

**U.S. District Court
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:11-cv-06690-JMF**

Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled et al v. de
Blasio et al
Assigned to: Judge Jesse M. Furman
Referred to: Magistrate Judge Frank Maas (Settlement)
Cause: 42:12112 Americans with Disabilities Act –
Employment Discrimination

Date Filed: 09/26/2011
Date Terminated: 03/06/2015
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 446 Civil Rights:
Americans with Disabilities – Other
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

**Brooklyn Center for Independence of
the Disabled**
a nonprofit organization

represented by **Christine Hsiao-Ting Chuang**
Disability Rights Advocates
2001 Center Street
Berkeley, CA 94704
(510)-665-8644
Fax: (510)-665-8511
Email: cchuang@dralegal.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Daniel L. Brown
Sheppard, Mullin, Richter & Hampton,
LLP (NYC)
30 Rockefeller Plaza, 24th Fl.
New York, NY 10112
(212)-332-3879
Fax: (212)-332-3888
Email: dlbrown@sheppardmullin.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jelena Kolic
Legal Momentum
5 Hanover Square
Suite 1501
New York, NY 10005
(312)-806-4678
Email: jkolic@dralegal.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Julia Miriam Pinover
Disabilities Right Advocates
40 Worth Street, 10th Floor
New York, NY 10013
(212) 644-8644
Fax: (212) 644-8636
Email: jpinover@dralegal.org
TERMINATED: 01/12/2015

Mary-Lee Kimber Smith
Disability Rights Advocates
2001 Center Street, 3rd Floor
Berkeley, CA 94704
(510) 665-8644
Fax: (510) 665-8511
Email: mkimber@dralegal.org
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rebecca Catherine Serbin
Disabilities Right Advocates
675 Third Ave., Ste. 2216

New York, NY 10017
(212) 644-8644
Fax: (212) 644-8636
Email: rserbin@dralegal.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rebecca Susanne Williford
Disability Rights Advocates
2001 Center Street
3rd Floor
Berkeley, CA 94704
510-665-8644
Fax: 510-665-8511
Email: rwilliford@dralegal.org
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shawna Leigh Parks
Disability Rights Advocates
2001 Center Street
Berkeley, CA 94704
(510) 665-8644
Fax: (510) 665-8511
Email: sparks@dralegal.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sid Wolinsky
Disability Rights Advocates
2001 Center Street, 4th floor
Berkeley, CA 94704
(510)-665-8644
Fax: (510)-665-8511
Email: swolinsky@dralegal.org
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Tania Morales

represented by **Christine Hsiao-Ting Chuang**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Daniel L. Brown
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jelena Kolic
Legal Momentum
5 Hanover Square
Suite 1501
New York, NY 10005
(312)-806-4678
Email: jkolic@legalmomentum.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Julia Miriam Pinover
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 01/12/2015

Mary-Lee Kimber Smith
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rebecca Catherine Serbin

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rebecca Susanne Williford
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shawna Leigh Parks
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sid Wolinsky
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

**Center for Independence of the
Disabled, New York**
a nonprofit organization

represented by **Christine Hsiao–Ting Chuang**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Daniel L. Brown
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jelena Kolic
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Julia Miriam Pinover
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 01/12/2015

Mary–Lee Kimber Smith
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rebecca Catherine Serbin
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rebecca Susanne Williford
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shawna Leigh Parks
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sid Wolinsky
(See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Gregory D. Bell

represented by **Christine Hsiao–Ting Chuang**
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Daniel L. Brown
(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jelena Kolic

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Julia Miriam Pinover

(See above for address)

TERMINATED: 01/12/2015

Mary-Lee Kimber Smith

(See above for address)

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rebecca Catherine Serbin

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Rebecca Susanne Williford

(See above for address)

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Shawna Leigh Parks

(See above for address)

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Sid Wolinsky

(See above for address)

PRO HAC VICE

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Michael R. Bloomberg

*in his official capacity as Mayor of the
City of New York*

TERMINATED: 02/09/2015

represented by **Mark Galen Toews**
NYC Law Department
100 Church Street Room 3-212
New York, NY 10007
(212) 356-0871
Fax: (212)-788-8877
Email: mtoews@law.nyc.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Martha Anne Calhoun

NYC Law Department, Office of the
Corporation Counsel (NYC)

100 Church Street

New York, NY 10007

212-356-0856

Fax: 212-356-1148

Email: mcalhoun@law.nyc.gov

LEAD ATTORNEY

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Carolyn Elizabeth Kruk

NYC Law Department

100 Church Street Rm.

New York, NY 10007

(212)-356-0893

Fax: (212)-788-0940

Email: ckruk@law.nyc.gov

ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant**The City of New York**

represented by **Mark Galen Toews**
 (See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Martha Anne Calhoun
 (See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Carolyn Elizabeth Kruk
 (See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant**Bill de Blasio**

represented by **Carolyn Elizabeth Kruk**
 (See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Mark Galen Toews
 NYC Law Department
 100 Church Street, RM2-171
 New York, NY 10007
 (212) 356-0871
 Fax: (212)-788-8877
 Email: mtoews@law.nyc.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Miscellaneous

The American Red Cross
TERMINATED: 06/29/2012

represented by **Teresa L. Jakubowski**
 Barnes & Thornburg LLP
 1717 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
 Washington, DC 20006
 202-371-6366
 Fax: 202-289-1330
 Email: teresa.jakubowski@btlaw.com
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Interested Party**United States Of America**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
09/26/2011	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York. (Filing Fee \$ 350.00, Receipt Number 465401017348) Document filed by Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Tania Morales.(rdz) (ama). (Entered: 09/27/2011)
09/26/2011		SUMMONS ISSUED as to Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York. (rdz) (Entered: 09/27/2011)
09/26/2011		Magistrate Judge Frank Maas is so designated. (rdz) (Entered: 09/27/2011)
09/26/2011		Case Designated ECF. (rdz) (Entered: 09/27/2011)

09/26/2011	<u>2</u>	RULE 7.1 CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. No Corporate Parent. Document filed by Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(rdz) (rdz). (Entered: 09/27/2011)
10/17/2011	<u>3</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Martha Anne Calhoun on behalf of Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York (Calhoun, Martha) (Entered: 10/17/2011)
10/17/2011	<u>4</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York.(Calhoun, Martha) (Entered: 10/17/2011)
10/19/2011	<u>5</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,. Michael R. Bloomberg served on 9/26/2011, answer due 10/17/2011. Service was accepted by Brandon James. Document filed by Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York ; Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled; Tania Morales. (Pinover, Julia) (Entered: 10/19/2011)
10/19/2011	<u>6</u>	AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Complaint,. The City of New York served on 9/26/2011, answer due 10/17/2011. Service was accepted by Brandon James. Document filed by Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York ; Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled; Tania Morales. (Pinover, Julia) (Entered: 10/19/2011)
10/19/2011	<u>7</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Mark Galen Toews on behalf of Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York (Toews, Mark) (Entered: 10/19/2011)
10/21/2011	<u>8</u>	MOTION for Mary-Lee Kimber Smith to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Document filed by Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(wb) (pgu). (Entered: 10/24/2011)
10/21/2011	<u>9</u>	MOTION for Sid Wolinsky to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Document filed by Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(wb) (pgu). (Entered: 10/24/2011)
10/25/2011		CASHIERS OFFICE REMARK on <u>9</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice, <u>8</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice in the amount of \$400.00, paid on 10/21/2011, Receipt Number 1019856,1019857. (jd) (Entered: 10/25/2011)
12/14/2011	<u>10</u>	Initial Scheduling Conference Notice and Order: Initial Conference set for 1/27/2012 at 10:00 AM in Courtroom 17B, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Richard J. Holwell, and as further set forth in this document. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 12/12/2011) (cd) (Entered: 12/14/2011)
12/20/2011	<u>11</u>	ORDER FOR ADMISSION PRO HAC VICE granting <u>8</u> Motion for Mary-Lee Kimber Smith to Appear Pro Hac Vice. It is hereby Ordered that Mary-Lee Kimber Smith is admitted pro hac vice as counsel for the plaintiffs. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 12/19/2011) (mro) (Entered: 12/20/2011)
12/20/2011	<u>12</u>	ORDER FOR ADMISSION PRO HAC VICE granting <u>9</u> Motion for Sid Wolinsky to Appear Pro Hac Vice. It is hereby Ordered that Sid Wolinsky is admitted to practice pro hac vice as counsel for the plaintiffs. (Signed by Judge Richard J. Holwell on 12/19/2011) (mro) (Entered: 12/20/2011)
02/14/2012	<u>13</u>	MOTION for Rebecca Williford to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Document filed by Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(sjo) (Entered: 02/14/2012)
02/16/2012		CASHIERS OFFICE REMARK on <u>13</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice in the amount of \$200.00, paid on 02/10/2012, Receipt Number 1029482. (jd) (Entered: 02/16/2012)
02/24/2012	<u>14</u>	CASE MANAGEMENT PLAN AND SCHEDULING ORDER: Amended Pleadings due by 2/1/2012. Joinder of Parties due by 2/1/2012. Fact Discovery due by 2/10/2012. Expert Discovery due by 8/24/2012. Dispositive Motions due by 10/5/2012. Plaintiffs motion for class certification due by 7/27/2012. Final Pretrial Order due by 11/2/2012. The parties do not request a jury and anticipate a trial of two weeks. Ready for Trial by 12/3/2012. (Signed by Judge Loretta A. Preska on 2/23/2012) (ab) (Entered: 02/24/2012)

02/24/2012	<u>15</u>	ORDER REFERRING CASE TO MAGISTRATE JUDGE. Order that case be referred to the Clerk of Court for assignment to a Magistrate Judge for Settlement. Referred to Magistrate Judge Frank Maas. (Signed by Judge Loretta A. Preska on 2/23/2012) (ab) (Entered: 02/24/2012)
02/24/2012	<u>16</u>	ORDER FOR ADMISSION PRO HAC VICE granting <u>13</u> Motion for Rebecca Williford to Appear Pro Hac Vice as counsel for Plaintiffs. (Signed by Judge Loretta A. Preska on 2/23/2012) (ab) (Entered: 02/24/2012)
02/28/2012		MEMORANDUM TO THE DOCKET CLERK: REMINDER : The conference scheduled for [03/02/11] at [10:00 am] "is adjourned sine die." Before the Honorable: Richard J. Holwell U.S.D.J. in courtroom 17-B 500 Pearl Street NYC. Due to the Judges Retirement all conferences are being rescheduled and an alternate conference date will be set in the near future. (tro) (Entered: 02/28/2012)
03/08/2012	<u>17</u>	STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER...regarding procedures to be followed that shall govern the handling of confidential material...This stipulation binds the parties to treat as confidential the documents so classified. The Court, however, has not reviewed the documents referenced herein; therefore, by so ordering this sttpulation, the Court makes no finding as to whether the documents are confidential. That finding will be made, if ever, upon a document-by-document review. Moreover, the Court does NOT so order 9/14, which purports to authorize the parties to file documents under seal without a prior court order. (Signed by Judge Denise L. Cote, Part I on 3/7/2012) (cd) (Entered: 03/08/2012)
03/14/2012	<u>18</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Daniel L. Brown on behalf of Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales (Brown, Daniel) (Entered: 03/14/2012)
03/29/2012	<u>19</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Frank Maas from Julia Pinover dated 3/28/2012 re: Counsel for the Plaintiffs writes to request that the mediation conference scheduled for 4/18/2012 be adjourned until 4/19/2012 at 2:00 PM. ENDORSEMENT: Approved. (Mediation Conference set for 4/19/2012 at 02:00 PM before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas.) (Signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas on 3/29/2012) (ab) (Entered: 03/29/2012)
04/16/2012	<u>20</u>	NOTICE OF CASE REASSIGNMENT to Judge Jesse M. Furman. Judge Richard J. Holwell is no longer assigned to the case. (pgu) (Entered: 04/16/2012)
04/19/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas: Settlement Conference held on 4/19/2012. (rjm) (Entered: 04/20/2012)
04/24/2012	<u>21</u>	ORDER: WHEREAS this case was recently transferred to the undersigned, it is hereby ORDERED that unless notified otherwise by the Court, any Scheduling Order or Case Management Plan remains in effect not withstanding the case's transfer, except that any currently scheduled conference or oral argument with the Court is adjourned until further notification.IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that each party must submit a letter to the Court, not to exceed five pages, updating the Court on the status of the case no later than May 9, 2012. The parties are directed to the Court's applicable Individual Rules and Practices (available at http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judge/Furman) regarding the submission of letters. The status letter should include the following: (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 4/24/2012) (js) (Entered: 04/25/2012)
04/30/2012	<u>22</u>	MOTION for Shawna Leigh Parks to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Document filed by Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(arc) (Entered: 05/02/2012)
05/03/2012	<u>23</u>	ORDER FOR ADMISSION PRO HAC VICE granting <u>22</u> Motion for Shawna Leigh Parks to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 5/3/2012) (cd) (Entered: 05/04/2012)
05/07/2012		CASHIERS OFFICE REMARK on <u>22</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice in the amount of \$200.00, paid on 04/30/2012, Receipt Number 1036803. (jd) (Entered: 05/07/2012)
05/14/2012	<u>24</u>	ENDORSED LETTER: addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Martha A. Calhoun dated 5/9/2012 re: Counsel writes pursuant to Your Honor's order order dated April 24, 2012, to apprise the Court of the status of this case As indicated on the docket, defendants are represented by Michael A. Cardozo, Corporation Counsel of the City of

		New York by Assistant Corporation Counsel Martha A. Calhoun and Mark G. Toews. The contact information for Ms. Calhoun is correct on the docket. The contact information for Mr. Toews should be corrected as follows: Mark G. Toews New York City Law Department 100 Church Street New York, New York 10007 Tel: 212 788-1281 Fax: 212-788-8877 Email: mtoews@law.nyc.gov. ENDORSEMENT: All counsel must promptly take steps to ensure that the contact information on CM/ECF is accurate. The parties shall appear for a conference on June 29, 2012 at 11:00 a.m. All other dates and deadlines remain in effect. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 5/14/2012) (js) (Entered: 05/15/2012)
05/14/2012	<u>25</u>	Letter addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Sid Wolinsky dated 5/9/2012 re: We write this status letter pursuant to your order of April 24, 2012. Plaintiffs' counsel has experience negotiating with cities and counties regarding the same issues that are presented by the instant case. Plaintiffs believe that the most effective basis for settlement is to involve a neutral expert who can evaluate the City's plans and provide a clear road map of the plans' deficiencies in a process-based solution. (js) (Entered: 05/15/2012)
05/25/2012	<u>27</u>	MOTION for Teresa L. Jakubowski to Appear Pro Hac Vice. Document filed by The American Red Cross.(pgu) (Entered: 05/31/2012)
05/29/2012	<u>26</u>	NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Mark Galen Toews on behalf of Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York. New Address: New York City Law Department, 100 Church Street, New York, New York, U.S.A. 10007, 212-788-0800. (Toews, Mark) (Entered: 05/29/2012)
06/05/2012		CASHIERS OFFICE REMARK on <u>27</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice in the amount of \$200.00, paid on 05/25/2012, Receipt Number 1039398. (jd) (Entered: 06/05/2012)
06/11/2012	<u>28</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Martha A. Calhoun dated 6/7/2012 re: Defendants respectfully request that the Court deny plaintiffs request to compel depositions and schedule a conference to discuss the issues. ENDORSEMENT: In light of Plaintiff's failure to meet and confer as required by the Court's Individual Rules, and their representation that they would provide defendants with a proposed amended complaint by today, plaintiffs' request for an Order compelling discovery is DENIED. Should there be any disputes requiring the Court's involvement after plaintiffs have provided their proposed amended complaint to defendants, or should the parties desire any changes to the existing schedule, either party may communicate with the Court – after conferring with opposing counsel – in accordance with the Court's Individual Rules. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 6/11/2012) (jfe) (Entered: 06/11/2012)
06/11/2012	<u>29</u>	Letter addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Sid Wolinsky dated 6/7/2012 re: Plaintiffs are writing to the court at this time because Defendants have repeatedly refused to produce properly noticed deposition witnesses. Defendants' self-help approach has delayed the orderly progress of the case and prejudiced Plaintiffs in the preparation of their case. Counsel respectfully ask the court at this time to order that Defendants produce their witnesses for the depositions previously noticed for June 11 and 12. Plaintiffs request that the court order Defendants to make such witnesses available for deposition within 7 calendar days. (jfe) (Entered: 06/11/2012)
06/11/2012	<u>30</u>	ORDER granting <u>27</u> Motion for Teresa L. Jakubowski to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 6/11/2012) (ama) (Entered: 06/12/2012)
06/29/2012	<u>31</u>	FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT amending <u>1</u> Complaint, against Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York. Document filed by Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Tania Morales, Gregory D. Bell. Related document: <u>1</u> Complaint, filed by Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(jfe) (Entered: 07/02/2012)
06/29/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Jesse M. Furman: Status Conference held on 6/29/2012. (ab) (Entered: 07/04/2012)
07/12/2012	<u>32</u>	REVISED PRETRIAL SCHEDULING ORDER: Motions due by 8/31/2012. Fact Discovery due by 7/31/2012. Expert Discovery due by 10/29/2012. Final Pretrial Conference set for 12/4/2012 at 03:00 PM in Courtroom 26A, U.S. Courthouse, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Jesse M. Furman. Joint Pretrial Order

		due by 11/19/2012. Bench Trial set for 12/10/2012 at 09:00 AM before Judge Jesse M. Furman, and as further specified in this Revised Pretrial Scheduling Order. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 7/12/2012) (rjm) (Entered: 07/12/2012)
07/16/2012	<u>33</u>	ANSWER to <u>31</u> Amended Complaint,. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York.(Toews, Mark) (Entered: 07/16/2012)
08/23/2012	<u>34</u>	ENDORSED LETTER: addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Shawna L. Parks dated 8/20/2012 re: Counsel for both Plaintiffs and defendants request that Plaintiffs' identification and disclosure of expert testimony be due September 17, 2012, Defendants' identification and disclosure of expert testimony due by October 15, 2012, Plaintiffs' disclosure of any rebuttal experts be due by October 29, 2012. The parties request that the deadline for the completion of all expert discovery be set for 11/12/2012. ENDORSEMENT: Application granted. All other dates and deadlines remain the same. Defense Counsel shall advise both Plaintiffs and the Court of the status of the Lovely H. Litigation on or before October 1, 2012. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 8/23/2012) (js) (Entered: 08/23/2012)
08/31/2012	<u>35</u>	MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF</i> . Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. Responses due by 9/14/2012(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
08/31/2012	<u>36</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF</i> .. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
08/31/2012	<u>37</u>	DECLARATION of SUSAN DOOHA in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF</i> .. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
08/31/2012	<u>38</u>	DECLARATION of JOAN PETERS in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF</i> .. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
08/31/2012	<u>39</u>	DECLARATION of TANIA MORALES in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF</i> .. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
08/31/2012	<u>40</u>	DECLARATION of GREGORY D. BELL, Sr. in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF</i> .. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
08/31/2012	<u>41</u>	DECLARATION of MARVIN WASSERMAN in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF</i> .. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
08/31/2012	<u>42</u>	DECLARATION of CHRISTINA CURRY in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION;</i>

		<i>MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF..</i> Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
08/31/2012	<u>43</u>	DECLARATION of JENNIFER HALBERT in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF..</i> Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
08/31/2012	<u>44</u>	DECLARATION of JEAN RYAN in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF..</i> Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
08/31/2012	<u>45</u>	DECLARATION of RONNIE ELLEN RAYMOND in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF..</i> Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
08/31/2012	<u>46</u>	DECLARATION of VALARIE BUCKNER in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF..</i> Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
08/31/2012	<u>47</u>	DECLARATION of MARY CONNER in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF..</i> Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
08/31/2012	<u>48</u>	DECLARATION of JON ELLENHORN in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF..</i> Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
08/31/2012	<u>49</u>	DECLARATION of DR. PETER BLANCK, Ph.D, J.D. in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF..</i> Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D)(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
08/31/2012	<u>50</u>	DECLARATION of DANIELL. BROWN in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF..</i> Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
08/31/2012	<u>51</u>	DECLARATION of SHAWNA L. PARKS in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF..</i> Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.

		(Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G, # <u>8</u> Exhibit H, # <u>9</u> Exhibit I, # <u>10</u> Exhibit J, # <u>11</u> Exhibit K, # <u>12</u> Exhibit L, # <u>13</u> Exhibit M, # <u>14</u> Exhibit N, # <u>15</u> Exhibit O, # <u>16</u> Exhibit P, # <u>17</u> Exhibit Q, # <u>18</u> Exhibit R, # <u>19</u> Exhibit S, # <u>20</u> Exhibit T, # <u>21</u> Exhibit U)(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
08/31/2012	<u>52</u>	MOTION to Seal <i>PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR AN ORDER PERMITTING PLAINTIFFS TO FILE UNDER SEAL: (1) UNREDACTED MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; AND (2) CERTAIN EXHIBITS TO THE DECLARATION OF SHAWNA L. PARKS</i> . Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit H to S. Parks' Declaration, # <u>3</u> Exhibit J to S. Parks' Declaration, # <u>4</u> Exhibit M to S. Parks' Declaration, # <u>5</u> Exhibit N to S. Parks' Declaration, # <u>6</u> Exhibit O to S. Parks' Declaration, # <u>7</u> Exhibit R to S. Parks' Declaration, # <u>8</u> Exhibit S to S. Parks' Declaration, # <u>9</u> Exhibit U to S. Parks' Declaration)(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
08/31/2012	<u>53</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF. MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION</i> . Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 08/31/2012)
09/12/2012	<u>54</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Julia Pinover dated 9/12/2012 re: Plaintiffs respectfully request that our expert report deadline be moved to September 19th, 2012, and as further requested in this letter. ENDORSEMENT: Application granted. So ordered. (Expert Discovery due by 11/14/2012.) (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 9/12/2012) (rjm) (Entered: 09/13/2012)
09/14/2012	<u>55</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Mark G. Toews and Matha A. Calhoun dated 9/13/2012 re: For the reasons set forth above, Defendants respectfully request a two (2) week extension of time to file opposition to Plaintiffs' motion to certify the proposed class and permission to simultaneously to move for summary judgment on the limited issue of standing. Again, I apologize for the tardiness of this request; however, we respectfully submit that the timing was unavoidable. Finally, given the complex nature of this case and the need to quote extensively from deposition transcripts, Defendants respectfully request that the Court extend the 25 page limit on legal memoranda to 30 pages. ENDORSEMENT: Defendants are granted until Monday, September 17, 2012, to file their opposition to plaintiffs' motion for class certification. Consistent with the Court's earlier order, plaintiffs shall have one week to file any reply to defendants' opposition. Otherwise, defendants' application is denied in all respects. Defendants may raise the issue of standing at trial. SO ORDERED., (Responses due by 9/17/2012) (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 9/14/2012) (ama) (Entered: 09/14/2012)
09/14/2012	<u>56</u>	Letter addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Julia Pinover dated 9/14/2012 re: Plaintiffs write in response to Defendants' request for a two week extension on their deadline to submit opposition papers to Plaintiffs' motion for class certification, Defendants' request for a page extension on their brief, and Defendants' request to file a motion for summary judgment. Although the parties have generally been able to resolve scheduling and other such issues in this matter, Plaintiffs believe that in this instance Defendants' requests are unjustified. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(ama) (Entered: 09/14/2012)
09/14/2012	<u>57</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Carolyn Elizabeth Kruk on behalf of Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York (Kruk, Carolyn) (Entered: 09/14/2012)
09/17/2012	<u>58</u>	DECLARATION of Carolyn E. Kruk in Opposition re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF..</i> Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u>

		Exhibit G, # <u>8</u> Exhibit H, # <u>2</u> Exhibit I)(Toews, Mark) (Entered: 09/17/2012)
09/17/2012	<u>59</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF.</i> . Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York. (Toews, Mark) (Entered: 09/17/2012)
09/24/2012	<u>60</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF. PLAINTIFFS REPLY MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION.</i> Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 09/24/2012)
09/24/2012	<u>61</u>	DECLARATION of SHAWNA L. PARKS in Support re: <u>60</u> Reply Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion,. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D)(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 09/24/2012)
10/03/2012	<u>62</u>	ENDORSED LETTER: addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Martha A. Calhoun dated 10/1/2012 re: Counsel write as directed by the Court to inform the Court and counsel for Plaintiffs of the status of Lovely H. v. Eggleston 05-cv-6920, a class action pending before Judge Forrest in which counsel is also lead counsel. This lawsuit will not be going to trial in mid November as previously scheduled. Judge Forrest has scheduled a conference in the case for tomorrow, October 2, 2012, at which it is anticipated that case scheduling issues will be discussed. ENDORSEMENT: Duly noted. The deadlines in the scheduling order of July 12, 2012, as modified by the letter endorsed on August 23, 2012, remain in effect. So Ordered. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 10/3/2012) (js) (Entered: 10/03/2012)
10/10/2012	<u>63</u>	Letter addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Shawna L. Parks dated 10/10/2012 re: Plaintiffs write in response to Defendants' letter of October 8, 2012 requesting an extension of the pre-trial and trial dates in this matter. Plaintiffs respectfully oppose any postponement of these dates. (rjm) (Entered: 10/11/2012)
10/10/2012	<u>64</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Martha A. Calhoun dated 10/8/2012 re: Defendants respectfully request that the date for pre trial submission be adjourned to January 11, 2012 and that the trial be adjourned to January 28, 2013. ENDORSEMENT: Application DENIED without prejudice to renewal if or when the United States files a motion to intervene. Defendants are directed to e-mail a copy of this endorsed letter to the assigned Assistant United States Attorney. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 10/10/2012) (rjm) (Entered: 10/11/2012)
11/07/2012	<u>65</u>	SEALED DOCUMENT placed in vault.(nm) (Entered: 11/07/2012)
11/07/2012	<u>66</u>	OPINION AND ORDER re: #102561 <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF</i> filed by Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Tania Morales, Gregory D. Bell. For the foregoing reasons, plaintiffs' motion for class certification is hereby GRANTED as modified and subject to comment from the parties. Absent objections, the Court will certify a plaintiff class consisting of the following: All people with disabilities, as defined by the Americans with Disabilities Act, who are within the City of New York and the jurisdiction served by the City of New York's emergency preparedness programs and services. The parties shall have until November 13, 2012, at 12:00 p.m., to submit letter objections, not to exceed three pages, regarding the Court's proposed class definition. It is further ORDERED that defendants have until November 19, 2012, to respond to plaintiffs' motion to seal, showing good cause why maintaining the relevant materials under seal is consistent with the presumption of access created by both the common law and the First Amendment. See, e.g., Lugosch v. Pyramid Co. of Onondaga, 435 F.3d 110, 126 (2d Cir. 2006). In any such response, defendants shall also address whether there is a basis to maintain the unredacted version of this Opinion and Order under seal. Absent a response, the Court will publicly file the unredacted version of this Opinion and

		Order and deny plaintiffs' motion to seal without further notice to the parties. In the meantime, the Clerk of Court is directed to maintain the unredacted version of this Opinion and Order under seal. It is important to note that the fact that plaintiffs have carried their burden at this stage, and class certification is appropriate, is not to say that the plaintiff class is entitled to the relief it ultimately seeks. It may be, as defendants vigorously assert, that the plaintiffs' claims are "patently false" and that the City has "carefully developed sophisticated operational and logistical plans and supporting resources that effectively serve the health and safety needs of all New Yorkers during emergencies, including those with disabilities." (Defs.' Opp'n Mem. at 1– 2). The fact that plaintiffs have carried their present burden is only to say that they have satisfied the requirements for proceeding by way of a class action. Whether they ultimately prevail will be determined at the trial scheduled to begin on December 10, 2012. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 11/7/2012) (lmb) Modified on 11/13/2012 (jab). (Entered: 11/07/2012)
11/07/2012		Set/Reset Deadlines: Responses due by 11/19/2012. (lmb) (Entered: 11/07/2012)
11/13/2012	<u>67</u>	ENDORSED LETTER: addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Martha A. Calhoun dated 11/13/2012 re: For the reasons set forth above, Defendants propose that the trial be adjourned to January 2013. To this end, Plaintiffs propose that pre-trial submissions be made by December 21, 2012 and any replies be made by January 4, 2013, with trial to begin as soon thereafter as is convenient to the Court. Defendants' position is that a date of December 21, 2012 for pre-trial submission is simply not possible, given that, as noted above, key witnesses are and will continue to be heavily involved in recovery efforts and that the parties will be supplementing the record with evidence from Hurricane Sandy. Accordingly, the earliest that Defendants can make pre-trial submissions would be January 7, 2013, with replies due January 14, 2013, with trial to begin as soon thereafter as is convenient to the Court. ENDORSEMENT: The parties are ordered to appear for a conference with the Court on November 16, 2012, at 11:30 am. By separate order, the Court is re-referring the case to Magistrate Judge Maas for settlement purposes. The parties are ordered to contact his chambers by November 16, 2012, to schedule a settlement conference as soon as possible. (Status Conference set for 11/16/2012 at 11:30 AM before Judge Jesse M. Furman.) (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 11/13/2012) (js) (Entered: 11/14/2012)
11/13/2012	<u>68</u>	ORDER OF REFERENCE TO A MAGISTRATE JUDGE: Order that case be referred to the Clerk of Court for assignment to a Magistrate Judge for Settlement. Referred to Magistrate Judge Frank Maas. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 11/13/2012) (js) (Entered: 11/14/2012)
11/14/2012	<u>69</u>	ORDER: Accordingly, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that this action is certified as a class action under Rule 23(b)(2) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. The class is defined as: "All people with disabilities, as defined by the Americans with Disabilities Act, who are within the City of New York and the jurisdiction served by the City of New York's emergency preparedness programs and services." (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 11/14/2012) (mt) (Entered: 11/14/2012)
11/15/2012	<u>70</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Julia Pinover dated 11/14/2012 re: Request for permission for Ms. Parks to appear telephonically at the 11/16/2012 conference in satisfaction of the Court's individual rule 2(A). ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED, although counsel who is present in the courtroom should be prepared to do most of the talking. Counsel shall provide the Court with a number to reach Ms. Parks at the time of the conference. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 11/15/2012) (cd) (Entered: 11/15/2012)
11/16/2012	<u>71</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Martha A. Calhoun dated 11/15/2012 re: I write to request that defendants' time to respond to plaintiffs' motion to seal certain documents submitted by plaintiffs in connection with their motion for class certification be extended one week, until November 25, 2012. ENDORSEMENT: Defendants' time to respond to the motion to seal is extended to November 25, 2012. In light of Defendants' consent, the Clerk of Court is directed to unseal the Court's unredacted Opinion and Order (Docket No. 65). (Responses due by 11/25/2012) (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 11/16/2012) (rjm) (Entered: 11/16/2012)

11/16/2012		Transmission to Sealed Records Clerk. Transmitted re: <u>71</u> Endorsed Letter, Set Deadlines to the Sealed Records Clerk for the sealing or unsealing of document or case. (rjm) (Entered: 11/16/2012)
11/16/2012	<u>72</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER: It is hereby ORDERED that the parties shall file their joint pretrial order by February 18, 2013. Responses to any such filings shall be filed by March 1, 2013. It is further ORDERED that a final pretrial conference will be held on March 4, 2013, at 3:30 p.m. Trial will begin on March 11, 2013, at 9:00 a.m. It is further ORDERED that the parties shall submit a joint letter to the Court by 5:00 p.m. on Tuesday, November 20, 2012, advising the Court with respect to whether the parties have reached agreement on the scope and timing of supplemental discovery relating to the response to Hurricane Sandy or, if not, the nature of any disagreement. (Final Pretrial Conference set for 3/4/2013 at 03:30 PM before Judge Jesse M. Furman. Joint Pretrial Order due by 2/18/2013. Bench Trial set for 3/11/2013 at 09:00 AM before Judge Jesse M. Furman.) (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 11/16/2012) (rjm) (Entered: 11/16/2012)
11/16/2012		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Jesse M. Furman: Status Conference held on 11/16/2012. (ab) (Entered: 11/20/2012)
11/16/2012	<u>82</u>	OPINION AND ORDER. For the foregoing reasons, plaintiffs' motion for class certification is hereby GRANTED as modified and subject to comment from the parties. Absent objections, the Court will certify a plaintiff class consisting of the following: All people with disabilities, as defined by the Americans with Disabilities Act, who are within the City of New York and the jurisdiction served by the City of New York's emergency preparedness programs and services. The parties shall have until November 13, 2012, at 12:00 p.m., to submit letter objections, not to exceed three pages, regarding the Court's proposed class definition. It is further ORDERED that defendants have until November 19, 2012, to respond to plaintiffs' motion to seal, showing good cause why maintaining the relevant materials under seal is consistent with the presumption of access created by both the common law and the First Amendment. See, e.g., Lugosch v. Pyramid Co. of Onondaga, 435 F.3d 110, 126 (2d Cir. 2006). In any such response, defendants shall also address whether there is a basis to maintain the unredacted version of this Opinion and Order under seal. Absent a response, the Court will publicly file the unredacted version of this Opinion and Order and deny plaintiffs' motion to seal without further notice to the parties. In the meantime, the Clerk of Court is directed to maintain the unredacted version of this Opinion and Order under seal. It is important to note that the fact that plaintiffs have carried their burden at this stage, and class certification is appropriate, is not to say that the plaintiff class is entitled to the relief it ultimately seeks. It may be, as defendants vigorously assert, that the plaintiffs' claims are "patently false" and that the City has "carefully developed sophisticated operational and logistical plans and supporting resources that effectively serve the health and safety needs of all New Yorkers during emergencies, including those with disabilities." (Defs.' Opp'n Mem. at 1- 2). The fact that plaintiffs have carried their present burden is only to say that they have satisfied the requirements for proceeding by way of a class action. Whether they ultimately prevail will be determined at the trial scheduled to begin on December 10, 2012. (This document was previously sealed in envelope # 65 and unsealed by document # 71.) (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 11/7/2012) (lmb) (Entered: 12/17/2012)
11/20/2012	<u>73</u>	NOTICE OF CONFERENCE: A settlement conference in the above referenced matter has been scheduled for December 7, 2012, at 10:00 a.m., before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas, in Courtroom 20A, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007. Judge Maas' settlement procedures are attached. Requests for adjournment must be made to the Court, in writing, at least 48 hours prior to the conference. (Settlement Conference set for 12/7/2012 at 10:00 AM in Courtroom 20A, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas). (pl) (Entered: 11/20/2012)
11/21/2012	<u>74</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Martha A. Calhoun dated 11/20/12 re: Counsel writes on behalf of the parties to advise the Court that they have agreed that fact discovery will be completed by 1/4/13 and that expert discovery will conclude by 2/1/13. ENDORSEMENT: So ordered. (Expert Discovery due by 2/1/2013., Fact Discovery due by 1/4/2013.) (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 11/21/2012) (mro) (Entered: 11/21/2012)

11/26/2012	<u>75</u>	FILING ERROR – WRONG EVENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU – MOTION to Seal <i>memorandum of law in support of</i> . Document filed by The City of New York. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Declaration of Joseph Bruno)(Calhoun, Martha) Modified on 11/27/2012 (db). (Entered: 11/26/2012)
11/27/2012		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE–FILE DOCUMENT – EVENT TYPE ERROR. Note to Attorney Martha Anne Calhoun to RE–FILE Document <u>75</u> MOTION to Seal <i>memorandum of law in support of</i>. Use the event type (1) Memorandum in Support of Motion; and also (2) Declaration in Support of Motion found under the event list Replies, Opposition and Supporting Documents. Re–File both documents separately, and link them both to the <u>52</u> Motion. (db) (Entered: 11/27/2012)
11/27/2012	<u>76</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>52</u> MOTION to Seal <i>PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR AN ORDER PERMITTING PLAINTIFFS TO FILE UNDER SEAL: (1) UNREDACTED MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; AND (2) CERTAIN EXHIBITS TO THE DECLARATION OF SHAWNA L. PARKS MOTION to Seal PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR AN ORDER PERMITTING PLAINTIFFS TO FILE UNDER SEAL: (1) UNREDACTED MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; AND (2) CERTAIN EXHIBITS TO THE DECLARATION OF SHAWNA L. PARKS MOTION to Seal PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR AN ORDER PERMITTING PLAINTIFFS TO FILE UNDER SEAL: (1) UNREDACTED MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; AND (2) CERTAIN EXHIBITS TO THE DECLARATION OF SHAWNA L. PARKS MOTION to Seal PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR AN ORDER PERMITTING PLAINTIFFS TO FILE UNDER SEAL: (1) UNREDACTED MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; AND (2) CERTAIN EXHIBITS TO THE DECLARATION OF SHAWNA L. PARKS. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York. (Calhoun, Martha) (Entered: 11/27/2012)</i>
11/27/2012	<u>77</u>	DECLARATION of Joseph Bruno in Support re: <u>52</u> MOTION to Seal <i>PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR AN ORDER PERMITTING PLAINTIFFS TO FILE UNDER SEAL: (1) UNREDACTED MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; AND (2) CERTAIN EXHIBITS TO THE DECLARATION OF SHAWNA L. PARKS MOTION to Seal PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR AN ORDER PERMITTING PLAINTIFFS TO FILE UNDER SEAL: (1) UNREDACTED MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; AND (2) CERTAIN EXHIBITS TO THE DECLARATION OF SHAWNA L. PARKS MOTION to Seal PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR AN ORDER PERMITTING PLAINTIFFS TO FILE UNDER SEAL: (1) UNREDACTED MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; AND (2) CERTAIN EXHIBITS TO THE DECLARATION OF SHAWNA L. PARKS MOTION to Seal PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR AN ORDER PERMITTING PLAINTIFFS TO FILE UNDER SEAL: (1) UNREDACTED MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT OF MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; AND (2) CERTAIN EXHIBITS TO THE DECLARATION OF SHAWNA L. PARKS. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York. (Calhoun, Martha) (Entered: 11/27/2012)</i>
11/30/2012	<u>78</u>	ORDER granting in part and denying in part <u>52</u> Motion to Seal. For substantially the reasons stated in Defendants' November 27, 2012 Memorandum of Law in Support of Plaintiffs' Motion to Seal (Docket No. 76), Plaintiffs' August 31, 2012 Motion to Seal is GRANTED in part and DENIED in part. Specifically, it is hereby ORDERED that Plaintiffs shall file Exhibit N under seal. The Court is persuaded that there is no public right of access to this document at this stage of the proceedings. Plaintiffs are further ORDERED to publicly file unredacted versions of the remaining documents discussed in their motion on ECF. The Clerk of Court is directed to terminate the motion (Docket No. 52). (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 11/30/2012) (mro) (Entered: 11/30/2012)
12/03/2012	<u>79</u>	SEALED DOCUMENT placed in vault.(nm) (Entered: 12/03/2012)
12/03/2012	<u>80</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF</i>

		<i>POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF. MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT OF PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION.</i> Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 12/03/2012)
12/03/2012	<u>81</u>	DECLARATION of SHAWNA L. PARKS in Support re: <u>35</u> MOTION to Certify Class <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT THEREOF..</i> Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit H, # <u>2</u> Exhibit J, # <u>3</u> Exhibit M, # <u>4</u> Exhibit O, # <u>5</u> Exhibit R, # <u>6</u> Exhibit S, # <u>7</u> Exhibit U)(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 12/03/2012)
02/04/2013	<u>83</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Martha A. Calhoun dated 2/1/2013 re: Counsel for the Defendants writes to request an extension of time to submit the joint pretrial order and request that the Court schedule a conference. ENDORSEMENT: The parties shall conduct the deposition of Deputy Mayor Holloway on February 5, 2013, or as soon thereafter as possible. The parties are granted until February 22, 2013, to submit the joint pretrial order and related filings. All other dates and deadlines remain in effect. (Deposition due by 2/5/2013. Joint Pretrial Order due by 2/22/2013.) (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 2/4/2013) (ab) (Entered: 02/04/2013)
02/05/2013	<u>84</u>	Letter addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Shawna L. Parks dated 2/4/2013 re: Counsel for the plaintiffs write in response to Defendants' requests to (1) postpone the pretrial filings, and (2) conduct an additional fact deposition and/or present this late witness at trial. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(ft) (Entered: 02/05/2013)
02/20/2013	<u>85</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Martha A. Calhoun dated 2/19/2013 re: I write to respectfully request a two-week extension of the time to submit the joint pretrial order and related filings in the above-referenced matter. ENDORSEMENT: Application DENIED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 2/20/2013) (ama) (Entered: 02/20/2013)
02/20/2013	<u>86</u>	Letter addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Shawna L. Parks dated 2/19/2013 re: Plaintiffs write in response to Defendants' letter of today requesting another extension of the pre-trial and trial dates in this matter. Plaintiffs respectfully but strongly oppose postponement of the trial date in this case. (ama) (Entered: 02/20/2013)
02/21/2013	<u>87</u>	Letter addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Shawna L. Parks dated 2/21/2013 re: Plaintiffs write in response to Defendants' letter of late yesterday requesting another extension of the pre-trial deadlines in this matter. Plaintiffs respectfully oppose Defendants' latest request. Document filed by Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(mt) (Entered: 02/22/2013)
02/21/2013	<u>88</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Martha A. Calhoun dated 2/20/2013 re: To address these issues and to permit the trial to commence on schedule, defendants respectfully request that the joint pre-trial order, exhibits, motions in limine, and declarations representing direct testimony be submitted on February 26, 2013 and that the proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law be submitted on March 1, 2013. ENDORSEMENT: The deadline for submission of the joint pretrial order and related filings, including the affidavits of witnesses, AND the deadline for submission of proposed findings of fact conclusions of law are hereby extended to February 26, 2013. No further extension of these dates will be granted. Responses to these filings remain due on March 1, 2013. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 2/21/2013) (mt) (Entered: 02/22/2013)
02/21/2013		Set/Reset Deadlines: All Defendants. Pretrial Order due by 2/26/2013. Responses due by 3/1/2013 (mt) (Entered: 02/22/2013)
02/22/2013	<u>89</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Preet Bharara dated 2/21/2013 re: Accordingly, the Government respectfully requests permission to file a Statement of Interest on behalf of the United States in this case, following the

		conclusion of the bench trial that has been scheduled to commence on March 11, 2013. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. Unless the Court orders otherwise, the Government's Statement of Interest shall be filed no later than 45 days after the evidence closes at trial. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 2/22/2013) (mt) (Entered: 02/22/2013)
02/26/2013	<u>90</u>	PRETRIAL MEMORANDUM. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 02/26/2013)
02/26/2013	<u>91</u>	PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 02/26/2013)
02/26/2013	<u>92</u>	MOTION in Limine <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION IN LIMINE TO EXCLUDE EVIDENCE RE PERSONAL EMERGENCY PREPAREDNESS AS A DEFENSE TO PLAINTIFFS CLAIMS; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT</i> . Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 02/26/2013)
02/26/2013	<u>93</u>	NOTICE of PLAINTIFFS' REQUEST FOR JUDICIAL NOTICE. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 02/26/2013)
02/26/2013	<u>94</u>	DECLARATION of JULIA PINOVER in Support re: <u>93</u> Notice (Other), Notice (Other). Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 02/26/2013)
02/26/2013	<u>95</u>	Objection <i>PLAINTIFFS OBJECTIONS TO DEFENDANTS EXHIBITS</i> . Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F)(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 02/26/2013)
02/26/2013	<u>96</u>	DECLARATION of REBECCA S. WILLIFORD in Support re: <u>95</u> Objection (non-motion), Objection (non-motion). Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F)(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 02/26/2013)
02/26/2013	<u>97</u>	PRETRIAL MEMORANDUM. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York.(Toews, Mark) (Entered: 02/26/2013)
02/26/2013	<u>98</u>	FIRST MOTION in Limine. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York.(Toews, Mark) (Entered: 02/26/2013)
02/26/2013	<u>99</u>	SECOND MOTION in Limine. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York.(Toews, Mark) (Entered: 02/26/2013)
02/26/2013	<u>100</u>	PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York.(Calhoun, Martha) (Entered: 02/26/2013)
03/01/2013		NOTICE: Please be advised that the conference scheduled for 3/4/2013 will be held in Courtroom 444 of the Thurgood Marshall Courthouse, 40 Centre Street. (ab) (Entered: 03/01/2013)
03/01/2013	<u>101</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>97</u> Pretrial Memorandum <i>PLAINTIFFS OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANTS MEMORANDUM OF LAW</i> . Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 03/01/2013)

03/01/2013	<u>102</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>99</u> SECOND MOTION in Limine. <i>PLAINTIFFS OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANTS MOTION IN LIMINE TO EXCLUDE EVIDENCE</i> . Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 03/01/2013)
03/01/2013	<u>103</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>98</u> FIRST MOTION in Limine. <i>PLAINTIFFS OPPOSITION TO DEFENDANTS MOTION IN LIMINE TO EXCLUDE TESTIMONY OF SUSAN DOOHA AND MARGI TRAPANI</i> . Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 03/01/2013)
03/01/2013	<u>104</u>	DECLARATION of SHAWNA PARKS in Support re: <u>103</u> Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Motion,. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 03/01/2013)
03/01/2013	<u>105</u>	RESPONSE <i>PLAINTIFFS RESPONSE TO DEFENDANTS OBJECTIONS TO PLAINTIFFS EXHIBITS</i> . Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 03/01/2013)
03/01/2013	<u>106</u>	MOTION to Strike <i>MOTION TO STRIKE LAY WITNESS TESTIMONY</i> . Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 03/01/2013)
03/01/2013	<u>107</u>	MOTION to Strike <i>MOTION TO STRIKE SECTIONS OF EXPERT REPORTS OF ELIZABETH DAVIS</i> . Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 03/01/2013)
03/01/2013	<u>108</u>	DECLARATION of REBECCA S. WILLIFORD in Support re: <u>107</u> MOTION to Strike <i>MOTION TO STRIKE SECTIONS OF EXPERT REPORTS OF ELIZABETH DAVIS</i> .. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G)(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 03/01/2013)
03/01/2013	<u>109</u>	PRETRIAL MEMORANDUM. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York.(Toews, Mark) (Entered: 03/01/2013)
03/01/2013	<u>110</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re: <u>92</u> MOTION in Limine <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION IN LIMINE TO EXCLUDE EVIDENCE RE PERSONAL EMERGENCY PREPAREDNESS AS A DEFENSE TO PLAINTIFFS CLAIMS; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT</i> .. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York. (Toews, Mark) (Entered: 03/01/2013)
03/01/2013	<u>111</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re: <u>92</u> MOTION in Limine <i>NOTICE OF MOTION AND MOTION IN LIMINE TO EXCLUDE EVIDENCE RE PERSONAL EMERGENCY PREPAREDNESS AS A DEFENSE TO PLAINTIFFS CLAIMS; MEMORANDUM OF POINTS AND AUTHORITIES IN SUPPORT</i> .. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York. (Toews, Mark) (Entered: 03/01/2013)
03/01/2013	<u>112</u>	MOTION for Pre-Trial (<i>Motion to Strike Testimony</i>). Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York.(Kruk, Carolyn) (Entered: 03/01/2013)
03/01/2013	<u>113</u>	DECLARATION of Martha Calhoun in Support re: <u>112</u> MOTION for Pre-Trial (<i>Motion to Strike Testimony</i>).. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York. (Kruk, Carolyn) (Entered: 03/01/2013)
03/04/2013	<u>114</u>	PRETRIAL ORDER:This case is to be a bench trial. The parties estimate that it will require ten (10) court days. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 3/4/2013) (lmb) (Entered: 03/05/2013)
03/04/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Jesse M. Furman: Final Pretrial Conference held on 3/4/2013. Dan Brown, Julia Pinover, Shawna Parks and Rebecca

		Williford present for the Plaintiffs. Mark Toews, Martha Calhoun, Carolyn Kruk, Stella Guarna and William Davidson present for the Defendants. Court reporter present. (ab) (Entered: 03/12/2013)
03/05/2013	<u>115</u>	ORDER denying <u>92</u> Motion in Limine; denying <u>98</u> Motion in Limine; denying <u>99</u> Motion in Limine; denying <u>107</u> Motion to Strike; denying <u>112</u> Motion for Pre-Trial. The Clerk of Court is directed to terminate Docket Nos. 92, 93, 95, 98, 99 107, 112. Docket No. 106 shall remain open pending the Court's ruling on the testimony of Brad Gair. It is further ORDERED that Defendants' response, if any, to Plaintiffs' objections to the testimony of Brad Gair shall be filed by March 7, 2013. In addition, the parties are directed to submit by letter their final lists of witnesses, in the order they will be called to testify, by March 7, 2013 at 5:00p.m. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 3/5/2013) (mt) (Entered: 03/05/2013)
03/07/2013	<u>116</u>	RESPONSE to Motion re: <u>106</u> MOTION to Strike <i>MOTION TO STRIKE LAY WITNESS TESTIMONY</i> .. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York. (Calhoun, Martha) (Entered: 03/07/2013)
03/07/2013	<u>117</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Carolyn E. Kruk dated 3/7/2013 re: Counsel for the Defendants writes to request permission to allow two laptops into the Courtroom during the duration of the trial. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. Counsel shall complete a copy of the Electronic Devices General Purpose form, available at http://nysd.uscourts.gov/forms.php , and submit it to the Court for signature. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 3/7/2013) (ab) (Entered: 03/08/2013)
03/11/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Jesse M. Furman: Bench Trial begun on 3/11/2013. Dan Brown, Julia Pinover, Shawna Parks and Rebecca Williford present for the Plaintiffs. Mark Toews, Martha Callhoun and Carolyn Kruk present for the Defendants. Court reporter present. Trial continued on April 12, 13, 13, 18, and 19. The Court reserves decision. (ab) (Entered: 04/09/2013)
03/12/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Jesse M. Furman: Bench Trial held on 3/12/2013. (ab) (Entered: 04/09/2013)
03/13/2013	<u>118</u>	TRIAL MEMORANDUM. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 03/13/2013)
03/13/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Jesse M. Furman: Bench Trial held on 3/13/2013. (ab) (Entered: 04/09/2013)
03/14/2013	<u>119</u>	Letter addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Martha A. Calhoun dated 3/9/2013 re: As one of the attorneys assigned to represent Defendants in the above-referenced class action, I write, consistent with the Court's Individual Rule 4(A), to respectfully request that select exhibits to be used at trial – consisting of various City emergency plans, protocols, guides and manuals – be filed in redacted form on ECF and in unredacted form under seal. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York.(lmb) (Entered: 03/14/2013)
03/14/2013	<u>120</u>	ORDER denying <u>106</u> Motion to Strike. For the reasons stated on the record at trial on March 13, 2013, Plaintiffs' Motion To Strike Lay Witness Testimony (Docket No. 106) is DENIED to the extent it seeks to exclude the testimony of Brad Gair. The Clerk of Court is directed to terminate Docket No. 106. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 3/14/2013) (lmb) (Entered: 03/14/2013)
03/14/2013	<u>121</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Shawna Parks dated 3/13/2013 re: Plaintiffs are writing, per our discussion in Court, to identify the redacted pages of Joint Trial Exhibit 5, New York City's Area Evacuation Plan (2005), that are relevant to this case. These pages are: CNY019292– CNY019297; CNY019305–CNY019308; CNY019316–CNY019319; and CNY019327–CNY019330. ENDORSEMENT: For the reasons stated on the record in open court, Joint Trial Exhibit 5 – without the pages referenced above redacted – shall be maintained under seal. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 3/14/2013) (lmb) (Entered: 03/14/2013)

03/14/2013	<u>122</u>	TRIAL MEMORANDUM. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York.(Calhoun, Martha) (Entered: 03/14/2013)
03/14/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Jesse M. Furman: Bench Trial held on 3/14/2013. (ab) (Entered: 04/09/2013)
03/18/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Jesse M. Furman: Bench Trial held on 3/18/2013. (ab) (Entered: 04/09/2013)
03/19/2013	<u>123</u>	TRIAL MEMORANDUM. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Exhibit A)(Pinover, Julia) (Entered: 03/19/2013)
03/19/2013	<u>124</u>	ORDER: As discussed on the record at the end of today's proceedings, the parties are directed to submit to the Court by March 22, 2013: (1) a list of all exhibits that have been admitted in this case; (2) a list of submitted depositions and the portions of those depositions that have been designated for the Court's consideration; and (3) a joint letter indicating whether either party believes limited post-trial briefing would be useful and which issue or issues should be briefed. In addition, Defendants are to submit any opposition to Plaintiffs' Memorandum Regarding Admission of City Council Reports as Statement of Party Opponents by March 22, 2013. It is further ORDERED that the parties are to submit revised proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law, no longer than 75 pages, by May 3, 2013. The proposed findings of fact shall include specific citations to the record for every proposition or proposed fact. Any statement of interest by the United States Government is also due by May 3, 2013. Any response to such a statement must be filed two weeks after the statement is filed. Finally, the parties are directed to contact Magistrate Judge Maas by March 20, 2013 at 5:00 pm to schedule a settlement conference as soon as his schedule permits. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 3/19/2013) (lmb) (Entered: 03/19/2013)
03/19/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Jesse M. Furman: Bench Trial completed on 3/19/2013. The Court reserves decision. (ab) (Entered: 04/09/2013)
03/20/2013	<u>125</u>	NOTICE OF COURT CONFERENCE: A settlement conference in the above referenced matter has been scheduled for April 19, 2013, at 2:00 p.m., before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas, in Courtroom 20A, 500 Pearl Street, New York 10007. Judge Maas' settlement procedures are included in this notice. Requests for adjournment must be made to the Court, in writing, at least 48 hours prior to the conference. By: Richalyn Chambers, Courtroom Deputy, Dated: March 20, 2013. (Settlement Conference set for 4/19/2013 at 02:00 PM in Courtroom 20A, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas). (djc) (Entered: 03/20/2013)
03/20/2013		Set/Reset Hearings: Settlement Conference set for 4/19/2013 at 02:00 PM in Courtroom 20A, 500 Pearl Street, New York, NY 10007 before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas. (djc) (Entered: 03/20/2013)
03/22/2013	<u>126</u>	Exhibit List <i>List of Admitted Trial Exhibits</i> . Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 03/22/2013)
03/22/2013	<u>127</u>	FILING ERROR – WRONG EVENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU – TRIAL MEMORANDUM. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York.(Calhoun, Martha) Modified on 3/25/2013 (ka). (Entered: 03/22/2013)
03/25/2013		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – EVENT TYPE ERROR. Note to Attorney Martha Anne Calhoun to RE-FILE Document <u>127</u> Trial Memorandum. Use the event type Memorandum of Law in Opposition(non-motion) found under the event list Other Answers. (ka) (Entered: 03/25/2013)
03/25/2013	<u>128</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW re: <u>123</u> Trial Memorandum <i>opposition to admission of city council papers as party admission</i> . Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York. (Calhoun, Martha) (Entered: 03/25/2013)
03/25/2013	<u>129</u>	Letter addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Shawna L. Parks, Martha A. Calhoun, Michael A. Cardozo, and Paul Garrity dated 3/22/2013 re: The parties write

		in response to the Court's instructions at the end of trial proceedings and its March 19, 2013 Order. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Michael R. Bloomberg, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales, The City of New York.(lmb) (Entered: 03/25/2013)
03/25/2013	<u>130</u>	ORDER: The parties are hereby granted leave to submit memoranda of law – no later than April 8, 2013, and not to exceed ten pages – addressing the implications, if any, of Defendants' post-complaint mitigation efforts on liability in this case. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 3/25/2013) (lmb) (Entered: 03/25/2013)
04/03/2013	<u>131</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: TRIAL held on 3/11/2013 before Judge Jesse M. Furman. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Denise Richards, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 4/29/2013. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 5/9/2013. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 7/8/2013.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/03/2013)
04/03/2013	<u>132</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a TRIAL proceeding held on 3/11/2013 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/03/2013)
04/03/2013	<u>133</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: TRIAL held on 3/12/2013 before Judge Jesse M. Furman. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Martha Drevis, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 4/29/2013. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 5/9/2013. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 7/8/2013.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/03/2013)
04/03/2013	<u>134</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a TRIAL proceeding held on 3/12/2013 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/03/2013)
04/03/2013	<u>135</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: TRIAL held on 3/13/2013 before Judge Jesse M. Furman. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Denise Richards, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 4/29/2013. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 5/9/2013. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 7/8/2013.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/03/2013)
04/03/2013	<u>136</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a TRIAL proceeding held on 3/13/13 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/03/2013)
04/03/2013	<u>137</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: TRIAL held on 3/14/2013 before Judge Jesse M. Furman. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Martha Drevis, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 4/29/2013. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 5/9/2013. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 7/8/2013.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/03/2013)

04/03/2013	<u>138</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a TRIAL proceeding held on 3/14/2013 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/03/2013)
04/03/2013	<u>139</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: TRIAL held on 3/18/2013 before Judge Jesse M. Furman. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Denise Richards, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 4/29/2013. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 5/9/2013. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 7/8/2013.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/03/2013)
04/03/2013	<u>140</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a TRIAL proceeding held on 3/18/2013 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/03/2013)
04/03/2013	<u>141</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: TRIAL held on 3/19/2013 before Judge Jesse M. Furman. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Martha Drevis, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 4/29/2013. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 5/9/2013. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 7/8/2013.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/03/2013)
04/03/2013	<u>142</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a TRIAL proceeding held on 3/19/2013 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 04/03/2013)
04/08/2013	<u>143</u>	POST TRIAL MEMORANDUM. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 04/08/2013)
04/08/2013	<u>144</u>	POST TRIAL MEMORANDUM. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York.(Toews, Mark) (Entered: 04/08/2013)
04/11/2013	<u>145</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Magistrate Judge Frank Maas from Julia Pinover dated 4/10/2013 re: I write on behalf of Plaintiffs in advance of the settlement conference scheduled before you on April 19, 2013 at 2:00 pm, regarding the following matters in this case. Plaintiffs would like to inform the Court that Julia Pinover and Daniel Brown, attorneys for Plaintiffs, will be present in person. Plaintiffs respectfully request that the Court allow Shawna Parks, Plaintiffs' lead counsel, to participate in the conference by telephone as she is in California and not able to travel east at the moment. Likewise, Plaintiffs inform the Court that representatives from organizational plaintiffs Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled ("BCID") and the Center for the Independence of the Disabled, New York ("CIDNY") will attend the settlement conference. However, Plaintiffs respectfully request that the Court allow individual Plaintiffs Tania Morales and Greg Bell to not attend the conference. ENDORSEMENT: APPLICATIONS GRANTED. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas on 4/9/2013) (djc) Modified on 4/12/2013 (djc). Modified on 4/15/2013 (djc). (Entered: 04/12/2013)
04/19/2013	<u>146</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 3/4/2013 before Judge Jesse M. Furman. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Paula Speer, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After

		that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 5/13/2013. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 5/23/2013. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 7/22/2013.(Rodriguez, Somari) (Entered: 04/19/2013)
04/19/2013	<u>147</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 3/4/13 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(Rodriguez, Somari) (Entered: 04/19/2013)
04/22/2013	<u>148</u>	ORDER: Pursuant to the settlement conference held on April 19, 2013, counsel for the parties shall exchange their proposals, with copies to my Chambers, by April 26, 2013, at 12 p.m. A telephone conference shall be held on April 29, 2013, at 9:30 a.m. Counsel for the plaintiffs should initiate the call. Accordingly, the schedule for the post-trial submission of proposed findings of fact and conclusions of law shall be extended by one week. (Telephone Conference set for 4/29/2013 at 09:30 AM before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas.)(Signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas on 4/22/2013) Copies Sent by Chambers to Hon Jesse M. Furman (dj) (Entered: 04/23/2013)
04/24/2013	<u>149</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Rebecca S. Tinio dated 4/23/2013 re: The Government respectfully requests a corresponding one-week extension of the deadline for submission of its Statement of Interest to May 10, 2013, in order to submit an appropriately tailored Statement. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 4/23/2013) (lmb) (Entered: 04/24/2013)
04/29/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas: Telephone Conference held on 4/29/2013. (Chambers, Richalyn) (Entered: 04/29/2013)
04/29/2013	<u>150</u>	ORDER: Pursuant to the telephone conference held on April 29, 2013, a further telephone conference shall be held on May 2, 2013, at 2 p.m. Plaintiffs' counsel should initiate the call. (Telephone Conference set for 5/2/2013 at 02:00 PM before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas.) (Signed by Magistrate Judge Frank Maas on 4/29/2013)Copies Sent By Chambers to Hon. Jesse M. Furman. (dj) (Entered: 04/30/2013)
05/02/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Magistrate Judge Frank Maas: Telephone Conference held on 5/2/2013. (Chambers, Richalyn) (Entered: 05/02/2013)
05/10/2013	<u>151</u>	POST TRIAL MEMORANDUM. Document filed by United States Of America. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Appendix)(Tinio, Rebecca) (Entered: 05/10/2013)
05/10/2013	<u>152</u>	POST TRIAL MEMORANDUM. Document filed by United States Of America. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F)(Tinio, Rebecca) (Entered: 05/10/2013)
05/10/2013	<u>153</u>	PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York.(Toews, Mark) (Entered: 05/10/2013)
05/10/2013	<u>154</u>	PROPOSED FINDINGS OF FACT AND CONCLUSIONS OF LAW. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Parks, Shawna) (Entered: 05/10/2013)
05/17/2013	<u>155</u>	ENDORSED LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Martha A. Calhoun dated 5/15/2013 re: The parties have conferred and share in the understanding that, consistent with the Court's March 19, 2013 Order (Docket No. 124), the deadline for submissions is now May 24, 2013, which is two weeks subsequent to the May 10, 2013 filing of the Statement; however, Defendants nonetheless seek confirmation of that deadline from the court to eliminate the possibility of any misunderstanding. ENDORSEMENT: So ordered. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 5/17/2013) (lmb) Modified on 5/20/2013 (lmb). (Entered: 05/17/2013)
05/24/2013	<u>156</u>	FILING ERROR – WRONG EVENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU – OPPOSITION BRIEF re: <u>151</u> Post Trial Memorandum <i>Response to Statement of</i>

		<i>Interest of the United States.</i> Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York.(Calhoun, Martha) Modified on 5/28/2013 (ka). (Entered: 05/24/2013)
05/28/2013		***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – EVENT TYPE ERROR. Note to Attorney Martha Anne Calhoun to RE-FILE Document <u>156</u> Opposition Brief. Use the event type Response(non-motion) found under the event list Other Answers. (ka) (Entered: 05/28/2013)
05/28/2013	<u>157</u>	RESPONSE re: <u>151</u> Post Trial Memorandum <i>Response to DOJ statement of interest.</i> Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York. (Calhoun, Martha) (Entered: 05/28/2013)
08/06/2013	<u>158</u>	NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Julia Miriam Pinover on behalf of All Plaintiffs. New Address: Disability Rights Advocates, 40 Worth Street, 10th Floor, New York, New York, United States 10013, 212-644-8644. (Pinover, Julia) (Entered: 08/06/2013)
11/07/2013	<u>159</u>	OPINION AND ORDER: As noted above, the trial in this case was limited to the question of liability. Having found that the City violated the ADA, the Rehabilitation Act, and the NYCHRL in several respects, the Court will proceed to consider the issue of how to remedy those violations. Given the complexity and potential expense involved, there is no question that crafting an appropriate remedy would be better accomplished by those with expertise in such matters and through negotiation, whether court-supervised or otherwise, than by Court order. Further, the United States has indicated that it is able and willing to assist the parties and, if necessary, the Court in addressing the question of remedy. (Statement of Interest of the United States 1 n.2). The parties are therefore directed to meet and confer – in person and with representatives of the Department of Justice, if they elect to participate – about the most productive means of resolving the question of remedies through alternative dispute mechanisms. At the same time, mindful that the Court will impose remedies if the parties cannot agree on them, the parties shall discuss the process and schedule for the remaining litigation, including but not limited to whether there is a need for additional discovery, whether the parties anticipate motion practice, and whether there is a need for another trial on remedies. The parties shall submit a joint status letter with respect to these matters and any other information that the parties believe may assist the Court in advancing the case to settlement or trial no later than November 26, 2013. They shall then appear for a conference with the Court on December 3, 2013 at 3:15 p.m. in Courtroom 1105 of the Thurgood Marshall Courthouse, 40 Centre Street, New York, New York. (Status Conference set for 12/3/2013 at 03:15 PM in Courtroom 1105, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Jesse M. Furman.) (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 11/7/2013) (tn) (Entered: 11/07/2013)
11/07/2013	<u>160</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from JULIA PINOVER dated 11/07/2013 re: Plaintiffs Lead Counsel. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Pinover, Julia) (Entered: 11/07/2013)
11/07/2013	<u>174</u>	INTERNET CITATION NOTE: Material from decision with Internet citation re: <u>159</u> Memorandum & Opinion. (fk) (Entered: 06/10/2014)
11/26/2013	<u>161</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from SID WOLINSKY and MARTHA CALHOUN dated NOVEMBER 26, 2013 re: Joint Status Letter for Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, et al. v. Bloomberg, et al. 11-Civ-6690. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Pinover, Julia) (Entered: 11/26/2013)
12/03/2013		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Jesse M. Furman: Status Conference held on 12/3/2013. Julia Pinover and Sid Wolinsky present for the Plaintiffs. Mark Toews, Martha Callhoun and Carolyn Kruk present for the Defendants. Court reporter present. (ab) (Entered: 01/07/2014)
12/04/2013	<u>162</u>	ORDER: As discussed on the record at the conference held yesterday, it is hereby ORDERED that the Honorable James M. McGuire is appointed as a mediator to assist the parties in reaching agreement and resolving disputes with respect to remedies in this case. The parties shall participate in the mediation in good faith, and Defendants shall bear the costs of the mediation. The parties shall bring any disputes with respect

		to discovery to the mediator in the first instance. If the mediator does not resolve any such dispute, either party may seek a ruling from the Court by filing a letter motion, not to exceed three pages. It is further ORDERED that the parties shall submit a joint status letter, no later than February 27, 2014, that (1) updates the Court on the status of remedies discussions and (2) indicates whether the parties believe there is a need for a conference. Unless the Court indicates otherwise, the parties shall appear for a conference with the Court on March 5, 2014, at 3 p.m., in Courtroom 1105 of the Thurgood Marshall Courthouse, 40 Centre Street, New York, New York., (Status Conference set for 3/5/2014 at 03:00 PM in Courtroom 1105, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Jesse M. Furman.) (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 12/4/2013) (lmb) (Entered: 12/04/2013)
01/08/2014	<u>163</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 12/3/2013 before Judge Jesse M. Furman. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Paula Speer, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 2/3/2014. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 2/13/2014. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 4/11/2014.(Rodriguez, Somari) (Entered: 01/08/2014)
01/08/2014	<u>164</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 12/3/13 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(Rodriguez, Somari) (Entered: 01/08/2014)
02/27/2014	<u>165</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Sid Wolinsky dated 02/27/14 re: Joint Status Update. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Attachment A)(Wolinsky, Sid) (Entered: 02/27/2014)
02/28/2014	<u>166</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Sid Wolinsky & Martha Calhoun dated 02/27/14 re: Joint Status Update. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Attachment A)(Wolinsky, Sid) (Entered: 02/28/2014)
03/04/2014	<u>167</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>166</u> Letter, filed by Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Tania Morales, Gregory D. Bell. ENDORSEMENT: In light of the parties' progress and the ongoing negotiations, the Court sees no need for a conference on March 5, 2014. Accordingly, the conference is ADJOURNED to May 7, 2014, at 3 p.m., at which point the Court will, in all likelihood, set deadlines and dates for litigation of the remedy issues, including, if need be, trial. No later than the Thursday before that conference, the parties shall file a joint letter updating the Court on the status of their negotiations and proposing dates and deadlines for the remainder of the litigation. If the parties believe that a conference before May 7, 2014, is warranted, they should advise the Court by letter. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 3/4/2014) (mro) (Entered: 03/04/2014)
03/04/2014		Set/Reset Hearings: Status Conference set for 5/7/2014 at 03:00 PM before Judge Jesse M. Furman. (mro) (Entered: 03/04/2014)
03/10/2014	<u>168</u>	LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference <i>Unopposed Request to Change Date of May 2014 Status Conference</i> addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from SID WOLINSKY dated MARCH 10, 2014. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Wolinsky, Sid) (Entered: 03/10/2014)
03/10/2014	169	ORDER granting <u>168</u> Letter Motion to Adjourn Conference. The Pretrial Conference is ADJOURNED to 5/19/2014 at 03:45 PM in Courtroom 1105, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Jesse M. Furman. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Jesse M. Furman)(Text Only Order) (Furman, Jesse) (Entered: 03/10/2014)

05/15/2014	<u>170</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>and Joint Status Update</i> addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from SID WOLINSKY dated May 15, 2014. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Wolinsky, Sid) (Entered: 05/15/2014)
05/15/2014	171	ORDER granting <u>170</u> Letter Motion for Adjournment. The Court commends the parties and Judge McGuire on their efforts to resolve the remedy issues in this case without the need for further Court intervention. In light of the parties' letter, the conference is ADJOURNED to June 16, 2014, at 2 p.m., at which point the Court will, in the absence of a resolution, set deadlines and dates for litigation of the remedy issues, including, if need be, trial. No later than the Thursday before that conference, the parties shall file a joint letter updating the Court on the status of their negotiations and, if appropriate, proposing dates and deadlines for the remainder of the litigation. If the parties believe that a conference before June 16, 2014, is warranted, they should advise the Court by letter. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Jesse M. Furman)(Text Only Order) (Furman, Jesse) (Entered: 05/15/2014)
06/06/2014	<u>172</u>	LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference <i>Joint Status Update</i> addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from SID WOLINSKY dated JUNE 6, 2014. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Wolinsky, Sid) (Entered: 06/06/2014)
06/06/2014	173	ORDER granting <u>172</u> Letter Motion to Adjourn Conference. The conference is ADJOURNED to June 30, 2014, at 11:00 AM in Courtroom 1105, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Jesse M. Furman. Per the terms of the Court's May 15, 2014 Order, the parties shall file a joint letter by the Thursday before the conference. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Jesse M. Furman)(Text Only Order) (Furman, Jesse) (Entered: 06/06/2014)
06/13/2014	<u>175</u>	ORDER: IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the conference in this matter, previously scheduled for Monday, June 30, 2014, at 11 a.m., is RESCHEDULED for Wednesday, June 25, 2014, at 11 a.m. in Courtroom 1105 of the Thurgood Marshall Courthouse, 40 Centre Street, New York, New York. SO ORDERED. (Pretrial Conference set for 6/25/2014 at 11:00 AM in Courtroom 1105 of the Thurgood Marshall Courthouse, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Jesse M. Furman.) (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 6/13/2014) (kgo) (Entered: 06/13/2014)
06/19/2014	<u>176</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from SID WOLINSKY and MARK TOEWS dated JUNE 19, 2014 re: Remedy Negotiations in Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled v. DeBlasio, Joint Status Report. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Wolinsky, Sid) (Entered: 06/19/2014)
06/25/2014	<u>177</u>	ORDER: The parties are directed to send a joint letter to the Court by the close of business on June 26, 2014, proposing interim discovery deadlines for fourteen hours of depositions for fact discovery, limited document production, expert reports, and expert depositions. The parties are directed to send a joint letter to the Court no later than Thursday, July 25, 2014, informing the Court of the status of settlement discussions and addressing the question of whether an interim order memorializing any agreements between the parties should be entered. On Monday, September 8, 2014, by noon, the parties shall file a Joint Pretrial Order. By Monday, September 15, 2014, the parties shall file any reply memorandum of law to any memorandum filed with the Joint Pre-Hearing Order and provide two (2) courtesy copies to the Court. The final pretrial conference is scheduled for Tuesday, September 23, 2014, at 3:30 p.m., in Courtroom 1105 of the Thurgood Marshall Courthouse, 40 Centre Street, New York, New York. It is ORDERED that the trial will begin on Monday, October 6, 2014. The trial will be conducted from 9:00 a.m. until 2:30 p.m. each hearing day, with one and only one half hour break. It is further ORDERED that the following procedures shown herein shall govern the conduct of the hearing. SO ORDERED. (Final Pretrial Conference set for 9/23/2014 at 03:30 PM in Courtroom 1105 of the Thurgood Marshall Courthouse, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Jesse M. Furman. Pretrial Order due by 9/8/2014. Bench Trial set for 10/6/2014 at 09:00 AM before Judge Jesse M. Furman.) (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 6/25/2014) (kgo) (Entered: 06/25/2014)

		06/25/2014)
06/25/2014		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Jesse M. Furman: Status Conference held on 6/25/2014. Dan Brown and Sid Wolinsky present for the Plaintiffs. Mark Toews and Carolyn Kruk present for the Defendants. Rebecca Tinio present for the US Attorney's Office for the United States. Court reporter present. (ab) (Entered: 07/01/2014)
06/26/2014	<u>178</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from SID WOLINSKY dated JUNE 26, 2014 re: Joint Letter Re: Proposed Discovery Deadlines. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Wolinsky, Sid) (Entered: 06/26/2014)
06/27/2014	<u>179</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>178</u> Letter, filed by Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Tania Morales, Gregory D. Bell. ENDORSEMENT: These dates are hereby adopted. The parties are cautioned that the trial date in this matter is a firm date. Because of that, and given the other pretrial deadlines set at the conference held yesterday, the discovery deadlines will not be extended absent extraordinary circumstances. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 6/27/2014) (mro) (Entered: 06/30/2014)
06/27/2014		Set/Reset Deadlines: Deposition due by 9/3/2014. (mro) (Entered: 06/30/2014)
07/03/2014	<u>180</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Christine Hsiao-Ting Chuang on behalf of Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 07/03/2014)
07/23/2014	<u>181</u>	ORDER: The Court will hold a brief telephone conference in this matter on Thursday, July 24, 2014, at 11:45 a.m. At that time, Plaintiffs' counsel should telephone the Court by calling (212) 805-0282 once all of the parties are on the line. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 7/23/2014) (ab) (Entered: 07/23/2014)
07/25/2014	<u>182</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Sid Wolinsky, Mark Toews dated July 25, 2014. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Michael R. Bloomberg, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales, The City of New York.(Wolinsky, Sid) (Entered: 07/25/2014)
07/25/2014	<u>183</u>	AMENDED LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>and Joint Status Letter</i> addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from the Parties dated July 25, 2014. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Wolinsky, Sid) (Entered: 07/25/2014)
07/27/2014	184	ORDER granting <u>183</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. The Court hereby grants the extensions set forth in the letter motion at Docket No. 183. The September 15th deadline for the submission of any reply memoranda and the trial date remain in effect. In addition, the telephone conference that was scheduled for July 25, 2014, is hereby RESCHEDULED for August 4, 2014, at 11 a.m. At that time, Plaintiff's counsel shall call the Court, with all counsel on the line, at (212) 805-0282. The letter motion at Docket No. 182 is denied as moot. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Jesse M. Furman)(Text Only Order) (Furman, Jesse) (Entered: 07/27/2014)
08/04/2014		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Jesse M. Furman: Telephone Conference held on 8/4/2014. Dan Brown, Christine Hsiao-Ting Chuang and Sid Wolinsky present via telephone for the Plaintiffs. Mark Towes and Carolyn Kruk present via telephone for the Defendants. Court reporter present. (ab) (Entered: 08/12/2014)
08/13/2014	<u>185</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>and Joint Status Letter</i> addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Sid Wolinsky, Mark Toews dated August 13, 2014. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Wolinsky, Sid) (Entered: 08/13/2014)
08/14/2014	186	ORDER granting <u>185</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. The discovery deadlines are extended as requested. All other dates and deadlines – including the trial dates –

		remain the same. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Jesse M. Furman)(Text Only Order) (Furman, Jesse) (Entered: 08/14/2014)
08/22/2014	<u>187</u>	STATUS REPORT. <i>Remedy Negotiations in Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled v. DeBlasio, Joint Status Letter</i> Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Wolinsky, Sid) (Entered: 08/22/2014)
08/27/2014	<u>188</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>187</u> Status Report, filed by Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Tania Morales, Gregory D. Bell. ENDORSEMENT: The parties shall appear for a conference to address these issues on September 2, 2014, at 4 p.m. In the meantime, all pretrial dates and deadlines are extended by 10 days, except for the final pretrial conference and the trial date, which remain in effect pending further order of the Court. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 8/27/2014) (mro) (Entered: 08/27/2014)
08/27/2014		Set/Reset Hearings: Status Conference set for 9/2/2014 at 04:00 PM before Judge Jesse M. Furman. (mro) (Entered: 08/27/2014)
08/27/2014	<u>189</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from the Plaintiffs dated August 27, 2014 re: Request to Appear Telephonically. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Wolinsky, Sid) (Entered: 08/27/2014)
08/28/2014	<u>190</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>189</u> Letter, filed by Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Tania Morales, Gregory D. Bell. ENDORSEMENT: Application GRANTED. Counsel shall make the necessary arrangements with Chambers. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 8/27/2014) (mro) (Entered: 08/28/2014)
09/02/2014		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Jesse M. Furman: Status Conference held on 9/2/2014. Dan Brown, Christine Chuang (via telephone) and Sid Wolinsky (via telephone) present for the Plaintiffs. Mark Toews and Carolyn Kruk present for the Defendants. Court reporter present. (ab) (Entered: 09/05/2014)
09/03/2014	<u>191</u>	ORDER: As discussed at the conference held on September 2, 2014, the existing deadlines in this case, including the date for the final pretrial conference and for trial, are hereby VACATED. The following schedule shall govern further proceedings in this case as further set forth in this order. If trial proves to be necessary, the parties should be prepared to start trial approximately two weeks after the filing of the JP.T.O., (Pretrial Order due by 9/30/2014., Responses due by 10/14/2014., Replies due by 10/21/2014.) (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 9/3/2014) (lmb) (Entered: 09/03/2014)
09/03/2014		Terminate Transcript Deadlines (lmb) (Entered: 09/03/2014)
09/10/2014	<u>192</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: conference held on 8/4/2014 before Judge Jesse M. Furman. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Denise Richards, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 10/6/2014. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 10/17/2014. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 12/12/2014.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 09/10/2014)
09/10/2014	<u>193</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a conference proceeding held on 8/4/2014 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 09/10/2014)
09/11/2014	<u>194</u>	STATUS REPORT. <i>and Request for Status Conference</i> Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Wolinsky, Sid) (Entered: 09/11/2014)

09/15/2014	<u>195</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>194</u> Status Report filed by Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Tania Morales, Gregory D. Bell. ENDORSEMENT: No later than September 17, 2014, Defendants shall submit a letter indicating whether they object to Plaintiffs' proposed procedure and, if so, the basis for the objection. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 9/15/2014) (tn) (Entered: 09/15/2014)
09/17/2014	<u>196</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Mark G. Toews dated September 17, 2014 re: Plaintiffs' proposed Rule 23 procedure. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York.(Toews, Mark) (Entered: 09/17/2014)
09/18/2014	<u>197</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>196</u> Letter filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York. ENDORSEMENT: In light of this letter, the Court adopts the proposal set forth in Plaintiffs' letter of September 11, 2014. To the extent necessary, the parties should confer about the particulars in advance of the September 30, 2014 deadline and promptly advise the Court in the event that there are disagreements to be resolved. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 9/18/2014) (rjm) (Entered: 09/18/2014)
09/30/2014	<u>198</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from THE PARTIES dated 9/30/2014 re: STIPULATION OF SETTLEMENT. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B, # <u>4</u> Exhibit C, # <u>5</u> Exhibit D, # <u>6</u> Exhibit E, # <u>7</u> Exhibit F, # <u>8</u> Exhibit G)(Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 09/30/2014)
10/02/2014	<u>199</u>	MEMORANDUM OPINION AND ORDER: For the reasons set forth within, the Court will take an intermediate approach and grant Plaintiff's request for an interim order requiring Defendants to comply with the settlement, subject to modification or rejection following notice to the class members and a fairness hearing pursuant to Rule 23(e). It is hereby ORDERED that, no later than October 7, 2014, the parties shall confer and submit a joint proposed order consistent with this Memorandum Opinion and Order. The proposed order should include, among other things, the parties' proposed procedures for giving notice to the class (along with the proposed notice(s)) and a proposed schedule for (1) providing notice; (2) filing a motion (joint or on consent, as the case may be) for approval of the settlement; and (3) the fairness hearing. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 10/1/2014) (ab) (Entered: 10/02/2014)
10/07/2014	<u>200</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from the parties dated October 7, 2014 re: Joint Letter Attaching Proposed Order. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Joint Proposed Order)(Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 10/07/2014)
10/14/2014	<u>201</u>	JOINT LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from the parties dated October 14, 2014 re: Revised Emergency Communications and Power Outages MOUs. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Stipulation of Settlement and MOUs)(Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 10/14/2014)
10/15/2014	<u>202</u>	STIPULATION OF SETTLEMENT AND REMEDIAL ORDER: Defendants' obligations with respect to Sheltering, Canvassing, Accessible Transportation, Emergency Communications, and Power Outages are set forth in the individual Memoranda of Understanding ("MOU") attached hereto as Exhibits A through E and are incorporated herein by reference. Defendants shall comply with their obligations as set forth in Exhibits A through E within three years after the Effective Date. Defendants' obligations with respect to the hiring of a Disability and Access and Functional Needs Coordinator and the creation of a Disability Advisory Community Panel ("Coordinator/Panel") are set forth in the MOU attached hereto as Exhibit F and are incorporated herein by reference. Defendants' obligations with respect to High Rise Evacuation are set forth in the individual MOU attached hereto as Exhibit G and are incorporated herein by reference. Defendants shall comply with their obligations as set forth in Exhibit G within four years after the Effective Date, and as further set forth in this order. Per the Court's Memorandum and Opinion dated October 2, 2014 (Docket No. 199), this Order is adopted subject to modification – or rejection – following notice to class members and the fairness hearing to be held pursuant to a separate order to be entered today. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 10/15/2014) (tn) (Entered: 10/15/2014)

		10/15/2014)
10/15/2014	<u>203</u>	ORDER REGARDING INTERIM RELIEF, NOTICE TO THE CLASS, AND FAIRNESS HEARING: that the Court GRANTS Plaintiffs' Request for Interim Relief and, by separate order today, adopts the parties' stipulation of settlement and attached memoranda of understanding, subject to modification or rejection of the settlement after notice to the class and a fairness hearing pursuant to this Order. The Court hereby approves, as to form and content, the proposed Notice to the class, attached as Exhibit A, subject to the modifications as further set forth. The following schedule will govern the proceedings relating to the proposed settlement: No later than October 27, 2014, the parties shall comply with the notification requirements of the Class Action Fairness Act. By the same date, the parties shall post or distribute the Notice in the manner described above. The Notice shall remain available through the date of the fairness hearing. December 29, 2014, is the deadline for submission to the Court of objections to the proposed settlement, with copies to counsel for the parties. Class members may present objections at the fairness hearing only if they have submitted written objections and noted their desire to speak at the hearing in accordance with the Notice. By January 16, 2015, the parties shall file a motion for final approval of the settlement, as well as (a) declarations confirming compliance with the Notice provisions set forth herein and (b) written responses to objections, if any. Any opposition to such motion shall be filed within two weeks; any reply shall be filed within one week thereafter. On February 13, 2015, at 10 a.m., the Court will hold a fairness hearing in Courtroom 1105 of the Thurgood Marshall United States Courthouse, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 to address all necessary matters concerning the settlement. (Motions due by 1/16/2015.) (Fairness Hearing set for 2/13/2015 at 10:00 AM in Courtroom 1105, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Jesse M. Furman.) (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 10/15/2014) (tn) (Entered: 10/15/2014)
10/24/2014	<u>204</u>	NOTICE of Proposed Class Action Settlement Under 28 U.S.C. § 1715. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A: Complaint, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B: First Amended Complaint, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(e)(1) Notice, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D: Stipulation of Settlement and Remedial Order)(Kruk, Carolyn) (Entered: 10/24/2014)
10/24/2014	<u>205</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE of Notice of Class Action Settlement Under 28 U.S.C. § 1715 served on federal and state attorneys general on October 24, 2014. Service was made by mail. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York. (Kruk, Carolyn) (Entered: 10/24/2014)
01/08/2015	<u>206</u>	NOTICE of Withdrawal of Counsel. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 01/08/2015)
01/12/2015	<u>207</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>206</u> Notice (Other) filed by Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Tania Morales, Gregory D. Bell. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. Attorney Julia Miriam Pinover terminated. (Signed by Judge Loretta A. Preska on 1/9/2015) (tn) (Entered: 01/12/2015)
01/16/2015	<u>208</u>	MOTION for Settlement <i>NOTICE OF PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT</i> . Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 01/16/2015)
01/16/2015	<u>209</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>208</u> MOTION for Settlement <i>NOTICE OF PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT. PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT</i> . Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 01/16/2015)
01/16/2015	<u>210</u>	DECLARATION of Sid Wolinsky in Support re: <u>208</u> MOTION for Settlement <i>NOTICE OF PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT</i> .. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A: Stipulation of Settlement and Remedial

		Order, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B: Resume of Sid Wolinsky, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C: Resume of Christine Chuang, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D: Resume of Daniel Brown)(Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 01/16/2015)
01/16/2015	<u>211</u>	DECLARATION of Christine Chuang in Support re: <u>208</u> MOTION for Settlement <i>NOTICE OF PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT</i> .. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 01/16/2015)
01/16/2015	<u>212</u>	DECLARATION of Carolyn Kruk in Support re: <u>208</u> MOTION for Settlement <i>NOTICE OF PLAINTIFFS MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT</i> .. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York. (Toews, Mark) (Entered: 01/16/2015)
02/09/2015	<u>213</u>	ORDER: At the Fairness Hearing to be held on February 13, 2015, the parties should be prepared to address, in addition to the general fairness of the settlement, how the memorandum of understanding pertaining to the evacuation of people with disabilities from high rise buildings (Wolinsky Decl. (Docket No. 210) ("High Rise Evacuation MOU"), Ex. A, at Ex. G) remedies the deficiencies identified in the Court's November 7, 2013 Opinion and Order (Docket No. 159). Specifically, the parties should be prepared to discuss how creation of a Task Force provides the remedies to which Plaintiffs are entitled given the Court's Opinion and Order, what assurances the Court can have that the Task Force will develop meaningful and adequate remedies, and how to ensure that any such remedies are implemented in a timely fashion. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 2/9/2015) (tn) (Entered: 02/09/2015)
02/09/2015	<u>214</u>	ORDER: Pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 25(d), the Clerk of Court is directed to substitute Bill de Blasio for Defendant Michael R. Bloomberg and to amend the caption accordingly. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 2/9/2015) (tn) (Entered: 02/09/2015)
02/09/2015		***DELETED DOCUMENT. Deleted document number <u>215</u> Order. The document was incorrectly filed in this case. (tn) (Entered: 02/10/2015)
02/10/2015	<u>215</u>	JOINT LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to <i>Negotiate Fees and Costs</i> addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Christine Chuang dated February 10, 2015. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 02/10/2015)
02/10/2015	<u>216</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER RE DEADLINE TO NEGOTIATE ATTORNEYS' FEES AND COSTS: The time frame for the negotiating the issue of attorneys' fees and costs will be extended an additional 75 days from February 12,2015 to April 28, 2015. In the event the parties are unable to agree on the amount of attorneys' fees and costs to be awarded to Plaintiffs counsel, Plaintiffs' counsel will file a motion with the Court. The Clerk of Court is directed to terminate Docket No. 215. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 2/10/2015) (ab) (Entered: 02/10/2015)
02/13/2015		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Jesse M. Furman: Fairness Hearing held on 2/13/2015. Dan Brown and Sid Wolinsky present for the Plaintiffs. Mark Toews present for the Defendants. Court reporter present. (ab) (Entered: 02/13/2015)
02/13/2015	<u>217</u>	ORDER. As discussed on the record at the hearing held today, it is hereby ORDERED that, no later than February 27, 2015, the parties shall submit either a joint letter or individual letters discussing: (1) The fairness, reasonableness, and adequacy of the settlement in light of the questions posed by the Court at today's fairness hearing concerning the memorandum of understanding regarding high-rise evacuations. In particular, the parties should address what actions the Court could permissibly take, if the settlement were approved, should the Task Force fail to develop recommendations by the stated deadline, including but not limited to whether the Court would have the authority upon a motion for specific enforcement or contempt to craft and impose its own remedies for the Courts prior findings of liability; and (2) Whether the Court has the authority under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 23 to approve only part of the Settlement Agreement or whether the Settlement Agreement must stand or fall as a whole. It is further ORDERED that the parties shall appear for an additional hearing on the fairness of the proposed settlement on March 6, 2015, at 10:00 a.m. in

		Courtroom 1105 of the Thurgood Marshall Courthouse, 40 Centre Street, New York, New York. (Fairness Hearing set for 3/6/2015 at 10:00 AM in Courtroom 1105, U.S. Courthouse, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Jesse M. Furman.) (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 2/13/2015) (rjm) (Entered: 02/13/2015)
02/27/2015	<u>218</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Christine Chuang dated Feb. 27, 2015 re: Plaintiffs Letter Pursuant to Courts Feb. 13, 2015 Order. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 02/27/2015)
02/27/2015	<u>219</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Mark G. Toews dated February 27, 2015 re: the Court's February 13, 2015 Order. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York, Bill de Blasio.(Toews, Mark) (Entered: 02/27/2015)
03/05/2015	<u>220</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Plaintiffs' Counsel dated March 5, 2015 re: Request to Appear by Telephone. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 03/05/2015)
03/05/2015	<u>221</u>	MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>220</u> Letter filed by Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Tania Morales, Gregory D. Bell. ENDORSEMENT: The Court would prefer an in person appearance, but assuming counsel cannot make it in person, the application is GRANTED. Counsel should make the necessary arrangements with Chambers. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 3/05/2015) (ama) (Entered: 03/05/2015)
03/06/2015	<u>222</u>	ORDER GRANTING MOTION FOR FINAL APPROVAL OF CLASS ACTION SETTLEMENT granting <u>208</u> Motion for Settlement: The Court hereby grants final approval of the Settlement. The Court finds that the Settlement is fair, adequate, and reasonable to all known and potential class members; and as further set forth in this order. The Clerk of Court is directed to close this case. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 3/6/2015) (tn) (Entered: 03/06/2015)
03/06/2015		Terminate Transcript Deadlines (tn) (Entered: 03/06/2015)
03/06/2015		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Jesse M. Furman: Fairness Hearing held on 3/6/2015. Dan Brown present for the Plaintiffs. Mark Towes and Carolyn Kruk present for the Defendants. Court reporter present. (ab) (Entered: 03/26/2015)
03/24/2015	<u>223</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 3/6/2015 before Judge Jesse M. Furman. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Rebecca Forman, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 4/17/2015. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 4/27/2015. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 6/25/2015.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 03/24/2015)
03/24/2015	<u>224</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 3/6/2015 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 03/24/2015)
03/24/2015	<u>225</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 2/13/2015 before Judge Jesse M. Furman. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Alena Lynch, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 4/17/2015. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 4/27/2015. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 6/25/2015.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 03/24/2015)

03/24/2015	<u>226</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 2/13/2015 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 03/24/2015)
04/15/2015	<u>227</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by The City of New York, Bill de Blasio. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Section A – Sheltering (with Exhibit A), # <u>2</u> Section B – PECO (with Exhibits A–C), # <u>3</u> PECO (Exhibit D), # <u>4</u> PECO (Exhibits E–H), # <u>5</u> Section C – Transportation (with Exhibits A–B), # <u>6</u> Section D – Communications (with Exhibits A–F), # <u>7</u> Section E – Power Outage, # <u>8</u> Section F – DAFN, # <u>9</u> Section G – High Rise Evacuation (with Exhibit A))(Kruk, Carolyn) (Entered: 04/15/2015)
04/22/2015	<u>228</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Mark G. Toews dated April 22, 2015. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York, Bill de Blasio.(Toews, Mark) (Entered: 04/22/2015)
04/23/2015	229	ORDER granting <u>228</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. The deadline is extended by 30 days. The parties should not expect any further extensions. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Jesse M. Furman)(Text Only Order) (Furman, Jesse) (Entered: 04/23/2015)
05/28/2015	<u>230</u>	MOTION for Attorney Fees . Document filed by Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 05/28/2015)
05/28/2015	<u>231</u>	FILING ERROR – WRONG EVENT TYPE SELECTED FROM MENU – MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>Memorandum in Support of</i> . Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Chuang, Christine) Modified on 5/29/2015 (db). (Entered: 05/28/2015)
05/28/2015	<u>232</u>	DECLARATION of Sid Wolinsky in Support re: <u>231</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>Memorandum in Support of</i> .. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G, # <u>8</u> Exhibit H)(Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 05/28/2015)
05/28/2015	<u>233</u>	DECLARATION of Dan Brown in Support re: <u>231</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>Memorandum in Support of</i> .. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B)(Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 05/28/2015)
05/28/2015	<u>234</u>	DECLARATION of Richard Pearl in Support re: <u>231</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>Memorandum in Support of</i> .. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A–F)(Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 05/28/2015)
05/28/2015	<u>235</u>	AFFIRMATION of Wayne Outten in Support re: <u>231</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>Memorandum in Support of</i> .. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 05/28/2015)
05/28/2015	<u>236</u>	DECLARATION of William Alderman in Support re: <u>231</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>Memorandum in Support of</i> .. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 05/28/2015)
05/28/2015	<u>237</u>	DECLARATION of Daniel Mason in Support re: <u>231</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>Memorandum in Support of</i> .. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York,

		Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 05/28/2015)
05/28/2015	<u>238</u>	DECLARATION of Susan Dooha in Support re: <u>231</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>Memorandum in Support of.</i> Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 05/28/2015)
05/29/2015		***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY TO RE-FILE DOCUMENT – EVENT TYPE ERROR. Notice to Attorney Christine Hsiao-Ting Chuang to RE-FILE Document <u>231</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees <i>Memorandum in Support of.</i> Use the event type Memorandum in Support of Motion found under the event list Replies, Opposition and Supporting Documents. (db) (Entered: 05/29/2015)
05/29/2015	<u>239</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>230</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees . . Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 05/29/2015)
06/05/2015	<u>240</u>	FIRST LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>230</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees . addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Mark G. Toews dated June 5, 2015. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York, Bill de Blasio.(Toews, Mark) (Entered: 06/05/2015)
06/05/2015	241	ORDER granting <u>240</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply re <u>230</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees. Any opposition shall be filed by 6/25/2015; any reply shall be filed by 7/2/2015. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Jesse M. Furman)(Text Only Order) (Furman, Jesse) (Entered: 06/05/2015)
06/25/2015	<u>242</u>	MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>230</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees . . Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York, Bill de Blasio. (Toews, Mark) (Entered: 06/25/2015)
07/02/2015	<u>243</u>	REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>230</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees . . Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 07/02/2015)
07/02/2015	<u>244</u>	DECLARATION of Sid Wolinsky ISO Reply in Support re: <u>230</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees .. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 07/02/2015)
07/02/2015	<u>245</u>	DECLARATION of Daniel L.Brown ISO Reply in Support re: <u>230</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees .. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 07/02/2015)
07/02/2015	<u>246</u>	LETTER MOTION for Conference re: <u>230</u> MOTION for Attorney Fees . <i>Plaintiffs Request for Oral Argument re Plaintiffs Motion for Reasonable Attorneys Fees and Costs</i> addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Christine Chuang dated July 2, 2015. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales.(Chuang, Christine) (Entered: 07/02/2015)
07/09/2015	247	ORDER with respect to <u>246</u> Letter Motion for Conference. The Court will advise the parties in the event it determines a conference or oral argument would be helpful. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Jesse M. Furman)(Text Only Order) (Furman, Jesse) (Entered: 07/09/2015)
07/14/2015	<u>248</u>	NOTICE of Withdrawal of counsel. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Wolinsky, Sid) (Entered: 07/14/2015)
07/22/2015	<u>249</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Carolyn Kruk dated July 22 2015 re: agreement reached to resolve motion for attorneys' fees. Document filed by The City of New York, Bill de Blasio.(Kruk, Carolyn) (Entered: 07/22/2015)

07/22/2015	250	ORDER terminating <u>230</u> Motion for Attorney Fees as moot in light of the parties' agreement. (See Docket No. 249). The parties' shall submit their written agreement within thirty days of today. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Jesse M. Furman)(Text Only Order) (Furman, Jesse) (Entered: 07/22/2015)
08/24/2015	<u>251</u>	STIPULATION OF SETTLEMENT OF PLAINTIFFS' CLAIM FOR ATTORNEYS' FEES AND COSTS: Plaintiffs' claims for attorneys' fees, costs and expenses accrued to date, other than those associated with monitoring activities, are hereby resolved and withdrawn, with prejudice, and without costs, expenses, or fees in excess of the amount specified in paragraph "2" below. The City of New York hereby agrees to pay Plaintiffs the sum of \$3,700,000.00 by check made payable to Disability Rights Advocates, one of the law firms for Plaintiffs, in full and final satisfaction of all monetary claims that were or could have been raised in this action, including claims for costs, expenses, and attorneys' fees. Plaintiffs reserve their rights to recover reasonable fees and costs for monitoring the terms of the Settlement Agreement, and as further set forth in this order. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 8/21/2015) (tn) (Entered: 08/24/2015)
10/09/2015	<u>252</u>	FIRST LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File <i>Defendants' Second Status Report</i> addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Mark G. Toews dated October 9, 2015. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York, Bill de Blasio.(Toews, Mark) (Entered: 10/09/2015)
10/09/2015	253	ORDER granting <u>252</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File status report. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Jesse M. Furman)(Text Only Order) (Furman, Jesse) (Entered: 10/09/2015)
10/22/2015	<u>254</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by The City of New York, Bill de Blasio. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G, # <u>8</u> Exhibit H, # <u>9</u> Exhibit I, # <u>10</u> Exhibit J, # <u>11</u> Exhibit K, # <u>12</u> Exhibit L, # <u>13</u> Exhibit M, # <u>14</u> Exhibit N)(Kruk, Carolyn) (Entered: 10/22/2015)
10/23/2015	<u>255</u>	ORDER OF APPOINTMENT: Kari Tatro, Executive Vice President for Emergency Management Operations at BCFS Health and Human Services, shall serve as Plaintiffs' subject matter expert and principal member of the Task Force pursuant to section 1.A of the High Rise MOU. The parties agree that Ms. Tatro has the knowledge, skills, and experience necessary to meaningfully contribute to the work of the Task Force. Ms. Tatro has been and shall continue to participate regularly in the Task Force meetings. Compensation and Payment The City of New York will be responsible for paying the costs of Ms. Tatro's work. Ms. Tatro will be paid at a rate of \$250.00 per hour for professional services, \$175.00 per hour for the first three hours of her travel time, and \$87.50 for every hour of her travel time after three hours. The City of New York will also reimburse Ms. Tatro for all travel expenses (e.g. airfare, transportation, lodging, and a reasonable per diem) in connection with her participation on the Task Force. Ms. Tatro will submit itemized statements of fees and expenses to the parties. The parties will review each statement from Ms. Tatro and inspect it for regularity and reasonableness. Where, after review of the statement and, if necessary, discussion by the parties, there are no disputes concerning the contents therein, the City shall pay the full amount listed on the invoice. In the event there is a dispute concerning Ms. Tatro's statement that cannot be resolved after a discussion amongst the parties, Defendants will submit Ms. Tatro's statement to the Court. If the Court determines Ms. Tatro's statement is regular and reasonable, the Court may endorse it in the form that it was received, or in any modified form that the Court deems appropriate. Such endorsement will constitute a direction to the City of New York to pay the amount set forth in Ms. Tatro's statement, or in another amount, in the regular manner in which it pays bills, but not later than 45 calendar days following Court approval. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 10/23/2015) (tn) (Entered: 10/23/2015)
11/19/2015	<u>256</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Jelena Kolic on behalf of Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Kolic, Jelena) (Entered: 11/19/2015)
04/15/2016	<u>257</u>	STATUS REPORT. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York, Bill de Blasio. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G)(Toews, Mark) (Entered: 04/15/2016)

07/01/2016	<u>258</u>	LETTER MOTION for Conference <i>and approval of Proposed Order</i> addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Jelena Kolic dated July 1, 2016. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Exhibit, # <u>3</u> Exhibit, # <u>4</u> Exhibit, # <u>5</u> Exhibit, # <u>6</u> Exhibit)(Kolic, Jelena) (Entered: 07/01/2016)
07/05/2016	259	ORDER granting in part and reserving judgment in part on <u>258</u> Letter Motion for Conference. The City shall respond to Plaintiffs' letter no later than July 11, 2016, and the parties shall appear for a conference with the Court on July 14, 2016 at 11:00 AM in Courtroom 1105, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Jesse M. Furman)(Text Only Order) (Furman, Jesse) (Entered: 07/05/2016)
07/06/2016	<u>260</u>	LETTER MOTION to Adjourn Conference <i>currently scheduled for July 14, 2016</i> addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Carolyn Kruk dated July 6, 2016. Document filed by The City of New York, Bill de Blasio.(Kruk, Carolyn) (Entered: 07/06/2016)
07/06/2016	261	ORDER granting <u>260</u> Letter Motion to Adjourn Conference. The conference is ADJOURNED to July 19, 2016 at 11:00 AM in Courtroom 1105, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007. (HEREBY ORDERED by Judge Jesse M. Furman)(Text Only Order) (Furman, Jesse) (Entered: 07/06/2016)
07/08/2016	<u>262</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Mark G. Toews dated July 8, 2016 re: Response to Plaintiffs' July 1, 2016 letter to the Court. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York, Bill de Blasio.(Toews, Mark) (Entered: 07/08/2016)
07/19/2016		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Jesse M. Furman: Status Conference held on 7/19/2016. Dan Brown and Jelena Kolic present for Plaintiffs. Mark Toews and Carolyn Kruk present for Defendants. Court reporter present. (ab) (Entered: 07/19/2016)
07/20/2016	<u>263</u>	ORDER: No later than July 29, 2016, Defendants shall provide to Plaintiffs a chart with three columns containing the follow information, if available: (a) the specific gaps that were identified as requiring policy, procedure and/or a regulatory remedy; (b) the specific recommendations that were developed to address those gaps; and (c) the concrete work plans in place to implement those recommendations, including entities responsible and any applicable dates. By the same date, Defendants shall provide a list of members for each of the subcommittees that will be formed to report to the High Rise Implementation Committee. By the same date, Defendants shall respond to the document requests set forth in Plaintiff's July 1, 2016 letter (Docket No. 258), and, for any documents not produced, shall provide an explanation for their non-production. If there are any disputes, the parties shall promptly meet and confer in an attempt to resolve the dispute before raising it with the Court. No later than August 31, 2016, Defendants shall file a letter updating the Court and Plaintiffs on the status of their sheltering efforts. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 7/20/2016) (tn) (Entered: 07/20/2016)
08/23/2016	<u>264</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 7/19/2016 before Judge Jesse M. Furman. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Raquel Robles, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 9/16/2016. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 9/26/2016. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 11/25/2016.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 08/23/2016)
08/23/2016	<u>265</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 7/19/16 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 08/23/2016)
08/31/2016	<u>266</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Carolyn Kruk dated August 31, 2016 re: Update to Plaintiffs and the Court on sheltering. Document filed by The City of New York.(Kruk, Carolyn) (Entered: 08/31/2016)

10/17/2016	<u>267</u>	STATUS REPORT. <i>The City's Fourth Progress Report and Exhibits A through K.</i> Document filed by The City of New York. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A through F, # <u>2</u> Exhibit G through K)(Kruk, Carolyn) (Entered: 10/17/2016)
04/17/2017	<u>268</u>	STATUS REPORT. (<i>Fifth Progress Report</i>) Document filed by The City of New York. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A (Accessible Communications Policy), # <u>2</u> Exhibit B (DAFNC Training), # <u>3</u> Exhibit C (AWS Outreach), # <u>4</u> Exhibit D (Cover Letter and Survey), # <u>5</u> Exhibit E (Cadmus Project Timeline), # <u>6</u> Exhibit F (AAR Operations/NYCT Paratransit Coastal Storm/Hurricane Plan), # <u>7</u> Exhibit G (Accommodations Options Key), # <u>8</u> Exhibit H (Universal Intake Form), # <u>9</u> Exhibit I (2016 Symposium Agenda), # <u>10</u> Exhibit J (High Rise Overview))(Kruk, Carolyn) (Entered: 04/17/2017)
06/15/2017	<u>269</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to Comply with Certain Provisions of the Settlement Agreement</i> addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Mark G. Toews dated June 15, 2017. Document filed by The City of New York, Bill de Blasio. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Stipulation)(Toews, Mark) (Entered: 06/15/2017)
06/16/2017	<u>270</u>	STIPULATION: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, BY AND BETWEEN THE UNDERSIGNED, AS FOLLOWS: The parties agree to amend the timelines in paragraph 3 of the Stipulation by extending the deadlines by which time Defendants must comply with their obligations relating to the Sheltering and Transportation Memoranda of Understanding so that paragraph 3 shall now read...The parties agree to amend the timelines in paragraph 18 of the Stipulation by extending the effective period of the Court's jurisdiction with respect to the Sheltering and Transportation Memoranda of Understanding so that paragraph 18 shall now read...and as further set forth herein. The Clerk of Court is directed to terminate Docket No. 269. Motions terminated: <u>269</u> LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time <i>to Comply with Certain Provisions of the Settlement Agreement</i> addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Mark G. Toews dated June 15, 2017, filed by The City of New York, Bill de Blasio. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 6/16/2017) (ras) (Entered: 06/16/2017)
06/21/2017	<u>271</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Sid Wolinsky dated June 21, 2017 re: Request the Court to Appoint a Special Master to Resolve Disagreements Between the Parties. Document filed by Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A)(Wolinsky, Sid) (Entered: 06/21/2017)
06/22/2017	272	ORDER re: <u>271</u> Letter re: Request the Court to Appoint a Special Master to Resolve Disagreements Between the Parties, filed by Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Tania Morales, Gregory D. Bell. The Court is inclined to believe that Plaintiffs' application must be made by formal motion, addressing – among other things – the Court's authority to appoint a special master and the relationship between the request and the terms of the parties' settlement. The parties shall appear for a conference to address that question and Plaintiffs' request generally, on June 29, 2017, at 2:30 p.m. Defendants are granted leave to file a letter responding to Plaintiffs' letter no later than June 28, 2017, at noon. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 6/22/2017) (Furman, Jesse) (Entered: 06/22/2017)
06/26/2017	<u>273</u>	NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Rebecca Catherine Serbin on behalf of Gregory D. Bell, Brooklyn Center for Independence of the Disabled, Center for Independence of the Disabled, New York, Tania Morales. (Serbin, Rebecca) (Entered: 06/26/2017)
06/28/2017	<u>274</u>	LETTER addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Mark Toews and Carolyn Kruk dated June 28, 2017 re: Plaintiffs' June 21, 2017 letter requesting the appointment of a special master. Document filed by The City of New York, Bill de Blasio.(Kruk, Carolyn) (Entered: 06/28/2017)
06/28/2017		NOTICE: The time for the conference in this matter, scheduled for tomorrow, June 29, 2017, is changed from 2:30 p.m. to 3:00 p.m. in Courtroom 1105 of the Thurgood Marshall Courthouse, 40 Centre Street, New York, New York. (Alexandra Smallman, Courtroom Deputy) (Entered: 06/28/2017)
06/29/2017		Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Jesse M. Furman: Status Conference held on 6/29/2017. Dan Brown and Sid Wolinsky present for Plaintiffs. Dan Towes and Carolyn Kruk present for Defendants. Court reporter present. (ab) (Entered: 06/29/2017)

		07/06/2017)
07/24/2017	<u>275</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: Conference held on 6/28/2017 before Judge Jesse M. Furman. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Pamela Utter, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 8/14/2017. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 8/24/2017. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 10/23/2017.(Siwik, Christine) (Entered: 07/24/2017)
07/24/2017	<u>276</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a Conference proceeding held on 6/28/17 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(Siwik, Christine) (Entered: 07/24/2017)
07/26/2017	<u>277</u>	TRANSCRIPT of Proceedings re: CONFERENCE held on 6/29/2017 before Judge Jesse M. Furman. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Pamela Utter, (212) 805-0300. Transcript may be viewed at the court public terminal or purchased through the Court Reporter/Transcriber before the deadline for Release of Transcript Restriction. After that date it may be obtained through PACER. Redaction Request due 8/16/2017. Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 8/28/2017. Release of Transcript Restriction set for 10/24/2017.(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 07/26/2017)
07/26/2017	<u>278</u>	NOTICE OF FILING OF OFFICIAL TRANSCRIPT Notice is hereby given that an official transcript of a CONFERENCE proceeding held on 6/28/17 has been filed by the court reporter/transcriber in the above-captioned matter. The parties have seven (7) calendar days to file with the court a Notice of Intent to Request Redaction of this transcript. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript may be made remotely electronically available to the public without redaction after 90 calendar days...(McGuirk, Kelly) (Entered: 07/26/2017)
10/16/2017	<u>279</u>	STATUS REPORT. (<i>Sixth Progress Report</i>) Document filed by The City of New York. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C (part 1 of 2), # <u>4</u> Exhibit C (part 2 of 2), # <u>5</u> Exhibit D, # <u>6</u> Exhibit E, # <u>7</u> Exhibit F, # <u>8</u> Exhibit G, # <u>9</u> Exhibit H, # <u>10</u> Exhibit I, # <u>11</u> Exhibit J, # <u>12</u> Exhibit K, # <u>13</u> Exhibit L, # <u>14</u> Exhibit M, # <u>15</u> Exhibit N, # <u>16</u> Exhibit O, # <u>17</u> Exhibit P, # <u>18</u> Exhibit Q, # <u>19</u> Exhibit R, # <u>20</u> Exhibit S, # <u>21</u> Exhibit T, # <u>22</u> Exhibit U, # <u>23</u> Exhibit V, # <u>24</u> Exhibit W, # <u>25</u> Exhibit X)(Kruk, Carolyn) (Entered: 10/16/2017)
12/15/2017	<u>280</u>	LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Mark G. Toews dated December 15, 2017. Document filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York, Bill de Blasio.(Toews, Mark) (Entered: 12/15/2017)
12/18/2017	<u>281</u>	STIPULATION: IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, BY AND BETWEEN THE UNDERSIGNED, AS FOLLOWS: The parties agree to amend the timelines in paragraph 3 of the Stipulation...The parties agree to amend the timelines in paragraph 18 of the Stipulation... (See document.) The Clerk of Court is directed to terminate Docket No. 280. Motions terminated: <u>280</u> LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time addressed to Judge Jesse M. Furman from Mark G. Toews dated December 15, 2017, filed by Michael R. Bloomberg, The City of New York, Bill de Blasio. (Signed by Judge Jesse M. Furman on 12/18/2017) (ras) (Entered: 12/18/2017)