

**U.S. District Court  
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:05-cv-06920-KBF**

H. et al v. Eggleston  
Assigned to: Judge Katherine B. Forrest  
Related Case: 1:12-cv-09162-KBF  
Cause: 42:12112 Americans with Disabilities Act – Employment  
Discrimination

Date Filed: 08/03/2005  
Date Terminated: 06/22/2015  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 446 Civil Rights:  
Americans with Disabilities – Other  
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

**Plaintiff**

**Lovely H.**  
*individually and on behalf of all others  
similarly situated.*

represented by **Carolyn Walker-Diallo**  
NYC Law Department, Office of the  
Corporation Counsel (NYC)  
100 Church Street  
New York, NY 10007  
(212)788-0868  
Fax: (212)788-8877  
Email: [cwalker@law.nyc.gov](mailto:cwalker@law.nyc.gov)  
*TERMINATED: 12/12/2011*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Kathleen Mary Kelleher**  
The Legal Aid Society (Civil Div. NYC)  
199 Water Street  
3rd Floor  
New York, NY 10038  
212 440-4275  
Fax: 212 509-8941  
Email: [kkelleher@legal-aid.org](mailto:kkelleher@legal-aid.org)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Kenneth Richard Stephens**  
The Legal Aid Society (Civil Div. NYC)  
199 Water Street  
3rd Floor  
New York, NY 10038  
212-440-4257  
Fax: 212-509-8761  
Email: [KStephens@legal-aid.org](mailto:KStephens@legal-aid.org)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sean Miles Murphy**  
Milbank, Tweed, Hadley & McCloy LLP  
28 Liberty Street  
New York, NY 10005  
(212)-530-5000  
Fax: (212)-822-5219  
Email: [smurphy@milbank.com](mailto:smurphy@milbank.com)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Richard Elliot Blum**  
The Legal Aid Society (Civil Div. NYC)  
199 Water Street  
3rd Floor  
New York, NY 10038  
212-440-4220

Fax: 212-509-8753  
Email: [rblum@legal-aid.org](mailto:rblum@legal-aid.org)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Susan Elizabeth Welber**  
The Legal Aid Society (Brooklyn)  
111 Livingston Street  
Brooklyn, NY 11201  
(718) 422-2845  
Email: [sewelber@legal-aid.org](mailto:sewelber@legal-aid.org)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Gloria Q.**  
*individually and on behalf of all others  
similarly situated.*

represented by **Carolyn Walker-Diallo**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 12/12/2011*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Kathleen Mary Kelleher**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Kenneth Richard Stephens**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sean Miles Murphy**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Richard Elliot Blum**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Susan Elizabeth Welber**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Michele N.**  
*individually and on behalf of all others  
similarly situated.*

represented by **Carolyn Walker-Diallo**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 12/12/2011*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Kathleen Mary Kelleher**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Kenneth Richard Stephens**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sean Miles Murphy**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Richard Elliot Blum**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Susan Elizabeth Welber**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Courtney B.**

represented by **Kathleen Mary Kelleher**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sean Miles Murphy**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Kenneth Richard Stephens**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Susan Elizabeth Welber**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Eula S.**  
*individually and on behalf of all others*  
*similarly situated*

represented by **Kathleen Mary Kelleher**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sean Miles Murphy**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Kenneth Richard Stephens**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Susan Elizabeth Welber**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Laura S.**

represented by **Kathleen Mary Kelleher**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sean Miles Murphy**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Kenneth Richard Stephens**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Susan Elizabeth Welber**  
(See above for address)

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

**Defendant**

**Verna Eggleston**

*as Administrator/Commissioner of the  
New York City Human Resources  
Administration.*

represented by **David Alan Rosinus , Jr.**  
New York City Law Department  
100 Church Street  
New York, NY 10007  
(212) 356-0877  
Fax: (212) 788-0877  
Email: [arosinus@law.nyc.gov](mailto:arosinus@law.nyc.gov)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Martha Anne Calhoun**  
NYC Law Department, Office of the  
Corporation Counsel (NYC)  
100 Church Street  
New York, NY 10007  
212-356-0856  
Fax: 212-356-1148  
Email: [mcalhoun@law.nyc.gov](mailto:mcalhoun@law.nyc.gov)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Thomas B. Roberts**  
The City of New York Law Department  
100 Church Street  
New York, NY 10007  
212-356-1000  
Fax: 212-788-8877  
Email: [throbort@law.nyc.gov](mailto:throbort@law.nyc.gov)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Emily Sweet**  
NYC Law Department, Office of the  
Corporation Counsel (NYC)  
100 Church Street  
New York, NY 10007  
(212) 788-1171  
Fax: (212) 788-8877  
Email: [esweet@law.nyc.gov](mailto:esweet@law.nyc.gov)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Janice Casey Silverberg**  
New York City Law Depart. Office of the  
Corporation Counsel  
100 Church Street  
New York, NY 10007  
212 788-8119  
Fax: (212) 788-0877  
Email: [jsilverb@law.nyc.gov](mailto:jsilverb@law.nyc.gov)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**John Michael Buhta**  
NYC Law Department  
100 Church Street Room 3-212  
New York, NY 10007  
(212)-356-0892  
Fax: (212) 788-0874  
Email: [jbuhta@law.nyc.gov](mailto:jbuhta@law.nyc.gov)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Jonathan L. Pines**

NYC Law Department, Office of the  
Corporation Counsel  
100 Church Street  
New York, NY 10007  
(212) 788-0933  
Fax: (212) 788-0940  
Email: [jpines@law.nyc.gov](mailto:jpines@law.nyc.gov)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Neil Anthony Giovanatti**

New York City Law Department  
100 Church Street Room 2663  
New York, NY 10007  
(212)-356-0886  
Fax: (212)-788-3770  
Email: [ngiovana@law.nyc.gov](mailto:ngiovana@law.nyc.gov)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
08/03/2005	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Verna Eggleston. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N..(jbe, ) Additional attachment(s) added on 8/9/2005 (jeh, ). (Entered: 08/04/2005)
08/03/2005		Case Designated ECF. (jbe, ) (Entered: 08/04/2005)
08/03/2005		Magistrate Judge Andrew J. Peck is so designated. (jbe, ) (Entered: 08/04/2005)
08/03/2005		SUMMONS ISSUED as to Verna Eggleston. (jbe, ) (Entered: 08/04/2005)
08/03/2005	<u>2</u>	ORDER Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 1915, permitting plaintiffs to proceed in forma pauperis. (Signed by Judge Stephen C. Robinson on 8/3/05) (jbe, ) Additional attachment(s) added on 8/9/2005 (jeh, ). (Entered: 08/04/2005)
08/05/2005	<u>3</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE. Verna Eggleston served on 8/4/2005, answer due 8/24/2005. Service was accepted by Nathan Solomon, Clerk. Document filed by Lovely H.. (Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 08/05/2005)
08/10/2005	<u>4</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Kenneth Richard Stephens on behalf of all plaintiffs (Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 08/10/2005)
08/10/2005	<u>5</u>	FILING ERROR – WRONG DOCUMENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU – FIRST MOTION to Certify Class. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Ex. 2# <u>2</u> Exhibit Ex. 4# <u>3</u> Exhibit Ex. 5# <u>4</u> Exhibit Ex. 6# <u>5</u> Exhibit Ex. 7)(Stephens, Kenneth) Modified on 8/11/2005 (kg). (Entered: 08/10/2005)
08/10/2005	<u>6</u>	ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE: why an order should not be entered against defendant pursuant to Rule 65 of the FRCP as further set forth in said Order. Show Cause Hearing set for 8/23/2005 12:00 PM before Judge Laura Taylor Swain. Show Cause Response due by 8/11/2005. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 8/10/05) (db, ) (Entered: 08/11/2005)
08/11/2005		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – DOCUMENT TYPE ERROR. Note to Attorney Kenneth Stephens to RE-FILE Document <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class. Use the document type Declaration in support (non-motion) found under the document list Other Answers. (kg) (Entered: 08/11/2005)
08/23/2005	<u>7</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 8/19/05 re: Application GRANTED. The proposed schedule is approved. The parties shall promptly inform the Court as to the amount of time expected to be required for presentation of evidence in connection with the preliminary injunction application. A hearing date will be set following such notification. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 8/22/05) Copies Faxed by Chambers.(db, ) (Entered: 08/23/2005)

		08/24/2005)
08/23/2005		Set/Reset Deadlines: Deposition due by 10/14/2005. (db, ) (Entered: 08/24/2005)
08/26/2005	<u>8</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Kathleen Mary Kelleher on behalf of all plaintiffs (Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 08/26/2005)
08/26/2005	<u>9</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Endorsed Letter dated August 19, 2005, Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain August 22, 2005 served on Martha Calhoun, Assistant Corporation Counsel on August 26, 2005. Service was made by mail. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 08/26/2005)
08/29/2005	<u>10</u>	INITIAL CONFERENCE ORDER:that an pretrial conference will be held in this case on 11/29/05, @4:30pm, in courtroom 1305, 40 Centre St., N.Y.C; that plaintiff shall serve a copy of this Preliminary Pre-Trial Order on each dfts within 10 calendar days following the date of this order; counsel for the parties confer preliminarily at least 21 days prior to the date set forth in paragraph 1 of this order to discuss the matters set forth in within. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 8/29/05) (pl, ) (Entered: 08/30/2005)
08/30/2005	<u>14</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura T. Swain from Kathleen M. Kellher dated 8/29/05 re: to confirm that argument on the motion has been adjourned to 9/15/05 at 4:00 PM. ENDORSEMENT: The adjournment is confirmed. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 8/30/05) (kco, ) (Entered: 09/08/2005)
08/31/2005	<u>11</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Initial Conference Order dated August 29, 2005 served on Eggleston on August 31, 2005. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 08/31/2005)
08/31/2005	<u>12</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Memo Endorsed Letter of the parties dated August 29, 2005, signed by Judge Swain on August 30, 2005 served on Eggleston on August 31, 2005. Service was made by mail. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 08/31/2005)
08/31/2005	<u>13</u>	NOTICE of appearance. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Sweet, Emily) (Entered: 08/31/2005)
09/12/2005	<u>15</u>	ANSWER to Complaint. Document filed by Verna Eggleston.(Silverberg, Janice) (Entered: 09/12/2005)
09/13/2005	<u>16</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Richard Elliot Blum on behalf of all plaintiffs (Blum, Richard) (Entered: 09/13/2005)
09/19/2005	<u>17</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER that plaintiffs' motion for a temporary restraining order is resolved as further set forth in this order. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 9/19/05) (dle, ) (Entered: 09/20/2005)
09/28/2005	<u>18</u>	STIPULATION AND PROTECTIVE ORDER; regarding procedures that shall govern the handling of confidential information during the course of these proceedings. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 9/27/05) (djc, ) (Entered: 09/29/2005)
10/11/2005	<u>19</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Swain from Martha Calhoun dated 10/5/05: the modification of the briefing schedule is approved. The preliminary injunction hearing will be held on 11/28/05, commencing at 9:30 am. The parties' attention is directed to the undersigned's general Rules for Trial counsel, copies of which are available on the court's web site or from the courtroom deputy. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 10/5/05) (cd, ) (Entered: 10/12/2005)
10/27/2005	<u>20</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Martha A. Calhoun dated 10/26/05 re: Counsel writes to request an enlargement of the discovery and briefing schedule as follows: defendants' opposition papers to be served on 11/15/05 and plaintiffs' reply papers to be served on 12/2/05; and request that the preliminary injunction hearing be adjourned. The request is granted. The hearing is adjourned from Nov. 28 to 12/13/05 at 9:30 a.m., as is the initial conference. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 10/26/05) (jco, ) (Entered: 10/27/2005)

11/01/2005	<u>21</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of so-ordered letter served on Kathleen Kelleher on 10/27/2005. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Calhoun, Martha) (Entered: 11/01/2005)
11/01/2005	<u>22</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Martha Anne Calhoun on behalf of Verna Eggleston (Calhoun, Martha) (Entered: 11/01/2005)
11/15/2005	<u>23</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Martha A. Calhoun dated 11/10/05 re: granting dfts request to have until 11/18/05 to serve and file their opposition papers and plaintiffs have until 12/7/05 to serve and file their reply. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 11/11/05) (pl, ) (Entered: 11/16/2005)
11/15/2005	<u>24</u>	STIPULATION; that dfts will refrain from performing any new involuntary transfers of the public assistance, Food Stamps, and/or Medicaid cases of recipients of public benefits from Job Enters to WeCare job centers through the date of the hearing on plaintiffs' motion for a preliminary injunction, 12/13/05. Five business days before release or mailing, dft, will provide copies to counsel for plaintiffs of notices regarding any voluntary transfer of the public assistance, Food Stamps, and/or Medicaid cases of recipient of public benefits. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 11/11/05) (pl, ) (Entered: 11/16/2005)
11/18/2005	<u>25</u>	ORDER REFERRING CASE TO MAGISTRATE JUDGE. Order that case be referred to the Clerk of Court for assignment to a Magistrate Judge for General Pretrial. Referred to Magistrate Judge Andrew J. Peck. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 11/18/05) (db, ) Additional attachment(s) added on 11/18/2005 (db, ). (Entered: 11/18/2005)
11/18/2005	<u>26</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Swain from Martha Calhoun dated 11/17/05: granting dft permission to submit a 60 page memo of law in opposition to pntfs' motions for a preliminary injunction and class certification. (Signed by Judge Charles E. Stewart on 11/18/05) (cd, ) (Entered: 11/21/2005)
11/21/2005	<u>27</u>	FIRST MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class. <i>and in opposition to motion for preliminary injunction</i> . Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Sweet, Emily) (Entered: 11/21/2005)
11/21/2005	<u>28</u>	DECLARATION of Martha Calhoun in Opposition re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit (Exhibit A)# <u>2</u> Exhibit (Exhibit B)# <u>3</u> Exhibit (Exhibit C)# <u>4</u> Exhibit (Exhibit D)# <u>5</u> Exhibit (Exhibit E)# <u>6</u> Exhibit (Exhibit F)# <u>7</u> Exhibit (Exhibit G)# <u>8</u> Exhibit (Exhibit H)# <u>9</u> Exhibit (Exhibit I)# <u>10</u> Exhibit (Exhibit J)# <u>11</u> Exhibit (Exhibit K)# <u>12</u> Exhibit (Exhibit L)# <u>13</u> Exhibit (Exhibit M)# <u>14</u> Exhibit (Exhibit N)# <u>15</u> Exhibit (Exhibit O)# <u>16</u> Exhibit (Exhibit P))(Sweet, Emily) (Entered: 11/21/2005)
11/21/2005	<u>29</u>	DECLARATION of Swati Desai in Opposition re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit (A)# <u>2</u> Exhibit (B))(Sweet, Emily) (Entered: 11/21/2005)
11/21/2005	<u>30</u>	DECLARATION of Sheldon Cantor in Opposition re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit (A))(Sweet, Emily) (Entered: 11/21/2005)
11/21/2005	<u>31</u>	DECLARATION of Barbara Ramirez Giove in Opposition re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit (1)# <u>2</u> # <u>3</u> Exhibit (3))(Sweet, Emily) (Entered: 11/21/2005)
11/21/2005	<u>32</u>	DECLARATION of Roberta Solomon in Opposition re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit (A))(Sweet, Emily) (Entered: 11/21/2005)
11/21/2005	<u>33</u>	DECLARATION of Frank R. Lipton, M.D. in Opposition re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Sweet, Emily) (Entered: 11/21/2005)
11/21/2005	<u>34</u>	ORDER a status conference is scheduled for 11/22/05 at 11:00 a.m., in courtroom 20D (500 Pearl Street) (Signed by Judge Andrew J. Peck on 11/21/05) "Copies Faxed & ECF by Chambers"(jco, ) (Entered: 11/22/2005)

11/21/2005		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Status Conference set for 11/22/2005 11:00 AM before Magistrate Judge Andrew J. Peck. (jco, ) (Entered: 11/22/2005)
11/22/2005		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Andrew J. Peck : Status Conference held on 11/22/2005. Disc. disputes resolved – see transcript. Parties to contact if disputes. (dle, ) (Entered: 11/29/2005)
11/22/2005		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Andrew J. Peck : Status Conference held on 11/22/2005. Disc. disputes resolved – see transcript. Parties to contact if disputes. (dle, ) (Entered: 11/29/2005)
11/29/2005	35	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 11/22/05 before Judge Andrew J. Peck. (jbe, ) (Entered: 11/29/2005)
12/12/2005	<u>36</u>	REPLY AFFIDAVIT of Richard Faust in Support re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Rosenberg, Scott) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/12/2005	<u>37</u>	REPLY AFFIDAVIT of Kathleen Kelleher in Support re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Rosenberg, Scott) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/12/2005	<u>38</u>	REPLY AFFIDAVIT of Linda W. in Support re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Rosenberg, Scott) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/12/2005	<u>39</u>	REPLY AFFIDAVIT of Marliese A. in Support re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Rosenberg, Scott) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/12/2005	<u>40</u>	REPLY AFFIDAVIT of Minerva R. in Support re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Rosenberg, Scott) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/12/2005	<u>41</u>	REPLY AFFIDAVIT of Danielle A. in Support re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Rosenberg, Scott) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/12/2005	<u>42</u>	REPLY AFFIDAVIT of Shantel E. in Support re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Exhibits A and B)(Rosenberg, Scott) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/12/2005	<u>43</u>	REPLY AFFIDAVIT of Phyllis F. in Support re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Rosenberg, Scott) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/12/2005	<u>44</u>	REPLY AFFIDAVIT of Keisha C. in Support re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Rosenberg, Scott) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/12/2005	<u>45</u>	REPLY AFFIDAVIT of Ruben R. in Support re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Rosenberg, Scott) (Entered: 12/12/2005)
12/12/2005	<u>46</u>	REPLY AFFIDAVIT of Richard Blum in Support re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit)(Rosenberg, Scott) (Entered: 12/13/2005)
12/13/2005		MEMORANDUM TO THE DOCKET CLERK: Hearing begun on 12/13/05 – provision of 11/11/05 stipulation extended on consent through 2/28/06. Plaintiff's reply papers due 12/22/05 and PI hearing scheduled for 1/27/06 at 9:30 a.m.. (sac, ) (Entered: 01/03/2006)
12/20/2005		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Andrew J. Peck : Status Telephone Conference held on 12/20/2005. (sac, ) (Entered: 01/06/2006)
12/21/2005	47	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 12/13/05 before Judge Laura Taylor Swain. (lma, ) (Entered: 12/21/2005)



12/21/2005	<u>48</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura T. Swain from Richard Blum dated 12/20/05 re: a request for an adjournment to 1/6/2006 to submit plaintiff's reply papers. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 12/21/05) (kco, ) (Entered: 12/22/2005)
01/04/2006	49	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 12/20/05 before Judge Andrew J. Peck. (es, ) (Entered: 01/04/2006)
01/06/2006	<u>50</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Rosenberg, Scott) (Entered: 01/06/2006)
01/09/2006	<u>51</u>	ORDER that the Preliminary Injunction Hearing set for 1/27/06 at 9:30 am is moved to 2/1/06, at 9:30 am. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 1/6/06) (cd, ) (Entered: 01/09/2006)
01/18/2006		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Replies due by 1/30/2007. (js) (Entered: 01/19/2007)
01/30/2006	<u>52</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 1/27/06 re: granting the parties joint requests that they be allowed instead to present argument on the motions based on the papers that will have been submitted to the Court on these motions; additional relief granted as set forth in this Order. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 1/27/06) (pl, ) (Entered: 01/30/2006)
01/30/2006	<u>53</u>	REPLY AFFIDAVIT of Richard Faust (corrected typo 1/23/06) in Support re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 01/30/2006)
01/30/2006	<u>54</u>	REPLY AFFIDAVIT of Amalia D. (signed Dec. 15, 2005) in Support re: <u>5</u> FIRST MOTION to Certify Class.. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 01/30/2006)
02/01/2006	<u>55</u>	ORDER PERMITTING PLAINTIFFS TO FILE EXHIBITS TO BLUM DECLARATION IN HARD COPY, the reply declaration of Richard Blum is to be fld electronically, wihtout the exhibits thereto and the exhibits in hard copy with the Clerk of the Court. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 2/1/06) (cd, ) (Entered: 02/01/2006)
02/01/2006		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Laura Taylor Swain : Oral Argument held on 2/1/2006 (pl, ) (Entered: 02/02/2006)
02/02/2006	56	LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Martha A. Calhoun dated 2/2/06 re: dfts. write to advise the court that dfts will agree to the extension of the current Stipulation barring the involuntary transfer of public assistance cases to WeCare job Centers thru 3/31/06 as the Court has requested.. Document filed by Verna Eggleston.(pl, ) (Entered: 02/08/2006)
02/14/2006	<u>57</u>	ORDER that the clerk is directed to docket and enter the letters from parties. (January 30, 2006 letter from Martha Calhoun to court; January 31, 2006 letter from Richard Blum to court). (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 2/14/06) (dle, ) (Entered: 02/14/2006)
02/15/2006	58	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 2/2/2006 before Judge Laura Taylor Swain. (jar, ) (Entered: 02/15/2006)
02/15/2006	59	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 2/2/2006 before Judge Laura Taylor Swain. (jar, ) (Entered: 02/15/2006)
03/27/2006	60	LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Martha A. Colhoun dated 3/27/06 re: dfts requests that a decision be rendered on or before 4/21/06. Document filed by Verna Eggleston.(pl, ) (Entered: 04/05/2006)
04/18/2006	61	LETTER addressed to Hon. Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M.Kelleher dated 4/18/06 re: Client Declarations filed in support of plaintiffs' motions for a preliminary injunction and for class certification. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N..(rag, ) (Entered: 04/18/2006)
04/19/2006	<u>62</u>	OPINION AND ORDER 93026 the Court hereby certifies a main class of plaintiffs consisting of recipients of public assistance, food stamps and/or Medicaid who have

		received or will receive a notice from the New York City Human Resources Administration involuntarily transferring their case to one of three hub centers in Manhattan, the Bronx or Brooklyn in connection with the WeCARE program. The plaintiff's motion for a preliminary injunction is hereby granted to the extent that defendant is hereby prohibited from reassigning class members' (and their associated persons') cases to the hub centers involuntarily. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 4/19/06) (jco, ) Modified on 4/20/2006 (ew, ). (Entered: 04/20/2006)
04/25/2006	<u>63</u>	ORDER SCHEDULING AND INITIAL PRETRIAL CONFERENCE: Initial Pretrial Conference set for 5/4/2006 at 12:00 PM before Magistrate Judge Andrew J. Peck. (Signed by Judge Andrew J. Peck on 4/25/06) (sac, ) (Entered: 04/25/2006)
04/25/2006	<u>64</u>	ORDER; amending cover sheet of 4/19/06 Opinion and Order. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 4/25/06) (pl, ) (Entered: 04/25/2006)
04/25/2006	<u>65</u>	ORDER SCHEDULING INITIAL PRETRIAL CONFERENCE: Pretrial Conference set for 5/4/2006 12:00 PM before Magistrate Judge Andrew J. Peck. In Courtroom 20D. (Signed by Judge Andrew J. Peck on 4/25/06) (js, ) (Entered: 04/26/2006)
05/04/2006		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Andrew J. Peck : Status Conference held on 5/4/2006; next status conf set for 6/8 at 9:30 am; position letters 2 days before. (cd, ) (Entered: 05/08/2006)
05/19/2006	<u>66</u>	ORDER; that the provisions of the Court's 4/19/06, Order that are stated herein r are suspended pending the implementation of HRA's plan to close the WeCare hub centers and reassign WeCare designees to their respective neighborhood centers. Additional relief are as set forth in this Order. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 5/18/06) (pl, ) (Entered: 05/19/2006)
05/22/2006	67	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 5/4/06 before Judge Andrew J. Peck. (tro, ) (Entered: 05/22/2006)
05/23/2006	68	LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Martha A. Colhoun dated 5/3/06 re: closing of WeCare Job Centers. Document filed by Verna Eggleston.(pl, ) (Entered: 05/24/2006)
05/23/2006	69	LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 5/5/06 re: response to letter dated 5/3/06, from the City Dft's announcing its intention to close the WeCare hub centers.. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.(pl, ) (Entered: 05/24/2006)
05/24/2006	70	LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Martha A. Calohoun dated 5/11/06 re: response from counsel for plaintiff dated 5/5/06. Document filed by Verna Eggleston.(pl, ) (Entered: 05/24/2006)
06/08/2006		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Andrew J. Peck : Status Conference held on 6/8/2006. City will provide to plaintiffs' counsel by 6/23: case number, closing (or sanctions) code, person's name, address and telephone number. City and Plaintiffs to agree on codes that do not need follow-up. Plaintiffs'counsel to contact clients to gather infor re: what happened thru 7/14. City to bring HRA substantive and/or computer person to future conferences. Status Conference set for 7/14/2006 09:30 AM before Magistrate Judge Andrew J. Peck – position letters 2 days before. (jar, ) Modified on 6/13/2006 (jar, ). (Entered: 06/12/2006)
06/23/2006	71	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 6/8/2006 before Judge Andrew J. Peck. (aba, ) (Entered: 06/23/2006)
07/14/2006		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Andrew J. Peck : Status Conference held on 7/14/2006. Next status conference set for 8/2/06 at 9:30 a.m. – position letters by 7/26/06. Discovery cutoff by 8/31/06. (db, ) (Entered: 07/17/2006)
07/31/2006	<u>72</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Memo Endorsement Order Dated July 31, 2006, Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain served on Defendant on July 31, 2006. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 07/31/2006)
07/31/2006	<u>73</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 7/28/2006 re: Additionally, I write on behalf of the parties to request the following briefing schedule: plaintiffs will serve the motion to amend the

		complaint on or before August 4, 2006; defendant will file responsive papers in opposition on or before September 8, 2006; and plaintiffs will serve reply papers on or before September 22, 2006. Motions due by 8/4/2006. Responses due by 9/8/2006 Replies due by 9/22/2006. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted and the proposed schedule is approved. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 7/31/2006) (jmi, ) (Entered: 08/01/2006)
08/02/2006		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Andrew J. Peck : Status Conference held on 8/2/2006. Def. to produce computer runs discussed at conf. by 8/8. Also to produce "We Care" docs on rolling basis, for completion by 8/14. Parties to cooperate to schedule depositions or use ints. Next status conf. scheduled for 8/16 at 9:30 a.m. (jco, ) (Entered: 08/07/2006)
08/03/2006	74	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 7/14/06 before Judge Andrew J. Peck. (tro, ) (Entered: 08/03/2006)
08/05/2006	<u>75</u>	MOTION to Amend/Correct <i>Class Action Complaint</i> . Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. Return Date set for 9/29/2006 10:00 AM. (Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 08/05/2006)
08/05/2006	<u>76</u>	FIRST MOTION to Amend/Correct <i>Class Action Complaint</i> . Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. Return Date set for 9/29/2006 10:00 AM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> # <u>2</u> # <u>3</u> # <u>4</u> # <u>5</u> # <u>6</u> # <u>7</u> # <u>8</u> # <u>9</u> )(Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 08/05/2006)
08/15/2006	77	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 8/2/2006 before Magistrate Judge Andrew J. Peck. (jmi, ) Modified on 8/31/2006 (rag, ). (Entered: 08/15/2006)
08/16/2006		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Andrew J. Peck : Discovery Conference held on 8/16/2006. Papers to LTS 9/22 plntf, def opp 10/6, reply 10/13. Parties to contact if discovery disputes. (cd, ) (Entered: 08/18/2006)
08/23/2006	78	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 8/2/06 before Judge Andrew J. Peck. (tro, ) (Entered: 08/23/2006)
08/25/2006	79	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 8/16/2006 before Judge Andrew J. Peck. (jmi, ) (Entered: 08/25/2006)
09/08/2006	<u>80</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of order of Judge Swain memo—endorsing defendants' request for an extension served on plaintiffs on Sept. 8, 2006 by fax and email. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Sweet, Emily) (Entered: 09/08/2006)
09/08/2006	<u>81</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Emily Sweet dated 9/6/2006 re: requesting a 2-week extension of time to respond to plaintiff's motion to amend the complaint. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 9/7/2006) (lb, ) (Entered: 09/11/2006)
09/08/2006		Set/Reset Deadlines: Responses due by 9/22/2006. Replies due by 10/6/2006. (lb, ) (Entered: 09/11/2006)
09/11/2006		CASE NO LONGER REFERRED to Magistrate Judge Andrew J. Peck. Reason: Discovery closed summary judgment motion due 9/22/06. (rag, ) (Entered: 09/13/2006)
09/22/2006	<u>82</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Swain from Kathleen Kelleher dated 9/20/06: granting joint request that deft be permitted to respond to plntf's motion to amend the complaint on or before 9/29/06, with plntf's reply due on 10/13/06; granting joint request for the parties to file briefs to the remedy on the preliminary injunction entered on 4/19/06; plntfs' are permitted a 3 week extension to 10/13/06, with deft filing responsive papers on or before 10/27/06 and plntfs' reply on or before 11/3/06. (Signed by Judge Gerard E. Lynch, Part I on 9/21/06) (cd, ) (Entered: 09/22/2006)
09/29/2006	<u>83</u>	OPPOSITION BRIEF memorandum of law in opposition to plaintiffs' motions to intervene, amend the complaint and amend the class definition. Document filed by Verna Eggleston.(Sweet, Emily) (Entered: 09/29/2006)

09/29/2006	<u>84</u>	OPPOSITION BRIEF re: <u>83</u> Opposition Brief <i>Declaration of Martha Calhoun, dated September 29, 2006, in support of defendant's opposition to plaintiffs' motions to intervene, amend the complaint and amend the class definition.</i> Document filed by Verna Eggleston.(Sweet, Emily) (Entered: 09/29/2006)
10/11/2006	<u>85</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura T. Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 10/10/06 ENDORSEMENT: Plaintiff's counsel shall serve on defense counsel and subject to the Court a precis, not exceeding 5 pages, of their anticipated partial summary judgment motion by 10/13/06. Defense counsel shall serve and submit a responsive precis, not exceeding 5 pages by 10/20/2006. The parties shall appear before the undersigned for a pre-motion conference on 10/26/2006 at 2:00 p.m. There will be no further briefing of the remedy issue until further order of the Court. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 10/10/06) (kco, ) (Entered: 10/11/2006)
10/13/2006	<u>86</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>75</u> MOTION to Amend/Correct <i>Class Action Complaint</i> .. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Rosenberg, Scott) (Entered: 10/13/2006)
10/26/2006		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Laura Taylor Swain : Interim Pretrial Conference held on 10/26/2006. Motion to be filed by 11/21/06 – response by 12/15/06 and any reply by 12/22/06. (ae, ) (Entered: 10/30/2006)
11/16/2006	<u>87</u>	MEMORANDUM OPINION AND ORDER # 93938: For the foregoing reasons, the Court GRANTS the plaintiffs' motions to amend the complaint, to intervene three additional named party plaintiffs and for an amendment of the class definition Class members Courtney B., Laura S. and Eula S. are granted permission to intervene as named plaintiffs. The main class definition is amended to be recipients of public assistance, food stamps and/or Medicaid who are or will be designated as participants in the WeCare program. Program. Plaintiffs shall serve and file an amended complaint no later than two weeks from the date of this order. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 11/15/06) (js, ) Modified on 11/17/2006 (rw, ). (Entered: 11/16/2006)
11/21/2006	<u>88</u>	FILING ERROR – WRONG DOCUMENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU – MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment (Plaintiffs Memorandum of Law). Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. Responses due by 12/15/2006 Return Date set for 1/8/2007 09:00 AM. (Stephens, Kenneth) Modified on 11/28/2006 (kg, ). (Entered: 11/21/2006)
11/21/2006	<u>89</u>	FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY – MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N. Responses due by 12/15/2006 Return Date set for 1/8/2007 09:00 AM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> )(Stephens, Kenneth) Modified on 11/28/2006 (kg). (Entered: 11/21/2006)
11/28/2006		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – DOCUMENT TYPE ERROR. Note to Attorney Kenneth Richard Stephens to RE-FILE Document <u>88</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment (Plaintiffs Memorandum of Law). Use the document type Memorandum of Law in support of motion found under the document list Responses and Replies. (kg) (Entered: 11/28/2006)
11/28/2006		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Note to Attorney Kenneth Richard Stephens to RE-FILE Document <u>89</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment.. ERROR(S): Filing Error of Supporting Documents. Supporting Documents must be filed individually. Event Code located under Responses and Replies. (kg) (Entered: 11/28/2006)
11/29/2006	<u>90</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>89</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 11/29/2006)
11/29/2006	<u>91</u>	MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. Responses due by 12/15/2006 Return Date set for 1/8/2007 09:00 AM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> )(Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 11/29/2006)
11/29/2006	<u>92</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>91</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 11/29/2006)

11/29/2006	<u>93</u>	DECLARATION of Kathleen Kelleher in Support re: <u>91</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A# <u>2</u> Exhibit B# <u>3</u> Exhibit C# <u>4</u> Exhibit D# <u>5</u> Exhibit E# <u>6</u> Exhibit F# <u>7</u> Exhibit G# <u>8</u> Exhibit H# <u>9</u> Exhibit I)(Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 11/29/2006)
11/29/2006	<u>94</u>	RULE 56.1 STATEMENT. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 11/29/2006)
12/11/2006	<u>95</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Endorsed Letter Signed by Hon. Laura Taylor Swain, December 8, 2006 served on Verna Eggleston on December 11, 2006. Document filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 12/11/2006)
12/11/2006	<u>96</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 12/8/2006 re: plaintiffs request an extension of time until 12/11/2006 to file their amended complaint; the parties request that defendant be permitted to answer the amended complaint on or before 2/2/2007; the parties also propose that they provide a status update on the progress of settlement discussions to Judge Swain and Magistrate Judge Peck by 2/16/2007. ENDORSEMENT: The requests are granted. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 12/8/2006) (lb, ) (Entered: 12/12/2006)
12/11/2006		Set/Reset Deadlines: Status Report due by 2/16/2007. (lb, ) (Entered: 12/12/2006)
12/11/2006		Set/Reset Scheduling Order Deadlines: Amended Pleadings due by 12/11/2006. Responses due by 2/2/2007 (rag, ) (Entered: 12/12/2006)
12/11/2006	<u>97</u>	AMENDED COMPLAINT amending <u>1</u> Complaint against Verna Eggleston.Document filed by Courtney B., Eula S., Laura S., Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N. Related document: <u>1</u> Complaint filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Michele N.(jco, ) (Entered: 12/13/2006)
12/15/2006	<u>98</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of memo endorsed letter served on Kathleen Kelleher, Esq on 12/14/2006. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Calhoun, Martha) (Entered: 12/15/2006)
12/18/2006	<u>99</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Martha A. Calhoun dated 12/13/2006 re: requesting that defendant's time to respond to plaintiffs' motion for partial summary be extended from 12/15/2006 until 12/29/2006. In addition it is further requested that plaintiffs' time to reply be extended until 1/10/2006. ENDORSEMENT: The request is GRANTED. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 12/14/2006) Copies Faxed By Chambers(lb, ) (Entered: 12/19/2006)
12/18/2006		Set/Reset Deadlines as to <u>91</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment. Responses due by 12/29/2006. Replies due by 1/10/2007. (lb, ) (Entered: 12/19/2006)
12/28/2006	<u>100</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of memo endorsed letter served on Kathleen Kelleher on 12/28/2006. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Calhoun, Martha) (Entered: 12/28/2006)
12/28/2006	<u>112</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Hon. Barbara S. Jones from Martha A. Calhoun dated 12/27/06 re: Extend time to respond to plaintiffs' motion for partial summary judgment ENDORSEMENT: Applications granted. Defendant's time to respond is extended to 1/5/07. Plaintiffs' reply is due 1/17/07.. (Signed by Judge Barbara S. Jones, Part I on 12/28/06) (rag) (Entered: 03/21/2007)
01/10/2007	<u>101</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Martha A. Calhoun dated 1/4/07; re: The request is granted, defendants response to <u>91</u> Plaintiff's Motion for Partial Summary Judgment due by 1/12/2007; Plaintiff's Reply due by 1/24/2007. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 1/10/07) (sac, ) (Entered: 01/10/2007)
01/11/2007	102	TRANSCRIPT of proceedings held on 10/27/06 before Judge Laura Taylor Swain. (tro, ) (Entered: 01/11/2007)
01/16/2007	<u>103</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>91</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Calhoun, Martha) (Entered: 01/16/2007)

01/18/2007	<u>104</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Martha A. Calhoun dated 1/16/07 re: It is respectfully requested that the Court accept filing of defendant's papers on January 16 and the plaintiffs be given until January 30, 2007 to submit their reply. ENDORSEMENT: The Request is granted. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 1/18/07) (js) (Entered: 01/19/2007)
01/30/2007	<u>105</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>91</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Lovely H., Eula S., Laura S., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 01/30/2007)
01/30/2007	<u>106</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>91</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Lovely H., Eula S., Laura S., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 01/30/2007)
02/02/2007	<u>107</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Emily Sweet dated 2/1/07 re: I'm writing to request an extension of time, from February 2 to February 14, 2007, to answer plaintiffs' amended complaint. ENDORSEMENT: The request is GRANTED. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 2/1/07) (js) (Entered: 02/05/2007)
02/02/2007		Set Answer Due Date purs. to <u>107</u> Endorsed Letter, as to Verna Eggleston answer due on 2/14/2007. (js) (Entered: 02/05/2007)
02/05/2007	<u>108</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Feb. 2, 2007 order of Judge Swain served on Plaintiff on Feb. 2, 2007. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Sweet, Emily) (Entered: 02/05/2007)
02/14/2007	<u>109</u>	ANSWER to Amended Complaint. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. Related document: <u>97</u> Amended Complaint filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Gloria Q., Eula S., Michele N., Laura S..(Sweet, Emily) (Entered: 02/14/2007)
02/21/2007	<u>110</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kellecher dated 2/16/07 re: The parties request that they be given until April 1, 2007 to provide a written update on the status of settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Magistrate Judge Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is GRANTED. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 2/16/07) (js) (Entered: 02/22/2007)
03/01/2007	<u>111</u>	AMENDED ANSWER to <u>97</u> Amended Complaint. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Sweet, Emily) (Entered: 03/01/2007)
04/02/2007	<u>114</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura T. Swain from Martha A. Calhoun dated 3/30/07 re: counsel for dfts requests that the parties provide an update on the status of settlement discussions. The request is granted. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 4/2/07) (dle) (Entered: 04/03/2007)
04/02/2007		Set/Reset Deadlines: Status Report due by 5/1/2007. (dle) (Entered: 04/03/2007)
04/03/2007	<u>113</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Judge Swain's April 2, 2007 order served on plaintiffs' counsel on April 2, 2007. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Sweet, Emily) (Entered: 04/03/2007)
05/03/2007	<u>115</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Letter from K. Kelleher to Hon. Laura Taylor Swain dated May 1, 2007 memo endorsed by the Court on May 1, 2007 served on Eggleston on 05/02/2007. Document filed by Lovely H., Courtney B., Eula S., Laura S., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 05/03/2007)
05/03/2007	<u>116</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 5/1/07 re: The parties request that they be given until June 8, 2007 to provide a written update on the status of settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Magistrate Judge Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is GRANTED. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 5/1/07) (js) (Entered: 05/04/2007)
06/12/2007	<u>117</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Martha A. Calhoun dated 6/8/2007 re: to the parties Plaintiff and Defendant request until July 10, 2007 to provide a written update on the status of settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Magistrate Judge Peck. Status Report due by 7/10/2007. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 6/11/2007) (jmi) Modified on 6/14/2007 (KA). (Entered: 06/13/2007)

06/15/2007	<u>118</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of endorsement of letter dated 6/8/2007 served on Kathleen Kelleher counsel for plaintiffs on 6/14/2007. Service was made by Facsimile. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Calhoun, Martha) (Entered: 06/15/2007)
07/11/2007	<u>119</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Martha A. Calhoun dated 7/10/2007 re: request until 9/12/2007 to provide a written update on the status of settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Magistrate Judge Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. Status Report due by 9/12/2007. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 7/10/2007) (jar) (Entered: 07/12/2007)
07/16/2007	<u>120</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of memo endorsement of July 10, 2007 letter served on plaintiff on July 11, 2006. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Sweet, Emily) (Entered: 07/16/2007)
09/13/2007	<u>121</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura T. Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 9/11/07 re: all parties request that they be given until 10/17/2007 to provide a written update on the settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Mag. Judge Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. SO ORDERED (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 9/13/07) (kco) (Entered: 09/13/2007)
09/14/2007	<u>122</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Memo Endorsed Letter from Kathleen Kelleher to Hon. Laura Taylor Swain, ordered September 13, 2007 served on Eggleston on September 14, 2007. Document filed by Lovely H., Courtney B., Eula S., Laura S., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 09/14/2007)
10/19/2007	<u>123</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Martha A. Calhoun dated 10/17/07 re: The parties request an adjournment of the status report (of settlement negotiations) deadline until 10/24/07. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. SO ORDERED. Status Report due by 10/24/2007. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 10/18/07) (db) (Entered: 10/19/2007)
10/25/2007	<u>124</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura T. Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 9/11/07 re: a request that the parties be given until 11/29/2007 to provide a written update on the status of settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Magistrate Judge Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. Status Report due by 11/29/2007. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 10/25/07) (kco) (Entered: 10/26/2007)
11/30/2007	<u>125</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura T. Swain from Martha a. Calhoun dated 11/29/2007 re: request that the parties be given until 1/10/2008 to submit a written update of the status of settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Magistrate Judge Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. Status Report due by 1/10/2008. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 11/29/2007) (jar) (Entered: 11/30/2007)
01/10/2008	<u>126</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 1/9/08 re: Pursuant to the Court's order of November 29, 2007, the parties were to provide this status update tomorrow, January 10, 2008. The parties will be in a position to provide a report on Monday, January 14, 2008 and request that the time for submission of this status report be extended to January 14, 2008. Both parties consent to this request and there have been no previous requests for extension of this deadline. ENDORSEMENT: So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Charles S. Haight (Part I Judge) on 1/10/08) Copies Mailed/Faxed to plaintiffs counsel.(js) (Entered: 01/10/2008)
01/16/2008	<u>127</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of January 10, 2008 Memo Endorsement of January 9, 2008 Letter from Kathleen Kelleher to Hon. Laura Taylor Swain served on Eggleston on 01/10/08. Document filed by Lovely H., Courtney B., Eula S., Laura S., Gloria Q., Michele N.. (Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 01/16/2008)
01/22/2008	<u>128</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 1/14/2008 re: I write on behalf of the parties to provide a status update on the progress of settlement discussions in this matter. Request that the parties be given until February 27, 2008 to provide a written update on the status of settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Magistrate Judge Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. SO ORDERED., ( Status Report due by 2/27/2008.) (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 1/22/2008) (jmi) (Entered: 01/22/2008)

02/28/2008	<u>129</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Martha A. Calhoun dated 2/27/08 re: The parties request an extension of time to submit a status report of their settlement negotiations until 3/12/08. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. ( Status Report due by 3/12/2008.) (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 2/28/08) (tro) (Entered: 02/28/2008)
03/13/2008	<u>130</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 3/12/08 re: The parties request that they be given until 4/18/08 to provide a written update on the status of settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Magistrate Judge Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. ( Status Report due by 4/18/2008.) (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 3/12/08) (tro) (Entered: 03/13/2008)
04/21/2008	<u>131</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 4/18/08 re: Accordingly, the parties request that the time for submission of this status report be extended to April 25, 2008. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 4/18/08) (js) (Entered: 04/21/2008)
04/28/2008	<u>132</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 4/25/08 re: It is requested on behalf of the parties to request that the Court grant an additional extension of two weeks for the parties to submit a written update on the status of settlement negotiations in this matter to Judge Swain and Magistrate Judge Andrew J. Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 4/28/08) (js) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
04/28/2008		Set Deadlines/Hearings: Status Report due by 5/9/2008. (js) (Entered: 04/28/2008)
05/12/2008	<u>133</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 5/9/08 re: Request that the status of settlement deadline be extended to 5/30/08. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. SO ORDERED. (Status Report due by 5/30/2008.) (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 5/12/08) (db) (Entered: 05/12/2008)
05/30/2008	<u>134</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 5/30/2008 re: Requesting that the parties be given until June 30, 2008 to provide a written update on the status of settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Magistrate Judge Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 5/30/2008) (jpo) (Entered: 05/30/2008)
07/01/2008	<u>135</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 6/30/08 re: Counsel writes on behalf of all the parties to report on the status of settlement discussions in this matter. The parties request that they be given until 7/16/08 to provide a written update on the status of settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Magistrate Judge Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. ( Status Report due by 7/16/2008.) (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 6/30/08) (tro) (Entered: 07/01/2008)
07/17/2008	<u>136</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Martha A. Calhoun dated 7/16/08 re: Request that the parties have until 8/15/08 to provide a written update on the status of settlement negotiations to Judge Laura Taylor Swain and Magistrate Judge Andrew J. Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. SO ORDERED. (Status Report due by 8/15/2008.) (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 7/16/08) (db) (Entered: 07/17/2008)
08/19/2008	<u>137</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura T. Swain from Martha A. Calhoun dated 8/15/08 re: counsel for the City requests that the parties be given until 9/12/08 to provide a written update on the status of settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Judge Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 8/19/08) (dle) (Entered: 08/19/2008)
09/17/2008	<u>138</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura T. Swain from Kathleen Kelleher dated 9/12/08 re: counsel for parties request that the Court grant an extension until 9/19/08 for the parties to submit a written update on the status of settlement. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 9/17/08) (dle) (Entered: 09/17/2008)



09/23/2008	<u>139</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 9/19/08 re: Counsel write on behalf of the parties to report on the status of settlement discussions in this matter. Counsel requests that the parties have until 10/6/08 to provide a written update on the status of settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Magistrate Judge Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 9/22/08) (tro) (Entered: 09/24/2008)
11/03/2008	<u>140</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 10/31/08 re: Counsel writes on behalf of the parties to report on the status of settlement discussions in this matter. Counsel requests that the parties be given until 11/14/08 to provide a written update on the status of settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Judge Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 10/31/08) (tro) (Entered: 11/03/2008)
11/17/2008	<u>141</u>	ENDORSED LETTER: addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Martha A. Calhoun dated 11/14/08 re: It is requested on behalf of both parties that the parties be given until November 26, 2008 to provide a written update on the status of settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Judge Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. So Ordered. ( Status Report due by 11/26/2008.) (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 11/14/08) (js) (Entered: 11/17/2008)
11/26/2008	<u>142</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Martha A. Calhoun dated 11/25/08 re: Counsel writes on behalf of all the parties to report on the status of settlement discussions in this matter. The parties request that they have until 12/19/08 to provide a written update on the status settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Judge Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 11/26/08) (tro) (Entered: 11/26/2008)
12/22/2008	<u>143</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 12/19/08 re: Counsel write on behalf of the parties to report on the status of settlement discussions in this matter. Counsel request that the parties be given until 1/16/09 to provide a written update on the status of settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Judge Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 12/22/08) (tro) (Entered: 12/22/2008)
01/20/2009	<u>144</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 1/16/09 re: Counsel requests that the parties be given until February 18, 2009 to provide a written update on the status of settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Judge Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 1/20/09) (mme) (Entered: 01/20/2009)
02/23/2009	<u>145</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Martha Calhoun dated 2/18/09 re: Request that the parties be given until 4/3/09 to provide a written update on the status of settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Judge Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. ( Status Report due by 4/3/2009.) (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 2/23/09) (cd) (cd). (Entered: 02/23/2009)
03/20/2009	<u>146</u>	ORDER In light of the ongoing settlement negotiations, the pending motion for partial summary judgment (docket entry no. 91) is hereby terminated, without prejudice to restoration upon he written request of either party. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 3/20/09) (mme) (Entered: 03/20/2009)
04/06/2009	<u>147</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 4/3/09 re: Counsel writes on behalf of parties in Lovely H. v. Eggleston to report on two issues. Counsel requests that the parties be given until 5/15/09 to report on the status of settlement negotiations to Judge Swain and Magistrate Judge Peck. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 4/3/09) (tro) (Entered: 04/06/2009)
05/18/2009	<u>148</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 5/15/09 re: Counsel writes on behalf of the parties regarding the status of settlement discussions. Counsel requests that they be granted until 6/3/09 to report back to the Court on the status of these negotiations. ENDORSEMENT: The request is granted. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 5/15/09) (tro) (Entered: 05/19/2009)

06/09/2009	<u>149</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 6/2/09 re: Request for a conference in regards to the status of settlement. ENDORSEMENT: A conference will be held on July 14, 2009, at 2:30 pm in courtroom 11C, if necessary. SO ORDERED. (Status Conference set for 7/14/2009 at 02:30 PM in Courtroom 11C, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Laura Taylor Swain.) (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 6/9/09) (db) (Entered: 06/09/2009)
07/14/2009		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Laura Taylor Swain: Interim Pretrial Conference held on 7/14/2009. (mro) (Entered: 07/15/2009)
02/03/2010	<u>150</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER TO AMEND CLASS DEFINITION NOW THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED BY AND BETWEEN THE UNDERSIGNED AS FOLLOWS: The class definition is hereby amended to be: recipients of public assistance, food stamps and/or Medicaid who (1) are of will be designated as participants in the Wecare program or (2) individuals who were part of a case that was designed as homebound by HRA and had that designation removed through the posting of an HRA NYCWAY computer Action Code 19HC. SO ORDERED (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 2/3/2010) (jmi) (Entered: 02/03/2010)
02/03/2010	151	LETTER addressed to Judge Laura Taylor Swain from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 2/2/2010 re: The parties request that the enclosed "Stipulation to Amend Class Definition" dated 2/1/2010 be so-ordered. Document filed by Lovely H., Courtney B., Eula S., Laura S., Gloria Q., Michele N.(tro) (Entered: 02/05/2010)
02/01/2011	<u>152</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER: I. The class definition IS hereby amended to be: Individuals who meet one of the following three criteria: (1) individuals who are, were, or will be recipients of public assistance, food stamps and/or Medicaid who are, were, or will be designated as participants in the WeCARE program or (2) individuals who were recipients of public assistance, food stamps and/or Medicaid who were part of a case that was designated as "homebound" by HRA and had that designation removed through the posting of an HRA NYCWAY computer Action Code 19HC or (3) individuals who are, were, or will be recipients of cash assistance and/or food stamps who have a physical mental or medical impairment within the meaning of the New York State Human Rights Law § 292(21) and who request to be designated as "homebound" by HRA. Paragraphs II and III further set forth the rules and definitions that shall be followed regarding the class. IV. The provisions set forth in paragraphs I and II of this Stipulation will become effective immediately upon the date this Stipulation is so-ordered by the Court. The provisions set forth in paragraph III of this Stipulation will become effective thirty days after the date this Stipulation is so-ordered by the Court. The provisions set forth in paragraph III of this Stipulation will terminate upon entry of a final judgment or settlement in this action or upon the agreement of the parties. (Signed by Judge Laura Taylor Swain on 2/1/11) (db) (Entered: 02/01/2011)
11/16/2011	<u>153</u>	NOTICE OF CASE REASSIGNMENT to Judge Katherine B. Forrest. Judge Laura Taylor Swain is no longer assigned to the case. (pgu) (Entered: 11/16/2011)
11/23/2011	<u>154</u>	ORDER: It is hereby ORDERED that the parties appear on December 12, 2011 at 11:00 a.m. in Courtroom 15A, United States District Court, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007, for a status conference, and that the parties be prepared to address the status of the ongoing settlement discussions. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 11/22/2011) (lmb) (Entered: 11/23/2011)
11/23/2011		Set/Reset Hearings: Status Conference set for 12/12/2011 at 11:00 AM in Courtroom 15A, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. (lmb) (Entered: 11/23/2011)
11/28/2011	<u>155</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by John Michael Buhta on behalf of Verna Eggleston (Buhta, John) (Entered: 11/28/2011)
12/12/2011		Minute Order Proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Status Conference held on 12/12/2011. The next Status Conference in this action is set for 2/14/2012 at 01:00 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. (jp) (Entered: 12/12/2011)

02/02/2012	<u>156</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 2/1/2012 re: The parties will submit a case management plan and scheduling order before the conference with the Court on February 14, 2012. ENDORSEMENT: Submit by 2/8/2012 via Chambers email. Trial should be set for Sept. 2012. So ordered. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 2/2/2012) (rjm) (Entered: 02/02/2012)
02/14/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Status Conference held on 2/14/2012. Bench Trial set for 9/10/2012 at 09:00 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. The next Status Conference in this action is set for 5/11/2012 at 04:00 PM. (jp) (Entered: 02/14/2012)
02/14/2012	<u>157</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER: All parties do not consent to conducting all further proceedings before a US Magistrate Judge. Fact Discovery due by 6/8/2012. Expert Discovery due by 7/13/2012. Joint Pretrial Order due by 8/27/2012. Trial in this matter shall commence on 9/10/2012. Trial will not be before a jury. Trial is anticipated to take 5-10 days. Status Conference set for 5/11/2012 at 04:00 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. Motions due by 3/15/2012. Responses due by 4/16/2012. Replies due by 4/30/2012. ENDORSEMENT: Further ordered: Plaintiffs' motion for partial summary judgment is due on 3/15/2012, with opposition thereto on 4/16/2012 and a reply due 4/30/2012. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 2/14/2012) (ab) (Entered: 02/14/2012)
02/14/2012	<u>158</u>	ORDER REFERRING CASE TO MAGISTRATE JUDGE. Order that case be referred to the Clerk of Court for assignment to a Magistrate Judge for Settlement. Referred to Magistrate Judge Andrew J. Peck. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 2/14/2012) (ab) (Entered: 02/14/2012)
02/23/2012	<u>159</u>	ORDER FOR SETTLEMENT CONFERENCE: A settlement conference is scheduled for March 19, 2012 at 2:00 p.m. before Magistrate Judge Andrew J. Peck in Courtroom 20D, 500 Pearl Street. Counsel attending the conference must have full settlement authority and their client(s) must be present at the conference, as must a representative of the client's insurance company where the decision to settle and/or amount of settlement must be approved by the insurance company. Counsel shall provide a confidential settlement memorandum to my chambers. The memorandum shall not be filed with the Clerk of the Court nor provided to opposing counsel. The memorandum should explain the factual and legal background of the case as it impacts on settlement negotiations; the status of prior settlement discussions between the parties; and the party's settlement proposal (range). See Order. Settlement Conference set for 3/19/2012 at 02:00 PM in Courtroom 20D, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Magistrate Judge Andrew J. Peck. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Andrew J. Peck on 2/23/2012) (rdz) (Entered: 02/23/2012)
03/16/2012	<u>160</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY –</b> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment. Document filed by Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S. Responses due by 4/16/2012 Return Date set for 5/11/2012 at 04:00 PM.(Stephens, Kenneth) Modified on 3/19/2012 (db). (Entered: 03/16/2012)
03/16/2012	<u>161</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – WRONG EVENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU –</b> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment <i>Declaration in Support</i> . Document filed by Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S. Responses due by 4/16/2012 Return Date set for 5/11/2012 at 04:00 PM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Correspondence, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Stipulation, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Correspondence, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Table, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Table, # <u>6</u> Exhibit Table)(Stephens, Kenneth) Modified on 3/19/2012 (db). (Entered: 03/16/2012)
03/16/2012	<u>162</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY –</b> MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>161</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment <i>Declaration in Support.</i> , <u>160</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment. Document filed by Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S. (Stephens, Kenneth) Modified on 3/19/2012 (db). (Entered: 03/16/2012)
03/16/2012		<b>***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Note to Attorney Kenneth Richard Stephens to RE-FILE Document <u>160</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment. ERROR(S): Supporting Documents are filed separately, each receiving their own document #. Rule 56.1 Statement is found under the Event Type – Other Answers.</b>

		<b>***REMINDER*** – First re–file Motion, then file and link any supporting documents. (db)</b> (Entered: 03/19/2012)
03/16/2012		<b>***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE–FILE DOCUMENT – EVENT TYPE ERROR. Note to Attorney Kenneth Richard Stephens to RE–FILE Document <u>161</u> MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment <i>Declaration in Support</i>. Use the event type Declaration in Support of Motion found under the event list Replies, Opposition and Supporting Documents. (db)</b> (Entered: 03/19/2012)
03/16/2012		<b>***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE–FILE DOCUMENT – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Note to Attorney Kenneth Richard Stephens to RE–FILE Document <u>162</u> Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion. ERROR(S): Document linked to filing error. (db)</b> (Entered: 03/19/2012)
03/19/2012		Minute Entry: for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Andrew J. Peck: Settlement Conference held on 3/19/2012. Parties to advise re settlement status by 3/22. (djc) (Entered: 04/04/2012)
03/23/2012	<u>163</u>	CASE NO LONGER REFERRED to Magistrate Judge Andrew J. Peck. I have closed the above reference for magistrate judge statistical purposes. Reason: Did Not Settle. (jab) (Entered: 03/26/2012)
03/27/2012	<u>164</u>	SECOND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment. Document filed by Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. Responses due by 4/16/2012 Return Date set for 5/11/2012 at 04:00 PM.(Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 03/27/2012)
03/27/2012	<u>165</u>	RULE 56.1 STATEMENT. Document filed by Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. (Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 03/27/2012)
03/27/2012	<u>166</u>	DECLARATION of Kenneth Stephens in Support re: <u>164</u> SECOND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Ex 1 – O'Halloran letter 2/4/2005, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Ex 2 – Stipulation– 3/14/2012, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Ex 3 – Calhoun letter 12/7/2011, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Ex 4 – SSI Benefit Levels Chart 2012, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Ex 5 – Welfare Allowances – Singles and Families without Children, # <u>6</u> Exhibit Ex 6 – Welfare Allowances – Families with Children)(Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 03/27/2012)
03/27/2012	<u>167</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>164</u> SECOND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. (Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 03/27/2012)
04/03/2012	<u>168</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kenneth Stephens dated 3/29/2012 re: Plaintiffs' motion for partial summary judgment calls into question whether New York State's Social Services Law § 106–b would violate the Supremacy and Due Process clauses of the United States Constitution, if it were to be applied so as to bar plaintiffs who are former public assistance recipients from receiving compensation for the loss of cash assistance benefits due to the violation of their federally–protected rights solely because they are no longer receiving public assistance benefits. ENDORSEMENT: The Clerk of the Court is directed to file this notice of constitutional question on the public docket. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 4/3/2012) (lmb) (Entered: 04/03/2012)
04/13/2012	<u>169</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Martha A. Calhoun dated 4/12/2012 re: As the Assistant Corporation Counsel representing defendant in the above–captioned action, I write to respectfully request the defendant's time to respond to plaintiffs' motion for partial summary judgment be extended two weeks, from April 16, 2012 to April 30, 2012 and that plaintiffs' time to reply be extended from April 30, 2012 to May 14, 2012. ENDORSEMENT: Opposition extended to April 30, 2012. Reply extended to May 14, 2012. ( Responses due by 4/30/2012, Replies due by 5/14/2012.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 4/13/2012) (djc) (Entered: 04/13/2012)
04/18/2012	<u>170</u>	ORDER: The Status Conference in this action, currently scheduled for May 11, 2012 is hereby adjourned to June 5, 2012 at 10:00 a.m., ( Status Conference set for 6/5/2012 at 10:00 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 4/18/2012) (lmb) (Entered: 04/18/2012)

04/27/2012	<u>171</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Won S. Shin dated 4/25/12 re: Counsel states that the State is currently reviewing plaintiffs' motion to determine whether it will intervene or otherwise submit a response. ENDORSEMENT: The Clerk of the Court is directed to place this letter on the public docket. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 4/27/2012) (mro) (Entered: 04/27/2012)
04/30/2012	<u>172</u>	ENDORSED LETTER: addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Martha A. Calhoun dated 4/27/2012 re: Counsel for defendant write to respectfully request that—in view of the letter from Assistant Solicitor General Won S. Shin, dated April 25, 2012, indicating that, pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 5.1(c), the State anticipates filing any submission in opposition to plaintiffs' motion for partial summary judgment by May 29, 2012 —the defendant's time to submit opposition to plaintiffs' motion be correspondingly extended to May 29, 2012. Defendant's opposition is currently due April 30, 2012. It is further requested that plaintiffs' time to reply be extended from May 14, 2012 to June 19, 2012. This is the second request for an extension of time and plaintiffs' counsel has given their consent. ENDORSEMENT: All extensions granted. Status conference remains for June 5. So Ordered. ( Responses due by 5/29/2012, Replies due by 6/19/2012.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 4/27/2012) (js) (Entered: 05/01/2012)
04/30/2012	<u>173</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Martha A. Calhoun dated 4/27/2012 re: Counsel respectfully request that in view of the letter from Assistant Solicitor General Won S. Shin, dated 4/25/12, indicating that, pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 5.1(c), the State anticipates filing any submission in opposition to plaintiffs' motion for partial summary judgment by 5/29/12 — the defendant's time to submit opposition to plaintiffs' motion be correspondingly extended to 5/29/12. It is further requested that plaintiffs' time to reply be extended to 6/19/12. ENDORSEMENT: All extensions granted. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 4/30/2012) (jfe) (Entered: 05/07/2012)
05/18/2012	<u>174</u>	ORDER: The Status Conference in this action, currently scheduled for June 5, 2012, will be heard on the same date (6/5/2012) at 1:00 p.m. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 5/18/2012) (mro) (Entered: 05/18/2012)
05/29/2012	<u>175</u>	COUNTER STATEMENT TO <u>165</u> Rule 56.1 Statement. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Buhta, John) (Entered: 05/29/2012)
05/29/2012	<u>176</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>164</u> SECOND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Buhta, John) (Entered: 05/29/2012)
05/30/2012	<u>177</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Won S. Shin dated 5/29/2012 re: I write to advise the Court that, after careful consideration and review of the documents submitted in connection with this matter, the Office of the Attorney General has determined that it will not intervene pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 2403(b) and Fed. R. Civ. P. 5.1(c) at this time. ENDORSEMENT: The Clerk of Court is directed to place this letter on the public docket. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 5/30/2012) (djc) (Entered: 05/30/2012)
06/05/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Status Conference held on 6/5/2012. (jp) (Entered: 06/05/2012)
06/06/2012	<u>178</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER: As set forth at the status conference with the Court on June 5, 2012, the following schedule shall govern the remainder of this action: Motions due by 10/29/2012. Responses due by 11/5/2012 Fact Discovery due by 8/31/2012. Oral Argument set for 6/25/2012 at 10:00 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. Pretrial Order due by 11/6/2012. Bench Trial set for 11/13/2012 at 09:00 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 6/06/2012) (ama) Modified on 6/14/2012 (ama). (Entered: 06/06/2012)
06/18/2012	<u>179</u>	ORDER: The Oral Argument in this action, scheduled for Monday, June 25, 2012 at 10:00 a.m. will be heard on the same date (6/25/2012), at 9:00 a.m. SO ORDERED.( Oral Argument set for 6/25/2012 at 09:00 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 6/18/2012) (ama) (Entered: 06/18/2012)

06/19/2012	<u>180</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>164</u> SECOND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment.. Document filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. (Gross, William) (Entered: 06/19/2012)
06/19/2012	<u>181</u>	RULE 56.1 STATEMENT. Document filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. (Gross, William) (Entered: 06/19/2012)
06/22/2012	<u>182</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from John Buhta dated 6/21/12 re: Counsel for the defendant requests an adjournment of the 6/25/12 oral argument. ENDORSEMENT: Adjourned until July 25, 2012 at 3:30 pm. ( Oral Argument set for 7/25/2012 at 03:30 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 6/22/2012) (mro) (Entered: 06/22/2012)
06/28/2012	<u>183</u>	ORDER: The Oral Argument in this action, currently scheduled for July 25, 2012, will be heard on the same date (7/25/2012), at 9:30 a.m. (Oral Argument set for 7/25/2012 at 09:30 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 6/28/2012) (djc) (Entered: 06/28/2012)
07/23/2012	<u>184</u>	ORDER: At the oral argument scheduled for July 25, 2012, at 9:30 a.m., the parties should be prepared to address the arguments made in their respective briefs in support of and in opposition to plaintiffs' motion for summary judgment (Dkt. No. 164), as well as, in particular, the following as further set forth in this order. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 7/23/2012) (lmb) (Entered: 07/23/2012)
07/25/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Oral Argument held on 7/25/2012 re: <u>164</u> SECOND MOTION for Partial Summary Judgment. filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Eula S., Michele N., Laura S.. (jp) (Entered: 07/25/2012)
08/08/2012	<u>185</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: ARGUMENT held on 7/25/2012 before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Karen Gorlaski, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 9/4/2012. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 9/13/2012. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 11/13/2012.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 08/08/2012)
08/08/2012	<u>186</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a ARGUMENT proceeding held on 7/25/12 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 08/08/2012)
08/27/2012	<u>187</u>	ORDER: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the parties shall appear for a telephonic status conference on August 29, 2012, at 5:15 p.m. Counsel for plaintiffs shall initiate the call to Chambers at (212) 805-0276, with counsel for all parties on the line. ( Status Conference set for 8/29/2012 at 05:15 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 8/27/2012) (ja) (Entered: 08/28/2012)
08/29/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Telephone Conference held on 8/29/2012. Letters due by 9/6/2012. (jp) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
09/06/2012	<u>188</u>	Letter addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Martha A. Calhoun dated 9/6/2012 re: Counsel for Defendant writes that consistent with the Court's direction at the telephone conference held on August 29, 2012, I write on behalf of the parties to inform the Court that any additional submissions by the parties with respect to the issues raised by the Court in connection with plaintiffs' motion for partial summary judgment will be made on or before September 14, 2012. In the meantime, plaintiffs have made a settlement demand with respect to retroactive relief which defendant is considering. Document filed by Verna Eggleston.(pl) (Entered: 09/06/2012)
09/14/2012	<u>189</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER: Fact Discovery due by 10/31/2012. Expert Discovery due by 1/31/2013. All pretrial materials, including the Joint Pretrial Order due by 2/22/2013. Trial in this matter shall commence on 2/28/2013. Trial will not be before a jury. Trial is anticipated to take 5-10 days. Status Conference set for 10/2/2012 at 09:00 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 9/14/2012) (djc) (Entered: 09/14/2012)

09/14/2012	<u>190</u>	Letter addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Martha A. Calhoun dated 9/14/2012 re: For the reasons set forth in defendant's Opposition Memo, applicable law requires that New York Social Services Law § 106-b must be applied to limit recovery to those plaintiffs currently eligible for the benefit. See generally Opposition Memo (Docket Entry #176). Neither a protected property interest, nor pre-emption by the ADA of the state law defining eligibility for the benefit should be applied to provide for recovery that is expressly contrary to state law. These arguments cannot be sidestepped by characterizing the relief plaintiffs seek as a metric. (djc) Modified on 9/14/2012 (djc). (Entered: 09/14/2012)
09/19/2012	<u>191</u>	Letter addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kenneth R. Stephens dated 9/14/2012 re: We therefore urge the Court to issue a ruling holding that SSL § 106 (b) does not apply to plaintiffs' claim for direct compensatory damages, thereby avoiding the constitutional questions, or, in the alternative, that the state statute cannot be applied so as to bar claims for damages as it is pre-empted by the Title II of the ADA, and doing so would also violate plaintiffs' due process rights. Document filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.(lmb) (Entered: 09/19/2012)
09/19/2012	<u>192</u>	MEMORANDUM & ORDER denying <u>164</u> Motion for Partial Summary Judgment. For the reasons set forth above, plaintiffs' motion for summary judgment is denied. As discussed on the August 29, 2012, conference call with the parties, if the parties wish to stipulate as to liability for even one plaintiff, the Court will issue a ruling as to the question of damages. The Clerk of the Court is directed to terminate the motion at Docket No. 164. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 9/19/2012) (lmb) (Entered: 09/19/2012)
10/02/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Status Conference held on 10/2/2012. The Trial in this action is set for 2/28/2012 at 09:00 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. (jp) (Entered: 10/11/2012)
10/03/2012	<u>193</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER: Motions for summary judgment on the "hub issue" due by 11/9/2012. Responses due by 12/10/2012 Replies due by 12/19/2012. Status Conference set for 1/11/2013 at 04:00 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 10/2/2012) (cd) (Entered: 10/03/2012)
11/08/2012	<u>194</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 11/7/2012 re: I write on behalf of the parties in Lovely H. v. Eggleston to request an extension of the time on papers related to Plaintiffs' Motion for Partial Summary Judgment as well as a suspension of the current Scheduling Orders until December 7, 2012 at which time the parties intend to propose a new scheduling order. The current briefing schedule in the case required plaintiffs' moving papers on partial summary judgment motion to be submitted by November 9, 2012, with defendant's opposition due on December 10, 2012 and plaintiffs' Reply on December 19, 2012 Prior to the storm, counsel had been discussing means by which the motion might be settled or perhaps presented to the Court with a stipulated agreement. Those discussions will continue during this time on a parallel track and the results will be reflected in the proposed status letter and revised scheduling order. ENDORSEMENT: Submit a proposed schedule for all remaining dates (for the Court's consideration) by 12/7/2012. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 11/8/2012) (js) (Entered: 11/08/2012)
12/10/2012	<u>195</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Emily Sweet dated 12/7/2012 re: I am an Assistant Corporation Counsel in the office of Michael A. Cardozo, Corporation Counsel of the City of New York, attorney for defendant New York City Human Resources Administration ("HRA") in the above-referenced matter. I write to update the Court on the status of the case and to request an extension of time to submit a proposed revised scheduling order to the Court. Plaintiffs do not oppose this request. ENDORSEMENT: Extension to submit proposed schedule extended to 1/11/2013. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 12/10/2012) (djc) (Entered: 12/10/2012)
12/12/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Hearing held on 12/12/2012. (jp) (Entered: 12/14/2012)
12/14/2012	<u>196</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from John Buhta dated 12/13/2012 re: Counsel for plaintiff writes that as discussed at yesterday's

		conference, we write to update the Court on the status of providing identifying information for homebound class-members in the zip codes eligible for D-SNAP benefits. HRA has determined that it will be able to identify and provide identifying information for those class members who reside in the 12 DSNAP zip codes who are not currently in receipt of SNAP benefits (and therefore potentially eligible for D-SNAP benefits) by noon on Friday, December 14th. ENDORSEMENT: Post on docket. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 12/14/2012) (pl) (Entered: 12/14/2012)
12/17/2012	<u>197</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen M. Kelleher dated 12/16/2012 re: We are anxious to speak with defendant's counsel tomorrow to discuss the most expeditious way to reach out and complete applications for those individuals on the list who are interested in applying for D-SNAP. We recognize that there are time and resource constraints affecting HRA, but it is not realistic to expect that plaintiffs' counsel will be able to reach each of these households in the next thirty-six hours, interview them – which will require an interpreter in many cases – and then arrange for these individuals to submit an application that conforms with the present current program application rules. It appears the best solution would be for HRA to reach out to some or all of these individuals to help them complete an application. ENDORSEMENT: Plaintiffs and defense counsel to confer on how best to resolve the above and report to the Court at 5:30pm (on a conference call with the Court) today. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 12/17/2012) (lmb) (Entered: 12/17/2012)
12/17/2012	<u>198</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from John Buhta dated 12/14/2012 re: Please find attached transcript of the proceedings before the Court on Wednesday, December 12, 2012. ENDORSEMENT: Clerk of Court to place this email on the docket. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 12/17/2012) (lmb) (Entered: 12/17/2012)
12/18/2012	<u>199</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – WRONG EVENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU – OPPOSITION BRIEF</b> re: <u>197</u> Endorsed Letter,,, <i>Declaration of John Buhta in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for A Preliminary Injunction (not yet filed)</i> . Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G, # <u>8</u> Exhibit H)(Buhta, John) Modified on 12/19/2012 (ka). (Entered: 12/18/2012)
12/18/2012	<u>200</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – WRONG EVENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU – OPPOSITION BRIEF</b> <i>Declaration of Roy A. Esnard in opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for a Preliminary Injunction (not yet filed)</i> . Document filed by Verna Eggleston.(Sweet, Emily) Modified on 12/19/2012 (ka). (Entered: 12/18/2012)
12/19/2012		<b>***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – EVENT TYPE ERROR. Note to Attorney John Michael Buhta to RE-FILE Document <u>199</u> Opposition Brief. Use the event type Declaration in Opposition(non-motion) found under the event list Other Answers. (ka)</b> (Entered: 12/19/2012)
12/19/2012		<b>***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – EVENT TYPE ERROR. Note to Attorney Emily Sweet to RE-FILE Document <u>200</u> Opposition Brief. Use the event type Declaration in Opposition(non-motion) found under the event list Other Answers. (ka)</b> (Entered: 12/19/2012)
12/19/2012	<u>201</u>	DECLARATION of John Buhta in Opposition. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G, # <u>8</u> Exhibit H)(Buhta, John) (Entered: 12/19/2012)
12/19/2012	<u>202</u>	DECLARATION of Roy Esnard in Opposition. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Buhta, John) (Entered: 12/19/2012)
12/19/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Conference held on 12/19/2012. (jp) (Entered: 12/21/2012)
01/02/2013	<u>203</u>	ORDER: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the status conference scheduled for January 11, 2013, at 4:00 p.m. will be heard that same day (January 11) at 2:30 p.m. ( Status Conference set for 1/11/2013 at 02:30 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 1/2/2013) (mro) (Entered: 01/02/2013)



01/11/2013	<u>204</u>	ORDER: Any Motion for partial summary judgment on the "hub issue" due by 2/22/2013. Response due by 3/22/2013, Reply due by 4/5/2013. As additionally set forth, if the parties are unable to agree to a joint letter (and schedule), they are to submit a letter on the discovery issues and schedule as discussed on the record at the referenced status conference by January 24, 2013, at 9:00 a.m., to which defendants are to respond by January 25, 2013, at 5:00 p.m. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 1/11/2013) (cd) (Entered: 01/14/2013)
01/11/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Status Conference held on 1/11/2013. (jp) (Entered: 01/17/2013)
01/24/2013	<u>205</u>	ENDORSED LETTER: addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Susan E. Welber dated 1/23/2013 re: Accordingly, to afford the parties the time needed to take a deposition if necessary, and/or reach agreement on a date proposal, the parties respectfully request more time to report to the Court on discovery issues and a proposed trial schedule. Plaintiffs request until 5:00 p.m. on Tuesday, January 29 and defendant requests until 5:00 p.m. on January 30, 2013. ENDORSEMENT: Application granted. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 1/24/2013) (js) (Entered: 01/24/2013)
01/30/2013	<u>206</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER: Fact Discovery due by 5/30/2013. Expert Discovery due by 8/15/2013. Status Conference set for 4/12/2013 at 03:00 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. Pretrial Order due by 9/16/2013. Trial in this matter shall commence on September 23, 2013. Trial will not be before a jury. Trial is anticipated to take 5–10 days. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 1/30/2013) (lmb) (Entered: 01/30/2013)
02/20/2013	<u>207</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kenneth R. Stephens dated 2/19/2013 re: Plaintiff's counsel writes behalf of the plaintiffs, with the consent of the defendants, to request a resetting of the scheduling of the plaintiffs' partial summary judgment motion on the "hub issue." Since our appearance before your honor on January 11,2013, the parties have continued to seriously pursue settlement of the issues that would be the subject of the motion. Both sides believe that an extension is appropriate as these discussions are still very much worth pursuing. Both parties also agree that resetting the deadlines will not impact the trial schedule. We propose that the deadlines set forth in the Court's Order of January 11,2013 be reset as follows: Plaintiffs' Motion: April 5, 2013 (from February 22, 2013); Defendants' Opposition: May 3, 2013 (from March 22,2013) ; Plaintiffs' Reply: May 17,2013 (from April 5, 2013).. ENDORSEMENT: Ordered. Granted. (The trial date remains, as you indicated.), ( Motions due by 4/5/2013, Responses due by 5/3/2013, Replies due by 5/17/2013.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 2/20/2013) (ago) (Entered: 02/20/2013)
03/18/2013	<u>208</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 1/11/2013 before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Jennifer Thun, (212) 805–0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 4/11/2013. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 4/22/2013. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 6/20/2013.(Rodriguez, Somari) (Entered: 03/18/2013)
03/18/2013	<u>209</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 1/11/13 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above–captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(Rodriguez, Somari) (Entered: 03/18/2013)
03/22/2013	<u>210</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kenneth R. Stephens dated 3/21/2013 re: I write on behalf of the parties to apprise the Court that Plaintiffs and Defendant have reached a settlement on partial summary judgment relating back to the "hub center" issue that was addressed in Your Honor's Decision and Order dated September 19, 2012, Docket # 192. The agreement is to pay those with closed cases 50% of the amount that they would otherwise have received in retroactive benefits using the formulas reflected in the Stipulation dated March 14,2012 for open cases, that was attached to my declaration in support of the Plaintiffs'

		Second Motion for Partial Summary Judgment, Docket # 166, attached hereto for your reference. We will be submitting a Stipulation to this effect forthwith. ENDORSEMENT: Ordered. Post to docket. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 3/22/2013) (ago) (Entered: 03/22/2013)
04/08/2013	<u>211</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Emily Sweet dated 4/5/2013 re: I write on behalf of both plaintiffs and defendant in the above-referenced matter regarding the parties' settlement of the "hub center" issue. On March 21, 2013, we informed the Court that the parties had reached a settlement of the claims on partial summary judgment relating back to the "hub center" issue that was addressed in Your Honor's Decision and Order dated September 19, 2013 (Docket # 192) and that we would be submitting a stipulation to the Court forthwith. At this time, the parties are working out a number of technical issues relating to the stipulation. In the event that we are not able to submit a proposed settlement document to the Court for preliminary approval prior to April 12, 2013, we will update the Court as to the status of any outstanding technical issues at the conference that is scheduled for that date. ENDORSEMENT: Ordered. Post to docket. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 4/8/2013) (ago) Modified on 4/10/2013 (ago). (Entered: 04/08/2013)
04/12/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Status Conference held on 4/12/2013. (jp) (Entered: 04/15/2013)
04/15/2013	<u>212</u>	ORDER: The next status conference in this matter will be held on Thursday, June 27,2013, at 1:00 p.m. As set forth on the record at the status conference held in this matter on April 12, 2013, the parties should confer and attempt to come to agreement on the following topics prior to the June 27,2013 conference as further set forth herein. ( Status Conference set for 6/27/2013 at 01:00 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 4/15/2013) (ago) (Entered: 04/15/2013)
05/15/2013	<u>213</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 12/19/2012 before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Martha Drevis, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 6/10/2013. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 6/20/2013. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 8/16/2013.(Rodriguez, Somari) (Entered: 05/15/2013)
05/15/2013	<u>214</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 12/19/12 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(Rodriguez, Somari) (Entered: 05/15/2013)
06/18/2013	<u>215</u>	ORDER: It is hereby ORDERED that the status conference previously scheduled for 1:00 p.m. on June 27, 2013 shall take place at 9:30 a.m. on that same day. ( Status Conference set for 6/27/2013 at 09:30 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 6/18/2013) (mro) (Entered: 06/18/2013)
06/27/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Status Conference held on 6/27/2013. (jp) (Entered: 06/27/2013)
06/27/2013	<u>216</u>	ORDER: As discussed at the status conference on June 27, 2013, it is hereby ORDERED that the following schedule shall govern the remainder of this case: 1. Defendant shall produce data to plaintiffs not later than August 5, 2013. 2. Plaintiffs shall serve any expert report not later than September 6, 2013. 3. Defendant shall serve any expert report not later than October 7, 2013. 4. Expert discovery shall close November 4, 2013. 5. Motions in limine shall be fully briefed not later than November 26, 2013. 6. The parties shall submit to the Court a joint pretrial order not later than November 26, 2013. If the parties elect to submit direct testimony via declaration, the joint pretrial order need not contain proposed findings of fact or conclusions of law. 7. The parties shall exchange direct testimony declarations on December 2, 2013. The parties shall submit redline and clean versions of the direct testimony declarations to the Court not later than 4:00 p.m. on December 5, 2013. 8. The parties shall appear for a final pretrial conference on December 6, 2013 at 10:00 a.m. 9. Trial in this matter shall commence on December 9, 2013. IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the

		proceedings in this case shall be bifurcated between liability and damages issues., ( Expert Discovery due by 11/4/2013., Motions due by 11/26/2013., Pretrial Order due by 11/26/2013.), ( Final Pretrial Conference set for 12/6/2013 at 10:00 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 6/27/2013) (lmb) (Entered: 06/27/2013)
08/30/2013	<u>217</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine P. Forrest from Susan E. Welber dated 8/30/2013 re: Counsel writes on behalf of the parties in Lovely H. v. Eggleston, to respectfully request modifications to the discovery schedule ordered by the Court on June 27, 2013. Pursuant to the June 27 order, plaintiffs' expert reports were due on September 6, 2013, and any reports from the defendant were due on October 4. Under the proposed, new schedule, plaintiffs' expert reports are due on September 20 and defendant's expert reports are due on October 15, and the trial date and all other deadlines in the Court's June 27th order would remain the same. ENDORSEMENT: Ordered. Adjusted dates are fine. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 8/30/2013) (tn) (Entered: 08/30/2013)
09/27/2013	<u>218</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 12/12/2012 before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Toni Stanley, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 10/21/2013. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 10/31/2013. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 12/30/2013.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 09/27/2013)
09/27/2013	<u>219</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 12/12/12 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 09/27/2013)
10/11/2013	<u>220</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Katherine B. Forrest dated October 11, 2013. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Attachment (scheduling order and endorsed letter))(Buhta, John) (Entered: 10/11/2013)
10/15/2013	<u>221</u>	ORDER granting <u>220</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. Ordered: Application granted. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 10/15/2013) (mro) (Entered: 10/15/2013)
10/15/2013		Set/Reset Deadlines: Expert Discovery due by 11/8/2013. (mro) (Entered: 10/15/2013)
11/08/2013	<u>222</u>	ORDER: On November 7, 2013, a deposition dispute arose between the parties. The undersigned resolved the issue telephonically. The ruling may be found in the deposition transcript. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 11/08/2013) (ama) (Entered: 11/08/2013)
11/20/2013	<u>223</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 6/27/2013 before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Bridget Lombardozzi, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 12/16/2013. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 12/26/2013. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 2/21/2014.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 11/20/2013)
11/20/2013	<u>224</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 6/27/2013 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 11/20/2013)
11/20/2013	<u>225</u>	FIRST LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Joint Letter from Parties dated 11/20/2013 re: Joint Request re JPTO. Document filed by Courtney B.,

		Verna Eggleston, Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S..(Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 11/20/2013)
11/21/2013	<u>226</u>	ORDER: The parties are hereby ORDERED to appear for a conference call today, November 21, 2013, at 5:10 P.M. All parties shall call chambers (212-805-0139) from a single line at the time of the conference. ( Telephone Conference set for 11/21/2013 at 05:10 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 11/21/2013) (mro) (Entered: 11/21/2013)
11/22/2013	<u>227</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Martha A. Calhoun dated 11/21/13 re: Consistent with the Court's scheduling order, dated June 27, 2013 the parties are working to submit the joint pre-trial order on November 26, 2013, As set forth in the letter of Kathleen M. Kelleher, dated November 20, 2013, the parties respectfully request that with respect to Rule 3(A)(vi) of the Court's Individual Rules, the parties be permitted to limit the deposition designations on the spreadsheet to testimony that is in dispute. ENDORSEMENT: Ordered: Post to docket. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 11/21/2013) (mro) (Entered: 11/22/2013)
11/22/2013	<u>228</u>	ORDER: that the parties shall notify the Court by 12/5/2013 who they plan on calling for live cross-examination. Deposition designations and exhibits to which there are objections shall be submitted at the same time as the parties' final pretrial materials; all other deposition designations and exhibits need only be submitted in advance of trial if the parties so desire. The parties need not submit two sets of exhibits; one set of exhibits is sufficient. The parties are reminded to test all electronic equipment prior to the start of trial; should the parties need permission to bring certain electronics, they shall submit proposed Orders to that effect in a timely fashion. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 11/22/2013) (tn) (Entered: 11/22/2013)
11/22/2013	<u>229</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Martha Calhoun dated 11/22/2013. Document filed by Verna Eggleston.(Buhta, John) (Entered: 11/22/2013)
11/26/2013	<u>230</u>	ORDER granting <u>229</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. Ordered: Starting trial on 12/13 and continuing 12/16 + 12/17 is fine. Other dates modified as set forth herein. Pretrial Order due by 12/9/2013. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 11/25/2013) (mro) (Entered: 11/26/2013)
11/26/2013	<u>231</u>	ORDER: The Final Pretrial Conference previously scheduled for December 6, 2013 is hereby rescheduled to December 11, 2013 at 3:00 P.M. ( Final Pretrial Conference set for 12/11/2013 at 03:00 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 11/25/2013) (mro) (Entered: 11/26/2013)
12/09/2013	<u>232</u>	SEALED DOCUMENT placed in vault.(nm) (Entered: 12/09/2013)
12/11/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Status Conference held on 12/11/2013. (jp) (Entered: 01/02/2014)
12/12/2013	<u>233</u>	ORDER: On December 11, 2013, a conference was held in the above-referenced matter. As discussed at that conference, the parties are hereby ORDERED to appear for a telephonic conference on December 17, 2013 at 5:00 P.M. All parties shall call chambers (212-805-0139) from a single line at the time of the conference. The parties are FURTHER ORDERED to appear for a status conference on March 14, 2014 at 1:00 P.M. ( Status Conference set for 3/14/2014 at 01:00 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest., Telephone Conference set for 12/17/2013 at 05:00 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 12/12/2013) (mro) (Entered: 12/12/2013)
12/16/2013	<u>234</u>	ORDER: The telephone conference previously scheduled for 5:00 P.M. on December 17, 2013 is hereby rescheduled to 11:30 A.M. that day. All parties shall call chambers (212-805-0139) from a single line at the time of the conference. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 12/16/2013) (mro) (Entered: 12/16/2013)
12/16/2013		Set/Reset Hearings: Telephone Conference set for 12/17/2013 at 11:30 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. (mro) (Entered: 12/16/2013)
01/22/2014	<u>235</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 12/11/2013 before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Tara Jones, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court

		Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 2/18/2014. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 2/27/2014. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 4/25/2014.(Rodriguez, Somari) (Entered: 01/22/2014)
01/22/2014	<u>236</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 12/11/13 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(Rodriguez, Somari) (Entered: 01/22/2014)
02/10/2014	<u>237</u>	ORDER: 3/14/2014 Conference reset for 3/13/2014 at 09:00 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 2/10/2014) (cd) (Entered: 02/10/2014)
03/05/2014	<u>238</u>	ORDER: A status conference in the above-referenced matter is currently scheduled for March 13, 2014 at 9:00 A.M. The parties are hereby ORDERED to submit a letter no later than March 7, 2014 providing the Court with a status update. The parties shall also indicate whether they believe the upcoming conference is necessary, and if so, what issues they plan to raise at that conference. (Status Conference set for 3/13/2014 at 09:00 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 3/5/2014) (tn) (Entered: 03/05/2014)
03/07/2014	<u>239</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Joint Letter from Plaintiffs Counsel (Kelleher) And Defendant's Counsel (Calhoun) dated 03/07/2014 re: Response to Order of March 5, 2014 Regarding Case Status. Document filed by Lovely H..(Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 03/07/2014)
03/10/2014	<u>240</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>239</u> Letter, filed by Lovely H. ENDORSEMENT: Ordered: Conference adjourned. Status update due 5/16/2014. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 3/7/2014) (tn) (Entered: 03/10/2014)
04/08/2014	<u>241</u>	ORDER: To clarify the schedule in the above-referenced action, the status conference initially scheduled for Friday, April 11, 2014 is adjourned. Instead, a joint status update shall be submitted no later than May 16, 2014. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 4/8/2014) (tn) (Entered: 04/08/2014)
05/13/2014	<u>242</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by David Alan Rosinus, Jr on behalf of Verna Eggleston. (Rosinus, David) (Entered: 05/13/2014)
05/16/2014	<u>243</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kelleher, Kathleen on behalf of the parties dated 05/16/2014 re: Joint Status Letter. Document filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S..(Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 05/16/2014)
05/19/2014	<u>244</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>243</u> Letter filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Gloria Q., Eula S., Michele N., Laura S. ENDORSEMENT: Ordered: Report to the Court by letter on May 30, 2014, regarding "measures to which the parties have agreed". (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 5/19/2014) (tn) (Entered: 05/19/2014)
05/30/2014	<u>245</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kelleher, on behalf of parties dated May 30, 2014 re: 05 cv 6920 – Status. Document filed by Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S..(Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 05/30/2014)
06/02/2014	<u>246</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>245</u> Letter filed by Lovely H., Gloria Q., Eula S., Michele N., Laura S. ENDORSEMENT: So ordered. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 6/2/2014) (tn) (Entered: 06/02/2014)
06/27/2014	<u>247</u>	JOINT LETTER MOTION for Conference <i>and Joint Status Letter</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from David Alan Rosinus, Jr. dated June 27, 2014. Document filed by Verna Eggleston.(Rosinus, David) (Entered: 06/27/2014)
06/30/2014	<u>248</u>	ORDER granting <u>247</u> Letter Motion for Conference: Request granted. The parties are Ordered to appear for a status conference on July 25, 2014 at 11:00 a.m. Status Conference set for 7/25/2014 at 11:00 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 6/30/2014) (tn) (Entered: 06/30/2014)

07/10/2014		<b>***DELETED DOCUMENT. Deleted document number <u>249</u> Order. The document was incorrectly filed in this case. (tn)</b> (Entered: 07/10/2014)
07/25/2014	<u>249</u>	ORDER: The status conference previously scheduled for 7/25/2014 is hereby ADJOURNED to 7/28/2014 at 03:30 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 7/25/2014) (tn) (Entered: 07/25/2014)
07/28/2014		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Status Conference held on 7/28/2014. (jp) (Entered: 07/28/2014)
07/29/2014	<u>250</u>	ORDER: that the parties shall determine the date by which the CAFA notice shall be distributed; Notice to the class shall be submitted to the Court for approval not later than August 12, 2014; Notice to the class shall be disseminated not later than August 26, 2014; Status Conference set for 9/19/2014 at 03:30 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. Fairness Hearing set for 10/31/2014 at 09:30 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 7/29/2014) (tn) (Entered: 07/29/2014)
08/05/2014	<u>251</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Susan Elizabeth Welber on behalf of Courtney B., Verna Eggleston, Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. (Welber, Susan) (Entered: 08/05/2014)
08/12/2014	<u>252</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kenneth Stephens dated 08/12/2014. Document filed by Courtney B..(Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 08/12/2014)
08/13/2014	<u>253</u>	ORDER granting <u>252</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. ORDERED: Request granted. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 8/13/2014) (ja) (Entered: 08/13/2014)
08/13/2014	<u>254</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY –</b> CONSENT MOTION to Approve Proposed Fairness Hearing Notice . Document filed by Lovely H.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Proposed Fairness Hearing Notice)(Stephens, Kenneth) Modified on 8/14/2014 (db). (Entered: 08/13/2014)
08/14/2014		<b>***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE–FILE DOCUMENT – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Note to Attorney Kenneth Richard Stephens to RE–FILE Document <u>254</u> CONSENT MOTION to Approve Proposed Fairness Hearing Notice . ERROR(S): No signature or s/. (db)</b> (Entered: 08/14/2014)
08/14/2014	<u>255</u>	FIRST MOTION to Approve Proposed Fairness Hearing Notice . Document filed by Lovely H.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Proposed Fairness Hearing Notice)(Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 08/14/2014)
08/15/2014	<u>256</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on MOTION FOR ORDER APPROVING PROPOSED FAIRNESS HEARING NOTICE. ENDORSEMENT: So ordered, this 15th day of August, 2014. Granting <u>255</u> Motion to Approve PROPOSED FAIRNESS HEARING NOTICE. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 8/15/2014) (rjm) (Entered: 08/15/2014)
08/22/2014	<u>257</u>	JOINT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to mail class notice</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from David Alan Rosinus, Jr. dated August 22, 2014. Document filed by Verna Eggleston.(Rosinus, David) (Entered: 08/22/2014)
08/25/2014	<u>258</u>	ORDER granting <u>257</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. ORDERED: Request granted. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 8/25/2014) (ja) (Entered: 08/25/2014)
08/25/2014	<u>259</u>	NOTICE of of Proposed Class Action Settlement Under 28 U.S.C. § 1715. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A: Complaint, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B: Amended Complaint, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C: Proposed Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(e)(1) Notice, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D: Proposed Stipulation and Order of Partial Settlement)(Rosinus, David) (Entered: 08/25/2014)
08/27/2014	<u>260</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Notice of Proposed Class Action Settlement Under 28 U.S.C. § 1715 served on federal and state attorneys general on August 26, 2014. Service was made by mail. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Rosinus, David) (Entered: 08/27/2014)

08/29/2014	<u>261</u>	MOTION to Approve Proposed Modified Fairness Hearing Notice . Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A: Modified Fairness Hearing Notice, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B: Stipulation and Order of Partial Settlement)(Rosinus, David) (Entered: 08/29/2014)
09/02/2014	<u>262</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT granting <u>261</u> Motion to Approve modified fairness hearing notice. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED, this 2nd day of Sept., 2014. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 9/2/2014) (tro) (Entered: 09/02/2014)
09/18/2014		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Status Conference held on 9/18/2014. (jp) (Entered: 09/22/2014)
09/19/2014	<u>263</u>	ORDER: A status conference was held in the above-referenced matter on September 19, 2014. The parties expressed that they hoped to present the Court with a settlement agreement on November 7, 2014. The parties shall report any change in their expectations at the fairness hearing scheduled on October 31, 2014. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 9/19/2014) (lmb) (Entered: 09/22/2014)
09/19/2014	<u>264</u>	STIPULATION: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED BY AND BETWEEN THE UNDERSIGNED AS FOLLOWS: The parties agree to the following interim treatment of Class Members while Lovely H. settlement discussions proceed, which will be implemented as quickly as possible given MIS implementation issues. This Agreement will expire upon the court's entry of a global settlement. The parties will specify any provisions of this Agreement that will remain in place as part of any such global settlement as further set forth in this order. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 9/19/2014) (lmb) Modified on 9/25/2014 (lmb). (Entered: 09/22/2014)
10/24/2014	<u>265</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Notice of Proposed Settlement of Class Action served on retroactive relief class members on September 12, 2014. Service was made by mail. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A: Notice of Proposed Settlement of Class Action (English version), # <u>2</u> Exhibit B: Notice of Proposed Settlement of Class Action (Spanish version))(Rosinus, David) (Entered: 10/24/2014)
10/30/2014	<u>266</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY</b> – MOTION to Approve Partial Settlement . Document filed by Lovely H. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Attorney Declaration in Support)(Stephens, Kenneth) Modified on 10/31/2014 (db). (Entered: 10/30/2014)
10/31/2014		<b>***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Note to Attorney Kenneth Richard Stephens to RE-FILE Document <u>266</u> MOTION to Approve Partial Settlement . ERROR(S): Supporting Documents are filed separately, each receiving their own document #. (db)</b> (Entered: 10/31/2014)
10/31/2014	<u>267</u>	MOTION to Approve Partial Settlement . Document filed by Lovely H..(Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 10/31/2014)
10/31/2014	<u>268</u>	DECLARATION of Kenneth Stephens in Support re: <u>267</u> MOTION to Approve Partial Settlement .. Document filed by Lovely H.. (Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 10/31/2014)
10/31/2014	<u>269</u>	ORDER. A fairness hearing was held on October 31, 2014 regarding the partial settlement in the above-referenced matter. As set forth on the record, the Court contingently found the settlement to be fair, reasonable and adequate. In accordance with the requirement in the Class Action Fairness Act of 2005, the Court's approval is not effective until November 24, 2014, assuming no objections are received. If no objections are received by that date, the Court will post the Order on ECF and the settlement will become fully effective. If objections are received, the parties should immediately notify the Court. The parties reported that they expect to finalize a settlement agreement on the remaining portion of the case by December 18, 2014. The parties shall appear for a conference on Thursday, December 18, 2014 at 10:00 a.m. (Status Conference set for 12/18/2014 at 10:00 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 10/31/2014) (rjm) (Entered: 11/03/2014)
10/31/2014		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Fairness Hearing held on 10/31/2014. (jp) (Entered: 11/03/2014)

11/25/2014	<u>270</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER OF PARTIAL SETTLEMENT: WHEREAS the parties have conducted extensive, arms-length negotiations to resolve this closed case issue and desire now to enter into an agreement to also settle Plaintiffs' Second Motion for Partial Summary Judgment, without further proceedings and without any admission of fault or liability, as specified in this Stipulation and Order. It is hereby Stipulated and Agreed by and between the undersigned as further set forth in this Order. Held in escrow to 11/24/14. If no objections received by that date, this Agreement becomes fully effective on that date. Motions terminated: <u>267</u> MOTION to Approve Partial Settlement filed by Lovely H. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 10/31/2014) (tro) (Entered: 11/25/2014)
12/18/2014		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Status Conference held on 12/18/2014. (jp) (Entered: 12/19/2014)
12/19/2014	<u>271</u>	ORDER: As set forth on the record, the Court hereby modifies the provision on attorney's fees in the Stipulation and Order of Partial Settlement made effective on November 24, 2014. (Order 38, ECF No. 270.) The prior 45 day requirement for an application to recover costs and fees no longer applies. A different time frame will be set on or before February 9, 2015 and tied to a global settlement order, the Court's resolution on remaining issues, or a consent agreement to the same. The parties shall appear for a conference on Monday, February 9, 2015 at 1:00 p.m. If a settlement is not reached by that date, the Court will set a schedule for motion practice. SO ORDERED. ( Status Conference set for 2/9/2015 at 01:00 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 12/18/2014) (ama) (Entered: 12/19/2014)
01/21/2015	<u>272</u>	ORDER: The conference previously scheduled for Monday, February 9, 2015 is hereby rescheduled for Friday, February 20, 2015 at 12:00 p.m., ( Status Conference set for 2/20/2015 at 12:00 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 1/21/2015) (lmb) (Entered: 01/21/2015)
02/19/2015	<u>273</u>	FIRST LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from All Parties dated 02/18/2015. Document filed by Courtney B., Verna Eggleston, Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.(Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 02/19/2015)
02/19/2015	<u>274</u>	ORDER granting <u>273</u> Letter Motion to Adjourn Conference addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from All Parties dated 02/18/2015. Ordered. O.K... but... let's wrap it up! Conference adjourned to 2/26/15 at 1 pm. (Status Conference set for 2/26/2015 at 01:00 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 2/19/2015) (kko) Modified on 2/20/2015 (kko). (Entered: 02/19/2015)
02/20/2015	<u>275</u>	ORDER: The conference scheduled for Thursday, February 26, 2015 is hereby RESCHEDULED to 10:00 a.m. that same day., ( Status Conference set for 2/26/2015 at 10:00 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 2/20/2015) (lmb) (Entered: 02/23/2015)
02/25/2015	<u>276</u>	ORDER: Due to unforeseen circumstances, the Court must RESCHEDULE the conference, previously scheduled for February 26, 2015, to Monday, March 2, 2015 at 10:30 a.m., ( Status Conference set for 3/2/2015 at 10:30 AM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 2/25/2015) (lmb) (Entered: 02/25/2015)
02/26/2015	<u>277</u>	JOINT LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Asst. Corporation Counsel Jonathan Pines dated February 26, 2015. Document filed by Verna Eggleston.(Pines, Jonathan) (Entered: 02/26/2015)
02/27/2015	<u>278</u>	ORDER granting <u>277</u> Letter Motion to Adjourn Conference. Ordered. Great news! Conference adjourned to 3/11/15 at 4PM. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 2/27/2015) (kl) (Entered: 02/27/2015)
03/10/2015	<u>279</u>	JOINT MOTION to Approve Notice in Class Action . Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A: Proposed Fairness Hearing Notice, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B: Proposed Order)(Rosinus, David) (Entered: 03/10/2015)
03/11/2015	<u>280</u>	ORDER APPROVING NOTICE IN CLASS ACTION: granting <u>279</u> Motion to Approve Notice in Class Action. IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT: 1. The Fairness



		Hearing Notice that is attached as Exhibit A to the parties' Motion for an Order Approving Notice in a Class Action, dated March 10, 2015, shall be displayed in Job Centers and WeCARE sites and posted on the respective web sites of the New York City Human Resources Administration and the Legal Aid Society from May 1, 2015 through June 1, 2015. 2. The Court finds that completion of this display and web posting of the Notice constitutes reasonable notice to class members who will be bound by the settlement of this class action pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(c)(2) & (e)(1). 3. Objections by class members will be considered if filed in writing at the address specified in the Notice on or before June 1, 2015, which date is twenty-one days before the fairness hearing that the Court is scheduling in paragraph 4 below pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(e)(2) ("the Fairness Hearing"), or, if the Court grants permission, if stated orally at the Fairness Hearing. Plaintiffs' counsel will make copies of each written objection received and will provide a copy to Defendant's counsel. 4. Plaintiffs' counsel shall also furnish the Court with copies of all written objections received, and counsel for the Parties may, if they so choose, furnish the Court with written submissions responding to any or all of those objections by June 15, 2015, which date shall be seven days before the Fairness Hearing. 5. The Court will hold the Fairness Hearing, to consider whether the proposed settlement is fair, reasonable, and adequate, on June 22, 2015 at 1 p.m. at the Daniel Patrick Moynihan Courthouse, 500 Pearl Street, Courtroom 15A, New York, New York 10007. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 3/11/2015) (lmb) Modified on 3/11/2015 (lmb). Modified on 3/11/2015 (lmb). (Entered: 03/11/2015)
03/11/2015		Set/Reset Hearings: Fairness Hearing set for 6/22/2015 at 01:00 PM before Judge Katherine B. Forrest. (lmb) (Entered: 03/11/2015)
03/11/2015	<u>281</u>	ORDER: The Court has reviewed the Proposed Stipulation and Order of Settlement (see attached) and preliminarily approves it, subject to the fairness hearing. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 3/11/2015) (tn) (Entered: 03/11/2015)
03/11/2015		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Status Conference held on 3/11/2015. (jp) (Entered: 03/13/2015)
03/23/2015	<u>282</u>	NOTICE of Proposed Class Action Settlement Under 28 U.S.C. § 1715. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A: Complaint, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B: Amended Complaint, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C: Order Approving Notice in Class Action, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D: Proposed Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(e)(1) Notice, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E: Proposed Stipulation and Order of Settlement)(Rosinus, David) (Entered: 03/23/2015)
03/23/2015	<u>283</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Notice of Proposed Class Action Settlement Under 28 U.S.C. § 1715 served on federal and state attorneys general on March 20, 2015. Service was made by mail. Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Rosinus, David) (Entered: 03/23/2015)
05/18/2015	<u>284</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Neil Anthony Giovanatti on behalf of Verna Eggleston. (Giovanatti, Neil) (Entered: 05/18/2015)
05/18/2015	<u>285</u>	FIRST LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>for Class Members to File Comments</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kenneth Stephens dated May 18, 2015. Document filed by Lovely H..(Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 05/18/2015)
05/19/2015	<u>286</u>	ORDER granting <u>285</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. Application granted. Modifications as set forth above accepted. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 5/19/2015) (lmb) (Entered: 05/19/2015)
05/22/2015		<b>***DELETED DOCUMENT. Deleted document number <u>287</u> Order. The document was incorrectly filed in this case. (jp)</b> (Entered: 05/22/2015)
06/15/2015	<u>287</u>	FIRST LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kenneth Stephens dated June 15,2015 re: No Objections to Proposed Settlement. Document filed by Lovely H..(Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 06/15/2015)
06/19/2015	<u>288</u>	DECLARATION of Jacquelyn Flaum <i>showing compliance with Order entered on March 11, 2015 (Dkt. No. 280), as modified by Memo Endorsed Order dated May 19, 2015 (Dkt. No. 286)</i> . Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Giovanatti, Neil) (Entered: 06/19/2015)

06/19/2015	<u>289</u>	DECLARATION of Anthony Wade <i>showing compliance with Order entered on March 11, 2015 (Dkt. No. 280), as modified by Memo Endorsed Order dated May 19, 2015 (Dkt. No. 286)</i> . Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Giovanatti, Neil) (Entered: 06/19/2015)
06/19/2015	<u>290</u>	DECLARATION of Julie Schaeffer <i>showing compliance with Order entered on March 11, 2015 (Dkt. No. 280), as modified by Memo Endorsed Order dated May 19, 2015 (Dkt. No. 286)</i> . Document filed by Verna Eggleston. (Giovanatti, Neil) (Entered: 06/19/2015)
06/19/2015	<u>291</u>	<b>FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY</b> – MOTION for Settlement Approval. Document filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. Return Date set for 6/22/2015 at 01:00 PM. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit)(Kelleher, Kathleen) Modified on 6/22/2015 (db). (Entered: 06/19/2015)
06/22/2015		<b>***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – DEFICIENT DOCKET ENTRY ERROR. Notice to Attorney Kathleen Mary Kelleher to RE-FILE Document <u>291</u> MOTION for Settlement Approval. ERROR(S): Supporting Documents are filed separately, each receiving their own document #. (db)</b> (Entered: 06/22/2015)
06/22/2015	<u>292</u>	MOTION for Settlement Approval. Document filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. Return Date set for 6/22/2015 at 01:00 PM.(Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 06/22/2015)
06/22/2015	<u>293</u>	DECLARATION of Kathleen M. Kelleher in Support re: <u>292</u> MOTION for Settlement Approval.. Document filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. (Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 06/22/2015)
06/22/2015	<u>294</u>	JUDGMENT APPROVING CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED THAT: 1. The Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this Action and personal jurisdiction over Plaintiffs and Defendant. 2. The Court hereby grants Plaintiffs' Motion for Final Approval of Class Action Settlement and enters Final Judgment in the Action. 3. The Settlement Agreement is approved as fair, reasonable, and adequate, and in the best interests of the members of the Class. The Parties to the Settlement Agreement are directed to consummate the Settlement Agreement in accordance with its terms and provisions. 4. The Settlement Agreement is procedurally fair, resulting from arm's-length negotiations by the parties for a period of sixteen months. 5. The Settlement Agreement is substantively fair and meets the criteria set forth by the Second Circuit in <i>City of Detroit v. Grinnell Corp.</i> , 495 F.2d 448 (2d Cir. 1974) as further set forth in this order. 7. The Parties have stipulated to negotiate the amount of counsel fees and costs pursuant to paragraph 148 of the Settlement and have also stipulated that, that if the parties fail to reach agreement on an amount within 90 days of the Effective Date as defined in paragraph of the Settlement Agreement, Plaintiffs may submit an application for counsel fees and costs to the Court. 8.This Court shall retain jurisdiction over this Action to the extent set forth by the provisions of paragraphs 138–147 of the Settlement Agreement. 9. There is no just reason for delay in the entry of this Judgment. Immediate entry of Final Judgment by the Clerk of the Court is expressly directed pursuant to Rule 54(b) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 6/22/2015) (lmb) (Entered: 06/22/2015)
06/22/2015		Terminate Transcript Deadlines (lmb) (Entered: 06/22/2015)
06/22/2015	<u>295</u>	ORDER: On June 22, 2015, the Court approved the parties proposed settlement. Although the issue of attorneys fees remains open, it does not prevent the termination of this action. The parties have worked diligently for a full decade to reach this landmark agreement. At long last, the Clerk of Court is directed to terminate this action. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 6/22/2015) (ama) (Entered: 06/22/2015)
06/22/2015		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Katherine B. Forrest: Fairness Hearing held on 6/22/2015. (jp) (Entered: 06/24/2015)
08/24/2015	<u>296</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Thomas B. Roberts on behalf of Verna Eggleston. (Roberts, Thomas) (Entered: 08/24/2015)

10/20/2015	<u>297</u>	SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT – <i>Letter Requesting Extension of Certain Settlement Agreement Deadlines; Stipulation</i> . Document filed by Courtney B., Verna Eggleston, Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order Stipulation requested to be So Ordered)(Welber, Susan) (Entered: 10/20/2015)
10/22/2015	<u>298</u>	STIPULATION: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, BY AND BETWEEN THE UNDERSIGNED, AS FOLLOWS: 1. Amending the timeline in Paragraph 122. The parties agree to amend the timeline in paragraph 122 of the Settlement by striking the phrase: "Within 90 days of the Effective date" from Paragraph 122 of the Settlement, and substituting the phrase "On or before January 22, 2016" as further set forth in this order. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 10/21/2015) (lmb) (Entered: 10/22/2015)
10/22/2015	<u>299</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>297</u> Settlement Agreement, filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Gloria Q., Eula S., Michele N., Laura S., Verna Eggleston. ENDORSEMENT: Post on docket. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 10/21/2015) (lmb) (Entered: 10/22/2015)
01/20/2016	<u>300</u>	SECOND LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>Of Certain Deadlines in Settlement</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen Kelleher On Behalf of the Parties dated 01/20/2016. Document filed by Courtney B., Verna Eggleston, Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Stipulation)(Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 01/20/2016)
01/21/2016	<u>301</u>	ORDER granting <u>300</u> SECOND LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time Of Certain Deadlines in Settlement addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen Kelleher On Behalf of the Parties dated 01/20/2016. Document filed by Courtney B., Verna Eggleston, Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S. So ordered. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 1/20/2016) (rjm) (Entered: 01/21/2016)
04/20/2016	<u>302</u>	THIRD LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>of One Deadline in Settlement</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen Kelleher On Behalf of the Parties dated 04/20/2016. Document filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Stipulation)(Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 04/20/2016)
04/21/2016	<u>303</u>	ORDER granting <u>302</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. So ordered. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 4/20/2016) (lmb) (Entered: 04/21/2016)
04/21/2016	<u>304</u>	STIPULATION: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, BY AND BETWEEN THE UNDERSIGNED, AS FOLLOWS: 1. Amending Paragraph 130. The parties agree to amend the timeline in paragraph 130 of the Settlement by amending the phrase: "on or before April 22, 2016" to "on or before June 3, 2016" so that Paragraph 130 of the Settlement shall read: The parties will jointly develop a protocol for monitoring the Defendants' compliance with the terms of this Stipulation ("Monitoring Protocol") on or before June 3, 2016, which shall be submitted to the Court and deemed incorporated into this Stipulation. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 4/20/2016) (lmb) (Entered: 04/21/2016)
06/01/2016	<u>305</u>	FOURTH LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>of Certain Deadlines in Settlement</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen Kelleher On Behalf of the Parties dated June 1, 2016. Document filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Stipulation)(Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 06/01/2016)
06/02/2016	<u>306</u>	STIPULATION: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, BY AND BETWEEN THE UNDERSIGNED, AS FOLLOWS: 1. Amending Paragraph 130, The parties agree to amend the timeline in paragraph 130 of the Settlement by amending the phrase: "on or before June 3, 2016" to "on or before July 22, 2016" so that Paragraph 130 of the Settlement shall read:The parties will jointly develop a protocol for monitoring the Defendants' compliance with the terms of this Stipulation ("Monitoring Protocol") on or before July 22, 2016, which shall be submitted to the Court and deemed incorporated into this Stipulation. 2. Amending Paragraph 148,The parties agree to amend the timeline in paragraph 148 of the Settlement by amending the phrase: "on or before July 22, 2016" to "on or before October 21, 2016" so that paragraph 148 shall read: Defendant agrees that Plaintiffs are entitled to reasonable

		counsel fees and costs as though they are prevailing parties. The Parties agree to attempt to negotiate the amount of such counsel fees and costs. If they are unable to agree on an amount on or before October 21, 2016, Plaintiffs may submit an application for counsel fees and costs to the Court, and Defendant reserves the right to respond to such an application in a manner that is consistent with this paragraph., Motions terminated: <u>305</u> FOURTH LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time of <i>Certain Deadlines in Settlement</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen Kelleher On Behalf of the Parties dated June 1, 2016. filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Gloria Q., Eula S., Michele N., Laura S. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 6/1/2016) (lmb) (Entered: 06/02/2016)
07/20/2016	<u>307</u>	FIFTH LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time of <i>Certain Deadlines in Settlement</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen Kelleher On Behalf of the Parties dated July 20, 2016. Document filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Stipulation)(Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 07/20/2016)
07/22/2016	<u>308</u>	STIPULATION: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, BY AND BETWEEN THE UNDERSIGNED, AS FOLLOWS: 1. Amending Paragraph 130. The parties agree to amend the timeline in paragraph 130 of the Settlement by amending the phrase: "on or before July 22, 2016" to "on or before October 21, 2016" so that Paragraph 130 of the Settlement shall read: The parties will jointly develop a protocol for monitoring the Defendants' compliance with the terms of this Stipulation ("Monitoring Protocol") on or before October 21, 2016, which shall be submitted to the Court and deemed incorporated into this Stipulation. (As further set forth in this order.), Motions terminated: <u>307</u> FIFTH LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time of <i>Certain Deadlines in Settlement</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen Kelleher On Behalf of the Parties dated July 20, 2016. filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Gloria Q., Eula S., Michele N., Laura S. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 7/22/2016) (lmb) (Entered: 07/22/2016)
10/19/2016	<u>309</u>	FIFTH LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time of <i>Certain Deadlines in Settlement</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen Kelleher On Behalf of the Parties dated October 19, 2016. Document filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Stipulation)(Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 10/19/2016)
10/20/2016	<u>310</u>	STIPULATION: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, BY AND BETWEEN THE UNDERSIGNED AS FOLLOWS: Amending Paragraph 130 & 148 of the Settlement, as further set for in the order. If they are unable to agree on an amount on or before March 31, 2017, Plaintiffs may submit an application for counsel fees and cost to the Court. (Motions terminated: <u>309</u> FIFTH LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time of <i>Certain Deadlines in Settlement</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen Kelleher On Behalf of the Parties dated October 19, 2016. filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Gloria Q., Eula S., Michele N., Laura S.) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 10/20/2016) (cla) Modified on 11/14/2016 (cla). (Entered: 10/20/2016)
10/20/2016		Set/Reset Deadlines: Motions due by 3/31/2017. (cla) (Entered: 11/14/2016)
12/20/2016	<u>311</u>	SEVENTH LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time Of <i>Certain Deadlines in Settlement</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen Kelleher On Behalf of the Parties dated December 20, 2016. Document filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Stipulation dated December 20, 2016)(Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 12/20/2016)
12/21/2016	<u>313</u>	ORDER granting <u>311</u> SEVENTH LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time Of <i>Certain Deadlines in Settlement</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen Kelleher On Behalf of the Parties dated December 20, 2016. Document filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S. So ordered. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 12/21/2016) (rjm) (Entered: 02/08/2017)
12/22/2016	<u>312</u>	STIPULATION: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, BY AND BETWEEN THE UNDERSIGNED, AS FOLLOWS: The Stipulation of Settlement is amended as further set out in the order. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 12/21/2016) (cla) (Entered: 12/22/2016)

02/17/2017	<u>314</u>	EIGHTH LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>Of Certain Deadlines in Settlement</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen Kelleher On Behalf of the Parties dated February 17, 2017. Document filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Stipulation)(Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 02/17/2017)
02/21/2017	<u>315</u>	STIPULATION: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, BY AND BETWEEN THE UNDERSIGNED, AS FOLLOWS: 1. Amending Paragraph 130. The parties agree to amend the timeline in paragraph 130 of the Settlement by amending the phrase: "on or before February 21, 2017" to "on or before February 28, 2017" so that Paragraph 130 of the Settlement shall read: The parties will jointly develop a protocol for monitoring the Defendants' compliance with the terms of this Stipulation ("Monitoring Protocol") on or before February 28, 2017, which shall be submitted to the Court and deemed incorporated into this Stipulation. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 2/21/2017) (cla) (Entered: 02/21/2017)
03/01/2017	<u>316</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen Kelleher On Behalf of the Parties dated 03/01/2017 re: Monitoring Stipulation. Document filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Monitoring Stipulation)(Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 03/01/2017)
03/01/2017	<u>317</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER: The obligations in this stipulation shall terminate and end at the same time the jurisdiction of the Court shall terminate. HRA shall provide all reports described herein to Plaintiffs within sixty (60) days of the last day of the applicable reporting period. If HRA is unable to deliver a report described herein to Plaintiffs within sixty (60) days of the last day of the applicable reporting period, HRA shall inform Plaintiffs that the issuance of the report is delayed and provide Plaintiffs with a date that the report will be produced to Plaintiffs. The obligations set forth in this stipulation satisfy all of HRA's monitoring and The obligations set forth in this stipulation satisfy all of HRA's monitoring and communication obligations as set forth in paragraphs 120–122 and 130–135 of the Final Settlement. In the event of a dispute as to compliance with this stipulation, the provisions of 141–143 of the Final Settlement shall apply. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 3/1/2017) (cla) (Entered: 03/02/2017)
05/11/2017	<u>318</u>	NINTH LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>Of Certain Deadlines in Settlement</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen Kelleher On Behalf of the Parties dated May 11, 2017. Document filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Stipulation)(Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 05/11/2017)
05/12/2017	<u>319</u>	STIPULATION. IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, BY AND BETWEEN THE UNDERSIGNED, AS FOLLOWS: 1. Amending Paragraph 148 The parties agree to amend the timeline in paragraph 148 of the Settlement by amending the phrase: "on or before May 31, 2017" so that paragraph 148 shall read: Defendant agrees that Plaintiffs are entitled to reasonable counsel fees and costs as though they are prevailing parties. The Parties agree to attempt to negotiate the amount of such counsel fees and costs. If they are unable to agree on an amount on or before August 31, 2017, Plaintiffs may submit an application for counsel fees and costs to the Court, and Defendant reserves the right to respond to such an application in a manner that is consistent with this paragraph. Motions terminated: <u>318</u> NINTH LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>Of Certain Deadlines in Settlement</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen Kelleher On Behalf of the Parties dated May 11, 2017. Document filed by Courtney B., Lovely H., Michele N., Gloria Q., Eula S., Laura S. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 5/12/2017) (rjm) (Entered: 05/12/2017)
08/23/2017	<u>320</u>	TENTH LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>Of Certain Deadlines</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen Kelleher, On Behalf of the Parties dated 08/23/2017. Document filed by Lovely H.. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Stipulation)(Kelleher, Kathleen) (Entered: 08/23/2017)
08/24/2017	<u>321</u>	ORDER granting <u>320</u> TENTH LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>Of Certain Deadlines</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kathleen Kelleher, On Behalf of the Parties dated 08/23/2017. Document filed by Lovely H. Ordered. OK. I'll grant this extension but this is the final extension. Any motion for fees (if there is no settlement) shall be filed not later than Nov. 27, 2017; any opposition shall be filed not

		later than Dec. 22, 2017; any reply by Jan. 8, 2018. (Motions due by 11/27/2017). (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 8/24/2017) (rjm) (Entered: 08/24/2017)
08/24/2017		Set/Reset Deadlines: Responses due by 12/22/2017. Replies due by 1/8/2018. (rjm) (Entered: 08/24/2017)
11/08/2017	<u>322</u>	JOINT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>for Plaintiffs to move for attorney's fees and expenses</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Thomas B. Roberts dated November 8, 2017. Document filed by Verna Eggleston.(Roberts, Thomas) (Entered: 11/08/2017)
11/09/2017	<u>323</u>	ORDER granting <u>322</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. So Ordered. (But at some point we have to come to a close on this...) (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 11/9/17) (yv) (Entered: 11/09/2017)
01/09/2018	<u>324</u>	CONSENT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Stipulation Settling Attorneys' Fees</i> addressed to Judge Katherine B. Forrest from Kenneth Stephens dated 01/09/2018. Document filed by Lovely H..(Stephens, Kenneth) (Entered: 01/09/2018)
01/10/2018	<u>325</u>	ORDER: granting <u>324</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 1/10/2018) (ap) (Entered: 01/10/2018)
01/26/2018	<u>326</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER OF SETTLEMENT OF ATTORNEYS' FEES, COSTS, AND DISBURSEMENTS: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND ORDERED: The City of New York, on behalf of Defendant, shall pay the gross sum of six million, five hundred thousand dollars and no cents (\$6,500,000.00) (the "Fee Payment") to Class Counsel; and Class Plaintiffs and Class Counsel agree to accept the Fee Payment in full satisfaction of all claims for attorneys' fees, costs, and disbursements that have been or will be incurred in connection with this Action against the City of New York and/or Defendant, incurred at any time prior to the entry of this Fee Stipulation as "so ordered," including without limitation all past, present and future officials, employees, departments, agencies, representatives, directors and agents of either the City of New York or HRA, their successors and assigns and their respective heirs, executors, administrators, personal representatives, and transferees, and each of them ("City Entities or Individuals")...This Fee Stipulation may be executed in counterparts, and a signature received by facsimile or email shall be deemed valid for all purposes. (Signed by Judge Katherine B. Forrest on 1/26/2018) (ras) (Entered: 01/26/2018)