

CLOSED

**U.S. District Court [LIVE]  
Western District of Texas (Austin)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:15-cv-00956-SS**

Gonzales et al v. City of Austin  
Assigned to: Judge Sam Sparks  
Cause: 42:1983 Civil Rights Act

Date Filed: 10/27/2015  
Date Terminated: 03/16/2016  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 440 Civil Rights: Other  
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

**Plaintiff**

**Valerie Gonzales**  
*TERMINATED: 12/08/2015*

represented by **Brian A. Coleman**  
Drinker Biddle & Reath LLP  
1500 K Street, N.W., Suite 1100  
Washington, DC 20005  
202-842-8800  
Fax: 202-842-8465  
Email: [brian.coleman@dbr.com](mailto:brian.coleman@dbr.com)  
*TERMINATED: 12/08/2015*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Joseph S. Grinstein**  
Susman Godfrey, L.L.P.  
1000 Louisiana  
Suite 5100  
Houston, TX 77002  
(713) 653-7824  
Fax: (713) 654-6666  
Email: [jgrinstein@susmangodfrey.com](mailto:jgrinstein@susmangodfrey.com)  
*TERMINATED: 12/08/2015*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Lindsay B. Orr**  
Drinker Biddle & Reath LLP  
222 Delaware Ave., Ste. 1410  
Wilmington, DE 19801  
302-467-4200  
Fax: 302-467-4201  
Email: [Lindsay.Orr@dbr.com](mailto:Lindsay.Orr@dbr.com)  
*TERMINATED: 12/08/2015*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Neal Stuart Manne**  
Susman Godfrey L.L.P.  
1000 Louisiana  
Suite 5100  
Houston, TX 77002-5096  
(713) 653-7827  
Fax: (713) 654-6666  
Email: [nmanne@susmangodfrey.com](mailto:nmanne@susmangodfrey.com)  
*TERMINATED: 12/08/2015*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Ranjana Natarajan**  
Civil Rights Clinic, University of Texas  
School of Law  
727 E. Dean Keeton St.

Austin, TX 78705  
512-232-7222  
Fax: 512-232-0800  
Email: [rnatarajan@law.utexas.edu](mailto:rnatarajan@law.utexas.edu)  
*TERMINATED: 12/08/2015*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Rebecca Bernhardt**  
Texas Fair Defense Project  
314 E. Highland Mall Blvd., Suite 108  
Austin, TX 78752  
(512) 637-5220  
Fax: 512-637-5224  
Email: [rbernhardt@fairdefense.org](mailto:rbernhardt@fairdefense.org)  
*TERMINATED: 12/08/2015*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Susanne Ashley Pringle**  
Texas Fair Defense Project  
314 E. Highland Mall Blvd.  
Suite 108  
Austin, TX 78752  
(512) 637-5220 x103  
Fax: (512) 637-5224  
Email: [springle@fairdefense.org](mailto:springle@fairdefense.org)  
*TERMINATED: 12/08/2015*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Trisha Trigilio**  
ACLU of Texas  
1500 McGowen Street  
Houston, TX 77004  
713.942.8146  
Fax: 713.942.8966  
Email: [ttrigilio@aclutx.org](mailto:ttrigilio@aclutx.org)  
*TERMINATED: 12/08/2015*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Maria Salazar**  
*TERMINATED: 12/08/2015*

represented by **Brian A. Coleman**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 12/08/2015*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Joseph S. Grinstein**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 12/08/2015*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Lindsay B. Orr**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 12/08/2015*  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Neal Stuart Manne**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 12/08/2015*

*LEAD ATTORNEY  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Ranjana Natarajan**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 12/08/2015  
LEAD ATTORNEY  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Rebecca Bernhardt**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 12/08/2015  
LEAD ATTORNEY  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Susanne Ashley Pringle**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 12/08/2015  
LEAD ATTORNEY  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Trisha Trigilio**  
(See above for address)  
*TERMINATED: 12/08/2015  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Karian Harris**

represented by **Brian A. Coleman**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Joseph S. Grinstein**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Lindsay B. Orr**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY  
PRO HAC VICE  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Neal Stuart Manne**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Ranjana Natarajan**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Rebecca Bernhardt**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Susanne Ashley Pringle**  
(See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY  
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Trisha Trigilio**

(See above for address)  
 TERMINATED: 01/27/2016  
 ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

**Defendant**

**City of Austin**

represented by **Christine G. Edwards**  
 Assistant City Attorney  
 P.O. Box 1546  
 Austin, TX 78767-1546  
 (512) 974-2419  
 Fax: 512/974-6490  
 Email: [chris.edwards@austintexas.gov](mailto:chris.edwards@austintexas.gov)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Robin E. Harris**  
 Loiacono Law Group  
 3800 N. Lamar Blvd., Suite 200  
 Austin, TX 78756  
 (512) 299-9598  
 Email: [robinharris@lolawgroup.com](mailto:robinharris@lolawgroup.com)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
10/27/2015	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT ( Filing fee \$ 400 receipt number 0542-7903906), filed by Valerie Gonzales, Maria Salazar. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Civil Cover Sheet)(Trigilio, Trisha) (Entered: 10/27/2015)
10/27/2015	<u>2</u>	REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS by Valerie Gonzales, Maria Salazar. (Trigilio, Trisha) (Entered: 10/27/2015)
10/27/2015		Case Assigned to Judge Sam Sparks. CM WILL NOW REFLECT THE JUDGE INITIALS AS PART OF THE CASE NUMBER. PLEASE APPEND THESE JUDGE INITIALS TO THE CASE NUMBER ON EACH DOCUMENT THAT YOU FILE IN THIS CASE. (so) (Entered: 10/27/2015)
10/27/2015	<u>3</u>	Summons Issued as to City of Austin. (so) (Entered: 10/27/2015)
10/27/2015	<u>4</u>	MOTION to Certify Class by Valerie Gonzales, Maria Salazar. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Ex. A, Gonzales Declaration October 2015, # <u>2</u> Ex. B, Gonzales Case List, # <u>3</u> Ex. C, Gonzales Declaration August 2015, # <u>4</u> Ex. D, Salazar Declaration, # <u>5</u> Ex. E, Austin Municipal Court Data 2011-2015, # <u>6</u> Ex. F, Application for Extension to Pay, # <u>7</u> Ex. G, Austin Municipal Court Internal Rule 13.3, # <u>8</u> Ex. H, Austin City Code 2-10-21, # <u>9</u> Ex. I, Rules of Austin Municipal Court, # <u>10</u> Ex. J, Austin Municipal Court Website: Appointment of Counsel, # <u>11</u> Ex. K, Austin Budget 2014-2015 (Excerpt), # <u>12</u> Ex. L, U.S. Census Quickfacts: Austin, Texas, # <u>13</u> Ex. M, Bernhardt Declaration, # <u>14</u> Ex. N, Pringle Declaration, # <u>15</u> Ex. O, Natarajan Declaration, # <u>16</u> Ex. P, Trigilio Declaration, # <u>17</u> Ex. Q, Grinstein Declaration)(Trigilio, Trisha) (Entered: 10/27/2015)
10/27/2015	<u>5</u>	<b>DEFICIENCY NOTICE:</b> re <u>4</u> MOTION to Certify Class (dm) (Entered: 10/27/2015)
10/27/2015	<u>6</u>	ATTACHMENT of Proposed Order Granting Class Certification to <u>4</u> MOTION to Certify Class by Valerie Gonzales, Maria Salazar. (Trigilio, Trisha) (Entered: 10/27/2015)
10/29/2015	<u>7</u>	SUMMONS Returned Executed by Valerie Gonzales, Maria Salazar. City of Austin served on 10/27/2015, answer due 11/17/2015. (Trigilio, Trisha) (Entered: 10/29/2015)
11/17/2015	<u>8</u>	Motion to Dismiss for Failure to State a Claim by City of Austin. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Edwards, Christine) (Entered: 11/17/2015)

11/19/2015	<u>9</u>	MOTION to Appear Pro Hac Vice by Susanne Ashley Pringle ( Filing fee \$ 100 receipt number 0542-7973277) by Brian A. Coleman on behalf of Valerie Gonzales, Maria Salazar. (Pringle, Susanne) (Entered: 11/19/2015)
11/19/2015	<u>10</u>	MOTION to Appear Pro Hac Vice by Susanne Ashley Pringle ( Filing fee \$ 100 receipt number 0542-7973493) by Lindsay B. Orr on behalf of Valerie Gonzales, Maria Salazar. (Pringle, Susanne) (Entered: 11/19/2015)
11/20/2015	<u>11</u>	ORDER GRANTING <u>9</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Brian A. Coleman. Pursuant to our Administrative Policies and Procedures for Electronic Filing, the attorney hereby granted to practice pro hac vice in this case must register for electronic filing with our court within 10 days of this order. Signed by Judge Sam Sparks. (os) (Entered: 11/20/2015)
11/20/2015	<u>12</u>	ORDER GRANTING <u>10</u> Motion to Appear Pro Hac Vice for Lindsay B. Orr. Pursuant to our Administrative Policies and Procedures for Electronic Filing, the attorney hereby granted to practice pro hac vice in this case must register for electronic filing with our court within 10 days of this order. Signed by Judge Sam Sparks. (os) (Entered: 11/20/2015)
11/24/2015	<u>13</u>	Unopposed MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply to <i>Motion to Dismiss</i> by Valerie Gonzales, Maria Salazar. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Grinstein, Joseph) (Entered: 11/24/2015)
12/01/2015	<u>14</u>	ORDER GRANTING <u>13</u> Motion for Extension of Time to File Response. Signed by Judge Sam Sparks. (dm) (Entered: 12/01/2015)
12/08/2015	<u>15</u>	AMENDED COMPLAINT against All Defendants amending, filed by Karian Harris.(Trigilio, Trisha) (Entered: 12/08/2015)
12/28/2015	<u>16</u>	ORDER DISMISSING <u>4</u> Motion to Certify Class; DISMISSING without prejudice <u>8</u> Motion to Dismiss. Signed by Judge Sam Sparks. (td) (Entered: 12/29/2015)
12/29/2015	<u>17</u>	Motion Re-urging Motion to Dismiss for Failure to State a Claim <u>8</u> by City of Austin. (Edwards, Christine) Modified on 12/29/2015 to correct motion type (td). (Entered: 12/29/2015)
12/30/2015	<u>18</u>	Response in Opposition to Motion, filed by Karian Harris, re <u>8</u> Motion to Dismiss for Failure to State a Claim filed by Defendant City of Austin, <u>17</u> Motion to Dismiss for Failure to State a Claim filed by Defendant City of Austin (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Proposed Order)(Grinstein, Joseph) (Entered: 12/30/2015)
01/04/2016	<u>19</u>	ORDER, ( Status Conference set for 1/13/2016 09:00 AM before Judge Sam Sparks,). Signed by Judge Sam Sparks. (dm) (Entered: 01/04/2016)
01/05/2016	<u>20</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply as to <u>18</u> Response in Opposition to Motion, by City of Austin. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Edwards, Christine) (Entered: 01/05/2016)
01/08/2016	<u>21</u>	MOTION for Leave to Exceed Page Limitation by City of Austin. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proposed Order)(Edwards, Christine) (Entered: 01/08/2016)
01/08/2016	<u>22</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion, filed by City of Austin, re <u>8</u> Motion to Dismiss for Failure to State a Claim filed by Defendant City of Austin (Edwards, Christine) (Entered: 01/08/2016)
01/11/2016	<u>23</u>	NOTICE of Attorney Appearance by Robin E. Harris on behalf of City of Austin (Harris, Robin) (Entered: 01/11/2016)
01/11/2016	<u>24</u>	ORDER GRANTING <u>20</u> Motion for Extension of Time to File Response. Signed by Judge Sam Sparks. (dm) (Entered: 01/11/2016)
01/11/2016	<u>25</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion, filed by Valerie Gonzales, Karian Harris, Maria Salazar, re <u>8</u> Motion to Dismiss for Failure to State a Claim filed by Defendant City of Austin <i>Surreply To Defendant's Motion to Dismiss</i> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit E, # <u>2</u> Exhibit F, # <u>3</u> Exhibit G, # <u>4</u> Exhibit H, # <u>5</u> Exhibit I, # <u>6</u> Exhibit J)(Grinstein, Joseph) (Entered: 01/11/2016)

01/11/2016	<u>26</u>	Opposed MOTION to Certify Class by Karian Harris. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Ex. A, Decl. of Karian Harris, # <u>2</u> Ex. B, Docket Sheets for Karian Harris, # <u>3</u> Ex. C, Austin Municipal Court Data, # <u>4</u> Ex. D, Payment Plan Application, # <u>5</u> Ex. E, Austin Municipal Court Internal Rule, # <u>6</u> Ex. F, Decl. of Valerie Gonzales, # <u>7</u> Ex. G, Decl. of Maria Salazar, # <u>8</u> Ex. H, Decl. of Juan Martinez, # <u>9</u> Ex. I, Austin City Code 2-10-21, # <u>10</u> Ex. J, Austin Municipal Court Rules, # <u>11</u> Ex. K, Austin Municipal Court Website, # <u>12</u> Ex. L, Austin City Budget Excerpt, # <u>13</u> Ex. M, US Census Austin Data, # <u>14</u> Ex. N, Decl. of Rebecca Bernhardt, # <u>15</u> Ex. O, Decl. of Susanne Pringle, # <u>16</u> Ex. P, Decl. of Ranjana Natarajan, # <u>17</u> Ex. Q, Decl. of Trisha Trigilio, # <u>18</u> Ex. R, Decl. of Joseph Grinstein, # <u>19</u> Ex. S, Decl. of Brian Coleman)(Trigilio, Trisha) (Entered: 01/11/2016)
01/12/2016	<u>27</u>	ORDER GRANTING <u>21</u> Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages. Signed by Judge Sam Sparks. (dm) (Entered: 01/12/2016)
01/13/2016	<u>28</u>	Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Sam Sparks: Status Conference held on 1/13/2016. Motions taken under advisement, written order forthcoming. (Minute entry documents are not available electronically.). (Court Reporter Lily Reznik.)(dm) (Entered: 01/13/2016)
01/19/2016	<u>29</u>	Proposed Scheduling Order by Valerie Gonzales, Karian Harris, Maria Salazar. (Grinstein, Joseph) (Entered: 01/19/2016)
01/19/2016	<u>30</u>	STIPULATION <i>Order Regarding Briefing Schedule for Plaintiff's Motion for Class Certification</i> by Valerie Gonzales, Karian Harris, Maria Salazar. (Grinstein, Joseph) (Entered: 01/19/2016)
01/26/2016	<u>31</u>	Unopposed MOTION to Withdraw as Attorney <i>for Plaintiff</i> , by Trisha Trigilio by Karian Harris. (Trigilio, Trisha) (Entered: 01/26/2016)
01/27/2016	<u>32</u>	ORDER GRANTING <u>31</u> Motion for Trisha Trigilio to Withdraw as Attorney. Signed by Judge Sam Sparks. (os) (Entered: 01/27/2016)
03/16/2016	<u>33</u>	ORDER GRANTING <u>17</u> Motion Re-Urging Motion to Dismiss. Signed by Judge Sam Sparks. (td) (Entered: 03/16/2016)
03/16/2016	<u>34</u>	ORDER DISMISSING CASE WITHOUT PREJUDICE. Signed by Judge Sam Sparks. (td) (Entered: 03/16/2016)
03/23/2016	<u>35</u>	Transcript filed of Proceedings held on January 13, 2016, Proceedings Transcribed: All Pending Matters. Court Reporter/Transcriber: Lily I. Reznik, Telephone number: 512-391-8792. Parties are notified of their duty to review the transcript to ensure compliance with the FRCP 5.2(a)/FRCrP 49.1(a). A copy may be purchased from the court reporter or viewed at the clerk's office public terminal. If redaction is necessary, a Notice of Redaction Request must be filed within 21 days. If no such Notice is filed, the transcript will be made available via PACER without redaction after 90 calendar days. The clerk will mail a copy of this notice to parties not electronically noticed Redaction Request due 4/13/2016, Redacted Transcript Deadline set for 4/25/2016, Release of Transcript Restriction set for 6/21/2016, (Reznik, Lily) (Entered: 03/23/2016)
04/04/2016	<u>36</u>	ADVISORY TO THE COURT by City of Austin. (Edwards, Christine) (Entered: 04/04/2016)