TransitCenter. (Boller, Robert) (Entered: 04/01/2019)
04/01/2019	<u>124</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Lauren Kelley Ross on behalf of TransitCenter. (Ross, Lauren) (Entered: 04/01/2019)
04/01/2019	<u>125</u>	RULE 7.1 CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. No Corporate Parent. Document filed by TransitCenter.(Ross, Lauren) (Entered: 04/01/2019)
04/01/2019	<u>126</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – WRONG EVENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU –</b> LETTER MOTION for Discovery / <i>Quash the Subpoena</i> addressed to Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman from Lauren K. Ross dated April 1, 2019. Document filed by TransitCenter. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D)(Ross, Lauren) Modified on 5/21/2019 (ldi). (Entered: 04/01/2019)
04/03/2019	<u>127</u>	JOINT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>response to motion to quash subpoena (See Docket Entry No. 126) on behalf of Defendants and non–party</i>

		<i>TransitCenter</i> addressed to Magistrate Judge Debra C. Freeman from Steven M. Silverberg dated April 3, 2019. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority.(Silverberg, Steven) (Entered: 04/03/2019)
04/08/2019		NOTICE OF CASE REASSIGNMENT to Judge George B. Daniels. Judge Robert W. Sweet is no longer assigned to the case. (sjo) (Entered: 04/08/2019)
04/09/2019	<u>128</u>	PROPOSED PROTECTIVE ORDER. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Goodell, Maia) (Entered: 04/09/2019)
04/10/2019	<u>129</u>	ORDER: A status conference is scheduled for April 25, 2019 at 9:45 a.m. (Status Conference set for 4/25/2019 at 9:45 AM before Judge George B. Daniels.) (Signed by Judge George B. Daniels on 4/10/2019) (js) (Entered: 04/10/2019)
04/10/2019	<u>130</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on NON–DISCLOSURE AGREEMENT. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge George B. Daniels on 4/10/2019) (mro) (Entered: 04/10/2019)
04/10/2019	<u>131</u>	STIPULATED CONFIDENTIALITY AGREEMENT AND PROTECTIVE ORDER...regarding procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of confidential material... (Signed by Judge George B. Daniels on 4/10/2019) (mro) (Entered: 04/10/2019)
04/11/2019	<u>132</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge George B. Daniels from Maia Goodell dated April 11, 2019 re: Adjournment of Conference Request. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan.(Goodell, Maia) (Entered: 04/11/2019)
04/12/2019	<u>133</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>132</u> Letter, filed by Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Harlem Independent Living Center, Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Chris Pangilinan, Dustin Jones, Bronx Independent Living Services. ENDORSEMENT: The status conference is adjourned from April 25, 2019 at May 2, 2019 at 9:45 a.m. (Status Conference set for 5/2/2019 at 09:45 AM before Judge George B. Daniels.) (Signed by Judge George B. Daniels on 4/12/2019) (cf) (Entered: 04/12/2019)
04/23/2019	<u>134</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge George B. Daniels from Lauren K. Ross dated April 23, 2019 re: Withdrawing Motion to Quash. Document filed by TransitCenter.(Ross, Lauren) (Entered: 04/23/2019)
04/24/2019	<u>135</u>	ORDER: withdrawing <u>126</u> Letter Motion for Discovery; terminating <u>127</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File. In light of TransitCenter's April 23, 2019 letter withdrawing its Motion to Quash Defendant New York City Transit Authority's February 25, 2019 subpoena, the Clerk of Court is directed to close ECF Nos. 126 and 127, accordingly. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge George B. Daniels on 4/24/2019) (ama) (Entered: 04/24/2019)
05/02/2019		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge George B. Daniels: Status Conference held on 5/2/2019, ( Status Conference set for 8/15/2019 at 09:45 AM in Courtroom 11A, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge George B. Daniels.). Plaintiff Counsel: Maia Beth Goodell, Michelle Anne Caiola, Emily Seelenfreund, Daniel L. Brown Defense Counsel: Helene Rachel Hechtkopf, Ira Jonathan Lipton, Miriam Jerry Manber, Steven Mark Silverberg and Court Reporter present. (Vega, Elizabeth) (Entered: 05/06/2019)
05/20/2019	<u>136</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: conference held on 5/2/2019 before Judge George B. Daniels. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Khristine Sellin, (212) 805–0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court



		Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 6/10/2019. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 6/20/2019. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 8/19/2019.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 05/20/2019)
05/20/2019	<a href="#">137</a>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a conference proceeding held on 5/2/19 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 05/20/2019)
05/28/2019	<a href="#">138</a>	ORDER terminating <a href="#">102</a> Motion for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery; terminating <a href="#">103</a> Motion to Compel; terminating <a href="#">107</a> Motion for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery; terminating <a href="#">115</a> Motion for Discovery. The Clerk of Court is directed to close the motions at ECF Nos. 102, 103, 107, and 115, as these motions were resolved at the May 2, 2019 status conference. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge George B. Daniels on 5/28/2019) (ks) Modified on 5/28/2019 (ks). (Entered: 05/28/2019)
06/04/2019	<a href="#">139</a>	ORDER terminating <a href="#">92</a> Motion to Compel; terminating <a href="#">101</a> Letter Motion for Discovery: The Clerk of Court is directed to close the motions at ECF Nos. 92 and 101, as these motions were resolved at the November 28, 2018 status conference before the late Judge Sweet. (Signed by Judge George B. Daniels on 6/4/2019) (jwh) (Entered: 06/04/2019)
07/16/2019	<a href="#">140</a>	MOTION for JAMES L. KERWIN to Withdraw as Attorney for Defendants MTA, NYCTA, Veronique Hakim and Darryl C. Irick. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority.(Kerwin, James) (Entered: 07/16/2019)
07/17/2019	<a href="#">141</a>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on MOTION TO WITHDRAW AS COUNSEL. ENDORSEMENT: So ordered. Granting <a href="#">140</a> Motion to Withdraw as Attorney. Attorney James Luke Kerwin terminated. (Signed by Judge George B. Daniels on 7/17/2019) (rjm) (Entered: 07/17/2019)
08/09/2019	<a href="#">142</a>	MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment . Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan.(Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<a href="#">143</a>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <a href="#">142</a> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment . . Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<a href="#">144</a>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY (SEE <a href="#">163</a> Declaration) –</b> DECLARATION of Michelle Caiola in Support re: <a href="#">142</a> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit 1, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit 2 Part 1, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit 2 Part 2, # <a href="#">4</a> Exhibit 3, # <a href="#">5</a> Exhibit 4, # <a href="#">6</a> Exhibit 5, # <a href="#">7</a> Exhibit 6, # <a href="#">8</a> Exhibit 7, # <a href="#">9</a> Exhibit 8, # <a href="#">10</a> Exhibit 9, # <a href="#">11</a> Exhibit 10, # <a href="#">12</a> Exhibit 11, # <a href="#">13</a> Exhibit 12, # <a href="#">14</a> Exhibit 13, # <a href="#">15</a> Exhibit 14, # <a href="#">16</a> Exhibit 15, # <a href="#">17</a> Exhibit 16, # <a href="#">18</a> Exhibit 17, # <a href="#">19</a> Exhibit 18, # <a href="#">20</a> Exhibit 19, # <a href="#">21</a> Exhibit 20, # <a href="#">22</a> Exhibit 21, # <a href="#">23</a> Exhibit 22, # <a href="#">24</a> Exhibit 23, # <a href="#">25</a> Exhibit 24, # <a href="#">26</a> Exhibit 25, # <a href="#">27</a> Exhibit 26, # <a href="#">28</a> Exhibit 27, # <a href="#">29</a> Exhibit 28, # <a href="#">30</a> Exhibit 29, # <a href="#">31</a> Exhibit 30, # <a href="#">32</a> Exhibit 31, # <a href="#">33</a> Exhibit 32, # <a href="#">34</a> Exhibit 33, # <a href="#">35</a> Exhibit 34 Part 1, # <a href="#">36</a> Exhibit 34 Part 2, # <a href="#">37</a> Exhibit 35, # <a href="#">38</a> Exhibit 36, # <a href="#">39</a> Exhibit 37, # <a href="#">40</a> Exhibit 38, # <a href="#">41</a> Exhibit 39, # <a href="#">42</a> Exhibit 40, # <a href="#">43</a> Exhibit 41, # <a href="#">44</a> Exhibit 42 Part 1, # <a href="#">45</a> Exhibit 42 Part 2, # <a href="#">46</a>

		Exhibit 42 Part 3, # <u>47</u> Exhibit 42 Part 4, # <u>48</u> Exhibit 44, # <u>49</u> Exhibit 45, # <u>50</u> Exhibit 46, # <u>51</u> Exhibit 47, # <u>52</u> Exhibit 48, # <u>53</u> Exhibit 49, # <u>54</u> Exhibit 50, # <u>55</u> Exhibit 51, # <u>56</u> Exhibit 52, # <u>57</u> Exhibit 53, # <u>58</u> Exhibit 54, # <u>59</u> Exhibit 55, # <u>60</u> Exhibit 56, # <u>61</u> Exhibit 57, # <u>62</u> Exhibit 58, # <u>63</u> Exhibit 59, # <u>64</u> Exhibit 60, # <u>65</u> Exhibit 61, # <u>66</u> Exhibit 62, # <u>67</u> Exhibit 63, # <u>68</u> Exhibit 64, # <u>69</u> Exhibit 65, # <u>70</u> Exhibit 66, # <u>71</u> Exhibit 67, # <u>72</u> Exhibit 68, # <u>73</u> Exhibit 69, # <u>74</u> Exhibit 70, # <u>75</u> Exhibit 71, # <u>76</u> Exhibit 72, # <u>77</u> Exhibit 73, # <u>78</u> Exhibit 74, # <u>79</u> Exhibit 75, # <u>80</u> Exhibit 76, # <u>81</u> Exhibit 77, # <u>82</u> Exhibit 78, # <u>83</u> Exhibit 79, # <u>84</u> Exhibit 80)(Caiola, Michelle) Modified on 8/13/2019 (db). (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<u>145</u>	DECLARATION of Chris Pangilinan in Support re: <u>142</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1)(Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<u>146</u>	DECLARATION of Dustin Jones in Support re: <u>142</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<u>147</u>	DECLARATION of Edith Prentiss in Support re: <u>142</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<u>148</u>	DECLARATION of Monica Bartley in Support re: <u>142</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<u>149</u>	DECLARATION of Sasha Blair–Goldensohn in Support re: <u>142</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<u>150</u>	RULE 56.1 STATEMENT. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<u>151</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>to exclude expert testimony of Dennis W. Olson</i> . Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan.(Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<u>152</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>151</u> MOTION in Limine <i>to exclude expert testimony of Dennis W. Olson</i> . . Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 08/09/2019)

		08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<u>153</u>	MOTION to Preclude <i>Plaintiffs' Experts</i> . Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority.(Silverberg, Steven) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<u>154</u>	DECLARATION of Ira J. Lipton in Support re: <u>153</u> MOTION to Preclude <i>Plaintiffs' Experts</i> .. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 13, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 14, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 15, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 16, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 17, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 18, # <u>19</u> Exhibit 19, # <u>20</u> Exhibit 20, # <u>21</u> Exhibit 21, # <u>22</u> Exhibit 22, # <u>23</u> Exhibit 23, # <u>24</u> Exhibit 24, # <u>25</u> Exhibit 25, # <u>26</u> Exhibit 26, # <u>27</u> Exhibit 27, # <u>28</u> Exhibit 28, # <u>29</u> Exhibit 29, # <u>30</u> Exhibit 30, # <u>31</u> Exhibit 31, # <u>32</u> Exhibit 32, # <u>33</u> Exhibit 33, # <u>34</u> Exhibit 34, # <u>35</u> Exhibit 35, # <u>36</u> Exhibit 36, # <u>37</u> Exhibit 37)(Silverberg, Steven) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<u>155</u>	DECLARATION of Dr. Alan J. Salzberg in Support re: <u>153</u> MOTION to Preclude <i>Plaintiffs' Experts</i> .. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Silverberg, Steven) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<u>156</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>153</u> MOTION to Preclude <i>Plaintiffs' Experts</i> . . Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Silverberg, Steven) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<u>157</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment . Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority.(Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<u>158</u>	DECLARATION of Ira J. Lipton in Support re: <u>157</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 13, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 14, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 15)(Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<u>159</u>	DECLARATION of Mathew Varghese in Support re: <u>157</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2)(Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<u>160</u>	DECLARATION of Alan J. Salzberg in Support re: <u>157</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<u>161</u>	RULE 56.1 STATEMENT. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/09/2019	<u>162</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>157</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . . Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, The City Of New York,. (Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 08/09/2019)
08/12/2019	<u>163</u>	DECLARATION of Michelle Caiola in Support re: <u>142</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2 Part 1, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 2 Part 2, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 13, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 14, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 15, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 16, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 17, # <u>19</u> Exhibit 18, # <u>20</u> Exhibit 19, # <u>21</u> Exhibit 20, # <u>22</u> Exhibit 21, #

		<u>23</u> Exhibit 22, # <u>24</u> Exhibit 23, # <u>25</u> Exhibit 24, # <u>26</u> Exhibit 25, # <u>27</u> Exhibit 26, # <u>28</u> Exhibit 27, # <u>29</u> Exhibit 28, # <u>30</u> Exhibit 29, # <u>31</u> Exhibit 30, # <u>32</u> Exhibit 31, # <u>33</u> Exhibit 32, # <u>34</u> Exhibit 33, # <u>35</u> Exhibit 34 Part 1, # <u>36</u> Exhibit 34 Part 2, # <u>37</u> Exhibit 35, # <u>38</u> Exhibit 36, # <u>39</u> Exhibit 37, # <u>40</u> Exhibit 38, # <u>41</u> Exhibit 39, # <u>42</u> Exhibit 40, # <u>43</u> Exhibit 41, # <u>44</u> Exhibit 42 Part 1, # <u>45</u> Exhibit 42 Part 2, # <u>46</u> Exhibit 42 Part 3, # <u>47</u> Exhibit 42 Part 4, # <u>48</u> Exhibit 43, # <u>49</u> Exhibit 44, # <u>50</u> Exhibit 45, # <u>51</u> Exhibit 46, # <u>52</u> Exhibit 47, # <u>53</u> Exhibit 48, # <u>54</u> Exhibit 49, # <u>55</u> Exhibit 50, # <u>56</u> Exhibit 51, # <u>57</u> Exhibit 52, # <u>58</u> Exhibit 53, # <u>59</u> Exhibit 54, # <u>60</u> Exhibit 55, # <u>61</u> Exhibit 56, # <u>62</u> Exhibit 57, # <u>63</u> Exhibit 58, # <u>64</u> Exhibit 59, # <u>65</u> Exhibit 60, # <u>66</u> Exhibit 61, # <u>67</u> Exhibit 62, # <u>68</u> Exhibit 63, # <u>69</u> Exhibit 64, # <u>70</u> Exhibit 65, # <u>71</u> Exhibit 66, # <u>72</u> Exhibit 67, # <u>73</u> Exhibit 68, # <u>74</u> Exhibit 69, # <u>75</u> Exhibit 70, # <u>76</u> Exhibit 71, # <u>77</u> Exhibit 72, # <u>78</u> Exhibit 73, # <u>79</u> Exhibit 74, # <u>80</u> Exhibit 75, # <u>81</u> Exhibit 76, # <u>82</u> Exhibit 77, # <u>83</u> Exhibit 78, # <u>84</u> Exhibit 79, # <u>85</u> Exhibit 80)(Goodell, Maia) (Entered: 08/12/2019)
08/15/2019		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge George B. Daniels: Status Conference held on 8/15/2019, ( Oral Argument set for 10/24/2019 at 10:30 AM in Courtroom 11A, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge George B. Daniels.). Plaintiff Counsel: Maia Beth Goodell, Emily Seelenfreund, Michelle Anne Caiola; Defense Counsel: Helene Rachel Hechtkopf, Ira Jonathan Lipton, Miriam Jerry Manber, Steven Mark Silverberg and Court Reporter present. (Vega, Elizabeth) (Entered: 08/15/2019)
09/05/2019	<u>164</u>	DECLARATION of Sarah Librera in Support re: <u>157</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B)(Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 09/05/2019)
09/10/2019	<u>165</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 8/15/2019 before Judge George B. Daniels. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Karen Gorlaski, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 10/1/2019. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 10/11/2019. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 12/9/2019.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 09/10/2019)
09/10/2019	<u>166</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 8/15/19 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 09/10/2019)
09/13/2019	<u>167</u>	COUNTER STATEMENT TO <u>150</u> Rule 56.1 Statement,. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Silverberg, Steven) (Entered: 09/13/2019)
09/13/2019	<u>168</u>	DECLARATION of Ira J. Lipton in Opposition re: <u>151</u> MOTION in Limine <i>to exclude expert testimony of Dennis W. Olson.</i> , <u>142</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9)(Silverberg, Steven) (Entered: 09/13/2019)
09/13/2019	<u>169</u>	DECLARATION of Mathew Varghese in Opposition re: <u>142</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Silverberg, Steven) (Entered: 09/13/2019)
09/13/2019	<u>170</u>	DECLARATION of Shoshana Cooper in Opposition re: <u>142</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Silverberg, Steven) (Entered: 09/13/2019)
09/13/2019	<u>171</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>142</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment . . Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan

		Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Silverberg, Steven) (Entered: 09/13/2019)
09/13/2019	<u>172</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>151</u> MOTION in Limine to <i>exclude expert testimony of Dennis W. Olson</i> . . Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Silverberg, Steven) (Entered: 09/13/2019)
09/13/2019	<u>173</u>	DECLARATION of Michelle Caiola in Opposition re: <u>157</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10, # <u>11</u> Exhibit 11, # <u>12</u> Exhibit 12, # <u>13</u> Exhibit 13, # <u>14</u> Exhibit 14, # <u>15</u> Exhibit 15, # <u>16</u> Exhibit 16, # <u>17</u> Exhibit 17, # <u>18</u> Exhibit 18, # <u>19</u> Exhibit 19, # <u>20</u> Exhibit 20, # <u>21</u> Exhibit 21, # <u>22</u> Exhibit 22, # <u>23</u> Exhibit 23, # <u>24</u> Exhibit 24, # <u>25</u> Exhibit 25, # <u>26</u> Exhibit 26, # <u>27</u> Exhibit 27, # <u>28</u> Exhibit 28, # <u>29</u> Exhibit 29, # <u>30</u> Exhibit 30)(Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 09/13/2019)
09/13/2019	<u>174</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>157</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . . Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 09/13/2019)
09/13/2019	<u>175</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY (SEE <u>181</u> Declaration) –</b> DECLARATION of Sasha Blair–Goldensohn in Opposition re: <u>157</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3)(Caiola, Michelle) Modified on 9/17/2019 (db). (Entered: 09/13/2019)
09/13/2019	<u>176</u>	DECLARATION of Dustin Jones in Opposition re: <u>157</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 09/13/2019)
09/13/2019	<u>177</u>	COUNTER STATEMENT TO <u>161</u> Rule 56.1 Statement. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 09/13/2019)
09/13/2019	<u>178</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>153</u> MOTION to Preclude <i>Plaintiffs' Experts</i> . . Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 09/13/2019)
09/13/2019	<u>179</u>	DECLARATION of Andrew Schwarz in Opposition re: <u>153</u> MOTION to Preclude <i>Plaintiffs' Experts</i> .. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 09/13/2019)
09/13/2019	<u>180</u>	DECLARATION of David Rishel in Opposition re: <u>153</u> MOTION to Preclude <i>Plaintiffs' Experts</i> .. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent

		Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 09/13/2019)
09/16/2019	<u>181</u>	DECLARATION of Sasha Blair–Goldensohn in Opposition re: <u>157</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3)(Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 09/16/2019)
10/11/2019	<u>182</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>151</u> MOTION in Limine <i>to exclude expert testimony of Dennis W. Olson.</i> . Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 10/11/2019)
10/11/2019	<u>183</u>	COUNTER STATEMENT TO Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 10/11/2019)
10/11/2019	<u>184</u>	DECLARATION of Ira J. Lipton in Support re: <u>157</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1)(Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 10/11/2019)
10/11/2019	<u>185</u>	DECLARATION of Alan J. Salzberg in Support re: <u>153</u> MOTION to Preclude <i>Plaintiffs' Experts.</i> , <u>157</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 10/11/2019)
10/11/2019	<u>186</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>153</u> MOTION to Preclude <i>Plaintiffs' Experts.</i> . Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 10/11/2019)
10/11/2019	<u>187</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>157</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . . Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 10/11/2019)
10/11/2019	<u>188</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>142</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment . . Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 10/11/2019)
10/11/2019	<u>189</u>	DECLARATION of Michelle Caiola in Support re: <u>142</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment .. Document filed by Sasha Blair–Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 10/11/2019)
10/11/2019	<u>190</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>153</u> MOTION to Preclude <i>Plaintiffs' Experts.</i> ( <i>Corrected version of Document 186 containing attorney signature</i> ). Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority. (Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 10/11/2019)

10/24/2019		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge George B. Daniels: Oral Argument held on 10/24/2019 re: <u>142</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment . filed by Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Harlem Independent Living Center, Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Chris Pangilinan, Dustin Jones, Bronx Independent Living Services, <u>151</u> MOTION in Limine to exclude expert testimony of Dennis W. Olson. filed by Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Harlem Independent Living Center, Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Chris Pangilinan, Dustin Jones, Bronx Independent Living Services, <u>153</u> MOTION to Preclude <i>Plaintiffs' Experts</i> . filed by Metropolitan Transportation Authority, Veronique Hakim, New York City Transit Authority, Darryl C. Irick, <u>157</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment . filed by Metropolitan Transportation Authority, Veronique Hakim, New York City Transit Authority, Darryl C. Irick. Plaintiff Counsel: Maia Beth Goodell, Michelle Anne Caiola, Rebecca Juliet Rodgers, Emily Seelenfreund Defense Counsel: Helene Rachel Hechtkopf, Ira Jonathan Lipton, Miriam Jerry Manber, Steven Mark Silverberg and Court Reporter present. (Vega, Elizabeth) (Entered: 10/25/2019)
11/14/2019	<u>191</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: conference held on 10/24/2019 before Judge George B. Daniels. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Kelly Surina, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 12/5/2019. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 12/16/2019. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 2/12/2020.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 11/14/2019)
11/14/2019	<u>192</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a conference proceeding held on 10/24/19 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 11/14/2019)
11/14/2019	<u>193</u>	PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW. Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan.(Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 11/14/2019)
11/18/2019	<u>194</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge George B. Daniels from Ira J. Lipton dated November 18, 2019 re: Plaintiffs' Proposed Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law (docket entry 193). Document filed by Veronique Hakim, Darryl C. Irick, Metropolitan Transportation Authority, New York City Transit Authority.(Manber, Miriam) (Entered: 11/18/2019)
11/19/2019	<u>195</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge George B. Daniels from Michelle Caiola dated November 19, 2019 re: Plaintiffs' Response to ECF No. 194. Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan.(Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 11/19/2019)
11/20/2019	<u>196</u>	PROPOSED ORDER FOR WITHDRAWAL OF ATTORNEY. Document filed by Sasha Blair-Goldensohn, Bronx Independent Living Services, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Disabled In Action of Metropolitan New York, Harlem Independent Living Center, Dustin Jones, New York Statewide Senior Action Council, Chris Pangilinan. (Caiola, Michelle) (Entered: 11/20/2019)
11/21/2019	<u>197</u>	ORDER FOR WITHDRAWAL OF ATTORNEY: Plaintiffs ask that the Court grant the withdrawal of Maia Goodell as counsel for Plaintiffs. IT IS SO ORDERED. (Attorney Maia Beth Goodell terminated.) (Signed by Judge George B. Daniels on

11/21/2019) (jwh) (Entered: 11/21/2019)