

**United States District Court
Eastern District of Pennsylvania (Philadelphia)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 2:18-cv-00115-CMR**

HAROLD et al v. RICHARDS et al
Assigned to: HONORABLE CYNTHIA M. RUFE
Cause: 42:1983 Civil Rights Act

Date Filed: 01/10/2018
Date Terminated: 09/25/2018
Jury Demand: Plaintiff
Nature of Suit: 950 Other Statutes:
Constitutional – State Statute
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

RUSSELL HAROLD

represented by **ZAK T. GOLDSTEIN**
Goldstein Mehta LLC
1221 Locust St
PHILADELPHIA, PA 19107
267-225-2545
Email: zaktgoldstein@gmail.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CATHERINE SEVCENKO
EQUAL JUSTICE UNDER LAW
4007TH STREET NW, SUITE 602
WASHINGTON, DC 20004
202-643-7227
Email: catherine@equaljusticeunderlaw.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MARISSA HATTON
EQUAL JUSTICE UNDER LAW
400 7TH STREET NW, SUITE 602
WASHINGTON, DC 20004
202-838-6709
Email: mhatton@equaljusticeunderlaw.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

PHIL TELFEYAN
EQUAL JUSTICE UNDER LAW
400 7TH STREET NW, SUITE 602
WASHINGTON, DC 20004
202-505-2058
Email: ptelfeyan@equaljusticeunderlaw.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

REBECCA RAMASWAMY
EQUAL JUSTICE UNDER LAW
400 7TH STREET NW, SUITE 602
WASHINGTON, DC 20004
202-643-0340
Email: rramaswamy@equaljusticeunderlaw.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

SEAN WILLIAMS
*ON BEHALF OF THEMSELVES AND
OTHERS SIMILARLY SITUATED*

represented by **ZAK T. GOLDSTEIN**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

CATHERINE SEVCENKO
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

MARISSA HATTON
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

PHIL TELFEYAN
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

REBECCA RAMASWAMY
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

LESLIE RICHARDS
*IN HER OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS
SECRETARY OF TRANSPORTATION
OF THE PENNSYLVANIA
DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION*

represented by **STEPHEN R. KOVATIS**
OFFICE OF ATTORNEY GENERAL
1600 Arch Street
PHILADELPHIA, PA 19103
(215) 560-2940
Fax: (717) 772-4526
Email: skovatis@attorneygeneral.gov
TERMINATED: 03/13/2018
LEAD ATTORNEY

A. MICHAEL PRATT
PEPPER, HAMILTON & SCHEETZ
18TH & ARCH STS.
3000 TWO LOGAN SQUARE
PHILA, PA 19103
215-981-4386
Email: prattam@pepperlaw.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

BARAK BASSMAN
PEPPER HAMILTON LLP
3000 TWO LOGAN SQ
18TH & ARCH STS
PHILADELPHIA, PA 19103
215-981-4771
Fax: 215-981-4853
Email: bassmanb@pepperlaw.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

HEDYA ARYANI
SHOOK, HARDY & BACON L.L.P.
TWO COMMERCE SQUARE
2001 MARKET STREET
SUITE 3000
PHILADELPHIA, PA 19103-2799
215-981-4011
Email: aryanih@pepperlaw.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JANINE P. YANIAK
PEPPER HAMILTON
3000 TWO LOGAN SQ
18TH & ARCH STS
PHILADELPHIA, PA 19103
215-961-4810
Email: yaniakj@pepperlaw.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOSEPH ZAFFARESE
AHMAD ZAFFARESE LLC
ONE SOUTH BROAD ST
SUITE 1810
PHILADELPHIA, PA 19107
215-496-9373
Fax: 215-496-9419
Email: jzaffarese@azands.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

KAY KYUNGSUN YU
Ahmad Zaffarese LLC
One South Broad Street
Suite 1810
PHILADELPHIA, PA 19107
215-496-9373
Fax: 215-496-9419
Email: kyu@azlawllc.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

LEO BAGLEY
*IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS
EXECUTIVE DEPUTY SECRETARY OF
THE PENNSYLVANIA DEPARTMENT
OF TRANSPORTATION*

represented by **STEPHEN R. KOVATIS**
(See above for address)
*TERMINATED: 03/13/2018
LEAD ATTORNEY*

A. MICHAEL PRATT
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

BARAK BASSMAN
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

HEDYA ARYANI
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JANINE P. YANIAK
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOSEPH ZAFFARESE
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

KAY KYUNGSUN YU
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

KURT MYERS
*IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS
DEPUTY SECRETARY FOR DRIVER
AND VEHICLE SERVICES OF THE
PENNSYLVANIA DEPARTMENT OF
TRANSPORTATION*

represented by **STEPHEN R. KOVATIS**
(See above for address)
*TERMINATED: 03/13/2018
LEAD ATTORNEY*

A. MICHAEL PRATT
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

BARAK BASSMAN
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

HEDYA ARYANI
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JANINE P. YANIAK
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOSEPH ZAFFARESE
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

KAY KYUNGSUN YU
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

TOM WOLF
IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS
GOVERNOR OF PENNSYLVANIA

represented by **STEPHEN R. KOVATIS**
(See above for address)
TERMINATED: 03/13/2018
LEAD ATTORNEY

A. MICHAEL PRATT
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

BARAK BASSMAN
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

HEDYA ARYANI
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JANINE P. YANIAK
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

JOSEPH ZAFFARESE
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

KAY KYUNGSUN YU
(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
01/10/2018	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against LEO BAGLEY, KURT MYERS, LESLIE RICHARDS, TOM WOLF (Filing fee \$ 400 receipt number 171681.), filed by RUSSELL HAROLD, SEAN WILLIAMS. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Exhibit, # <u>3</u> Exhibit, # <u>4</u> Exhibit, # <u>5</u> Civil Cover Sheet)(jwl,) (Additional attachment(s) added on 1/11/2018: # <u>6</u> Complaint Signature Page) (jwl,). (Entered: 01/11/2018)
01/10/2018		Summons Issued as to LEO BAGLEY, KURT MYERS, LESLIE RICHARDS, TOM WOLF. Four Forwarded To: Counsel on 1/11/18 (jwl,) (Entered: 01/11/2018)
01/10/2018		DEMAND for Trial by Jury by RUSSELL HAROLD, SEAN WILLIAMS. (jwl,) (Entered: 01/11/2018)
01/11/2018	<u>2</u>	MOTION for Preliminary Injunction filed by RUSSELL HAROLD, SEAN WILLIAMS.Motion. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Exhibit 4)(GOLDSTEIN, ZAK) (Entered: 01/11/2018)

01/11/2018	<u>3</u>	MOTION to Certify Class filed by RUSSELL HAROLD, SEAN WILLIAMS.Motion. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit Exhibit 6)(GOLDSTEIN, ZAK) (Entered: 01/11/2018)
01/11/2018	<u>4</u>	ORDER THAT THE ABOVE-CAPTIONED CASE IS REASSIGNED FROM THE CALENDAR OF THE HONORABLE ROBERT F. KELLY TO THE CALENDAR OF THE HONORABLE CYNTHIA M. RUFÉ. SIGNED BY KATE BARKMAN, CLERK OF COURT ON 1/11/18. 1/12/18 ENTERED AND COPIES E-MAILED AND MAILED TO UNREPRESENTED PARTIES.(kw,) (Entered: 01/12/2018)
02/21/2018	<u>5</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by STEPHEN R. KOVATIS on behalf of LEO BAGLEY, KURT MYERS, LESLIE RICHARDS, TOM WOLF with Certificate of Service(KOVATIS, STEPHEN) (Entered: 02/21/2018)
02/22/2018	<u>6</u>	WAIVER OF SERVICE Returned Executed by SEAN WILLIAMS, RUSSELL HAROLD. Waivers sent to All Defendants on 1/31/2018, answers due 4/2/2018. (GOLDSTEIN, ZAK) Modified on 2/26/2018 (tjd). (Entered: 02/22/2018)
02/26/2018	<u>7</u>	First MOTION for Pro Hac Vice Admission of Catherine Sevchenko filed by RUSSELL HAROLD, SEAN WILLIAMS.Application.(GOLDSTEIN, ZAK) (Filing fee paid on 2/27/18) Modified on 2/28/2018 (kw,). (Entered: 02/26/2018)
02/26/2018	<u>8</u>	First MOTION for Pro Hac Vice Admission of Marissa Hatton filed by RUSSELL HAROLD, SEAN WILLIAMS..(GOLDSTEIN, ZAK) (Filing fee paid on 2/27/18) Modified on 2/28/2018 (kw,). (Entered: 02/26/2018)
02/26/2018	<u>9</u>	First MOTION for Pro Hac Vice Admission of Rebecca Ramaswamy filed by RUSSELL HAROLD, SEAN WILLIAMS..(GOLDSTEIN, ZAK) (Filing fee paid on 2/27/18) Modified on 2/28/2018 (kw,). (Entered: 02/26/2018)
02/26/2018	<u>10</u>	First MOTION for Pro Hac Vice Admission of Phil Telfeyan filed by RUSSELL HAROLD, SEAN WILLIAMS..(GOLDSTEIN, ZAK) (Filing fee paid on 2/27/18) Modified on 2/28/2018 (kw,). (Entered: 02/26/2018)
02/28/2018	<u>11</u>	ORDER THAT APPLICATION OF MARISSA HATTON, ESQ., TO PRACTICE IN THIS COURT PURSUANT TO L.R.C.P. 83.5.2(b) IS GRANTED. SIGNED BY HONORABLE CYNTHIA M. RUFÉ ON 2/28/18.3/1/18 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E-MAILED.(kw,) (ECF FORM MAILED TO COUNSEL ON 3/1/18) (Entered: 03/01/2018)
02/28/2018	<u>12</u>	ORDER THAT APPLICATION OF REBECCA RAMASWAMY, ESQ., TO PRACTICE IN THIS COURT PURSUANT TO L.R.C.P. 83.5.2(b) IS GRANTED. SIGNED BY HONORABLE CYNTHIA M. RUFÉ ON 2/28/18.3/1/18 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E-MAILED.(kw,) (ECF FORM MAILED TO COUNSEL ON 3/1/18) (Entered: 03/01/2018)
02/28/2018	<u>13</u>	ORDER THAT APPLICATION OF CATHERINE SEVCENKO, ESQ., TO PRACTICE IN THIS COURT PURSUANT TO L.R.C.P. 83.5.2(b) IS GRANTED. SIGNED BY HONORABLE CYNTHIA M. RUFÉ ON 2/28/18.3/1/18 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E-MAILED.(kw,) (ECF FORM MAILED TO COUNSEL ON 3/1/18) (Entered: 03/01/2018)
02/28/2018	<u>14</u>	ORDER THAT APPLICATION OF PHIL TELFEYAN, ESQ., TO PRACTICE IN THIS COURT PURSUANT TO L.R.C.P. 83.5.2(b) IS GRANTED. SIGNED BY HONORABLE CYNTHIA M. RUFÉ ON 2/28/18.3/1/18 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E-MAILED.(kw,) (ECF FORM MAILED TO COUNSEL ON 3/1/18) (Entered: 03/01/2018)
03/08/2018	<u>15</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by BARAK BASSMAN on behalf of LEO BAGLEY, KURT MYERS, LESLIE RICHARDS, TOM WOLF with Certificate of Service(BASSMAN, BARAK) (Entered: 03/08/2018)
03/08/2018	<u>16</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by HEDYA ARYANI on behalf of LEO BAGLEY, KURT MYERS, LESLIE RICHARDS, TOM WOLF with Certificate of Service(ARYANI, HEDYA) (Entered: 03/08/2018)

03/08/2018	<u>17</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by A. MICHAEL PRATT on behalf of LEO BAGLEY, KURT MYERS, LESLIE RICHARDS, TOM WOLF with Certificate of Service(PRATT, A.) (Entered: 03/08/2018)
03/08/2018	<u>18</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by JANINE P. YANIAK, ESQ., on behalf of DEFTS LEO BAGLEY, KURT MYERS, LESLIE RICHARDS, TOM WOLF, Certificate of Service. (kw,) (Entered: 03/09/2018)
03/12/2018	<u>19</u>	STIPULATION AND ORDER THAT THE STIPULATIONS ARE APPROVED AS FOLLOWS: DEFTS SHALL RESPOND TO PLFFS' MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION NO LATER THAN 3/27/2017 & SHALL RESPOND TO THE COMPLAINT NO LATER THAN 4/16/2018, ETC. SIGNED BY HONORABLE CYNTHIA M. RUFÉ ON 3/12/18. 3/13/18 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E-MAILED.(kw,) (Entered: 03/13/2018)
03/13/2018	<u>20</u>	NOTICE of Withdrawal of Appearance by STEPHEN R. KOVATIS on behalf of LEO BAGLEY, KURT MYERS, LESLIE RICHARDS, TOM WOLF(KOVATIS, STEPHEN) (Entered: 03/13/2018)
03/22/2018	<u>21</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by KAY KYUNGSUN YU on behalf of LEO BAGLEY, KURT MYERS, LESLIE RICHARDS, TOM WOLF with Certificate of Service(YU, KAY) (Entered: 03/22/2018)
03/22/2018	<u>22</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by JOSEPH ZAFFARESE on behalf of LEO BAGLEY, KURT MYERS, LESLIE RICHARDS, TOM WOLF with Certificate of Service(ZAFFARESE, JOSEPH) (Entered: 03/22/2018)
03/27/2018	<u>23</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery , MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply to <i>Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification</i> filed by LEO BAGLEY, KURT MYERS, LESLIE RICHARDS, TOM WOLF.Certificate of Service.(YU, KAY) (Entered: 03/27/2018)
03/27/2018	<u>24</u>	Memorandum of Law in Opposition re <u>2</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction filed by LEO BAGLEY, KURT MYERS, LESLIE RICHARDS, TOM WOLF. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> AFFIDAVIT OF KARAN. TEMPLETON, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B)(PRATT, A.) (FILED IN ERROR BY ATTORNEY; ATTORNEY REFILE AS DOCUMENT <u>25</u>)Modified on 3/28/2018 (nd,). (Entered: 03/27/2018)
03/27/2018	<u>25</u>	Memorandum OF LAW IN OPPOSITION re <u>2</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction filed by LEO BAGLEY, KURT MYERS, LESLIE RICHARDS, TOM WOLF. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> AFFIDAVIT OF KARAN. TEMPLETON, # <u>2</u> A, # <u>3</u> B, # <u>4</u> C)(PRATT, A.) (Entered: 03/27/2018)
03/29/2018	<u>26</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>23</u> MOTION for Extension of Time to Complete Discovery MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply to <i>Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification</i> filed by RUSSELL HAROLD, SEAN WILLIAMS. (HATTON, MARISSA) (Entered: 03/29/2018)
04/05/2018	<u>27</u>	ORDER THAT DEFTS' MOTION FOR LEAVE TO CONDUCT CLASS DISCOVERY & MOTION FOR EXTENSION OF TIME TO RESPOND TO PLFFS' MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION [DOC. NO. 23] IS DENIED WITHOUT PREJUDICE. DEFTS SHALL RESPOND TO MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION NO LATER THAN 4/16/2018, ETC. SIGNED BY HONORABLE CYNTHIA M. RUFÉ ON 4/5/18. 4/5/18 ENTERED AND COPIES MAILED AND E-MAILED.(kw,) (Entered: 04/05/2018)
04/06/2018	<u>28</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>2</u> MOTION for Preliminary Injunction filed by RUSSELL HAROLD, SEAN WILLIAMS. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit)(HATTON, MARISSA) (Entered: 04/06/2018)
04/16/2018	<u>29</u>	MOTION to Dismiss <i>DEFENDANTS MOTION TO DISMISS, OR IN THE ALTERNATIVE, TO STRIKE PLAINTIFFS CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT</i> filed by LEO BAGLEY, KURT MYERS, LESLIE RICHARDS, TOM WOLF.Memorandum in Support, Certificate of Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B)(PRATT, A.) (Entered: 04/16/2018)
04/16/2018	<u>30</u>	Memorandum of Law in Opposition re <u>3</u> MOTION to Certify Class filed by LEO BAGLEY, KURT MYERS, LESLIE RICHARDS, TOM WOLF. (PRATT, A.)

		Modified on 4/18/2018 (tjd). (Entered: 04/16/2018)
04/16/2018	<u>31</u>	Defendants' Sur-Reply Memorandum of Law in Opposition to Plaintiffs' Motion for Preliminary Injunction by LEO BAGLEY, KURT MYERS, LESLIE RICHARDS, TOM WOLF. (PRATT, A.) (Entered: 04/16/2018)
04/26/2018	<u>32</u>	REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>3</u> MOTION to Certify Class filed by RUSSELL HAROLD, SEAN WILLIAMS. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Exhibit)(HATTON, MARISSA) (Entered: 04/26/2018)
04/30/2018	<u>33</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>29</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>DEFENDANTS MOTION TO DISMISS, OR IN THE ALTERNATIVE, TO STRIKE PLAINTIFFS CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT</i> filed by RUSSELL HAROLD, SEAN WILLIAMS. (HATTON, MARISSA) (Entered: 04/30/2018)
05/08/2018	<u>34</u>	Defendant's Sur-Reply Memorandum of Law in Opposition to <u>3</u> Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification. by LEO BAGLEY, KURT MYERS, LESLIE RICHARDS, TOM WOLF. (PRATT, A.) Modified on 5/9/2018 (tjd). (Entered: 05/08/2018)
05/14/2018	<u>35</u>	Defendants' Reply Brief in Support of their Motion to Dismiss, or in the Alternative, To Strike Plaintiffs' Class Action Complaint. by LEO BAGLEY, KURT MYERS, LESLIE RICHARDS, TOM WOLF. (PRATT, A.) (Entered: 05/14/2018)
05/25/2018	<u>36</u>	Sur-Reply to Motion re <u>29</u> MOTION to Dismiss <i>DEFENDANTS MOTION TO DISMISS, OR IN THE ALTERNATIVE, TO STRIKE PLAINTIFFS CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT</i> Sur-Reply in Opposition to Defendants' Motion to Dismiss filed by RUSSELL HAROLD, SEAN WILLIAMS. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Exhibit, # <u>3</u> Exhibit, # <u>4</u> Exhibit, # <u>5</u> Exhibit)(HATTON, MARISSA) Modified on 5/30/2018 (tjd). (Entered: 05/25/2018)
09/25/2018	<u>37</u>	MEMORANDUM AND/OR OPINION. SIGNED BY HONORABLE CYNTHIA M. RUFÉ ON 9/25/18. 9/5/18 ENTERED AND COPIES E-MAILED.(kw,) (Entered: 09/25/2018)
09/25/2018	<u>38</u>	ORDER THAT DEFTS' MOTION TO DISMISS [DOC. NO. 29] IS GRANTED. THE COMPLAINT IS DISMISSED WITH PREJUDICE, ETC. PLFFS' MOTION FOR PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION [DOC. NO. 2] & MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION [DOC. NO. 3] ARE DISMISSED AS MOOT. THE CLERK IS DIRECTED TO CLOSE THIS CASE. SIGNED BY HONORABLE CYNTHIA M. RUFÉ ON 9/25/18. 9/5/18 ENTERED AND COPIES E-MAILED.(kw,) (Entered: 09/25/2018)